A SURVEY

OF

THE CONTEMPORARY INDIANS

OF CANADA

Economic, Political, Educational Needs and Policies

PART 1

A SURVEY OF THE CONTEMPORARY

INDIANS OF CANADA

A Report on Economic, Political, Educational Needs and Policies

In Two Volumes

Editor, H. B. Hawthorn

Principal authors
of Volume I: H. A. C. Cairns
S. M. Jamieson
K. Lysyk

Principal authors
of Volume II: M. A. Tremblay
F. G. Vallee
J. Ryan

Indian Affairs Branch, Ottawa

Volume I

October 1966

IAND Publication No. QS-0603-020-EE-A-18

© Crown Copyrights reserved
Available by mail from Information Canada, Ottawa,
and at the following Information Canada bookshops:

HALIFAX
1735 Barrington Street

MONTREAL
1182 St. Catherine Street West

OTTAWA
171 Slater Street

TORONTO
221 Yonge Street

WINNIPEG
393 Portage Avenue
VANCOUVER

657 Granville Street

or through your bookseller
Price: $4.00Catalogue No. R32-1267/1

Price subject to change without notice

Information Canada
Ottawa
First Printing 1967

Reprinted 1971

Administrative and Research Staff

H. B. Hawthorn, Director
M. A. Tremblay, Associate Director
A. M. Bownick, Secretary and
Administrative Assistant

H. J. Audain
B. Bernier
H. Burbidge
P. Charest
S. W. Corrigan
D. M. Coutts
C. B. Inglis
R. H. Jackson

J. E. M. Kew
L. Laforest
D. Luth
M. J. Lythgoe
R. F. McDonnell
J. E. Nicholls
C. Parsons
E. Schwimmer

To The Honourable Arthur Laing, P.C., M.P.

Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development

400 Laurier Avenue West

Ottawa 4, Ontario

In 1964 the Minister of Citizenship and Immigration asked The University of British Columbia to undertake, in conjunction with scholars in other universities, a study of the social, educational and economic situation of the Indians of Canada and to offer recommendations where it appeared that benefits could be gained.

We have the honour to submit Part 1 of the findings, concerned primarily with economic, political and administrative matters.

M. A. Tremblay
Associate Director

H. B. Hawthorn
Director

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I

INTRODUCTION AND RECOMMENDATIONS 5

II

THE CONCEPT AND GOALS OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 21

III

SOURCES AND METHOD OF THE ECONOMIC SURVEY 35

IV

THE GENERAL PICTURE 45

V

COMPARATIVE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AMONG VARIOUS INDIAN BANDS IN CANADA 65

VI

SOCIO-ECONOMIC FACTORS AFFECTING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 101

VII

SOCIO-CULTURAL FACTORS INFLUENCING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT . 119

VIII

MAJOR TRENDS AND PROCESSES OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT FOR INDIANS 135

IX

GENERAL PROSPECTS BY MAJOR REGIONS 145

X

CONCLUSIONS ON THE MAJOR ECONOMIC ISSUES 163

XI

THE CANADIAN FEDERAL SYSTEM 199

XII

THE LEGAL STATUS OF CANADIAN INDIANS 211

XIII

INDIANS AND THE FRANCHISE 255

XIV

INDIAN LOCAL GOVERNMENT 263

XV

INDIANS AND WELFARE SERVICES 312

XVI

INTER-GOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS 344

XVII

THE POLITICS OF INDIAN AFFAIRS 300

XVIII

FEDERAL AND PROVINCIAL ROLES IN INDIAN AFFAIRS 386

LOCATION OF FIELD AND OTHER RESEARCH BY STAFF - INDIAN RESEARCH PROJECT

Name	Main Topic and Region		Period
Dr. M.A. Tremblay	Education	Data collection and interviews in Ottawa and in various centres. Reserves: Maria, Restigouche, La Romaine, Mingan, Natashquan, Seven Is. (old reserve), Maliotenam, Bersimis, Pointe Bleue, Mistassini, Weytonmachie (Sanmaur), Rupert House, Six Nations, Fort Alexander, Beardy's. Agencies: Quebec, Ottawa, Toronto, Winnipeg, Saskatoon, Edmonton	1-3 days at each
Assistants:			
Mr. B. Bernier	Statistics		
Mr. L. Laforest	Statistics		
Mr. P. Charest	Ideology		
Miss J. Ryan	Education	Reserves: Cowichan #1 and #2, Comox, Inkameep, West Saanich, Sooke, Six Nations, Caradoc (Oneida, Muncey, Chipeweyan), Oak River, The Pas, Roseau River, Duck Lake, James Smith, Sweetgrass, Red Pheasant, Mosquito Stoney, Poundmaker, Little Pine. Agencies: Ottawa, Toronto, London, Winnipeg, Portage La Prairie, The Pas, Saskatoon, Duck Lake, N. Battleford, Edmonton, Vancouver, Nanaimo, Duncan, Vernon.	1 day - 6 weeks at each.
Mrs. M.J. Lythgoe Mr. M. Burbidge	Education	Reserves: Musqueam, Squamish, Dollarton. Interviews at Vancouver Vocational Institute, Burnaby Technical, U.B.C. and various high schools in Vancouver and North Vancouver.	3 months
Dr. H.A.C. Cairns Adminis-	Political various centres. trative Issues	Data collection and interviews in Ottawa and in &	
Assistants:			
Mr. M. J. Audain	Welfare		4 months
Mr. R.H. Jackson	Administration		8-1/2 months
Mr. J.E. Nicholls	Administration		4 months
Professor K. Lysyk	Constitutional & Legal Issues	Data collection and interviews in Ottawa and in various centres.	
Dr. S.M. Jamieson	Economic Survey	Data collection and interviews in Ottawa and provincial capitals.	
Assistant:			
Miss D.M. Coutts	Social dis-organization	Reserves: Squamish, Musqueam, Sarcee	3 months
Dr. F.G. Vallée	Band organization		

Name	Main Topic and Region		Period
Mr. G.B. Inglis	Social Organization	Reserves: Chilliwack, Port Simpson, Saddle Lake, Nipissing	2-10 weeks in each
Mr. D. Luth	Social Organization	Reserve: Walpole Is.	9 weeks
Mr. R.F. McDonnell	Social Organization	Reserves: Kamloops, Masset, Goodfish Lake, Dokis	2-3 weeks
Mr. G. Parsons	Social Organization	Reserves: Manitoulin, Fort Alexander	12 weeks
Mr. E. Schwimmer	Social Organization	Reserves: Mount Currie, Blood, The Pas	2-3 weeks at each
Dr. T.F.S. McFeat	Band Organization	Reserves: Christian Is., Parry Is. Work mainly with Tobique Malecites in New Brunswick.	2 summers
Mr. J.E.M. Kew	Social Organization	Reserves: Christian Is., Walpole Is., Georgia Is., Scugog, Rama, Curve Lake, Hiawatha (Rice Lake), Alderville, Saugeen	1 day to 1 week in each
Mr. B. Bernier	Social Organization	Reserves: Comox, Cowichan	2 months each
Mr. S.W. Corrigan	Social Organization	Reserve: Oak River	5 months

INDEPENDENT RESEARCH SUPPORTED IN FULL OR IN PART BY THE PROJECT

Name	Main Topic and Region		Period
Mrs. P. Koezur	Education	Bands: Mattagami, Michipicoten, Amalgamated Rainy River, Couchiching, Lac La Croix, Seine River Stangecoming, Golden Lake, Albany, Attawapiskat, Moose Factory, Moosonee, Winisk. Rat Portage, Shoal Lake #93 and #40, Wabigoon, Whitefish Bay, Manitoulin Is., Sheguiandah, Sucker Creek, West Bay, Whitefish River. Fort Hope, Long Lac #58 and #77, Nipigon, Dokis, Matachewan, Nipissing, Temagami, Whitefish Lake, Parry Sound. Fort William, Gull Bay, Red Rock, Mississauguas of Curve Lake, Batchewana (Rankin), Garden River, Serpent River, Spanish River #1 and #2. Caribou Lake (Round Lake), Lac Seul, Osnaburg (New Osnaburg, Cat Lake), Trout Lake, Six Nations, St. Regis, Mohawks of the Bay of Quinte, Walpole Is. Amalgamated.	1-28 days in each
Dr. B.S. Lane	Education	Saanich	45 days
Mr. S.W. Munroe	Social Organization	Stoney Band at Morley	continuing
Drs. LW. &.M. McL. Ames	Socialization	Iroquois school children	
Miss P. Atwell	Off-reserve Migration	Indians residing in Calgary	continuing
Miss M. Bossen	Economic Development	Ontario	3 months
Dr. H. Dimock	Economic Development	Chibougamau-Mistassini	
Prof. K. Duncan with D. Korn and P. McIntyre	Vocational Training	Oneida, Chippewa, Delaware	
Mr. L.R. Gue Education		Northern Alberta	continuing
Mr. & Mrs. W.R. Ridington	Social Organization	Prophet River	1 year

Name	Main Topic and Region		Period
Mrs. R.L.B. Robinson	Socialization & Child Care	The Pas	2 months
Miss J. Smith with Mr. R. Malpass	Socio-economic Factors	Micmac	continuing
Dr. T.F. Storm and assistants	Motivation Research	British Columbia	continuing

Consultants

Mr. A. McCallum
Dr. C. S. Belshaw
Dr. R. M. Will
Dr. D. V. Smiley
Dr. E. R. Black
Dr. E. S. Rogers
Dr. P. Carstens
Dr. R. W. Dunning
Dr. E. W. Ames
Dr. M. McL. Ames
Dr. P. Termansen
Dr. T. F. Storm
Mr. W. Duff
Dr. T. F. S. McFeat

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The Purposes and Goals of the Report

In 1964 the Minister of the Department of Citizenship and Immigration asked that a study be undertaken of the contemporary situation of the Indians of Canada with a view to understanding the difficulties they faced in overcoming some pressing problems and their many ramifications. The Director and Associate Director, Dr. Harry Hawthorn and Dr. Marc-Adélard Tremblay, accepted the charge, and were joined by Dr. Alan Cairns, Dr. Stuart Jamieson and Dr. Frank Vallée as senior members of the research group, and by a number of other scholars who have acted as consultants and field research staff, and by specialized assistants who deployed their various skills.

The problems that called for detailed and objective study were concerned with the inadequate fulfilment of the proper and just aspirations of the Indians of Canada to material well—being, to health, and to the knowledge that they live in equality and in dignity within the greater Canadian society. The Indians do not now have what they need in some of these matters arid they cannot at present get what they want in others.

In general, they want the material blessings other Canadians have in the way of incomes, houses, cars, furnishings, clothes, foods and so on, perhaps partly because they are advertised at and exhorted to want them equally with the rest of us. Their income levels and their average expenditures are rising but on the average are now far less than equal to national or regional averages and the gap is ever widening. They want and need good health but their possession of it, manifested by mortality tables and by the observation of every teacher and country doctor, is less than others possess although most Indians are more active and do more hard physical work than most Whites.

Their children are required to enter school and urged by parents and teachers to do well, but their stay there is often marked by retardation and terminated by dropping out; although ever more Indian children attend school and stay longer, the increasing national educational levels provide another receding horizon.

They call for independence from the special controls of the federal government but the management skills required to replace the sponsorship and support of the Indian Affairs Branch are at this time not often enough in evidence. More and mare Indian enterprises exist but the need for specialized assistance with the management of their resources is always growing and is now greater than ever.

What support they receive from agencies and persons other than the Indian Affairs Branch and its staff has not offered much more than local amelioration of their condition and in many regions is not immediately equipped to do much more. The public concern about the Indians and the public knowledge of their problems that would demand a change are scanty and uneven. Public knowledge does not even match public misconception. Not enough is known of the problems to create a call for their solution. In two or three cities the newspapers from time to time print a special story, of disease, neglect and poverty, of isolation or of Skid Road, and then leave the topic for months or years. A few good documentary films have not been enough to enlighten the public sufficiently so that it will clamour for the massive support that is needed.

Furthermore the knowledge of the progress that has actually been made is neither enough to encourage the Indians nor enough to develop pride of achievement in those who work with them. The public knows little of the extent of the services now given by the federal and provincial governments to Indians, and many newspapers share a general misconception that Indians are less than full citizens, and wholly and solely a federal responsibility.

The trend of the analysis offered in this Report and a basic and general goal of its recommendations is to find courses of action which will be profitable for the Indian end to improve his position to choose and decide among them.

This is not advocacy that he acquire those values of the major society he does not hold or wish to acquire. Because the issue is a burning one, and at certain junctures in the analysts it is a complex one, it is worth reiterating clearly and simply that the research group do not think that the Indian should be required to assimilate, neither in order to receive what he now needs nor at any future time. The possibility that many Indians should reject some values or institutions held dear by the Canadian majority is comprehended in the goal of the economic and political recommendations made in this Report. Ordinary respect for what values and institutions, languages, religions and modes of thought persist in their own small societies, which were once fully viable and to varying extents are so today, calls for maintenance of this principle. Almost certainly some Indians will choose not to accept what we regard as the benefits of our society and will choose instead what they regard as the benefits of theirs.

But no choice by Indians, neither to accept nor to reject Canadian values and opportunities, can have a sequel of purposeful action and successful result unless they have certain capacities to sustain it. The attractions and pressures of the major society, the changes in natural resources and the whole new social ambience now render completely helpless the person who lacks the shields and weapons of adequate schooling. rewarding employment, good health and fit housing; and the capital equipment, training and knowledge adequate for the enterprises he undertakes.

These prerequisites for proper choice and decision must be supplied in sufficient amount for them to be at all effective. Indeed inadequate aid may be worse than none at all because it will almost certainly drain off hope and courage. We may cite Chesterton: "If you think everyone should have a cow, and you only give him the first half to start with, he will only leave the first half lying around."

A further part of the basic and general goal of the Report is to review the arguments establishing the right of Indians to be citizens plus, and to spell out some of the ways in which this status can be given practical meaning The argument presents facts and legal and political decisions leading to the conclusion that the right derives from promises made to them, from expectations they were encouraged to hold, and from the simple fact that they once occupied and used a country to which others came to gain enormous wealth in which the Indians have shared little.

We discuss the possible conflict between the status of citizens plus and the egalitarian attitudes both Whites and Indians hold. On the other hand, the reverse status Indians have held, as citizens minus, which is equally repugnant to a strongly egalitarian society has been tolerated for a long time, perhaps because it was out of sight, and so out of mind of most people.

2. The Content of Part I of the Report

This is the first of two parts of the Report of the research group. The second part dealing with issues in education and with the internal organization of the reserves will be presented within a few months.

The starting point of the study was to enquire into some of the many facets of Indian well-being, to try to ascertain the reasons for its lack where that was the case, and to uncover the modes whereby well-being could be enhanced. We assumed that the justification for any continuing differential in the services provided for the Indian must be that they are better, not worse, and that they make greater contributions to his well-being than could be made by the services available to other citizens.

In this part of the Report we present our analysis and findings concerning those conditions and programs that are primarily economic, political and administrative. Some of the same concerns will be taken up again in Part II of the Report, because the educational approaches to some issues, for example, employment and economic development in general, complement the purely economic ones; while the abilities and willingness of people to take part in band council and other organizations within the reserves, also considered in Part II, are vital to the future of the governmental programs for the reserves considered here.

The topics of prosperity, poverty and welfare are examined, as is the Indian degree of participation as provincial and federal citizens, the provision of services for them, and the legal and constitutional position of their administration. Understandably, economic development and the responsibility for it receive major stress in the Report, as material well-being is inseparable in his own mind and in ours from all the issues now confronting the Indian. To arrive at the conditions for successful economic growth we have tried to understand the causes of reserve prosperity and poverty, and the reasons why the Indians on the average are falling farther and farther behind the advancing national averages in incomes and spending. To these ends we have scrutinized a number of the factors that economic theorists commonly associate with economic development and endeavoured to find out how they operate in the economic situations of the reserves. Included in our survey are a score or more of these factors on which figures were furnished by a Resources Questionnaire sent to Indian Agencies by the Branch. Some of the results have been surprising and others, though less surprising, are basic to planning. Thus we have found that such primary resource-based modes of livelihood as trapping, fishing and farming exert a negative influence on Indian prosperity. This influence is contrasted to the great contribution to prosperity made by steady wage and salaried employment off the reserve. We consider the support offered by such findings for vocational training and job placement services on a massive scale, for special assistance to those who choose to seek work off the reserve, and for creation of opportunities for industrial and other urban employment.

While an increasing number of people already work and live away from the reserves, the reserves are not vanishing. Indeed the actual number who live in them is also increasing. Bands are not seeking enfranchisement and comparatively few individuals sever connection with the reserves by enfranchisement. Because many of our findings stress the connection between economic well-being and ability to get employment of f the reserves, it has been necessary to give some consideration to the status and special needs of off-reserve Indians. While we have done this relatively briefly we adduce support for the principle that Indians can and should retain the special privileges of their status while enjoying full participation as provincial and federal citizens. By every calculation they have been disprivileged and low-cost citizens up to the present time and many services will need to be increased for them before they catch up.

Consequently it has been necessary to examine at some length the responsibility for provision of future services and to appraise the implications of the assumption that has grown over the past decade that more and more of these services will be provided by agencies of the provinces. We pay some attention to three main issues in respect to services: the relative capacities of provincial agencies and of the Branch to supply them; payment for them; and Indian willingness to claim and receive, and provincial willingness to extend the services that are now required by all other citizens.

The status of reserves as they advance in management of their own affairs is discussed in relation to these issues. We have given thought to the advantages of attaining municipal status and have presented a case for the development of a unique position for Indian reserves. There is support for the view that reserves can remain viable and distinct Indian social entities, which many Indians want them to be, while gaining the full benefits of provincial as well as federal services.

Some examination is given to the future of the Branch. We cannot share the point of view that it should or can dissolve at any near point in time or in program. The responsibility for aiding in the management of trust monies and lands has been firmly laid on it and the responsibility for sponsoring the development of band government is seen as unlikely to devolve successfully on any other agencies. In addition we offer a brief comment on the likelihood we foresee that crises will arise in Indian life in the near future, and that no organization other than Indian Affairs or perhaps the Citizenship Branch, appears to have the knowledge or readiness to assist.

A final case is made for an Indian Progress Agency, an organization whose function would be to substitute for occasional reviews of policy a regular flow of information and the application of continuous measures of advancement to the situation of the Indian.

We have undertaken in this Report to present the results of our study of what we considered the major economic, educational and political issues. The task has not been a small one, but it is only a part of what should be done. No fault attaches to the Indian Affairs Branch for any limitation of the study; the scope of this enterprise has been so wide as to be barely manageable, and others must undertake what other work must still be done. Indeed, some others are already engaged in some continuing and related research.

Some of the topics listed in the first proposals for this project have not been touched upon by us and are not at present being studied by anyone known to the authors. (Exceptions to this statement include several graduate students., whose research is likely to be of high quality but to be confined to limited topics and regions.) The neglected topics include linguistic change, and its relations to socialization and education; the operation and results of Indian friendship centres; the function and potential of organizations of local and wider scale; and Indian voting patterns and potential political influence. There are many others, some of them mentioned in the text of the Report.

There are some other topics on which work has been started without yet yielding enough to report. These include systematic studies of the psychological characteristics of the Indian child, and the possible influences of the "culture of poverty" or of "reserve culture" on the child. Partial results have been incorporated in our reporting on the schooling of the child, but work will continue, under auspices other than the Indian Research Project, for some time yet, before definite and general conclusions can be reached.

A few studies have been commenced within the past year, when it became clear what could not be incorporated in this Project. They include a study of Indians and taxation, and a preliminary or feasibility study of Indians and the law.

There are other broad research areas where as far as we know there is little present initiative and where we have made no recommendations, such as health needs and services. We know of some work that is now underway, but we are not competent to even estimate the value of a major and comprehensive study there.

Finally we have outlined in this Report some needed studies, as in the chapters on economic matters and on welfare. This may seem to be a superabundance, but contemporary administration cannot operate without up-to-date information, and the appraisals of complex situations must be continuous.

3. Contributors, Sources and Methods

A survey of the contemporary life of the Indians of Canada is a large task, and the work of a large number of people has been required for its completion. In all, more than forty scholars have been engaged in the collection of data and their analyses at some point or other in its two-and-a-half years of operation. This includes some twenty who had already planned or had begun to work independently on topics of value to the Project. Where it was needed we offered support and obtained the benefit of their findings. In addition, we obtained the judgment and knowledge which others made available as consultants, and the skills of several assistants who helped with statistical and tabulating tasks.

We wanted to base our conclusions on the fullest knowledge that could be obtained in the time at our disposal. To this end the Branch in Ottawa placed their files at our disposal and provided all the summarized data in their possession that we asked for, including the results of the comprehensive Resources Questionnaire sent out to all agencies in 1964. It is unlikely that any study has been more fortunate in the support given to it by the senior officials of an agency whose operations formed a major part of the survey.

It was necessary in addition to pursue information on a number of issues and obtain answers to a number of queries by firsthand observation and interview. While the purpose of the survey did not call for the kind of knowledge that only very lengthy and detailed observation could reveal, there were some elements of present-day Indian life that we wanted to understand more fully than could be achieved from any materials so far gathered and published. For example, we needed to know more of what accounted for the performance of Indian children in school, how effectively people in reserves played their parts in organizations like band councils and in voluntary associations, what economic goals they held, and what were the values most relevant for their political futures. Some of the desired knowledge updated and extended the findings of the study made of the Indians of British Columbia ten years earlier, and some dealt with new situations and issues that had arisen since then. To these ends we visited a large number of reserves for brief periods and also undertook studies of longer duration in a few reserves. The reserves were chosen to illuminate the issues we had in mind, as an ordinary sampling procedure would not have been suitable for the task.

The five senior members of the research staff, the Director, the Associate Director, Dr. Jamieson, Dr. Cairns and Dr. Vallée, worked part-time for two-and-a-half years, including the major parts of three summers. Miss Joan Ryan worked for three summers and most of the others for one or more. Mrs. Alice Bownick was the secretary and administrative assistant of the Project throughout, responsible for the organization of material support for the staff, organization of the office and its operations, and for the preparation of working papers and drafts and the final Report.

The writing of Part I of the Report has been undertaken mainly by Dr. Jamieson who took major responsibility for Chapters II to X and by Dr. Cairns who took major responsibility for Chapters XI to XVIII. The recommendations that emerge were discussed by all senior members and represent the majority or usually unanimous opinion.

In addition many and lengthy special and field reports have been written. Among them is one by Professor Lysyk on constitutional and legal issues, which is now the first section of Chapter XII; ones by Mr. Audain and Mr. Nicholls on welfare and administrative considerations, also used by Dr. Cairns in Chapters XV and XIV; others by Mr. Kew, Mr. Inglis, Mr. Schwimmer, Mr. McDonnell, Mr. Bernier, Mr. Luth, Mr. Corrigan; these field reports and special analyses have been extensively used and are again being employed in Part II of the Report. Others which have a bearing exclusively on the educational and organizational issues in Part II are not mentioned at this time. Most of these special and field reports contain a great deal more than has been directly used in the Report. By agreement at the beginning of the Project, these individual studies may later be used in scholarly publications, omitting personal or privileged facts, by their authors.

4. Indian Autonomy and Integration

To many Indians the maintenance of a separate culture is important; to others it does not matter, and many of the young in particular would prefer to see the past transferred to the pages of histories and ethnographies rather than have it continue into the present. But those who cherish the language, the religion, the special relationships of kin and association, the exchanges of goods, support and obligation, that mark some Indian communities today should have their right to these affirmed by any program of government rather than diminished.

The research group consider it is important that cultural autonomy not be directly lessened by any proffered political, educational or economic changes. It is equally important that individuals be given the capacity to make choices which include the decision to take jobs away from reserves, play a part in politics, and move and reside where they wish. The whole direction of the Report argues towards increasing the scope for decision by Indians and this includes a decision either to reside in separate cultural communities or to leave them temporarily or permanently.

Consequently the research on which the Report is based was not directed towards finding ways in which Indians might be assimilated, or integrated into the Canadian society without their wish to do so, and without leaving traces of their particular and special cultural identities. Nevertheless, it is our opinion that the retention of these identities is up to the Indiana. No official and perhaps no outside agency at all can do that task for them. Whether or not, and to what extent, Indians remain culturally separate depends on what it is worth to them. And it is obvious that equal services of all kinds should be offered and as high a standard of schooling as for other children be given to every Indian child unless he is to be deprived of a choice.

Nevertheless, quite apart from their intention, the effect of implementing the recommendations in the Report, like the effect of the governmental programs now in question, is not neutral towards the maintenance of autonomous Indian societies within the Canadian nation. This would be taken as obvious were it not apparent that there are those who cannot see it. The protections and controls of law, police and courts have displaced or affected in some ways the former institutions of social control, and their linked institutions of kinship and rank; the benefits of welfare services have taken over, often where the former rules for mutual aid were no longer operative; schooling has at least supplemented parental responsibilities and plays its part in the whole socialization process; jobs with regular wages and hours throughout the year have affected hunting and other subsistence activities and provide a choice which an increasing number now want to make; the use of English or French in most homes and for most of the day has effects on the Indian languages, as does the need to add words for the new items that are constantly purchased; all these new ventures change the Indian's view of himself and of his world. Where separate Indian cultural forces continue to operate, they can only do so while accepting and adjusting to these influences.

5. Indian Resources and Responsibilities

The Indian in Canada does not come empty handed to the modern situation.

Each different question about wealth and capacities requires different calculations but it is perhaps correct to say that all the land and other material resources of the Indian, estimated according to their likely potential uses and values, are outweighed by the human ones. Indians comprise nearly a quarter of a million people, a high proportion of them young, their numbers growing faster than any sectional rate of increase in Canada, and many of them accustomed to living in regions and latitudes that are seeing vital new industrial developments.

Not enough is known about the present capacities of Indians for the jobs that are to be found in these developments and for the other wage and salaried employment that we have seen to be the most vital factor in economic development. We are of the opinion that a full inventory should be made of the educational attainments, the work skills and experience, and the attitudes and motivations of people in each reserve, to show their potentialities for different kinds of work. Short of this being done, we know enough to conclude that there are many active and able people on reserves at the same time that positions are vacant elsewhere.

Other resources of the Indian are considerable but cannot be as easy to recognize, because we have heard everywhere opinions that there is a lack of Indian leadership. Actually, we see the small Indian community to be a training ground for some of the qualities of leadership and many of its members are well equipped with them. On many reserves people live close together, undertake many joint enterprises, have disputes, make some disposition of them, and afterwards go on living with the results. Goods and energy are always in short supply and differences in opinion about their allocation are therefore likely to be frequent. Those who are concerned must arrange these things and continue to see and work with one another afterwards, unprotected by the social distance that makes an impersonal decision, whether good or bad, an easy one to render in organizations within a large society. The gifts of personality, wisdom and skill needed for the continuous face-to-face management of often very complex joint affairs are significant ones and, although peace and equity do not reign continuously in Indian communities, many Indians possess and exercise these management skills in large measure. One proof is that so many communities have survived without the formal governmental institutions that are needed elsewhere to illuminate issues, arrive at decisions and compel adherence to them

It is true that the observer who looks for leadership qualities in the wrong situations on reserves will not find them. This is especially true if he expects to find Indian leadership in the specific tasks which are given to them in present-day communities. These tasks are likely to be out of tune with their techniques and values, and to be defined by outsiders, Sometimes the tasks are not actually worthwhile, or are in conflict with other necessities, or their performance requires some specialized competence, like estate management, that ordinary persons do not possess It is usually this disharmony and the external nature of the situation where outsiders call for leadership, rather than a lack of general leadership competence, that often gives an appearance of disorganization and inertia to reserve life. In most bands, leadership is quickly forthcoming for particular tasks, defined by the Indians as within their own interest and competence. This is frequently in contrast with the operation of band councils. Commonly the band council and other official leaders are beset by all the dilemmas of indirect rule and additionally by the complicated set of requirements that band enterprises must fulfil to satisfy several government agencies at the same time.

We have considered the issue of how much responsibility and of what sort falls on Indians to employ these capacities to remove the disadvantages in their present situation. A component of many of their difficulties is a high degree of dependency, that goes well beyond the dependency of the average person in today's complex welfare state because the sources of partial independence, primarily ones linked to education and to income, are so much less for the Indians. in the last instance, successful moves to lessen dependency can be made only by them But for the majority of Indians, their own actions cannot at this time meet all the needs an ordinary citizen must meet, and extra external aid is required as a supplement. The real question arises when we consider the sources of such aid. We present arguments that the Indian Affairs Branch should not withdraw services unless superior ones will be supplied by other agencies. Even where Indian Affairs Branch services can profitably be replaced by provincial ones it appears proper that Indians should first concur as is now required before Indian children transfer to provincial schools.

Some thought has been given as to whether Indian emergence into public debate and decision should come in other ways as well. The Indian Affairs Branch requests for money have been traditionally small or cut down. The Branch has never been enabled to operate with sufficient resources to do the tasks that are now seen to have been needed. In the absence of continued and widespread public pressure for expansion of the needed services, Indians themselves must supply some of the pressure We have considered their potential to do so, through Indian organizations and by exerting their influence as voters. Up to the present they have hardly been in this position, and the delegations they have sent in connection with disputes over land and Indian rights in the past have been received with courtesy but without trepidation. Today the changed climate of Canadian opinion on the rights of sectors of the plural society, along with the growing numbers of Indian voters, and the existence of special bodies like the Indian Eskimo Association, support their immediate emergence as a potent pressure group.

It is clear that whatever is done to assist it, this pressure will ultimately come from Indians. Results are needed now, however, and Indians should be aided so that they can produce them sooner rather than later. It is also clear that Indian political pressure will soon express a demand for something different from the wishes and requests of today's older Indians. The significance of the benefits conferred by the treaties and agreements seems negligible to many of the younger people today. But without requiring from Indians any more than from others that they make an unanimous decision on just what it is that they want, Indian organizations and voters should be heard and should be encouraged to press their case. In a plural society the alternative for a supine and silent segment is inevitably over-dependency and charity.

The certainty of growing and ultimately effective political pressure from Indians does not bypass the need for improvements to be made now in their situation whether or not they clamour for them. Indeed it underlines the need. The claims of a relatively well-off group can be discussed, adjusted if necessary, and granted if just. A really disprivileged group often cannot discuss its needs and when pressures finally burst out, discussion is too late.

6. Future Role of the Indian Affairs Branch

It is widely expected that the Indian Affairs Branch will wither away, its work done. Many members of the staff of the Branch share the feeling that it should wind up its business and cease to exist, that it is charged with a defined duty whose completion should see the termination of the Branch itself.

We made the study of the functions and operations of the Branch one of our central concerns, and the balance of our argument is that we cannot agree with this approach and this conclusion. The facts and their significance appear to us to lead to a very different result. For quite a long time the special needs of the Indians and the special status they should maintain will require the sponsorship and backing of the Indian Affairs Branch. It is true that other people with needs and claims that may be partly similar could benefit from the sort of sponsorship advocated for Indians but that is another issue and at first glance it would appear that no other group in Canada has the same entitlement to consideration. (This study did not include the Eskimo; however, in general their socio-economic situation is similar to that of many Indians, and it might not be far wrong to include them in the more general statements we make about the Indians.)

Our discussion of the continuing responsibilities of the Branch takes up the matter of assistance with the management of resources. This assistance may in the future be less often of a direct sort, for it is as impossible for the Indian Affairs Branch staff to control all the needed financial and other skills as it is for Indians to do so. More often effective assistance will consist of aiding the Indians to recognize when help is needed, and aiding them to seek it from the best quarters. Another responsibility may be assisting Indians to seek and obtain the benefits offered by the provinces to all provincial citizens.

Other new responsibilities are pointed out that are likely to call for assumption by the Branch. At least one of these new responsibilities can be foreseen. In the not so distant future some agency, the Indian Affairs Branch or perhaps the Citizenship Branch, will need to get set for a vast cityward movement of Indians that is now in its beginning phases. At the present rate of growth of Indian population, a critical phase of this movement could be reached in ten years' time even if the reserves continue to hold their present numbers. Problems of housing, placement, recreation and training will be intensified and in many ways will be special to Indians. The problem facing the Branch will be to aid in filling the needs that cannot be met by existing municipal and provincial agencies. Present experience, in Canada and elsewhere, indicates that no other government agency is likely to be ready for a large movement of this nature. Perhaps the role of the Branch will be to be prepared with blueprints drawn from its own special knowledge and from experience elsewhere, in the United States for example; to keep close watch on the situation and initiate action in time; to point out at once the growing needs of these new people in the city, needs that existing agencies are likely to be slower to recognize and respond to.

7. Recommendations

The following recommendations are summarized from the text of Part I of the Report. It should be emphasized that the full sense of the recommendation does not reside in this brief and abstracted form; the facts, analysis and argument in the text often modify the recommendations in significant ways.

General

(1) Integration or assimilation are not objectives which anyone else can properly hold for the Indian. The effort of the Indian Affairs Branch should be concentrated on a series of specific middle range objectives, such as increasing the educational attainments of the Indian people, increasing their real income, and adding to their life expectancy.

(2) The economic development of Indians should be based on a comprehensive program on many fronts besides the purely economic.

(3) The main emphasis on economic development should be on education, vocational training and techniques of mobility to enable Indians to take employment in wage and salaried jobs. Development of locally available resources should be viewed as playing a secondary role for those who do not choose to seek outside employment.

(4) Special facilities will be needed to ease the process of social adjustment as the tempo of off-reserve movement increases. Where possible these should be provided by agencies other than the Indian Affairs Branch. However, if other agencies prove inadequate, either due to incapacity or unwillingness, the Indian Affairs Branch must step in itself regardless of whether the situations requiring special attention are on or off the reserve.

(5) As long as Indians are deficient in the capacity for self-defence in a society of large and powerful private and public organizations they must be given supplemental consideration by government.

(6) The Indian Affairs Branch should act as a national conscience to see that social and economic equality is achieved between Indians and Whites. This role includes the persistent advocacy of Indian needs, the persistent exposure of shortcomings in the governmental treatment that Indians receive, and persistent removal of ethnic tensions between Indians and Whites.

(7) Indians should be regarded as 'citizens plus'; in addition to the normal rights and duties of citizenship, Indians possess certain additional rights as charter members of the Canadian community.

(8) The Indian Affairs Branch has a special responsibility to see that the 'plus' aspects of Indian citizenship are respected, and that governments and the Canadian people are educated in the acceptance of their existence.

(9) An autonomous public body, to be known as the Indian Progress Agency, should be established. Its main function would be the preparation of an objective annual progress report on the Indian people.

(10) Attempts to deny Indian access to basic public programs at any level of government on the grounds of an alleged incompatibility between

Indian status and the program in question should be critically investigated to ensure that the incompatibility is real and not merely imagined.

Economic Development

(11) Larger expenditures than hitherto will have to be made on reserves in order to bring their standards of housing and other facilities and services closer to White norms.

(12) A working blueprint for a viable economic development program for Indians will require a more detailed cross-country survey to provide an inventory in terms of job aptitudes and capabilities, potential income-yielding resources, job opportunities locally available, and numbers in each community requiring special training and migration to other areas. Such a survey should be carried out jointly by the Indian Affairs Branch and the new Department of Manpower, with the aid of various experts in industry and resources.

(13) An adequate program for economic development of Indians will require public expenditures on their behalf in the hundreds of millions of dollars per annum over the foreseeable future. This will entail a much larger budget and staff for the Indian Affairs Branch, as well as more assistance from other government agencies at all levels.

(14) The Indian Affairs Branch should be given every support in its announced objective of providing Indians with maximum educational and training opportunities and services. Inseparable from education and training, job placement should play a major role in a viable economic development program for Indians.

(15) Because of problems facing Indians in urban life and industrial or business employment, the Indian Affairs Branch should possess a staff of specially trained placement officers with supporting facilities, services, and personnel to fit in with the larger labour market, training and placement program developed by the Department of Manpower.

(16) Wide differences in degree of economic development among Indian bands and in the types of problems they face in different regions and localities, should be reflected in a highly flexible and variegated overall program with different priorities for different cases.

(17) People in semi-isolated bands across the Northern wooded belt face special problems of development that require special types of programs, and should receive maximum support in moving away to obtain employment in areas or urban centres offering adequate job opportunities.

(18) For those who do not choose to leave their reserves, training programs should be devised with travelling teams of instructors to train reserve residents in skills and functions that would enable them to cope better with their actual environment.

(19) Inseparable from such training, adequate provision of efficient up-to-date equipment on a liberal rental or purchase basis will be needed to enable Indians in isolated areas to exploit more effectively the resources and job opportunities available to them.

(20) More efficient and economical storage, processing, transport and marketing facilities should likewise be provided for them, either by government agencies or by private enterprises under strict governmental control on a public utility basis.

(21) Special studies should be made of various communities to explore the possibility that they could operate service or retail enterprises to provide for their own needs, rather than import such goods or services at excessive cost from far distant suppliers.

(22) Community development should be viewed as playing a distinctly secondary role for most Northern and isolated, small communities, in relation to the more pressing needs for greater capital and technical aid and special training facilities.

(23) A number of bands in farming regions are as depressed and underdeveloped as any. An economic development program on their behalf would require broadly similar measures, with the major emphasis on educating, training and placing those who wished to obtain employment off the reserve.

(24) In all but a minority of cases, no attempt should be made to encourage train and finance any large number of Indians to engage in commercial farming, even in those reserves where relatively plentiful amounts of arable land are available.

(25) Subsistence farming, where suitable land is available, should be encouraged for households who do not wish to migrate to other areas, and who have no alternative opportunities for remunerative employment.

(26) Employment of Indians in low-paid farm labour with substandard working conditions should be discouraged.

(27) The main emphasis for economic development of the more depressed and underdeveloped reserves located within, or close to, urban or industrial centres offering many potential job opportunities should focus on expanded social work programs for rehabilitation of disorganized households, intensive training programs for potential workers, and counselling work among women and mothers to assist them in the complexities of urban living.

(28) Community development should be directed as much to Whites as to Indians, in view of the many barriers which the former put in the paths of the participation of the latter.

(29) Among relatively high-income bands whose members specialize in high paid seasonal manual labour, younger workers or students should be encouraged to train for a wider diversity of jobs. The present pattern of specialization renders such communities vulnerable to serious economic reversals, in the form of unemployment arising from technological changes or cyclical downturns.

(30) For bands occupying reserve land strategically situated for industrial or commercial development of various kinds, adequate capital and technical aid should be provided to band members deemed capable of developing and operating business establishments of their own.

(31) Where Indian-owned and operated businesses are not feasible, and where it would be more economical to lease land to outside concerns, every effort should be exerted to assure that band members are given prior opportunity and training for new jobs that the tenant firms make available.

Federal Provincial Relations

(32) The general policy of extending provincial services to Indians should be strongly encouraged, although due attention must be given to merits of the case in each functional area.

(33) Where it is desirable to extend provincial services to Indians, this should be undertaken as expeditiously as possible. Otherwise, as a consequence of the growth in Indian population, the temptation to establish or maintain separate services will become more pronounced and, for technical reasons, will appear more defensible.

(34) Both levels of government must pool their legislative and fiscal resources to overcome the isolation and poverty of most Indian communities.

(35) Provincial governments should be encouraged to make the policy decision that Indians are, in reality, provincial citizens in the fullest sense compatible with those aspects of Indian status found in treaties, the special nature of Indian communities, the particular characteristics of Indian land holdings, and certain historic privileges they have long enjoyed under the Indian Act.

(36) The Indian Affairs Branch should increase its awareness of existing provincial legislation, legislative and policy changes in each province, and the possible relevance of such legislation and such changes for Indians. Where necessary the Indian Affairs Branch should make representations to ensure that there is no discrimination against Indians, either deliberately or through inadvertence.

(37) Changes in the relationships between governments and Indians in the federal system should always be sanctioned by Indian consent.

(38) It is recommended that the federal position be clarified with respect to the constitutional appropriateness of informing Indians that they have the right to reject provincial services in such areas as child welfare where there is no federal legislation occupying the field. This clarification may require some qualification to the previous recommendation.

(39) The discrepancy between the stability of the constitutional position of the federal government under "Indians and Lands Reserved for the Indians" and the marked changes possible in the significance to be attached to it must be clearly understood, especially by Indians, if the change in federal-provincial roles is not to be misperceived.

(40) The increased funds the provinces will require as they assume growing responsibilities for providing services to Indians should be provided, as quickly as agreement can be reached, within general federal-provincial fiscal arrangements rather than by an infinity of specific agreements dealing with particular functions.

(43) Federal-provincial coordinating committees should be viewed as only the formal expression of continuing contacts between the Indian Affairs Branch and provincial officials.

(42) The question of publicity should be carefully considered in all programs to which both governments have contributed either in a financial or an administrative capacity. Deliberate efforts should always be taken to give favourable reference to the role of the other government.

(43) In order to facilitate intergovernmental collaboration, restraint in the public expression of views critical of the other government should be employed.

(44) There should be constant scrutiny of coordinating committees in order to ensure that they contribute to, rather than frustrate, their stated purpose.

(45) The participants in intergovernmental groups must mute their natural desires to further the interests of their respective governments or departments, and should concentrate on the objectives which they cannot attain without each other's assistance.

(46) Good relations between governments depend on assiduous cultivation. Where recognition of this does not exist it must be fostered.

(47) In British Columbia, where the regional headquarters of the Indian Affairs Branch are located in Vancouver, steps should be taken to overcome the barriers to easy communication with provincial officials which result from distance from the provincial capital.

Political

(48) Indians should be assisted in identifying and diligently seeking redress, by all the political weapons of a free society, from the disabilities under which they presently suffer. They should make their own vigorous requests to provincial governments for provincial services they are not now receiving.

(49) The Indian Affairs Branch has, and should assert, a legitimate right to represent Indians and advocate their needs at policy-making levels of government. This is necessary to counterbalance the political underrepresentation of Indians in the overt political system.

(50) The Indian Affairs Branch should take a positive, interested, and sympathetic approach to Indian organizations and to various mixed or White groups that have an interest in Indians.

(51) Cooperative working relationships between the Indian Affairs Branch and Citizenship officials should be strengthened. Members of each branch should be continually aware of the possibilities of furthering the advancement of Indians by collaboration in public relations and in the stimulation of community concern.

(52) For its efforts to succeed, the Branch needs the support, understanding, and cooperation of Indians, the general public, provincial governments, employers, and service organizations. An effective public relations program, therefore, constitutes a basic weapon in the successful pursuit of Branch objectives.

Welfare

(53) Welfare services under provincial control should be extended to Indians as rapidly as possible.

(54) It is incumbent on governments to make the necessary arrangements to overcome quickly the discriminatory treatment which Indians still encounter in the welfare field.

(55) Emphasis should be placed on the rewards to the provinces of extending their welfare services to Indians.

(56) All possible efforts should be made to induce Indians to demand and to accept provincial welfare services.

(57) The Indian Affairs Branch, perhaps in conjunction with the Department of National Health and Welfare or the Canadian Welfare Council, should cooperate with the provinces in the employment of Indians in the welfare field. If necessary, special short training courses should be set up.

(58) Increased recognition should be given to the role which invigorated welfare services can play in improving the conditions of Indian existence.

(59) Stricter controls should be placed on relief administration by Indian Affairs Branch field officials.

(60) The administration of social assistance by band officials should only take place where it is provincial practice for small non-Indian municipalities to administer their own assistance. Exceptions to this general rule should require specific justification.

(61) Where band officials administer welfare under provincial legislation, their work should be effectively supervised and guided by provincial welfare officials.

(62) In provinces which resist extension of welfare services, bands should be permitted to complete arrangements with local private agencies for interim services.

(63) It is important to support and encourage local committees of interested citizens and

officials who address themselves to the needs of Indians in new urban settings.

(64) Where training courses in welfare administration exist, the participation of Indian welfare administrators should be sought.

(65) When Children's Aid Societies extend their services to Indian reserves, the appointment of Indians to the Boards of Directors should be sought, and consultation between the Societies and the band councils should be encouraged.

(66) The separation of relief payments from public works projects which is mandatory under the Unemployment Assistance Act, and which reflects the virtually unanimous opinion of social workers, should be as applicable on Indian reserves as in the remainder of Canada.

Local Government

(67) Continuing encouragement should be given to the development of Indian local government.

(68) The problem of developing Indian local government should not be treated in the either/or terms of the Indian Act or the provincial framework of local government. A partial blending of the two frameworks within the context of an experimental approach which will provide an opportunity for knowledge to be gained by experience is desirable.

(69) At the present time, the Indian Act, suitably modified where necessary, constitutes the most appropriate legislative vehicle for the development of Indian local government.

(70) At the present time the Indian Affairs Branch has much more experience in the handling of the governmental matters of small communities than do provincial governments. As a consequence, and given its present orientation towards community development and self-government, it is a more appropriate agency for attempting to develop self-governing political systems for the communities over which it now has jurisdiction than the provinces would be.

(71) It is not incumbent on Indians to give up their special community status for the sake of equal treatment in areas in which that status is irrelevant. On the contrary, it is the responsibility of Whites, acting through their governments, to see that the special position in which Indian communities find themselves as a result of history is made compatible with as much as possible of the provincially provided services and supports available to White communities.

(72) The partial ad hoc integration of Indian communities into the provincial municipal framework should be deliberately and aggressively pursued while leaving the organizational, legal and political structure of Indian communities rooted in the Indian Act.

(73) Indian communities, while retaining their distinct status and remaining anchored in the Indian Act, should be encouraged to develop the same kind of relationship with provincial departments and with developing forms of regional government as would exist if they were not Indian communities.

(74) Reserves should be treated as municipalities for the purpose of all provincial and federal acts which provide grants, conditional and unconditional, to non-Indian municipalities, except where the application of a specific act conflicts with the provisions of Section 87 of the Indian Act or is unacceptable to the Indians concerned.

(75) The Indian Affairs Branch should establish a Local Government Bureau to provide a focus for the important function of developing local government on reserves.

(76) The Local Government Bureau should master the relevant provincial legislation which can be operated through reserve institutions, and

should act in a middleman capacity between Indian communities and provincial officials until sufficient mutual involvement has occurred to put the contacts on a self-sustaining basis.

(77) The Local Government Bureau should provide Indian bands with information on the various grants, programs and advisory services for which they will be eligible if provincial governments prove responsive to the need for extending their services and programs to Indian communities.

(78) A review should be undertaken of all provincial legislation which operates through local governments, with an evaluation of the extent to which the application of such legislation to Indian communities would be compatible with their special position as reserves, an evaluation of the seriousness of Indian exclusion, and the devising of formulae by which Indian communities could be brought into the same kind of relationships of a financial and advisory nature with provincial governments as are enjoyed by their White neighbours.

(79) The Local Government Bureau should provide a roving inspection and advisory service for Indian local governments.

(80) Indian representation should be aggressively pursued for various boards, commissions, and intermunicipal bodies which deal with matters on an area basis and often encompass several general purpose local governments within their jurisdiction.

(81) Indian and Branch participation should be sought and obtained in the various local government associations which exist in every province and at the national level.

(82) The creation of a band civil service should be fostered. Small bands should be encouraged to cooperate with nearby bands in the employment of one or more civil servants which they could not separately finance or employ.

(83) A basic function of band civil servants should be the fostering, cultivation, and development of positive relationships with the external world of officials and political leaders who possess services and expertise which could be beneficially employed by Indian local governments.

(84) As administrative competence improves at the local level, the role of the Superintendent must change accordingly. His role should become essentially advisory.

(85) Indians must increase their understanding of the local government procedures of their White neighbours, and of the network of relationships which White communities have with a variety of provincial government departments. To this end, provincial governments should be approached to sponsor and encourage programs to increase Indian familiarity with the practices of White local governments and the relations they have with the provincial government. For example, Indian participation should be sought and welcomed in provincial training and refresher courses for local government officials. The provinces should actively support a program for the placement of Indian trainees in White local governments for varying periods of time. White municipalities contiguous to reserves should be actively encouraged to display an interest in the common and special needs of their Indian neighbours.

(88) An invigorated educational program should be undertaken to ensure that band councils have a good understanding of the Indian Act, particularly those sections which refer to the functions and powers of band councils.

(87) All administrative practices and procedures which inhibit quick responses to band requests for information) or for approval of a specific course of action, should be reviewed with the objective of minimizing delay.

(88) Bands must be encouraged to develop their own independent sources of revenue, perhaps from the local citizens of the reserve, to avoid exclusive reliance on external sources of funds.

(89) The British Columbia experiment of forming District Councils, organized on an agency basis, to which bands may choose to send delegates to discuss matters of common concern should be considered in terms of its suitability for extension to other regions.

(90) Continuing attempts should be made to break down the isolating effects of the trespass provision of the Indian Act.

(91) The local government functions and the function of managing Indian assets should be separated on an experimental basis in order to overcome the serious contradictions which the present blending of this duality of function entails. The Indian thus would have one status as a citizen of a local community and a separate status as a shareholder in the corporate assets of the band.

CHAPTER II

THE CONCEPT AND GOALS OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

It has become increasingly evident in recent years, as the subject has come into greater public attention, that the majority of the Indian population constitutes a group economically depressed in terms of the standards that have become widely accepted in Canada. They are not sharing equally with others in proportion to their numbers in the material and other gains, satisfactions and rewards that an affluent and rapidly growing national economy has to offer. True enough, their level of material welfare, as measured simply by average per capita real income from all sources, and their level of formal education, are probably higher than they have ever been, and a minority among them have had successful careers in various lines of work. Nonetheless, in comparison to the much larger gains in these and other respects that the majority of the non-Indian population has enjoyed in recent decades, there are indications that the gap between the two groups has been widening.

In the comparatively simple economy of a few generations ago, when the major part of the population depended on farming supplemented by unskilled wage labour, in many communities the levels of living and styles of life of Indians and Whites were not strikingly different. Today there is the growing danger that a majority of Indians together with a small minority of Whites may become a more-or-less permanently isolated, displaced, unemployed or under-employed and dependent group who can find no useful or meaningful role in an increasingly complex urban industrial economy.

The Indian Affairs Branch is now attempting to formulate a program that will encourage the more rapid development of Indians and it proposes to attack the problem on several fronts – governmental and political, educational, social and cultural, as well as economic.

The goal of economic development seems crucial in any such program for two related reasons:

1. The receipt of income depends primarily on gainful employment, and income largely determines the degree to which people can enjoy the goods or facilities and participate in the various types of meaningful facilities and activities that Canadian society has to offer. Economic rewards are an essential means to other ends.

2. Gainful employment in jobs socially defined as useful and productive still remains the most important single field of activity for the vast majority of people. It is the main tie that links the adult with his society and that gives him a sense of status and identity. Prolonged or permanent unemployment, poverty and dependency, among individuals and groups, tend to become increasingly demoralizing and give rise to a host of costly and destructive social and psychological problems.

This is not to say, however, that economic development is or should be the key or primary goal in any program for Indians or that it is separate and distinct from other aspects of social life. On the contrary, as this study will emphasize, there is every evidence to indicate that the economic development of Indians depends not only on what have traditionally been viewed as economic factors, but on a variety of political, educational, social and cultural variables. Substantial change and progress in these latter aspects may, indeed, be needed before any substantial economic development can be achieved.

Economics of Development

The broad ultimate goal that the Indian Affairs Branch holds on behalf of Indians in Canada is in one major respect similar to that of the advanced nations in relation to the developing countries – that is, a long-range program of balanced economic and social development to approach equality in levels of material well-being and welfare between the two groups.

Since World War II there has been a widening gap in per capita income and welfare between the advanced and developing nations. Economic development on a national or international scale today requires vast accumulations of capital and expenditures for capital equipment, research, education and social welfare to cope with increasingly complex production techniques and social problems -- expenditures on a scale which only the already well-developed, high-income nations can afford. The developing nations, characteristically, are faced with rapid population increase and bare subsistence levels of income that leave little or nothing available for development. It is widely acknowledged by prominent experts and observers of the international scene that foreign aid on a large scale, intensive crash program will be necessary to arrest or reverse this trend.

The same tendency is apparent, on a smaller scale, within Canada and the U.S.A. as between Indians and Whites. As discussed further below, further economic participation of Indians in White society seems the only feasible path by which to achieve substantial improvement in economic status. The objective of increased participation would seem to call for a large and intensive crash program in the near future. The difficulties and costs of the program seem likely to increase sharply in the years ahead, for two main reasons:

1. Owing to extremely high and rising rates of natural increase, Indians are increasing in numbers more rapidly than their local resources and traditional means of livelihood can support. The income gap between Indians and Whites thus tends to widen year by year (except for the pockets of unemployable and dependent low-income Whites, in urban as well as sub-marginal rural areas, who have virtually ceased to play any effective role in the economy); and

2. There tends to be an increasing gap, likewise, between the skills that Indians have acquired, and those required by the developing national economy, which in the process of development becomes more demanding of social and community organization as well as of job requirements. In brief, it becomes increasingly difficult for the rural migrant or untrained urban worker, Indian or other, to get a foothold in the economy by starting in as an unskilled or semi-skilled labourer in urban industry and business.

There are, however, some obvious and significant differences between the two cases of the Indians and the developing nations:

1. Because of the magnitude of the problems involved, developing countries face definite limits in the amount of capital and technical or other aid available from the advanced nations. This creates difficult problems of choice for donors and recipients alike – problems of allocation to produce optimum results in terms of contributions to economic growth and welfare. These, in turn, involve estimates of potential revenue among various agricultural, industrial or commercial projects, and even more difficult, comparisons of the welfare

effects of money put into revenue-producing industrial projects as compared to non-revenue producing educational, health or social welfare projects.

A government-sponsored and financed developmental program for Indians, by comparison, would face far less complex problems of allocation. For one thing, because of the relatively small size of the Indian population (hardly more than 1 per cent of the total Canadian population) a developmental program of unprecedented scope and liberality would still involve only a relatively minor proportion of the national income and of dominion and provincial revenues. The supply of funds and personnel for such a program would be essentially limited only by political considerations and public attitudes rather than by basic technical, physical or financial constraints,

It follows, therefore, that one major problem to be faced in encouraging greater economic development of Canada's Indian population is to encourage changes in political and public attitudes and policies that will bring about the kind of response required.

2. A major datum facing any program of aid for developing nations is that of nationalism, with all that the word implies. Most such nations are willing to receive external aid only to the degree that it does not jeopardize (or appear to, at least) their national sovereignty and independence, the maintenance of their distinct cultures, and valued institutions and customs. Nationalism often provides a strong drive for economic development, but at the same time may tend to revive and strengthen institutions and attitudes that frustrate the inculcation of attitudes, behaviour patterns and techniques necessary for such development. Generally, the smaller the nation (in terms of population, land area, size and diversity of resources), the more specialized it will be in its economy, the more dependent on external trade and aid, and therefore the less able it will be to achieve the double objectives of economic development and national independence.

Similar desires to maintain a sense of separate ethnic identity appear to a limited extent among Indians on this continent. In the nature of their situation, however, they are too small a proportion of the population, and most of the communities in which they reside are too small, scattered, and limited in resources, to provide viable economies that could support anything like independent societies, To achieve levels of economic and social development comparable to those of Whites would involve such heavy dependence on external aid and subsidy and such an intensive degree of participation in the White-controlled economy, as to make inconceivable any such degree of independence. Any substantial degree of economic development of Indians in Canada will require a far greater degree of participation in the Canadian economy and polity than has been achieved to date,

It should be stressed at the outset, however, that such participation does not require assimilation and loss of identity. Some Indians, in the process of involvement in our complex urban-industrial environment, are likely to organize and identify themselves increasingly with self-consciously Indian institutions and activities established on a larger-than-local regional or national basis. At the same time, unlike other minorities, Indians do have an assured status base in the form of reserve communities to which they have the option of returning, and these provide a stronger base for maintaining their identity than most other minorities enjoy. While the requirements for economic development will require larger numbers and proportions of Indians leaving their reserves to become established elsewhere, in most reserve communities a minority, at least, are likely to remain. There is no law or regulation, in existence or in prospect, which can force Indians to leave their reserve communities. The most that is recommended here is to provide financial aid and other support for the large and increasing numbers who wish to do so, where such measures are demonstrably the best means for improving their economic status and welfare generally. Meanwhile, for those Indians who remain in their reserve communities, a secondary but nonetheless important part of any economic development program on their behalf will require large and increasing investments in them, to provide facilities and services of a standard generally accepted as a norm for comparably-sized White communities.

The all-important factor in this whole discussion is the matter of choice. Poverty, generally, provides few, if any, options to the individual, particularly where, as with most Indians, it is associated with dependence upon external authority for relief, in cash or kind, and other services essential for survival. Indian identity has come to be associated with a special relationship with government, in which Indians have been guaranteed protection and maintenance at low subsistence levels on their own reserves.

Economic development should seek, primarily, to provide facilities and services that would widen the range of choices available to individual Indians, e.g. to work full-time, part-time, or not at all; to be relatively well paid or poorly paid; to leave their reserves to take advantage of higher income opportunities, or to stay; and for those who leave, a choice to lose their distinct ethnic identities in complex urban-industrial environments, or, alternatively, to assert them aggressively using what organized bargaining power they can muster as a separate pressure group.

In purely economic terms, an affluent society provides at least two choices to most individuals, namely, to be affluent or to be poor (and a significant minority of White society, who reject the activities and characteristics required to become affluent, opt for poverty). For the minority relegated, by prevailing circumstances beyond their control, to the ranks of the poor – and most Indians are at present in this category –no such choice is available. The main argument for the economic development and integration of Indians, in brief, is to provide the opportunities of making the kinds of choices that most other Canadians are entitled to.

Economic Development

As the vast body of literature that has been written on the subject since World War II makes all too evident, economic development is a difficult subject to define meaningfully, let alone to measure and compare by degree among regions or countries, The same applies in attempting to compare degrees of development among different Indian communities in Canada. The measures here considered are:

1. Accumulation of Wealth-Ownership Per Capita

Per capita ownership of wealth has several obvious limitations as a criterion of economic development. Development, as such, has or should have, the connotation of a dynamic, on-going process. Wealth or ownership of capital, as such, is static, Only if the wealth is being actively used in conjunction with labour, resources, and technology to achieve continued growth, can it be considered as any accurate sort of index of development. Among Indian bands there is the special limitation that some of the richest of them, as measured by individual and collective ownership of wealth (in the form of band funds) have achieved this status primarily by the lease or sale of resources to others.

2. Per Capita Real Income

The most widely used single index for comparing the degree of economic development among nations is that of per capita real income, i.e. the volume of goods and services per head of population, allowing for differences in prices and exchange rates

This index likewise has some obvious limitations. A relatively small but untrained or unskilled population that has the good fortune to occupy a wealth of resources having a large demand in outside markets may enjoy a higher average per capita real income than a more skilled and industrious population that controls limited resources, Thus, the Sheikdom of Kuwait, on the Persian Gulf, has one of the highest average real incomes of any country. Or again, by this measure alone, Canadians would be deemed more economically developed than Englishmen, Germans, or Japanese (indeed, four or five times more than the latter). Such limitations would apply with special force to Indians, as there is fully as extreme a diversity in resources owned by, or accessible to, various Indian bands as there is to the nations of the world. There is wide inequality among Indian bands likewise with regard to ownership of band funds and the receipt of band revenues. Finally, a large part of the income of many Indians is derived from external subsidies or relief, mainly because of inadequate economic development.

3. Per Capita Real Income from Gainful Employment

The only adequate single index for measuring economic development among Indians in Canada would seem to be that of per capita real income from gainful employment, for it measures the results of active, income-producing participation of individuals and groups in the economy, rather than of living off the proceeds (sales, interest, rents and royalties) of ownership of capital or resources. In some cases (as with the Sarcee and Sampson Bands in Alberta) such income may itself enable and induce Indians to avoid gainful employment and thus impede their economic development beyond a limited level.

4. Conflicting Models: Specialization vs Diversification

Measuring economic development by the single index of per capita real income from gainful employment necessarily has some limitations of its own.

(a) In the first place, a more significant index of comparative economic development among Indian bands may in some respects be the average annual earnings of the employed members of the band. The per capita income of a population depends significantly on a number of variables. For one thing, a few high income bands have had birth rates well below the generally high average for Indians since World War II, so that a smaller proportion of their population is in the unproductive, non-earning younger age groups (under sixteen). Again, there are wide differences in labour participation rates (particularly for women) in the population of working age (sixteen to sixty-four years inclusive). And finally, some bands whose full-time working members earn relatively high annual incomes, also have a relatively large fraction of unemployed or under-employed adult males. However, all of these are variables that contribute to or obstruct economic development. Average per capita real income, as a comparative index or measure, can reasonably be taken to include these variables.

(b) There is a more important objection to the narrower definition. On the international scene, developed and developing countries differ sharply in their industrial and occupational structures as well as in per capita incomes. Characteristically, the highest income, most economically advanced nations have a small and decreasing percentage of their population engaged in agriculture and other primary industries, a sizable but static or slowly increasing percentage in manufacturing or secondary production, and a large and rapidly growing percentage in the tertiary fields, e.g. sales and services, particularly in the professional category, and finance. They are also characterized by generally high educational levels, ,a consequent low and decreasing participation rate of younger age groups (below eighteen or twenty years of age) and a high and rapidly increasing participation rate of women (particularly married women) in the labour market. Developing economies contrast with this pattern on virtually every point. Most of their populations are engaged in primary production, and their economies usually specialize in a few staples in the primary category for sale in outside markets; they have customarily low educational levels, people go to work at a young age, and most women are engaged in work mainly for domestic consumption. Business, professional and managerial personnel comprise only a very small fraction of the labour force.

Should comparable models be used in comparing economic development among Indian communities, rather than the one simple index of per capita real income from gainful employment? Would there be a high degree of correlation in any case, between the per capita incomes of bands and the degree of diversification of band members in various specialized jobs? The picture appears mixed in this regard, as the analysis that follows will bring out.

The lowest income and most economically under-developed bands exhibit, on a small scale, much the same characteristics as do developing nations. This is particularly the case among the more isolated bands along the whole large northern wooded belt of the country, whose populations specialize to a high degree in hunting, fishing, and trapping. It is also true of numerous southern bands whose adult workers are largely marginal or sub-marginal farmers or casual farm labourers.

Among the most economically developed bands at the other extreme, are some large Indian communities in Southern Ontario and Quebec whose members are employed in a variety of occupations – farming, skilled and semi-skilled factory jobs, clerical labour, and a few business or professional positions and proprietorships .[1]

There are important exceptions to this generalization, however. Among the highest income bands – in fact, the bands whose working adults receive the highest average annual earnings – are several in which a large minority or a majority, of adult male workers specialize in certain types of relatively high-paid skilled or semi-skilled work, some of them in the primary industries and some in secondary industries. Among these are the Caughnawagas in Quebec, who specialize in high steel construction, and the Skidegate, Squamish, Sheshaht and Nimpkish, all in British Columbia, who specialize in such fields as long-shoring, logging and fishing. With the exception of Nimpkish, these bands generally have a smaller percentage of their adult population engaged in business enterprises, professional and clerical work, and a smeller proportion taking post-high school or university education, than numerous lower income bands in Central Canada and in British Columbia.

---

[1] There is, perhaps one notable type of exception to the generalizations in this section concerning the inability of minority ethnic or cultural groups to survive as viable economies, when established in relatively small communities having, at most, a few thousand inhabitants. The Hutterites are, perhaps, the most notable example that would seem to disprove the thesis. They have managed to retain relatively diversified and self-contained local economies, together with a language and a distinct set of religious beliefs, values, customs, modes of dress and styles of life that differentiate them rather sharply from the norms of the larger society that surrounds them. This ability to survive as a small, distinct minority group depends, however, on a number of special factors, such as:

1. The rigorous process of rejection that characterizes the membership of certain religious sects;
2. A strongly imbued, rigidly interpreted and enforced, religious doctrine;
3. The top priority given to farming, supplemented by ancillary handicrafts, as the necessary way of life and economic base of a separate religious-cultural community, to enable it to maintain the relatively high degree of independence and self-sufficiency needed for survival;
4. A closely integrated set of beliefs, values, and rules to support such an economy (e.g. idealization of work as such, particularly farm work; austerity and restriction in food, dress and recreation and other forms of consumer expenditure; etc.); and
5. A highly centralized and authoritarian system of internal government to assure compliance with community norms and restrictions deemed necessary for survival.

At various times, over the past several decades in Canada and the U.S.A., numerous sectarian minorities, having most or all of the characteristics, objectives and motivations outlined above, have attempted to establish and maintain themselves as independent, more or less self-sufficient cultural and economic entities. Few have managed to survive, despite intense and at times violent efforts to do so. (The Doukhobor sect, particularly the more fundamentalist Sons of Freedom wing, is a notable example..)

Indian bands for the most part, lack practically all of the qualities outlined above.

The possibilities of Indian bands achieving and maintaining viable local economies comparable to those of the Hutterites, therefore, seem very limited.

In the nature of the case, the criteria for measuring economic development, and the most feasible program or strategy for encouraging it, are not, and cannot be, the same for native Indian communities as for nations. Modern nations – even the smallest and those most dependent on foreign trade – are relatively large and diversified entities in which the people, in the aggregate, work, produce and sell most of the output of goods and services among themselves. No nation depends on external trade for more than one-half –and very few depend on it for more than one-quarter – of their total income. Therefore, economic growth of a nation depends upon developing an increasing diversity of specialized employments and outputs of goods and services.

By contrast, Indian bands in Canada, even the largest, are far too limited in population and resources to achieve anything approaching self-sufficiency. Their level of economic development depends essentially on their relationship with, and participation in, the external White-controlled economy.

One exception among Indians, in a sense, might be the few remaining partially nomadic bands that still derive their livelihoods primarily from hunting and fishing, and to a lesser degree, trapping. Even here, however, they are not independent or self-sufficient, in so far as they depend on deriving their livelihoods from externally-owned Crown lands rather than from their own reserves.

Among Indian bands there are different paths and different strategies for achieving economic development. For some, it involves specialization, and f or others, diversification, depending on the productive economic relationships that can be developed with the Canadian economy in each area. For it is a cardinal tenet of international and interregional and even local trade, that the maximum economic advantage for the individual, the group or the community, lies in specializing in employment or output for sale in the outside market in those fields in which one has a comparative advantage, buying from outside those things that would cost more to produce at home, hiring the services of others to do jobs that one cannot do as well or as cheaply for oneself, and leasing to others resources that would yield more income than could be derived from developing them on one's own.

This is more than an academic question. It has important implications for any Indian Affairs Branch program designed to speed up the economic development of Indians. How should financial and other resources be used so as to get the maximum (or optimum) results in the shortest time? Should the math expenditures of money, time and effort be devoted to training and encouraging Indians to specialize in certain occupations for which they have special capacities and preferences, for which openings are most easily available, and which offer the prospects of adequate, though limited, returns in money and status which would yield highest average, per capita real income in the foreseeable future? Or should the major effort be devoted to encouraging all Indians as individuals to develop to their full capacities, aspiring to a wide range of occupations that differ widely in education, skill and personality requirements, and that offer widely unequal returns in income and status and, on the average, perhaps lower per capita incomes than would the first pattern? In brief, should the main emphasis be placed on encouraging diversity rather than specialization in the role that Indians are to be trained and encouraged to play in the economy?

For various reasons gone into more fully below, the weight of evidence would seem to favour specialization during the foreseeable future at least. Maximum diversity may be more desirable ultimately, but in the nature of the case it would seem slower in achievement and results.

This argument should not be carried to the extreme, of course. It is a matter of relative emphasis. Individual Indians who show special aptitudes or interests for higher academic or technical education, or for clerical, business or other types of jobs that differ from those engaged in by the relatively well-paid minority, or majority of adults in the band, should be given every encouragement and aid to make full use of their talents and opportunities.

Balance in Economic and Social Development

A very considerable change has occurred during the past few decades in the philosophy of economic development and social change, and in views as to appropriate government policies, as a number of comprehensive studies have brought out (e.g. Report on the World Social Situation, United Nations, N.Y., 1961).

i. Up to the late nineteenth century, the prevailing theory of economic development was essentially exploitative. Development required the accumulation of capital, which in turn required widening inequality of incomes. Some by virtue of superior strength, cunning or fortune at birth, got a larger share of the national income, and their fortunes made capital available for productive investment. Others, getting less, had to suffer poverty and deprivation as the price of progress. The Marxists and the more conservative laissez-faire economists were agreed on this point at least.

ii. A growing modification of these views developed with theories of, and movements for, reforms of various kinds. There was growing demand for legislation and welfare programs that would put some sort of floor under the incomes of the weak and the poor and protect them against exploitation. Economic development, or industrialization in the broad sense, was viewed by many as retrogressive from a social welfare point of view, because of many unhealthy developments it led to – disorganization of community and family life, child labour, urban slums and congestion, and delinquency. Such social problems seemed most apparent when industrialization was introduced or superimposed by one cultural group upon another.

A rising expenditure by government for social welfare measures has thus come to be justified as necessary to cover the social costs of economic development and industrialization. Implicit in this view, however, is the assumption of competition and therefore a problem of choice, between economic (or revenue-producing) and non-economic expenditures. Welfare facilities and services, being non-revenue-producing, have to depend on tax revenue extracted from the revenue-producing sectors (predominantly private enterprise).

iii. Further shifts in emphasis have occurred since World War II with the growing interest in social and cultural variables directly affecting the rate of economic development; it is expressed in such phrases as "balanced economic and social development", or "balance and integration of economic and social development". No neat theoretical model or consistent body of theory has been formulated to provide firm guidelines for policy. It consists, rather, of a practical formulation of policy based on the following assumptions which come from considerable past experience:

(a) Economic development, or industrialization, does not necessarily constitute a sole or major cause of social disorganization and costly social problems. The most serious social problems today seem to be occurring on the most massive scale in those regions or countries in which economic development is failing to occur rapidly enough to meet the needs and aspirations of rapidly growing populations.

(b) Expenditures for social development in the broad sense – for education, physical and mental health, etc. – should not, therefore, be considered simply as costs (or debits) to be measured against the gains (or credits) that economic development makes

> possible. As the report of an expert committee of the United Nations put it recently: "Instead of treating social policy as a housemaid whose function is to tidy up human suffering and insecurity left in the wake of economic development, social objectives should be built in on an equal footing with economic objectives into comprehensive social and economic planning." (Op.cit., p. 23).

This postulates, in effect, two related views:

1. What adequate measures of social control and welfare undertaken in conjunction with economic development could prevent many socially disorganizing effects of such development, and reduce the costs of having to deal with various long-range social problems that would otherwise accompany it; and

2. That on the more positive side, expenditures of sufficient amounts, and of the right kinds (difficult as these are to judge) are or can be among the most important contributors to economic development, just as much as, or more than, capital expenditures for machinery, roads, irrigation projects, and the like. Indeed, as numerous ill-founded experiments since the war have shown, investments in real capital tend to mean pouring money down the drain unless there has been sufficient prior training and preparation of the recipient population to make adequate use of such facilities.

Economists have been paying increasing attention to the economics of human investment since the War, and have been coming to the conclusion that in many situations, the percentage rate of return (or percentage growth in output and income per dollar of investment) is greater when put into human capital than into "real" (or physical) capital.

Expenditures on education are a case in point. Some economists present a convincing case to argue that rising standards of education of the labour force, expenditures for research, the resultant accumulation of knowledge and its application in technology have, in the aggregate, accounted for the largest part of the increased productivity that the advanced western economies (as well as the U.S.S.R. and Japan) have experienced in recent decades.

Some of the same considerations apply to a lesser extent, probably, to other types of expenditures for social development. Programs that improve the housing, health and nutritional standards of a population should be expected to pay off in greater productivity and output made possible by greater energy, lower rates of absenteeism, etc. Improvements in mental health and family life through provision of better services should likewise pay off in better morale and stronger work motivations.

Such observations cannot be taken simply at face value, of course. The types of program and their timing in relation to one another, as well as the amounts spent on them, may be crucial. An educational program that stressed ancient virtues, or the classical values of an aristocratic elite, might generate a contempt for manual work, technical expertise, and business enterprise of the very kinds that an under-developed people most need to advance economically. Again, medical and health programs carried out on their own, without prior preparation for their end results, have contributed in many cases to rates of population growth that have outrun economic development, thus in the long run reducing rather than improving the sum total of human welfare.

Birth Control and Economic Development

The above suggests, of course, that programs for the effective control of population growth are, or should be, among the most important in any serious planning for balanced economic and social development. Indeed, such economists as H. N. Villard have presented a convincing case supported by sound statistical estimates, that a large investment of foreign capital in a really massive campaign for reducing birth rates would increase the per capita real income of such countries as India or Pakistan considerably more than would an equally large investment in major capital projects.

Here, again, generalizations that are valid when applied to nations having to depend primarily upon their own resource development, capital accumulation and acquisition of technological know-how, are not always applicable to a group like native Indians, who comprise a minute fraction of the total Canadian population, and whose economic development, as noted, must depend primarily upon their greater involvement in wage and salaried employment in the larger economy. For the following reasons, among others, there would seem to be few, if any, valid grounds for recommending a concerted birth control campaign among native Indians as part of any overall program for their economic development:

(1) It would be unwise and discriminatory to single out any minority for a special birth control campaign simply on the grounds that it is poor and has a high rate of population growth;

(2) Most economists in Canada maintain that the country is under populated, and that a larger population would encourage economic growth and higher per capita output and income generally. Government policy has been based on this assumption, since World War II at least, and vigorous efforts have been made to encourage rapid population growth by such varied measures as family allowances and subsidized immigration.

(3) Native Indians comprise hardly more than 1% of the total Canadian population. While their rate of natural increase is almost double that of Whites, their total impact in numbers cannot be deemed to constitute any conceivable threat of over-population in the foreseeable future.

(4) Among Indians themselves, in the aggregate, the evidence available (as outlined in Chapter IV) indicates that a high rate of natural increase is not an important factor contributing to their generally low state of economic development. Some of the most developed bands (as measured by per capita real income from gainful employment) are among the largest in population, and have among the highest rates of natural increase; and vice versa.

Indians in some parts of Canada face a population (or over-population) problem in only one very limited sense – that is, in various bands the population has outrun the capacity of locally available resources and job opportunities to support them, so that they are suffering declining real incomes from gainful employment. Such communities in reality, however, represent not problems of over-population that call for birth control measures, but rather, shortcomings of government policy and public attitudes that have failed to provide the facilities and services necessary to give Indians the education, training, motivation and mobility needed to enable them to develop economically.

All this, of course, does not rule out the provision of birth control aid and information for family planning to Indian individuals or households any more or less than for members of other groups.

Welfare and Economic Development

Perhaps the outstanding example of unbalance and poor timing in economic and social development on the North American continent, may have been the administration of relief and social welfare. Ready provision of welfare grants and ancillary services to unemployed and indigent families may have encouraged people to remain in idleness rather than to look actively for work or to stay on a job. The Indian Affairs Branch has come in for particular criticism on this score although much of the criticism has been unfair and misguided. A far larger proportion of Indians than of Whites depends on relief at least part of the year and in some of the more depressed bands relief, together with other social security benefits such as family allowances and old age pensions, provide more income to the population than do their earnings from gainful employment.

Again, with the wisdom of hindsight, it is now apparent that a vigorous, well-designed and comprehensive program of economic development should have preceded, or at least accompanied, the provision of more liberal welfare or social security benefits. For, among a people who have become more or less accustomed to a low subsistence level of living, subsistence from welfare can permanently replace subsistence from work (particularly where, as in the case of most under-developed Indian bands, the work available for the members is often arduous, disagreeable, risky and low-paid, as in trapping, and in unskilled farm labour and construction jobs). Economic development when attempted under these circumstances, then, faces special difficulties because of widespread apathy, resignation and lack of motivation among the people it is attempting to develop.

In an attempt to counteract and reverse these tendencies, a new program of community development is being launched by the Indian Affairs Branch as well as by several provincial government departments. The central idea of this program is to help people to help themselves, to arouse and mobilize the latent or unused energies of people in various communities by inducing them, by one means or another, to undertake projects on their own that will contribute to their economic or social betterment, rather than relying increasingly on the government to provide a minimum of subsistence and other essential services. The various roles, requirements, and relationships between economic development and community development, respectively, will be discussed at greater length later in this study.

Integration and Economic Development

To repeat, greater economic development for Indians in Canada is not an end in itself. It is essentially a means to other ends, a means by which they may participate more fully and effectively in the larger society and live a fuller, richer, more meaningful and satisfactory life. The larger goal of rehabilitation and development programs for Indians is their more successful participation in Canadian society.

The economic development of Indian communities in Canada because of their highly dependent position, rests essentially on the relationships which their members develop with the larger external society. Presumably, then, the more fully and actively that Indians participate in various facets of Canadian society, the greater their level of economic development should be. More specifically, if a high proportion of a band"s members participate in various economic, political, social or other activities in Canadian society, and on a more or less equal competitive and cooperative basis with Whites, this would develop, or at least indicate, levels of motivation, skills and technical knowledge that would tend to raise the general average of real income above that of bands that remain comparatively isolated, economically and socially.

Such conclusions are not necessarily valid, however. A high proportion of band members in good jobs off the reserve might mean that a community is drained of its pacesetters while the residue remains economically and culturally depressed and impoverished. Or, by contrast, a geographically or socially isolated band could enjoy a relatively high level of per capita real income from gainful employment if it controlled or had access to high revenue-producing resources which members of the band were able to utilize effectively without participating actively with the outside.

Again, there is a question of the pattern of participation of Indians, as there is with economic development. Two Indian bands could be said, in a sense, to be similar in this respect if an equal proportion of their members of various age groups participated equally intensively and in comparable status levels, in organizations or activities in which Whites also participated. But the pattern of such participation, and its effects upon Indians and Whites alike, could conceivably be markedly different. Here again, as with economic development (and necessarily interacting with it), we may oversimplify the picture by setting up the two models of specialized and diversified participation.

The position was taken earlier that more rapid economic development for Indiana could be achieved, in most cases, if the major aid and encouragement were given them to specialize in types of jobs which were most open and available

to them, where such employment was reasonably well paid and met the special capabilities or interests of a sizable minority, or majority, of Indian members
– this as against attempting to train and prepare Indians for every conceivable type of employment that might be available to them sometime in the future.

One possible objection to the first alternative is that if Indians were to fit into the economy in a highly specialized role as predominantly semiskilled or skilled manual labour, their social status or image might tend to be fixed at a certain level, and their ability to participate in numerous types of social and other institutions would be correspondingly limited. If Indians were trained and prepared for a more diversified economic role, even if it meant a lower per capita real income on the average, it might render them better able to participate in a variety of organizations and activities.

As against this, there is the major fact that, in our society, money income is still the major means of obtaining the satisfactions to be derived from the various facilities and activities that it has to offer. By and large, the greater the money income per capita of an Indian band, the greater will be the possibility of participation by its members in one activity or another in Canadian society and as stressed earlier, a specialized economic role by the majority, or a substantial minority, does not preclude giving every aid and encouragement to specially promising individuals to enter other types of jobs that offer higher rewards in income and prestige.

The image that a White community has of Indians would probably be improved as much by one or two outstanding members of a prestigious profession or other occupation, as by a larger number of moderately successful or mediocre aspirants or practitioners. Or, as another pattern, a band, the majority of whose adults are self-supporting semi-skilled workers is likely to create a better image than one in which a minority achieves special status in the White community, while a large minority or a majority remains in the ranks of the casual unskilled or dependents on welfare.

Again, the pattern of social, as distinct from economic, participation in Canadian activities and organizations (though the two are related) may follow a specialized, or a diversified, pattern. It seems to be characteristic of some bands, for instance, that a large proportion of the population participates actively with Whites in a limited range of organized activities –for instance, trade unions and competitive sports. In other cases, a minority of Indians participates with Whites in a wider range of activities, such as P.T.A., church socials, 4-H clubs, Boy Scouts, etc. The professional Indian participant has become almost a distinct occupational or vocational type in his own right.

There is also a third variant to consider. So far we have been discussing two patterns of participation in terms of numbers or proportions of a band participating with Whites in the same organizations and activities. In different ways, both types of bands may be said to have limited autonomy or self-sufficiency. More or less in contrast to these are numerous Indian bands in which there is a high degree of organization within the band community, and most participation is in predominantly band-controlled organizations. This sort of pattern may tend to apply particularly to fairly large bands having a strong agricultural base and fairly diverse fields of employment, as well as having some degree of spatial separation from White communities.

This raises a number of questions: Do highly organized Indian communities (in this internal, semi-autonomous sense) tend to have culturally separatist tendencies? Or does wide and active participation within the community also encourage more active participation with Whites in outside organizations and activities as well? Again, does such a pattern of organization tend to slow down economic development of the group, through discouraging active participation in the outside labour market, or does it encourage it by strengthening the Indian's pride and morale? From the evidence available so far, there seems to be no very clear correlation between economic development, internal or autonomous organization within the band and patterns of participation in White society. The most unorganized bands (in the internal, semi-autonomous sense discussed above), include some of the poorest Indian communities in the country (particularly a number of isolated, depressed and dependent bands depending on hunting, fishing and trapping in areas with inadequate resources) but also some of the most economically developed and integrated bands (such as the Lorette in Quebec) . Again, a high degree of economic participation of the specialized pattern discussed above does not necessarily preclude separatist tendencies or a strong drive for cultural autonomy, as shown by the example of Caughnawaga.

These various patterns of relationships, of course, have important implications for every important aspect of Indian Affairs Branch policy. They raise, first of all, the question of priorities in the allocation of funds and trained personnel. In educational policy, should the major effort be devoted to training Indians to play fairly specialized roles in the economy, or to giving the same type of education that Whites have at each age level? Should the Community Development program be oriented primarily to the Indian community as such, or should it focus primarily on nearby White communities as well, and on orienting Indians to the latter? In any economic development program generally, to what extent should capital and technical aid be devoted to encouraging and enabling Indians to develop the land or other resources available to them to the fullest extent, as against devoting it to aiding and encouraging them to move elsewhere and take special training courses for urban-industrial employment? How much should be expended for welfare, housing aid, social work and home economics counselling for Indians residing on reserves, as against those who have left the reserves and face special difficulties in adjusting to life in urban centers?

It is clear that in view of these issues and the wide range of differences among Indian bands with regard to the degree of economic development, ownership or access to resources and to markets, location in relation to White communities of various kinds, and degrees and patterns of participation in Canadian society, all facets of policy will need to be highly flexible and call for different priorities in different situations.

CHAPTER III

SOURCES AND METHOD OF THE ECONOMIC SURVEY

This is the first attempt to carry out a nationwide study of the economic status and development of Indians in Canada on a comparative basis. Hitherto, research studies of Indians in Canada have been local or regional in scope. Various divisions of the Indian Affairs Branch have made nationwide statistical and evaluative surveys of particular aspects of Indian life (educational levels, housing conditions, welfare expenditures, family income and the like). But no thorough-going attempt has been made, until now, to integrate and interpret data from these sources to get a comprehensive picture of the economic position of Indians across the country.

The questions this study will attempt to answer are:

What is the general economic status or level of development of Indians as a whole across Canada? What factors account for their generally low economic status?

What are the more significant differences among Indian bands with regard to per capita incomes and other indices or factors of economic growth (industrial or occupational structure; unemployment or under-employment; dependence on welfare and other forms of subsidy; accumulation of capital)?

What are the main variable factors – geographic, economic, social, cultural or administrative – that account for the differential levels of development among different communities?

What have been the main policies followed by the Indian Affairs Branch in administering to the economic welfare of Indians, and in what ways have such policies contributed, favourably or unfavourably, to their further development?

(1) The main source of data for this research survey is a detailed Resources Questionnaire which the Economic Development Division of the Indian Affairs. Branch prepared and circulated in 1964 to Superintendents across the country, to include all bands within each agency, When all the questionnaires have been completed and returned, and their findings tabulated and analysed for all 562 bands, they will provide a far more accurate, detailed and comprehensive picture of Canada's 200,000 plus Indians than any that has been available before. The eighteen-page questionnaire contains no less than 124 questions, several of which cover two or more items, These, in the aggregate, provide a wealth of material concerning the current economic position of Indians. They include such items as: land and timber., and other resources in each band community; ownership of capital of various kinds; types of jobs. rates of pay, and duration of employment in each job; and organizations in the community.

Completing the survey requires a tremendous amount of time and effort on the part of already scarce and overworked I.A.B. personnel. In the few sample questionnaires that have been returned so far, covering individual bands, Agency Superintendents and their assistants report spending anywhere from thirty to seventy hours of work spread over a period of several weeks in addition to their regular duties, to complete each questionnaire for each band. At the time of making this analysis, not all the questionnaires were completed. Pending completion of the survey, it was felt that a reasonably accurate picture of the aggregate could be obtained from a selection of bands. A list of fifty bands was drawn up and superintendents in the agencies in which the bands are located were requested to give these first priority in completing and returning the questionnaires.

The basis of selection was as follows:

First, for each major province or region of the country (Maritimes, Quebec, Ontario, Prairies, British Columbia, the Yukon and North West Territories) the number of bands chosen and their population were roughly equal (as a proportion of fifty) to each region's Indian population in proportion to the total in Canada.

Second, the bands within each region in turn were chosen, as far as possible, from three rather arbitrarily defined types, classified as follows:

1. Relatively isolated and under-developed. Primarily hunting, fishing and trapping bands in the northern wooded belt from Quebec to British Columbia inclusive, but also including a number of bands located in farming areas in the more southern sections of most provinces.

2. Transitional. Bands located in more or less close proximity to White communities of various sizes, and subject to relatively rapid change.

3. Developed or advanced. Bands which, from the knowledge available, appeared to stand out above the vast majority with regard to such indices as per capita income, proportion employed in steady, well-paid jobs; low rates of dependency on relief or social welfare; and successful business proprietors or professional men. Only a few met these standards, and they were all in Southern Quebec, Southern Ontario and British Columbia.

By the end of October, 1964 questionnaires on thirty-five out of the sample of fifty had been completed satisfactorily and been made available. The job of compiling and tabulating, analysing and interpreting the data, adding data from other sources covering communities in the sample, and preparing it all for computer analysis took several months. It was decided to continue rather than wait for the remaining fifteen of the original sample to be returned. Most of the statistical estimates that are tabulated and analysed in the pages that follow are drawn from the group of thirty-five Indian bands. By the time of writing (May, 1965) a number of additional questionnaires had been received. However, a few of the earlier ones were not used in some of the tabulations because of obvious errors or omissions.

(2) There are some obvious objections to this selection in so far as the bands are not entirely representative of Indian bands across the country. While they account for slightly less than 7 per cent of the 562 bands, they have a total population of 35,683, or almost 18 per cent of the Indians in Canada. The larger, more economically developed bands (such as Six Nations, Caughnawaga, Walpole Island and Squamish) are over-represented in the selection of thirty-five, while the smaller, more isolated bands, and to a lesser extent, the rural bands in the Prairie region, are under-represented.

However, where the central interest in the analysis is economic development, as such, the data available about the economically developed bands are crucial.

Furthermore, there is already a sizable body of data about the relatively under-developed northern trapping bands available from such sources as the study of Indians and Metis in Northern Saskatchewan by Buckley, Kew and

Hawley (Centre for Community Studies, Saskatoon, 1963), in Northern Manitoba by Jamieson and Hawthorn (Committee on Manitoba's Economic Future, Provincial Government, Winnipeg, 1962) and in Northern Ontario by Dunning (Social and Economic Change among the Northern Ojibwas) and Greenwood (Big Trout Lake). Much of the analysis in this Report concerning Indians in the Northern region has been based on such sources.

Apart from the basis of selection, as outlined above, there are certain limitations in the Resources Questionnaire itself that should be noted.

(a) First, it should be stressed, the questionnaire was not designed for the specific needs and purposes of the current research project on Economic Development of Indians in Canada, with which this Report deals. As the title suggests, it is a resources questionnaire, not a questionnaire on economic development as such. That is, it was designed, within the limitations of time and personnel available to the Indian Affairs Branch, to provide a comprehensive and up-to-date 'inventory' of the main resources contained within, or available to, Indian band communities across the country, in relation to their resident and non-resident populations, classified into broad groups according to employability or unemployability, occupations, earnings, and regularity or duration of employment. These, of course, are the types of basic data essential for achieving any sort of overall view of the present economic status of Indians in Canada, and the magnitude of the economic problems they face in each area; and, despite various limitations noted below, it provides by far the best source of data available to date for measuring and analysing, on a nationwide scale, the major issues of economic development for Indians.

If the questionnaire had been designed primarily to measure the comparative levels of economic development achieved by Indian bands across the country, and to assess the numerous factors contributing or retarding such development – as this Report attempts to do – numerous additional questions, covering a wider and more detailed list of data, would have to have been included in the questionnaire, at the cost, of course, of much additional staff time and delay.

It should be added, furthermore, that in preparing a lengthy, complicated and detailed questionnaire, it was almost unavoidable that various gaps and ambiguities in the questions would come to light after the completed questionnaires started coming in.

For these reasons, therefore, there are certain limitations in the questionnaire, as a main source of data for the present study, as follows:

1. The main attention is devoted to the primary fields of employment, particularly farming, and relatively little to the secondary and tertiary fields.

   For instance, in a section devoted to land use inventory there are more than two pages with twenty-three questions, a number of which have subsections calling for further detail, and in another section entitled "supplementary questions regarding improved land" there are an additional four pages with thirty-eight questions. Altogether, these comprise almost one-half of the entire questionnaire. The majority of both sets of questions are concerned with actual or potential agricultural use of Indian reserve land. As the survey itself brings out, and other studies substantiate this, farming plays a relatively small role in the economy of most Indian communities, and its potentialities with regard to their general economic development seem limited, at best.

2. The section dealing with capital inventory comprises forty-eight questions dealing with types of capital items, classified under the following headings: "vehicles", "agricultural fixed assets", "farm machinery and equipment", "logging machinery and equipment", "major fishing, hunting and trapping equipment", "other fishing, hunting and trapping gear", and "livestock". Each of these is, in turn, itemized in number and value under the headings of "band owned", "individually owned" and "department owned".

From the evidence available in the sample survey the primary industries covered employ more than one-half of all Indian workers in the country, the majority of whom are self-employed. But they represent fields of generally decreasing employment opportunities compared to wage work in other industries. And, because of the generally low rates of earnings, they contribute considerably less than one-half of the total earnings received by Indians from gainful employment of all kinds. Nevertheless, to repeat, an inventory of such items is extremely useful and valuable in itself in answering a number of questions and opening up numerous interesting lines of analysis.

Lacking from the list are any questions regarding the number, types and values of fixed assets, equipment and stock in the non-primary categories – that is, industrial, commercial or service establishments of various kinds including (1) those owned or operated by band members both on and off reserves; (2) those on reserves that are owned and managed by non-Indians; (3) those on reserves that are owned by non-Indians but managed by Indian band members. These comprise one of the most significant indices to the economic development of a band.

The only provision for these type of data are three broad questions as follows:

a) "Comment on enterprises of importance introduced in previous years, indicating success or otherwise; e.g. sawmills and other efforts to create commercial projects, etc.

–very successful
–mostly successful
–some success
–tried but failed
–none tried."

(b) "Are there processing, manufacturing or commercial enterprises on this reserve?"

Yes No

(c) "If Yes for the three principal enterprises, state the type, indicating whether ownership and management are exercised by (a) Indian band, (b) individual Indians, (c) Indian Affairs Branch, or (d) non-Indians."

3. The questions dealing with the make-up of the labour force, types of jobs, duration of employment and rate of earnings likewise have several limitations, so that some highly useful types of information are lacking.

(a) For instance, one section asks for estimates of the number of employable males in the band population, and the numbers employed and unemployed, for various months of the year. This, of course, is a crucial measure of a community's economic health. Unfortunately, however, there is no provision for obtaining similar data for women workers, so that there is no way of knowing how many women are employed, what kinds of jobs they do, and at what rate of earnings (except in those questionnaires which clearly specify jobs done by women; e.g. nurses). Entrance of women into the outside labour market, particularly in factory, white-collar and service jobs, is another key element in a community" s economic growth.

(b) Again, a wealth of valuable information is available in a question entitled "employment of residents on or off the reserves". This lists nineteen different categories of work, for each of which data are to be tabulated under the headings "number of workers", "man months of work", and "estimated income". Additional highly useful data could have been obtained with a fuller description and breakdown of certain classifications. Again, the main attention is given to the primary fields of employment, and relatively little to the secondary and tertiary. The primary fields account for nine out of the nineteen classifications, and are broken down into specific industries; e.g. "forestry on reserve", "forestry off reserve", "beef stock ranching", "dairy farming", etc. Other types of wage or salaried employment are classified into a limited number of broad categories (i.e. "clerical and office work", "unskilled casual labour", "skilled labour", "self employment in other industrial and commercial enterprises" (other than farming and primary industries) and "other sources of employment (specify)). Each of the categories is further broken down into "on reserve" and "off reserve".

(i) One notable and important category of work that is omitted is that of semi-skilled labour in a variety of fields, such as factory work, truck driving and longshoring. The result is some inconsistency in the returns from the completed questionnaires. Some respondents, for instance, put longshoremen in the "unskilled casual" category, while others classed them as "skilled".

(ii) Again, it would be interesting and valuable to know in what specific types of industries Indians in different bands across the country are being employed in wage or salaried work, with a breakdown at least as detailed as that for primary industries, such as: "factories", "stores", "service establishments", "building construction", "railways and highways", "automotive transportation", etc. Fortunately, much of the missing information for the fifty bands in the sample used here is supplied by other sources, such as a survey questionnaire carried out by the I.A.B. 's Welfare Division in 1963, in which in one section, agency personnel were asked to provide data for each band on "main sources of outside employment", listed in order of importance.

Despite such limitations as these, the Resources Questionnaire provides a wealth of data which have not been available hitherto for assessing the present economic status of Indian bands across the country, and their potentialities for future economic growth. If members of the current research project had attempted a comparably wide and comprehensive survey of their own, with additional questions focussing on special developmental aspects, a far larger staff and larger expenditures of money, time and effort would have been required to get the same essential basic data, and there would have been much more delay in getting such data collated and analysed.

4. There may also be some doubts concerning the reliability or accuracy of the data on incomes, particularly on estimates of real income per capita from gainful employment, which are central to the analysis that follows. The question of accuracy, however, appears to be an unavoidable problem in any attempt to get reliable estimates of personal income among any particular group in the population. There is no reason to believe that the estimates provided in the Resources Questionnaire are any less reliable than other widely used types of personal income surveys. This point perhaps merits discussion at some length.

(a) Accurate estimates of personal incomes – except in terms of large national aggregates – are, of course, notoriously difficult to get. Some of the most widely used sources are open to wide margins of error. Census returns, for example, depend primarily on the responses of individual householders (which are themselves often unreliable) supplemented by sample checks of payrolls, farms, businesses and other sources. Income tax returns, likewise are open to miscalculation, concealment and outright fraud, and in any case do not provide data for the lower income, tax exempt groups (among which are the majority of Indians). Much the same applies to smaller sample surveys. In general, income earners or households tend to be secretive about their earnings and, to inquisitive outsiders seeking information, to under estimate or under state them. Opportunities for doing so are often quite

substantial, in view of the widespread prevalence of non-standard or supplementary sources of income in many occupations, such as:
overtime and holiday pay, shift differentials, piece rates; bonuses, tips and gratuities in cash or in kind, earnings from "moonlighting"; and so on

(b) The personnel of Indian Affairs Branch agencies responsible for providing income and other data for the Resources Questionnaire would seem to be generally in a position to get more reasonably accurate estimates with regard to Indian households than is the case with most types of personal income surveys. This would seem likely for the following reasons:

(i) The dependence of most Indian households upon the Indian Affairs Branch for relief loans, and other types of goods and services, gives Agency Superintendents and other personnel an unusual degree of knowledge about the assets and affairs of households under their immediate jurisdiction.

(ii) The limited fields of employment available to Indians in most bands, and their limited mobility, makes it relatively easy to assess and check their average earnings in wage or salaried employment.

(iii) So also the fact that fairly detailed and accurate records of output and earnings are kept in fields in which Indians are widely engaged as self-employed proprietors. In regard to trapping, fishing, logging and pole-cutting, for instance, such records are generally required by provincial governments for purposes of conservation policy. Furthermore, the outputs in such fields of employment are generally sold through one, or at most a few, buyers in each locality, so that reasonably accurate estimates of the incomes received by producers are not too difficult to derive.

(iv) Again, most types of wage or salaried employment in which relatively large numbers of Indians are engaged outside of their reserves (e.g. farm labour, construction work, guiding, logging, longshoring, sawmilling, factory and clerical work generally) usually pay fairly standard hourly, daily, weekly or monthly rates over fairly wide areas, as established by custom, collective bargaining, or the forces of demand and supply in the labour market.

(b) Special difficulties are encountered by the Indian Affairs Branch in attempting to get accurate estimates of real income in the following categories:

(i) Of Indian band members engaged in various types of casual jobs, as well as some types of steady employment, that take them away from their reserve communities for months at a time, or permanently. As noted in the statistical data in following chapters, for a number of bands, the Indian Affairs Branch respondents have made no attempt to estimate the earnings of non-resident band members, in such cases the estimated per capita earnings of a band apply only to the reserve residents. For some of the larger, more developed bands with a high proportion of non-residents – such as Six Nations and Tyendinaga, for instance – this may involve a considerable underestimate of their earnings, in so far as the Resources Questionnaire brings out the fact that in most bands, where fairly accurate estimates are possible, Indians who have left their reserves for outside employment generally earn considerably higher incomes, on the average, than their fellow band members who remain.

(ii) In estimating average per capita real income, another type of difficulty arises in the case of numerous Indian bands, particularly in the vast Northern wooded belt of the country, that are mainly resource-based in their economies, in such fields as hunting and trapping, fishing, pole-cutting, guiding and handicrafts. While generally having far lower money incomes, on the average, than those who specialize in wage or salaried employment for a large part of the year, Indian households in such bands generally derive a large (but difficult to estimate) part of their livelihoods from production for home use rather than for the market (e.g. game, fish, fuel wood and timber; hides and handicrafts; etc.) The net value of such items, in terms of equivalents in money income, is exceedingly difficult to assess for each band. The adequacy of resources within commuting or transporting distance of band reserves varies widely, for one thing. In some bands, most or all of the households are engaged in hunting, fishing, trapping and food gathering the year round. For some bands such things constitute a large item. The twenty-eight households in the Dog Rib Rae Band in the Northwest Territories, for instance, in addition to their hunting and trapping, catch an estimated 100,000 pounds of fish per annum, or an average of more than 3,500 pounds per household, while in others, produce for home use is derived only by those households whose adult males are actively engaged in commercial fishing or trapping for a few months of the year. And, as against the value of real income derived from nearby resources, there are the higher prices that have to be paid by members of Northern Indian bands, for purchased goods and services, due to long distances and high transportation costs, as compared to bands in more Southern regions.

Similarly with regard to farming. In some bands having farm proprietors who specialize in grain production, for instance, little or nothing may be produced for home consumption, while in others, engaged in growing diversified crops or livestock, the value of output produced for domestic use often far exceeds that sold in the market.

To meet such problems, a somewhat arbitrary estimate of average real income per annum for each band has been chosen, by assuming a value of $50 a month for home-produced output for each household, for the months in which its members were engaged in farming, trapping or fishing. This is the most frequently quoted estimate of Indian Affairs Branch officials and others familiar with the situation, who were queried on this score. For some bands, of course, this will be an overestimate, while for others (particularly those in which a large proportion of households are on relief, or engaged in casual wage employment, but which also hunt, fish, raise vegetables or cut timber and fuelwood for varying periods of time for their own use) it will be an underestimate.

(iii) Another sizable gap in knowledge, that perhaps leads to considerable underestimating of average per capita incomes, applies particularly to some of the higher income bands – such as Skidegate, Sheshaht, Caughnawaga and Tyendinaga – in which a high proportion, or majority, of adult male members are engaged in highly-paid skilled jobs. Particularly is this the case where jobs are on piece rates and involve a good deal of overtime, and where a large proportion supplement their wage work with other remunerative activities such as fishing. As against these factors, there is the fact (contrary to a widely held view) that Indians have to pay income taxes, on the same basis as do Whites, on earnings derived from jobs or resources outside of reserve boundaries. This would tend to narrow the gap, in average disposable income, between the high and low income groups, in so far as most workers in the latter category earn less than the minimum taxable level.

In any case, granting these limitations in knowledge and possible sources of error, a broad comparative analysis of a sample of Indian bands, ranging from the highest to lowest income groups, does not require precise accuracy The types of errors or omissions, overestimates and underestimates, as discussed above, would tend to be fairly consistent throughout the range, and sometimes to cancel one another out. Thus, while probably none of the income estimates, in statistical tables in the chapters that follow, are precisely accurate, the place of most bands in the range, and the relative differentials among main Income groups is probably correct. Within broad income groups, of course, whether high, medium or low, various individual bands would probably have to be moved one or two places further up or down, if fully accurate measures of per capita real incomes were available in every case. But it is the comparative position of Indian bands in an income-ranking, rather than a precise knowledge of their actual real earnings, that is of major interest in assessing the factors accounting for differential rates of economic development,

5. Other limitations in the information supplied by the Resources Questionnaire are unavoidable, due to the nature of the material and the difficulty or impossibility of getting reasonably accurate estimates of some kinds of data.

(a) For one thing, the unit of study chosen is the band. If the unit chosen were the individual or family, a study of a 5 per cent or 10 per cent random sample of the total Indian population might show somewhat different results (for instance, an economically depressed Indian band might be one which most of the more enterprising or economically successful members have left).

A special study of a representative sample of economically successful Indians in different regions would thus seem called for. Of particular interest in this regard would be Indians who had permanently left their band reserves and become more thoroughly integrated with the wider society.

(b) Secondly, and more important, several scattered studies, special reports and casual observations, together with data from the Resources Questionnaire itself, seem to indicate that the most important determining factors governing the rate or pace of economic development of Indian bands have not been included in the questionnaire, and would not have been feasible to include in any case because they are too intangible to be identified and quantified in manageable statistical form in a broad survey of this kind. These include such questions as:

- predominant attitudes and values of Indians with regard to wage employment of various kinds, acquisition of durable consumer goods, and accumulation of capital for independent business ventures,

- rewards or sanctions of the Indian community, applied to individuals who achieve success in professional or business careers;

- character and techniques of leadership, and the type of ideologies required, in Indian communities,

- the role and impact of traditional (or revived) ceremonial activities,

- attitudes, behaviour patterns and policies towards Indians by various elements (particularly employers, potential fellow workers, merchants and purveyors of credit) in the White community, and the reactions of Indians to these expressed or implied White attitudes, behaviour patterns, and policies, and

- finally, above all, the general structure of attitudes and relationships and patterns of participation and interaction between Indian bands and the larger White communities in different regional contexts

For data dealing with such topics as these, this project on economic development of Indians will have to depend upon the more intensive studies of particular communities, Some of these are already completed and published, and some of them are still underway. They may not comprise a properly chosen sample of Indians, in the rigorous, statistical sense, but they are sufficiently scattered and diverse in terms of location and social or economic contexts of the communities and individuals studied, to provide a realistic picture of the major non-economic variables affecting economic development.

CHAPTER IV

THE GENERAL PICTURE

In pursuit of the objectives outlined in the preceding chapters, and with the research data at present available, the appropriate first step is to provide a general picture of the economic status of Indians in Canada – their main means of employment and livelihood, the duration of their employment, size of earnings from gainful employment, and the degree to which they depend upon other sources of income.

Tables A and B below provide a broad picture of this kind. They cover a population of 35,683 Indians in the representative sample of thirty-five bands. They range in number of people from 130 to more than 7,000. Slightly more than 73 per cent or almost three-quarters, were residing on reserves when the survey was made, while more than one-quarter were non-residents, though still retaining their band membership.

Employment and Earnings

The total earnings from gainful employment of this population amounted in all to $10,843,638, or a little over $300 per capita, as compared to an average over Canada as a whole of $1,400.[1] (This low level of earnings per capita of Indians in comparison to the Canadian average as a whole, is due primarily to their concentration of employment in low-paid industries and occupations, and the wide prevalence of unemployment and under-employment. It is partly due, also, to their extremely rapid rate of population growth since World War II, and the consequent large proportion of their population below working age. From statistics taken from the Census of Indians in 1959 it was found that more than 49 per cent of the population in the thirty-five sample bands in Tables A and B were below the age of sixteen, as compared to the Canadian average of over 28 per cent, while the proportion in the productive age group of sixteen to sixty-four were roughly 45 per cent and 65 per cent respectively, In proportion to population, therefore, Indians had far fewer people in the productive age group as had Canada as a whole.)

---

[1] This figure is derived by dividing the total Canadian population of 19.4 million average during 1964 into the total income of $27,475 million for that year. This income figure includes total wages, salaries and supplementary labour income; net income of farm operators; and net income from non-farm incorporated businesses – in a word, total income from gainful employment. It does not include transfer payments from governments, or corporation profits, rent, interest or other purely investment income. (Bank of Canada Statistical Summary Supplement, 1964, pp. 112, 117, Ottawa.)

These earnings were derived from 7,962 jobs of varying duration and in various types of industries and occupations that are classified in Table A into fourteen broad categories. Most of these jobs were presumably carried out by the estimated 6,327 employable males between the ages of sixteen and sixty-four inclusive. Unfortunately, the Resources Questionnaire did not contain any queries concerning employment of women or of workers under sixteen years of age, so we have no way of knowing just how the jobs were distributed as among these groups.

The sample of thirty-five bands available for analysis and statistical tabulation, as pointed out before, is weighted on the side of the larger, higher income and more economically developed bands. Nonetheless, the general picture the figures present of native Indians in Canada is one of serious unemployment or under-employment, [1] poverty and dependency.

The average duration of employment during the year, as may be seen from Column 3 in Table A, was only 4.8 months during 1964-65 (though as noted, this does not tell us the average months of employment per worker during the year, as we have no way of knowing how many workers held more than one job during the year).

A breakdown of the 6,327 employable males in terms of months of employment provides a more graphic picture, as shown in Table B. Only 28.5 per cent were employed more than nine months of the year, while 61 per cent were employed less than six months, and 23.6 per cent less than two months.

Average yearly earnings per worker were similarly inadequate at $1,361 compared to the general Canadian average of almost $4,000.2 A further breakdown by income groups, provided in a special welfare and housing survey by the Indian Affairs Branch in 1965 provided the following estimates for the 36 bands shown in Table B: only 11.5 per cent of the Indian households had incomes of $4,000 per annum or more; 78.5 per cent received less than $3,000, 54.5 per cent less than $2,000, and 28.2 per cent less than $1,000.

Accompanying the widespread under-employment and low earnings, Indian households are heavily dependent on welfare (i.e. relief payments, in money or in kind) and other supplementary income. More than one-third (33.5 per cent) of all households in the sample depended on welfare grants from the Branch, and these amounted in toto to 9.3 per cent of total earnings from gainful employment. However, this underestimates the degree of dependence on welfare, because a number of Indian bands with larger band funds and revenues look after their own welfare needs. All types of transfer payments in the social security category to Indians including unemployment insurance, and family allowances, old age security and old age assistance, and welfare payments from band revenues as well as from public bodies, in the aggregate amounted to 31.4 per cent or almost one-third of total earnings from employment. (It should be pointed out in this connection that the percentage of total income received by Indians from welfare or "relief" payments has probably gone up in recent years, since the Indian Affairs Branch has adopted provincial scales in each region.)

---

[1] The official statistics on unemployment, as formulated by the Dominion Bureau of Statistics and presented in most government publications are open to criticism on several grounds. The labour force is estimated in terms of those actively seeking work and the unemployed as those actively seeking work who have not been employed in the week or more preceding the time of interview. This method tends to underestimate the degree of unemployment in two ways: (1) people who have sought work unsuccessfully for a long period tend to become discouraged, and stop looking for jobs, then they cease to be counted as part of the labour force, and therefore as unemployed; and (2) people who, when interviewed, do have a job are counted as being employed, even though they may have been unemployed for weeks or months previously, and may lose their jobs and become unemployed for long periods subsequent to the interview.

In brief, the official statistics on unemployment tend to underestimate the degree of under-employed, which in the aggregate, is a more serious problem. The statistics provided in the Indian Affairs Branch's Resources Questionnaire provides a fuller picture, with regard to employable Indian males of working age.

[2] This figure is derived by dividing the total income from gainful employment in Canada, as described in a preceding footnote, by the civilian labour force averaging 6,933,000 during 1964. (Bank of Canada, op. cit.)

TABLE A

SUMMARY SURVEY OF EMPLOYMENT AND EARNINGS OF INDIANS IN THIRTY-FIVE REPRESENTATIVE BANDS ACROSS CANADA

Industry or Occupation	Total Numbers Employed	Total Months Employed	Average Months Employment	Total Earnings	Average Monthly Earnings	Average Yearly Earnings Per Worker	Per Cent of Total Earnings	Per Cent of Total Employment By Months	Per Cent of Total Jobs
Forestry:									
On reserve	592	2060	3.48	392,500	190.5	663.0	3.6	5.4	7.4
Off reserve	287	1100	3.83	208,400	189.5	726.0	1.9	2.9	3.6
+Fishing	366	1152	3,15	401,016	348.0	1095.5	3.7	3.0	4.6
+Trapping	1115	4025	3.6	646,242	160.69	580.0	5.96	10.5	14.0
Guiding	176	481	2.7	90,300	188.0	513.0	.83	1.3	2.2
Food gathering (inc. wild hay)	1070	1219	1.1	103,600	85.0	96.8	.95	3.2	13.4
Handicrafts	326	1150	3.5	69,285	60.25	212.5	.64	30	4.1
Sub total	4037						17,6	29.3	49.3
Proprietor farm	298	2244	7.5	488,230	217.6	1638.35	4,5	5.8	3.7
Proprietor, non-farm	185	1552	8.4	487,000	313.8	2632.4	4.4	4,0	2.3
Professional and technical	52	542	10.4	266,000	490.8	5115.4	2.45	1.4	.65
Clerical	207	1977	9,55	479,680	242.6	2316.8	4.4	52	26
*Skilled	1115	9429	8.45	4,944,495	524.4	4434.5	45,6	24.6	14.0
** Unskilled and Casual	2168	11339	5.2	2,266,890	200.0	1045.6	20.9	29.6	27.2
(Farm Labour)	(95)	(360)	(3.8)	(50,600)	140,5)	(532.6)			
Total	7967	38267	4,8	10,843,638	283,4	1361.1	100.0	100.0	100.0

+ For those bands specializing mainly in hunting, fishing and trapping, an allowance of $50 per month per household for "country food" was made, in arriving at the earning figures above. The same allowance is made for farm proprietors.

* A number of relatively well paid semi-skilled workers, such as loggers in British Columbia, truck drivers, and steadily employed factory workers, were included under "skilled" in this table, rather than under "unskilled and casual" or (in the case of loggers) "Forestry" as provided in the Indian Affairs Branch Questionnaire.

** In a number of the completed questionnaires, farm labour was included in the broad category of "unskilled and casual". Only 95, as shown in this Table, were clearly defined as such.

TABLE B

SUMMARY 0F SURVEY OF EMPLOYMENT, EARNINGS AND DEPENDENCY AMONG THIRTY-FIVE REPRESENTATIVE BANDS

Total Population = 35,683

On reserves 73.27.
Off reserves 26.87.

Employable Males Aged 16 - 64 = 6,327

Employed more than 9 mos. 28.5%
Employed 6-9 mos. 10.6%
Employed less than 6 mos. 61.0%
Employed less than 2 mos. 23.6%

Annual Earnings of Worker s
Less than $1000 = 22.5%
Less than $2000 = 62.1%
Less than $3000 = 81.7%
More than $5000 = 4.67%

Welfare

Total expenditure on Indians = $1,007,796

= 9.3% of earnings
Coverage 33.5%. of households

Total Transfer Payments to Indians = $3,407,887
= 31.4% of earnings

TABLE I

Bands Ranked a/c Average Per Capita Real Income from Gainful Employment	Per Capita Real Income	Average Months Employment Per Worker	Average Months Employment Per Job	Per Cent Distribution of Main Sources of Employment of Bands by Industry and/or Occupational Status												
				Forestry	Fishing	Guiding	Handi-Craft	Food Gather-	Farm Labour	Casual Unskilled	Skilled	Clerical	Professional	Farm Proprietor	Farm Non-Proprietor	Trapping
Skidegate	1252	10.6	6.7		21.6		4.9				70.3				3.24	
Caughnawaga	793	9.2	8.2							6.5	83.6	8.5			3.0	
Walpole Is.	715	6.16	5.9		2.9	3.0	6.5			55.4	8.0	8.1		8.7	3.5	3.8
Sheshaht, V.I.	664	10.7	10.7		.8			2.0		24.8	72.3					
Lorette	630	10.5	8.7			3.0	14.0			32.3	18.5	1.0.1	2.0		19.5	
Squamish	630	8.0	8.0		1.5		2.1			62.6	28.3	1.7			1.7	
Tyendinaga	516	8.3	8.0							24.5	36.5	12.0		17.5	4.6	
Curve Lake	350	7.3	3.1			6.8	8.1	10.2		30.6	28.5				8.1	8.0
Six Nations	350	7.5	4.0						13.9	35.8	26.8	2.1	8.5	12.9	4.7	
Mistassini	341	5.6	5.6	8.1	2.9	2.3				27.6	2.3	1.4				54.3
Masset	336	3.8	3.8		20.5		6.0			52.2	14.9			1.9	4.3	
Dog Rib Rae	332	5.67		8.0	12.3		4.0			28.6		4.0				42.5
Port Simpson	325	6.9	4.35		30.0					36.4	24.6				5.5	2.1
Kamloops	314	9.5		7.2					5.0	51.8	8.6	1.4		11.5		
Sarcee	302	6.7	2.82				10.7		17.8	21.4	10.7	6.9		23.5		
Fort William	298	8.1	6.45	31.7						40.1	16.9	8.4				
Williams Lake	291	7.5	3.23	13.3				26.6		23.9	10.6			25.7		
Moose Factory	284	6.24		6.1						48.0	24.6	4.9				12.3
Fort Alexander	255	7.1	1.7													
River Desert	250	4.9	3.5	53.4		15.4	2.7			5.6	5.1	6.2	2.5	2.6	3.7	6.2
St. Mary s	249	7.27	2.3	55.8			3.3	4.2	6.2	22.5	1.2				3.3	
Attawapiskat	247															
Pointe Bleue	222	6.2	5.6	3.3		5.6				40.1	14.7	20.3			8.1	5.0
Tobique	215	10.6	3.7	10.3		11,0	12.9		41.2	16.5	8.2					
Pekangikum	197	6.3	3.4	6.8	19.8					13.5						57.4
Shubenacadie	180	4.3	2.5	8.8			22.7	15.1		26.5	6.0				9.1	

TABLE I (continued)

Bands Ranked a/c Average Per Capita Real Income from Gainful Employment	Per Capita Real Income	Average Months Employment Per Worker	Average Months Employment Per Job	Per Cent Distribution of Main Sources of Employment of Bands by Industry and/or Occupational Status												
				Forestry	Fishing	Guiding	Handi Craft	Food Gather-	Farm Labour	Casual Unskilled	Skilled	Cleri-cal	Profess-ional	Farm Proprietor	Farm Non-Proprietor	Trapping
Oak River, Man.	176	3.6	3.6						8.7	31.2	10.4			32.3	8.7	8.7
Rupert House	174	3.2	2.5	7.8		10.4				5.2						62.3
Cold Lake	165		3.4	25.5	2.8		16.7		5.5	10.0	3.2			18.7		2.8
Fort St. John	161	5.0	5.0													
Deer Lake, Ont.	156	3.6	3.5		18.7		3.1			15.5	1.8	1.8				56.6
The Pas	140	6.6	6.6	3.4			5.6			58.2	4.8	4.8		2.4	13.5	4.8
James Smith	126	6.6	3,3							29.2		5.2		26.8		15.1
Peguis	99	4.6	4.6	13.7	6.8					18.3	5.6	13.7		37.0	1.4	
Big Cove	61	7.0	2.75	23.6			25.5		28.3	5.7		8.5			8.5	
Piapot	55		5.5	11.0						54.7	4.6			23.3	6.0	

TABLE II

				Duration of Employment of Employable Males Aged 16-64			Annual Incomes of Resident Households*			
Bands Ranked a/c Average Per Capita Real Income from Gain ful Employment	Average Annual Earnings Per Worker $	Average Monthly Earnings Per Worker $	Participation Ra te %	% Employed < 2 mos.	% Employed < 6 mos.	% Employed > 9 mos.	% < 1000	% < 2000	% < 3000	% > 4000
Skidegate	4642	438	37.7	2.8	5.6	64.3	15.4	30.8	54	30.8
Caughnawaga	4554	495	25.6	17	42.5	42.6	15	25	55	33
Walpole Island	2048	332.5	51.3	12.6	20.5	37.3	12.9	48	83	8
Sheshaht, V.1.	4400	411	34.7	6.4	11	85	20	28	40	50
Lorette	3529	336	52.3	5.7	5.7	94.3	11	30	53	24
Squamish	3427	428	38.9	9.3	29.6	51.8	6	24	60	23.5
Tyendinaga	3818	459	25.2	15.4	33.8	48.5	19	51	79	8
Six Nations	2660	308	24.75	n/a	n/a	n/a	6	24.2	70	8
Curve Lake	2222	304	39.5	22.3	60	40.0	25	79.5	88	10
Mistassini	1853	331	39.4	0	62.3	10.7	39	84.8	97.5	1.25
Masset	1428	370	45.7	34.5	84.1	15.9	15	30	50	30
Dog Rib Rae	1546	273	3.4	66.2	24.0	0	43	88	10.7	
Port Simpson	2729	395	35.4	4,3	74.0	8.7	10	46.7	70	6.5
Kamloops	2037	214	40.3	8.0	40.0	50.3	19	33	78.5	10
Sarcee	1354	202	46.7	11.0	32.9	36.6	1.4	32.8	74.6	11.9
Fort William	2334	288	30.4	15.0	58.3	20.0	17.4	47.8	69.6	8.7
Williams Lake	1708	228		25.0	85.0	15.0	20.0	89	100.0	0
Moose Factory	2256	361		9.0	50.0	25.0	37	67.8	85.7	0
Fort Alexander	1992	279		14	72.7	20.4	56.6	78.0	88	3.2
River Desert	836		46.3	5.0	65.0	15.0	10.6	59.8	95	1.4
St. Mary s	1320	181	30.8	23.1	77,0	23.1	83.3	100,0	100	0
Attawapiskat	1400			3.6	75.7	6.3	70.6	98.5	100	0
Pointe Bleue	1800	290	23.2	65.0	80.0	19.1	38	77.4	87	2.6
Tobique	2050	193	20.0	30.4	98.0	2.0	74	85	94.6	2.7
Pekangikum	779	124		5.3	84.2	15.8	100	100	100	0
Shubenacadie	809	201	39.3	66.67	88.0	10.75	57.5	86.3	94,5	2.7
Oak River, Man	770	214		62.5	97.0	3.0	54.5	91	100	0
Rupert House	810	253		27.5	52.5	5.8	82	100	100	0
Cold Lake	1840			66,67	85,2	3.7	7.8	97	98.5	0
Fort St. John	931	186			100.0		100	100	100	0

TABLE I (continued)

Bands Ranked a/c Average Per Capita Real Income from Gain ful Employment	Average Annual Earnings Per Worker $	Average Monthly Earnings Per Worker $	Partici-pation Ra te %	Duration of Employment of Employable Males Aged 16-64 % Employed < 2 mos.	% Employed < 6 mos.	% Employed > 9 mos.	Annual Incomes of Resident Households* % < 1000	% < 2000	% < 3000	% > 4000
Deer Lake, Ont,				40.35	87.0	11.7	93	100	100	0
The Pas	1283	194		9.3	32.4	49.0	51.9	85	98	0
James Smith	1143	173	23.1	50.8	80.0	13.3	55	82.3	95	3.4
Peguis	480	104	21.7	22.0	88.5	8.0	31.6	67	95.6	.88
Big Cove	734	105	35.3	42.0	80.0	10.3	37.5	92.2	95	1.5
Piapot				32.2	79.0		33	81	94	0

* Figures derived from Housing Survey, Indian Affairs Branch, Ottawa, January, 1965.

Certain discrepancies appear in the data presented in Tables A and B, I and II, above (as, for example, in the ranking of bands according to per capita income, or in average monthly or annual earnings, on the one hand, and in proportions of populations in various income groups as shown in the columns on the right side of the Table II, on the other). For instance, Walpole Island, while classed as one of the higher income bands, shows a higher proportion of households with annual incomes of less than $3,000 and a smaller percentage with incomes of more than $4,000, than a number of bands having a considerably lower per capita income. The main explanations for such apparent discrepancies are as follows:

(1) The figures on per capita income and for average annual or monthly earnings per worker are derived from data in the Resources Questionnaire and other sources, and include, as noted earlier, an estimate of $50 per month employed in trapping, fishing and farming to allow for produce for home consumption. The figures for "Annual Incomes of Resident Households" are derived from the Indian Affairs Branch's Housing Survey of 1965, and include only cash income.

(2) The figures for "Resident Households" include all households in each of the band reserve communities listed. In many reserves a high proportion of households, and in some cases a majority, have no gainfully employed members, and depend almost entirely on government subsidy. The figures for annual average and monthly earnings, on the other hand, do not include such households, as they apply only to those individuals who are gainfully employed, at least part of the time during the year.

(3) Among the higher income bands, as noted elsewhere, there are generally high proportions of non-resident members, and they usually have higher incomes than the residents, thus raising the average per capita income level for the band as a whole. The income classifications for households in Table II, on the other hand, include only resident households.

Occupational Distribution

The main reasons for the economically depressed and under-employed status of Indians in this sample seem readily apparent from their distribution by types of employment, as may be seen from Table A and Table 1. Almost one-half of 49.3 per cent of all the jobs they performed during 1964-65 were concentrated in their traditional fields of employment in primary, resource-based industries and occupations; namely, forestry, fishing, trapping, guiding, food gathering and handicrafts.[1] These are fields of employment that for various reasons yield inadequate incomes for most workers. They are highly seasonal by nature and a number of trends have tended to reduce employment opportunities rather sharply in recent years; rapid population increases that outstrip locally available resources in many areas, depletion of resources as a by-product of population growth, economic growth and industrialization; declining markets and low prices in some fields such as trapping; and technological changes that have reduced labour requirements per unit of output. Thus, employment in the traditional primary industries has been of comparatively short duration tor the Indians studied in this survey, averaging hardly more than three months per annum, and low paid, averaging less than $200 a month. As may be seen from Table A, while these fields provided almost one-half of all jobs, they accounted for Less than 30 per cent of all employment as measured by total man-months, and less than 18 per cent of all earnings.

More than a quarter of the jobs in this sample, 27.2 per cent, are in the unskilled and casual category; these are in addition to employment in the primary resource-based industries dealt with above. They provide only a slightly longer average duration of employment (5.2 months) and slightly higher average rates of pay ($200 monthly). A sizable fraction -- and in some cases a majority – of jobs performed by members of all the bands in the sample lies in this category.[2] This is especially true of the more urbanized bands located in the more southern sections of the country.

Only 14 per cent of the jobs in this sample fall in the skilled category. These include some types of work that pay high wage rates (as seen by the $524 monthly average) but involve fairly protracted periods of unemployment, with an average of less than eight and one-half months of employment per annum. Nevertheless, these are the jobs of the higher average income group in the sample and while representing only 14 percent of all jobs, they account for 45.6 per cent or almost one-half of total earnings. The small minority of professional and clerical workers, while enjoying steadier employment, have generally lower average monthly rates of pay. Most of these are in the lower paid professions. such as teaching, nursing, social work, and a few salaried lawyers and doctors.

The minority of proprietors or self-employed, both farm and non-farm (outside of those engaged in forestry, fishing and trapping) appear to be largely in the marginal or sub-marginal category, to judge from the low average annual incomes of $1,638 and $2,632 respectively. (Note: In estimating the incomes of farm proprietors, as for Indians engaged in hunting, trapping and fishing, an arbitrary figure of $50 monthly was added to the earnings reported for the months in which they were engaged in such activities, to allow for the value of produce devoted to household use rather than sold on the market.)

---

[1] The proportion of all Indians in Canada depending on these sources of employment is probably higher because, as noted before, the sample is weighted on the side of the more urbanized, developed, bands.

[2] As noted, the Resources Questionnaire listed wage jobs in only two broad categories; namely, "skilled" and "casual and unskilled", No provision was made for more-or-less regularly or continuously employed semi-skilled workers. In Tables A and I those workers employed for more than six months of the year, and at wage rates above $300 a month, were put in the skilled category. These include such groups as loggers and sawmill workers in British Columbia, longshoremen, truck drivers in some areas, various types of factory and construction workers, and maintenance men.

Factors Conducive to Economic Backwardness

Among the bands across Canada, and among the thirty-five in the sample summarized in Tables A and B, and presented in more detail by bands in Tables I and II, there are wide variations in average earnings, in degrees of skill, in types of employment engaged in, in behaviour patterns of working, saving and spending, and other factors conducive to, or discouraging, economic development. A number of these differences among bands will be analysed at some length in the chapter that follows.

In view of this, it is obviously dangerous to indulge in sweeping generalizations applying to Indians as a whole in this country, in seeking to explain the depressed economic position of the majority, and their concentration in intermittent and low-income types of employment. There are, however, certain special forces that seem to apply in varying intensity, to virtually all Indians, and that tend to hold them back economically. A number of these have been analysed at some length in certain regional studies undertaken earlier[1] and various recent studies have brought to light additional ones.

For a large minority of Indians, of course, there are the obvious physical factors of distance and isolation from centres of job and income opportunities. This applies particularly across the whole northern wooded belt of the country, from Quebec to British Columbia. Most of these people are engaged mainly in trapping and fishing, and as noted earlier, average earnings in these activities are tending to decline due to rapid population growth resource depletion, inadequate or obsolete equipment and techniques, declining markets, low prices and other adverse trends. Meanwhile, new industries that offer sufficient alternative means of employment and income to Indians have failed to develop, as yet, in the northern region.

Another sizable group of the more economically depressed bands -- some of them more depressed and dependent, indeed, than in the northern belt -- are in predominantly agricultural areas, particularly in the Prairies. In some cases the population is too large to be maintained adequately on the land available to them, while in other cases there is ample land, but the band members have insufficient incentive, skill or capital to develop it adequately.

Here, too, there tends to be a lack of other types of industry to provide alternative employment.

Even where a band is located within an area that offers numerous employment opportunities, the factors of distance and isolation may still be operative. For a number of reasons discussed more fully below, Indians in some areas tend to be less mobile than Whites. more reluctant to leave their reserves permanently. or for extended periods of time for employment elsewhere. Unless a plant, a business or industrial centre is within commuting distance of a reserve or band community, therefore, the majority, for this and other reasons, fails to take advantage of the employment opportunities available.

As against these, there are numerous bands in which the distance and physical isolation are obviously not the dominant factors impeding economic development. These account in the aggregate for a large minority, if not the majority, of Indians in Canada, In many parts of the country Indian bands are on the outskirts of, or within reasonable commuting distance of, cities or towns that offer potentially unlimited job opportunities to Indians. Again, in recent years, new resource development projects, and accompanying new industries and towns, have developed close to hitherto isolated Indian communities.

Yet only a minority of Indians, as Tables A, B, I and II above bring out, have been able or willing to take advantage of such opportunities, to the extent of obtaining steady work or seasonal jobs at relatively high rates of pay, such as to provide annual incomes of $3000 or more (the level which social workers and others tend to identify as a minimum level of decency for a household).

---

[1] Cf. H. Hawthorn, C Belshaw and S. Jamieson, The Indians of British Columbia (Toronto) 1957; S. Jamieson and H. Hawthorn, The Economic Future of Native Peoples in Northern Manitoba (Govt. of Manitoba, Winnipeg, 1962).

Here, obviously, the forces impeding the economic development of Indians are social, cultural or psychological rather than geographical, in nature. Again, it should be stressed that there are wide variations among Indian band communities as well as individuals – and even among bands within the same localities, or adjoining the same cities and industrial centres, as well as among different regions across the country. One attempt is made in the next three chapters to isolate and analyse the main variables accounting for these widely differing rates of development among Indian bands in this category. But, to repeat, certain special factors appear to apply in varying degrees to all Indian communities across the country.

Among the more important of these are:

1. As Proprietors. A larger proportion of Indians than of Whites are, technically, self-employed proprietors in such fields as fishing, trapping, farming, logging and pulp wood cutting and, to a much lesser extent, manufacturing, retailing, transportation and local service industries. A small minority in some of these activities has achieved outstanding success, owning capital worth tens of thousands (even in a handful of cases, hundreds of thousands) of dollars, and earning five-figure incomes. The majority, however, as our figures and numerous other surveys have indicated, derives very limited and inadequate incomes from such activities -- less generally than can be earned by those employed at unskilled or semi-skilled labour in other industries. Numerous reasons have been offered: overcrowding and depletion in the primary resource-based industries, as noted, inefficient or obsolete techniques and equipment; inability or unwillingness to accumulate and maintain the capital needed for effective operations; lack of technical and business know-how; lack of initiative and enterprise; and so on.

2. As Employees. Indians in many cases face even greater difficulties in some respects in becoming established as wage or salary-earning employees when they do attempt to leave their traditional fields of employment in the primary resource-based industries. Among the more easily observed reasons for this are the following:

   (a) Inadequate education and training to provide the knowledge, skills and techniques required in a large-scale, complex economy that is subject to rapid technological and other changes. Unemployment generally in Canada has been concentrated among those who have less than a full grade school, and to a lesser extent, high school, education. The majority of Indians are unskilled workers who lack such educational qualifications.

   (b) Discrimination. Even where Indians have the necessary educational or skill qualifications for employment, they face widespread discrimination from potential fellow workers as well as from employers. Many firms follow a definite policy (informally or unofficially, where such policies are illegal in terms of provincial legislation) of refusing to hire Indians at all, or in token numbers at best. Such discrimination is not against Indians as Indians, in most cases; it has developed as a result of unfortunate experiences with or observations of them as workers which tend to build up an unfavourable stereotype. Awareness among Indians of these attitudes tends to evoke counteracting attitudes and behaviour patterns that reinforce and justify the Whites' judgment of them. And so on, in a vicious circle.

   The unfavourable image of Indians, as workers or employees, is frequently expressed in such words or phrases as "shiftless", "irresponsible", "unreliable", or "lacking in drive", "careless with equipment", "spending their money foolishly", "they don't turn up on the job when they're supposed to", and "they quit without notice". Often these traits or behaviour patterns are attributed to drinking. The unfavourable generalizations are often qualified to some extent by favourable ones, such as: "they learn fast", "they'll work under conditions no White man would stand", "they'd be top workers in this line if they'd only stay with it", and the like.

Whites also tend to have an unfavourable image of Indians as residents or potential neighbours, and thus discriminate against them in the provision of housing and various services. Such discrimination may develop out of the living habits of some Indians - standards of dress, personal hygiene, comportment, housing and household management and child care.

These reactions are particularly apparent and important in small or medium-sized industrial or commercial centres near larger Indian reserves, and even more, in company towns or new company-controlled towns many of which have been built around the development of new resource-based industries (lumber, pulp and paper, mining and smelting) in areas hitherto predominantly Indian in population. Indians, in effect, are often frozen out of such communities by the attitudes and social pressures of the White residents. The companies that provide the payroll and economic base of such communities, and community officials under the pressure of local businessmen, may limit or exclude Indians as residents for fear that it might be difficult to attract and keep sufficient White residents and workers to assure continued growth of the industry and community.

In brief, then, many Indians even when they have the requisite skills, motivations and work habits, are prevented from getting remunerative wage employment because they are considered unacceptable in accessible centres of employment opportunity.

Cultural Factors

In general, the behaviour patterns of many Indians, and the attitudes and responses evoked among Whites prevent most Indians from participating and sharing effectively in the economic opportunities potentially available to them. Basic to these problems are the special and distinct culture or cultures of Indians, which diverge more or less sharply from those of most White communities. In general terms, culture is used here to refer to a fairly distinct complex of institutions, values, and ways of doing things. Indians have cultures that differ widely among themselves, but at the same time have in varying degrees some characteristics in common that distinguish them from most Whites. These common characteristics have developed in response to highly specialized relationships with White society at particular levels, and a special system of administration, in which Indians have been under the direct control and influence of government, churches, and special interests (notably the Hudson's Bay Company in numerous areas) to a far greater degree than has any other ethnic group.

It is at best difficult, if not impossible, to sort out and measure the degree to which each of these forces has shaped the character, values, attitudes and behaviour patterns of Indians in general or in particular communities. In general, however, they have the following results.

1. The Culture of the Reserve

(a) Advanced industrial nations have achieved this status in large part only through a long period of education, indoctrination, training and conditioning of their people, to respond to motivations or goals that will induce them to put forth the effort, and submit to various disciplines, restrictions and hardships, of the kinds necessary to achieve substantial economic growth. Our modern economy is characterized by an elaborate structure of status and prestige positions, and a wealth of goods, services and activities that provide satisfaction or escape by way of compensations generated by the types of work that have to be done. The rewards offered require money, and people are motivated to work, to varying degrees, largely by the money to be earned.

To people of most non-industrial cultures, however, such rewards may be intangible or meaningless, and thus fail to provide effective incentives for participating more actively in the economy.

Related to this is the fact that in most non-industrial cultures, the standard of living of most groups remains relatively static at a customary near-subsistence level, and the class or status structure is commonly ascribed rather than achieved. There is little or no incentive for individuals in such societies to work harder or longer to acquire money and accumulate goods to attempt to achieve higher status. Hence the time-worn complaint, familiar to many colonial areas as well as among employers of Indians in Canada, that "if you pay them more they simply quit that much sooner, once they have all they need". (This is not infrequently offered as a justification for paying Indian workers lower rates than Whites, for doing the same kinds of jobs. The dissatisfaction generated among Indians by unequal treatment of this kind probably enhances rather than reduces their rate of turnover.)

(c) Such societies are usually characterized by a close relationship of the individual to his family or kinship group and to his community and reserve. This relationship provides the individual with security in the social or emotional sense. It also provides him with a certain economic security in terms of a claim to at least a customary level of subsistence from family and kinsman. Individuals are reluctant to leave the community, and thus mobility to take advantage of outside job opportunities is inhibited, because prolonged absence in employment away from family and home village threatens to destroy such relationships and gives rise to anxiety and insecurity. This is often the governing factor that accounts for the failure of many Indians to "stay at the job" and their penchant to "quit without notice, for no apparent reason".

This security system may also have the effect in many cases of discouraging the accumulation of capital and the development of successful businesses, as well as dampening any ambition the individual may have for enhancing his income, For the reciprocal of the individual's claims against kinsmen are their claims against him, particularly when he has the ability or good fortune to earn a superior income. Such claims tend to reduce the standard of living of the higher income individual and his family, and the temporarily successful individual whose "family and kinfolk move in on him and eat and drink him out of house and home" has become a widely quoted item in the folklore about Indians.

Generalizations of this kind, again, would have widely differing degrees of applicability among different Indian groups. Among those groups which have depended essentially on fishing and trapping, the levelling and inhibiting effects of the sharing tradition are presumably most pronounced. The mobility required in their way of life, and the necessity to travel light would tend to generate attitudes and motivations rather indifferent or hostile to the accumulation of large or expensive types of capital or consumer goods and services, or to long-term employment in particular jobs in particular locales. On the other hand, in some bands, particularly in those with cultures that accorded prestige to the accumulation of capital in one form or another, the economic position of the more enterprising or promising individual may be enhanced by cooperative effort and pooling of funds by kinsmen and friends.

(d) There are often striking divergences between the evaluation of intrinsic job interest made by people of an advanced urban industrial culture on the one hand, and that made by a non-industrial culture on the other.

In modern urban industrial society, as noted before, many jobs lack intrinsic interest for the worker and thus other compensations are required to attract and hold him. Most White workers in our culture, where they have the choice, seem to prefer jobs that require inside rather than outside work; that are physically easy rather than hard, particularly if they are in the white collar rather than manual category; that are steady rather than intermittent; with big companies rather than with small; and in large cities rather than in isolated communities.

Job preferences among Indians seem to be quite opposite to these on a number of points. Indians show a marked preference for outdoor rather than indoor jobs; for men's work that has elements of excitement and risk, and opportunities for exhibiting prowess in competition with others; and for a variable rather than even pace of work, with period of peak physical effort followed by opportunities for rest and relaxation. Even when engaged in the same industries as Whites, Indians whether by choice or compulsion seem to avoid large cities or towns, and are employed mostly by small rather than large operators.

With most Indians, moreover, job interests and preferences are far less disassociated from other activities and interests than is the case with Whites. An Indian's preference for one type of job with a particular employer or in a particular location and his work habits on the job may be connected with such non-monetary attributes as seasonal layoffs that provide opportunities to engage in ceremonial activities and other social occasions of the band.

(e) One of the most commonly observed differences between producers or workers in non-industrialized as compared with industrialized cultures lies in the rhythms of work. Life has meaning in many Indian communities in terms of a recurring cycle of inter-related economic, social and religious activities and this cycle is geared to the different seasons of the year. Members of the group work intensively and participate strenuously in certain related activities for weeks at a time during one season, and then turn to other types of work for relaxation during the next season. By contrast, in our modern economy, the seasonal cycle has been all but eliminated, except in such fields as sports and fashion. The round of activities, of work and relaxation, eating and resting is geared to the daily and weekly cycle rather than to the seasons. That, perhaps, is the feature of industrial life that many Indians find difficult to accept, regardless of the rewards in money or status, for it deprives life of meaning in terms of their traditions and values.

(f) A strong desire for independent status is felt by many Indians and partially accounts for their extreme concentration in a few primary industries, and militates against their being integrated with the urban industrial economy in any large numbers. For in the primary industries it is still possible for individuals with little or no capital to make an independent living, although this is becoming more and more difficult, owing to increasing mechanization and the growing dominance of large-scale operations, on the one hand, and to depletion of resources and conservation measures on the other.

Self-employment offers a freedom to cease work and participate in other meaningful activities when the occasion demands, rather than be tied down to a rigid schedule which can be ignored by a hired employee only at the price of being dismissed.

Indians may be more uncomfortable working under the authority and supervision of a foreman than are Whites. Whites have been trained and indoctrinated to accept authority in business, industry, education and government, to make compromises and suffer indignities if necessary as a price for earning a livelihood and getting ahead. To Indians the exercise of authority by supervisors on the job may be unacceptable because it is regarded as illegitimate. Indian cultures have structures of status and authority which do not coincide with the division of labour in a complex economy of large-scale operations. Some of the high turnover of Indian workers in such fields as logging and sawmilling may represent sensitiveness to and dissatisfaction with the exercise of power and authority by supervisors to whom, in the Indian view, such prerogatives are not appropriate,

2. The System of Administration

The one factor that tends to be singled out more frequently than any other, in laying blame for the economic backwardness and underdevelopment of most Indians in Canada, is the general system of administration under the Indian Affairs Branch.

In discussing this question, two or three important points should be kept in mind from the outset, to qualify most of the generalizations that follow:

First is the fact that most of the generalizations regarding economic status, and the characteristics and behaviour patterns attributed to Indians, as outlined above, are also applied widely to the Metis where these constitute recognizable, distinct groups of any significant size in a community. They, however, are the responsibility of provincial and/or municipal authorities, and do not come under the jurisdiction of the Indian Affairs Branch's system of administration. Therefore the special features of administration that are widely attributed as the generator of special Indian characteristics and behaviour patterns, cannot be held responsible for similar attributes of the Metis.

Secondly, it should be stressed that the special features of the Indian Affairs Branch's philosophy and system of administration, as discussed below, are today becoming a matter of past history. Probably no long established department or branch in the entire federal government has been undergoing such drastic changes in structure and personnel, in philosophy, policies and objectives as the Indian Affairs Branch has been experiencing over the past few years, in an effort to correct past limitations and carry out ambitious new programs on behalf of Canada's Indian population. However, most Indians now of working age were born and raised in reserves under the old system of administration which, in spite of a radically changed Branch philosophy, shows a remarkable tenacity of life in many agencies and in many reserves. The generalizations that follow, therefore, regarding the effects of this system upon attitudes, behaviour patterns and levels of economic performance of the adult Indian population of today are offered as still valid.

As so many critics have pointed out at one time or another, including many on the staff of the Indian Affairs Branch itself, the main emphasis of the Branch's policy in previous decades has been administration, as such, rather than development in the full sense of the term. The Branch has been, from the outset, in the position of "trustee" for Indians and the main objectives of the trusteeship until recently have been those of caretaking and protection. Up to World War II this consisted mainly of protecting property interests, while providing a minimum of subsistence, housing, health and welfare, education, and other services well below White standards. Since World War II the standards have been raised considerably and over the past decade particularly much greater emphasis has been put on education, economic development, and encouragement of Indians generally to achieve greater autonomy, independence, and responsibility for running their own affairs. The actual system as distinct from Branch policy remains, to a large extent, one of paternalism though every effort is now being made to decentralize and democratize it. The Indian Affairs Branch still exerts a degree of authority over Indians, particularly with regard to economic matters, far greater than any other government agency exerts over Whites. This exertion of authority tends to elicit from Indians attitudes of dependency, irresponsibility, apathy, submissiveness, and disguised hostility.

The relationship and the interactions it has tended to generate are seen most clearly at the level of the Agency Superintendent and the bands under his jurisdiction. This official, characteristically overworked and understaffed, is responsible for dispensing a wide variety of benefits and services of vital importance to the physical or material welfare of the Indians under his jurisdiction, and for keeping detailed records and submitting reports about a variety of matters. He must also deal with other Whites who deal with Indians (e.g. priests or ministers, storekeepers, nurses, teachers, officers of the law and other functionaries). Agency Superintendents may differ widely in ability and ideas, but the pressure of their duties forces virtually all of them to function in a primarily administrative rather than development role, and in an authoritarian rather than democratic and educative fashion.

In many of the more isolated, economically backward or under-developed reserves, as Dunning and others have noted, the White minority of functionaries has an unusual status and power, resting on outside authority in the dispensation of services to the majority of dependent residents. They are in positions having a degree of authority which is quite different from any counterparts in White society, and this tends to generate a special set of attitudes and behaviour patterns on their part. Each member of this small White minority has a virtual monopoly in the dispensation of money goods and services on which Indians must depend for their livelihoods and welfare; the superintendent or his assistant in granting relief, housing grants or credits, liaison with other agencies, and the like; the Hudson's Bay Company factor as store manager (and sometimes one or two competitors) in supplying grubstakes or other forms of credit, buying produce and selling food, clothing and other necessities; the nursing station in providing health or , medical services, and referring cases to hospital for further treatment; the priest or pastor in administering to things of the spirit and interceding on the Indians' behalf with other authorities (as well as in putting restrictions on certain activities). Indians consequently tend to become structured in their attitudes to Whites in this sort of situation in ways which prevent their successful adjustment to and participation in White society.

The background and conditioning of this environment have tended to structure the relationships of Indians with Whites off the reserve as well, and to create an ambivalent attitude to authority that complicates labour-employer relations and makes it difficult for Indians to adjust successfully to regular wage or salaried employment. On the one hand, attitudes of dependence and passivity have tended in many cases to encourage the unscrupulous White employers (like some of their counterparts in fish and fur-buying, and in store-keeping) to exploit Indians. And on the other, such attitudes inhibit many Indians from verbally expressing their values or grievances to the employer, and actively fighting for their legitimate rights.[1]

Many of the unfavourable behaviour patterns that White employers or fellow workers attribute to Indians, therefore, have arisen in part from the special attitudes and problems of communication generated by the special system of Indian-White relationships and administration under which most Indians have lived, These patterns are marked by apathy and apparent indolence, by high labour turnover (or "quitting for no apparent reason"), and sometimes by conscious or unconscious carelessness or sabotage of equipment, rather than by verbal, overt and organized union demands, grievances procedure, and spontaneous wildcat strikes.

Of course these generalizations do not hold in every case. Modifications have to be allowed for in particular situations. Some Indian bands have shown a high degree of initiative and willingness to assume responsibility, running their reserve communities with a minimum of dependence upon, or interference from, agency superintendents. Other Indian reserves are notoriously difficult to administer because the local minority of Whites are plagued with excessive demands on the part of their Indian clientele, backed up even by intimidation and actual or threatened violence. Again, while Indian workers usually express their job dissatisfactions by simply quitting without notice, occasionally they have engaged in strikes, protest marches and lobbying.

Another by-product of the past has been a certain rigidity in attitudes, as expressed in an inability or unwillingness to use initiative to meet immediately pressing -- and apparently easily soluble -- problems. This shows in the inefficient methods and techniques by which, in many or most communities, people utilize locally available resources for their own domestic purposes, as well as for sale in the market. This point is discussed at greater length below.

The reserve system is also a system of security that has tended in many cases to inhibit Indians from seeking, or keeping, outside wage or salaried employment. On their reserves, Indians can be assured at least of minimum subsistence from public subsidy, supplemented by what fish, game, fuelwood, and other resources they are willing and able to garner for themselves. They are also assured of housing of some sort, education, nursing and, where necessary, medical and hospital treatment, and other essential services. Off the reserve they have had to shift pretty much for themselves in most cases or depend on agencies and officials with which they are unfamiliar.

---

[1] As an extreme example of this latter situation, one able and ambitious young Indian became ill from hepatitis and was unable to eat, much less work, properly for several days. His employer accused him of laziness and malingering, and he was fired from his job. He put up no verbal protest and left quietly. His case would not have become known if he had not arrived at the Indian Affairs Branch Office in a nearby town, in a state of serious illness, utter destitution and near starvation.

The dependence of reserve Indians on a few White administrators for aid and prerequisites of various kinds perhaps enhances the tendency for the less fortunate majority to depend on the more fortunate kinsmen -- a tendancy perhaps general among people dependent on public welfare, The whole concept of social welfare or social security in the broad sense, is in principle supposed to free the individual family or kinship group from the responsibility of assuming the entire burden of sustaining all of its members who are in need – the young and dependent, aged and infirm, the sick, injured and unemployed, and so on. Presumably, then, more liberal and comprehensive social welfare or social security programs should reduce the burden of kinship claims on the individual.

In practice, however, in the actual administration of social security or welfare, until very recently, those with good jobs and income were expected to carry their less fortunate relatives, and the latter were denied public assistance. This tended to be the practice in the administration of Indian affairs, as in provincial and municipal welfare. It should be stressed, however, that the welfare policies of the Indian Affairs Branch and most other government agencies have been changed in this regard in recent years. The family is no longer held responsible for the maintenance of dependent relatives, so that the deterrent effects of welfare policy on individual economic incentives and development, as outlined below, should be much less operative in the future.

The results of inconsistencies or anomalies in mutual aid and social assistance policies in previous decades tended to have a more serious effect on Indians than on Whites because a far smaller proportion of the former have managed to become established in the more secure, well-paid types of employment, and a much larger proportion were and are in the low-income, dependent category. The result has been to perpetuate a sort of poverty cycle among Indians, and a wide gap in per capita income between Indians and Whites, even when employed at the same types of jobs and at the same rates of pay.

In the more isolated reserves where fish, game, fur and timber resources are insufficient to meet the needs of a rapidly expanding population, the anomalous situation often exists where the welfare cases (the aged, the sick, the mothers with numerous children) who have no relative earning enough to support them, receive more income in cash or kind than able-bodied male workers can earn from intermittent employment in the traditional resource-based industries, or from unemployment relief. The demoralizing effects of this situation are more than obvious. Cutting off relief to force people to work is obviously no solution. A solution may rather lie in encouraging and making possible the migration of increasing numbers into urban-industrial areas that offer increasing employment opportunities, and, for some, providing new techniques and equipment in resource-based industries that will provide incomes from work above those provided by relief.

But in this context, kin obligations tend to reduce the real income and standard of living of the individual worker and his family below that of his fellow workers, render him socially unacceptable in the industrial, urban community, and undermine or destroy any incentives he may have to stay on the job (with all its unaccustomed drudgery, discipline and monotony) much less to exert extra effort to get ahead.

The burdens of aid to kin and friends seem to underlie a multitude of problems in addition to those of employment and income alone. In some cases alcoholism is induced by the feelings of hopelessness and resignation -- nothing to work for or see ahead -- as well as a means of blunting the inter-personal conflicts and tensions that arise from overcrowding and friction with kin and others.

There is a similar background to the tendency of some Indian women to become slatternly. Some Indian wives and mothers, faced with unlimited child-bearing and unlimited demands from kin for support, on bare subsistence incomes and with inadequate housing and facilities, simply give up. They have nothing to look forward to, to dress for, or to put up an appearance for. (Much of the opposition to employing Indians, or allowing them to reside in the community appears to be based mainly on the slatternly and demoralized appearance, living habits and behaviour patterns of their womenfolk.)

So, likewise, arises the violence that lies so close beneath the surface of the apparent passivity and resignation of Indians. One has only to observe the frequent verbal and physical brawls among men, and between men and women, in some towns, and the disproportionate number of arrests that Indians account for, even with permissive policy by law enforcement authorities.

Such generalizations are most applicable to the more geographically isolated Indian bands, particularly those in the northern belt that specialize in fishing and trapping and which have become increasingly dependent upon relief and various special services from outside. They would also apply to a special degree, perhaps, to Indian bands in rural areas lacking in opportunities for industrial employment, and which thus depend upon Branch subsidies and technical aid to carry on farming or ranching activities, supplemented by relief. The limitations of the reserve system, however, still seem to apply to a considerable degree to even the most urbanized bands, inhibiting them from participating fully in the urban industrial economy.

3. Contact and Relationships with White Society

The character, duration, and extent of contacts and relationships of Indians with White society varies widely, of course, as between the geographically isolated band whose members see only a handful of White functionaries the year round, on the one extreme, to the highly urbanized band whose reserve has become hardly more than an enclave or suburb of a large metropolitan community, on the other. As will be brought out in more detail later, the differences in relationships between Indians and Whites appear to be one of the most important variables determining differential rates of economic development among Indian communities. So here, again, sweeping generalizations can be misleading and dangerous. In the aggregate, however, it seems safe to conclude that the nature of the relationships, in the majority of cases, has been such as to reinforce the traits that are so inimical to the economic development of Indians.

Contact with White society, with a much richer diversity of goods and services than the tribal cultures could provide, did of course generate new demands among Indians – new standards of living or consumer aspirations above the customary level– that provided varying degrees of motivation to participate as workers and producers in the White-controlled economy.

From their first contact with Whites over a period of centuries, however, the pattern of participation has tended to be one of weakness in the bargaining power of Indians, and growing dependence on Whites. This developed first in trapping and fur trading where (except for brief periods of intense competition such as between the Hudson's Bay and North West Companies) the Indian trapper and his family became dependent on the fur trader as a local monopolist in buying the furs and providing equipment and other supplies (and, most important, credit or furnish to carry the family over the slack season). Frequently the relationship became one almost of bondage: the buyer would extend credit in order to obligate the Indian to produce and sell his furs exclusively to the creditor, while the debtor was induced to remain in debt to insure that he would always have a ready buyer of his produce. Suspicion among Indians of exploitation and cheating on the part of the Whites (well-founded in all too many cases) was and still is endemic in the relationship, in so far as the high costs and risks facing the fur buyer required him to pay the Indians far less than the final market price for their furs, and charge a high markup on goods sold to them.

Much the same sort of pattern of dependency has been characteristic of other primary, resource-based industries in which Indians have tended to concentrate: contract logging, pulpwood and pole-cutting; clearing and brush cutting; fishing and fish canning and processing.

A long history of and experience with this type of relationship, coupled with the paternalism of the reserve system, has tended to structure the attitudes and relationships of Indians working for employers in other industries. This is even more likely because Indians, through discrimination and other disadvantages, are generally more limited in their choice of job opportunities and therefore in a weaker position of bargaining power than are other workers.

The other main element in White society with which Indians come into most frequent contact because of the occupations in which they tend to specialize, and the low and uncertain earnings they receive, are the generally low-income casual workers who depend on welfare or relief for a large part of their livelihoods.

As a number of studies have brought out, casual, low-income workers tend to develop distinct cultures with their own systems of ethics, scales of values, motivations and norms of behaviour as a process of adjustment to the social and economic environment in which they have to work and live. This type of subculture, or culture of poverty, is sharply at variance on many points with the more acceptable ways of life of steadily employed and better paid middle-class and working class groups.

The motivations and behaviour patterns of casual or underprivileged workers in urban-industrial society shed some light on the patterns of Indian work in modern industry. Superficially, indeed, the underprivileged White worker's sub-culture resembles life in many Indian communities more than it does that of the White middle or upper working class. The various barriers that prevent Indians from participating more fully and effectively in the economy tend to confine them to the ranks of the casual worker. The hardships and insecurities of the casual worker's life, the compensations which it provides, and the behaviour patterns it forms, all serve to reinforce the economic values of the reserve.

Conclusion and Summary

In seeking to explain the generally depressed position of Indians in Canada the main emphasis has been placed on social and cultural factors influencing motivations, attitudes and behaviour patterns. As brought out more fully in a later chapter, these appear to have been more important than objective physical and technical factors such as location, accessibility to resources and availability of capital.

Attention has been focussed on a few socio-cultural forces that have moulded the Indians; the reserve cultures, the system of administration, and the major points of contact with White society. These have been pictured as self-reinforcing, in ways that inhibit the Indians from adjusting to and participating in the larger economy effectively.

It would be misleading and erroneous, however, to leave the impression that those sets of influences have been at all times consistent and unilateral in character. The Indian Affairs Branch, for instance, on numerous occasions has supplied large amounts of capital and technical aid to various Indian bands and individuals in an effort to improve their economic status and enable them to become more independent. Its efforts have frequently been frustrated, however, by Indian apathy, suspicion and non-cooperation, and by internal conflicts within the Branch which such new experiments have tended to generate. On the other hand, as the statistics on employment and income in Tables A and B above indicate, a substantial fraction of almost one-quarter of all Indians in the sample surveyed have left their reserves while still retaining their band membership, while another, possibly larger number and proportion have left permanently and fitted into White society on various levels. Among band members generally, including some bands in which the vast majority continue to reside on the reserve, a significant and growing minority have come to terms effectively with White society and participate successfully in the urban industrial economy as steadily or regularly employed skilled and semi-skilled wage earners, clerical workers, self-employed proprietors and salaried professional personnel

CHAPTER V

COMPARATIVE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AMONG VARIOUS INDIAN BANDS IN CANADA

Introduction

The broad survey in the preceding chapter of a representative sample of Indian bands across Canada brings out sharply the generally depressed economic status and serious under-employment and dependency among Indians in this country. It also brings out the fact, however, that a minority have achieved levels of income and occupational status above those enjoyed by the majority of Whites. Even within the confines of a broad survey of averages, it is evident that there are wide inequalities in wealth and income among individual Indians.

The explanations offered for the generally depressed economic position of Indians in Canada apply to all bands to some extent, in so far as they have all gone through somewhat similar experiences under an unique system of administration, and in so far as attitudes and relationships between Whites and Indians fall into certain characteristic patterns wherever the two groups are in continuous contact.

The intensity and impact of such forces vary widely, however, among communities in different areas, While all communities, as pointed out, share some common characteristics and experiences, at the same time it is true to say that each Indian band is an unique entity that differs more or less sharply from other Indian bands in several or many respects: size of population; resources; ownership of capital; types of work, average size of income; rates of unemployment and dependence on relief; religion: family size; education and skill; proximity to White communities of various sizes and types; quality of leadership; attitudes of Whites and Indians towards each other, and patterns of social interaction between them; administrative policy with regard to such matters as education, loans or grants of capital, and economic development generally; and so on.

A comparative cross-country survey of communities in this regard reaffirms the old principle that broad averages hide significant differences. This is apparent with regard to their comparative economic development. If, for reasons spelled out in Chapter II, per capita level of real income from gainful employment is accepted as the main index of economic development, then the differences between band communities are significantly wide, For, in the representative sample of thirty-five surveyed in the preceding chapter, the most highly developed band, Skidegate, in the Queen Charlotte Islands of Northern British Columbia, had a per capita income from gainful employment of about $1,252, or more than twenty times that of Piapot, Saskatchewan, the least developed in the sample.

There are similar, even wider, extremes with regard to other indices of economic development, or lack of it, Dependence on welfare for varying periods during 1963 ranged from 100 per cent of all households in such bands as James Smith or Peguis and from $192 per capita in Shubenacadie, to nothing, on both counts, in Tyendinaga. Similarly, in the Sheshaht Band, 85 per cent of the employable males between the ages of sixteen and sixty-four had eleven to twelve months employment during the year, while in the James Smith Band more than one-half the males were employed for less than two months, and only 5 per cent worked eleven to twelve months in the same period.

There has been, as noted earlier, a vast body of literature since World War II dealing with the question of comparative levels among developing nations and peoples. Numerous hypotheses have been formulated, tested and applied (in the form of capital or technical aid programs, for instance) . Some of these hypotheses appear to have been disproved in some cases by failures at the operational level, while others appear to have been validated (to the extent that this is possible through follow-up research and concrete achievement in particular cases)

This research project is based on the assumption that native Indians in Canada - - while representing a special case differing in some important respects from that of developing countries in Asia, Africa or Latin America -- do have some features in common with these, and do offer a special opportunity (as something of a control group or laboratory sample) for testing the validity of various hypotheses that have been formulated at one time or another in attempting to explain the main variables that operate to encourage. or discourage, economic development. A comparative analysis of bands in the sample offers an unique opportunity for testing various beliefs and hypotheses. In terms of practical results, it should be capable of providing guidelines for achieving more effective developmental programs in the future.

The main hypotheses to be examined and tested where data are available and statistically measurable are outlined below. The statistical and other factual data drawn from the Resources Questionnaire of 1964-65 supplemented by other special reports and research studies provide the main sources. Somewhat arbitrarily perhaps, but for convenience in analysis, the main hypotheses to be examined are grouped under three broad headings, as follows:

Economic Factors Affecting Development

1. Ownership of, or access to, resources
2. Ownership of, or access to, capital
3. Social capital or infrastructure
4. Leavening effect of a professional and entrepreneurial middle class
5. Occupations, earnings and continuity of employment
6. Rates of population growth.

Socio-Economic Factors (Chapter VI)

1. Educational levels and attainments
2. Demonstration effect and proximity to urban centres
3. Mobility
4. Dependence on welfare.

Socio-Cultural Factors (Chapter VII)

1. Religious affiliation
2. Participation in Indian ceremonial activities or revivals
3. Kinship ties and obligations
4. Quality of leadership
5. Organized activity within the band
6. Participation in outside activities and organizations
7. Social and personal disorganization
8. Administrative policy.

The main purpose of this exercise is to measure and examine the degree to which the differential levels of economic development achieved by the members of the band communities are correlated to the economic, social and cultural variables listed above.

A couple of observations should be made at the outset. Some hypotheses based on certain variables in the above lie in the realm of popular myths or beliefs that have been attacked and discredited by social scientists in other contexts. There still seems some value in testing them as applied to Indians, however, if only to invalidate them further where they continue to be held.

Again, some hypotheses, on the basis of a number of variable factors listed, would obviously apply at the extremes. It would seem obvious, for instance, that the six or eight highest income, most economically developed bands in the sample would generally (though not in each and every case) be in closer physical proximity to industries and jobs have larger accumulations of capital, ownership of or access to more resources higher levels of education, and be less dependent on welfare than would be the case with the six or eight lowest income, least developed bands, particularly where these latter are geographically isolated communities whose populations have outgrown the locally available resources on which they have depended for their livelihoods. The weight of the extreme cases, may, in a straight statistical test, show a fairly high degree of correlation, but it is questionable how much value this has.

The problems of the geographically isolated and depressed bands concern particularly those in the broad northern wooded belt of the country, which have depended upon fishing and trapping. They also include certain relatively isolated rural bands in the Prairie region, and in cutover areas of the Maritimes. All of these face the problem of inadequate resources available locally, coupled with distance from potentially alternative job opportunities. In the aggregate, these comprise a minority of the Indians in Canada, but a rapidly growing minority. They constitute a special problem in Indian Affairs, of a kind that calls for special policies and programs on their behalf.

More interesting and important in some respects are comparisons among the majority of Indian band communities which are broadly classed as in the middle position of transitional, and comparisons between these and the minority of relatively developed bands. For among these, several widely accepted hypotheses break down, and numerous variable factors often thought to be crucial for economic development fail to show any significant correlation with levels of per capita real income. Numerous Indian band that are lacking in some types of assets generally deemed favourable to economic development have been compensated by others.

Economic Factors Affecting Development

The most over-simplified hypotheses of poverty and under-development among various nations and peoples have been those formulated o the basis of pure economic analysis. Policies based on such analyses have frequently proven to be expensive failures, because of failing to take account of social or cultural variables that may be crucial to the economic development of a people.

Basic to pure economic analysis is one assumption applied more or less universally to all peoples and cultures, namely, scarcity in relation to wants.. People, it is assumed, naturally desire to have more goods and services than are currently available to them regardless of their ethnic or cultural backgrounds, their current standards of living or per capita real income levels. The only essential limitations to their economic growth, their getting more, are the means available; i.e. the availability of resources, capital, techniques and job opportunities, relative to population growth.

The basic problem facing developing peoples is seen as a self-perpetuating poverty cycle. Due to a shortage of resources relative to population, or a shortage of capital or poor techniques that prevent them utilizing their resources effectively, they live on inadequate subsistence incomes. Because of low per capita incomes they are forced to consume most or all that they produce or earn. This renders them unable to save and accumulate the capital that would be required to increase their productivity and raise their levels of income. Advanced, high income peoples or nations by contrast, enjoy a reverse and built-in trend of dynamic expansion, whereby high incomes make possible large savings, and capital formation and training in new technologies to assure further growth in per capita income in the future.

The transition from one stage to the other, therefore, would require first the provision of capital, technical aid and advice by loan or gift to increase productivity without having to reduce the already inadequate levels of consumption and social or welfare services; and second, with higher incomes derived from the use of capital and technical aid, larger saving and capital accumulation to take place to the point that economic development and rising per capita income can become a self-sustaining process of increased saving, capital investment, technological know-how, output and income.

1. Ownership or Availability of Resources

The most widely accepted cause of the poverty that afflicts the majority of nations today is that of population outrunning available resources. On the other hand, some of the highest income, most economically developed nations are notably poor in resources relative to population (e.g. Great Britain, Japan, Holland and Switzerland), while some of the lowest per capita income countries have large and diverse resources (e.g. Indonesia and the Congo). Obviously, then, the economic development of a nation does not depend primarily on the ownership or availability of resources as such, but rather on such factors as the possession of capital and techniques, and a social and political structure that enables a people to utilize resources effectively, or, where resources are unavailable, to utilize the talents of its human resources to process and produce other goods and services in exchange.

Band communities in various important respects are hardly comparable with nations because of their much smaller size, less diversified skills, and greater dependence on outside markets. As small enclaves in a highly developed economy, they have potentially unlimited access to capital and technical knowledge. On the other hand, their restricted links to White society limits their acquisition of capital, technical knowledge and know-how and leaves them far more dependent on resource-based industries for their livelihoods, as the survey in the preceding chapter brings out. One would expect, therefore, that ownership or availability of resources would play a major role in determining the relative degree of economic development and per capita income positions achieved by most band communities. Mainly on this assumption, the Indian Affairs Branch, in its economic development policies, has tended in the past to lay major stress in planning and personnel and in providing capital and technical aid, upon local resource development projects for Indian band communities. This emphasis may also have been, and perhaps still is, encouraged by considerations of administrative convenience, The structure of the Indian Affairs Branch has been based essentially on the reserve as the basic administrative unit, and developmental or other activities beyond the reserve area involve complicated relationships with provincial and local governmental agencies, as well as a variety of private interests. For reasons that will be spelled out more fully later such a policy appears to have been misguided on several counts if aimed solely at economic goals.

It is difficult, at best, to devise any adequately measurable index of resource ownership or availability to determine to what extent local resources do account for economic development, and for differences in per capita real income among bands. First, it is difficult to get accurate estimates of the potential employment and income-producing capacity of any given type, or area, of resources. Tracts of improved crop land or unimproved range land vary widely in fertility and yield, and in distance from markets; woodlands and timber stands likewise differ in quality of timber and number of board feet per acre; similarly, waterfront acreage on rivers, lakes and seashore in their attractiveness as potential tourist sites; arid, of major importance to many bands, the potentialities of reserve land for business or industrial sites if adequate transportation, electrical power, water and other facilities were provided (as noted before, the Indian Affairs Branch's Resources Questionnaire was not concerned with this latter type of resource).

Certain general observations can be made safely, however.

Reserve Resources

First, very few Indian bands derive any large part of their livelihoods in gainful employment from the direct utilization of resources within band-owned reserves. There are several reasons for this:

(1) Most reserves originally were laid out and designed mainly for residential purposes, on the temporary meeting-grounds or campsites of mobile bands that derived their livelihoods from resources over a fairly wide area beyond reserve boundaries. This is particularly true of the numerous mobile bands across the northern wooded belt, whose members depended on hunting and fishing; it is true of the numerous more sedentary bands along the coastline of British Columbia for similar reasons,

(2) Most bands that were originally assigned relatively large reserves with sizable tracts of agricultural land or timber stands, have since grown in population beyond the level that the resources could sustain, even if the resources were utilized with maximum efficiency.

(3) Those bands which do have more than enough resources in their reserves (in agricultural land, timber, oil or minerals, and tourist business or industrial sites) sell or lease the major part of these to outside interests rather than develop them directly. The proceeds usually go into band funds or band revenues, which contribute towards welfare and other services of the community, and part of which are sometimes distributed as cash dividends to the band members.

For these reasons, there appears to be little, if any, correlation between resource ownership and economic development of Indian bands, as measured by per capita real income from gainful employment. Some of the most economically depressed bands in the sample under study have relatively large amounts of land suitable for raising crops or livestock. Notable in this category are the Piapot and the James Smith Bands, As may be seen from Table III below (comprising sixteen bands in the sample of thirty-five that are deemed to have some potentialities for internal development in agriculture and forestry) the James Smith Band has, on a per capita basis, 28 acres of improved crop land, 4 acres of range land and 8.75 acres of woodland, while Piapot has 10.45, 15.4 and 3.24 acres in these respective categories. These holdings are considerably above the average for the bands listed in the Table, particularly in the more productive category, that of improved crop land. Yet, in a ranking of thirty-five bands according to per capita income levels, James Smith comes thirty-first and Piapot thirty-fifth. The reason for this is, mainly, that these land holdings are too small to sustain the population on the basis of the large-scale farming operations required for optimum efficiency, while alternative employment opportunities are lacking in these areas of Saskatchewan.

Even those few bands which have more than enough resources to sustain the population at a reasonably high level of employment and income are far from being the most economically developed. The outstanding example is the Sarcee Band adjoining the City of Calgary. This band, with a population of 368, has on its reserve no less than 11,631 acres or 31.6 acres per capita of improved agricultural land, and 55,361 acres of unimproved land, Of these latter, 14,014 acres or about thirty-eight per capita are in rangeland and 25,887 acres are in woodland, of which 15 per cent or about 11-1/4 acres per capita are being logged commercially. It is estimated that potential crop-land in the reserve amounts to 18,000 acres, or about fifty per capita, and potential hay and grazing land almost 22,000 acres or fifty-nine per capita. In sum, then, land actually or potentially productive in terms of agriculture and forestry amounts to some 300 acres per capita or 1,475 acres per household. Added to these assets are revenues from oil leases that amount to more than $100,000 per annum and that have built up a band fund of more than one million dollars,

Yet with these assets, the Sarcee Band can be considered, at best, as only moderately developed, or relatively under-developed. In terms of per capita real income from gainful employment, it ranks seventeenth out of the thirty-five bands in the sample,

In contrast to such examples as these, several of the most economically developed, highest income bands have no or virtually no, workable or marketable resources within their reserve boundaries. Notable examples are Lorette, Skidegate and Sheshaht. In a couple of other high income bands, notably

TABLE III

AGRICULTURAL AND WOODED LAND PER CAPITA

SIXTEEN SELECTED BANDS

Band	Improved Crop Land	Unimproved Land	
	(Acres Per Capita)	Range	Woodland
		(Acres Per Capita)	
Walpole Island	6.24		1.5
Tyendinaga	2.96	.87	.64
Six Nations	1.34	.28	2.35
Kamloops	1.67	71.87	28.67
Williams Lake	.51	7.72	5.67
River Desert	1.13	.45	45,35
St. Mary's	3.27	90.57	8.07
Pointe Bleue	.59	-	-
Oak River	6,1	2.12	-
Cold Lake	2.1	14.2	24.0
The Pas	1,24	2.33	7.77
James Smith	28.0	4.0	8.75
Peguis	.4	13.9	24.4
Piapot	10.45	15.4	3.24
Sarcee	31.6	38.0	70.0
Sampson	9.6	6,0	5.4

Caughnawaga and Squamish, the main resource (apart from the human factor) is land leased for business or industrial purposes.

Even in those relatively well-developed, high-income bands that do have sizable natural resources within their reserves (notably Walpole Island, Tyendinaga and Six Nations, all in Ontario) the resources account for only a minor part of the members' incomes from gainful employment, and the average earnings of those employed directly in utilizing the resources are considerably below those engaged in other types of employment. This is made evident in Table IV below, which includes the same list of bands as in the preceding table. In the highest income bands, it may readily be seen, farm proprietors comprise only a small fraction of the labour force, and their earnings are considerably below the general average. The same is true of most of the other bands in the sample, including the land-rich Sarcee described above. Of the five bands in which farm proprietors did receive higher average earnings than the total labour force, four, namely Oak River and Peguis, Manitoba and James Smith and Piapot, Saskatchewan, are, as noted before, in predominantly agricultural areas lacking in alternative opportunities for employment. And, as noted, they are among the lowest-income, most depressed and dependent Indian band communities in the country.

One obvious explanation for the relatively small proportion of farmers in the labour force, and their relatively low average earnings in those bands having more or less substantial agricultural potentialities lies in the disinterest of Indians in farming, and their generally small-scale, inefficient methods. Related to this is the fact that in most cases Indian bands tend to lease out more land than they cultivate themselves. Of the total improved cropland held by the sixteen bands listed in Tables III and IV, only 34.7 per cent or hardly more than one-third is farmed by band members themselves, while almost two-thirds is leased to non-Indians. In the case of the Sarcee Band in particular, 82 per cent of the cropland, and 90 per cent of the woodland (15 per cent logged commercially and the remainder used for grazing) is leased to non-Indians.

The Resources Questionnaire asked superintendents to indicate "reasons for the lack of development of resources available to Indians". With regard to agricultural resources, in the representative sample of forty bands for which the data are available the answers given were as follows, ranked by frequency:

Reasons	Number
Attitudes of (reserve) residents	(18)
Attractiveness of wage employment	(16)
Educational level of Indians	(15)
Lack of vocational training	(12)
Lack of funds	(12)
Lack of guidance	(7)
Land tenure system	(7)
Other	
Trust fund and oil revenue distributions	(2)
Lack of initiative	(1)
Mismanagement of earnings	(1)

Resources Available Outside the Reserves

With regard to natural resources, those outside of reserves and to a varying degree accessible or available to band members are far more important than those within their reserves. In the nature of the case they are also less measurable in quantity, quality and economic impact in different Indian band communities.

Here the picture is fully as variable as resource ownership but, again, there appears to be little, if any, consistent correlation between resource availability and per capita real income from gainful employment among the Indian bands under study. At the one extreme are the most economically depressed bands as noted before: those in the northern wooded belt who have depended hitherto on fishing and trapping, but whose populations have outrun the resources available, or whose resources have become depleted. Outstanding examples are Oxford House and Shammattawa in Northern Manitoba, and Big Cove in New Brunswick. Equally depressed and dependent, however, have been such bands as Hay Lake in Northwestern Alberta which has, however, just begun to receive important revenues from oil, and full employment has just been achieved. While among members of this latter and many other northern bands incomes from hunting, fishing and trapping have sharply declined, their community is within easy access of potentially fertile and productive farmland and timber stands which, for various reasons, they have left virtually untouched. (This was the case until recently of the Hay Lake Band in Northwestern Alberta, for instance. See special report by B. Baich, Indian Affairs Branch Community Development Officer for Northern Alberta.)

At the other extreme, among the highest-income, most economically developed bands are some located within access of resources which they specialize in exploiting, whether as wage-earning employees or as self-employed proprietors. Outstanding among these are three Indian bands in British Columbia; Nimpkish, whose members specialize in fishing supplemented by logging; Skidegate, the majority of whose members have shifted from fishing to logging; and Sheshaht, specializing in logging. On the other hand, a number of bands in British Columbia appear to be equally well located as are these three, with regard to accessibility to income and employment-producing resources, yet their per capita incomes are far lower.

One conclusion seems obvious from all this. The levels of economic development and per capita incomes achieved by Indian bands are determined, not so much by their ownership of or accessibility to resources, as by the band members' attributes of skill, technique, know-how and motivation in exploiting whatever resources or opportunities are available in the labour market. This seems borne out in Table VI below, in which the agency superintendents attribute reasons for the failure of Indians in forty representative bands to develop various types of resources available to them. The most frequent reasons, as noted, are (1) the educational levels of Indians and (2) their attitudes.

Finally, to repeat, among the highest income and most highly developed Indian bands are some that own or have access to virtually no natural resources

TABLE IV

COMPARISON OF AVERAGE ANNUAL INCOMES OF FARM PROPRIETORS AND TOTAL LABOUR FORCE IN SIXTEEN SELECTED BANDS

		Per Capita	Farm Proprietors*		All Workers	
Band	Population	Income from Gainful Employment	Number	Average Annual Earnings	Number	Average Annual Earnings
Walpole Is.	1422	$715	25	$2750	240	$2961
Tyendinaga	2033	516	34	1250	150	2500
Six Nations	7736	350	39	1760	1765	1983
Kamloops	314	314	8	1512	46	2037
Sarcee	368	302	34	1331	82	1354
Williams Lake	198	291	4	2600	2000	1570
River Desert	878	250	25	150	1000	1836
St. Mary's	175	249	3	750	25	1300
Pointe Bleue	1376	222	2	340	145	1586
Oak River	706	176	31	2526	158	770
Cold Lake	703	165	18	826	22	1545
The Pas	839	140	4	450	83	1283
James Smith	800	126	12	1517	65	1140
Peguis	1800	99	27	1800	192	480
Piapot	506	55	35	1103	76	318
Sampson	1431		136	445	215	530

- Average annual earnings of farm proprietors in this table include an allowance of $50 monthly for the months employed in farming, as an arbitrary estimate of value of home consumption for the households involved. In many cases, perhaps the majority, this may lead to an over-estimate of the real incomes of Indian farm proprietors.

suitable for primary production -- notably, Caughnawaga and Lorette. Their main resources are human ones of the skills, techniques and motivation needed to sell their labour effectively in the market. The only non-human resource that they have is land that is actually or potentially employment and revenue-producing for business or industrial purposes (and Lorette, with a total area of fifty-seven acres, of which only one is used for industrial purposes, has little even of that). Possession of such industrial or business land in itself does not necessarily make a major contribution to the economic development of an Indian community. Presumably it may do so in three main ways:

(a) It may stimulate some band members to undertake business enterprises or undertake new kinds of work;

(b) An influx of non-Indian business firms may provide a demonstration effect that influences consumer aspirations and work habits favourably among the residents; or

(c) As in Kamloops, for instance, land leases to non-Indian business firms can be used as a lever for providing new jobs for residents.

Considering the increasingly important role that business and industrial leases are playing in the economics of numerous Indian band communities, it might well indeed have been included in the item in the Resources Questionnaire on which the data in Table VI below are based.

2. Ownership or Availability of Capital

As outlined earlier, shortages or unavailability of capital are frequently offered as an explanation for the economic under-development of nations

TABLE VI

ATTRIBUTED REASONS FOR LACK OF DEVELOPMENT OF RESOURCES AVAILABLE TO INDIANS

	Agriculture	Forestry	Fishing	Trapping	Tourism	Total
1. Educational level of Indians	15	8	6	6	16	52
2. Lack of vocational training	12	11	6	1	12	42
3.Lack of guidance	7	10	7	5	12	42
4. Attractiveness of wage employment	16	4	8	11	2	41
5. Land tenure system	7	-	-	-	3	10
6. Lack of funds	12	8	8	4	10	42
7. Attitude of residents	18	11	5	12	5	51
8.Other						
a. Distribution of oil cheques and band revenues	2	1	1	1	3	8
b. Lack of initiative						
c. Mismanagement of earnings	1	1	1			3

or regions. Low levels of income prevent the accumulation of capital, and lack of capital prevents the developing of resources or the exploiting of market opportunities to raise incomes.

Among Indian bands of widely varying income levels, there does not appear to be any more consistent relationship between ownership or availability of capital and level of economic development, than there is with ownership of or accessibility to resources. Indeed, there is a fairly close functional relationship between capital and resources which are, in a sense, interchangeable factors of production. By and large, the bands which own the largest value of resources, per capita, likewise have the largest amount of capital, per capita, acquired through the sale or lease of resources to outside interests. Similarly, for reasons discussed more fully later, those bands whose members depend for their livelihoods primarily upon the exploitation of natural resources within or accessible to their reserves tend to accumulate more revenue-producing capital than those which specialize in wage or salaried employment.

In the broad sense, looking at the extreme cases, there is some relationship between ownership, control or availability of capital and degree or level of economic development – as there is with control over or accessibility to resources, as described above~ Certainly, the poorest and least developed Indian bands are those which have no band funds; whose individual members are unable to save, accumulate and invest capital profitably; and whose qualifications and ability to borrow capital from outside sources are most limited. At the other extreme are those bands which have large band funds and revenues and, because of their favourable position with regard to wealth and income potentials, are in a favourable position to raise capital from outside sources for specific projects.

Between these extremes, however, as the figures below bring out, there appears to be at most a very limited correlation between ownership, control, or availability of capital, and level of economic development achieved (as measured by average per capita real income derived from gainful employment).

The main revenue-producing capital owned by, or available to Indians for investment in revenue-producing undertakings, may be listed as follows:

(a) Band funds
(b) Band revenues
(c) Band-owned equipment
(d) Individual savings and real capital
(e) Capital aid or grants from the Indian Affairs Branch
(f) Repayable loans, from the Indian Affairs Branch
(g) Repayable loans or credit from other outside agencies (banks, finance companies, equipment dealers or suppliers, etc.)

The main questions, or hypotheses that call for testing and verification (or otherwise) from the evidence at hand are:

(a) Do Indian bands whose members enjoy a relatively high per capita income tend to save, accumulate and invest larger amounts of capital than do low income bands? If such is the case, to what extent have these higher income bands actually invested their capital in ways that contribute to their further economic development and higher income?

(b) Similar questions could be applied to Indian bands which have large band funds and revenues, due to the good fortune of owning or controlling sizable amounts of valuable collateral for sale or lease.

(c) What evidence, if any, is there to indicate that the availability of capital from the Indian Affairs Branch (in the form of capital aid; i.e. outright grants, or repayable loans) has contributed directly to economic advancement and higher per capita income?

(d) What special difficulties, if any, do Indians face in raising capital from other sources, and to what extent have these impeded their economic development?

Fortunately, in attempting to test such hypotheses, the Resources Questionnaire and other sources provide much fuller and more accurate data concerning capital than is the case for resources. And most of such data are amenable to quantifying and testing statistically, as shown in Table VII below. This tabulates, on a per capita basis, band funds, band revenues, and value of revenue-producing equipment and livestock that are band-owned, individually-owned and Branch owned, respectively, in each of 35 Indian bands selected from the representative sample discussed earlier, ranked in order from highest to lowest income. From these figures, coefficients of correlation[1] have been derived, to determine the degree of relationship, if any, between each of these sources of capital and their totals with levels of per capita income from gainful employment. As may be seen at a glance from the table, the correlations are slight and, in the case of Branch-owned equipment, inverse.

(a) Band Funds

The coefficient of correlation between band funds per capita and economic development (as measured by per capita real income from gainful employment) is only .075, which is so small as to amount to a random distribution. The extremes stand out in inverse correlation. As with ownership of resources, the Sarcee Band in Alberta has by far the largest funds per capita, at $2,191. In terms of per capita income from employment, however, the former is 14th out of the 35 bands. At the other extreme, Sheshaht Band in B.C. which ranks third in per capita income, has negligible band funds. Or, as another measure, 85.4 per cent of workers in Sarcee earned less than $2,000 per annum in 1964 as compared to 0 per cent in Sheshaht whose funds are minimal. Similar patterns are apparent, on a less extreme scale, among numerous other bands in the upper and lower ranges of the income scale.

---

[1] The coefficient of correlation measures the degree to which two sets of data (a dependent variable and an independent variable – in this case, per capita real incomes of the various bands in the sample) move together in a direct, straight line relationship.

TABLE VII

POTENTIALLY REVENUE-PRODUCING CAPITAL OWNED BY OR AVAILABLE TO INDIANS

(Amounts per capita in each of thirty-five bands)

Band	Income	Band Funds	Band Revenues Per Annum	Buildings, Equipment & Livestock Estimated Value			Total
				Band-owned	bd. Indians	I.A.B.-owned	
Skidegate	$1252	$104.3	$ 77.00	$ 35.4	$442	$ 0	$ 658.7
Caughnawaga	793	58.13	5.00	0	82.00	0	145.0
Walpole island	715	298.70	141,00	100.0	46.3	0	486
Sheshaht, V.1,	664	nil	0	47.8	14.8	0	62
Lorette	630	1	0	0	20.9	0	22
Squamish	630	258.6	183	0	24.0	0	464
Tyendinaga	516	21.0	11	1	38.7	8	80
Curve Lake	350	124	18	0	43.1	0	185
Six Nations	350	100	13	2	70.4	0	185
Mistassini	341	0	0	9	268.0	40	317
Dog Rib Rae	332	0	0	0	107.4	0	107.4
Port Simpson	325	46.5	26	8	80.0	0	80.0
Kamloops	314	739.15	266	42	138.3	6	1191
Sarcee	302	2190.10	625	116	462.8	0	3395
Fort William	298	183.9	39	0	11.3	0	234
Williams Lake	291	107.0	73	74	181.0	22	457
Moose Factory	284	1	0	0	70.3	74	145
River Desert	250	126	18	1	90.0	0	235
Attawapiskat	247	0	0	0	66.4	0	66
St. Mary's	249	203.9	40	0	35.1	0	279
Pointe Bleue	222	0	0	2	103.2	3	108
Tobique	215	87.8	11	0	6.7	0	106
Fond du Lac	200	0	0	0	62.1	11	73
Pikangikum	197	2.7	6	0	66.6	15	101
Shubanacadie	180	16.5	42	0	65.2	4	127

TABLE VII (Continued)

POTENTIALLY REVENUE-PRODUCING CAPITAL OWNED BY OR AVAILABLE TO INDIANS
(Amounts per capita in each of thirty-five bands)

Band	Income	Band Funds	Band Revenues Per Annum	Buildings, Equipment & Livestock Estimated Value			Total
				Band-owned	bd. Indians	I.A.B.-owned	
Oak River	$176	$ 49.0	$ 17	$0	$187.5	9	$262
Rupert House	174	0	0	16	51	0	67
Cold Lake	165	12.6	6	6	123.1	24	172
Fort St. John	161	354.6	45	32.2	30.8	25	488
Deer Lake	156	0	0	0	37	23	60
The Pas	140	109.0	24	38	46	1	218
James Smith	126	51.6	21	0	74.9	9	157
Peguis	99	18.5	4	0	159.7	25	208
Big Cove	61	1	0	0	18.6	0	21
Piapot	55	75	24	7	158	19	283
Coefficient of Cor. with Per Capita Income		.075	.128	.25	.27	- .25	.029

One obvious, but only partial, explanation (for reasons developed later) for this lack of correlation is that band funds, as a source of capital, have been used to only a small extent in investments that yield income from gainful employment to band members, The major part of them has been invested in government bonds and to a lesser extent, in social capital or welfare projects on reserves (e.g., council houses, residential housing, various public works or local improvements). There are, of course, individual exceptions that show fruitful results; for example, Kamloops, while of moderately low income, has shown rapid development in recent years, partly through using its band funds for developmental purposes.

(b) Band Revenues

Band revenues show a similar pattern of distribution to that of band funds, of course, as they are derived largely from the latter, and they show a similarly low degree of correlation (.128) with levels of per capita income. Strictly speaking, of course, band revenues are a category of income rather than of capital. But, as a source of income over and above earnings from employment or other sources, they represent a potential source of capital accumulation and economic development. Like band funds, however, the revenues accruing to Indian bands have been used to only a limited extent far employment or revenue-producing purposes for the members. They have been used rather for such purposes as welfare or relief, repair and maintenance of social capital, and the like. In practice, as often as not, the availability of sizable annual revenues available for cash distribution to band members has acted as a deterrent to, or a substitute for, gainful employment. As noted earlier, the Superintendents of both the Sarcee and Sampson Agencies listed such cash distributions as one factor deterring the members of these communities from making full use of the resources owned by or available to them.

(c) Band-owned Equipment

This item, in the aggregate, is of relatively minor consequence. The only bands with large amounts of such capital are those with large band funds, and generally the same observations would apply.

(d) Individual Savings and Real Capital

It is a basic tenet of economic theory that the "propensity to save" rises more than proportionately to increases in income. The higher the income, generally, the higher the proportion, as well as the amount, of income that is saved in one form or another. On the basis of this principle, one would expect a high positive correlation between income levels and individual accumulations of capital among different Indian bands across the country.

There is no way of knowing the magnitude of savings by individual Indians in the form of bank accounts, cash hoards, equities in insurance policies and the like. Nor is there any reliable means for finding the sum total of their personal indebtedness to creditors of various kinds, such as private fur, fish or lumber buyers, retailers of equipment and supplies, etc. One general impression is that the majority in most communities have very small, if any, personal savings, and are continually in debt to creditors of one kind or another.

One measurable index of private capital accumulation is the ownership of revenue-producing buildings, equipment, supplies and livestock. With regard to this category of capital, again, there appears to be little, if any, positive correlation between average income levels and ownership of real capital. This is evident in the figures shown in Table VII and the coefficient of only .27.[1]

Again, there appears to be a fairly simple explanation for this lack of correlation. The Indian bands enjoying the highest average per capita real incomes are, as noted earlier, those which have a high proportion of their members working in relatively well-paid wage or salaried jobs on the outside. Such are, for instance, the Caughnawaga in Quebec and the Skidegate and Squamish in British Columbia. Two of these groups have little incentive to save and accumulate capital for income or revenue-producing purposes, for the larger metropolitan communities in which they reside already provide most of the goods and services they require more efficiently, and at lower cost, than they could produce for themselves. Their surplus incomes above subsistence, therefore, tend to be invested in automobiles, television sets, household appliances and other types of consumer capital, or spent on relatively expensive types of services and recreational activities. (Members of the Caughnawaga Band, for instance, appear to own two or three times the number of automobiles, per capita, owned by most other Indians in Canada, Considering the mobile conditions which their employment in high steel construction requires, perhaps automobiles should be considered as income-producing capital, like the tractor for the farmer, the boat for the fisherman, or the snowmobile for the trapper.)

---

[1] As noted earlier, the inventory of capital equipment in the Resources Questionnaire covered only the four resource industries of farming, fishing, hunting and trapping, and logging. Unfortunately, it did not include the value of buildings, equipment and supplies of Indian-owned business and industrial enterprises.

The Indian bands whose members have accumulated the largest amounts of revenue-producing capital per capita, by contrast, are those in which a large proportion of the members have specialized in the function of individual proprietors who derive their livelihood from local resources (particularly farming) rather than outside wage employment. The traditional, and over crowded, resource-based industries (farming, trapping and fishing particularly) generally offer lower rates of pay – especially for independent proprietors or workers on contract – than do the more efficiently organized urban industries hiring workers by the hour – and the former generally require the investment of several hundreds of dollars in equipment and supplies to boot!

There are notable exceptions to this broad picture. There are a few bands in the high average income category, in which a minority of successful proprietors have accumulated relatively large amounts of capital which have enabled them to operate efficiently and profitably, on a large scale. Notable among these are Nimpkish, on Vancouver island, in which several residents own purse-seining vessels valued at $50,000 or more, and frequently earn five-figure incomes from fishing; the Okanagan Band in British Columbia in which a few own herds of cattle valued in the tens of thousands of dollars; and Lorette, Quebec, in which one family owns a factory valued in the hundreds of thousands, and several proprietors own capital in the tens of thousands.

(e) Capital Aid or Grants from the Indian Affairs Branch

Most capital investments or grants in band communities made by the Indian Affairs Branch have been for social capital and public works of various kinds, rather than directly for employment and revenue-producing purposes. The policy has been, generally, to give a higher priority for such capital aid to low income, under-developed bands, while those with larger band funds and revenues are expected to look after most, or all, of their own undertakings. Thus, as may be seen from Table VII, there is a generally negative correlation between per capita income and Branch-owned facilities or equipment per capita.

(f) Repayable Loans Available from the Indian Affairs Branch

The main source of capital made available to Indians by the Branch for revenue-producing purposes is the so called Revolving Fund, as laid down in Section 69 of the Indian Act. It is designed to make loans available to Indians on favourable terms, because of special difficulties they face in raising credit from outside sources. Such loans are generally limited to a maximum of $10,000 to any one individual or group, are repayable within five years and are designed for the purchase of movable equipment or livestock (as distinct from real estate or fixed assets).

A study of the economic position of Indians in British Columbia undertaken in 1954-55 indicated that the Fund, having an upper limit of $350,000 in total loans outstanding, was insufficient. The demand for loans exceeded the funds available, and numerous individual projects that appeared to be worthwhile and potentially revenue-producing had to be abandoned or deferred by 1964, when the present study was begun. The maximum available from the Fund had been raised to $1,000,000, and in recent years the total loans outstanding to qualified applicants fell far short of this. The picture has changed rapidly, again, during the past two years; by 1966 the maximum total had been raised to $1.5 million, and the demand for loans again exceeded capacity.

Again, there appears to be little or no direct correlation between the availability of such credit, or the degree to which it has been used, on the one hand, and the level of economic development achieved, on the other. The reason is broadly the same as outlined earlier. The main demand for Revolving Fund loans comes from small scale working proprietors or self-employed in such fields as farming, logging, trapping and fishing, and to a much lesser extent, small business and service establishments. These are generally in the low, marginal, or, at best, medium income category. Among the highest income bands, on the other hand, where a high proportion of the members work outside of the reserve for wages, the demand for Revolving Fund loans is minimal or nonexistent.

(g) Repayable Loans or Credit from Other Outside Agencies

While there does not appear to be any serious shortage of short-term or intermediate capital in the form of small or medium-sized loans available to Indians, they do face certain special difficulties in getting long-term capital for larger fixed investments (e.g. stores, industrial plants, large logging or sawmilling operations, large fishing boats and buildings and equipment for large scale farming). Their most obvious limitation in this regard appears to lie in their inability to use their land or buildings for collateral to raise mortgage capital, because of restrictions on the alienation of reserve land or fixed assets.

Indians appear to meet similar difficulties in getting large amounts of short-term or intermediate credit from other outside sources (e.g. banks, finance companies, equipment dealers, and the like) for meeting short-term needs with regard to such items as payrolls and restocking of inventories, repairs and replacements, etc. In part this arises from the stereotype held by Whites of Indians as being irresponsible and careless with money and equipment and the like. Perhaps more important is the fact that very few Indians (and few Whites for that matter) have the training, experience, know-how and contacts to be able to operate among all the intricate channels and deals involved in raising capital in the complex maze of money and credit facilities that characterize the modern business world.

Most credit that Indians raise for employment-and revenue-producing purposes, outside of the Indian Affairs Branch, as noted earlier, comes from individuals or firms engaged in the buying, selling and processing of resources such as fish canneries or processing plants, fur traders, log buyers and the like. Characteristically, the buyer grubstakes and equips the Indian producer on credit, usually on the understanding that the latter will sell his output exclusively to the creditor. While this arrangement probably has enabled many Indians to acquire the means to make a livelihood in the basic resource industries, which they might not have been able to do otherwise, the system tends to have two singular disadvantages: it tends to perpetuate a relationship of paternalism and dependency between Whites and Indians, and it tends to limit the mobility of Indians, and perpetuate overcrowding and inadequate income in the traditional resource industries.

In general, the limited role that capital has played in the economic development of Indians lies in their lack of business experience, know-how and motivation, and weaknesses in their position in competition with experienced and established non-Indian operators, rather than difficulties in their raising capital. By and large, the Indian reserves which offer the greatest potentialities for business or industrial development are also those which already have large band funds and revenues, for the reason that they generally occupy land that is strategically situated and valuable. Band funds and other Indian owned capital have been used to only a limited extent for business or industrial development. A major part of such development on reserves appears to have been done by outside interests leasing land and other resources from Indian bands. To an increasing extent this appears to be the prevailing trend in agricultural development as well.

Again, there are notable exceptions. A few Indian-owned and managed enterprises in scattered bands across the country have achieved considerable success and magnitude. They would seem to merit a special study in themselves, not only to examine the special character and circumstances of Indians who become successful entrepreneurs, but also to examine how they raised the capital to finance their operations.

3. Social Capital and Infrastructure

Many writers and experts in the field of economic development maintain that people in a nation, region or community will not develop economically –that is, individuals will not be stimulated to save and invest capital for developmental purposes – until there is a sufficient infrastructure of road, railway, or water transportation, electrical power, running water and other facilities required for the efficient harvesting, transporting, processing and marketing of resources; the provision of adequate living conditions for people, and facilities for transporting them to and from their jobs; and other such needs.

The development of such facilities, or their availability to Indians depends on four sources in roughly the following order of importance:

(a) Indian Affairs Branch
(b) Other government agencies: federal, provincial or municipal
(c) Band funds, where available
(d) Private business firms in certain fields (e.g. automotive transportation)

By its nature, it is impossible to get accurate and quantified measurement of the comparative role that social capital or infrastructure plays in contributing to the economic development of different band communities across the country. At the extremes, of course, the picture seems clear; on the one hand, there are the isolated, under-developed bands in the north, having minimum facilities; and on the other, the high-income, developed bands lying in or near large urban communities and benefiting from an already well developed infrastructure.

Again, it would seem a safe assumption that the economic and social backwardness of Indians generally in Canada, as compared to Whites, rests at least partly on the fact that, because of their geographic or social isolation, they have had less access to and use of a variety of public facilities besides those of formal education and health. These are a necessary part of the everyday conditioning of most individuals in fitting them to function efficiently in the complex society of today.

It would be difficult, however, to establish any direct connection between capital expenditures by the Indian Affairs Branch for social capital in different bands, and their degree of economic development, because such expenditures tend to be proportionately larger in the poorer bands, whose members are unable to pay for such facilities from their own income and resources. The bands that are best provided with such facilities appear to be those with large band funds, and most of these, as noted, are also located close to, or with good access to, large metropolitan centers or flourishing industrial communities, for instance, the Lorette, Walpole Island and Squamish Bands. But even among bands that appear to have equally good infrastructure there are wide variations in the degree to which Indians utilize their resources effectively for economic development, and/or take full advantage of job opportunities in the outside labour market.

Perhaps the more important impact of infrastructure development on Indian band members, in the long run, may be its effect on their work incentives rather than on their willingness to save and invest capital and develop resources owned by or available to them. Electrification of homes and farms, and the construction of good roads and highways in or near Indian villages, would tend to generate increased demand for automobiles and other vehicles, electrical appliances and other expensive types of consumer capital. This, in turn, should be expected to instil stronger incentives to seek, and get, steady well-paid employment outside of the reserve.

TABLE VIII

DURABLE CONSUMER GOODS: PERCENTAGES OF HOUSEHOLDS IN THIRTY-FIVE SAMPLE BANDS WITH BASIC HOME FACILITIES AND AUTOMOBILES

Band	Per Capita Income	Indoor Toilets % h.h.	Baths % h.h.	Telephone % h.h.	Automobiles % h.h.	Electricity %h.h.
Skidegate	$1252	74	83	55.5	54	100
Caughnawaga	793	33	33	33	88.5	92
Walpole Is.	715	13	13	43	33	56
Sheshaht, V.I.	664	80	80	45	25	86
Lorette	630	100	100	100	17.5	100
Squamish	630	75	99	21	36	100
Tyendinaga	516	2	2	35	81	73.5
Curve Lake	350	11.2	2.0	18	66	95
Six Nations	350	4.5	4.5	31	68.5	72
Mistassini	341	2.5	2.5	2.5	7.3	2.5 (1 house hold out of 41)
Dog Rib Rae	332	0	0	0	0	0
Port Simpson	325	21	88	0	1.0	87
Kamloops	314	3	3	11	25.5	100
Sarcee	302	6	6	23	48.0	0
Fort William	298	2	2	11	42.5	82
Williams Lake	291	3.3	3.3	10	8.0	100
Moose Factory	284	1.6	1.6	45	33	4
River Desert	250	7	5	35	30.0	41
Attawapiskat	247	0	0	32	14	0
St. Mary's	249	n/a	n/a	n/a	10	0
Pointe Bleue	222	20	12.7	51	22.5	70
Tobique	215	33	28	10	34.6	98
Fond du Lac	200	0	0	0	0	0
Pikarigikum	197	0	0	0	12.3	0
Shubenacadie	180	6	4	10	30.1	0
Oak River	176	0	0	2	72.1	33
Rupert House	174	0	0	0	0	1.2

TABLE VIII (continued)

Band	Per Capita Income	Indoor Toilets % h.h.	Baths % h.h.	Telephone % h.h.	Automobiles % h.h.	Electricity % h.h.
Cold Lake	165	1.7	1.7	1.7	13	1.7 (2 house holds)
Fort St. John	161	0	0	0	0	0
DeerLake	156	0	0	0	7	0
The Pas	140	0	0	8	9	7
James Smith	126	0	0	2	14	2
Peguis	99	1	1	0	12.5	40
Big Cove	61	4	4	4	38.6	40
Piapot	55	0	0	0	46	2
Coefficient of Correlation with Per Capita Income		.72	.67	.64	.40	.55

Limited evidence in this connection seems to indicate that there is some such effect. Table VIII, with a sample of bands ranked according to per capita income, lists the percentage of houses with electricity, telephones, baths and indoor toilets, and the ratio of automobiles to population (measured in terms of numbers of households per automobile) for each band. The first four items show a high or significant degree of correlation with income, with coefficients of .55, .72, .65 and .72 respectively. The majority of bands lack electricity and the housing facilities listed, while all of the eight most developed bands, with the exception of Sheshaht, a logging community on Vancouver Island, are relatively well supplied with such facilities. The role of automobiles is less significant as an index and shows no significant degree of correlation because many bands, some of which are relatively well developed, lack adequate roads or highways and depend primarily upon transportation by boat, plane or snowmobile.

Even on this point, however, the relationship is far from consistent. To use the example of the Sarcee Band again, it is exceptionally well endowed in natural resources and in capital, and adjoins the rapidly expanding city of Calgary. Apart from electrical power, it has itself, and has further access to, a far better infrastructure than the vast majority of bands. Yet, in terms of per capita income from gainful employment, it is far less developed than numerous other bands that are far less endowed in this respect.

Close physical proximity of a community to a well developed city or town does not in itself, of course, mean that the band members are endowed with, or have access to, a good infrastructure. For the residents of many a reserve on the outskirts of a city or town, poor roads and lack of cars or other means of transportation, coupled with the attitudes of most urban White residents, may create a degree of isolation as effective as if the reserve were located a hundred miles distant. And, in many cases, such reserves are as lacking in good roads, electricity, running water, sewers or other such facilities as are the more rural and geographically isolated communities.

This may be one factor that helps to account for the very different degrees of development achieved by two or more Indian bands which in virtually all other respects seem comparable. An example of this are the Squamish and Musqueam Bands in Greater Vancouver. Both bands have a similar earlier cultural background and the same religious affiliations, and are located in suburban areas about equally distant "as the crow flies" from the business centre of the city. But, where Squamish is ranked as one of the more high income, developed bands, Musqueam is relatively depressed, with most of the labour force in the casual unskilled category and a high rate of dependency on relief. However, the Squamish Band is located in the midst of a mixed industrial-commercial-residential area in North Vancouver, with a high proportion of its residents located along main highways and streets, close to White neighbours, industrial plants and shopping centres. Most of the residents of Musqueam, by contrast, are located in a large tract on the extreme southwestern edge of the city, along the flats where the North Arm of the Fraser River empties into the Gulf of Georgia. This community adjoins a broad high class middle and upper-income residential area, which separates most Musqueam residents from easy access to business or industrial establishments. There are only one or two roads that provide any sort of physical connection of the reserve with the city, while roads within the reserve were, in 1964, poor. In effect, the physical barriers in the way of transportation and communication, even over a limited distance of one or two miles, create a degree of social isolation that has helped to keep the Musqueam community underdeveloped.

It is in such situations as this that the creation of an effective infrastructure can, under propitious circumstances, achieve spectacular results in economic development. The Kamloops Band is an outstanding example. Ten years ago it was a relatively depressed, low-income band, most of whose members were casually employed at farm or ranch labour and dependent upon revenues from land and timber leases, supplemented by relief, for a large or major part of their livelihood. Subsequently the Band Council, with the assistance of the Indian Affairs Branch and of outside planning consultants, had a tract of reserve land zoned and developed for lease to outside interests for business or industrial purposes. Several dozen new plants have been established on the reserve, providing a major new source of employment and income for band members. In a number of other communities, by arrangement with the Band

Councils, city boundaries have been extended to include tracts of reserve land and roads, water mains, sewers, fire protection and other city facilities and services have been provided. In a number of such cases, the additional revenue from industrial or business leases has more than compensated for the additional taxes and other charges involved.

About all one can conclude from these numerous examples is that an adequate infrastructure is a vital and necessary part of any developmental program for Indian band communities, but it is not sufficient by itself.

4. Professional and Entrepreneurial Middle Class

One feature common to poor and under-developed nations or regions is the relatively small percentage of the population that comprises middle class professionals and businessmen. A number of authorities express the view that such groups are crucial to economic development, for two main reasons:

(a) To provide the enterprise and assume the risks of accumulating and investing capital in job-and income-producing enterprises;

(b) To provide a demonstration effect, or leavening effect, in raising the level of aspirations of others in the community, thereby motivating them to become more industrious and productive workers.

With regard to the various Indian bands in the representative sample being studied in this Report, it would be difficult to demonstrate that any such leavening effect is operative. For one thing, as may be seen from Table IX below, the number of bands with any professional workers at all among their members is very limited. Only four bands in the sample of thirty-five are in this category. Two of them, Lorette and Six Nations, are in the high and medium income category respectively, while two others, Sarcee and River Desert, are, at best, in the moderately developed class. This perhaps understates the case, however, in so far as an unknown number of Indians from various bands who have achieved a professional status have left their home reserves permanently and forsaken their band membership.

In any case, it seems likely that the small numbers of native Indian professional workers probably have very little leavening effect on their fellow band members, for two main reasons:

(a) The majority of professional workers, to engage in their practice, reside and work in cities and towns where they are physically separated from the reserve communities.

(b) Attainment of a professional status requires, in most cases, long hours over a period of years, of study and hard work at relatively low rates of pay. Indian professional workers, particularly those who are visible to their fellow band members, tend to be concentrated in the ranks of those professions that are in the lower paid categories, such as teaching, nursing and social work, and, in a handful of cases, salaried lawyers and doctors. These latter, lacking perhaps the most valuable contacts or connections, and perhaps also unsophisticated in the ways of the Establishment, are usually in the lower income ranks of their professions. In general, as the broad survey in the preceding chapter brought out, among Indians, professional workers, while more regularly employed and having higher annual incomes than skilled workers, have lower average monthly earnings. To many Indians, therefore, valuing both leisure and short-run gains in money or kind, the rewards of professional careers probably appear intangible, if not absent.

The picture is far less clear with regard to self-employed non-farm proprietors, who could be put, broadly, in the business class. The difficulty with defining this occupational category – in the Resources Questionnaire as in the Dominion Census – is that it covers such a wide range as to be virtually meaningless. Among the bands sampled, as in the figures in Table IX, it ranges from individuals who barely eke out a living from small confectioneries, carrying a few hundred dollars of stock, or small logging or construction contractors

TABLE IX

PERCENTAGE OF WORKERS IN PROFESSIONAL POSITIONS AND INDEPENDENT NON-FARM PROPRIETORSHIPS, IN EACH OF THIRTY-FIVE SAMPLE BANDS

Band	Per Capita Income	Professional Workers	Non-Farm Proprietors
Skidegate	$1252		3.24
Caughnawaga	793		3.0
Walpole Island	715		35
Sheshaht	664		
Lorette	630	2.0	19.5
Squamish	630		1.7
Tyendinaga	516		4.6
Six Nations	350	8.2	4.7
Curve Lake	350		
Mistassini	341		
Dog Rib Rae	332		
Port Simpson	325		5,5
Kamloops	314		
Sarcee	302		
Fort William	298		
Williams Lake	291		
Moose Factory	284		
River Desert	250	2.5	3,7
Attawapiskat	247		
St. Mary's	249		3.3
Pointe Bleue	222		8.1
Tobique	215		
Fond du Lac	200		
Pikangikum	197		
Shubenacadie	180		9.1
Oak River	176		8.7
Rupert House	174		
Cold Lake	165		
Fort St. John	161		
Deer Lake	156		
The Pas	140		13.50*
James Smith	126		
Peguis	99		1.4
Big Cove	61		8.5
Piapot	55		6.0

*The figure for The Pas was inflated by the inclusion, in the item in the Resources Questionnaire, of a number of self-employed pulpwood cutters working on contracts or shares.

with a few fellow band members working on shares, to the owners of large fishing vessels and industrial establishments valued in the tens or hundreds of thousands of dollars. (Unfortunately, as noted before, the Resources Questionnaire did not provide any inventory of types and values of buildings, equipment and materials of Indian-owned business or industrial enterprises.)

By a strict statistical test, there does not appear to be a significant correlation between economic development and percentage of the labour force in independent non-farm proprietorships. As another, but rough, index, however, seven out of the eight most highly developed bands have some independent business or industrial proprietors (and Lorette has the significantly high percentage of 19.5) while only eleven out of the remaining twenty-seven bands are in this category. These figures probably understate the degree of correlation, for virtually all of the relatively large proprietorships including those which employ others for wages or salaries, are in the eight most developed bands.

On the other hand, two of the highest income bands have virtually no business proprietorships – notably, Squamish, with only 1.7 per cent of the labour force, and Sheshaht, with none at all. A number of other bands in British Columbia, including several in the northern coastal region, have higher proportions of business and professional men in their ranks even though having lower per capita real incomes. One important factor, perhaps, is that their relative isolation from main White population centres offers an incentive to some individuals to provide some goods or services to their fellow band members for a profit, while having some protection against White competition. In contrast to these, while the relatively high incomes and sizable band funds and revenues of the Squamish Band could, in isolation, support a large number and variety of business and professional services, these have not, in fact, developed. The main reason appears to be the accessibility to (and therefore competition from) business and professional services easily available in the surrounding urban community. Consequently, Squamish Band-owned land for business and industrial enterprises has been leased to outside interests, rather than used by band members to develop business and professional services for themselves or the surrounding White community.

This pattern of specialization is probably typical of a number of bands, particularly where they comprise a relatively small population that specializes in wage-earning jobs in nearby towns or industrial centres.

5. Occupations, Earnings and Continuity of Employment

The evidence available from the sample study shows very limited – and in some cases, inverse – correlation of the comparative levels of per capita income with some of the most widely accepted economic determinants of economic development; namely, ownership or availability of resources and of capital, infrastructure, and development of a professional and business minority in the community.

The only basically economic determinants that do show a high positive correlation, as brought out below, are those concerning: (a) the occupations or industries in which the members of different bands are employed; (b) their comparative rates of pay; and (c) their duration or continuity of employment. The results are modified by two demographic factors, namely –

(1) differences in age structure among the band population; and
(2) the participation rate; that is, the percentage of persons of working age who are gainfully employed.

As noted earlier, a band whose workers earn a relatively large annual income, may have relatively low per capita real income from gainful employment, because of a low participation rate of its adults in the labour force, and/or a high proportion of dependent children and old people in its population. Thus, for instance, Lorette, whose workers average only $2048 per annum, or less than one-half the $4400 received by workers in Sheshaht, has only a slightly lower per capita real income from gainful employment because it has a high participation rate of 51.3 per cent as compared to 34.7 per cent for Sheshaht, while the percentages of the band populations under sixteen years of age are 32.8 per cent and 51.7 per cent respectively. Or, again, the low participation rate in Caughnawaga of only 25.6 per cent is counterbalanced by the unusually high level of average earnings per worker, and the low percentage of the population under sixteen years of age, of only 32.1 per cent (incidentally, the lowest known percentage of any Indian band in Canada).

For various reasons that will be discussed later, there appears to be a fairly high degree of inverse correlation between economic development or per capita real incomes of bands, and percentages of band populations under sixteen, but very little, if any, with participation rates. The main economic determinants of average per capita real income, to repeat, are those of occupations, rates of pay, and duration of employment.

The role of occupations seems clearly apparent from Table X below, As could be surmised from the broad survey in Chapter III, and from the discussion of resource ownership or availability above, there is generally an inverse correlation between average per capita real income of a band and the percentage of the population engaged in resource-based industries. Only a small proportion of the labour forces in the eight most economically developed bands are engaged in the resource-based fields of farming, farm labour, forestry, fishing, trapping, guiding, food gathering and handicrafts, while in most of the lower income or under-developed bands a majority of the labour force is engaged in two or more of these fields.

One or two exceptions to this general pattern require some explanation. With regard to forestry, in the broad sense of the term, a majority of workers in the Skidegate and Sheshaht Bands and a significant minority in the Squamish Band are employed in logging. However, logging on the Coastal areas of British Columbia, involving as it does the use of large and complicated machinery requiring considerable skill in varying degrees to handle the unusually large size of logs, is so different from forestry operations in the rest of the country as to constitute a distinct industry in itself. Its workers are predominantly skilled and, to a lesser extent, semi-skilled, and most of them have been classed accordingly in Table X. (As noted earlier, the Resources Questionnaire has no provision for the semi-skilled category. Loggers in British Columbia, as well as other skilled or semi-skilled workers whose incomes were less than $2000 per annum, or $300 per month, were placed in the casual, unskilled category in the Table.)

Similar observations would apply to fishing in British Columbia, as represented in the Skidegate, Masset and Port Simpson Bands, as compared to fishing in other provinces.

As may be seen from Table K, the highest degrees of correlation between economic development or per capita real income of bands and percentage of workers in various occupations lies in skilled work (.79). The lack of any significant correlation in the case of casual unskilled labour is explained by the fact that, as in the case of non-farm proprietorships as discussed earlier, the data included in this classification in the Resources Questionnaire cover such a wide range as to render any meaningful relationship impossible to measure. Such widely different groups as intermittently employed longshoremen, construction workers and factory workers earning $2.50 to $3.50 an hour, or $300 to $400 monthly, in Quebec, Ontario or British Columbia, are sufficiently different from Indians doing odd farm jobs in the Southern Prairies or the Maritimes for 60¢ to $1 or $100 to $150 a month, as to constitute separate and distinct occupations.

This is illustrated in Table XI below, from data collected in a nationwide welfare and housing survey by the Indian Affairs Branch in 1963. For the twenty-five Indian bands covered, that are part of the sample being studied in this Report, it is evident that labour in the more developed bands – including those which have sizable amounts of farmland or other resources on their reserves – the main sources of income and employment lie in such fields as construction, longshoring, logging (in British Columbia), factories or industrial establishments and offices, while in the low-income bands they are largely related to the lower income resource-based industries. (In this connection it is interesting to note that the correlation between per capita income and percentage of band members in farm proprietorships, while too small to be of any significance, is negative at -.25.)

The close relationships between economic development, rates of pay and duration of employment are readily apparent from the figures in Table XII below. There is a high correlation of bands ranked according to per capita real income with ranking according to the following variables shown in the Table: average annual earnings (.61), monthly rates of pay (.77), average months of employment per job per annum (.63), months of employment per worker per annum (.60), and percentage of employable males aged sixteen to sixty-four employed more than nine months during the year (.72), or inversely, percentage employed less than six months (-.76)

There is also a high degree of multiple correlation among these variables. That is to say, a relatively large proportion of people in the more developed bands are employed at relatively steady jobs and these, by and large, are better paid (in terms of average hourly or monthly rates) than are the odd jobs of short duration that characterize the employment pattern of the lower income, less developed bands. Hence workers in the former category enjoy average annual earnings several times higher than those in the latter. At the extremes, the ratio between Skidegate and Peguis is almost 10:1 (i.e. $4640 to $480 – see Table I, Chapter IV). Indeed, the difference between the extremes is probably higher than this in view of the fact, as noted in Chapter III, that per capita real incomes in the more developed bands, such as Skidegate, are probably under estimated.

TABLE X

PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF LABOUR FORCE BY INDUSTRY AND OCCUPATION, IN THIRTY-FIVE SAMPLE BANDS

	Per Capita Income	Forestry	Fishing	Trapping	Guiding	Handi-crafts	Food Gathering	Farm Labour	Casual & Unskilled	Skilled	Clerical	Profes-sional	Farm Proprie-tors	Non-Farm Proprie-tors
Skidegate	$1252		21.6			4.9				70.3				3.2
Caughnawaga	793								6.5	83.6	8.5			3.0
Walpole Is.	715		2.9	3.8	3	6.5			55.4	8	8.1		8.7	3.5
Sheshaht	664		.8				2		24.8	72.3				
Lorette	630			3.4	14				32.3	18.5	10.1	2		19.5
Squamish	630		1.5			2.1			62.6	28.3	1.7			1.7
Tyendinaga	516								24.5	36.5	12		17.5	4.6
Six Nations	350						13.1		33.8	25.3	2	8.2	7	4.7
Curve Lake	350			8.0	6.8	8.1	10.2		30.6	28.5				8.1
Mistassini	385	8.1	2.9	54.3	2.3				27.6	2.3	1.4			0
Dog Rib Rae	332	8	12.3	42.5		4			28.6		4			
Port Simpson	325		30	2.1					36.4	24.6				5.5
Kamloops	314	7.2						5	51.8	8.6	1.4		11.5	
Sarcee	302					10.7		17.8	21.4	10.7	6.9		23.5	
Fort William	298	31.7							40.1	16.9	8.4			
Williams Lake	291	13.3					26.6		23.9	10.6			25.7	
Moose Factory	284	6.1		12.3					48	24.6	4.9			
River Desert	250	53.4		6.2	15.4	2.7			5.6	5.1	6.2	2.5	2.6	3.7
Attawapiskat	247													
St. Mary s	249	55.8				3.3	4.2	6.2	22.5	1.2				3.3
Pointe Bleue	222	3.3		5.0	5.6				40.1	14.7	20.3			8.1
Tobique	215	10.3				11.0	12.9		41.2	16.5	8.2			
Fond du Lac	200		4.3	56.9					28.7	4.2				
Pikangikum	197	6.8		19.8	57.4				13.5					
Shubenacadie	180	8.8				22.7	15.1		26.5	6.0				9.1
Oak River	176				8.9			8.7	31.2	10.4			32.3	8.7
Rupert House	175	7.8			62.3	10.4			5.2					
Cold Lake	165	25.5	2.8	2.8			16.7	5.5	10	3.2			18.7	

TABLE X (CONTINUED)

	Per Capita Income	Forestry	Fishing	Trapping	Guiding	Handi-crafts	Food Gathering	Farm Labour	Casual & Unskilled	Skilled	Clerical	Profes-sional	Farm Proprie-tors	Non-Farm Proprie-tors
Fort St. John	$ 161													
Deer Lake	156		18.7	56.6			3.1		15.5	1.8	1.8			
The Pas	140	3.4			4.8		5.6		58.2	4.8	4.8		2.4	13.5
James Smith	126				15.1				29.2		5.2		26.8	
Peguis	99	13.7	6.8						18.3	5.6	13.7		37.0	1.4
Big Cove	61	23.6					25.5	28.3	5.7		8.5			8.5
Piapot	55	11							54.7	4.6			23.3	6.0
Coefficient of Correlation with Per Capita Income									.002	.79	.05		- .25	.06

TABLE XI

EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES AND SEASONAL UNEMPLOYMENT

(Representative Sample of Thirty-Five Indian Bands)

Band	Per Capita Income	Employment Opportunities Locally Available in Order of Importance	Critical Months of Seasonal Idle Capacity
Skidegate		Logging, fishing, seal hunting, trapping, construction, mining.	
Caughnawaga	$793	Structural steelwork, factory work, office work, work on stone quarries, tree surgery, golf clubs, and also other work common to a small town.	March, April, May, December, January, February.
Walpole Is.	715	Industry, agriculture, construction, fishing and guiding, domestic.	December, January, February.
Sheshaht	664	Logging, sawmills, pulp mills, longshoring	May.
Lorette	630	Industrial work, trade, retail services, clerical work, local industries on the reserve and in nearby localities in Quebec City.	March, April, May, December, January, February.
Squamish	630	Longshoring, mills, factories, logging, fishing.	December, January, February.
Tyendinaga	516	Casual part-time employment on farms and canning factories nearby. Day labour on construction projects in surround ing communities.	December, January, February.
Curve Lake	350	Industry (C.G.E., Outboard Marine, etc.), construction, tourism, farming, handicraft, manufacture.	March, October, November, December, January, February.
Six Nations	350	Fruit and tobacco labour, (seasonal), construction, factory construction, (farm implements, canning, etc.), domestic work, farming - labour and self-employed. Main source of income found off reserve.	December, January, February.
Masset		Logging, fishing, cannery work, mining, construction.	
Mistassini (Crees)	385	Trapping, mining, guiding, construction, transport and surveys.	June, July & August.
Dog Rib Rae	332	Trapping, fishing, fire-fighting, logging, wage employment, local construction.	December, January, February, June, July, August.

TABLE XI (continued)

Band	Per Capita Income	Employment Opportunities Locally Available in Order of Importance	Critical Months of Seasonal Idle Capacity
Port Simpson	$325	Fishing, logging, stevedoring, winter works.	September, October, December, January, February.
Kamloops	314	Industrial subdivision on reserve, logging, lumber mills, cattle ranching, seasonal agricultural labour.	
Sarcee	302	Cattle ranching, casual and seasonal ranch work, wage employment in Calgary.	March, April, May.
Fort William	298	Pulp cutting on reserve, grain elevators, casual and seasonal employment.	December, January, February.
Williams Lake	291	Ranch labour, logging, cattle raising, trapping.	
Moose Factory	284	Hospital jobs, construction, casual employment (H.B.C., R.C.A.F.), trapping.	March, April, May.
River Desert	250	Wood operation on reserve, guiding, agency projects, pipeline.	March, April, May.
Attawapiskat	247	Hunting, trapping, intermittent work around H.B.C. and R.C. Mission, limited commercial fishing in summer (nomadic in winter – live in Rupert House in summer).	July, August.
St. Mary's	249	Logging, seasonal agricultural labour, Xmas tree harvest, farming and farm labour, construction, guiding, trapping, handicraft.	January, February, March.
Pointe Bleue	222		March, April, May, December, January, February.
Tobique	215	Potato harvest and construction work in Maine; local handicrafts	June, July, August, December, January, February.
Pikangikum	197	Trapping, fishing, employment provided by Indian Affairs Branch, logging.	March, April, May.
Shubenacadie	180	Handicrafts; fuel wood and Xmas trees; employment in industry away from reserve.	March, April, May, June, July, November, December, January, February.
Oak River	176	Few farmers, several farm labourers in summer, several in construction, sugar beet fields, roads. Majority are unemployed during the winter.	March, April, May, September, October, November, December, and January, February.

TABLE XI (continued)

Band	Per Capita Income	Employment Opportunities Locally Available in Order of Importance	Critical Months of Seasonal Idle Capacity
Rupert House	$174	Trapping and hunting main source, but decreasing; guiding; canoe manufacture. Economy cannot support population without relief assistance.	March, April, May.
Cold Lake	165	Farm labour, fishing, construction and work at nearby air base.	March, April, May, December, January, February.
Fort St. John	161	Trapping, farming, ranch labour (highly mobile until three years ago)	June, July, August.
Deer Lake (Sioux Lookout)	156	Fishing, trapping, guiding, firefighting.	February, March, April, May.
The Pas	140	Manitoba Highways labour, C.N.R., casual local labour, trapping, fishing, pulpwood cutting.	March, April, May, June.
James Smith	126	Farm labour; casual jobs in other districts; trapping; community employment program.	November, December, January, February, March, April.
Peguis	99	General labour and nurses aides, seneca root, pulp cutting, fish, farming and stock raising.	March, April, May, September, October, November, December, January, February.
Big Cove	61	Lumbering, fishing, handicrafts.	March, April, June, July, August, December, January, February.
Piapot	55	Casual farm labour, construction, domestic jobs. (Numerous members reluctant to accept employment away from home because earnings are less than social aid payments for an average family.)	March, October, November, December, January, February.

The proportion of the population below the age of sixteen, presumably non-working and non-earning, is also considerably smaller in most (though not all) of the more developed bands than in the lower income categories. Thus, in Caughnawaga it is 32.1 per cent and in Skidegate 34.5 per cent as compared to Big Cove's 54.4 per cent. This creates a further disparity in the ratio of per capita real income from gainful employment of 13:1 and 20:1 respectively.

This relatively over-simplified picture, however, needs to be modified by two considerations, as listed earlier: (1) differences in participation rate; and (2) the fact that broad averages hide significant details.

There is not a discernible degree of correlation (.26) as seen in Table XII below, between average per capita real earnings and participation rates because, among Indian bands, as among nations, high participation rates are characteristic of both high average incomes and low average incomes at different stages of development. Characteristically, in the early stages of industrialization in Britain, the United States, Japan and other industrial countries, the earnings of men were insufficient to support their families, so their wives and older children also had to work. Over a period of decades, as the level of wage rates and annual earnings rose - - owing to higher productivity, protective labour legislation, trade unionism, and other forces --wives tended to leave outside employment and return to their homes, and children remained longer in school so the participation rate tended to decline. In more recent decades, in the higher income, more economically advanced countries, women, particularly married women, have again been comprising a rapidly increasing proportion of the labour force. This has arisen from a number of developments such as higher levels of consumer aspirations, coupled with smaller families, labour-saving devices in the home, and a higher proportion of jobs in the white collar and service rather than manual category.

These variations seem apparent among Indian bands in the sample studied, as may be seen from Table XII. One of the highest-income, most developed bands, namely Lorette, has the highest participation rate, namely 52.3 per cent. Reference to Tables X and XI, showing main fields of employment, would suggest that a high proportion of women of working age in that band are employed in such fields as clerical and office work, retail sales, and light industry. On the other hand, some notably low-income bands, such as Maniwaki, Shubenacadie and Big Cove likewise have high participation rates. Data from Tables K and XI suggest that a high proportion of women in these bands are employed for short periods in low-income employment such as berrypicking and handicrafts.

At the other extreme, some high-income bands such as Skidegate, Caughnawaga, and to a lesser extent, Sheshaht and Squamish, have relatively low participation rates. In these, the high incomes are accounted for by specialization of a high proportion of the male workers in the bands in highly paid "men's work" such as high steel construction, longshoring and logging, while a relatively small proportion of the women participate in the outside labour market.

Some of the relatively developed bands, such as Walpole Island, Tyendinaga and Six Nations follow both patterns. A large minority of their members is employed in high-paid jobs in factories and construction, while another large minority of women and older children is employed in short, seasonal, and relatively low-paid jobs at farm labour, cannery work and domestic service. Hence the relatively low average annual earnings of workers in these three bands (i.e. $2048, $1983 and $1413 respectively, as compared to $4554 in Caughnawaga, $4400 in Skidegate, $4400 in Sheshaht and $3529 in Lorette).

There are, likewise, wide variations in rates of unemployment or underemployment among the highest income bands. The high average earnings and long average duration of employment of 9.2 months in Caughnawaga and eight months in Tyendinaga, for instance, tend to obscure the fact that there are significantly large numbers of unemployed or under-employed, as shown in the 17 per cent and 15.4 per cent respectively, of males aged sixteen to sixty-four in these bands who had less than two months employment during the year preceding the survey made in the Resources Questionnaire.

TABLE XII

EMPLOYMENT AND EARNINGS AMONG THIRTY-FIVE SAMPLE INDIAN BANDS

						Males Aged 16-64			
	Per Capita Income	Average Months Employment Per Worker	Average Months Employment Per Job	Average Annual Earnings Per Worker	Average Monthly Earnings	% Employed Less Than 2 Months	% Employed Less Than 6 Months -	%Employed More Than 9 Months	Participation Rate
Skidegate	$1252	10,6	6.7	$4642	$438	2.8	5.6	64.3	37.7
Caughnawaga	793	9.2	8.2	4554	495	17.0	42.5	42.6	25.6
Walpole Is.	715	6.16	5.9	2048	332.5	12.6	20.5	37.3	51.3
Sheshaht	664	10.7	10.7	4400	411	6.4	11	85	34.7
Lorette	630	10.5	8.7	3529	336	5.7	5.7	94.3	52.3
Squaniish	630	8.0	8.0	3427	428	9.3	29.6	51.8.	38.9
Tyendinaga	516	7.98	8.0	1413	177	15.4	33.8	48.5	25.2
Curve Lake	350	7.3	3.1	2222	304	22.3	60	40	39.5
Six Nations	350	7.5	4.0	2660	308	n/a	n/a	n/a	24.75
Mistassini	341	5.6	5.6	1853	331	0	62.3	10.7	39.4
Dog Rib Rae	332	5.67		1546	273	3.4	66.2	24.0	
Port Simpson	325	6.9	4.35	2729	395	4.3	74.0	8.7	35.4
Kamloops	314	9.5		2037	214	8.0	40.0	50.3	40.3
Sarcee	302	6.7	2.82	1354	202	11.0	32.9	36.6	46.7
Fort William	298	8.1	6.45	2334	288	15.0	58.3	20.0	30.4
Williams Lake	291	7.5	3.23	1708	228	25.0	85.0	15.0	
Moose Factory	284	6.24		2256	361	9.0	50.0	25.0	
River Desert	250	4.9	3.5	836		5.0	65.0	15.0	46.3
Attawapiskat	247			1400		3.6	75,7	6.3	
St. Mary's	249	7.27	2.3	1320	181	23.1	77.0	23.1	30.8
Pointe Bleue	222	6.2	5.6	1800	290	65.0	80.0	19.4	23.2
Tobique	215	10.6	3.7	2050	193	30.4	98.0	2.0	20.0
Fond du Lac	200	4.4	2.9	997	126	1.6	96.7	3.3	
Pikangikum	197	6.3	3.4	779	124	5.3	84.2	15.8	
Shubenacadie	180	4.3	2.5	809	201	66.67	88.0	10.75	39.3
Oak River	176	3.6	3.6	770	214	62.5	97.0	3.0	
Rupert House	174	3.2	2.5	810	253	27.5	52.5	5.8	
Cold Lake	165		3.4	1840		66.67	85.2	3.7	
Fort St. John	161	5.0	5.0	931	186		100		

TABLE XII (continued)

	Per Capita Income	Average Months Employment Per Worker	Average Months Employment Per Job	Average Annual Earnings Per Worker	Average Monthly Earnings	Males Aged 16-64			
						% Employed Less Than 2 Months	% Employed Less Than 6 Months -	%Employed More Than 9 Months	Participation Rate
Deer Lake	$ 156	3.6	3.5			40.35	87.0	11.7	
The Pas	140	6.6	6.6	$1283	$194	9.3	32.4	49.0	
James Smith	126	6.6	3.3	1143	173	50.8	80.0	13.3	23.1
pegLlis	99	4.6	4.6	480	104	22.0	88.5	8.0	21.7
Big Cove	61	7.0	2.75	734	105	42.0	80.0	10.3	35.3
piapot	55	5.5	5.5			32.2	79.0	15.5	
Coefficient of Correlation with Per Capita Income		.60	.63	.61	.77	- .41	- .76	.72	.26

growth there tended to be an unusually high rate of population increase, due mainly to a higher survival rate made possible by better standards of nutrition and health. With higher per capita incomes in the rapidly developing countries, however, the rate of population increase slowed down, as higher standards of living and rising consumer aspirations induced families to limit their numbers of offspring. Generally, the lower the income level of a class or group in the population, the higher the birth rate and the larger the families. This was the trend from the late nineteenth century until World War II. The trend was reversed after the War, however. During the 1940's and 50's birth rates and the rate of population increase rose sharply, particularly in high income countries such as Canada and the United States (and in these countries, among families in the middle and upper income groups). Since the mid-fifties, birth rates have been declining again.

To what extent have Indian bands followed such cycles, in response to economic growth and contact with White society? Is there evidence to indicate that birth rates have declined, or tended to be lower) in high income, economically developed bands, as compared to the underdeveloped ones?

Generally speaking, up until World War II, despite high birth rates, most bands appear to have been at a margin of subsistence which kept their numbers limited, or even declining, due to checks of disease, accident and such causes. Since World War II they have experienced a phenomenal rate of increase, due mainly to a combination of continued high birth rates, coupled with much higher survival rates made possible by higher real incomes and better health, nutrition and medical services. The natural rate of increase of native Indians in Canada is now approximately double that of the population as a whole in this country.

One broad measure of comparison is the proportion of the population under sixteen years of age. For Canada as a whole, it is about 28 per cent (which, incidentally, is higher than that of any other western or developed country) For Indians in Canada as a whole, it is about 50 per cent, and the percentage in most bands in the sample of thirty-five under study is close to this figure

There are some significant variations from this general pattern, however, as may be seen in Table XIII below, where there tends to be an inverse correlation between the level of economic development of Indian bands and the percentages of their population under the age of sixteen (as may be seen from Table XIII, there is a statistically significant inverse correlation of -.46 between per capita income of bands and the proportion of their members under the age of 16). Five of the nine most developed bands, namely, Skidegate, Caughnawaga, Lorette, Tyendinaga and Six Nations have a little over 30 per cent of their populations in this age group, while Walpole Island, at 43 per cent is still well below the. general average for Indians in Canada. These figures suggest that (with the exception of Skidegate) centuries of contact with White society at various levels, coupled with a high proportion of wage earners in the labour force at relatively high rates of pay have tended to induce Indians in these bands to adopt White standards of family size. Their situation probably represents a combination of higher survival rates of Indian children in these bands prior to World War II, due to their already higher levels of economic development compared to most other Indians, together with a relatively widespread practice of birth control since the War, (An intensive study of the Six Nations by one author brings out the fact the techniques of birth control are and have been widely known, accepted and practised in that community. Much the same is probably the case with the other four bands mentioned.) Of these five, three are predominantly Protestant in religious affiliation.

The religious factor does not appear to be the dominant one, however, except in particular contexts Iwo high income bands with the lowest percentages of population under sixteen are Lorette and Caughnawaga, both predominantly Catholic in affiliation.

TABLE XIII

AGE DISTRIBUTION OF BAND POPULATION

Band	Per Capita Income	Per Cent Under 16	Per Cent 65 and Over
Skidegate	$1252	34.5	5.4
Caughnawaga	793	32.1	65.9
Walpole Island	715	43	7.0
Sheshaht	664	51.7	4.9
Lorette	630	32.8	10.2
Squamish	630	49.3	3.5
Tyendinaga	516	34.1	12.1
Curve Lake	350	46.0	5.9
Six Nations	350	37.1	7.7
Mistassini	341	50.1	3.1
Masset	336	47.8	4.3
Dog Rib Rae	332	42.4	5.8
Port Simpson	325	49.7	4.1
Kamloops	314	50.2	4.3
Sarcee	302	49.3	3.1
Fort William	298	45.0	5.2
Williams Lake	291	42.8	6.6
Moose Factory	284	49.7	6.0
Fort Alexander	255	54.1	2.7
River Desert	250	36.1	8.8
St. Mary's	249	32.3	6.4
Attawapiskat	247	46.6	4.8
Pointe Bleue	222	40.7	6.1
Tobique	215	44.7	4.0
Pikangikum	197	43.4	3.5
Shubenacadie	180	43.3	5.9
Oak River, Man.	176	50.6	3.6
Rupert House	174	50.3	3.9
Cold Lake	165	50.9	5.0
Fort St. John	161	50.0	5.0
Deer Lake, Ont.	156	52.1	2.6
The Pas	140	50.1	5.1
James Smith	126	52.2	4.5
Peguis	99	45.7	7.8
Big Cove	61	54.4	3.8
Piapot	55	49.4	5.1
Coefficient of Correlation with Per Capita Income		- .46	.20

On the other hand, two high-income, relatively developed bands, one of which is predominantly Protestant, and the other predominantly Roman Catholic in affiliation, have percentages of their populations close to, or above, the general average for Indians across Canada. Sheshaht, a non-urban band, has 51.7 per cent and Squamish, a highly urbanized band, has 49.3 per cent.

There are two or three possible explanations for this divergent pattern. On the one hand, Lorette and Caughnawaga are among the most urbanized and integrated bands in the country. Lorette, in particular, includes among its members a few wealthy businessmen and a number of professional and white collar workers, as well as skilled and semi-skilled wage earners – in brief, it represents a rough cross-section of the Quebec City population. Birth rates and average family size probably closely approximate those of the French-speaking Catholic population of the City – and birth rates and average family size have been falling rapidly in Quebec over the past two decades. A major factor in the case of Caughnawaga is probably the high mobility of its labour force, coupled with its high degree of urbanization.

Members of the Squamish Band in North Vancouver are also predominantly Catholic in their religious affiliations, as pointed out, and equally urbanized in location. They are less integrated and representative of the city population as a whole, however, in so far as: (1) they are predominantly Roman Catholic in affiliation, in the midst of a predominantly Protestant (or religiously neutral) community; (2) they are specialized in the wage earning class; and (3) their economic development and participation as wage-earners in the urban industrial economy has been achieved more recently than has been the case with the other high income bands in Ontario and Quebec. The same (apart from religious affiliation) would apply to Sheshaht, except for their lesser degree of urbanization, in the broad sense of the term. For these reasons, then, they would tend to be less influenced by the surrounding White society as far as birth control and family size are concerned. Or, again, if a special study could be made, it might be found that Squamish followed a roughly comparable pattern to other Catholic wage-earners in the Vancouver district, especially if these were concentrated as an equally homogenous group in one limited residential area.

Lacking sufficient detailed knowledge about the Maniwaki and St. Mary's Bands, one can only speculate as to the reasons for their relatively slow rates of population growth, as measured by the low percentages under the age of sixteen. One possible explanation may be an unbalance in numbers between the sexes of child-bearing age, that leads to low marriage rates and birth rates. Both bands have a relatively high percentage of their members who reside outside of the reserves, namely 20.5 per cent for Maniwaki and 25.6 per cent for St. Mary's. If this out-migration were concentrated disproportionately among the members of one sex – particularly females of child-bearing age – it would tend to slow down the rate of population growth.

The higher income bands also generally have a higher percentage of their populations in the upper age group, over sixty-five, as well as having smaller percentages in the lower age, under sixteen group, than do the lower income bands, though the degree of correlation, as shown in Table XII, is not statistically significant.

The factors operating in this direction are probably much the same in both cases. Generally the higher income bands can afford, or have access to, better nutrition, health and medical care to look after their aged as well as their children.

One general conclusion, from the evidence available, would seem to be that higher proportions of the aged and lower proportions of the young in the population are, in most cases, by-products rather than determinants of economic growth. Such proportions affect the distribution of income and its amount per capita, as stressed earlier. But they do not appear to have any measurable adverse effects upon the work incentives or earning capacities of the band population, which are the prime determinants of economic development.

CHAPTER VI

SOCIO-ECONOMIC FACTORS AFFECTING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

The preceding chapter has dealt with primarily economic determinants of differential economic development among Indian bands across the country. This chapter, and the one following, are concerned with forces which, though not primarily economic in motivation or purpose, may be viewed as having more or less important effects upon the levels of economic development achieved by different bands. Somewhat arbitrarily, for purposes of analysis these have been put into two broad categories; namely, socio-economic and socio-cultural.

Included in the socio-economic category are the following, educational levels or attainments; demonstration effect and proximity to urban centres; mobility; and dependence on welfare.

1. Educational Levels and Attainments

Perhaps the most widely accepted hypothesis in the great body of research and writing on the subject is that education is becoming an increasingly important priority for economic development. The United Nations' Report on the World Social Situation (New York, 1961) covering several dozen nations ranging from the most to the least developed, found a far higher degree of correlation between economic development and educational levels than for any other single variable (see Report, Chap. 3).

Education is viewed as playing a central role in economic development for two main reasons:

(a) An increasingly long period of formal education and training is required to adjust people to rapidly changing technologies in an increasingly complex society. A disproportionate number of the displaced and unemployed, we are told, are concentrated in the ranks of the unskilled and under-educated, as the general skill levels required of labour in modern industry are raised.

(b) Fully as important as the actual technical or intellectual content of the courses offered are the work habits and motivations which the educational system attempts to instil in people at an impressionable age. A difficult problem of industrialization lies in the inculcation of work habits regulated by the clock and the weekly calendar, the acceptance of steady (and often monotonous) time schedules and routines, of submission to authority, and other requirements of employment in modern industrial and commercial enterprises.

Education, in the broad sense, is considered crucially important for the economic development of Indians in Canada, for several reasons:

(a) Their present educational levels or attainments in most regions are generally far below those of most other Canadians.

(b) A disproportionately large number of able bodied Indians of working age are unemployed or under-employed, and a disproportionate number of the employed are concentrated in low-income resource industries and in unskilled jobs. To facilitate the transfer of large numbers of these into more skilled or better paid fields of employment having the most favourable prospects of expansion, will require an extensive, and intensive, program of education, training and conditioning of Indian workers.

(c) Most important of all is the fact that approximately one-half of the Indian population, as compared to less than one-third of Canadians generally, are less than sixteen years of age. Most Indian bands have far higher birth rates than Whites, and comparatively even higher mortality rates for infants and children. These latter rates, however, have been dropping fairly rapidly since World War II. It seems likely, therefore, that the proportion of the Indian population in the under sixteen age group will continue to grow in the foreseeable future. Allowing for this age group at one end, coupled with the 5-7 per cent over sixty-five years of age, as well as other groups of working age (i.e. sixteen to sixty-five) who are unable to work due to physical or mental incapacity or to family responsibilities (e.g. widows and unmarried mothers), only a fraction of the Indian population –probably one-quarter to one-third – could be deemed available actually or potentially, for productive employment. A viable economic development program for Indians during the foreseeable future, therefore, will have to focus, not so much on employing, re-employing or redirecting the employment of Indians now of working age, as on educating, training and preparing for work, young Indians who will be reaching working age in rapidly increasing numbers over the years ahead.

Education, in brief, is deemed to play a crucial role in the economic development of Indians and in their integration into the larger Canadian society. Over the past decade or more, as compared to previous years, the Indian Affairs Branch has been carrying out a far larger, more comprehensive and varied educational and training program on behalf of Indians, and education now accounts for the largest single item on the Indian Affairs Branch's annual budget.

In view of the above, therefore, one would expect that among Indian bands, there would be a high degree of correlation between educational levels and per capita real incomes, and that those bands with the highest educational standards would also enjoy, on the average, the highest occupational achievements and income levels – as was found in the U.N. Survey referred to above.

From the evidence available in the present study, this hypothesis seems generally valid, though the degree of correlation is lower than one would expect. Among the most economically depressed bands are the isolated ones in which the majority of adults are illiterate and unschooled, with a limited command of English or French, while some of the most advanced, high-income bands, such as Lorette and Skidegate, have a significant minority of individuals with relatively high levels of educational achievement. Between these broad extremes, however, the relationship is far from clear.

Here the question of definition is important in attempting to measure the correlation between education and economic development, and even more in attempting to formulate policy.

(a) What is the best measure of the educational level or attainment of a band? Should it be measured in terms of the proportion of all band members who have completed grade school or high school? Or should it be measured in terms of the minority who have taken post-secondary or university education? The two do not necessarily go together. For instance, as may be seen in Table XIV below (based on a special survey by the Education Division of the Indian Affairs Branch), a larger percentage of the Caughnawaga population than of the Six Nations has a formal education beyond the level of Grade IX, yet the Six Nations has a far higher percentage who have attended, or graduated from, university (and several of their graduates have achieved notable prestige in a number of professions).

TABLE XIV

EDUCATIONAL LEVELS OF BAND POPULATIONS

Band	Per Capita Income	Per Cent Aged 16 and Over in School	Per Cent of Population Educated Past Grade IX
Skidegate	$1252		
Caughnawaga	793	3.45	4.7
Walpole Island	715	3.92	2.9
Sheshaht	664	3.95	3.6
Lorette	630	4.24	7.0
Squamish	630	3.36	3.9
Tyendinaga	516	3.89	2.4
Curve Lake	350	6.78	2.2
Six Nations	350	7.63	2.8
Mistassini	341	3.20	2.2
Masset	336		
Dog Rib Rae	332		
Port Simpson	325	3.20	2.9
Kamloops	314	2.87	1.9
Sarcee	302	5.48	1.6
Fort William	298	5.35	3.8
Williams Lake	291	6.10	7.1
Moose Factory	284	4.71	1.8
Fort Alexander	255		
River Desert	250	2.90	1.8
St. Mary's (B.C.)	249	4.28	3.4
Attawapiskat	247	3.27	2.1
Pointe Bleue	222	6.12	5.3
Tobique	215	7.66	3.5
Pikangikum	197	.88	0.0
Shubenacadie	180	3.24	.8
Oak River	176		
Rupert House	174	4.51	1.8
Cold Lake	165	2.78	3.7
Fort St. John	161	.73	0.0
Deer Lake, Ont.	156		
The Pas	140	1.79	0.0
James Smith	126	5.40	3.1
Peguis	99	2.25	4.0
Big Cove	61	3.25	1.3
Piapot	55		
Coefficient of Correlation with Per Capita Income		.002	.47

On the other hand, the Six Nations Band has more than twice as large a proportion of its population over sixteen attending schools of one kind or another, than has Caughnawaga. (Indeed, in this latter category, as one of the highest income bands, Caughnawaga has lower percentages than a number of low-income bands such as Tobique, Rupert House and James Smith.)

Again, how is one to compare technical or vocational training, or on-the-job training with formal education? While the evidence on this point is not conclusive as yet, it appears that a number of Indian bands along the Northern Coast of British Columbia have a higher percentage of their adult populations who have taken, or are taking, technical or vocational training courses, as well as a higher proportion of university students and graduates, than the Squamish Band in Greater Vancouver.

How precisely, and in what detail, should one attempt to correlate education with economic development (particularly if defined in terms of per capita real income from gainful employment)? In White society there is far from a positive correlation. For instance, the most highly educated members, college professors, have lower incomes than members of some other business or professional groups having less rigorous educational requirements. Or, at lower levels of educational achievement, white collar clerical or office workers generally have lower incomes than manual workers who have had fewer years of high school or vocational training. Obviously, even in such an income-oriented society as that of English-speaking Canada, non-monetary incentives are as important, or in some cases more important, than the monetary ones, in the recruitment and motivation of various occupational groups.

The Indians may well be less imbued with the particular non-monetary status-striving motivations peculiar to the White culture. The role of education in their economic development, generally, and individual success in particular, therefore, may be even less precisely definable than in the larger society.

Table XIV above, uses two very rough indices of comparative educational levels; namely, (1) percentage of the population over sixteen still enrolled in schools, and (2) percentage of the total population with an education beyond Grade IX, among a representative sample of thirty-five bands ranked according to per capita real income from gainful employment. As may be seen from the table, there is no meaningful correlation (beyond that of a random sample – i.e. .002) between the per capita incomes of band members and (1) above. And there is only a limited (though statistically significant degree (.47) of correlation with (2) –(i.e. proportion of population educated past Grade IX)

There are a number of possible explanations for this limited degree of correlation between economic development and educational standards.

(a) One explanation may lie in certain limitations in data and in statistical techniques.

(1) First and most important, perhaps, is the fact that the data in Table XIV apply only to resident members of the bands. It was found impossible to obtain reliable data on the educational achievements of non-residents. If such data were available, they would probably show a higher degree of correlation for both measures of educational standards – i.e. percentage over sixteen attending school, and percentage of population having more than a Grade IX education. For, as noted elsewhere, a high proportion of Indians, perhaps a majority, who graduate from high school or who take vocational or technical training at the secondary or post-secondary levels, leave their reserves and become permanently established elsewhere. And, from the limited knowledge available about them, they generally earn higher incomes than their fellow band members who continue to reside in their home communities. Indeed, the provision of such education and training on a larger scale would appear to be one of the most vital measures for supporting those who wish to leave reserve communities in which the populations have outrun locally available resources and job opportunities.

(2) The degree of correlation between economic development and education at the Grade IX level or over may also be underestimated because the latter applies to the entire resident band population in each case, and not just to those of working age. A Grade IX or higher education would probably (but not necessarily, for reasons explained below) show a higher degree of correlation with average earnings of adults (i.e. sixteen and over). The figures in Table XIV do, however, provide one rough index of the value that different communities put on education: that is, the degree to which children as well as adults in bands at different income levels are educated to the Grade IX or higher level in school.

(3) The absence of any correlation between average income and proportion of population sixteen years of age and over in school seems more difficult to explain. Absence of data regarding nonresident band members is one limiting factor, as noted, but even

if available it is doubtful whether the degree of correlation would be significant.

It is also possible that attendance at school at age sixteen or over tells us little about the quality of education received, or the level of education attained. The figures apply only to residents of each reserve community. For reasons explained earlier, in many bands (particularly those in areas lacking high schools or vocational training institutes) most of those attending school at sixteen or over would be non-residents. Or, again, in some of the more depressed bands suffering from serious unemployment, a high proportion of Indian students may be kept in school at sixteen or over, even if their educational motivations and attainments are low because job opportunities are lacking and there is, in effect, nothing else for young people to do. By contrast, some bands located in areas where there are manifold job opportunities for Indians at relatively high rates of pay may experience high drop-out rates among their teenage members.

(4) Another essential limitation is that data on incomes available in this study are essentially static. The ranking of bands according to per capita real incomes is for the year 1964 (and in a few cases 1965). Comparable data for earlier periods are not available, so no analysis can be made of income changes or trends for each band over a period of ten years or so. In some high income bands a high proportion of adults specialize in jobs of a kind that are vulnerable to sharp cyclical fluctuations in employment and earnings (as in logging and construction work, for instance). Ideally, a more adequate measure of the relationships between education and earnings among Indian bands would require correlating improvements in educational standards with improvements in earnings over an extended period of time. A really adequate measure, indeed, would require a correlation of lifetime earnings of individual Indians (or averages for each band) with different educational standards achieved. For high income occupations requiring lengthy education and training generally have low starting rates of pay, lower than do semi-skilled or skilled manual jobs with limited formal educational requirements.

(b) While the data on this question are fragmentary and would require a series of fairly detailed biographies, many or even most of the Indians who have achieved positions of comparative wealth and business success --as proprietors in farming, fishing, and commercial or industrial enterprises – appear to have had less than the average education. They have followed, rather, the pattern of traditional entrepreneurship, depending on individual qualities of hard work, abstinence, shrewdness, business acumen, etc. The more highly educated Indians, on the other hand, as pointed out earlier, have tended to be in relatively low-paid professions such as teaching, social work or the civil service, or to be in such professions as law, in which their lack of contact, acceptance and knowledge of the ways of the Establishment keep them in the lower-paid fringe.[1]

---

[1] While the following example is too limited to draw any very broad conclusions, it may be typical of several bands in different parts of the country. Three Indian university students who are now established in professional positions came from three different fishing villages in British Columbia, two of them from families of modest means, with fathers the owner-operators of gillnetting boats. The third came from a broken family at the bottom of the social scale. All three are of the view that the most substantial men in their villages – the owners of seine boats worth tens of thousands of dollars – belittle the value of education, using their own limited education by way of example. Their sons, according to these informants, are indifferent students and have a high drop-out rate. They maintain that in this sort of Indian community with sharp differences in wealth and income, it is children from the middle class group or, occasionally, from the most disadvantaged deviant families, who are likely to be the most highly motivated in school.

(c) On the more general level, as brought out in the preceding section, the evidence available indicates that the most important single determinant of a band's economic development is the proportion of its members employed in relatively well-paid manual jobs which have low, or limited, educational requirements. Two of the highest income bands, as noted frequently above, are the Squamish and the Caughnawaga, both located within the environs of major metropolitan areas, providing easy access to the best educational institutions (including universities) within their respective regions. Yet few members of either band are university graduates, and so far there are few that have attended university. Proximity and demonstration effect have not yet operated as motivating forces with effect on development in these cases.

Undoubtedly, part of the answer lies in certain inadequacies in the primary and secondary levels of schooling in previous years. More important, however, would appear to be the main occupational bases of the adult members of these bands, and the attitudes and values that these generate. They appear to impose a certain ceiling of aspirations on the children and teenagers (especially male) of these communities, which in turn affects their attitudes towards, and achievements in, the formal educational system.

On this point, such highly urbanized bands as the Squamish and Caughnawaga appear to have much in common with predominantly working-class suburbs of our major cities and towns. This has some important implications for policies or programs designed to encourage integration of Indians with White society, and the role of education in any such integration program. For the key questions, as pointed out earlier in this Report, are; for what patterns of employment, specialization or diversification, and at what levels of participation in the larger White society should educational programs for Indians be designed?

Specifically, what is suggested is this: In a community in which the majority (or substantial core) of adult male members are employed in relatively well-paid jobs, having limited educational requirements, these establish the basic style of life and also the ceiling of aspirations, for the majority of young people due to enter the labour force in the near future. Particularly where an occupation has elements of risk, excitement and glamour, and a he-man role – as does the high steel construction work of the Caughnawagas, and to a lesser extent, the longshoring jobs of the Squamish, and the logging jobs of Sheshaht and other bands in British Columbia – it becomes the model or the main expectation of young males, the type of job that fathers, uncles and older brothers do. Formal education at the high school or post-high school level is viewed as having little or no positive role to play in this career orientation.

By comparison, a relatively developed community (Indian or White) in which the adult males are engaged in a greater diversity of work, such as proprietors of farms, fishing vessels and small businesses, as well as factory or office work, is likely to generate stronger incentives towards education and training. Many Indians – like many Whites – are being displaced from primary industries such as farming and fishing, owing to rapid technological change and the trend towards larger scale operations. Clerical and factory workers are more directly influenced by such changes. Both groups are more likely, therefore, to attribute lack of success on their part to deficiencies in education or training, and to stress in conversation the importance of education as a requirement for economic survival.

(d) Another possible factor to explain the fact that some bands located within easy access of large urban communities fail to take advantage of them for their own advancement, is that such access also offers too many competing attractions. For instance, superintendents' reports and other data indicate a high drop-out rate among Indian students of the Sarcee Band on the outskirts of Calgary, even though this band's location, as well as its sizable band funds and revenues, provide it with advantages for achieving a superior level of economic and educational development.

(e) Another factor that can strongly influence the educational motivations and attainments as well as the economic development of an Indian band is the degree of difference in status between its members and residents of the adjoining or nearby White community. This can have a strong effect on Indians and Whites alike.

Conclusions and Qualifications

One limitation in this study is that the data available in this research survey probably underrate the effect of education on economic development, because it focusses on the community rather than the individual. An increasing number of Indians have graduated from high school or taken post-high training and permanently left their home reserves.

Another limitation is that, in the nature of the case, it is too early to be able to measure the full impact of education upon economic development. It is scarcely more than fifteen years since the Indian Affairs Branch began its program for the integration of Indian pupils in White schools, and to improve the quality as well as the amount of education that Indians receive. Most adult Indians received what limited education they now have prior to this period, when there were serious shortcomings in the educational facilities available to them, while the younger adults have not had time, as yet, to enjoy the full benefits in earnings from the improved educations that they've received.

Finally, it is possible that to some extent the apparent lack of a more direct connection or higher correlation between the levels of education and of economic development achieved by various Indian band communities may be due to continued shortcomings in overall policy. The program for integrated education of Indian children in many cases may be doomed to failure unless it is accompanied by equally ambitious programs on other fronts --housing, community development, infrastructure, and economic growth generally.

2. Demonstration Effect and Proximity to Urban Centres

The orthodox economic viewpoint as noted at the beginning of this study is that people are naturally motivated to want more than they have and will exert themselves to get it wherever they have the opportunity. They are limited only by their means.

The more sophisticated view today is that the intensity of wants of a people depends on cultural contact, including the demonstration effect of seeing and experiencing a higher standard of consumption among more economically developed people.

According to this view, Indian bands living in close proximity to more developed White communities should have correspondingly more developed consumer tastes, especially for expensive durable goods or services that involve long-term saving or debt commitments (e.g. homes, automobiles, university education). These, in turn, should induce Indians to seek and hold steady well-paying jobs and to save and accumulate capital to develop their resources more effectively.

One might expect, therefore, that most members of Indian bands located in close proximity to White communities would be so motivated and economically more advanced than those located at some distance from them. Indeed, one might postulate a rank order of bands in terms of the sizes and types of White communities to which they have easiest access, major metropolitan centre, satellite city or suburb, small commercial centre, small industrial centre, village, and farm community, in descending order. The larger and more complex the community, the wider the choice of goods and services (as well as types of job opportunities) the greater the demonstration effect and motivation, and so on.

This, again, is a variable factor that would be difficult to quantify and measure with any degree of accuracy, as no statistics have been compiled on the subject. These would probably be redundant in any case, for on inspection there appears to be little, if any, correlation between the comparative economic development of bands and their relative proximity to urban centres of various types and sizes, except, again, at the extremes. The more isolated bands in the northern belt and some of the more isolated rural bands in the Prairies are among the least developed, and their members probably have the lowest standards of living or levels of consumer aspiration. By contrast, as shown in Table VIII earlier (in the section dealing with infrastructure) most of the highest income, most economically developed bands in the sample studied are located in or near large metropolitan centres or industrial towns, and generally show the highest percentages of households with electricity, running water, indoor baths and toilets, telephones and automobiles.

Such communities, however, appear to be in the minority. Among the highest-income and most developed bands, economically and educationally, are several which are located at considerable distances from urban centres. Among the most depressed Indian bands are some located in or near White urban communities, including large metropolitan centres as well as notably prosperous and expanding business or industrial towns that would seem to offer manifold job opportunities. For various reasons the members of such bands have failed to participate effectively in the surrounding economic activity. Among such reasons are the following:

(a) Modern improvements in transportation and communication have tended to reduce the importance of physical distance, or proximity, as factors determining the frequency of intensity of contact and demonstration effect. A great distance, in terms of miles, may mean little in terms of time and effort where there are automobiles and good roads, or chartered plane flights and the means to pay for them. Advertising by means of radio, television, mail-order catalogues or magazines can create as much desire for various commodities as does actual window shopping. The main distance facing most Indians and the main barriers that prevent them functioning effectively in the national economy, are essentially social rather than physical in character,

(b) Most large urban areas have a dependent White minority containing a familiar hard core of the social casework loads, As pointed out by various authorities, individuals in such groups are not motivated by the same incentives or to the same degree as are most members of the working and middle class, The urban poor constitute a self-perpetuating sub-cultural group with its own system of rewards and satisfactions in which durable consumer goods, education and higher status do not function as economically motivating forces, Indians frequently tend to integrate with White society at this level and thus tend to perpetuate low subsistence standards that have grown up in reserve life.

(c) Again, even in the same metropolitan community, different Indian bands may react differently, or be motivated in quite different degrees.

Here the crucial variable would seem to be the groups in the White community with whom Indians participate, or fail to participate, effectively. For instance, in the Vancouver area, members of the Squamish Band at one time were concentrated in fishing, cannery labour and casual longshoring. In recent decades, they have become displaced from fishing and cannery labour to a large extent, while longshoring has been decasualized. A sizable core of adult workers has become regularly employed, well paid workers on the docks and to a lesser extent in logging operations, sawmills and other industrial establishments, and appears to maintain relatively high standards of consumption. Their houses, cars and other appurtenances appear to be of nearly equal quality with White middle-income neighbours. Members of the Musqueam Band, by contrast, have remained concentrated in the ranks of casual labour and a much larger proportion than in Squamish are dependent on relief. Unlike Squamish, the Musqueam Reserve is located on the outskirts of a prosperous high-income or upper middle class community. Children of both groups in the area, White and Indian, largely attended the same schools. However, the gap in incomes and living standards between the two groups appears to be too large and thus perhaps fails to have sufficient demonstration effect on Indian motivations with regard to work habits and behaviour patterns as well as education.

These cases perhaps raise some important points regarding the integration and motivation of Indians. In some cases Indians appear to be more economically motivated and participate jointly with Whites to a greater extent in less developed communities, where White standards in income, consumption and schooling are not too high in relation to the Indians, so that the latter can feel confident of being able to compete on an equal basis The Pemberton Valley, some sixty miles northeast of Vancouver, again seems a good example of this process. Both groups, Whites and Indians, have been abandoning farming and turning increasingly to logging and construction work. To an increasing extent, they are employed on the same projects. Educational standards are generally low for both groups. A small core of residents, both White and Indian, has made a determined effort to improve educational standards and encourage greater participation of both groups in various social activities. While employment opportunities are rather limited for both groups, and there is usually a body of under-employed Whites as well as Indians, increasing numbers of Indians have become steady, well-paid skilled or semi-skilled employees, as well as completing their high school educations and pursuing careers elsewhere.

3. Mobility

It is a basic tenet of economics that greater mobility of the labour force contributes to increased efficiency and higher per capita income over the economy as a whole. Logically, it should apply to individual Indian bands as well. If a high proportion of band members were willing and able to leave their reserves for more or less long distances and extended periods of time, they would be better able to take advantage of outside job opportunities and move into better paid types of employment, while at the same time reducing the pressure of population on resources and job opportunities in or near their own communities.

Generally, the findings in this research survey from the evidence that is available seem to indicate that there is a high degree of correlation between mobility and economic development, as measured by per capita real income from gainful employment. As one sort of indication, for instance, correspondence among officials at different levels within the Indian Affairs Branch throughout the country indicates that there is a pronounced cyclical pattern of mobility among Indians. During periods of expansion when new job openings are available to them, increasing numbers leave their reserves for varying periods of time. In periods of recession and unemployment, as during 1957-58 and again in 1960-61, more or less large numbers of them return to their reserve communities because of displacement and unemployment. In the past four years of rapid and uninterrupted expansion in British Columbia, for instance, the percentages of band members residing off their reserves rose as follows, year by year as of January 1st: 1962–14.2 per cent; 1963–15.8 per cent; 1964–18.7 per cent; 1965–22.4 per cent. As of 1965 there were some 400 fewer Indians on reserves than there were in 1961, despite an increase in total Indian population of more than 3,500 in the province.

It is appropriate at this point to define different types or patterns of mobility, to analyse more precisely in what respects they may be viewed as favouring, or discouraging, the economic development of a band.

(1) Among the most depressed Indian bands are those whose members have lost their mobility. The outstanding case, of course, comprises the dozens of bands across the whole northern belt of the country who formerly engaged in hunting, fishing and trapping economies with their high requirements of seasonal movement. As noted earlier, a combination of low fur prices, rapid population increase and depletion of resources in some areas, coupled with changes in educational and welfare policies of the Indian Affairs Branch, have led increasing numbers to abandon their former means of livelihood, reside permanently in or near the band community and depend increasingly on relief.

(2) Daily commuting to work. Generally, as noted earlier, there is a positive correlation between average per capita real income and the proportion of band members employed in wage or salaried work outside the reserve, This is particularly true of some bands located in or near urban or industrial operations in which steady, year-round jobs, or regular employment in well-paid seasonal jobs, are available within commuting distance of their reserves.

(3) Working and living away from the reserve for weeks or months at a time. Among different bands, we find a mixed picture in this regard.

(a) Some bands with a high mobility of this type have low per capita incomes because many of their members are employed in low-paid casual types of labour. Among these, as noted, are those engaged in such work as sugar beet labour in South Alberta, wild rice harvesting in Southeastern Manitoba, and tobacco field labour and fruit picking in Southern Ontario.

(b) Other bands in this category would be classed as relatively high-income groups because many of their members are employed in high-paid seasonal work that requires their leaving the reserve for extended periods (e.g. steel construction of the Caughnawagas, logging and fishing among the Skidegate, Nimpkish, and numerous other bands on the West Coast, and clearing and construction work among numerous bands in virtually all provinces).

(4) Permanent residence off the reserve. The line between this and the preceding category, of course, is hard to draw. It is largely a matter of process and degree. One familiar sequence, for instance, is that of individual Indians who have to leave their families for weeks or months at a time, to get and keep jobs in areas too distant from their home reserves to be able to make regular visits home except at an exorbitant cost for transportation. This sort of situation, of course, tends to create anxiety and tension, and partly accounts for the high turnover. Where the pay and working conditions are satisfactory, or at least superior to anything available within commuting distance of the home reserves – and where adequate housing accommodation is available, Indian workers frequently bring their families with them and leave the reserve permanently (or, alternatively, in some cases, they may desert their families, as happens not infrequently among Whites). In times of recession and layoffs, as noted earlier, many such workers and their families tend to return to their home communities.

Permanent residence away from the reserve is more pronounced among the skilled and educated minority, where home reserves are too distant from the urban centres in which they receive their training and in which their main opportunities for employment are concentrated. While lacking definite statistics, most of the available evidence seems to indicate that very few Indians from more isolated bands in Northern Ontario, Manitoba, or British Columbia who (with the assistance of the Indian Affairs Branch) receive high school or vocational school training in Toronto, Winnipeg or Vancouver, ever return to their home reserves, except for brief visits.

It might be thought, in this connection, that such mobility would have adverse effects on the development potential of numerous Indian bands, for the net result might tend to be to drain the community of its most able, enterprising and productive members. From what evidence is available, however, this does not seem to be the case. Table XV below presents statistics concerning the percentage of the population residing outside their reserve communities for each band, and the average annual earnings from employment of non-residents as compared with resident, for thirty-six bands in the sample studied. The percentage of non-residents to total population is generally larger for the high-income than for low-income bands. There are notable exceptions among both income groups, of course. The percentage of non-residents is relatively low for two high-income bands – i.e. Sheshaht (13.2 per cent) and Squamish (9.9 per cent) – largely because the working residents of these bands are able to find well-paid employment within commuting distance of their reserves. Some relatively low-income bands, on the other hand, show a high rate of non-residence; notably Shubenacadie, Nova Scotia (41.6 per cent).

This is to be explained mainly by the large proportions of band members who have emigrated to the United States to take advantage of superior employment opportunities, while employment opportunities and rates of pay remain inadequate for those who have stayed in their reserve communities.[1]

That non-resident band members in the majority of cases gain economically from their mobility seems indicated by the second column of figures in Table XV, showing, in percentage terms, average annual earnings of non-residents compared with residents in each band. Non-residents' earnings, on the average, exceed those of residents in seventeen bands; in three they are estimated to be the same; in seven they are less than those of residents; and in nine the earnings of non-residents are unknown. The superior earnings of non-residents are particularly striking among a number of low-income bands in the Prairies in which farming and casual farm labour are the main sources of employment; e.g. Piapot and James Smith, Saskatchewan (300 per cent); Peguis (200+ per cent); and Oak River (250 per cent) in Manitoba. The 300 per cent figure for Sheshaht represents a handful of specially skilled and highly paid workers in a small band having only 50 family units.

(5) So far most of the discussion has concerned the reversible mobility of male workers or family groups. Another very significant type of mobility among the Indians, however, is that of individuals, particularly females, who move permanently into White society. In many, perhaps most bands, the girls study in school longer than the boys and acquire training that better fits them for outside jobs, particularly as nurses' aides, office or clerical workers, and occasionally teachers and social workers. They are employed mainly in urban communities and frequently marry White men, This migration tends to leave an imbalance between the sexes of marriageable age in the home bands. The surplus of males of marriageable age, in turn, probably encourages greater numbers of men to leave their home reserves permanently to find work elsewhere.

This pattern would apply primarily to bands in farming and primary industrial areas that are beyond commuting distance from sizable cities and towns. In the more isolated hunting and trapping bands in the north, the movement of Indian women out of the reserves to live with Whites does not necessarily improve the economic status of the community. In many, perhaps most, cases the Whites are of a lower economic status and inter-marriage under such circumstances has given rise to numbers living on the outskirts of reserves under equally or more depressed conditions than the residents of the reserves.

There may be two or three other situations in which out-migration does not contribute to economic advancement of the individual or of the band:

(i) Where resources in the band community are more than adequate to support the populations at higher levels of income if used more fully and effectively and where mobility might prevent such utilization. (This may be the case with a few of such well-endowed bands as the Blood and Sarcee in Alberta.)

---

[1] In comparing rates of mobility, four bands (i.e. Dog Rib Rae, Attawapiskat, Pikangikum and Deer Lake) should perhaps be omitted from the discussion because "percentage residing off reserves" is not in itself a reliable index of mobility. In these cases, and numerous other bands across the northern wooded belt, a large proportion – and in some cases all – of the band members reside on Crown lands acquired by the Indian Affairs Branch on their behalf, and their communities comprise, in effect, new reserves.

(ii) Where mobility is basically non-economic in motivation and in results (e.g. the hundreds of Indians in British Columbia who go berrypicking a few weeks each year in Northern Washington, frequently at the expense of more remunerative employment in farming or logging closer to their home bases).

(iii) Where there is a migration to cities and towns of Indians who are unskilled and unprepared for urban life. A large but unknown number has ended up becoming permanently unemployed and dependent on social welfare, or on Skid Road.

Mobility, finally, should be expected to encourage greater participation of Indians in the social as well as economic sense in White society. Again, however, this is not always the case. Some patterns of mobility may tend to keep Indians in a distinct and separate status as a group (e.g. the annual migration of Indians for sugar beet work in Southern Alberta and Saskatchewan, and in British Columbia for berrypicking, fishing and cannery labour). Or, again, the continuous mobility of the Caughnawagas required by the very nature of their specialized high steel construction work perhaps prevents them establishing firm roots in outside White communities, and reinforces their much publicized determination to survive as a distinct social group.

It seems safe to conclude, however, that high rates of mobility and out-migration from reserves are major factors contributing to the economic advance-merit of most Indian bands in Canada. Indeed, there seem to be good grounds for concluding that in most bands expenditures of money, time and personnel for training and conditioning Indians to migrate from their reserves, and providing them with the facilities for resettlement elsewhere, would contribute more to their economic advancement than equivalent expenditures devoted to community and resource development within or adjacent to their reserves. The two policies are not mutually exclusive, of course. What is suggested is greater emphasis on the former than has been the case hitherto, to achieve a better balanced program.

4. Dependence on Welfare

Among the most strongly diverging viewpoints concerning economic development are those centred around the role and effect of welfare expenditures, in the broad sense of the term.

The conservative or traditionalist economic view, as outlined earlier, is that the accumulation of capital needed for development requires saving, which in turn means restricting levels of consumption (including government welfare expenditures paid out of taxes). Proponents of traditional free enterprise philosophy maintain that, spending too much on non-productive, non-revenue-producing welfare services and facilities, discourages expansion of the productive, revenue-producing sectors of the economy.

But there is a growing body of thought that stresses the need for balanced economic and social development. For one thing, rapid economic development often has disruptive effects that involve high social (and in the long run economic) costs (e.g. the social problems that accompany the launching of a major new industry, with the influx of large numbers of transients into a hitherto stable, tradition-bound community). Beyond this, there is growing emphasis on the economics of human investment (i.e. expenditures on health and welfare, as well as educational services and facilities) as against investment purely in capital goods, as a necessary accompaniment of and stimulus to economic development. To the degree that such expenditures serve to improve the health, morale and efficiency of the people, they should stimulate economic growth.

Perhaps the most common charge levelled against the Indian Affairs Branch (and the critics include many people within the Branch itself) is that its welfare policies since the War have tended to lower the initiative of Indians and thus impede their economic development. In one broad sense this charge seems justified. Dozens of bands across Northern Canada who up until recently supported themselves at a meagre subsistence level in hunting, trapping and fishing economies, have now forsaken their traditional activities and become almost entirely dependent upon government welfare and relief. The problem is compounded by the

TABLE XV

MOBILITY AND EARNINGS

Band	Per Capita Income	% Population Residing Off Reserve	Average Earnings Non-Residents, 70 of Residents	Religious Affiliation (1959 Census)
Skidegate	$1252	18.0	86	100% UC
Caughnawaga	793	27.11	150	84% RC
Walpole Island	715	19.3	82.2	70% AC, 22% UC
Sheshaht	664	13.2	298	97% UC
Lorette	630	41 .8	n/a	100%. RC
Squamish	630	9.9	100	97% RC
Tyendinaga	516	53.8	160	40% AC, 56% not stated
Curve Lake	350	26.3	136	98% UC
Six Nations	350	39.8	n/a	34% AC, 30% Bap. 19% LH
Mistassini	341	20.0	31.4	Over 90% AC
Masset	336	24.7	n/a	99% AC
*Dog Rib Rae	332	100.0 (Nomadic)	n/a	98% RC
Port Simpson	325	33.0	n/a	99% UC
Kamloops	314	20.7	n/a	100% RC
Sarcee	302	5.4	n/a	52% RC, 48% AC
Fort William	298	24.5	78.4	100% RC
Williams Lake	291	11.0	172	100% RC
Moose Factory	284	19.4	n/a	98% AC
Fort Alexander	255	17.7	100.5	73% RC, 27% AC
River Desert	250	20.5	200	90% RC
St. Mary's	249	25.6	125	100% RC
*Attawapiskat	247	48.3	n/a	94% RC
Pointe Bleue	222	23.2	189	99% RC
Tobique	215	29.6	92	100% RC
*Pikangikum	197	29.1	112	75% UC,19% RC
Shubenacadie	180	41,6	n/a	100% RC
Oak River, Man,	176	2.3	268	71% AC, 29% RC
*Rupert House	174	10.7	n/a	100% AC
Cold Lake	165	13.4	129	97% RC
Fort St. John	161	15.5	120	92% RC
Deer Lake, Ont.	156	31.0	132	67% UC, 30% RC
The Pas	140	8.8	n/a	100% AC
James Smith	126	3.75	300	95% AC
Peguis	99	8.0	167	90% AC
Big Cove	61	18.4	n/a	100% RC
Piapot	55	13.0	779	93% RC

*- Entirely Crown Land
RC - Roman Catholic AC - Anglican
UC - United LH - Long House

---

fact that better health and nutrition, due to government expenditures, as compared with the old subsistence economies, have sharply reduced the death rate and led to the familiar population explosion.

Much the same has occurred among depressed Indian bands in the Maritimes and the Prairies. In many such communities, prior to the War, most band members depended upon marginal farming and low-paid casual jobs of short duration, supplemented by meagre relief handouts.

Such cases should not simply be accepted as proof that welfare expenditures discourage development, however. Several points would seem to modify or refute that conclusion. First, there is nothing to indicate that Indian communities were more economically developed prior to the adoption of a more liberal welfare program. The subsistence economies in the northern belt based on hunting, trapping and fishing were static and undeveloped, and most Indians would probably have been displaced from these activities in any case owing to technological changes substitutes for fur, low fur prices, development of new transportation facilities and industries resulting in the influx of Whites, depletion of resources, etc. Second, improved welfare was probably unavoidable in any case regardless of possible deterring effects economically, for there is a moral necessity to provide minimum subsistence and health services to all the population. Third, if a balance of new job opportunities were made available, and if Indians could be motivated to make full use of such opportunities, in the aggregate they probably would be found to be more employable than before, by reason of their improved levels of nutrition and health, made possible by the more liberal welfare services available to them since the War, than they would have been had such services not been provided.

Fourth, the more valid criticism is not that against welfare as such, but rather against the lack of a balanced program for economic and social development. With the wisdom of hindsight, we can now see that it would have been better to have launched an ambitious program of economic and community development in the broadest sense among Indians, with welfare as only one part of the program. This imbalance is not peculiar to the Indian Affairs Branch. On a world scale some of the main problems of economic development have arisen from the fact that in previous decades developed countries exported personnel and facilities for improving health and reducing the death rate before exporting capital. and techniques for achieving sufficient economic growth to support the population increases that better medicine and health brought about.

Finally, it should be pointed out there does not seem to be any significant inverse correlation between welfare expenditure and economic development except, again, at the extremes. As would be expected, the highest expenditures per capita by the Indian Affairs Branch are for the most undeveloped bands whose members are almost entirely unemployed, while at the other extreme, some of the highest income bands involve virtually no relief expenditures out of public funds. For reasons discussed below, however, this pattern arises primarily because welfare needs are a result of a lack of economic development, but cannot be assumed to be a basic cause of this lack. Furthermore, the low level of public welfare expenditures among a number of bands is explained by the fact that. they have sizable band funds and revenues which are drawn upon to pay for relief and other types of welfare for their members.

A more meaningful comparison might be achieved by combining relief expenditures from both sources – i.e. band funds and the public purse. Here, however, another difficulty arises, because bands differ considerably in relief policy. The Squamish Band, for instance, appears to have been fairly liberal in giving relief to indigent Indian mothers who had lost their band membership by leaving the reserve to marry or live with White men and subsequently returned to the reserve. Some wealthy bands in Alberta, such as the Blood, by contrast are exceedingly strict in their criteria of band membership and in granting relief to non-resident band members, or former residents who lost their membership rights. Again, such bands as the Sarcee have been extremely liberal in voting themselves large annual cash distributions from the band revenues, and these should, functionally, be considered the equivalent of relief,

A special survey carried out by the Welfare Division of the Indian Affairs Branch a couple of years ago provides a broad comparison of per capita incomes and Indian Affairs Branch welfare expenditures per capita for some sixty-nine agency divisions across the country. Conspicuous by their absence from the list were seven agencies that include some of the most developed bands, in terms of average per capita real income from gainful employment (or, from the Branch's view, the minimum problems of welfare); namely, Vancouver, New Westminster and Kwawkewlth in British Columbia, Caughnawaga and Lorette in Quebec, and Six Nations and Walpole Island in Southern Ontario.

Allowing for these at one end of the scale, and for the most undeveloped and depressed areas on the other, the inverse correlation between annual income per worker and per capita relief payments was small. As measured by income, the agencies were ranked according to percentage of Indian households receiving less than $2000 per annum from employment. Three of the five highest, Fort Vermilion, Alberta (100 per cent), Battleford, Saskatchewan (98.1 per cent), and Eskasoni, Nova Scotia (98.3 per cent) were among the top ten ranked according to relief expenditures per capita ($162, $116, and $118 respectively). Beyond these, there appears to be little correlation. For instance, Seven Islands, Quebec, ranking sixty-second in terms of percentage of households earning less than $2000 per annum (68.3 per cent) ranked second out of sixty-nine in per capita relief payments ($157). Similarly, Pointe Bleue, Quebec, ranked fifty-sixth and third ($149) respectively. At the other extreme, Fort St. John, British Columbia, ranked third highest in percentage of Indian households earning less than $2000 per annum (99.1 per cent), was near the bottom in terms of relief per capita ($20). In between these were such agencies as the Blackfoot in Alberta with 71.1 per cent and $1 respectively, and the Queen Charlotte Agency in British Columbia, with 40.9 per cent and $81 respectively.

Data regarding welfare expenditures per capita, and percentage of households receiving welfare for periods of varying duration during the year for most of the sample bands in the study are shown in Table XVI below. These figures were provided as part of the special survey made by the Welfare Division of the indian Affairs Branch in 1963.

Generally, as would be expected, the figures from this representative sample of bands show much the same pattern as by agencies, as described above. That there is a definite relationship between welfare expenditures and lack of development is shown by the inverse correlation between bands ranked on a descending scale according to per capita real incomes from gainful employment, and the generally ascending scale of percentages of households depending on welfare payments during the year, and welfare expenditures per capita.

Again, however, there are significant divergencies from this general pattern. The percentages of households receiving welfare during the year were considerably larger in certain high income bands such as Caughnawaga (12.76 per cent), Walpole Island (14.1 per cent), and Squamish (28.5 per cent), than in certain relatively low-income, under-developed bands such as River Desert (6.7 per cent) and Fort St. John (7.4 per cent). Similarly, per capita expenditures in Squamish were $42 for the year, as compared with a mere $7.6 in Dog Rib Rae and $5.24 in River Desert.

One can only conclude, from these data, that welfare or relief for indigents has widely differing results on the work motivations and behaviour patterns of Indians in varying circumstances. (Another variable in the picture, of course, is differences in policy, between strictness and liberality among Indian superintendents.) At the one extreme, in an agency such as Fort Vermilion in Northern Alberta, or individual bands within that agency, where 100 per cent of the Indian households were estimated to earn less than $2000 per annum and which also receive the highest per capita relief grants ($162), one can only conclude that the majority have given up their low-paid trapping activities and become almost wholly dependent on relief. In Fort St. John on the other hand, where 100 per cent were estimated to receive less than $200 per annum and where only 7.4 per cent of the households receiving relief and per capita expenditures over the agency as a whole amounted to only $10, the majority of band members continued to sustain themselves in their older way of life, despite the low average earnings.

By contrast, in the Queen Charlotte Agency, for instance, a larger proportion of Indians is employed in relatively well-paid logging, fishing and canning jobs, and in the Caughnawaga and Squamish Bands in well-paid construction and longshoring jobs, so that less than half are earning less than $2000 per annum; and only 9.1 per cent and 16.4 per cent respectively earn less than $1000 per annum, as compared to almost 100 per cent in Fort St. John. But a far higher proportion of band members depend on relief, and per capita payments were $81 in the Queen Charlotte Agency as compared to $20 in the Fort St. John Agency. This suggests that for most people the availability of relief, which at best yields a bare subsistence income, acts as a deterrent to working for a livelihood only where employment opportunities themselves are limited to arduous, risky or otherwise unattractive types of employment which also yield only a bare subsistence income (such as trapping

TABLE XVI

WELFARE DEPENDENCE AMONG BANDS

Band	Per Capita Income	% Households Receiving Welfare	Welfare Expenditure Per Capita	Total Transfer Payments Income Per Capita
Skidegate	$1252	n/a	n/a	n/a
Caughnawaga	793	12.76	12.33	73.0
Walpole Island	715	14.1	5.22	107.95
Sheshaht	664	3.4	9.5	70.7
Lorette	630	2.1	6.3	77.47
Squamish	630	28.5	42.0	186.0
Tyendinaga	516	0	0	161.0
Curve Lake	350	n/a	n/a	n/a
Six Nations	350	2.3	4.28	78.0
Mistassini	341	84.75	46.92	137.6
Masset	336	n/a	n/a	n/a
Dog Rib Rae	332	18.5	7.6	109.87
Port Simpson	325	28.0	29.4	115.2
Kamloops	314	13.7	18.9	73.0
Sarcee	302	44.3	24.0	220.5
Fort William	298	37.3	69.34	173.33
Williams Lake	291	36.8	27.0	91.6
Moose Factory	284	n/a	n/a	n/a
Fort Alexander	255	n/a	n/a	n/a
River Desert	250	6.7	5.24	102.8
St. Mary's	249	58	38.5	265.8
Attawapiskat	247	39.2	45.0	194.0
Pointe Bleue	222	66.5	94.6	194.5
Tobique	215	76.4	65.0	127.0
Pikangikum	197	43.8	31.64	93.5
Shubenacadie	180	78.1	191.84	276.7
Oak River	176	83.33	29.0	112.3
Rupert House	174	21.4	18.0	85.8
Cold Lake	165	89.3	73.9	197.86
Fort St. John	161	7.4	65.0	89.7
Deer Lake	156	n/a	n/a	n/a
The Pas	140	25.8	14.72	124.0
James Smith	126	100	70.7	172.0
Peguis	99	100	82.46	119.0
Big Cove	61	67.2	69.0	139.6
Piapot	55	86.5	95.3	214.4

in the Northern Territories). And even there, as the case of the Fort St. John Agency at the time this survey was undertaken indicates, numerous Indian bands continued to support themselves at these activities, despite the inadequate rewards.

Where their employment opportunities do yield adequate levels of income, and in areas where through demonstration effect Indians have been imbued with consumer aspirations well above the subsistence level, the availability of relief does not in itself act as a deterrent to employment and economic development. This seems to be the case among the majority of Indians in the higher-income, more developed agencies and bands, such as Queen Charlotte, Caughnawaga, Squamish and others noted above.

This divergent pattern may also, perhaps, indicate some weakening of kinship ties and obligations among residents in the more urbanized, developed bands. In the more urbanized bands such as Caughnawaga and Squamish where most families depend for their livelihoods upon the earnings of the family head as an individual wage earner, the family tends to be more reluctant to look after indigent kin, and more insistent on their seeking welfare aid.

Important in bringing about changes in this relationship among the more urbanized and industrialized bands is the fact that family income is primarily in the form of money rather than kind (in the form of fish, game or farm produce). The latter is a type of income that often must be produced or garnered collectively and thus is to be shared accordingly.

One other pattern that stands out is that some of the wealthier bands, in terms of ownership of large band funds yielding large band revenues, are under-developed in terms of average earnings from gainful employment. This is indicated in the fact that Indians in the Blackfoot Agency, 71.1 per cent of whose workers earned less than $2000 per annum, received nothing in relief payments from the Indian Affairs Branch. As suggested above, a liberal relief policy and large cash distributions, both financed by band funds, have acted as deterrents to their members seeking and training for, and keeping, relatively steady, well-paid jobs or, alternatively, utilizing their resources more intensively to yield a larger work income.

CHAPTER VII

SOCIO-CULTURAL FACTORS INFLUENCING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

A growing body of literature has focussed on what may be called socio-cultural factors, rather than economic or socio-economic factors, as the crucial variables determining the pace and magnitude of economic development.

Indian bands in Canada have been subjected to several sorts of historical influences from their interactions, of varying scope or intensity, and at certain levels, with White society, and from the special systems of administration and internal organization of the reserve and band council, under the supervision of an agency superintendent.

Numerous socio-cultural variables within this general context may be viewed as helping, or hindering, economic development. Unfortunately, most of these variables, because of their subtle and subjective nature, do not lend themselves to objective and statistical types of measurement and comparison.

1. Tribal Culture

It is widely believed, and a number of facts would appear at first glance to verify it, that Indians from bands of some cultural or language groups are more enterprising and progressive than those of others, due to values and behaviour patterns that encourage their economic development in the modern age. Comparisons are frequently drawn between the Iroquois and the Ojibways or Crees in Ontario and Quebec, and numerous Indian bands along the coast of British Columbia with most bands in the Interior of the province. The contrast seems particularly striking along the Skeena River from the coast up to and including Hazelton. The Tsimpshian are generally more developed, as measured by average per capita income from gainful employment, educational levels, development of Indian-owned enterprises, numbers in business or professional positions, and so on. These differences seem to apply even where the purely economic factors are equal, or if anything more favourable to Carrier than to Tsimpshian Bands (e.g. size of band funds, location in relation to expanding urban communities and job opportunities).

One plausible explanation that is frequently offered is that coast Indian economy was such as to enable them to reside in settled communities during most of the year and to develop advanced techniques and relatively expensive types of capital, such as large houses and canoes. Experience and skill in fishing and related work were used in their integration with the White economy, as fishing and canning became one of the early leading resource industries of the province. Until fairly recently, the coast Indians managed to retain a firm foothold in the industry, despite rapid technological and organizational changes, and a rapid trend toward larger scale, more expensive boats and equipment. While large numbers of Indians have been displaced from the industry in recent years, there are still a number of substantial proprietors owning capital in the tens of thousands of dollars.

Indians having this sort of background, it might be expected, would be more adaptable than most to change, and fit more easily into the requirements of modern industrial society.

The Carriers, by contrast – and much the same would be true of other people in the broad northern belt of the country – have depended essentially on highly mobile hunting and fishing (and, for most of the period since contact with Whites, trapping) in small scattered groups. Band members came together for brief periods during the summer months. The high mobility required and the necessity to travel light might be expected to generate attitudes and values rather indifferent to the accumulation of large or expensive types of capital, or to long-term employment in particular jobs in particular locales.

Much the same sort of apparent contrast might be stated for Indians in other regions. Plains Indian bands – such as the Sarcees and the Blood, have not shown much propensity for economic development so far, despite the fact that some of them are well off in purely economic terms, with large band funds and revenues, valuable and potentially productive farm and range lands, and access to job opportunities in rapidly expanding urban areas. This comparative lack of development, again, may perhaps be attributed to values of the tribal cultures, which again were based on mobile hunting and trapping.

Among the most highly developed bands are Lorette, of Huron background, and several of Iroquois background – notably the Six Nations, and Tyendinaga in Southern Ontario and the Caughnawagas in Quebec. The Iroquois, as well as the Hurons, lived in fairly settled communities and were developing an agricultural economy prior to contact with Whites. They also served as middlemen between the Europeans and the nomadic trapping bands when the fur trade was in its heyday. A more likely explanation of their economic development than these factors in their background, however, is their history of residence among and business contact with Whites in the course of the fur trade in earlier times and since then in relatively prosperous farming and diversified industrial communities.

While broad comparisons of this kind can be made to yield some crude explanation of differential development, it would be difficult to come to any precise conclusions as to the effects of the factors in tribal culture and history on economic development. Even intensive research could attribute only hazardously values and behaviour patterns to sources in earlier cultural history. The differences in degree of development among different bands within a cultural or language group are frequently wider than among the latter. For instance, Walpole Island, one of the most advanced bands in Southern Ontario, is a Southern Ojibway Band, but so also are some of the most depressed and undeveloped bands in this region, as brought out by Dunning and others. One can point to dozens of such contrasts across the country.

It would seem more fruitful, therefore, to focus on variables concerning types of interaction and relationships of Indians with Whites, rather than on the earlier tribal cultures.

2. Cultural Revival

The role of cultural revivals in encouraging or impeding economic development is a subject of some controversy.

One school of thought tends to look upon such phenomena as expressions of defeatism or retreat. These attempts to find a new source of security and meaning in life are necessarily futile, some say, because the whole base, material and otherwise, of the tribal culture has been destroyed, while the values and behaviour patterns generated by participation in attempted revivals render individuals that much less able to participate effectively in a modern economy.

As against this view, it is held that such cultural revivals may be necessary in many cases for rehabilitation and economic development. By gaining a new pride and sense of identity, Indians may lose apathy and defeatism, and acquire the confidence to participate in the world around them and compete on a more equal basis.

From the limited evidence that comes to hand from this research survey, it would be impossible to prove or disprove either of the above propositions; either could be supported. Communities in which there is a great deal of revivalist activity seem to represent both advanced and backward economic status.

Two distinct patterns of economic development and integration may have different implications for the success of revivalist or of any perpetuative activity. One pattern of economic development is that in which a large and growing proportion of the band members become full-time wage and salary earners in enterprises outside of the reserve. In this situation, particularly if the reserve is part of a large urban community, it is difficult for the band to retain a distinct tribal culture. Another pattern is one resting on a more diversified base of farming, business and industrial enterprises and professional services within the community, as well as outside wage and salaried employment. Here, as in the Six Nations, economic development may even provide some of the means for sustaining the revival of various aspects of the traditional culture, and may give the band the means for resisting and surviving encroachments from outside.

There are other distinctively Indian aspects of band life that do contribute to economic development. The band's rights in hunting and fishing provide an important source of food supply, and therefore real income to many bands. Various tourist attractions, ranging from colourful pageants down to the sale of handicrafts provide a variable source of extra income.

Some of the most advanced Indian bands are also those which had highly developed art forms in their tribal cultures. A revival and expansion of such art might well be a supplement to economic development of a band that had other main sources of income,

In general, one gets the impression that the many and varied ceremonies organized by Indian bands across the country generally constitute a positive factor contributing to economic development. Particularly is this the case where Indians take the initiative, and where Whites are spectators or participants. There are innumerable forms of these occasions such as sports days, regattas, stampedes, dog sled races, salmon barbecues and the like. One might add that model Indian villages and handicraft displays serve something of the same purpose.

3. Kinship Ties and Obligations

One of the most widely observed factors in economic development, generally held to be negative in its effects, is the obligation of the individual to his kinship group. In most tribal and peasant societies, a fairly wide kinship group is the basic unit of organization, economic and otherwise. It defines the role and status of the individual, and provides him with some degree of security; that is, in terms of a right to minimum subsistence and other prerequisites in times of need. The mutual ties of rights and obligations act as deterrents to economic advancement in an industrial society. The individual's mobility may be reduced, for one thing, as he may be reluctant to sacrifice his security by moving to centres of job opportunity elsewhere. Where an individual does advance himself, through wage employment or successful entrepreneurship, the claims of his kinfolk may reduce his standard of living and his capital.

This sort of pattern is conspicuous and therefore easily and frequently observed by outsiders. On the other hand, kinship ties among many groups are a source of support and economic advancement for individuals and the group generally, where capital is pooled to finance a profitable enterprise, or to provide higher education for more promising students.

The more parasitic aspects of kinship were probably reinforced in the past by the dependency of the reserve system. This has led to important changes in social welfare or relief policy to free the individual and his immediate family from the burdens of supporting other kin, and thus encourage their independence and ambition to better themselves.

The role that kinship plays in economic development of Indians across Canada would be extremely difficult to establish. One can point to numerous individual case histories to illustrate economically deterrent effects, because these are the cases that come to light, of individuals who have failed to keep their jobs, or lost them through drinking, and who blame their troubles on their relatives. And at the other end of the pole, another conspicuous person is the economically successful worker or independent proprietor who appears to have severed his ties and become more or less socially isolated and resented by his relatives and friends. Or again, in some cases, a minority of well-paid, steady employees in the band appear to have become a separate clique – perhaps the beginning of a new economic élite that will establish new patterns of kinship and social relations in the community, as a by-product of and step towards further economic advancement.

On the other hand, there is much that is not evident and known, and that would require further research. Of the dozens of relatively successful Indian business and professional men across the country, was their success achieved despite kinship ties and obligations, or was the support of kin an essential first step? To what extent have numerous business failures among Indians been due to such obligations? And to what extent do other business successes depend on the pooled resources of relatives?

One reasonable, though unproven, conclusion is that the persistence of widespread kinship obligations among Indians, as among other depressed and dependent low-income groups, is a result, rather than a cause, of poverty. Much the same conclusion might apply to the high rate of growth of the Indian population and of its dependence on welfare.

4. Quality of Leadership

One would expect that Indian bands with able and intelligent leaders would be more economically advanced than those with less able ones. To provide some opinion on this issue, the questionnaire circulated by the Economic Development Division of the Indian Affairs Branch asked agency personnel to classify the band leadership in one of five categories: (5) High Quality; (4) Quite Positive; (3) Moderate; (2) Seldom; (1) No Evidence of Leadership.

Outstanding examples, of course, can be pointed out to show the tangible results of strong leadership. The council of the Kamloops Band moved to call in a firm of outside consultants to advise them on the most effective use of their reserve land. A plan was submitted calling for an industrial subdivision to lease to outside business interests. The plan was instituted, and in recent years several dozen firms have established themselves and provided many new job opportunities for band members. Over the past ten years, in brief, there has been considerable economic development by any measure of the term, and one could attribute it at least partly to progressive leadership.

However, from data made available from the Resources Questionnaire, there does not appear to be any high degree of correlation between the quality of leadership (as identified with the band council and chief) and the degree of economic advancement of the band members for several reasons.

(1) In their responses to the Resources Questionnaire, the judgments of agency superintendents or of anyone else on the quality of leadership would tend to be subjective and to vary from one agency to another. "Positive" may be interpreted as "cooperative" (with the superintendent) and the policies followed by the latter are not necessarily conducive to economic development, particularly if there is opposition from the band membership.

(2) In many instances the band chief and council are often not the real leaders in the community. These latter are often pictured as some older members of the community – or sometimes business proprietors –who, though not elected to council, have wide influence and make or break a program..

(3) In some cases, particularly in an advanced band in which a high proportion of the members is employed in outside wage or salaried employment

or have time-consuming farms or businesses to look after, only the underemployed or less successful band members have the time or inclination to serve on the council.

(4) In some of the most economically advanced and integrated bands, the band council may cease to serve any meaningful purpose, as the band ceases to function in any real sense as a distinct and separate entity in the larger community. This appears, from limited evidence, to be the tendency at Lorette, Its leadership is classed in the questionnaire as moderate though a number of individual band members have achieved notable success in industry and professions.

This raises an important question in terms of long-range policy. How much emphasis should be placed on encouraging greater strength of leadership, participation in and delegation of functions to the band council? Where the band represents a community with a diversified resource base, and a strong urge to cultural revival and separatism, as with the Six Nations, strong emphasis would seem justified, But where the path to economic development seems to lie in closer integration with the White community and greater dependency of band members on paid employment and migration away from the reserve, the band council's importance seems bound to decline.

•

5. Organizational Activity

Numerous sociological studies of communities, and of income groups and classes have established a high degree of correlation between organizational activity and economic advancement. Generally speaking, the higher the income and status of individuals or occupational groups, the larger the number of organizations they belong to or participate in, and there is a similar differentiation of communities with regard to membership and participation per capita.

One would expect this to be broadly true of band communities, One of the major deterrents to economic advancement of Indians is their widespread anomie, the attitudes of apathy and alienation that lower the levels of energy and interest and lessen the capacities for individual success in economic and other activities,

The Resources Questionnaire includes one question asking agency superintendents to list the number and types of organization in each band community. The results are listed in Table XVII below, Again, the sample thirty-five bands are ranked according to per capita real income from gainful employment, and alongside these are listed in the first column, the number of organizations in the community, and in the second column, as one rough index of intensity or degree, the number of band members per organization (i.e. the smaller the number, the more organized the community).

There are obvious limitations to the question as stated and the resulting data. For one thing, the answer simply indicates the number existing without indicating how many members an organization has, or what proportion of the total band membership participates in each organization, or how intensively they participate. Also, one would logically expect to find proportionately more organizations, the larger the total membership in the band and the more diversified its economic base, quite apart from the average per capita real income of the bands themselves, Or, to put it another way, with regard to degree of organization, a band with a small population and one or two organizations, might show a higher degree of organization than a larger band with several organizations, but the numerical relationship or proportion would not tell very much by itself. The data presented in Table XVII show a statistically significant (.48) degree of correlation between numbers of organizations in each band, and average per capita income of members, but this may be influenced mainly by the fact that the higher income bands are, on the average, considerably larger than the low income bands. There is no evident correlation with average number of people per organization.

In particular kinds of situations, however, there is a significant relationship between the two variables. A large but economically depressed and dependent band such as Norway House or Cross Lake in Northern Manitoba has fewer organizations among its members than an economically more developed band

TABLE XVII

ORGANIZATIONS IN BAND COMMUNITIES

Band	Per Capita Income	Number of Organizations	Average Number of People Per Organization
Skidegate	$1252	13	24
Caughnawaga	793	8	365
Walpole Island	715	15	77
Sheshaht	664	7	38
Lorette	630	2	277
Squamish	630	7	125
Tyendinaga	516	10	94
Curve Lake	350	7	60
Six Nations	350	12	
Mistassini	341	0	0
Dog Rib Rae	332	3	92
Masset	336	n/a	n/a
Port Simpson	325	8	124
Kamloops	314	7	102
Sarcee	302	7	35
Fort William	298	8	43
Williams Lake	291	3	91
Moose Factory	284	2	88
Fort Alexander	255	10	n/a
River Desert	250	2	250
St. Mary's	249	5	60
Attawapiskat	247	1	698
Pointe Bleue	222	4	32
Tobique	215	9	117
Pikangikum	197	4	94
Shubenacadie	180	4	99
Oak River	176	0	0
Rupert House	174	0	0
Cold Lake	165	8	76
Fort St. John	161	0	0
Deer Lake	156	9	74
The Pas	140	6	127
James Smith	126	6	128
Peguis	99	9	184
Big Cove	61	4	174
Piapot	55	0	0
Coefficient of Correlation with Per Capita Income		.46	.06

with fewer members, such as Walpole Island or Tyendinaga in Southern Ontario, or Kamloops in British Columbia. The most economically depressed bands –such as a marginal farming community like Piapot, Saskatchewan, or some of the more isolated hunting and trapping bands that have become almost entirely dependent on relief – appear to be almost completely without organizations, and do not constitute a community in any meaningful sense. This is also true for some of the more dependent bands in other areas, such as one of the Southern Ojibway studied by Dunning – people he classed as a collection rather than a community.

On the other hand, the same tendency may also arise as a by-product of economic development and integration in some cases, as with leadership. Lorette again provides an interesting example. While one of the most economically developed bands in the country, it is marked by few organizations Where sufficiently integrated, members of the band may cease to regard themselves as a distinct community with separate organizations of its own and participate rather as individual members of various outside organizations.

This question, of course, has considerable relevance – taken in terms of priority of effort – for the community development programs now being launched by the Indian Affairs Branch and several provincial government agencies.

6. Participation in Outside Organizations and Activities

While there are limits to the correlation of economic development of Indians and organizational activity within a band community, for reasons noted above, one would reasonably expect a more positive correlation with participation in organizational activities in the outside White community, for, as noted in the latter, there is a high degree of correlation between income or economic status and participation in such activities.

The data available from the research are rather fragmentary on this point. Answers to the Indian Affairs Branch questionnaire on organizations, described briefly above, do not in all cases indicate which ones within bands are branches of outside organizations in which Indians participate with Whites, and which ones are confined to the band membership itself. Nor do they indicate how or in what capacity Indians participate – desultorily; passively; actively and enthusiastically; as opposition minorities; indiscriminately as members of other groups or cliques, including Whites; running for office, and being elected or appointed to positions of responsibility; and so on. Reports by agency superintendents and other observers vary widely in the detail and insight brought to bear on these questions.

Again, there are all sorts of more informal or less structured, but fully as important, types of participation by Indians in activities organized by Whites or jointly organized with them (e.g. dances and other social or recreational activities; athletic contests; baseball or lacrosse games) which are not easy to quantify and measure in a comparative survey of this type.

From the limited data available and from reasonable inference from observable facts, however, there appears to be a positive correlation between economic development of Indians and their participation in organized activities outside of the reserves. At the one extreme are the isolated and depressed bands, which are precluded from such participation by their very location. Again, among the more depressed bands in closer physical proximity to White communities, social isolation seems to go hand-in-hand with underemployment and dependency. At the other end of the pole, among the more highly developed bands are those with a large proportion of members engaged continuously in organized White activities. Regular wage or salaried employment in White-owned and—staffed establishments, of course, is itself a highly important type of participation. Beyond this, Indians in the more remunerative types of employment generally belong to trade unions, because such types of employment tend to be highly unionized, some of them coming under closed shop or union shop agreements (e.g. high steel work; other types of construction work on major projects and in main urban centres; factory work in Ontario; longshoring and stevedoring; logging and sawmilling with larger operators and in larger cities and towns; fishing and cannery work in British Columbia; and so on).

Among bands having a more diversified economic base, particularly farming, the picture may be more mixed. If the reserve is at some distance from any city or town, there may be little or no participation in outside social or recreational activities. On the other hand, even here such participation tends to be correlated with comparative degree of economic development. Generally it will be only the better Indian farmers or ranchers who participate with Whites in stockmen's associations, marketing cooperatives, and the like, for membership participation in such organizations usually requires having something worthwhile to raise and to sell.

Even those relatively developed bands where there are strong drives towards cultural survival or revival and resistance to integration, probably show a relatively high degree of participation in outside activities. Such is the case, for instance, among the Caughnawaga, with their membership in construction workers' unions; or among a minority in the Six Nations Band employed in various unionized industrial establishments in and around Brantford and other nearby industrial communities. Further study might show that minorities within a large band of this kind participate in a variety of other outside organizations besides trade unions (e.g. 4-H Clubs, Boy Scouts, Canadian Legion, Athletic Clubs). Such participation is not necessarily inconsistent with maintenance of the Long House religion, resisting further integration in the schools, or refusing to participate in the P.T.A.

There is one final, and perhaps obvious, point in this connection. Frequently, in Canada and the United States, active efforts by members of various ethnic minorities to join and participate in organizations controlled by the majority group have been resisted by the latter. Various minorities have been accused of being too insistent. This reaction is frequently interpreted as being generated, among members of the majority group, by feelings of insecurity arising from fear of competition. The minority group's drive to join and be accepted is interpreted as striving for economic advancement or higher social status and recognition for economic gains already achieved (sometimes by dubious means).

The vast majority of Indians, obviously, do not fit into this picture. Their most apparent problem is passivity and unaggressiveness. Where there is a high degree of participation in outside activities, therefore, in most cases it indicates an unusual degree of active encouragement (or in a few cases, as with union closed shop agreements, actual compulsion) from the White majority.

Fully as important as the more formal, organized and official activities or policies of the White majority are the more informal or spontaneous attitudes, expressions and behaviour patterns of those Whites with whom Indians come into contact in various facets of life.

A couple of examples seem to bring this out graphically. The Kamloops Band has achieved considerable advancement in recent years through outside counselling in a planned program of leasing tracts of reserve land to industrial enterprises that provide job opportunities for band members, The improvement has been paralleled by the formation of an organization called the Mika Nika Club which was formed among businessmen and other White citizens of the Kamloops area, with participation of representative Indians, for the express purpose of improving the economic and social position of Indians in the area.

Less spectacular in terms of concrete measurable gains, but significant nonetheless, have been relationships in economically marginal areas such as the Pemberton Valley in British Columbia. Farming in the area for Whites as well as Indians has been declining. A majority of the Whites as well as Indians are engaged in wage work, in seasonal logging and construction jobs. A minority of the Whites residing at any one time in the valley are briefly employed transients. The main organizational activities in the area are controlled by a small élite of modest means, drawn mainly from the older resident families, mostly farm owners who are also part-time workers in other industries, and a few business and professional men, This group go to unusual effort to encourage Indians to participate in a variety of joint social, recreational and educational activities, while maintaining informal relations. Their efforts appear to have met with considerable success despite the generally unfavourable economic environment, as well as the fact that the Indians (a majority of the population) are Roman Catholic in religious affiliation while the Whites are predominantly Protestant or unaffiliated. Undoubtedly there are a number of developments of this kind favourable to the future economic advancement of various Indian bands across the country.

By contrast, one can point to many cases of some of the most depressed, idle and dependent Indian bands located in close proximity to booming cities and towns that should offer manifold job opportunities. In such cases, lack of participation in White-controlled economic and other activities seem to go together, coupled with self-reinforcing attitudes on both sides. The majority of Whites with whom Indians come into contact make it clear that they regard them as shiftless and unemployable, and the reactions of Indians tend correspondingly to be distrustful and apathetic or contemptuous and hostile when under the influence of alcohol.

One widely quoted example of such relations appears to be the booming town of Kenora, Ontario. One ridiculous phenomenon brings out graphically two different definitions of the situation. In Kenora White residents tell, by way of illustrating how disgusting or degraded Indians can be, how they've seen drunken Indians, women as well as men, urinating on the street. More sophisticated observers have pointed out that for many Indians who periodically visit the town, virtually the only places where they can feel at all welcome and sit down to rest are a few beer parlours in the sleazier part of town. Sometime later, after shopping or just walking around to see the sights, nature takes its course. But the other parts of town are so unfamiliar or unfriendly to Indians (even to the point of prohibiting them from using toilets in beer parlours or restaurants), that they cannot find any place where they can urinate other than the street!

7. Social and Personal Disorganization

A widely accepted popular explanation and perhaps one that is valid, for the failure of individual Indians and bands to develop economically, could be lumped under the general heading of personal disorganization. Under this heading would be included the various combinations of attitudes, behaviour patterns and limitations of character and personality that prevent the individual and the group from making an effective adjustment to, and participating successfully in, the larger society, with consequent economic deterioration, dependency, and demoralization. Behaviour patterns widely attributed to Indians as proof of personal disorganization are those of drunkenness, sexual promiscuity, shiftlessness or laziness, irresponsibility, neglect of family, and the like.

Personal disorganization, where it does follow similar patterns among large numbers of a particular ethnic or cultural minority, presumably arises from a failure of the minority group to adjust to the dominant culture.

Social disorganization, however, does not or should not necessarily mean that there will be a high incidence of personal disorganization. Presumably, social disorganization is unavoidable in the process of economic development in so far as it involves transforming a culture and social organization based on a relatively static, localized subsistence economy into one that is dynamic, high-income, large-scale and complex in its operations. Presumably, then, relatively developed, high-income bands are those which have made the transition successfully. The low-income bands are assumed to be those which have failed to make the transition successfully. Presumably they fall into two categories:

(a) Those which have retained, in large part, the economic patterns of an earlier adjustment, and remain in a static subsistence economy. For example, the Dog Rib Rae and Old Crow Bands remained until recently largely self-sustaining, mobile hunting and trapping groups.

(b) Those bands which have pretty well lost or abandoned their earlier means of livelihood but failed to become engaged in new types of employment that provide an adequate livelihood. In this sort of situation, social disorientation tends to be accompanied by personal disorientation. This in turn tends to create a self-perpetuating poverty cycle.

Over the economy as a whole there is no simple direct correlation between poverty and the indices of social and personal disorganization. In fact, numerous statistics since World War II seem to indicate almost the reverse in the United States, Canada and a number of other economically developed countries. Over the past two decades of unprecedented economic growth and rising per capita incomes, the incidence of delinquency and crime, alcoholism, divorce, desertion, illegitimacy, mental breakdowns, and other social and personal problems has also been rising, particularly among higher-income working class and middle class groups.

Nevertheless, it does seem to be true that in a rapidly growing affluent society, poverty, where it occurs, tends to have more demoralizing effects on individuals and groups than it would in a context where most people are poor. This demoralization in turn renders people that much less able to fit into the economy and reap an adequate share of its benefits. The special problem of the "hidden poor" has become one of the most widely publicized issues of the present day. Native Indians account for a disproportionate number in this category.

It was found impossible to make any sort of accurate or meaningful comparison among Indian bands, or to find any meaningful degree of statistical correlation between indices of social and personal disorganization on the one hand, and the degree of economic development on the other. The main reasons are:

(a) The reports on the basis of which statistics can be derived regarding such indices are often very subjective and vary widely;

(b) Administrative policy, on the basis of which other statistics are derived, also varies widely from province to province and community to community; and

(c) Various indices of disorganization seem to be as large, or larger, among high-income developed bands as among the lower-income bands.

To give some examples:

The Indian Health Services has been attempting to develop an adequate statistical reporting system on the basis of which it can allocate its personnel and services more efficiently. One attempt in this direction involved having its nurses fill in a fairly detailed annual report on Indian communities across the country, dealing with such matters as housing, nutrition, sanitation, incidence of various types of illness, drinking, and other social and health problems. Some of the items are listed by degree: for instance, the incidence of drinking in a community is classed as "good", "fair", "poor" and "extreme", one of which the rapporteur is to underline. Obviously there might be wide differences in judgment between nurses coming from different types of background.

In any case (as the voluminous literature on alcohol research has brought out) there is a wide variety of drinking patterns among people, and the same amount of drinking can have widely differing effects upon the health, employability and earning capacity of individuals. Among Indians, as among Whites, heavy drinkers include the economically most successful as well as the most poverty-stricken and dependent. Thus in the nurses' reports, for instance, Caughnawaga is classed as a heavy drinking band, on a par with the most disorganized and poverty-stricken communities in Saskatchewan or New Brunswick.

Again, official statistics regarding arrests and convictions of Indians for crimes and misdemeanours face the essential limitation that police, as individuals, vary widely in their interpretations of the law and their strictness in enforcing it, as do local magistrates or judges in making convictions. And the laws themselves vary considerably from province to province.

Such limitations seem to apply to most or all of the other indices of personal disorganization and render any adequate comparison among the sample bands all but impossible. One index that might be taken as a measure of disorganization is the rate of illegitimacy. Table XIX below shows the percentage of unmarried mothers of total mothers in each band, with the bands ranked according to per capita real income. Here again there appears to be very little, if any, correlation. There seems to be an equally wide range in illegitimacy rates among high-income and low-income bands.

Thus the present conclusions are based on rather impressionistic reports from agency superintendents and other sources which supplement the statistics that are available. These give the following broad picture:

(1) The most developed bands appear to have a lower incidence of personal disorganization than do most Indian communities. On the other hand, such bands appear to show a higher rate of disorganization of particular kinds. For instance, Caughnawaga and Nimpkish are reputed to have particularly high rates of male juvenile delinquency, especially for theft and property damage. In the former band much of this is blamed on the prolonged absence of fathers from their families, due to the nature of

TABLE XIX

UNWED MOTHERS

Band	Unwed Mothers as Per Cent of All Mothers
Skidegate	90
Caughnawaga	2.0
Walpole Island	113
Sheshaht	5.3
Lorette	Nil
Squamish	10.1
Tyendinaga	5 .0
Six Nations	9.1
Curve Lake	12.2
Mistassini	1.1
Masset	24.4
Dog Rib Rae	14.3
Port Simpson	16.1
Kamloops	22.8
Sarcee	13.2
Fort William	13.6
Williams Lake	27.5
Moose Factory	10.3
Fort Alexander	n/a
River Desert	10.7
St. Mary's	11.4
Attawapiskat	11.0
Pointe Bleue	1.2
Tobique	9.5
Pikangikum	4.6
Shubenacadie	15.7
Oak River	5,7
Rupert House	7.2
Cold Lake	83
Fort St. John	35.5
Deer Lake, Ont.	2.3
The Pas	8.4
James Smith	7,8
Peguis	12.5
Big Cove	6.4
Piapot	9.5

their work. In the latter, it. is blamed on a minority of less successful families, in a community that also has a minority of unusually successful proprietors in the fishing industry. Juvenile delinquency of this kind may be an expression of aggressiveness and frustration that is associated with economic development, in contrast to the apathy and resignation of the more impoverished bands.

(2) The least developed bands, the more isolated and dependent, likewise appear to have a lower than average incidence of personal disorganization. Perhaps it would be more accurate to say that personal disorganization is less evident and is not expressed so much in the forms that come to public attention and become recorded statistically. The actual problems are probably more those of idleness, low income, dependency, overcrowding, malnutrition and poor health, with consequent attitudes of apathy and indifference.

(3) The communities which appear to have the highest incidence of personal disorganization are those in which there is access to White communities and considerable inter-action at certain levels with Whites. Some of these are long established, others were relatively isolated until new economic development brought a sudden influx of Whites with money to spend and invest.

More specifically, personal disorganization among Indians seems most apparent in those communities in which (1) there is a lack of encouragement or opportunity for Indians to participate in meaningful White-controlled activities, and/or (2) where the community does not have the means for developing a more or less satisfactory and functioning cultural base of its own (as most Iroquois Bands in Southern Ontario have done, for instance). In such situations, the only points of contact between Indians and Whites are in centres of disorganization, and with the more disorganized Whites. Hence, the familiar picture of Indians on Skid Road in major urban and metropolitan centres; drinking excessively in the sleazier bars and beer parlours; bootlegging; pimping, prostitution and panhandling in boom towns with large numbers of transient Whites; and so on.

This over-simplified and somewhat obvious picture suggests two broadly different foci of emphasis in any general program of economic development for Indians.

(1) A community development program, as such, would seem most needed, and most likely to bring tangible results in Indian communities in the third category above, which have access to potential job opportunities or other economic benefits, but which are unable to take advantages of such opportunities because of social and personal disorganization. Such community development, however, would have to focus on Whites as much or more than on Indians.

(2) In the isolated, undeveloped type of band, where the population has outrun its means of livelihood using traditional techniques, the main priority would appear to be economic development rather than community development as such; that is, the most immediate and pressing needs are training band members in new techniques for utilizing resources more effectively, or getting jobs elsewhere; provision of capital, materials and equipment for developing new sources of employment; inducing and facilitating migration of band members to other, more economically viable areas. Community development by itself would not seem the appropriate program to begin with until the members of the community have something tangible to develop and work for to support themselves on.

8. Religious Affiliation

A notable group of economic historians and sociologists has delved into the relationships between different religious beliefs and affiliations, on the one hand, and economic development on the other.

These scholars found a positive correlation between economic growth and religious affiliation, or, more specifically, between the rapid rise to economic dominance, in recent centuries, of predominantly Protestant Northwest Europe as compared to predominantly Roman Catholic Southern Europe. In Canada this is paralleled by the more rapid economic growth of English-speaking and Protestant Ontario as compared to French-speaking Catholic Quebec, and the dominant control of industry, commerce and finance in the latter by a relatively small English-Protestant minority. (Note: The correlation in Europe appears to have broken down since World War II. Predominantly Catholic Italy, France and West Germany achieved far more rapid economic growth during the 1950's than did the predominantly Protestant Great Britain, Canada, or the United States.)

The explanations offered lay in differences in religious doctrine, and the effects these have had upon attitudes and actions of individuals in coping with their economic problems. The Catholic Church is pictured as being essentially authoritarian in structure and other-worldly in outlook. The emphasis on dogma may tend to encourage attitudes of submissiveness, and discourage individual initiative and a spirit of scientific inquiry. Where an ethnic minority is predominantly Roman Catholic in a largely Protestant or secular environment, the church has tended to encourage a policy of cultural and religious separatism that keeps members of the minority economically depressed.

Protestantism, especially of the Calvinist or Puritan variety, by contrast, from its origin as a revolt against established church authority, has tended to encourage a spirit of aggressive individualism which conduced to economic success. The Puritan Doctrine has been interpreted as sanctifying hard work, and measuring virtue by the accumulation of material goods. The Puritan condemnation and restriction of drinking, gambling, games and frivolity has been favourable to capital accumulation and economic success.

These theories were perhaps more appropriate to the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries than to the twentieth. In the earlier stages of industrialization, in an era of predominantly small-scale enterprises owned and operated by individual proprietors, the road to economic growth and success did perhaps depend primarily upon such qualities as thrift and abstemiousness conducing to a high rate of personal saving and capital accumulation. In the modern era of large-scale enterprise and mass consumption, however, in which the major capital accumulations and investments are carried out by business firms rather than individuals, and in which the overwhelming and increasing majority of the gainfully employed are employees rather than owner-operators, the main incentives to hard work and productive effort would appear to be those of consumption (particularly of durable consumer goods and services in the status symbol category) rather than those of individual saving, ownership and capital accumulation. To a considerable extent, therefore, economic growth and productive effort may be stimulated by motivations that are almost the reverse of those extolled by Puritan doctrine – that is, by social standards that induce a high rate of wasteful consumption, which require correspondingly high incomes and for job security. At any rate, the highest income, most economically developed nations today are characterized by high propensities to consume, and large savings and capital accumulations in the aggregate are determined essentially by the overall levels of income and demand, rather than by the inclinations of individuals to save. (Indeed, as the outstanding economist, the late J.M. Keynes pointed out, a too high propensity to save, and a correspondingly low propensity to consume, tends to be a deterrent to economic growth and, paradoxically, therefore, to reduce the potential level of total savings and investment in a national economy.)

For these reasons, among others, therefore, as noted above, in recent decades differential roles of economic growth among various nations and regions do not appear to have any meaningful correlations with religious differences, at least as between Catholic and Protestant populations.

Some of the above generalizations would seem to apply to numerous Indian bands examined in this study, As brought out in Chapter IV above, the highest income, most economically developed bands are characterized by a high proportion of wage earners rather than proprietors in the adult work force, and by relatively high expenditures on expensive consumer durable goods (e.g. electricity and household appliances) rather than on individual revenue-producing capital. And, as brought out below, there appears to be little, if any, correlation with Catholic or Protestant religious affiliation among such bands,.

It would be dangerous, of course, for reasons pointed out earlier, to draw too close an analogy between entire nations or regions on the one hand, and small scattered bands on the other. It is possible that there are other ways than those discussed above in which religious affiliation may affect the economic growth of Indian communities.

The earlier generalizations are frequently put forward, in an even more simplified form, as a major factor accounting for the economic backwardness of Indians generally, and for the marked unevenness in economic and educational development among various groups of them in Canada. The churches were allowed by government to have a degree of authority and control over education and social life in Indian communities, far greater than in any White communities (with the possible exception perhaps of Quebec). In the administration of Indian affairs, certainly, until recently, there was not the separation of church and state that is taken for granted outside of Quebec.

The Catholic Church has been generally the most separatist in its policy towards Indians, It has maintained separate schools and resisted integration in secular schools. It has tended to discourage migration from reserves, or other forms of participation of Indians in White-controlled activities, where the band is predominantly Catholic in a predominantly Protestant or secular environment, The Anglican Church has operated with the same goals, to perhaps a slightly lesser degree. The United Church and its antecedents have generally been much less separatist in announced policy.

To the extent that religious beliefs and affiliations have any tangible effect upon economic motivations and activities, one would expect, therefore, other things being equal, to find unequal degrees of economic development among Indian bands and individuals, depending upon their religious affiliation.

The broad picture at first glance appears to support the view that bands that are predominantly Roman Catholic in affiliation are, in most cases, economically more backward than those that are Protestant – and further, that those predominantly Anglican are more backward than those predominantly United Church. As may be seen from Table XX below, of the fifteen bands in the sample having average per capita incomes above $300, six are predominantly Roman Catholic in affiliation, two are Anglican, four are United and three are mixed. Of the twenty-one bands having average per capita incomes below $300, thirteen are Roman Catholic, six are Anglican and two are United in affiliation.[1] Or, again, of the seven lowest per capita income bands in the sample, three are predominantly Roman Catholic, three are Anglican and one is United Church. On the other hand, of the seven highest income bands, three are predominantly Roman Catholic, two are United, one is Anglican and one is mixed. Other variables enter into the picture, however, so that no very valid conclusions can be drawn from these facts alone. Important among such variables are:

(a) location, and
(b) cultural background.

(a) By and large, Indian bands that are predominantly Catholic in affiliation are for the most part in less advantageous locations for economic development. This applies particularly to the large number of bands in the more isolated or inaccessible northern interior regions of the country, who depended mainly on a nomadic trapping, hunting and fishing economy for their livelihood (as well as most bands in the Maritimes). This concentration, in turn, dates back to the earliest days of the fur trade. Under the French regime, whose economy rested on the fur trade, Catholic missionaries with the full power of the Crown supporting them, followed close on the heels of, and frequently led, the fur trader and voyageur in contacting and converting Indians. The English (and presumably English Protestant Churches as well), by contrast, in the fur trade tended to operate from established bases and deal with certain more advanced or prosperous tribes (notably the Iroquois) as middlemen, rather than reaching out to the source of supplies among the more marginal hunting groups.

Industrialization and urbanization developed rapidly in Canada during the latter nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, but mainly in the southern belt of the country, and under predominantly English-speaking and Protestant control. Indian bands converted, to Protestantism were thus generally in a more favourable location for economic development.

There are two or three notable exceptions to this general picture. One is the Lower Mainland area of British Columbia. It is by far the most highly urbanized and industrialized area in the province, accounting for almost one-half the population. The Indian bands in this area are predominantly Catholic in affiliation, and are, on the whole, also economically better off than the vast majority in other parts of the country. Other notable exceptions are the Caughnawaga and Lorette Bands, both predominantly Catholic, in metropolitan Montreal and Quebec.

(b) The location variable presumably could be eliminated if Indian bands having comparable economic advantages (in terms of control over arable farmland; transportation facilities and access to urban communities offering comparable job opportunities) were found to differ appreciably

---

[1] A band is classed as "predominantly" in a category where two-thirds or more of the band members are of one faith, and "mixed" where no one church has two-thirds or more of the members.

> in per capita incomes and if these differences coincided with differences In religious affiliation.
>
> Here, however, the other variable tends to enter in, namely, differences in cultural background that may affect economic performance up to the present day. Differences in religious affiliation tend to coincide with differences in language or culture. As noted earlier, there seems to be a substantial difference in degrees of economic development, despite roughly equal or comparable economic. advantages, between the Tsimpshians and the Carriers in northern British Columbia from Prince Rupert east to Prince George. The Tsimpshian Bands are predominantly Protestant, while the less-developed Carrier Bands are predominantly Catholic in affiliation. It seems impossible at this point, however, to define and measure which variables are dominant in affecting the differential rates of growth.

Possibly both of these other variables could be eliminated, and the effect of the religious factor measured, if a number of bands could be chosen that belonged to the same language or cultural group, and that were similarly situated with regard to economic advantages. This would seem possible, however, only among those language groups that were based on a mobile hunting economy, and which today have many bands scattered over a large territory. This is notably the case with the Crees, and to a lesser extent, the northern Ojibways. Even in this case, however, it is likely to prove difficult to find anything definitive – for the vast majority of bands among these groups are today in much the same circumstances regardless of religious affiliation, Their main problems are the familiar ones of over-population relative to resources; poverty and dependency; limited education and training; coupled with isolation from centres of job opportunities. From a brief survey of Indian band communities in Northern Manitoba during the summer of 1962, the general picture that emerged was that there were no significant differences in economic status coinciding with differences in religious affiliation, Among the minority of Cree or northern Ojibway Bands located within reasonably close access to urban communities, on the other hand, it is difficult to find samples that differ in religious affiliation that are at the same time really comparable in economic advantages, for, over a wide area, urban communities of roughly comparable size often differ widely in job opportunities. On the other hand, there appear to be just as wide differences among bands of the same religious affiliations as among those with different affiliations – as is true of bands within the same language groups.

One obvious limitation in any attempt to measure the religious factor in economic development by means of a broad, comparative statistical survey is that it measures only the quantitative, not the qualitative, aspect, All that a statistical survey can show, with regard to religion, is the affiliation of band members The more important effects of religion upon economic performance, however, would depend upon the intensity of religious faith and belief, the degree to which individuals have internalized religious values such as to affect significantly their attitudes and actions in the workaday world, Affiliation, as such, tells us little. Among Indians as well as Whites, many churches in nominally Catholic or Protestant communities remain practically empty every Sunday.

More important may be the deterrent effects which religious affiliation may have upon activities contributing to economic success. As noted earlier, the Roman Catholic Church has discouraged Indian parents from sending their children to secular schools, as well as discouraging migration from Indian reserves. This educational policy may well serve to reduce the level of educational attainments among Indian Catholics, and to the extent that economic advancement depends increasingly on education, this may affect their future economic well-being adversely.

All this is by way of speculation, however. An attempt is made, in Table XX below, to provide some statistical measurement of church influence upon or relationships with various aspects of Indian life discussed above. The table presents data for the sample 36 bands, concerning per capita income, rates of natural increase (as measured roughly by percentage of population under the age of 16), mobility (as measured by percentage of band population living off the reserve – for reasons mentioned earlier, 4 bands were omitted

TABLE XX

RELIGIOUS AFFILIATION AND OTHER VARIABLES

Band	Religious Affiliation		Per Cent Residing Off Reserves	Per Cent Population Under 16 Years	Education		Per Capita Income
	Church	No.			% Grade 9	% 16 in School	
Skidegate	UC	3	18.0	34.5	n/a	n/a	$1252
Caughnawaga	RC	0	27.1	32.1	4.7	2.1	793
Walpole Is.	AC	1	19.3	43.0	2.9	2.1	715
Sheshaht	UC	3	13.2	51.7	3.6	8.9	664
Lorette	RC	0	41.8	32.8	7.0	7.5	630
Squamish	RC	0	9.9	49.3	3.9	3.3	630
Tyendinaga	M	2	53.8	34.1	2.4	2.3	516
Curve Lake	UC	3	26.3	46.0	2.2	4.9	350
Six Nations	M	2	39.8	37.1	2.8	3.2	350
Mistassini	AC	1	20.0	50.1	2.2	2.0	341
Masset	AC	1	24.7	47.8	n/a	n/a	336
Dog Rib Rae	RC	0	-	42.4	0	0	332
Port Simpson	UC	3	33.0	49.7	2.9	3.6	325
Kamloops	RC	0	20.7	50.2	1.9	3.5	314
Sarcee	M	.5	5.4	49.3	1.6	2.1	302
Fort William	RC	0	24.5	45.0	3.8	6.1	298
Williams Lake	RC	0	11.0	42.8	7.1	8.4	291
Moose Factory	AC	1	19.4	49.7	1.8	5.5	284
Fort Alexander	RC	0	17.7	54.1	n/a	n/a	255
River Desert	RC	0	20.5	36.1	1.8	.4	250
St. Mary's	RC	0	25.6	32.3	3.4	3.3	249
Attawapiskat	RC	0	-	46.6	2.1	10.7	247
Pointe Bleue	RC	0	23.2	40.1	5.3	5.3	222
Tobique	RC	0	29.6	44.7	3.5	5.7	215
Pikangikum	UC	3	-	43.4	0	0	197
Shubenacadie	RC	0	41.6	43.3	.8	1.2	180
Oak River	AC	1	2.3	50.6	0	0	176
Rupert House	AC	1	10.7	50.3	1.8	5.8	174
Cold Lake	RC	0	13.4	50.9	3.7	2.4	165
Fort St. John	RC	0	15.5	50.0	0	0	161
Deer Lake, Ont.	UC	3	-	52.1	0	0	156
The Pas	AC	1	8.8	50.1	0	10.4	140
James Smith	AC	1	3.7	52.2	3.1	5.7	126
Peguis	AC	1	8.0	45.7	4.O	.7	99
Big Cove	RC	0	18.4	54.4	1.3	2.0	61
Piapot	RC	0	13.0	49.4	n/a	n/a	55
Coefficient of Correlation with Religious Affiliation			.14	.02	.22	.01	.28

for this calculation), and educational standards. These are each correlated with religious affiliation (Roman Catholic – RC; Anglican – AC; United Church – UC; and Mixed – M. Each of these is given a numerical symbol, as indicated, for purposes of statistical analysis; i.e. RC - 0; AC - 1; Mixed -2; UC - 3. Sarcee was given the figure of .5 as its population is 52 per cent RC and 48 per cent AC).

It is readily evident from these data that there is no measurably significant correlation of religious affiliation with any of these variables.

CHAPTER VIII

MAJOR TRENDS AND PROCESSES OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT FOR INDIANS

Indian bands, as the preceding chapters bring out, differ widely in the degree of economic development they have achieved as measured by their per capita real incomes from gainful employment, and there is a wide variety of factors contributing to or impeding such development.

The factors having a high or significant degree of correlation with relative economic development of various bands have been examined and discussed at some length in preceding chapters. They are summarized in Table XXI below, ranked in descending order according to degree of correlation, positive or negative.

It is readily apparent that the most important variables determining the economic status of Indian bands as stressed earlier are those concerning wage or salaried employment rather than resource ownership or development, i.e. proportions of skilled workers, months of employment during the year, and average monthly or annual earnings. These account for seven out of the fourteen variables having a statistically significant degree, as well as the three variables showing the highest degree of correlation with average income.

The second in importance is ownership of household fixtures and appliances, i.e. telephones, indoor toilets, baths and electricity. In one sense this relationship is to be expected, to the point of being obvious. One would expect the highest percentage of households having such conveniences to be found in the highest income bands whose families can afford them. What is more important, however, is that in the bands in which a high proportion of households have such relatively expensive conveniences, and where they have become a required part of the accepted standard of living, band members will be strongly motivated to seek, and keep, the more skilled and better-paid types of jobs offering regular employment.

Three other variables show significant, but lower, degrees of correlation. These are: number of organizations in the band community; educational levels (as measured by the percentage of population educated beyond Grade IX); and rate of population growth (as measured by percentage of population below sixteen years of age). The first two of these are less amenable to precise or accurate measures of statistical correlation, and their relative importance is probably under-estimated in the table.

A. Band Characteristics

In attempting to get a coherent picture, it is perhaps appropriate also to focus on the main features of the seven most developed bands in the sample of thirty-five under study. These are pictured below as more or less oversimplified models or profiles.

(1) Developed

The outstanding features that characterize the more developed bands appear to be the following, in varying combinations:

First (and by far the most important) is dependence upon steady or regular wage and salaried employment; i.e. a large minority, or majority, of adult male band members employed at steady, reasonably well-paid semi-skilled labour, or regularly employed in highly-paid seasonal skilled labour.

Second (and much less important) is degree of urbanization. As opportunities for such wage or salaried employment tend to be concentrated in large metropolitan areas and industrial cities or towns, most (but not all) of the more developed bands are located within, or close to, such centres. It is readily apparent, however, that some notably depressed and under-developed bands are similarly situated while some relatively developed bands are non-urbanized in the above sense.

Third (and perhaps more important than degree of urbanization or accessibility) is degree of mobility, in terms of the proportion of band members willing or able to reside away from their reserves for extended periods or permanently. This is a characteristic of all the relatively well-developed bands with the exception of those in which most of the working members have found remunerative employment available within commuting distance of their reserves.

Fourth, ownership of or accessibility to resources, as stressed earlier, appears to be a minor factor in contributing to the economic development of band members. Apparent exceptions to this general hypothesis among the sample under study are some non-urbanized bands in British Columbia, such as Skidegate and Sheshaht. These are located in areas of intensive logging operations and most of their adult male workers are engaged in well-paid employment in that industry.

However, it is not so much the accessibility to forests as it is technical competence, enterprise, mobility and other human factors that account for the relative prosperity of these bands. Other bands in British Columbia that are equally well located in terms of access to lumber or fish are far less developed. Furthermore, the requirements of employment in the logging industry of this province, because of its special character, resemble those of most large-scale, highly capitalized and mechanized urban industries rather than the traditional primary resource industries. (Successful operations in British Columbia coastal fishing operations, likewise, require large capital investments, adaptability to rapid technological change, and a high degree of mobility.)

Fifth, degree of organization and participation, both within and outside of the band community. Here, as stressed earlier, the casual relationship to economic development is least clearly defined in this broad survey, and would require intensive studies of individual communities to establish. The pattern of organizational participation varies considerably among the more developed bands.

The seven most developed bands in the sample may be tabulated, in oversimplified form in terms of these major variables, as follows:

Band	Employment	Urbani-zation	Mobility	Ownership or Access to Resources	Internal Organization
Caughnawaga	specialized	high	high	low	low
Squamish	specialized	high	low	low	low
Sheshaht	specialized	low	low	high	high
Skidegate	specialized	low	high	high	high
Lorette	diversified	high	high	low	low
Walpole Is.	diversified	medium	low	medium	high
Tyendinaga	diversified	medium	high	medium	high

As may be seen from the above table, the variables in which the majority of developed bands are ranked as high are those of specialized employment (4:7) and mobility (4:7). Urbanization is classed as high where a band is located

TABLE XXI

SIGNIFICANT CORRELATIONS OF CERTAIN VARIABLES WITH PER CAPITA REAL INCOME OF BANDS, RANKED IN ORDER OF SIGNIFICANCE

Variable	Coefficient of Correlation
Per cent of skilled workers in labour force	.79
Average monthly earnings per worker	.77
Percentage of adult males employed less than 6 months	-.76
Percentage of adult males employed more than 9 months	.72
Percentage of houses with indoor toilets	.72
Percentage of houses with baths	.67
Percentage of households with telephones	.64
Average months of employment per job	.63
Average annual earnings per worker	.61
Average months of employment per worker	.60
Percentage of houses with electricity	.55
Number of organizations in band community	.47
Percentage of population educated beyond Grade IX	.47
Percentage of population under 16 years of age	-.46

(The above are deemed "significant" on the basis of a 99.5% probability. On the basis of 95%, one other variable would be added as being on the "borderline" of significance, namely:

Percentage of adult males employed less than 2 months - .41)

---

within a major metropolitan complex, medium where it is within commuting distance of industrial centres, and low where it is relatively isolated or beyond commuting distance of cities or towns providing employment for any large fraction of its resident band members; similarly, with ownership of, or access to, resources (depending on the proportion of band members deriving their livelihoods from them). From these variables certain characteristic patterns or models emerge as follows:

1. Highly urbanized and specialized role in economy

   Caughnawaga - high mobility, low organization
   Squamish - low mobility, low organization
   Both - low access to resources

2. Highly urbanized and diversified in economy

   Lorette - high mobility, low organization
   - low access to resources

3. Low or medium urbanization, specialized, high access to resources

   Skidegate - low mobility, high organization
   Sheshaht - low mobility, low organization

4. Low or medium urbanized and diversified role in economy and medium access to resources

   Tyendinaga - high mobility, high organization
   Walpole Island - low mobility, high organization.

In general, the highly urbanized bands appear to have a relatively low degree of internal organization, whether specialized or diversified in their economic roles, perhaps because band members tend to participate more in outside, non-reserve activities and organizations. The reverse tends to be the case with the more highly developed, non-urban or medium-urbanized bands.

A low rate of mobility, as noted before, appears to be induced mainly by accessibility to remunerative employment within commuting distance of reserves, whether such employment is in urban industry or in resources. Another factor, however, may be the number, variety and duration of contacts of band members with White society at different levels. This is suggested by the generally much higher mobility (as measured by the percentage of band members residing away from their reserves) of the larger more developed bands in Ontario and Quebec (e.g. Tyendinaga - 53.8 per cent, Caughnawaga - 27.11 per cent, Lorette 41.8%, and Walpole Island 19.3 per cent) as compared to British Columbia (e.g. Skidegate - 18.0 per cent, Squamish - 9.9 per cent, and Sheshaht - 13.2 per cent).

(2) Transitional

The division between the categories of developed and transitional bands is rather arbitrary. However, if per capita real income from gainful employment is acceptable as a measure of economic development, there is a significant gap of more than $100 or about 25 per cent, between the lowest income developed band; namely, Tyendinaga, and the highest income transitional bands; namely, Curve Lake and Six Nations. The transitional category is meant to include those bands which are in a favourable position with regard to some factors (e.g. access to urban centres or to resources; mobility; organizational activity or leadership) but unfavourable with regard to others. Some are undergoing a rapid process Of development from a previously depressed state, while others are in a static or deteriorating situation, despite otherwise favourable circumstances. They tend to fall into much the same patterns as the developed bands with regard to combinations of different variables.

Six Nations. To put this band in the transitional category perhaps merits a special explanation.

First, it may be partly due simply to a lack of accurate knowledge. Because of its unusually large size, with more than 7,000 members, it was much more difficult to get accurate estimates of duration of jobs and rates of pay for all working members in the community. This was particularly the case with non-resident band members, who comprise the unusually large proportion of 48 per cent. No estimates were attempted for this group (and, as noted earlier, in most bands – and perhaps particularly for the Six Nations – the nonresident members probably earn on the average a considerably higher income than the residents).

Second, the Six Nations Band has usually been thought of as the most advanced or progressive in the country, mainly because of a few individuals who have won national or international renown in various fields of endeavour. Many of these, of course, are no longer band members so do not contribute towards raising the statistic of average income, Still, the proportion of resident band members who are in the professional category (8 per cent) is several times higher than that of any one other band in the sample. But this is still a relatively small minority of the labour force. More than counterbalancing it are:

(a) the low participation rate of adults in the labour force (only 24+ per cent);

(b) the relatively small percentage of participating workers in the higher paid skilled category (as evidenced by the relatively low average monthly rates of pay in Table X);

(c) while data regarding the months of employment of employable males are lacking, it seems evident that there is a relatively high rate of unemployment and/or a relatively low average duration of jobs, (i.e. 7.5 months, and 4.0 months per job as shown in Table I); and finally,

(d) a relatively high rate of low-income dependency for certain groups (for instance, the number of residents receiving disability pensions is 127, or 16 per cent of all households, as compared to 4 per cent in Caughnawaga, 2 per cent in Squamish, 8 per cent in Tyendinaga, and 0 per cent in Sheshaht, as examples among the more developed bands.

Curve Lake Lacks ownership or access to resources; there is diversified employment, depending primarily on wage-paying jobs, but more distant from industrial centres with job opportunities, or industries offering high rates of pay, together with a lower rate of mobility, than the more developed bands; hence, smaller proportions of skilled, lower average rates of pay, and higher rates of unemployment.

Port Simpson and Masset. Non-urban, specialized, resource-based economies; displacement from specialized fishing and canning, partial (and, compared to Skidegate, incomplete and less successful) shift to logging; hence, higher rates of unemployment.

Kamloops. Formerly depressed and underdeveloped, depending on ranching and casual farm labour, supplemented by farmland and timber leases; recent shift to industrial leases providing new opportunities for diversified wage employment, but at relatively low rates of pay. High mobility and high degree of organization.

Mistassini and Dog Rib Rae. Bands which have largely continued the economy of hunting, fishing and trapping, but in which a growing minority have found new opportunities for casual or seasonal wage employment in mining, forestry and auxiliary activities. High mobility and low degree of organization.

Sarcee and Blood. Ownership of and access to a wealth of resources, as well as to metropolitan centre which offers manifold job opportunities, but failure to utilize these assets fully (due, in large part, to the income derived from resource ownership). Low mobility.

(3) Depressed or Under-developed

The dividing line between the categories of transitional and underdeveloped bands, again, is arbitrary in principle and blurred at the margin. The lowest income bands, however, tend to fall into relatively simple, clearly defined types, as compared to the developed and transitional types described above.

(a) The relatively numerous, geographically isolated bands across the vast northern wooded belt, most of whose members have been partially or wholly displaced from their hunting, trapping and fishing economies, have lost their mobility, failed to find alternative opportunities for employment, and thus come to depend mainly on welfare. (e.g. Golden Lake; Cross Lake and God's Lake; Fond du Lac; and, until the discovery of rich oil resources on band reserve land, Hay Lake,)

(b) Bands in predominantly farming areas, in which opportunities for wage employment are lacking (other than in low-paid casual farm labour). (e.g. Piapot, James Smith and Peguis.)

(c) Bands located in areas lacking in farmland or other utilizable resources, and isolated from main centres of employment. (e.g. Big Cove and Shubenacadie.)

(d) Bands located close to metropolitan or industrial centres, but lacking the skills, motivation, or acceptance in the White community, required for economic development. (e.g. Musqueam, Kenora and Fort Alexander.)

All four of these categories of depressed or under-developed bands are generally low in internal organization. Some, like Musqueam and Fort Alexander, have a small minority of highly paid, regularly employed skilled workers in nearby industrial enterprises but, for various reasons, these have not managed to exert a sufficient demonstration effect upon the rest of the community to encourage any significant shift into better-paid types of employment. Some of the more depressed bands show high rates of mobility but this is not on a sufficient scale to compensate for the lack of resources or job opportunities locally available to the majority of band members who remain on their reserves.

B. The Process of Economic Development in Stages

From the above comparison of Indian bands of widely varying income levels, the range of economic development may be illustrated as extending from the most isolated, local resource-based, dependent and depressed bands, at the one extreme, to the most economically integrated urban bands at the other, whose working members are employed in a variety of jobs that come close to a representative cross-section of an urban-industrial White population.

Degree of economic development for Indians, as measured by per capita income from gainful employment tends to be closely correlated with the degree of industrialization and urbanization in work behaviour, and way of life generally of individuals and groups. Degree of industrialization and urbanization would be determined not so much in terms of location as in the job characteristics and requirements of industries and occupations in which people are employed. In most cases – depending mainly on location – it involves mobility in the sense of a prolonged absence or permanent separation or break from the reserve. More important, however, is the degree of break from the reserve culture, and the attitudes, values and behaviour patterns that it tends to generate. Industrialization and urbanization would be measured in terms of such criteria as degree of mechanization and size of capital investment per worker; division of labour and proportions of skilled to unskilled in the labour force; rates of pay; regularity of employment; rules and sanctions governing hours of work, punctuality, tardiness or absenteeism, quality and pace of work, promotions, transferences, layoffs and dismissals; and the like.

From this perspective, then, we may view the process of economic development as a progression of individuals and groups through a series of different types of industries and occupations having job requirements and characteristics ranging from the least to the most industrialized and urbanized. The order of progression may be viewed somewhat as follows:

1. subsistence hunting, fishing, trapping, food and fuel-wood gathering and marginal farming, supplemented by intermittent domestic handicrafts;

2. casual, seasonal and non-recurrent commercial employment for short periods in such jobs as guiding, fishing, and fish canning or processing, fruit and vegetable canning, casual farm labour, logging (other than along the British Columbia coastal region), pole-and pulpwood-cutting, clearing and unskilled construction labour, fire-fighting;

3. regular or recurrent seasonal employment over longer periods of the year in such fields as semi-skilled or skilled construction work, road and railway maintenance, truck driving, longshoring, logging and sawmilling in some areas and various seasonal secondary industries (particularly in food handling and processing);

4. regular full-time or permanent employment in a non-urban setting, in such fields as commercial farming; highway and railway maintenance; maintenance, repair, service and clerical employment in larger bands; government employees in game and forestry conservation; and the like;

5. specialized full-time or recurrent seasonal employment and residence in relatively high-wage, urban-located industries, particularly in small and medium-sized industrial towns, such as larger sawmills and planing mills, plywood, pulp and paper plants; mining and smelting operations; factory work, particularly in the semifinished category; building construction, maintenance and repair; automotive transportation; and various clerical and service occupations;

6. full-time employment and residence in urban communities, particularly large metropolitan centres, in diverse occupations representative of a metropolitan population, ranging from unskilled to the most skilled, technical and professional jobs.

It seems evident that any substantial improvement in the economic position of Indians generally will require the movement of large and increasing numbers from the overcrowded low-income resource-based industries and locales in which they now work and reside into better-paid wage and salaried employment in other industries, which, in most cases, will probably be beyond commuting distance from their reserves More efficient development and utilization of resources accessible to their home reserves should be deemed distinctly secondary in importance and designed essentially for the residue who have special skill or promise in working in local resource-based industries, or who, for various reasons, will be unable to adjust to migration and relocation.

The process of industrialization and urbanization as described above should not, of course, be viewed as a process in which every Indian must unavoidably go through every higher stage in order to obtain the best employment. There are enough case histories over the past ten years or more to demonstrate fairly conclusively that individual Indians, given sufficiently careful selection, training, placement, and counselling, can bridge the wide gap between a relatively simple, isolated and local resource-based band to living and working successfully in a complex metropolitan environment. The question is not so much whether it can be done as whether it can be expected to occur or can be brought about on a sufficient scale to relieve the present and growing pressure of population on resources and job opportunities in many communities with their consequent under-employment, poverty and dependency. It would seem that bigger and quicker results would be achieved by putting the main priority on encouraging the movement of Indians in as large numbers as possible, into the types of jobs which are most easily available or attainable in terms of their location, skills, motivations, and job preferences, rather than focussing on the training of the minority of more promising Indians for special achievements though this latter objective should be maintained, by all means.

Perhaps this question is really a difference in emphasis as between short-term and long-term objectives. The Indian Affairs Branch is now dedicated to the principle that Indians, like Whites, should be provided with all the educational opportunities that they can utilize effectively, to enable every Indian to develop to his full capacities. One cannot quarrel with this objective for Indians, any more than for the population generally. If Indians are to be enabled to develop economically to the point of achieving equal or comparable levels of income and occupational status with Whites generally, one of the essential requirements will be that they receive levels of education and training generally equal or comparable to the White majority. In view of the at-present low levels of educational achievement of most Indians, however, coupled with deficiencies in educational personnel and facilities, and numerous deterrent factors in the home and community environments among many bands, it seems evident that such educational and economic equality will take at best, many years to achieve. Meanwhile, there are pressing problems such as wide spread unemployment and under-employment, as well as large and increasing numbers of young Indians reaching working age year by year. The more immediate and pressing need, therefore, would appear to be to educate and train Indians, in the largest possible numbers, to take advantage of the job opportunities that are most readily available to them,

Specifically, what is suggested is that the most rapid and in the aggregate the greatest improvement in the economic status of Indians could be achieved by a really massive effort to encourage and enable large numbers of them to move out of trapping, fishing and marginal farming into wage employment in seasonal industries such as logging, construction and railway maintenance; from these into more regular and secure types of employment, such as in saw milling, pulp and paper, smelting and maintenance work in industrial towns; and so on.

This sort of approach is far from novel or original, of course. It has been followed by the Indian Affairs Branch in various parts of the country for several years with varying degrees of intensity.

This sort of policy may be open to criticism on several grounds:

(a) It is discriminatory in principle to assume that most Indians have natural attributes and preferences for seasonal outdoor jobs in non-urban settings, or that they naturally have difficulty in settling down to steady jobs at regular hours in urban environments. Furthermore, even if the assumption were realistic for the majority, it would be unfair and undemocratic to neglect the interests of the minority of Indians having special abilities, or those who do not have the physical or temperamental attributes required for certain types of skilled or semi-skilled manual labour.

In brief, the argument seems to boil down to the following proposition: If Indians are to be given equal opportunities with Whites to develop to levels of approximate equality economically and otherwise, the full range of educational or training facilities and job openings at all levels must be made available to them on the same basis. In effect this would mean that the main metropolitan centres, with their multiplicity of special services and facilities, and their potentially unlimited opportunities for employment, must be rendered, one way or another, as accessible to Indians as to Whites. For it is in the metropolitan areas which have an increasing majority of the nation's population, in which are concentrated most special facilities and services for education and training, medicine and public health, trade and industry and economic activity – in brief, the very nature of our urban industrial society is controlled and shaped by our metropolitan centres.

(b) There is also a practical matter of policy to be considered. Large metropolitan centres are cosmopolitan and multi-racial or multiethnic in composition and more tolerant of deviant behaviour or physical or cultural differences than are small or medium-sized towns. The criteria of employability are more likely to be the objective ones of formal training and measurable efficiency rather than family or racial background. On these grounds, then, it could be argued that Indians could be absorbed into employment in larger numbers and would find the adjustment to urban living easier in large metropolitan centres than in small towns.

There has been a very limited amount of research done on Indian workers and residents of metropolitan areas, and the findings are far from conclusive. J.D. Fransen (formerly Assistant Indian Affairs Branch Superintendent in Southern Ontario, and now with the Indian and Metis Branch of the Saskatchewan Government) has recently completed a study for his Master of Social Work degree at the University of Toronto.[1] The group of Indians he studied showed a high degree of adaptability to urban work. They were performing a wide variety of jobs requiring various levels of skill and training. All but a few had experienced little or no prejudice or discriminatory treatment from employers or fellow workers. They showed distinctly positive attitudes to their jobs, had remained at them for several years, and a number had had promotions or were taking special education or training purely on their own initiative to advance themselves.

The group represented a random sample of thirty out of some 190 Indians known to be residing in Toronto. However, they proved to be of a rather special category, who could hardly be taken as representative of Indians generally in Ontario, much less Canada as a whole. They all came from eight bands in Southern Ontario –one-third of the sample from Six Nations alone – all of which are located near medium-sized urban communities. They could be presumed, then, to be already more urbanized and capable of adjusting to city life than Indians from more remote localities. Furthermore, they all are relatively young, and most are single and/or childless so have limited responsibilities. And finally, they are all able to make return visits to their home reserves on weekends without excessive time or expense.

---

[1] J.D. Fransen, "Employment Experience and Economic Position of a Selected Group of Indians in Metropolitan Toronto", June, 1964.

(c) In general, then, a program designed to increase greatly the movement of the more specially gifted or qualified Indians out of reserves and into major metropolitan centres to work in a variety of skilled jobs is greatly to be desired on several counts. For one thing, Indians generally tend to lack a middle class, employed in technical, professional or semi-professional positions of status who could act effectively as leaders and spokesmen for their interests. And, for the more depressed Indian bands located close to large metropolitan centres, their employment off the reserve seems to be the only feasible path for economic development in any case. In the foreseeable future, it is reasonable to expect that increasing numbers and proportions of Indians will gravitate to the major metropolitan centres for residence and employment, as has been occurring among the White population for several decades. If such is the prospect, it would seem only feasible to put growing emphasis on educating, training and conditioning Indians – particularly those below sixteen years of age, who comprise about one-half the total population – for living and working in metropolitan environments.

But, to repeat, this cannot be relied upon, in the short run at least, to deal with the larger problems of excess population and under-development of the many Indian bands in the more northern wooded regions as well as numerous farming areas across the country, For one thing, as noted before, the educational deficiencies of most Indians from such environments at present rule out their acquiring high school and post-secondary vocational training of the kinds that seem increasingly necessary for successful adjustment in the metropolitan economy. The relatively small stream of young Indians who come from various bands to Vancouver, Winnipeg or Toronto each year for special education and training and who become placed successfully in employment, fall far short of the flood of young Indians reaching working age each year in British Columbia, Manitoba or Ontario in areas of serious under-employment.

To meet this problem would require moving much larger numbers into, and through, a range of middle positions such as listed in the table of industries and occupation in the urban-industrial spectrum above. The crucial link in this regard would appear to be those in the category described in No. 5 – i.e. full-time or regular seasonal employment in such industries as pulp and paper, mining and smelting, sawmilling, plywood and various service and repair fields related to these.

These fields seem to offer several possibilities for Indians.

1. They are expanding rapidly in new small or medium-sized towns that are being established, or already established, in areas with sizable under-employment of resident Indian populations so that for many the problems of distance and transportation costs are not too great.

2. The types of employment in primary manufacturing and related seasonal occupations appear to be more in line with the work experiences and job preferences of Indians coming from local resource-based economies than would be work in secondary manufacturing or large offices in major urban centres.

3. Because of their size and location, many of the smaller or medium-sized industrial towns offer more opportunities to Indians to participate in hunting, fishing, guiding and food-gathering on weekends or holidays.

4. The demonstration effect on fellow band members is likely to be more readily observable and effective in inducing migration out of reserves and into new areas of employment where numbers become employed at reasonably steady and well-paid manual, clerical or service jobs in accessible industrial or business centres, as

> compared with that of a few individuals who make the big jump and become established in a large and distant city.

Every placement of a worker at this key point could potentially create a chain reaction that would open up new and better job prospects for four or five others and thus greatly increase mobility. Steady workers recruited for work in sawmills, pulp plants or smelters from the ranks of seasonal railway or highway maintenance workers, or maintenance and repair workers on reserves, would in turn make new jobs in these latter fields available to otherwise unemployed Indians who remain overcrowded in hunting, trapping, and fishing and who must depend on relief for much of their livelihood; and so on.

The main difficulty of getting Indians placed in these middle levels of industrial employment, as noted earlier, seems to be in attitudes of exclusiveness or hostility towards them by White employers and residents. In the unprecedented industrial expansion that Canada has experienced since the War, many new industrial communities have developed in many parts of the country, from which Indians have been almost entirely excluded. It will require a major effort of planning and pressure to get any large number of Indians established in such communities but the potential economic gains to be achieved would seem to far outweigh the costs.

CHAPTER IX

GENERAL PROSPECTS, BY MAJOR REGIONS

The previous chapter has outlined the trends whose encouragement would seem to promise the greatest degree of improvement in the economic position of Indians in Canada. The general pattern is that of a series of shifts through different stages of industrialization and urbanization.

The pattern differs considerably and appropriate economic policies would, therefore, have to vary among the major provinces or regions across the country. The rate and pattern of change would depend upon such variables as:

- the size, structure, and location of major industries;
- amounts, location and types of resources (including climate and topography) and location of main markets, on which the industrial structure is based;
- present and anticipated rates of growth in output and employment;
- distribution of the total population in communities of different size and type;
- location of Indian communities of various sizes in relation to usable resources, transportation facilities, and White centres of industry and population having employment opportunities;
- degrees and patterns of mobility in response to economic opportunities.

There are wide variations in the degree of economic development achieved to date, widely unequal rates of growth in the foreseeable future, and hence widely unequal economic prospects for Indians among the major regions in the country.

(1) British Columbia

While not as highly developed industrially as Ontario, and having a slightly lower per capita income from all sources for the total population, British Columbia has the most prosperous Indian population as a whole and offers the most favourable prospects for the economic development of this minority in the immediate future. This view is based on several findings:

(a) The size and location of Indian bands. Unlike most other provinces, British Columbia's Indian population comprises a large number of relatively small bands. While comprising less than one-fifth of the total Indian population in Canada, they account for some 180, or almost one-third, of the 560-odd bands in Canada, and these have almost 2,000 reserves. Few bands in this province have more than 1,000 members, and none has as many as 2,000.

Most of these bands, furthermore, appear to be favourably located in relation to job and income-producing resources, to transportation facilities, and to centres of industry and population. One large segment of the population resides in numerous bands along the mainland coast from Vancouver to the Alaskan Boundary, as well as Vancouver Island, the Queen Charlottes. and lesser islands. Most of the bands in the interior of the province have fairly easy access to transportation by railway, highway, or waterway. Only a small minority of the Indian population of the province is located on reserves more than a few hours travel by boat, automobile or train to sizable industrial or commercial centres.

(b) British Columbia has been undergoing a rapid rate of economic growth in recent years, with types of industries that are, on balance, favourable to the employment of Indians in terms of their present location and job preferences. Along the coast, fishing and fish canning or processing until recently provided the largest single field of employment for Indians. They have faced increasing displacement in recent years because of mechanization and larger-scale operations, coupled with increasing competition from other ethnic groups. A minority of the more able and enterprising Indians in the fishing industry, as noted in previous chapters, has remained among the most prosperous in the country, but the majority in it appears to be under-employed and earning inadequate incomes which require supplementing from other sources.

More than compensating for this trend in fishing, however, has been the great and growing expansion in the forest products industry generally on the coast – logging, sawmilling, plywood, pulp and paper production and related service industries such as towing or transporting, loading and shipping. While the employment of Indians in processing industries such as plywood, pulp and paper production has been limited, there has been rapid expansion in logging and sawmilling. While adequate statistics are lacking, there appear to be far more Indians now employed in these two fields, as well as longshoring, on the coast, than was the case in the fairly detailed employment survey of Indians in British Columbia some ten years ago.[1] A particularly favourable trend has been the rapid expansion of logging in areas of predominantly Indian population in which the displacement of Indians from fishing has been most severe, as in Vancouver Island, the Queen Charlottes, and along the Skeena and Nass Rivers.

Similar expansion has been occurring in the interior, particularly the northern interior sections of the province. New pulp, paper and plywood plants and planermills have been, and are being, established in numerous centres. Again, while relatively few Indians have been employed in processing establishments, increasing numbers appear to have shifted from trapping and marginal farming or ranching operations to seasonal employment in logging and sawmilling.

Even more spectacular, in some respects, has been the rapid growth in the construction industry, particularly, again, in the interior of the province – most notably, the Peace River and Columbia River power projects, each involving hundreds of millions of dollars, in the northern interior and southern interior respectively. More than 200 Indians have been, and are now, employed on the former project, in rough clearing and construction work – most of them recruited from dozens of under-employed and depressed bands over a wide area. Many more are employed in various parts of the province in road building and powerline construction and in the initial phases of new resource development projects such as pulp and paper plants, mines and the like.

As stressed below, however, a major effort will be required in British Columbia, as in other provinces, to get larger numbers of Indians employed in the processing and tertiary sectors of the economy, once the initial developmental phase of the present expansion is finished.

---

[1] Hawthorn, Belshaw, Jamieson, The Indians of British Columbia.

(2) Prairie Provinces

Owing to topographical features and natural barriers to transportation and communication, it is customary to look upon the Prairies as one region in which the three provinces have certain characteristics and problems in common, contrasting sharply, in many respects, from British Columbia to the West, and Ontario, Quebec and the Maritimes to the East.

In analysing the economic problems and prospects of the Indian population in these provinces, however, it would perhaps be more realistic to divide Cana a generally into four main regions, on a north-and-south, rather than east-and-west basis, as follows:

(a) the Maritimes;

(b) the lower St. Lawrence Valley and Southern Ontario, having a high density of population and a major concentration of urban industry;

(c) the plains and foothills regions of the Prairie Provinces;

(d) the vast northern forest, rock, and muskeg belt, occupying virtually all of Quebec and Ontario north f the St. Lawrence and Great Lakes, more than three-quarters of Manitoba running from the southeast corner to the north and west of Lake Winnipeg, almost one-half of Saskatchewan and about one-third of Alberta, and including the Yukon and Northwest Territories as well as the large part of British Columbia lying north of the C.N.R. line from Prince George to Prince Rupert.

The economic positions of the majority of Indian bands throughout this vast northern region, and the special maladjustments and problems they face are fundamentally similar, based as they are primarily upon hunting, fishing, and trapping supplemented by casual wage work and relief. These are discussed in general terms below. However, the number and proportion of Indians in each province residing in the northern and southern belts respectively, and the northern Indians' prospects for finding alternative employment in other industries, appear to differ appreciably. The northern regions of the Prairie provinces – particularly Manitoba and Saskatchewan – as well as the Yukon and Northwest Territories, appear to face special difficulties in this regard.

Economy of the Northern Indians

The fishing and trapping economies of Indians throughout the northern belt appear to be facing similar trends and problems. A combination of rapid population growth, excessive trapping and depletion of game and fur-bearing animals in some areas, obsolete or inefficient organization, techniques and equipment, competition of substitutes and consequent low prices for wild furs in recent years, all have led to inadequately low and declining returns to trappers over the past decade or more. These, coupled with rising consumer expectations and with stricter control over school attendance as a condition for receiving family allowances, in turn have reduced incentives to trap and consequently mobility. To an increasing extent, people have ceased to carry on trapping, and come to reside the year round in large and permanent settlements built around schools, nursing stations, Hudson's Bay Company stores, Indian Affairs Branch offices and other such institutions. In many cases, they depend upon relief, family allowances, old age pension and assistance cheques, and other government subsidies or welfare payments for the major part of their income.

In comparison or contrast to the situation in British Columbia, a large proportion of Indians in the northern region in the Prairie provinces as well as Northern Ontario are concentrated in a few large bands which are poorly located in terms of access to transportation facilities and industrial or business centres offering alternative job opportunities. This is particularly the case in Northern Saskatchewan and Manitoba. In the latter, an Indian population of more than 16,000 belongs to only twenty-two bands, compared to the 180 bands for 40,000 people in British Columbia. And in the former, some of the largest bands such as Norway House and Island Lake, each with almost 3,000 residents, are located in areas accessible only by expensive transportation by air, or by long and arduous water, snowmobile or bombardier transportation, over hundreds of miles from any urban centre . The same is true of certain relatively large Indian communities in Northern Ontario, such as Big Trout Lake.

Within this broad perspective, of course, the picture varies consider-ably from band to band and area to area across this huge region. The size of the northern region, and the numbers of Indians residing in it vary widely from province to province. Northern Manitoba, for instance, had roughly 16,000 Indians and 4,000 Metis in 1962, while Northern Saskatchewan, much smaller in area and resources, had 5,520 Indians and 4,240 Metis. By contrast, the predominantly trapping Indian population in Northern British Columbia numbers less than 1,000. Again, Northern Ontario, while smaller than Northern Quebec (as defined earlier), has several times the Indian population of the latter.

In Northern Saskatchewan, despite considerable effort and planning for conservation and development, coupled with improved marketing and distribution, the annual fur catch appears to have reached an upper limit, despite inadequate returns averaging only $300 - $400 per annum to trappers, and their consequent growing dependence on relief.[1] In Northern Manitoba, by contrast, an intensive survey under government auspices in 1962 came to the conclusion that only 20 per cent of the potential wild fur was being harvested, though the income to trappers was hardly any better on the average than in Northern Saskatchewan.[2] As a third variant, a number of bands, particularly in the Yukon and Northwest Territories, as well as some parts of Northern Quebec, have remained largely mobile and self-supporting in hunting, trapping and fishing, albeit at low levels of income.

The decline in income and employment in trapping during the 1950's and early 1960's has been compensated, to some extent, by the opening up and development of commercial fishing in an increasing number of northern lakes. This has been a particularly notable development in Manitoba arid, to a lesser extent, Ontario and Saskatchewan. In the former, fishing in recent years has provided a considerably larger total cash income, though less employment, than trapping. It still provides far from adequate returns, however, averaging less than $500 per annum, and its prospects are uncertain, due again to long distance from markets, high transportation costs, poor organization and distribution, inefficient and obsolete techniques and equipment, and the like.[3]

Guiding, fire-fighting, pulpwood cutting, seasonal road and railway building and maintenance have also provided supplementary employment to considerable numbers of Indians in numerous northern areas.

Again, some bands such as Hay Lake in Northwestern Alberta, are located in areas with large tracts of potentially arable farmland and commercial timber stands, as possible alternative sources of gainful employment and are now receiving large revenues from the discovery of oil resources on their reserves. Similarly, a number of bands in Northern Quebec and Ontario and in Northwestern Manitoba have potentially large new employment opportunities with the development of major mining and smelting, pulp and paper, and hydro-electric power operations in their midst. Large developmental projects involving investments in the hundreds of millions of dollars, notably the Athabasca tar sands in Northern Alberta, the earlier mentioned Peace River power project in Northern British Columbia, and the Hamilton Falls power project in Northern Quebec, offer potentially great alternative employment opportunities for Indians in these areas. By contrast, large numbers of Indians in areas such as Northeastern Manitoba and most of Northern Saskatchewan, appear to have limited or inadequate alternative resources locally available to Indian communities, and few prospects for new industrial developments within reasonable access to any large number (though the recently announced project for hydro power development on the Nelson River in Northern Manitoba may change the picture dramatically in this region).

---

[1] Buckley, Kew and Hawley, op.cit.

[2] "Manitoba, 1962-75", Report, Committee on Manitoba's economic Future, Government of Manitoba, Winnipeg, 1963.

[3] Buckley, Kew and Hawley, op.cit. Manitoba, 1962-75 Report.

Considering the present levels of inefficiency, a great deal could be done through larger investments in equipment, personnel and training to improve the utilization of available resources and improve the levels of real income of Indians who depend upon trapping and fishing.

In their domestic economies, for instance, part of the northern Indian household's real income is derived from domestic consumption of game, fish, fuelwood and timber, which, in urbanized areas, would require large outlays in cash. (As noted in Chapter II, an arbitrary allowance of $50 monthly for a six-month period was made for northern bands in estimating their annual per capita real incomes from gainful employment.) With rapidly increasing populations and reduced mobility, however, Indian households in many communities, particularly the larger ones, find it increasingly difficult to supply themselves with these necessities within a distance feasible for transporting the produce back to the home, due to depletion of resources within a widening radius of their settlements. The real income per man hour of labour is decreasing. Hence, there is increasing reliance on purchased food, clothing, fuel and lumber, and these are sold at far higher prices than in the more populated areas in the south, owing to high transportation costs in importing them from outside. Through better organization and proper transportation facilities, many communities in the north could more economically utilize hitherto untapped resources at greater distances, over much larger areas. Again, a number of reserves in the northern region contain, or have access to, areas of arable land which could be used to grow vegetables of much better quality, and far lower in cost than the dried, canned or occasional fresh varieties available in local stores.

Much higher total and per capita incomes would likewise be possible for Indians engaged in commercial trapping and fishing through more efficient organization and up-to-date techniques and equipment, as a number of studies have brought out. The effects on total employment, however, are more problematical. The most intensive study of the economic potential for Indians and Metis of resource industries in the northern belt was carried out in Northern Manitoba by numerous outside consultants and experts on behalf of the Manitoba Government in 1962. In view of the fact that the wild fur industry in that region was being exploited to only 20 per cent of its full potential, the research findings were to the effect that the industry, currently employing some 3,000 trappers earning in toto only $1 million per annum or $300 per capita, could, through proper equipment and organization, be made to yield a total of $5 million per annum for 5,000 trappers, or an average of $1,000 per capita for a three to four-month trapping season. This potential, however, could be reached only if supported by other supplementary or supporting sources of income and employment (notably fishing), coupled with relatively drastic provisions concerning such matters as education and social welfare.

Increasingly, however, as noted earlier, commercial fishing has been the main supplementary employment to trapping, and now exceeds it in total income yielded. However, it was found in another special research study in Manitoba that the improvements needed to bring this industry into an effective level of competition efficiency would involve a drastic reduction of the total labour force employed, from the prevailing level of 5,000 down to 1,500. This would be necessitated by large-scale, more mechanized operations, and the elimination of wasteful duplication in plant and facilities. The 3,500 displaced from fishing, it was concluded, would need re-training for employment in other industries.[1] Clearly, then, the changes recommended for fishing would go counter to the requirements for increasing employment and income in trapping.

The intensive study of Indians and Metis in Northern Saskatchewan by Buckley, Kew and Hawley did not come up with such sensational estimates with regard to either the potential expansion of employment and income in trapping or the potential decline of employment in fishing. Its conclusions were, how-ever, that employment and income prospects in these older resource-based industries were at best limited and inadequate for a population increasing at an unusually rapid rate. Numerous other less comprehensive studies of other parts of the northern belt seem to reach much the same conclusions.

---

[1] Ibid., p. V-4-3. For a fuller analysis of the economic prospects of Indians in Northern Manitoba, see Jamieson and Hawthorn, The Role of Native People in the Economic Development of Northern Manitoba.

Alternative Sources of Employment

In general then, if the maximum efficiency in resource use were achieved through modernization of equipment, intensive training in new techniques, and improvements in processing and marketing, the average real incomes of Indians engaged in trapping and fishing could be raised appreciably to yield monthly rates of pay comparable to those of other industries. The total employment prospects, however, appear to be static or declining, in terms of conservation requirements. At best, they fall far short of meeting the needs of a rapidly expanding population (particularly where the expansion is most rapid among the younger groups now reaching working age). And, in view of the high seasonality of northern trapping and fishing -- providing, at best, only six to seven months employment per annum – the average annual earnings from these industries would still fall considerably short of the levels deemed adequate by urban standards. Finally, there is the fact to be faced that a large and growing number of young people arriving at working age in the northern areas, owing to the requirements of more-or-less continuous school attendance, are incapable of earning an adequate livelihood from trapping and fishing in any case, for skill in these activities is to a large extent dependent upon detailed and intimate knowledge of terrain and of the life habits of fish and game – knowledge of a kind that is acquired through long years of apprenticeship from boyhood on.

The conclusion seems unavoidable, therefore, that any substantial improvement in the employment and income prospects of northern Indians will be possible only with a large-scale migration to, and relocation in, areas offering opportunities for remunerative wage employment. Alternative possibilities in this regard merit some examination.

(a) Southern Prairies

One major trend common to virtually all regions of the North American continent and particularly pronounced since World War II, has been the migration from rural to urban areas, and accompanying this a growing concentration of population in the larger metropolitan centres and nearby satellite business and industrial towns. For in these centres are concentrated the main secondary, financial, sales and service industries which are undergoing the most rapid rates of expansion in the economy, and which offer, therefore, the most opportunities for remunerative employment. In Canada, by the very nature of its geography, this population movement involves a predominantly north-to-south migration, at least of the Canadian-born.

Counterbalancing this trend, to some extent, has been a migration of people from the more populated areas in the south to hitherto thinly populated or unpopulated areas in the north, consequent upon improved transportation facilities, new resource development projects and the communities that develop around them. Only in British Columbia, however, has this counter-movement of population since World War II been of such a magnitude as to lead to a faster rate of population growth for the northern region as a whole than for the metropolitan centres.

A highly industrialized region like Southern Ontario could potentially absorb unlimited numbers of northern Indians displaced from primary employment (except for problems of technical training and social adaptation or adjustment). For reasons discussed briefly in the preceding chapter, however, this does not seem the most feasible way in the immediate future, at least, of attempting to deal with the growing problem of under-employment and dependency in the northern belt.

In the Prairies the southern plains and foothills region would appear incapable of absorbing large numbers of displaced northern Indians in any case, apart from the technical and social problems involved. Southern Manitoba and Southern arid Central Saskatchewan are predominantly agricultural in their economies, with a limited degree of industrialization and a surplus rural population more than sufficient to fill the limited job opportunities avail-able in the cities and towns of the region. Numerous bands residing in this region, as noted in an earlier chapter, are among the lowest income, most depressed and dependent groups in the country. Their real income per capita from gainful employment tends to be even lower than that of most northern hands, because they do not have the game, fish, fuelwood and timber available for home consumption.

Alberta appears to be in a better position than the other Prairie provinces. Southern and Central Alberta have been undergoing considerably greater expansion than the other Prairie provinces, due mainly to the discovery and development of major oil and gas resources and the multiplier effect these have had on further development of the other industrial and commercial activities. So far, however, this expansion appears to have benefited Indians to a very limited extent as far as gainful employment is concerned. It has yielded large band funds and revenues to certain bands, such as the Blood, Blackfoot, Sarcee and Sampson, and these, together with ownership of large tracts of arable land, have enabled numbers of Indians to become established in ranching. But relatively few have found remunerative wage employment in metropolitan Calgary or Edmonton or in the smaller towns.

(b) Northern Region

A limited number of Indians from northern communities, of course, have been migrating and resettling in southern cities and towns and their numbers are likely to increase in the future. However, for the next decade this seems unlikely to occur on a scale sufficient to meet the needs of rapid population growth in the north, as well as among bands in the southern region. The best hope for the former group, therefore, seems to lie in the development of new industries in the north itself that offer potentially new opportunities for employment to Indians and Metis in the region. Migration and relocation of northern Indians, in brief, seems to promise greater economic gains where directed to new centres of growth in the north itself, rather than from north to south.

The most promising industries as far as new employment possibilities in the north are concerned, are in forestry products (particularly pulp and paper) and in mining and smelting. These industries are already well developed in Northern Quebec and Ontario, of course, and are employing a considerable (though unknown) number of Indians. Further expansion on a large scale is to be expected. Most recent of the large new developments, involving actual or potential investments in the hundreds of millions of dollars, are those in iron ore in Northern Quebec, and in copper in Northern Ontario.

These two provinces likewise account for the major output of pulp and newsprint in the country. The long-run growth prospects of these products are highly favourable, and it seems likely that forestry operations to supply the raw material will be carried farther north in areas of predominantly, or entirely, Indian population.

Prospects are also favourable in Northern Manitoba, a region with a relatively large number of under-employed Indians in isolated communities. The mining and smelting industry in this region is far less developed than in Ontario and Quebec, but it has great potentialities. The three main mining and smelting centres of Flin Flon, Lynn Lake and Thompson in Northwestern Manitoba together have a population considerably larger than the entire non-urban, predominately Indian and Metis population of the whole vast region of Northern Manitoba. Thompson, with a population of approximately 6,000, is expected to grow to 20,000 or 25,000 in the next few years. There has been a high rate of turnover among mining and smelting workers. The new job openings in this one centre alone, therefore, are sufficient in number to more than match the numbers of under-employed or unemployed Indians and Metis in the northern section of the province (again, ignoring the problems of migration and relocation, training and social conditioning that would be involved). Large proven reserves, plus large suspected reserves, of mineral ores in the undeveloped area south and east of the Hudson Bay railway line offer the prospect of development in that area, as well as in the northwest.

The forest products industry likewise shows prospects of great expansion in output and employment opportunities. Northern Manitoba is one of the few remaining regions on the continent in which large tracts of potentially usable timber have remained virtually untouched and unclaimed. One estimate by a group of expert consultants hired by the Manitoba Government is that through proper methods of organization, conservation, development and utilization, the dollar value of output of forest products could be increased five times over and employment more than doubled from the current 8,000 to more than 18,000. The latter, moreover, could enjoy longer periods of employment and at higher rates of pay than now apply in the industry.[1]

Strong recommendations have been made to the Manitoba Government to facilitate the establishment of a large-scale pulp plant in the strategic centre of The Pas. Further recommended are large-scale pulp-log operations farther north and east in timber stands accessible by rivers and lakes to the Hudson Bay railway line for shipment of logs, in bulk, through the port of Churchill on Hudson's Bay. (At present there is only one pulp and newsprint plant in Manitoba, in the southeast section of the province some 80 miles northeast of Winnipeg, while only a few small sawmills operate in the northern sector.)

Such developments, of course, are contingent upon the provincial government adopting a vigorous program of public investment in roads, power lines and other facilities and services necessary to induce private capital to invest in major resource development projects.

Prospects in Northern Saskatchewan, according to the Report by Buckley, Kew, and Hawley, appear to be considerably more uncertain, despite the greater degree of government planning and control of resource use than in Manitoba. The explanation lies, of course, in the relative paucity of resources. To quote some more pertinent sections of the Report:

With regard to mining and smelting:

"Taking into account all the difficulties and uncertainties, it cannot be assumed that development will come, inevitably, within the next ten years. Neither can we assume that new mines will employ Indians and Metis. This consideration, above all others, demands a drastic revision in existing northern programs.

"What the future of mining holds for Indians and Metis depends less on new discoveries and more on training. In the absence of the latter, any number of new mines may be brought into production and the Indian will remain on the fringe of employment, as he has at Uranium City. But even without new mines, Indian people can be trained for jobs with existing companies.

". . . a training program would not threaten White workers now employed because many will leave Uranium City in any event. According to estimates supplied by Buck and Henderson, the labour turnover in northern mines generally varies between 50 and 200 per cent a year. (Buck & Henderson, '59, p. 106.) A training program, therefore, would take into account labour turnover as well as a possible expansion in the demand for labour in the future."

With regard to forest products industries:

"The timber industry does not employ large numbers of workers in the north. Of more than 500 sawmills in the province, only sixteen are located in the northern region. Of 2,700 men employed in Saskatchewan in 1961 -- at sawmills and in the woods - - only 255 were employed in the northern region. Moreover while northern labour seldom moves south, there is a considerable movement of forest workers from south to north. Therefore, what little employment there

---

[1] "Manitoba 1962-75", Report, op.cit., part V, Sec. 3.

"is in the northern region goes to outsiders as much as it does to local men. The largest contractor, for example, employs seventy-five to eighty men, only forty of whom are Indians or Metis.

"In the province as a whole, Indians and Metis have actually lost ground in the timber industry as a result of mechanization.

"No great prospects appear to be in store for northern people as a Te-suit of the natural expansion of the timber industry. With a limited resource far from markets, northern mills are likely to remain small and few. Men better equipped than the Indian and Metis are likely to take the lion's share of employment."

With regard to pulp:

"What is needed, of course, is a mill or mills in Saskatchewan. According to the Stanford Study, the resource could support about six mills, each with a capacity of 300 tons per day. (Stanford Research Inst., '59, pp. 270-274.) For the present, the hope is to establish one medium-size mill (200 ton capacity). An operation of this size would employ around 200 men in the mill the year round, and probably 150 to 200 in the woods.

"It is clear that pulpmill prospects are a thin support for faith in new industry as the cure to northern poverty. The mill itself remains a question mark; yet even if construction began this year, the jobs could all be filled with ease by unemployed workers from the south. At best, Indians and Metis might get a share of employment in the woods, although experience in the timber industry suggests that this share would be rather small."

No such intensive studies of the economic problems and prospects of Indians in Northern Alberta have been undertaken, comparable to those quoted from Saskatchewan and Manitoba. The Canadian Shield accounts for a much smaller part of Alberta than of the other two provinces, and so the number and proportion of Indians in physically isolated communities who depend on trapping and fishing, supplemented by relief, and the problems posed by their relocation and re-employment in other industries, are correspondingly smaller. And, as noted earlier, Northern Alberta and British Columbia are, and will be, undergoing major developments -- most notably, the Peace River power and Athabasca tar sands projects -- that will, on paper, generate more than enough new jobs to absorb under-employed Indians in these provinces.

It is misleading, however, to discuss the northern region and the northern Indians and their employment prospects in terms of provincial boundaries. For many Indians, their main opportunities would appear to lie in an east-to-west pattern of mobility to developing centres of new industry. Over the northern region as a whole, as noted, industrial development to date is of a magnitude to employ far more workers than the resident Indians and Metis could provide in numbers alone. Hitherto, the labour employed in these industries has been drawn mainly from the southern regions and from immigrants, while the local people have been largely excluded. Problems of physical distance or unwillingness to move have not been the major barriers facing Indians and Metis. Historically, indeed, many of them have been notably mobile and adaptable, and many today seem little attached, on sentimental or other grounds, to their present localities. The present immobility of Indians is based, rather, on the provision of facilities and services and subsistence on reserves which are unavailable to them on the same basis in non-reserve centres, coupled with special difficulties getting and keeping jobs in such centres, and special difficulties in adjusting to urban life.

A study of this aspect was undertaken in Northern Manitoba on behalf of the Manitoba Government in 1962. Part of the findings, quoted at some length below, are probably applicable to comparable industrial centres throughout the northern region, from Quebec to British Columbia inclusive.

"A number of factors can be pointed to by way of explanation for this failure of Indians and Metis to take full advantage of their potential employment opportunities offered by industrial expansion in Northern Manitoba. Some of these are fairly obvious, others are subtle and complex. In gathering information on this question, we focussed on three companies and the industrial "communities that have grown around them. In seeking information we inter-viewed company officials, union leaders and members, government employees and others. The data they provided all seemed to fit into a fairly consistent picture, which we endeavour to present below. All three companies and indus-trial communities have had experiences in common, as regards Indian and Metis, but each has certain unique features. One of these industrial communities lies within easy commuting distance of a large Indian reserve, while the other two are located some distance away from Indian communities. Of these latter two, one town grew without much planning in its earlier stages, and now appears to have reached its peak. The other is a very carefully planned community that is undergoing rapid growth. Together, these three provide, we feel, a representative picture of the problems to be faced in the 'integration' of Indians and Metis into the modern industrial complex in which the hopes for economic development in Northern Manitoba must lie.

"In two large companies, which have been operating for several decades, 'dozens' of Indians have been employed at one time or another. Large numbers were taken on during and immediately after the war. when there was an acute labour shortage. Very few have remained. Officials of both companies now estimate that there are only 'about a dozen' on their payrolls. The explanations offered are as follows:

"(a) The inability of Indians and Metis, accustomed to seasonal outdoor work with a variable pace of operations, to adjust to jobs in such fields as mining and smelting, or pulp and paper processing, which require regular hours, punctuality, and a highly mechanized routine of work. Working in 8-hour shifts (8 a.m. to 4 p.m.; 4 p.m. to 12 p.m.; 12 p.m. to 8 a.m.) – and shifts which vary for the individual worker from month to month – the Indians and Metis found particularly difficult to get accustomed to. Mining and smelting work, it is stressed, is not like fishing or pulpwood cutting, or railroad maintenance work for that matter. One cannot add variable numbers of workers to an operation, or 'stretch out the job' if shorthanded. Each man has a special job, dealing with certain types of equipment. If a man fails to turn up for the job to relieve the man who has put in a shift, the latter has to stay at it, or another be called, and they have to be paid 'overtime' rates. Tardiness, absenteeism, or quitting without notice, therefore, leads to inefficiency and high labour costs, The experience with most Indians that were employed at one time or another in such operations was that they would quit voluntarily without notice, or be discharged for continual tardiness and absenteeism.

"(b) A number of Indian and Metis workers did, nonetheless, gradually become adjusted to the rigid schedules and requirements of mining and smelting or pulp and paper work. As on the Hudson Bay Railway line, company records show that numerous workers quit work several times, were re-employed, and finally 'settled down' to become 'steady', 'reliable' employees. A number of these, however, were finally 'beaten' by the pressure of the familiar family and kinsfolk obligations, with all the tensions, frictions and anxieties that these tend to create. In some cases the Indian's or Metis' home village was too distant for daily commuting, or for visits home on weekends, without an exorbitant cost to the worker. On the one hand, then, the Indian or Metis who left his wife and family back in the home community, in coming to work in an industrial town, would become lonely, anxious, and frustrated, worrying about his wife 'playing around with other men', or not being able to 'get by' and 'look after the kids' without his help at home. On the other hand, the Indian or Metis (well paid as he was by customary standards) who rented or bought a house in town and brought his family in, or whose reserve community was close enough for commuting, would soon find himself inundated with relatives and others who would 'eat and drink him out of house and home' . No matter how hard and conscientiously he might work and how much money he might earn, he would find himself no further ahead in the long run (or frequently, find that he was getting increasingly in debt). This, of course, is discouraging to individual incentives and morale The reaction of the individual Indian or Metis caught in such circumstances tends to be either: (i) to 'give up', quit his job and revert to the traditional way of life and standard of living based on hunting and trapping, fishing, and relief; or (ii) take to drink to relieve his tensions, and sooner or later be fired for tardiness, absenteeism, careless or inefficient work, (Note: The traditional pressure on the better-paid or more fortunate to 'share' is perhaps particularly strong in situations "like these, where a few secure, well-paid employees have many indigent friends and relatives, and especially where such employees continue to reside in or near their home reserves, among fellow residents who live on a much lower scale, depending on odd seasonal jobs and relief,) Individual cases were cited to us in our survey. in which men averaging $7,000 a year or more, rent-free, found themselves getting steadily further in debt. Alternatively, in a few cases the breadwinner was able to free himself from such pressures only at the expense of virtually severing his and his family's emotional ties with kinsfolk and friends, and facing considerable hostility and ostracism from fellow members of the band. Success for a few individuals does not seem to have served as a 'symbol' of inspiration, to induce others to improve their work habits or strive for higher levels of attainment, Reactions of the less successful tend to be those of rationalization ('he's just lucky' or 'he's got pull') or of resentment (who does he think he is') rather than admiration of a model whose example is worth copying.

"(c) These tendencies on the part of Indians, and to some degree Metis, in turn affect the attitudes of Whites in larger industrial towns. An unfavourable stereotype of the 'native' develops, due to rather glaring examples of drunkenness and prostitution, overcrowding and slum housing, the slatternly appearance of womenfolk, lack of accepted standards of personal cleanliness and sanitation, and the like. Each community seems to have some sort of limit to its willingness or capacity to 'absorb' Indians and Metis, as indicated above in the limited numbers that reside in such towns as Fun Flon, Thompson and Pine Falls. A more or less subtle type of organized pressure or ostracism tends to develop among Whites in such communities, to prevent the rent or sale of housing to Indians or physically recognizable Metis, or their employment in various jobs in the sales or service field that Involve 'meeting the public' This, together with the unfavourable reputation that Indians and Metis tend to have as 'shiftless' and 'unreliable' workers, tends to 'freeze them out' of job opportunities in the multiplicity of secondary and service industries that develop in towns that have developed around one major industry such as mining and smelting or pulp and paper processing,"[1]

The implications of the experiences outlined above seem highly important in regard to employment opportunities for Indians and Metis in new, rapidly expanding industrial communities such as Thompson and, possibly in the future, new towns that may develop around new pulp and paper plants..

Fairly long-established industrial towns such as Fun Flon or Pine Falls in Manitoba, appear to have already achieved most of their potential growth. Their own population supplies most or all of their labour needs except for a few highly specialized personnel who have to be recruited elsewhere. The attitudes and policies towards Indians or Metis tend to jell into certain patterns, owing to long experience.

In a new, rapidly growing community, however, such jelling has not had time to develop, and the potential opportunities for fitting Indians and Metis into new employment would seem greater. Thompson and the Inco mining and smelting operations nearby would seem to warrant special study in this regard.

Inco's huge investment in the complex nickel mining and smelting operations at Thompson, and the rapid growth of the town itself over the past years, has been the most highly publicized showpiece of economic growth in Northern Manitoba. In such developments as these lie the region's main economic hope. A few more such developments, particularly in locations having good mineral prospects such as Island Lake and God's Lake, would make it economically feasible to build railroads and roads or highways into areas now virtually inaccessible by land transportation. Such facilities, in turn, would make it feasible to tap resources (particularly timber) that up to now have been uneconomical to utilize because of distance from markets and impossibly high transportation costs. And, as noted, the mining and smelting industry payroll has a multiplier effect in the variety of secondary and service industries that it can support.

---

[1] S. Jamieson, H. Hawthorn, "The Role of Native People in Industrial Development in Northern Manitoba, 1960-1975", A Report prepared for the Committee on Manitoba's Economic Future, 1962, pp. 169-174.

In purely statistical terms, the town of Thompson alone would seem to offer a potential increase in employment and income opportunities more than enough to meet the needs of Northern Manitoba's entire resident native population. Its present population of 6,000 is expected to grow to possibly 20,000 within a few years. It is safe to say that Indians and Metis have reaped very little benefit from this major development, directly or indirectly (except, as noted, the temporary clearing and construction work in the initial stages).

By far the majority of people now making their living in Thompson have been recruited from Southern Manitoba, or from other Canadian provinces and other countries. Very few Indians and Metis from the surrounding area, as noted above, have managed to get regular employment in the community.

Thompson's development has been very carefully planned and controlled from the outset. Every effort has been made to avoid going through the stage of being a wild mining town. The only access from Southern Manitoba or else-where to Thompson is by air, or via the Hudson Bay Railway through The Pas. Individuals seeking employment with Inco at Thompson must have medical certificates from their place of residence, and are screened again at a company employment office (with medical check-up) at The Pas. Single men, or men separated from their families, are lodged in bunkhouses located near the main smelting operations. As in most mining and smelting communities, there is high turnover among these (the most frequently quoted estimate is about 200 a month).

The main residential and business section with single-family dwellings and duplexes, retail stores and service outlets, and other facilities, is physically separated at some distance from the smelter, company offices and bunkhouses. This, as noted, is a carefully planned town that aspires to high minimum standards of housing, community facilities, and general layout. A limited amount of rental housing is available. Most houses are built and sold by private contractors or realtors, and financed by Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation. A worker, to acquire a house of his own (generally $15,000 and up), has to save up a minimum down payment and finance the balance with a mortgage which the employer will guarantee or underwrite. Inco guarantees such mortgages for its employees where their work records, rates of pay and future prospects seem to warrant obligations assumed.

The company in its employment policies has been careful to avoid any appearance or charge of racial discrimination. (As noted before, it was impossible to get an accurate count of Indians and Metis on the payroll, because in application forms and in employee records on file, it is prohibited by law from asking for or making reference to an employee's racial background or religious affiliations.) Certainly one gets the impression that the residents of Thompson represent a wide variety of ethnic and language backgrounds. Spokesmen of the company emphasize that Indian and Metis applicants for employment are treated on exactly the same basis as representatives of any other group. If they go through the same channels and meet the minimum medical requirements, they are accepted equally for jobs for which their education or training suits them, and their tenure on jobs depends on meeting minimum standards of competence, punctuality, reliability, and so on.

In practice, however, the system is one that tends to virtually exclude most Indians and many Metis from getting employment in Thompson, or from keeping their jobs if accepted. As usual, in such situations, in the course of a survey of this kind one hears numerous charges of deliberate discrimination by Inco and smaller private employers at Thompson against Indians and Metis. The truth of this would be impossible to ascertain without detailed investigation. Indians, and to a lesser extent Metis, tend to be excluded by factors other than hiring policy. Considering the special social, psychological and other disadvantages they face in adjusting to the complexities of urban-industrial life, a policy of complete impartiality, of treating individuals of every racial or ethnic group on an absolutely equal basis in terms of objective medical or technical criteria, tends to mean that many Indians and Metis are rejected in the competition for jobs and living accommodation. There is the familiar difficulty of Indians adjusting to rigid work schedules on shift in a highly mechanized industry. And there is also the familiar problem of loneliness of the individual worker, living in a bunkhouse and separated trom his wife and family on the home reserve (and a visit home is expensive, in so far as in most cases it requires travel by chartered air-plane at 50¢ a mile). Regular full-time employment on a permanent basis, and moving one's family into town, on the other hand, involves saving up a down payment for a house and assuming large and long-term financial obligations, in the form of a 20-year mortgage of $10,000 or $12,000 guaranteed by one's employer. In terms of their standards of living and saving or spending habits, very few Indians or Metis are in a position to assume financial burdens of such size or duration.

Other aspects of a community such as Thompson likewise tend to have the effect of excluding most of the resident native population from surrounding areas. By definition, a planned community (planned on the basis of urban White middle-class or upper working class standards of housing, sanitation, clothing and deportment generally) has no place for Indians or Metis emigrating from semi-isolated reserves or fringe communities that depend on seasonal outdoor employment supplemented by relief at far lower material levels of living. Thus officials responsible for administering the new hospital in Thompson expressed reluctance to accept patients from Indian communities in Northern Manitoba for fear that this would lead to hordes of relatives or friends inundating the town on visits, with all the problems of conflicting standards of behaviour that this would present. Similar opposition for much the same reasons has been expressed to suggestions for establishing residential high schools or vocational training institutes for Indians in Thompson (which would have the advantage of training and familiarizing Indian students or trainees with the techniques, ways and requirements of industrial work and urban living of a type that is rapidly developing in their midst). Spokesmen for a carefully planned community along such lines point to The Pas as the example of an unplanned, disorganized community that the Indians and Metis have taken over and ruined – a pattern that must, they feel, be avoided at all costs.

To the degree that an expanding industry such as mining and smelting and its various tertiary activities fail to absorb native resident workers into employment, this should properly be considered a cost to be assessed against the benefits of industrial expansion for the economy as a whole. How large a net benefit does the province of Manitoba receive if, for every new job created in Thompson a new worker is brought in from outside, while another Indian or Metis has to be supported (at a high cost per capita) on relief? (The cost to the province is perhaps minimal, and the net gain large in the case of Indians, of course. in so far as the federal government meets the cost.)

Other by-products of industrial expansion that operate to the detriment of the local people's interests and livelihoods should or could be considered as costs directly attributable to such expansion. There is, for instance, some depletion of resources on which local residents depend to some degree for their livelihood. Large mining and smelting plants and townsites take up amounts of land formerly used for hunting and trapping; wastes from industrial plants pollute rivers and lakes and cause depletion if fish; flooding large tracts of land and the building of dams, reservoirs and power plants likewise tend to cause depletion of fish and game resources; the building of roads that make new areas accessible to large numbers of people depletes game and fur-bearing animals; and so on.

Again, as noted earlier, the temporary boom in employment and income that new industrial growth during its early stages of development provides for local natives, tends to operate to their disadvantage later on. For a brief period they are able to enjoy relatively high rates of pay and high levels of expenditure while employed on rough construction jobs. These reduce their incentives when they must return to the more difficult and lower-paid activities of fishing, trapping, pulpwood and fuelwood cutting.

And finally, there are the costs of social disorganization and demoralization of large numbers of Indians as another by-product of industrial growth. The International Nickel Company, and the City of Thompson, as described earlier, have been largely able to avoid these costs by a rigorous program of town planning and job selection and placement. To a large extent, the problems created by Inco's and Thompson's growth have been dumped on such communities as The Pas. Large numbers of single males continually come through The Pas for employment in Thompson and other mining and smelting communities. Others come through often with their bankrolls after quitting jobs in the north, or on holiday. For both groups, one of the main attractions of the town seems to be seeking Indian and Metis women. Bootlegging and prostitution, consequently, have the status of service industries in the community, particularly for Indians and Metis, blocked, for various reasons, from other fields of employment and income. But the demoralizing effects of this situation render many of them that much less adaptable to or suited for gainful employment in the urban industries that offer the greatest possibilities of expansion.

Such costs as these and others that could be listed, are now borne almost entirely, directly or indirectly, by governments and taxpayers at all levels: federal, provincial and municipal. To what extent should some of them also be borne by the industries themselves? Such costs might conceivably take the form of requiring that large mining and smelting companies and other private employers be required to hire larger numbers of Indians and Metis for on-the-job training and full-time employment; to provide them rental housing, or credit for purchasing adequate housing, furniture and appliances, as well as full and equal access to and use of community facilities for education, recreation, health, and medical care, etc.; and to provide special personnel for guidance and counselling, to help Indians and Metis from the bush to adjust to the complexities of urban living. Such items would be costs, directly in terms of additional outlays that employers would have to make for such extra facilities and personnel, and indirectly in the form of lower levels of efficiency and output per man hour of Indians and Metis as compared to White workers. From the viewpoint of the economy as a whole, the imposition of such requirements would presumably prevent industrial expansion and economic growth from achieving their full potential in fields like mining and smelting (as it has in trapping, fishing and lumbering).

The answers of employers and company spokesmen to such a suggestion are clear, unequivocal and (on certain assumptions) logical:

> "1. That private industry – particularly in such a risky and competitive field as mining and smelting – should not be expected, singlehanded, to solve the economic and social problems of Indians and Metis (particularly where such problems are, to a large extent, the result of a century or more of inadequate, or misguided, policies of government); and
>
> 2. That, in terms of labour legislation at the federal and provincial levels, as well as in terms of fair or equitable company policy (and written into agreements with unions) employers cannot properly, or legitimately, discriminate between Indians and Metis on the one hand, and Whites on the other (and favouritism or special treatment of the former, it is pointed out, means discrimination against the latter).
>
> Both positions are open to criticism. With regard to the first, we would reiterate the principle enunciated earlier: any private interest operating under a publicly conferred privilege or licence (such as the exclusive right to utilize resources in a particular area for private profit) should be made to bear at least part of the costs (in the form of losses incurred directly or indirectly by the locally resident population as a by-product of such industrial expansion and resource use). With regard to the second point, there are strong arguments for making a special case for Indians and, to some degree, Metis. Because of their backgrounds, the system of administration under which they are governed, their distinct way of life, and the unfavourable stereotypes and attitudes they have to face in White communities, Indians and Metis operate at a special disadvantage in most labour markets, and have special problems of adjustment to the complexities of urban-industrial life. Where they are forced to compete on a basis of equality with other groups (on the basis of criteria of technical or social adequacy defined by the White majority) they must lose. In a word, equality of opportunity and free competition by our standards ensures that Indians and Metis will fail and equality in a more final

> sense can be achieved only if this minority is given special consideration and special preparation for competing on an equal basis with Whites and others for jobs, housing and other facilities."

In brief, expanding industrial communities such as Thompson seem crucial to improving the economic welfare and integration of the Indian and Metis population of such regions as Northern Manitoba. The process of employing and absorbing any large and growing numbers in the near future, however, poses many complex and subtle problems. The efforts and costs involved cannot be expected to be assumed entirely by mining and smelting companies and other private employers. They will require, rather, careful planning, a share in financing, and close cooperation among government agencies at all levels, private employers, and various representative institutions and organizations (churches, trade unions, service clubs, and the like). Some of the more specific steps that could or should be taken to this end are discussed in the following chapter as part of the overall problem of fitting Indians and Metis into urban industrial life and work.

If an adequately large and comprehensive program were undertaken along such lines, there would seem to be no sound reason why distance or provincial boundaries, as such, should create any severe barrier to the migration and reestablishment of Indians in new employment. It would probably prove economical, in the long run, to assist relatively large numbers of Indians to move hundreds of miles from their present locations in depressed areas such as Northeastern Manitoba to centres of industrial expansion in Northern Ontario, to Northwestern Manitoba from Northern Saskatchewan, the Northwest and Yukon Territories to Northern Alberta and British Columbia, and the like.

(c) The Southern and Central Prairies

A number of Indian communities in the southern and central Prairie region present a special problem for which there is no easy solution.

The Prairie region generally presents a problem of over-population, in terms of the numbers of people that can be adequately supported by a predominantly agricultural economy, if optimum-size farming operations were generally adopted Reflecting this relative over-population, the provinces of Manitoba and Saskatchewan (and Alberta until the late 1940's) have experienced since the 1920's and particularly since World War II, large losses of population through migration to Ontario, British Columbia and various parts of the United States. Despite these losses of population numbering in the hundreds of thousands, mainly from rural areas, the region is still characterized by excessive numbers of marginal or sub-marginal farms, too small in terms of acreage and capital investment to be operated efficiently enough to provide adequate returns on the labour and capital expended. Many such farm operations have had to be subsidized, therefore, partly from government expenditures and partly from the farm operators' earnings from labour in other industries.

Among the most economically depressed and dependent bands in the country, as noted before, are a number in the Prairie region. Most of them have too little land to support their members adequately on an agricultural basis and do not utilize what land they have at anything near peak efficiency. Alternative employment opportunities are generally lacking for the residents in the region because of limited industrialization in the region, the existence of an already surplus under-employed White population, and excessive competition for jobs in cities and towns.

In view of this larger picture, the conclusion seems unavoidable that Indians will need the opportunity to participate with Whites in the general migration of surplus rural population to other regions having more remunerative job opportunities. Otherwise the Indians will remain, as they have for decades, a depressed group having no meaningful economic role to play in an increasingly large-scale farm economy, To facilitate such migration, of course, would require a large and comprehensive program of special training and financing of Indians.

(d) The Maritimes

Essentially the same conclusions would seem to apply to the few thousand Indians in the Maritime Provinces. This region, of course – particularly New Brunswick – generally has the highest rates of unemployment and the lowest per capita incomes in Canada. Here the basic problems are depletion of resources (especially tither), obsolescence (especially coal), and distance and high transportation costs from major potential markets. Barring massive federal investments and expenditures on an unprecedented scale, coupled with large subsidies and other inducements to entice outside capital to invest in the region, one can see little prospect for substantial improvement in the economic position of the Maritime population, White or Indian.

(e) Other Rural Areas

In a number of other areas besides those mentioned, there are numerous bands that own or have access to large areas of land suitable for farming, while a large proportion of their members are unemployed and dependent on relief. It seems only reasonable, therefore, that idle people and unused resources should be brought together in workable combinations to produce some employment and income for the residents. A major part of the Indian Affairs Branch program for economic development hitherto has consisted of such local resource projects. Farming, in particular, has accounted for much of the Branch's expenditures of capital and the time and effort of its personnel.

The merits of such a policy are, at best, questionable. It is not sound economic policy, under all circumstances, to utilize fully any or all unused resources available. Sound economic policy, rather, consists of allocating labour and capital to those activities that offer the highest rates of return per unit of expenditure. In the nature of the case, it is often economically sound policy to leave resources unused where the returns of labour and capital are inadequate as compared to other potential uses.

Encouragement of Indians to farm seems a particularly inappropriate policy in all but a few cases. Despite the fact that the total number of people engaged in farming in Canada fell by 21 per cent from 1951 to 1961, while the population as a whole increased by more than one-third, in no industry is there such a large number of uneconomically small, submarginal, low-income operators and low-paid labourers. As noted before, in most types of farming today the most efficient unit of operation is large and growing rapidly in terms of acreage and even more in the size of capital investment required for up-to-date plant, machinery, equipment and livestock. Increasing numbers of small-scale family farmers are able to survive only by the help of government subsidies and by engaging in outside wage employment.

Indians, with few exceptions, have shown lack of preference or aptitude for farming. Replies in the Resources Questionnaire and other reports from the Indian Affairs Branch personnel show in almost every case that the members of bands with tracts of farmland have failed to utilize them to the full and in many reserves farming has been abandoned entirely. Some critics blame the Indian Affairs Branch for not providing a sufficient corps of properly qualified agricultural experts to provide adequate training of Indians in efficient farming operations. A far more important reason for the failure, however, probably lies in attitudes of apathy or disinterest among Indians to farming as a way of life. This is indicated by the figures presented in Table III, Chapter V, as to reasons for the failure of Indians to utilize local resources. As indicated in the table, the reasons most often mentioned are "attitudes of reserve residents" (18) and "attractiveness of wage employment" (16), as compared to "educational level of Indians " (15) and "lack of vocational training" (12). In any case, at a time when many skilled, experienced and highly motivated White farmers are finding it increasingly difficult to make an adequate livelihood, it seems doubtful that an expensive program for training and financing large numbers of Indians to engage in farming would be an economically justifiable investment. In the majority of cases an equal investment of money, time and personnel to help them re-establish themselves in other occupations and centres of wage employment would contribute far more to their economic development.

In some bands, of course, there are individuals who have special aptitudes or capacities for farming. Where the land is available to them economically, they should be given aid and encouragement to operate on the most efficient basis possible. Such individuals, however, are a small proportion of the total Indian population and can contribute little to their general economic development.

CHAPTER X

CONCLUSIONS ON THE MAJOR ECONOMIC ISSUES

Introduction

Some of the criticisms and recommendations presented below are, or soon will be, out of date. They are based on some familiarity with the Indian Affairs Branch structure and operations – particularly of its Economic Development Division – at the time this study was undertaken, early in 1964. Already hardly more than a year later at time of writing (Summer, 1965), the Indian Affairs Branch has undergone a considerable reorganization in structure, launched new programs with a considerably different emphasis in policy than has applied hitherto, and added new personnel. A number of the recommendations outlined below, therefore, may turn out to be mere endorsements of policies that the Indian Affairs Branch is already in the process of instituting or is even now carrying out. The first section of this chapter is broadly descriptive and discursive in dealing with a number of controversial questions of policy concerning Indians and the Indian Affairs Administration. The purpose is to provide some background explanation for the recommendations that follow. Most of the points raised here, as well as others derived from preceding chapters, are summarized and listed in more condensed form in Section B.

A. General Observations

Administration

The annual budget of the Indian Affairs Branch has increased several times over since the war. In general, it appears to have grown far more rapidly than most other branches of the federal government. This should not, however, obscure the fact that the budget is still far from adequate to undertake development required to bring the Indians to a status approximately equal with Whites, economically and socially. The present backwardness and depressed economic and social status of most Indians reflects, in large part, the past failures of governments at all levels to invest enough money in, and commit enough personnel and time to, their development economically and socially.

To present some very broad and crude comparisons: the budget of the Indian Affairs Branch was a little over $60 million last year, or approximately $300 for every Indian. To this should be added the approximately $20 million budget of the Indian Health Services. This is the budget to provide facilities and services to a minority comparable to those provided to more than nineteen million other Canadians by government agencies. By comparison, the total federal government budget in 1964 was $6,550 million, including $3,042 million for goods and services, $2,235 million for transfer payments, $995 million for interest on bonded indebtedness and $278 million for subsidies; provincial and municipal expenditures combined for these categories were, respectively, $5,565 million, $1,924 million, $937 million and $39 million (Canadian Statistical Review, July, 1965). All told, total government expenditures at all levels amounted in 1964 to $14,376 million for Canada's 19.4 million people, or about $740 per capita, as compared to the Indian Affairs Branch's expenditures of about $300 per capita for Indians alone, a rate of almost 2:1.

Obviously, of course, such figures above present a distorted picture in some respects: (1) Defense expenditures alone account for about $1,500 million of the Federal Budget, and these should be viewed as a charge against the population of the country as a whole. On the other hand, Indians, in view of their location and the types of jobs they specialize in, probably get very little benefit, directly or indirectly, from the jobs and incomes generated by defense expenditures. Similar observations would apply to a number of other types of items, such as foreign trade, law and order, and the like; (2) similarly, in the large item of $2,235 million federal expenditures for transfer payments, Indians may be assumed to be benefiting, at least equally with Whites, from such items as family allowances, old age assistance and pension payments (which are over and above expenditures by the Indian Affairs Branch); (3) similarly, Indians may be presumed to benefit from numerous provincial and municipal expenditures, for which neither they nor the Indian Affairs Branch are held directly chargeable such as roads and highways, law enforcement, and conservation and development of natural resources.

Allowing for all these, however, it is still true that a large and perhaps major part of public expenditures at all three levels is for facilities and services for which the vast majority of Indians, because of their geographic and social isolation, ignorance, lack of training, or other reasons, are unable to make any significant use. Our universities are an outstanding example, and much the same generalization would apply to a wide list of other public facilities and services, in the category of social capital that are heavily concentrated in the cities and towns of the nation, in which reside only a small fraction of the Indian population but a major part of the population as a whole.

Much the same generalization applies to privately financed and managed business or industrial operations. A common estimate is that it takes, on the average, a capital investment of about $10,000 to create one new job, ranging from a few hundred dollars in small-scale retail or service operations to $50,000 or more in highly automated operations such as oil refining. By far the major part of privately owned facilities and services in stores, office buildings, industrial plants and other outlets is likewise concentrated in larger cities and towns in which, in the aggregate, most of the nation*s people reside. With these facilities most Indians have little or no contact whether as employees, customers or clients.

In general, then, most Whites have lived and worked most of their lives in complex environments in which there have been investments in the tens of thousands of dollars per capita, in private and public facilities, and annual per capita expenditures in the thousands. Most Indians, by contrast, live and work in relatively simple environments that have involved investments of a few hundred – or at most a few thousand – dollars per capita, and annual per capita expenditures in the hundreds of dollars.

All told, therefore, any program that is seriously designed to raise the Indian population to a level of competitive equality with Whites will have to be a truly massive undertaking by comparison with the limited bits-and-pieces program that has been followed hitherto. There is a tremendous job of catching up to do, owing to decades of previous neglect. One cannot expect it to be done with the limited budget that the Indian Affairs Branch has been getting. We must expect that it will cost thousands of dollars per capita, and hundreds of millions per annum in the aggregate, to provide Indians with the facilities and services needed to bring them up to White standards. Part of this increased expenditure will be necessary to provide more and better capital, public facilities, technical aid and other services to the areas in which they now reside. A larger and increasing part will be required to bring them to the capital – that is, to finance the training and conditioning, movement and relocation of increasing numbers of Indians from their present areas of residence to industrial or business centres in which the main opportunities for economic growth exist.

Anything less than a massive program on some such scale is likely to be inadequate. It may provide maintenance but certainly not much in the way of development. Economic development of Indians in Canada, in brief, should perhaps be viewed essentially as one special part of the government's war on poverty. It will require many of the same programs, involving special educational and training facilities, travel and rehabilitation grants, and the like. But it would also require special provisions of its own, in so far as Indians present a special aspect of the larger problem of poverty in this country.

Much of this past neglect of Indians has been due to the rather isolated and anomalous position of the Indian Affairs Branch in the governmental structure. On the implicit assumption that it could look after its own, it has frequently been ignored or by-passed by governments at all levels. As separate enclaves under federal jurisdiction within the various provinces, Indian bands have failed to receive many of the benefits of provincial expenditures in such fields as education, public works and resource development projects. On the other hand, owing perhaps to inadequate liaison or pressure from the Indian Affairs Branch on other departments in Ottawa, bands have also failed to receive benefits from numerous federal-matching grants to the provinces and municipalities. An outstanding example is the Prairie Farm Rehabilitation Act. From the mid-thirties to the mid-sixties, more than $800 million of federal funds were expended on this program -- and in other provinces besides the Prairies. No Indian band received any funds from it until a couple of years ago, and then only a few thousand dollars.

The Indian Affairs Branch has established much better liaison with other governmental agencies at all levels in recent years. This has been particularly noticeable in the fields of education and welfare at the provincial level, and in various Federal-provincial and Federal-municipal cost-sharing arrangements, such as the Winter Works Program. It is to be hoped that the Branch will have a high priority in any funds allocated to various agencies for the program of the war on poverty.

Indian Affairs Branch

The economic development program of the Indian Affairs Branch and the structure, policies and objectives of its special Economic Development Division appear to he inadequate and inappropriate in several important respects. (Note: To repeat, the criticisms that follow apply to the situation as of early 1964. There have been significant modifications since then.)

(1) The total budget of the Indian Affairs Branch, as noted earlier, is wholly inadequate in relation to the responsibilities it is called upon to undertake on behalf of Indians. And within this context, the annual budget and personnel allotted to the Economic Development Division are inadequate and out of balance with other major aspects of Indian Affairs Branch Administration. To put the picture into some sort of focus: Out of the total Indian Affairs Branch budget of some $62 million in 1964, about $30 million, or one-half, was spent on education, and another $20 million on welfare. The new Community Development Program in 1964 was budgeted for $3.5 million over a three-year period.

The Economic Development Program, by comparison, was budgeted for only $1.5 million per annum (or about $7 per capita for the 200,000 Indians across Canada). Capital items, as distinct from the annual operating expenses, account for possibly another million a year.

Just how inadequate this is may be judged in relation to the fact noted earlier, that each additional job created in the economy as a whole is estimated to require an average capital investment of some $8 - $10,000.

(2) The main time and effort of its personnel appears to have been devoted to what might be called economic caretaking or maintenance rather than economic development. This is perhaps mainly a carryover of the traditional role of the Indian Affairs Branch as a trustee or caretaker of the Indians as its special responsibility. At any rate, many of the personnel are engaged merely in keeping accounts and records of such matters as land titles and leases; band fund revenues and expenditures; loans and grants; etc.

(3) There is far too much emphasis on the resource industries from which Indians have in the past derived much of their livelihood; namely, game (including trapping), fish, farming and forestry, and far too little on industry and commerce, in the broad sense, and outside wage employment. This is clearly brought out in the structure of the Economic Development Division. There is a head with an assistant for each of the four resource industry divisions listed above, as well as for Engineering and Mineral resources (including oil and gas). There is, however, no division head or other personnel for industrial or commercial development (though there is a placement division head).

This emphasis, as noted earlier, shows up clearly in the Resources Questionnaire which the Economic Development Division prepared and circulated to all agency superintendents to complete.

(4) Another improvement in the structure and program of the Economic Development Division would come not only from an increase in funds and in personnel generally for various functions, but also in trained professional personnel in key positions. Of the special branches with the Division at the Ottawa headquarters, only the heads of the Mineral Branch and the Engineering Branch are qualified professional specialists in their respective fields. The first Chief of the Economic Development Division was an administrator of long experience in the Indian Affairs Branch, and he has recently been transferred to another administrative post. Ideally, the chief should be a professional economist, who has had some years of practical experience in the field of economic development. In addition to the lack of an Industry and Commerce Branch within the Division, there is also lacking an Economics Research staff. The personnel in each branch of the Division are engaged in dealing with detailed records and accounts, requests for funds, proposed projects in different communities drawing up budgets, etc. almost exclusively within their own particular area of jurisdiction, Personnel in one branch seem to have little or no idea of what those in other branches are doing. There is no research staff whose job it is to correlate the data accumulated from the various branches, let alone gather other useful data that are not accumulated by present methods -- and put them together into a coherent overall view, Such a staff is needed, responsible directly to the Division Chief to provide the material on which a workable, properly balanced and dynamic economic program could be built. Much of the same deficiencies in size and professional qualifications of staff seem to apply at the regional and local levels.

These weaknesses, again, come to light in the questionnaire which is designed to provide a complete "inventory of human and material resources" of Indian bands across the country. Not only are some aspects overemphasized and other important ones ignored, as noted earlier, but some of the questions asked also require, for an adequate answer, knowledge or experience that many agency superintendents or their assistants are not likely to have. A really adequate survey of the resources, income and employment potentials would require teams of qualified specialists to visit and assess virtually every band in the country.

In general, an improvement in personnel in the Indian Affairs Branch, particularly in its economic development program, would appear to come from an abandonment of a policy of relative isolation and self-containment. Staff for key positions appear to be recruited from within, based on their administrative experience and skill in the Branch, rather than for their expertise or professional training and qualifications for the special functions they are called upon to perform.

(5) The Division's program for economic development appears to have lacked any sort of overall consistency or central theme. It appears to consist of innumerable small bits-and-pieces of local resource development projects -- a fishery here, a logging project there, and a land clearing or fur conservation program somewhere else. Most of these appear to be in the category of make-work or employment-relief programs, designed primarily for the bands suffering the worst degrees of unemployment and dependency.

The extreme emphasis on development of resource industry seems, on the whole, inappropriate for any program of economic development for Indians. Long-term employment prospects in these industries have been declining for several decades, This decline was particularly pronounced during the 1950's, and shows every prospect of continuing. While total employment in Canada increased by 21.6 per cent from 1951 to 1961, employment in trapping and fishing fell by 30.2 per cent, in logging by 21.4 per cent, and in agriculture by 21.9 per cent. Even these figures under-estimate the true picture, for there is considerable underemployment in these fields – that is, excessive numbers of submarginal operators or workers earning inadequate incomes, whose removal from production would, if anything, increase total output by facilitating larger-scale, more efficient operations. By contrast, employment in such fields as construction, sales and service trades increased by more than one-third during this period. Any developmental program for Indians in the resource industries, therefore, can be at best only a sort of holding action to enable decreasing numbers to derive their livelihoods from this source, while the main avenue of improvement in the economic status of Indians must lie in speeding up their absorption into outside wage employment.

(6) As against the prevailing emphasis on local resource industries, there appears to be a special need to expand the employment placement program and personnel. At present, there is every indication that this aspect of the Indian Affairs Branch's economic development program is badly under-staffed. There is one division head and an assistant at the national headquarters in Ottawa, while most provincial regional headquarters in each province have one or two only.

According to the most experienced and successful placement officers in the Branch, the optimum revolving case load is about fifty. The officers must interview job applicants or prospects and judge their aptitudes and capabilities; maintain adequate liaison with the business community generally, and interview individual employers as to job prospects and requirements; follow employees for a year or two after they are placed (i.e. handle their grievances and problems of adjustment; intercede with the employer when troublesome issues arise; and so on). From a purely economic standpoint, a considerable expansion in the placement staff would be a profitable investment, for every Indian placed successfully in permanent employment represents not only a saving in welfare costs but a contribution of hundreds of dollars in income taxes as well. From the experience of several years of placement work in Southern Ontario, officials in the Indian Affairs Branch headquarters in that region alone estimate that they could fully utilize at least eight to ten more such personnel or, ideally at least, one such officer for every major urban industrial centre having a sizeable Indian population within a twenty-five to fifty mile radius. To an increasing extent, furthermore, personnel in this area are having to place Indians migrating from Northern Ontario and from other provinces.

The above applies mainly to Indians placed in permanent employment, largely in manufacturing, service and clerical or office work in a highly industrialized region like Southern Ontario. In other provinces a much larger number and proportion of placements will continue to be for some time in temporary or seasonal jobs in such fields as land clearing and construction, logging and sawmilling, railway and highway maintenance. Presumably the follow-up time would be less and the optimum case load larger, The need for more trained personnel is as urgent, however, for temporary or seasonal employment in such fields is often the first experience of Indians in wage employment away from their reserves and the first experience of employers in hiring Indians. It is important, therefore, that everything possible be done to make the experience satisfactory to both sides, In many cases, shortages of personnel have led the Indian Affairs Branch to place Indians in employment simply by recruiting the number an employer requests without adequate interviewing and selection beforehand, and sending them off to the job with little or no follow-up. The result has often been dissatisfaction, high turnover and quitting without notice on the part of the Indians, and a prejudice on the part of the employers against hiring Indians again.

(a) This recently valid criticism of the Indian Affairs Branch's economic development policy is likewise somewhat out of date at this point for some provinces. In British Columbia, for instance, the Branch has placed major emphasis on job placement rather than local resource development. Where last year (1964) it had only two placement officers on its staff, this year it has positions open for no less than twelve, nine of which have been filled to date. These men have had some notable achievements to their credit. In one case, a contractor working on the major Peace River power project last year asked for 150 Indian workers. The Branch placement officer in Williams Lake visited by helicopter more than a dozen Indian bands over a wide area, recruited the work crew, arranged for their transportation and for providing them with power saws, etc. The contractor found them so satisfactory that this year he asked the Branch to recruit more than 200 for another major clearing operation. The placement officer has been ordered to stay on the project to follow up the placement.

(b) The Branch also has recently established what would appear to be a rational division of function as follows: (1) the placement division, and placement officers in each region are responsible for attempting to place Indians in unskilled or semi-skilled categories in wage employment. Most of such placements, as noted, have been in seasonal or temporary jobs, in such industries as clearing and construction, logging and sawmilling; and (2) the placement of the relatively few Indians who have taken special education and training that qualify them for skilled manual, white collar or service jobs, has been transferred to the education division.

Notable gains have been achieved in both areas, They still leave uncovered, however, what would appear to be the largest and most important single area of potential new employment opportunities for Indians -- that is, semiskilled (and, in time, skilled) full-time employment in industrial plants, business firms and offices, and service establishments in small or medium-sized industrial towns and business centres that are within relatively easy access of large under-employed Indian populations. In dozens of such centres across the country one can observe business and industrial growth and new job opportunities developing, while around each centre, within a radius of fifty or 100 miles, are numerous impoverished Indian bands with total populations in the thousands, The town of Kenora is an extreme example of this. The economic role of Indians in such communities appears to be, at best, that of casual, temporary and unwelcome visitors, customers and spectators of White society.

The Indian Affairs Branch has been widely criticized hitherto on the grounds that its program in general, along many lines of policy, has been one that encourages Indians to stay on their reserves, rather than to work and live outside. The Indian who stays on his reserve can get financial assistance to build a home for himself and family; if he leaves, he has to shift for himself and find what quarters he can. On the reserve, the Indian family is assured minimum relief and welfare, medical and health services and facilities; when he and his family leave the reserve, the Indian Affairs Branch, faced with a limited budget, tends to take the position that the Indians are the responsibility of provincial and municipal governments and, at best, will merely recompense the latter for services rendered to Indians who have retained their band membership and Indian status.

What is suggested is that, in so far as the economic development of Indians lies primarily in wage and salaried employment, and that for most Indians such employment lies beyond commuting distance of their reserves, a large and increasing part of an expanded Indian Affairs Branch budget should be used to support Indians who wish to leave their reserves. The first priority of the housing budget should be for Indians who wish to take their families with them to new centres of job opportunities -- and housing aid for these should be made more liberal than those for reserve residents, because acceptable standards of housing for most urban White working-class and middle-class residents are considerably above those acceptable on most reserves. If provincial and municipal government agencies are willing and able to provide educational, health, welfare and other necessary facilities and services to Indians superior to those that the Branch can provide, well and good. If not – depending upon the policies of particular provincial governments – then the Branch should be provided with a budget and personnel to supply such facilities and services on its own, even if the individual province be expected to assume such responsibilities.

Special Problem Areas

As stressed before, there is a wide diversity in resources and job opportunities available to different Indian bands, and a wide variety of socio-psychological factors, attitudes and behaviour patterns operating within and around different band communities. Even when the bands are grouped more or less arbitrarily into broad categories, each of these calls for a considerable variation in emphasis in programs designed to encourage greater economic development.

Semi-Isolated Northern Bands

The Indian communities that face some of the most urgent and difficult problems of economic development appear to be the numerous bands scattered throughout the vast northern belt of the country, encompassing most of Quebec, Ontario and Manitoba, roughly the northern one-third of Saskatchewan and one-quarter of Alberta, a smaller fraction of British Columbia in terms of Indian population, and virtually all of the Yukon and Northwest Territories. Among this large group are found the lowest levels of education and of marketable skills, the highest proportions of illiteracy and inability to communicate in English; among the most serious problems of malnutrition and disease, due to substandard housing and diet; and overall, among the highest rates of unemployment and dependency. Here, literally dozens of bands which formerly sustained themselves on a hunting, trapping and fishing economy have rapidly been abandoning their former means of livelihood and becoming dependent mainly on relief. In some cases this has been due to population outrunning the resources available. In other cases it has been due to a combination of circumstances – insufficient technical knowledge and inefficient methods; inadequate or obsolete equipment; loss of mobility due to educational requirements and to new health and welfare services; or in general, an inability to derive as large a real income from the traditional means of livelihood as can be received from relief and welfare generally.

The longer the present trend continues, the progressively more serious the cost will be in growing demoralization, unemployability, poverty and dependency, for proficiency in such activities as hunting, trapping and fishing is to a large extent a matter of long experience, of detailed knowledge of one's environment, and of familiarity with the habits and behaviour patterns of fish and wildlife. Many Indians are losing or have failed to acquire proficiency in such activities.

These are, of course, broad generalizations, the validity of which vary greatly among different areas and bands across the whole northern belt. Appropriate policies to encourage economic development would vary accordingly.

The most detailed study of a broad northern area, encompassing numerous bands of Indians as well as Metis, was carried out by Buckley, Kew and Hawley during 1961-62, in Northern Saskatchewan. This area has probably a higher proportion of depressed and dependent households in this group than any other of comparable size in the northern belt. In their study, they made a series of some twenty-two detailed recommendations, attacking the whole question of development on a broad front in numerous potential fields of employment opportunity. Some of their findings and recommendations are appropriate primarily to the Northern Saskatchewan area and population, with its own special characteristics and problems but many would be generally applicable throughout the whole northern belt. They are summarized in condensed form, as follows:

The Mining Industry

1. That a program of on-the-job training be instituted immediately.

2. That the present program of prospector assistance be revised and enlarged to provide for;

    (a) more participation by Indians and Metis;
    (b) more intensive and advanced training;
    (c) paid employment for some graduates of prospectors' schools.

3. That mineral exploration be further assisted as a means to create jobs in the short run as well as to increase production in the long run. Specifically, it is suggested that the mapping and survey program of the Department of Mineral Resources be extended, and the road to Reindeer Lake be built immediately.

The Forest Industries

4. That short courses for lumbermen be established in conjunction with credit for the purpose of purchasing power saws and other equipment.

5. That government-sponsored sawmill operations be expanded.

6. That programs of forest management and silviculture be greatly expanded.

7. That a new forest protection service be established, providing permanent employment for at least fifty men.

Mink Ranching

8. That the government institute a developmental program aimed not simply at promoting the growth of the industry, but at establishing Indians and Metis as mink ranchers. A specific target of fifty new ranchers over the next ten years is suggested.

9. That the development program for the mink ranching industry include the following;

    (a) extension services to new and established ranches;
    (b) establishment services – loans and training;
    (c) research and investigation, to include problems of ranch efficiency and low-cost operation, as well as animal husbandry.

Agriculture

10. That the agricultural potential of the north be given official recognition and a new approach to agricultural development be devised.

11. That an agricultural development program aimed at establishing men as farmers be instituted at Cumberland House and in the Buffalo region.

12. That a northern Saskatchewan development plan provide for a thorough and comprehensive study of all aspects of northern agriculture.

13. That small-scale agricultural activities be fostered in all parts of the northern region.

Government Service

14. That measures be devised to open the door to Indians and Metis for all government jobs in the north.

    These would include:

    (1) easing the requirements of the Public Service Commission;
    (2) enlisting the cooperation of all government agencies in the north;
    (3) establishing a training program based on their staff requirements.

Other Industries

15. That an employment and job placement service be established for the northern area.

16. That a school for guides be established at La Ronge, aimed at raising the status of the occupation and the earnings of participants through imposition of professional standards. The organization of a guides' association and restrictions on licenses should follow as quickly as possible.

17. That government encourage and foster business enterprise, whether large or small, by means of preliminary surveys and analysis of prospects; through financial assistance when needed, and by rendering every possible assistance in marketing.

18. That the Community Workshop at La Ronge be granted loan funds and other assistance as required, and that an effort be made to give as large a role as possible to the Indian and Metis workers. Studies should be undertaken to determine additional marketable products.

19. That assistance be given to the Northern Cooperative Handicraft Association in order that it may exploit more effectively a growing market for handicrafts. Specifically, there should be (1) loan of capital, (2) a full-time manager, (3) training of workers, (4) exploration of new lines of production, (5) more assistance in marketing.

20. That the economic potential of the peat moss industry be given official recognition and that government proceed to:

    (a) determine the feasibility of a crown corporation or a cooperative for the production and marketing of peat moss from the northern region;

    (b) explore the feasibility of a program which would combine attention to the needs of private operators with measures designed to increase employment of Indians and Metis.

Special Projects

21. That the cooperative housing project designed by the Northern Affairs Branch be given all necessary support and high priority in programming.

22. That the present program of municipal works be extended to cover more villages and a greater number of projects. Continued coordination with the Federal Municipal Winter Works Program is desirable.

23. That measures be devised without delay which can deal with the particularly depressed situation of the people of La Loche.[1]

While the present Report would generally endorse the majority of these recommendations as the product of an intensive study of a special area (and designed essentially for provincial government action) for most northern regions, certain types of programs would seem to merit a special emphasis, as follows:

1. In view of this general situation of over-population and rapid growth relative to employment opportunities from locally available resources, it would seem logical to give the highest priority in policy to a concerted program for making possible the training and re-settlement of all Indians in such bands who appear capable of being trained and adjusted to working and living in other, mainly urban, communities. It would be of particular importance to focus on young people in their

---

[1] The Indians and Metis of Northern Saskatchewan, Centre for Community Studies, Saskatchewan, 1963, pp. 57-59.

teens, and young couples in their twenties with children of grade school or pre-school age. Not only are these younger groups likely to be more amenable to education and training at the high school and vocational school levels, but their emigration would also reduce the rate of population increase in their band communities.

As noted elsewhere (and as analysed more fully in a later section of this Report) the Indian Affairs Branch in recent years has been undertaking an ambitious program of providing transportation and living expenses to qualified young Indians from northern communities, to reside in southern cities and towns and take secondary or high school education and post-secondary technical or professional education, as well as upgrading classes to prepare them for apprenticeships or formal vocational training programs in various occupations. Because of serious deficiencies in the educational backgrounds of many or most Indians in northern communities, the number able to participate in such programs appears to fall far short of the rapidly increasing numbers who are reaching working age each year. Presumably, this problem can be solved only over a fairly extended period of years. It will require, presumably, larger expenditures for education at the primary level in the home reserves, together with special educational personnel, special programs, and various special supportive services in homes and communities, to meet such educational deficiencies,

Preparing these younger Indians for working and living in an urban industrial environment, as noted earlier, would require not only academic education or vocational training, but also the services of placement officers for liaison, consultation and follow-up, and for families, the services of home economists and social welfare counsellors, and special financial aid for housing.

2. Among the employable adults above twenty-five to thirty years of age, probably only a minority would be found suitable for resettlement in urban environments, due to the special difficulties that would be encountered in living in an urban environment (though every effort should be made to identify those who would be suitable). For Indians in this category, an intensive program of training and capital assistance would be required to enable them to utilize more efficiently the resources available to them, such as to provide a level of income and standard of living high enough to induce them to work rather than stay on relief. This would require such measures as the following:

(a) Training in certain basic skills, essential for making an adequate livelihood in isolated communities (e.g. motor mechanics; carpentry and plumbing and other basic construction jobs; and for women, cooking, nutrition and household maintenance). An adequate training program of this kind would require a corps of vocational training teachers who would travel to various Indian communities to give courses of the requisite length to the residents. Such training programs would, or could, serve several purposes in such communities, such as:

(i) Enable Indians to build and maintain better houses for themselves;

(ii) Enable Indians to build, repair and maintain buildings required by the Indian Affairs Branch, by storekeepers, and by medical health services, and other government services rather than incurring the added expense of importing highly paid labour from outside; and

(iii) Fit more Indians to take advantage of new employment opportunities that may develop within fairly easy access of their band communities. (In recent years, as noted, a number of new industrial or resource development projects have been undertaken in hitherto isolated northern areas in which Indians have been the sole residents (e.g. Peace River power project in British Columbia; Athabaska Oil Sands in Alberta; Inco's Thompson Project in Manitoba; etc.) Such projects offer opportunities for well-paid and temporary construction jobs in the initial phase, and permanent jobs in the final processing phase, and in the communities that develop around such projects. To date, Indians have been employed to only a very limited degree in such developments.)

(b) Provision on a liberal loan basis of up-to-date equipment and facilities to increase the productivity of Indians in hunting, fishing, and trapping. There may, indeed, be good grounds for renting equipment or providing it outright in whole or in part, on condition that it is adequately maintained and fully utilized. It is an unwise principle generally to subsidize producers in economic activities that are sub-marginal and low-income. In the case of many Indian families in isolated communities, however, there may be no alternative. Subsidization may be the only means for keeping them active and maintaining morale and avoiding the progressive demoralization that occurs with prolonged idleness and dependency.

One of the main requirements appears to be equipment or facilities that will increase the mobility of Indians engaged in trapping, to enable them to move to more distant under-trapped areas having plentiful supplies of game and fur-bearing animals. Such facilities would include, for instance, snowmobiles and outboard motors for canoes, and, in strategic areas, available to several bands, airplanes; also storage facilities such as walk-in freezers.

Along with such facilities, expert personnel appear to be needed in many communities to train Indians in better methods of processing and care of their produce (such as filleting fish and dressing skins).

(c) Community development would play a necessary, but subsidiary, role in any such programs. The prior need is economic development, which requires intensive training in various techniques and a sizable investment of capital in each band community. Community development may be viewed primarily as an instrument for imbuing members of each community with the motivation, energy and will to take advantage of such services and facilities for their own betterment. Related to this is the objective of encouraging the community to mobilize the energies and talents of the members to engage in collective projects of the social capital type that will contribute to their economic development and higher real income. As noted before, one is struck in visiting such reserves by the combination of idle people and unused resources, in a situation of poverty. Properly equipped and organized hunting and fishing expeditions, fuel gathering, kitchen gardening and building projects of various kinds, could add greatly to the real income, comfort and welfare of most such Indian communities.

3. The recommendations in 1. and 2. above involve providing basic skills, equipment and facilities to all employable adults residing in Indian communities.

In addition to these, there appears to be considerable scope for developing a variety of specialized skills and services that could provide remunerative full-time employment for numbers of Indians – as well as training-grounds for larger numbers in the future – in the larger northern Indian bands.

A widely noted feature of most northern Indian bands is the almost complete absence of specialization and division of labour. Virtually all the population are engaged in hunting, fishing and trapping, or they are on relief. A few rudimentary skills ancillary to these are used by each household for itself, and for anything beyond this, the household and the community depend on goods or services imported from the outside, at an exorbitant cost because of time and distance. This whole system becomes more economically inefficient and costly as Indians become more and more dependent upon power-driven equipment for various purposes: power saws, and outboard motors, snowmobiles, bombardiers, automatic pumps, steam boilers and diesel motors, down to household appliances such as washing machines, and personal items such as transistor radios. When the machine fails to work, the individual owner attempts to repair it himself, ordering the parts from outside individually, at high cost. If he is unable to fix it, the machine may be abandoned prematurely or be sent outside to be repaired at high cost (except at odd times when an outside expert repairman happens to be in the community).

In large bands such as Norway House or Island Lake, having populations of 2500-3000 depending heavily on water transportation, it is estimated that each could fully employ a half dozen or so mechanics on outboard motors alone. When all the other types of machinery and equipment are considered, probably double this number could be employed in each such community. There are probably potential markets for a number of other types of specialized retail or service outlets in numerous larger, more isolated Indian communities; e.g. recreational. outlets, such as pool halls and beer parlours (where local regulations permit); coffee shops; confectioneries; gas stations; and the like. Some of these should, perhaps, be encouraged to develop in a cooperative form, primarily for their educational value. Considering the special difficulties Indians face in developing and running cooperatives efficiently, however, special encouragement and aid to privately-owned and operated Indian enterprises would probably be more productive in the short run.

4. Qualifications - Any primarily economic analysis of, and recommendations for policy regarding Indians in Canada, is almost bound to be unsatisfactory and frustrating. Economists tend to be overly bound by certain precepts, some of which are moral, and some of which are basic assumptions of their discipline. Two major precepts in particular tend to create frequent and sharp conflicts when it comes to policy. These are:

(i) Unemployment or idleness is deplorable – particularly if it coexists with unused resources. It is assumed that society, as well as the individual, benefits if people are kept active during most of their waking hours producing things that are useful.

(ii) The central criterion of economic efficiency is maximum output in relation to input of labour and capital (or minimum input per unit of output). Any activity that requires subsidizing is, by definition, economically inefficient.

Either precept if carried to its logical conclusion, of course, becomes ridiculous, as measured in terms of the other. The principle of keeping people fully and productively employed has led at the one extreme to subsidizing farmers and other producers to engage in long hours of hard work and drudgery for inadequate returns and to produce outputs that have had to be destroyed, given away, or otherwise disposed of because they could not be sold in the market at prices sufficient to cover their costs of production. In terms of normal criteria of efficiency, it has been demonstrated that society would gain in net income if large numbers of small submarginal farmers were paid the market value for their land and pensioned off for life, at rates equal to their net earnings from farming.

Similarly with economic efficiency. Hunting and fishing as generally practised on this continent are obviously inefficient in terms of conventional economic criteria. En fishing, if the central objective were to maximize the total catch in relation to expenditures of labour and capital, the most efficient method would be simply to set fish traps in all lakes, streams, and river mouths.

Obviously the efficiency of hunting and fishing activities has to be measured by other criteria than these. To an increasing extent, they are carried on as leisure-time activities, the value of which is to be measured by the enjoyment they generate among the participants, and the revenue and employment the latter create in paying for the privilege of participating.

Hence the elaborate restrictions on equipment, techniques, licences and seasons to assure that hunting and fishing will be carried on by technically or economically inefficient methods, as leisure time or play (as distinct from productive or work), activities. The distinctions become blurred, however, where guides, conventionally defined as productive workers, are employed to assist people to conduct their inefficient and unproductive leisure-time activities.

Thus leisure-time activities which, by conventional economic standards are inefficient and unproductive in terms of producing an output that others find useful, generate employment and income for others. A rapidly increasing proportion of the national income is spent on, and a correspondingly rapidly increasing proportion of the nations' labour force is engaged iii, producing goods and services for such subsidized leisure-time activities.

The discussion leads to a basic question of principle. The present system of taxation and income distribution enables some higher-income groups to subsidize themselves in inefficient hunting and fishing activities. On what grounds, moral, ethical or economic, can it be argued that Indians are not also entitled to such subsidization? Men of high income pay as much as $500 to $1,000 a week for sport hunting and fishing, with the assistance of White or Indian guides, Is it more economical or beneficial to society to enable well-to-do tourists to subsidize Indians in employing them as guides, than for the government to subsidize Indians directly to engage in hunting and fishing (and perhaps trapping) to produce food and materials for handicrafts, for themselves as well as for the market?

The proper criteria of economic policy for large numbers of underemployed and dependent Indians in the northern belt should be formulated in terms of contributing to an active and meaningful life for them. Complete, or nearly complete, idleness and dependency on relief is obviously unsatisfactory as it leads to frustration, demoralization and, in general, unhappiness. Reorganizing the whole structure and operations of the trapping and fishing industries in terms purely of maximum economic efficiency in terms of the industries, as such, will not meet this problem. It would enable a minority of the more efficient workers in each band to earn far larger incomes from trapping and fishing than before, but many would be entirely displaced from these industries. The displaced, in turn, would have to be either:

(a) maintained on relief, or

(b) given special training and assistance to move into new employment in urban industrial centres.

This is the easy answer in terms of conventional criteria of economic efficiency, but it raises further questions.

The costs of special training and the various types of assistance that would be required to move Indian families into urban industrial centres, and enable them to adjust to the urban way of life, are likely to be high. Even with the greatest pressure and inducement, the numbers that can be induced and enabled to move and make the necessary adjustments may not be enough for several years to meet the needs of an expanding population. If, then, sizable numbers have to be maintained on relief, the question is: where?

On the face of it, it seems uneconomical and inefficient to maintain northern Indian families on relief in their present locations in isolated communities in which the costs of imported goods and services are inordinately high, and in which many types of facilities and services are lacking. It would seem more economical and efficient to move them to urban centres where such goods, facilities and services are both cheaper and more plentiful.

On the other hand, it is questionable whether this would be the most satisfactory and efficient alternative. It would be difficult, at best, to induce any large number of northern Indians to relocate in urban centres, particularly if they are merely to be maintained on relief. Dissatisfaction and demoralization would probably be more widespread and intense than if they were maintained on their home reserves. And, if they are not to become a depressed, demoralized slum group in urban centres, the Indian Affairs Branch and other government agencies would have to provide special facilities, personnel and services equal, or more than equal, in amount and cost per household, to those recommended for the more promising Indians as part of any large-scale program for training, relocation and new employment in such urban centres.

The only feasible policy, therefore, appears to involve both of the following:

(a) Assisting, along the lines outlined earlier, the movement and relocation of as many Indian households as wish to move into urban or industrial centres of employment; and

(b) For those who do not wish to, or cannot, relocate, subsidizing them – by new equipment, techniques and other facilities and services – so that they can earn more from hunting, fishing, trapping, handicrafts and related activities, than from relief; or, to put it another way, to earn enough from these activities to keep them participating.

Considering the relatively small numbers of Indians in the northern area in relation to the total Canadian population, the total volume of expenditures or subsidies that would be required to enable them to live a meaningful and active life would be a very small fraction of the gross national product (or of the total Federal and provincial budgets).

Bands Located in Farming Areas

Among the more depressed and under-employed bands in virtually every province, are a number located in farming areas having sizable tracts of land in their reserves suitable for agriculture.

(a) In some cases the under-employment is due to rapid population growth, in which the acreage per capita has declined to the point that the land, even if fully and efficiently utilized, could not support the present population adequately, let alone further population increases in the future.

In the broad sense, the problems facing such bands, and the types of programs that would best promote their economic development, appear to be broadly similar to those of the bush bands discussed above. They are not, of course, geographically isolated in the same sense. Most of them have roads or highways running nearby or through their reserves and are within a few hours travelling distance, at most, from small or medium-sized urban centres. But their employment opportunities outside of the reserve in many cases are about as limited, for in predominantly farming areas there tends to be surplus White farm populations as well, particularly with the trend toward larger-scale operations and the displacement of small operators. This generally creates intense competition for jobs and limited job opportunities in the towns. Such is the situation in large areas in all three Prairie provinces and the Maritimes, as well as parts of Ontario, Quebec and British Columbia.

The first priority in this situation, therefore, would also appear to be that of training and preparing the younger people in the community for permanent employment and residence in urban centres that have sufficient job opportunities in areas too far from the reserves to allow for regular daily or weekly commuting.

(b) In the majority of cases, bands that have sizable tracts of farmland in their reserves fail to make full use of it. The land, that is to say, could potentially employ more adults and support more families than it now does. This state of affairs has led the Indian Affairs Branch to pour capital, in loans and grants, into such communities in order to encourage Indians to farm. The results have not been very successful in most cases.

It might be argued that Indians in such communities should be encouraged and subsidized because, as in many isolated northern bands, there are unused resources and idle men, and subsidizing their farming activities may seem the only way to prevent progressively greater idleness, dependency and demoralization.

The two situations are not entirely analagous, however, for several reasons.

1. There may be a sound argument for subsidizing the older members in isolated bands in hunting, trapping and fishing, because most of them have a considerable experience, aptitude and preference for such activities, where the financial rewards are adequate (or, at least, above the levels of relief). Few Indians, by contrast, have such preferences and capacities when it comes to farming. It would require much more intensive training and expensive capital investments to equip them for farming, on a basis of efficiency comparable to most White farmers.

2. As stressed earlier, rapid increases in productivity, the increasing size and scale of operations required to achieve optimum efficiency, and the continuance in operation of many subsidized farmers, all serve to render commercial agriculture a poor prospect for new entrants, particularly where a large investment is required to set up each new operation. To subsidize any large number of Indians in such endeavours would tend to perpetuate and contribute further to the problem of excessive numbers of sub-marginal farmers, to reduce their mobility, and reduce their opportunities for engaging in other more remunerative employment opportunities. In general, it would tend to perpetuate the problem of rural slums.[1]

    -a- In some cases where circumstances allow, where land titles are in suitable form, it might be a better course of action to encourage consolidation of farms in Indian communities into larger-scale, more efficient units. Where individual Indians have the requisite desire and aptitude, presumably they should be encouraged to undertake such efforts with the aid and counsel of properly qualified agricultural experts and with liberal credit extended by the Indian Affairs Branch (or its future counterpart under provincial administration).

---

[1] Despite the hundreds of thousands of farm workers and operators that have abandoned farming for other pursuits since the war, agriculture remains relatively the most overcrowded and under-paid sector of the Canadian economy. As the table below brings out (from the Economic Council of Canada's Second Annual Review, Ottawa, December 1965), labour income per person employed in agriculture is less than one-half the average for all other industries in the country.

INDEX OF LABOUR INCOME PER PERSON EMPLOYED,
BY MAJOR INDUSTRY, 1956*

Sector or Industry	Index	Sector or Industry	Index
Agriculture	45.0	Forestry	113.2
Fishing and Trapping	78.0	Manufacturing	115.4
Trade	92.7	Finance, Insurance, Real Estate	122.3
Construction	105.3	Electric Power, Gas	138.1
Public Administration, Defence and Service	106.4	Mining	144.8
Transportation, Storage, Communications	111.4	All Industries	100.0

* These estimates include an allowance for the income of unincorporated business and net farm income attributable to the labour of the owner. Economic Council of Canada, Second Annual Review, Ottawa, December, 1965, p. 65.

-b- In bands in which such skills, aptitudes and preferences are lacking, it would be more economical to all concerned to lease the land to outside operators, and use the revenues for purposes that the band agrees to (as is now done in many cases).

-c- In still other cases where bands are resistant to consolidation of holdings into larger units and to leasing to outsiders, it may be more economical to leave it idle and unused rather than to subsidize the owners to encourage them to farm it.

Large numbers of Whites owning tracts of farmland leave it unused, for speculation or as a form of insurance in case of need, so there should be no special opprobrium attached to Indians for doing the same thing.

In general, it would appear that in most cases the same amount of investment and expenditure in money, time and effort for special training by expert personnel, could better be used for equipping Indians to engage in urban-industrial types of employment rather than in farming.

In any case, the most effective use of Indian-owned farmland is a question that would require the expert advice of agricultural economists.

3. The analysis so far has been concerned mainly with the prospects of Indians in commercial farming. This does not rule out subsistence farming among Indians who own or control farmlands and who, for one reason or another, are unable to migrate and sustain themselves by employment outside the reserve. Where idleness and dependency are the only alternatives, it would seem logical to provide every reasonable encouragement or pressure to engage in subsistence farming and other community projects that would contribute to the real income of the band members. This, presumably, would be among the most useful type of project for a community development program to undertake.

To a certain extent it might prove economical also to encourage greater specialization and division of labour within bands located in agricultural areas. It would be far less so than in the more isolated northern bands, however, for in most farming areas, specialized repair and other retail services are available in cities and towns for the surrounding farm populations.

It could be argued, of course, that bands could get a larger employment multiplier effect out of their limited incomes if households spent more of their incomes within the community, on services provided by trained and skilled band members, rather than spending them in nearby White towns, thus providing income and employment to Whites rather than Indians. Notable examples of such facilities or services that create a large outflow of Indian income, are taxis, pool halls and beer parlours.

There are serious limits to the degree that this principle could be applied, however, apart from such matters as skill and experience:

-a- In many types of retailing (especially supermarkets),economics of scale in serving a large population over a wide area more than compensate for higher transportation costs; and

-b- It is not certain, by any means, that Indians would patronize local services provided by fellow band members in preference to those in a town several miles away, even if they were available at comparable prices. There is an element of psychic income involved in Indians' shopping habits. A large part of the incentive for shopping in town, as in any farming area, is the change and novelty of getting away from the confines of the home community. Another is the symbolic value of having White service workers wait on them – in reverse to most White-Indian relationships. This is a partial explanation of the tendency among Indians to spend a disproportionately large part of their limited incomes on taxis.

Casual Farm Labour

A special question of policy concerns the employment of Indians for car~.al farm labour in certain specialized crops. In Southern Alberta and Saskatchewan hundreds of Indians recruited from numerous bands over a wide area are employed for a few months each year in thinning and harvesting of sugar beets. Rates of pay are far below standards applying in other industries. Agriculture is exempt from provincial labour legislation, including minimum wage laws; housing and other facilities are seriously substandard; and living conditions are generally deplorable. The Indians earn barely enough to live on while working, and generally end the season as destitute as they began and have to go back on relief.

This is a situation that the Indian Affairs Branch should end as soon as possible; for the Branch to cooperate in recruiting and supplying Indian workers to farm employers paying substandard wages and substandard housing and other facilities is undesirable. The Branch cannot, of course, prohibit individual Indians or households from voluntarily seeking and getting such work, but it should use every means possible -- including periodic inspection by placement officers and other personnel, and pressure on provincial and local authorities -- to assure that adequate rates of pay and facilities are provided.

The current situation is open to criticism on several counts:

1. On economic grounds alone, the general principle should apply that any firm or industry that is so inefficient that it cannot meet going or market standards of wage rates and working or living conditions should not continue in operation. If, for reason of public policy, it is essential that the sugar beet industry continue to operate, and if it is so inefficient that it cannot operate without being subsidized, then subsidies should be provided directly by the federal and provincial governments, at levels that will enable the employers to pay adequate wages and provide decent living facilities. As the situation stands now, the industry is being subsidized by the Indian Affairs Branch (which has to maintain sugar beet workers and their families on relief most of the year) and by the Indians themselves, through their under-paid labour.

2. The familiar argument that it is better to have people working -- even if at substandard wages and working conditions -- rather than have them continually maintained in idleness on relief is invalid, partly for the reason pointed out above, and also because it goes directly counter to accepted government policy for labour generally, outside of agriculture. Workers entitled to Unemployment Insurance can remain unemployed and continue to receive unemployment benefits as long as work is not available to them of a type and at rates of pay in line with their previous job experience. When their unemployment insurance benefits are exhausted, they are entitled to unemployment assistance, and ultimately social welfare or relief. The accepted policy, in brief, is that unemployed or destitute people cannot be denied unemployment benefits or relief in order to force them to work at substandard rates of pay or working conditions. To do otherwise would open the way to widespread exploitation and economic inefficiency. To follow any different policy with regard to Indians employed in casual farm labour would be to single them out for discriminatory treatment as second-class citizens.

3. Finally, as numerous studies of casual and migrant farm labour in the United States have brought out, the substandard rates of pay and living conditions, the specially low status, and the disorganized social and family life accompanying such work, altogether have the affect of isolating the group as a lower caste. People become trapped in this way of life, and are unable to adjust to or become accepted in other types of employment. This has happened to large numbers of Whites but for a distinct ethnic group such as Indians the effects are doubly damaging in terms of any long-range objectives toward economic growth and integration.

> There is perhaps one important qualification to the above, by way of a possible exception. It has been the experience of placement officers in some parts of the country that seasonal farm labour can be a useful means of introducing Indians from more isolated bands who lack other opportunities for employment, into outside wage work and encouraging confidence to move from the reserves to seek other work, This should be viewed, however, as a purely temporary measure, primarily for educational purposes, in the broad sense. Care should be taken to assure that Indians do not become trapped in low-paid seasonal farm labour as a permanent way of life.

(c) Disorganized Bands Near Expanding Urban Centres or New Industrial Development Projects

Among the more economically depressed and dependent bands) as noted earlier, are some located close to expanding urban centres or new industrial development projects. In some cases the urban expansion occurs because of new transportation facilities which transform White as well, as Indian communities. In others a major new development brings a large influx of newcomers to a relatively small, isolated community, with drastic effects on local Whites and Indians alike. In still another pattern, Indians from various bands are attracted by economic expansion, leave their reserves and become a low-income slum group in urban communities in which they play, at most, a submarginal role in the economy.

Here the main barriers to economic development are not objective economic factors such as shortages of available resources or job opportunities. Rather, as pointed out before, the main factors are socio-psychological including social and personal disorganization among Indians; apathy and lack of motivation; drunkenness; absenteeism and carelessness on the job; and hostility from and discrimination by Whites, It would have to be accompanied by an intensive program of training, social conditioning and placement similar to that recommended for urban migrants from northern Indian communities, as outlined in Section B below.

There are no easy solutions to the type of social problems that such communities present, and no program that can be devised is likely to yield spectacular results In the midst of unprecedented prosperity, society is still faced with the problem of poverty, particularly among the permanent welfare cases in major metropolitan areas. And applied social science as practised by social workers has yet to discover a means for motivating the more apathetic cases.

The more depressed Indian communities represent a large and important variant of the welfare hard core, They may, however, have one asset that the other more heterogeneous groups lack, a sense of separate identity which represents a latent pride that might be drawn upon to provide some motivation for improvement. This is an asset which a community development program could be designed to tap.

Education and Economic Development

The subject of education takes up a large section by itself later on in this Report, and provides a complex field of research on its own. Considering the crucial role that it plays in economic development and is likely to play far more in the future for Indians in Canada, a few general observations about the subject would seem in order at this point.

Intensive studies by various United Nations' agencies, as well as numerous individual scholars have found that there is a higher correlation of economic development with education than with any other single variable, The Economic Council of Canada gives the highest priority to education along with a larger, more comprehensive and coordinated manpower program. for achieving maximum economic growth in this country. Among Indian bands, as noted earlier, the correlation does not appear to be very high, though it may well turn out to be so during the next five to ten years as the new educational policies of the Branch begin to bear fruit.

Education, as pointed out before, helps the individual economically not only through providing the essential technique and know-how required for most jobs in the modern economy, but also by instilling some of the discipline and work habits that modern business, industry and other institutions require.

All three types of economically under-developed or depressed Indian communities discussed above have one feature in common – that the educational levels of their members are generally low.

A criticism that is sometimes levelled at the educational program now being carried out for Indians, is that it drains communities of their most intelligent, educated and enterprising members. A high proportion of Indian students who complete their high school education and take special vocational, technical or professional training, leave their home reserve permanently.

The data compiled to date about the sample bands and others, do not entirely bear out this criticism. As the sample brought out, there is a high correlation between economic development and the proportion of band members residing outside of the reserve, which suggests that the migration does not contribute to deterioration of the band. True enough, the non-residents generally earn a higher average per capita income than the residents, which suggests that they are concentrated among the more skilled and enterprising, but, at the same time, the residents of such bands also earn, on the average, a higher average per capita income than those of bands with a small proportion of non-residents.

On the other hand, it appears that among the more developed bands are those in which a high proportion of the specially trained professional or semiprofessional members return to the same community to practise their trade as teachers, nurses, administrators and the like. This seems to be the case particularly with the Six Nations Band. Unfortunately, the questionnaire circulated by the Indian Affairs Branch, which included a question listing the occupations of band members, does not ask whether the professional or semi-professional members are residents or non-residents.

B. Summary and Recommendations on Economic Development

I. General - Cross Country

(1) "Economic development", as the term is used in this Report in discussing Indian communities in Canada, is defined, analysed and measured in terms of per capita real income derived from gainful employment.

(2) Economic development for Indians in Canada has an unique connotation, and will require different types of programs – or programs with a different emphasis – from those discussed or recommended in the vast body of literature dealing with the economic development of under-developed or developing regions or nations. In the latter, the main problems are those concerning the acquisition or accumulation of capital and new or improved techniques, to develop available resources more fully, create new industries, and produce larger outputs that will sustain the resident population at higher real income levels. By contrast, for the Indians in Canada, as a small minority of the total population, and residing in hundreds of small, scattered communities within a complex, industrially developed and generally high income economy, the main problems of economic development are largely inseparable from those concerning the broad objective of integration into Canadian society as a whole. Their income and employment prospects in the traditional resource-based industries of trapping, fishing, farming and food gathering are generally static or declining. The main avenue for economic advancement of most Indians in Canada lies in facilitating travel or migration away from their reserves, to take wage or salaried jobs in non-Indian communities and enterprises beyond reserve boundaries. Exploitation and development of resources within or close to their reserve communities would or should play a distinctly secondary role in any comprehensive economic development program on their behalf.

(3) In so far as their economic development is inseparable from their participation in Canadian life in the broad sense, any program on their behalf, to achieve substantial results, will have to be integrated and comprehensive in scope and conception. The most feasible and effective goal or strategy should be, ideally, that of balanced social and economic development. Economic development, that is to say, cannot be realistically viewed or effectively carried out as something done for its own sake, or by peculiarly economic devices, distinct and separate from educational, social, cultural or political considerations. Developments along all these lines must be carried out more or less conjointly, so that they can be mutually reinforcing rather than mutually defeating.

(4) Economic development for Indians will also require greater integration than has been achieved hitherto, in government policy at all levels, federal, provincial and municipal. The federal government in recent years have passed a number of items of legislation designed to deal with various aspects of poverty. These include, for instance, training and retraining programs. loans to unemployed workers to finance their movement to new centres of employment, and financial grants to encourage the rehabilitation and development of depressed rural areas. Some of these measures are, or will be, financed entirely by the federal government, and some by cost-sharing arrangements with provinces and municipalities. These, and other special measures still to be enacted, are, presumably, to be coordinated in the war on poverty announced last year.

The Indians, a majority of whom would be classed among the poor and under-employed, will presumably benefit from various measures undertaken as part of the larger program. As a special problem group within the broad area of poverty, unemployment and under-development, however, they will still require special coordinated programs of their own, with special services and facilities over and above those designed for broad groups of the population.

(5) Hitherto, government policy with regard to Indians has been largely that of protection, maintenance and caretaking, rather than development. To enable Indians to rise to an economic status approaching that of equality with Whites will require, as pointed out, a comparatively massive,

coordinated developmental program on many fronts. This, in turn, will require a much larger level of expenditures than the budget of the Indian Affairs Branch has provided for hitherto – probably two or three times as large as that for 1964, for instance. (As one rough measure, by way of comparison: total government expenditures for all types of publicly provided facilities and services at all levels – federal, provincial and municipal, on behalf of the Canadian population as a whole during 1964 were, on a per capita basis, about two and a half times the total expenditures of the Indian Affairs Branch on behalf of Indians. There is probably a much wider discrepancy in the private sector generally.) The Indian Affairs Branch's appropriation, of course, would. not necessarily have to be increased by such proportions as these, in so far as various measures undertaken as part of the war on poverty, and financed out of general revenues, may benefit Indians equally with Whites, and provide some of the facilities and services recommended below for the economic development of Indians.

(6) The Indian Affairs Branch's budget will need a major shift in emphasis or priorities, as well as a large increase in amount. During 1964, for instance, out of a total budget of about $60 million, education accounted for about $30 million and welfare about $20 million, while economic development specifically had about $I-I/2 million (though, as stressed earlier, various expenditures in other areas, particularly education, would be deemed appropriate or necessary for any comprehensive program for economic development). An adequate program for the future is likely to mean that, for several years at least, economic development will account for the largest single item in a greatly enlarged budget.

(7) Some major changes in organization, personnel and policy will be required within the economic development division, together with a larger budget. (Note: A number of suggestions outlined below, and some others, were already being undertaken while this Report was being prepared);

(a) Economic development policies of the Indian Affairs Branch hitherto have placed major emphasis on local resource development for Indian communities. The evidence now available indicates that the major emphasis should shift to that of encouraging the migration and placement of Indians in wage and salaried jobs, with local resource development playing a secondary but supporting role, if an adequate rate of growth in real income is to be achieved. One implication of this will be that a much larger and increasing share of the Indian Affairs Branch's expenditures than hitherto will have to be allocated to the provision of facilities and services for Indians who have left their reserves, as compared to those who remain on them.

(b) A staff properly qualified in economics and allied disciplines will be required to gather, collate and analyse pertinent data and prepare integrated, comprehensive reports of the type appropriate for undertaking coordinated economic development programs on behalf of Indians in different regions, as well as to relate the Indian Affairs Branch's role to that of other government agencies at all levels in carrying out such programs.

(c) Properly qualified specialists should also be in charge of various main subdivisions within the Economic Development Division, to be able to deal adequately with various technical questions and types of data that will be encountered. (The main industrial subdivisions now include: Agriculture, Forestry, Fish and Game, Mining and Minerals, and Engineering. At the time of writing, only the latter two were headed by professionally trained persons. A subdivision for Business and Industry also should be added, with specialists and personnel trained in such fields as business management and marketing.)

(d) The function of job placement should have a special role and status in economic development. It should have a larger staff of qualified people, especially at the regional or provincial level (though substantial improvements have been made along these lines over the past two years).

(e) Large numbers of additional personnel having various kinds of special training and experience will be needed, particularly, again, at the regional or provincial level, to provide various kinds of supporting facilities and services for some of the more complex and difficult types of job placement programs.

(8) Economic development for the Indian population as a whole in Canada may be viewed as a process of facilitating the movement of relatively large and increasing numbers, as rapidly as possible, through a series of industries and occupations having widely different job characteristics and requirements with regard to such matters as skill, seasonality, punctuality, degree of mechanization, authority and supervision. These present a rough order of progression from the overcrowded local resource-based fields in relatively isolated areas, to the complex and highly-paid employments characteristic of major urban centres. This order was set out in an earlier chapter.

(9) Job placement, as stressed, must play a central role in any comprehensive program for the economic development of Canada's Indian population. Placement is a complex process that requires specially skilled and qualified personnel to perform or supervise such functions as: liaison with employers, employment service centres, trade unions and other agents or agencies controlling access to jobs in various fields; selection of job applicants; provision of travel grants and other costs of moving; financial aid for housing and resettlement; counselling; mediating between workers and employers; and so on.

(a) Hitherto, the Indian Affairs Branch has limited itself to two main categories of placement, and the personnel have performed the above functions to a varying degree. These are:

(i) Placement of Indians who have received special education or training that qualifies them for certain types of skilled, technical, clerical, office or service jobs. This is the responsibility of special personnel within the Education Division of the Indian Affairs Branch, and

(ii) Placement of unskilled or semi-skilled Indians in casual or seasonal jobs, mainly in such fields as farming, logging or pole-cutting, and rough construction work. This is the responsibility of the Placement Division.

(b) A crucially important area of placement between the above two, as viewed in the broad perspective outlined in (8) above, presents more difficult problems. That is, the placement of larger numbers of Indians in semi-skilled jobs in industrial and business establishments in numerous small or medium-sized towns that have developed in areas having large numbers of unemployed or under-employed Indians. This is particularly characteristic of numerous towns in the northern sections of virtually every province that have developed around the sawmilling, pulp and paper, and mining and smelting industries. It is also characteristic of urban transportation, business and commercial centres in numerous agricultural areas in which numbers of economically depressed and under-employed Indian bands are located. Indians have largely been frozen out of employment in such centres, due to lack of appropriate skills, work habits, or ability to adjust successfully to urban life, on their part, and hostility of White employers and urban residents on the other.

Getting Indians successfully placed in employment and established in such centres would require teams of specialists, and special facilities and services in each region, to perform such functions as the following:

(i) Careful selection and recruitment of Indians from different bands who show promise, in terms of stability of character and work habits, intelligence and adaptability;

(ii) A high-pressure campaign among local employers and businessmen to accept Indians for employment on a subsidized on-the-job training basis;

(iii) Provision of transportation expenses, training grants, and housing loans or subsidies, to enable Indians who qualify for permanent employment to acquire housing and furnishings of a standard comparable to White workers in their job status;

(iv) Counselling by home economists in such matters as household management, clothing, food and sanitation to enable Indians from the more depressed reserves to live a style of life acceptable to their White neighbours in town;

(v) Special educational personnel , courses, and facilities for Indian children, who face special handicaps in attending integrated schools in such communities;

(vi) Counselling by psychiatric social workers to acquaint indians – particularly Indian wives and mothers – with the legal, social and medical services available to them, and to enable them generally to adjust to the difficulties of urban living; and finally

(vii) Special liaison with influential groups or organizations in the town – businessmen, unions, religious, political, fraternal and others – to allay criticism or attack, and enlist the utmost public support for the employment and acceptance of Indian families in the community.

(10) The broadly phrased recommendations outlined above, and the more specific ones listed below, arise out of the findings of this Report. These findings have been derived largely from a representative sample of completed Resource Questionnaires circulated by the Indian Affairs Branch to its agency superintendents, supplemented by the findings of numerous special surveys and research monographs. The findings are, admittedly, somewhat fragmentary and of limited accuracy in dealing with some important types of data. This Report, therefore, can properly make only very broad types of suggestions by way of recommendations concerning Indian Affairs Branch policy.

A more detailed type of cross-country research survey will be required to provide a really workable blueprint and give realistic estimates regarding the various types of policies suggested here, involving such questions as: numbers of Indians to be involved in various types of programs; size of capital investments and operating budgets required; numbers and types of staff needed for different operations at the national and regional level; and so on.

(a) A cross-country research survey of this kind would require the following:

(i) An adequate survey of the Indians themselves to provide a workable picture of their present capabilities in the aggregate. Such a survey would involve fairly detailed individual studies by way of physical and aptitude tests, educational attainments, work skills and experience. This could provide an inventory, showing the number of actually or potentially employable people in each community and their potentialities for different kinds of work, as compared to the number that are, or likely will be, permanent dependents. Only when this is done can there be a reasonably accurate estimate of what would be required in terms of money, numbers and types of personnel required for education and training, rehabilitation, relief and welfare, capital loans or grants in each community, each province, and over the nation as a whole.

(ii) A similar detailed, comprehensive survey is required of resources controlled by or accessible to each band community that is resource-based, to any important degree, in its economy. This would require surveys by more expertly qualified personnel, and provide more accurate and reliable estimates than were presented in the Resources Questionnaire circulated by the Indian Affairs Branch in 1964-5. Presumably it would require the use of hired consultants. Such a survey, combined with the manpower survey outlined above, would provide workable guidelines or estimates of the number of Indians in each community who could earn their livelihoods locally, at real incomes above a minimum poverty level of $2,500 to $3,000 per household, if trained and equipped to use efficient and up-to-date techniques in trapping, fishing, farming, logging and sawmilling, food gathering, guiding, and handicrafts.

(iii) And finally, a thorough survey to estimate the numbers and kinds of job opportunities potentially available to Indians within commuting distance of their reserve communities. (This would be of particular importance for bands deficient in locally-owned or available resources, and located near small or medium-sized towns and industrial projects. It would not be so necessary for bands located near large cities or metropolitan centres, for, in this case, job opportunities for Indians could be considered virtually unlimited if they could be trained and inculcated with the requisite skills, incentives, motivation and know-how.)

(iv) On the basis of data from these surveys, a reasonable estimate could be made of the numbers of Indians, along with their aptitudes and qualifications, who may be considered as actually or potentially redundant and unemployed or underemployed in relation to local economic development and job opportunities. Only then can reasonably accurate estimates be made of the magnitude of migration that must be supported for Indians who wish to seek jobs out of their home reserves, the numbers that will have to be relocated and re-established in other communities, the special types of training and conditioning that will be needed, the amounts of loans or investments required for housing them adequately, and the like.

(b) A research survey of this magnitude and detail would, of course, require a far larger professionally or technically trained staff than the Indian Affairs Branch has or would need permanently. It would necessitate, therefore, hiring large numbers of outside consultants and research personnel on a temporary basis. A cross-country survey of this kind would seem more appropriate for the new Department of Manpower to carry out. For, as the Economic Council of Canada's latest report stresses, one of the first requirements of an effective manpower policy is adequate labour market information, particularly as regards job opportunities and job applicants. And, it stresses, such information should be continuously kept up to date. A special survey of Indians, as outlined above, would seem called for, as part of a larger manpower survey. The Department of Manpower, in carrying it out, would presumably have to secure personnel from various federal and provincial departments dealing with industry and resources, as well as from the Indian Affairs Branch. It would be expensive, of course, but in all likelihood economical in the long run, to the extent that it could provide sound guidelines for expenditures in the hundreds of millions of dollars.

II. Specific Sectors

This research survey indicates, and a more comprehensive and detailed survey of the kind recommended above could bring out more fully and accurately, the different types of economic problems faced by Indian communities in various regions and localities, and the types of economic development programs that would be most appropriate in each case. Among the major groups appear to be the following:

(1) Northern Wooded Belt

One of the most difficult problems of economic development concerns the hundreds of Indian bands scattered across the northern wooded belt of the country. For various reasons, Indians in this vast belt have been forsaking their mobile hunting, trapping and fishing economies and coming to depend increasingly on relief.

For many or most such communities across this broad region, the most appropriate type of program would appear to be three-fold in character:

(a) Through improvements in primary and pre-school education, and various supporting services, increasing to the maximum possible, the number of Indian students receiving secondary and vocational education or training in centres having the required personnel and facilities;

(b) To support the entry of as many Indians as possible into industrial wage employment away from their reserves (as outlined in I. (8) and (9) above). (Particular emphasis should be placed on younger workers in their late teens or twenties, for two main reasons: (1) their greater adaptability to urban employment and living conditions; and (2) the deterrent effects which their leaving would have on birth rates and natural increase among the reserve population); and

(c) To devise local resource and community development projects for the resident reserve populations, to raise their per capita or household real incomes above the poverty level; or, more specifically, to increase the real incomes to be derived from gainful employment sufficiently above those received from relief, to induce able-bodied Indians to become active workers rather than idle dependents.

These objectives, but particularly the latter, would require such services and facilities as the following:

1. Specialized training, by teams of qualified instructors travelling to each community, along several lines, and for several purposes, as follows:

(a) Generalized training for all adults in certain basic skills essential for making adequate livelihoods in relatively isolated northern communities (e.g. for men: motor mechanics and repair, carpentry and plumbing, and other basic types of construction jobs; for women: cooking, nutrition, child care and household maintenance).

Such training could potentially serve several purposes, such as:

– enable Indians to build and maintain better homes and other facilities for themselves;

– enable the Indian Affairs Branch and other resident institutions to hire resident Indians for various types of building and maintenance work;

– fit more Indians to take advantage of new employment opportunities that might at any time develop within fairly easy access of their band communities.

(b) Special training in improved techniques in methods of catching, and in care and preparation, processing and shipping, of produce derived from local resource industries (e.g. trapping – preparation of skins; fishing – filleting and processing; logging and sawmilling, etc.).

(c) Special courses in bookkeeping and accounting, for self-employed trappers, fishermen and other producers who have to deal with outside buyers, suppliers and creditors.

(d) More specialized, and lengthier, training for a minority of more qualified candidates in larger northern Indian communities that could support some local residents employed in full-time specialized services rather than importing such services from outside at high cost. This would apply particularly to repair services for outboard motors, snowmobiles, power saws and other types of automatic power-driven machines that are coming into increasing use.

(e) Other specialized training for limited numbers of individual Indians in communities where available resources or markets offer reasonable prospects for remunerative employment in certain lines (e.g. as suggested in Buckley, Kew and Hawley's study of Northern Saskatchewan for instance).

2. Provision of efficient, up-to-date equipment on a liberal rental or credit and purchase basis. Subsidization of Indian trappers and fishermen in the northern region as regards provision of equipment would be justified if it served to give them a special inducement to work rather than remain idle and dependent on relief with the proviso that the beneficiary would sacrifice his equity or right to rent such equipment if he failed to maintain it adequately, or put it to optimum use.

One of the main requirements, for many Indians dependent on hunting, trapping and fishing, appears to be equipment and facilities that will increase their geographic mobility, to enable them to move to more distant, under-utilized areas having plentiful supplies of fish, game and fur-bearing animals. Such equipment would include, for instance, snowmobiles or bombardiers, outboard motors for boats or canoes, and, in strategic areas accessible to several bands, airplanes and storage facilities.

3. Organization and establishment of more efficient and economical storage, processing, transport and marketing of local produce, in particular fish and furs, in northern communities.

Some intensive studies point to various inefficiencies or diseconomies in the operations of the fishing, trapping and logging and sawmilling industries in the northern region, as evidenced by inordinately large mark-ups and spreads between the low and inadequate returns to the primary (predominantly Indian) producers and the final prices for the finished products in retail markets. These spreads have been largely attributed to different sets of factors operating to varying degrees among different communities and with different communities and with different products, namely: (1) exploitation by individuals or companies having local monopolies in the purchase of the primary producers' outputs as well as in the provision of equipment and supplies; (2) wasteful competition and duplication of facilities; and (3) a high element of risk, in providing credit and in selling produce in outside markets that are subject to extreme fluctuations in price.

Several alternatives have been suggested at one time or another to meet these problems.

(a) Processing and marketing cooperatives organized on behalf of Indian, Métis and a minority of other primary producers. While perhaps an ideal solution for their educative as well as economic benefits, such cooperatives would be exceedingly difficult to organize and run effectively, on truly democratic principles in the immediate future, mainly because of limitations in education, skill, experience and motivation among northern Indians and Métis, and various adverse factors in their social and cultural environment.

(b) Government-owned and operated marketing boards, and storage and processing facilities, operating on both the buying and selling side. Presumably these would be under provincial jurisdiction, though by mutual agreement such jurisdiction could be transferred to a federal government agency such as the Indian Affairs Branch. Much of its potential effectiveness might be vitiated, however, by long-established attitudes of many Indians and Metis towards government agencies.

(c) Perhaps the most effective and reasonable compromise, in the immediate future at least, might be privately-owned and operated marketing and processing facilities that have local or regional monopolies (or limited competition) under careful government control and supervision, along generally similar lines to those of public utility regulation. In principle, at least, this could prevent wasteful competition and duplication of facilities, on the one hand, and monopolistic price exploitation on the other.

4. The handicraft industry, as a potential source of additional employment and income for Indian households in many areas, is one that perhaps requires a special research study on a fairly wide scale, and should include such questions as the feasibility of large-scale centralized marketing facilities, provision of equipment and supplies, and more efficient division of labour and sub-division of processes.

5. Community development as the term is generally interpreted to mean, should be viewed as playing a distinctly secondary or ancillary role in the economic development of Indians in the northern belt. The prime need, as indicated above, is to support, by all feasible means, the maximum free movement of Indians away from their present reserves to become re-employed and re-established in more promising centres. For those who wish to remain in or close to their home reserves, the main requirements are those of training in new (or at present unacquired) skills, and new and more efficient equipment and facilities. In any case, the prior needs appear to be those of intensive training in various techniques, and sizable investments of capital, for the members of most or all band communities.

Community development may be viewed primarily as a device for imbuing the residents of a community, individually and collectively, with the motivation and will to undertake, on their own volition, measures to improve their situation – in a word, to help people to help themselves. Given the provision of adequate technical training and capital investment, as suggested above, community development could play an important supporting role in encouraging the more enterprising Indians to emigrate from their reserves, and encouraging the residents to rationalize the hunting and fishing, fuel gathering, kitchen gardening, and building projects that could add materially to their real income, comfort, welfare and morale. Without something tangible to work with, by way of more efficient techniques and equipment to utilize available resources, community development efforts alone might lead to frustration and disillusionment.

(2) Bands Located in Farming Areas

(a) For bands located in rural areas that lack sufficient land or locally available job opportunities, the main problems of economic development would seem roughly comparable to those of most northern bands discussed above. The first priority, therefore, also appears to be that of training, preparing and financing students and younger workers or households for permanent residence and employment in urban centres that have sufficient job opportunities, in areas located too far from home reserves to allow for regular daily or weekly commuting.

(b) Much the same sort of considerations apply to many bands across Canada in which arable land within reserve boundaries could, potentially, support a larger number of farm households than it now does. The question then arises: To what extent should the Indian Affairs Branch, as part of an economic development program, provide financial subsidies, technical advice and other forms of aid to encourage larger numbers of Indians to engage in commercial farming?

As spelled out in some detail in preceding chapters of this Report, the available evidence appears to weigh overwhelmingly against such a policy. Commercial farming generally is the most overcrowded single field of employment in Canada, with the result that underemployment is considerably greater, and the income from gainful employment considerably less on the average than for other industries and occupations. The same applies to Indian farm proprietors in comparison to fellow band members engaged in wage or salaried employment in other industries. They are generally less motivated and experienced than White farm proprietors, and their incomes and financial resources are, on the average, far more limited.

In the vast majority of cases, therefore, it would not be economical for the Indian Affairs Branch to attempt to establish Indians in commercial farming. The money, time and effort and personnel that would be required could be used more effectively for training and financing Indians who wish to leave their reserves to work in other industries.

(c) In some cases where circumstances allow, and where land titles are in suitable form, it might be a better course of action to encourage consolidation of farms in Indian communities into larger-scale, more efficient units. Where individual Indians have the requisite desire and aptitude, presumably they should be encouraged to undertake such efforts with the aid and counsel of properly qualified agricultural experts and with liberal credit extended by the Indian Affairs Branch (or its future counterpart under provincial administration).

(d) In bands in which such skills, aptitudes and preferences are lacking, it would be more economical to all concerned to lease the land to outside operators, and use the revenues for purposes that the band agrees to (as is now done in some cases).

(e) In still other cases where Indian band members are resistant to consolidation of holdings into larger units, and to leasing to outsiders, it may be more economical to leave it idle and unused rather than to subsidize the owners to encourage them to farm it.

(f) The analysis so far has been concerned mainly with the prospects of Indians in commercial farming. This does not rule out subsistence farming among Indians who own or control farmlands and who, for one reason or another, are unable to migrate and sustain themselves by employment outside the reserve. Where idleness and dependency are the only alternatives, it would seem logical to provide every reasonable encouragement or pressure to engage in subsistence farming and other community projects that would contribute to the real income of the band members. This, presumably, would be among the most useful types of projects for a community development program to undertake.

(g) To a certain extent, it might prove economical also to encourage greater specialization and division of labour within bands located in agricultural areas. It would be far less so than in the more isolated northern bands, however, for in most farming areas, specialized repair and other retail services are available in cities and towns for the surrounding farm populations.

(h) Seasonal farm labour is generally low paid, and working and living conditions are generally inferior to those applying in other industries. The Indian Affairs Branch, therefore, should encourage Indians to participate in this type of work only temporarily, where it is useful in accustoming Indians to wage work outside their reserves, where other employment opportunities are lacking. Every effort should be made – including periodic inspection by placement officers and other personnel, and pressure on provincial and local authorities – to assure that adequate rates of pay and facilities are provided by employers.

(3) Disorganized Bands Near Urban Centres or Industrial Projects

Many of the most depressed bands are located close to urban centres or new industrial projects offering manifold job opportunities. Here the main problems of economic development are not physical – in the sense of distance or isolation, or shortage of resources – but social or psychological in nature.

This is the sort of situation in which a well planned community development program would appear to have the highest priority. Community development, however, would have to be directed as much or more towards the Whites as towards the Indians. It would have to be accompanied by the following:

1. an intensive program of training of Indians to prepare them for the types of job opportunities available;
2. intensive training and counselling work, particularly among Indian women, in household economics, dress and personal care to prepare the families for living in a new and changing urban industrial environment;
3. an intensive social work program for rehabilitation; and
4. an intensive educational and public relations program aimed at key groups in the White community.

A key issue of policy is whether, in the educational program designed for Indians, a special effort should be made to educate and train Indian students and provide special incentives to them to return to their home communities to provide the various professional, educational, and administrative and other services now performed largely by Whites – as agency superintendents, teachers, nurses, technical experts, community development officers, and the like. On the face of it, this would seem to be a logical objective. On the other hand, it is not entirely clear that Indians would be better suited to perform such services in view of such difficulties as the factionalism frequently found in Indian communities and the ambivalent attitudes of Indians towards themselves as well as Whites (describable in over-simplified terms as an inferiority complex).

(4) Relatively Developed, High-Income Bands

For the minority of relatively developed high income bands, there is little that one can recommend in a general research survey of this kind by way of specific programs to encourage further development other than the provision of expert advice, facilities for educational and vocational training and the like. It would seem only logical that the poorer, under-developed bands should get the highest priority.

(a) There can be an argument for encouraging greater diversification in training and employment among members of the higher income bands. The highest income bands, as noted earlier, are those in which a majority of the adult males are specialized in high-wage manual employment. This renders the community potentially vulnerable to sharp economic reverses, due to depletion of resources or to technological change and displacement of labour. A greater diversification of the occupational and economic base of such communities seems a desirable objective in the long run.

(b) A number of high income bands occupy reserve land that is strategically situated to take advantage of industrial and commercial development of various kinds, and in a number of cases Indians have become successful industrialists and business proprietors on a modest scale. In such cases, it would seem appropriate to aid and encourage band members to develop their own local industries as much as possible by provision of adequate capital and expert technical advice in business management and operation. In many cases, however, it may be more economical and productive in the long run to lease reserve land to outside interests to use for industrial or business sites, as these latter, having larger amounts of capital and expertise, can operate on a scale and level of efficiency that few or no band members can manage. In such cases, it would seem appropriate that every effort be made to assure that Indians are given prior opportunity and training for new job opportunities that the tenant firms provide.

(c) In some cases, bands may refuse to lease reserve land that would contribute materially to their revenue where they fear that an influx of outside business or industrial interests may cause disruption in the community and threaten their survival as a distinct cultural entity. Such has been the reaction, for instance, among the Caughnawaga and Six Nations. While such reactions may be uneconomic in the orthodox sense, they seem justified in terms of human goals and satisfactions. Economic development, after all, is merely a means for fulfilling the goals that a people deem important, and if cultural survival is a prior value of a band's members, they should be given every assistance to use their economic assets to that end.

C. Government Responsibility for, and Administration of, An Economic Development Program for Indians

The recommendations outlined above call for a much larger and more comprehensive program for the economic development of Indians in Canada, making necessary a vastly larger budget and a greater number and variety of trained personnel to this end. The question then arises: What portions of the total program, and which parts or aspects of it specifically, should be financed and administered by the federal and provincial governments respectively?

This, of course, is much too large a question to attempt to answer in any sort of detail at this point, and is considered again in later chapters. Offered below are merely a few broad observations on the economic aspects of this question.

The Indian Affairs Branch, to an increasing extent, has had to depend upon provincial government agencies and personnel and provincially-owned or controlled resources to carry out its responsibilities to Indians, and to pay provincial governments on some mutually agreed upon estimates of cost for services rendered. There seem, on the face of it, to be some strong arguments for giving the provinces most or all of the responsibility for economic development programs on behalf of the Indians. The main reasons offered appear to be as follows:

(a) The wide diversity of problems to be faced in furthering economic development, varying widely from province to province, and among different Indian communities within each province. Most such problems appear to be local, or at most, regional in scope, involving such issues as the utilization by Indians of resources accessible to their band communities; job opportunities within limited distance from their reserves; relationships with Whites with whom Indians come regularly, or periodically in contact; and so on.

(b) Economic development for Indians requires, increasingly, their greater participation in Canadian society. In specific terms, this involves, for an increasing proportion of the Indian population, greater mobility and residence for long periods, or permanently, away from their reserves. Inseparable from such mobility are increasing involvement and participation in, and dependence upon, institutions, agencies, facilities and services outside of the reserves (e.g. business or industrial undertakings; trade unions; schools; hospitals; social welfare agencies; recreational facilities and activities; and the like). The vast majority of these are directly, and exclusively, under provincial jurisdiction or control, are financed or staffed by provincial government personnel, and/or are subject to provincial government rules and regulations.

(c) The growing dependence upon wage or salaried employment, outside of their reserves, as the main avenue for the economic advancement of Indians in Canada. Provincial governments, in the aggregate, have jurisdiction over jobs accounting for more than 90 per cent of the Canadian labour force. The exceptions, under federal jurisdiction, are those in ocean, lake and river waterways and harbours; railways, airlines, and inter-provincial bus and truck transportation; telephone, telegraph, radio and television communication; and Federal government facilities and services. Hence, provincial governments are responsible for passing and enforcing legislation, covering more than 90 per cent of all workers in the country, concerning such matters as wages and hours, holidays, working conditions, labour-employer relations, protection against discrimination in employment on racial, ethnic or religious grounds, and the like. Effective protection of Indians against discrimination or exploitation, therefore, does and will have to depend primarily upon the terms of provincial legislation and their effective enforcement by provincial government personnel.

(d) Provincial governments likewise have exclusive jurisdiction and control over the use of most resources, outside of reserve boundaries, on which the livelihoods of many Indians depend. In recent decades the cooperation of provincial government agencies with the Indian Affairs Branch has been necessary to protect Indians from ruinous competition and displacement from primary resource employment (e.g. the allocation of trap lines and fishing licences in various localities). Protective action by provincial governments may well be even more important in the future. Indians are becoming displaced in increasing numbers from their traditional resource-based employments in hunting, trapping, fishing, and food gathering, and will have to depend increasingly for their livelihoods and economic advancement on wage employment in resource-based manufacturing industries, and the communities that develop around these, such as in sawmilling, pulp and paper production, mining and smelting, and hydro power development. Control over the use and allocation of resources gives provincial governments considerable leverage for assuring that Indians have sufficient opportunities for on-the-job training and employment in such fields.

In this connection, there are strong moral or ethical grounds for asserting that provincial governments should contribute far larger amounts of money and trained personnel for coping with the problems of depressed Indian communities of the kinds described above, for provincial governments, in the final analysis, have jurisdiction over the use of resources and the allocation of jobs within their boundaries and control over the types of development that take place in using these resources. Quite properly, therefore, they should assume prior responsibility for the social and economic costs that are a direct by-product of such development, such as depletion or spoilage of resources on which Indians depend for their livelihood, technological changes that render various types of employment obsolescent, new resource development projects and influxes of population that cause social disorganization in established communities, and so on. Hitherto provincial administration has tended to sanction various types of revenue, while dumping the problems they generate in the laps of other authorities, such as the Indian Affairs Branch and local or municipal governments.

(e) The annual revenues and expenditures of provincial governments and of municipal governments under their jurisdiction have, in the aggregate, been increasing relative to those of the federal government in recent years, and now exceed the latter by a considerable margin. These provide – potentially for Indians as well as for the rest of the population – a much larger volume and variety of public facilities and services than in previous years, particularly in such areas as education, health and social welfare; transportation and public works; and resource development and conservation. They also provide, in the aggregate, a rapidly expanding field of employment in which provincial governments, where so inclined, could assure a wide choice of opportunities for on-the-job training and wage or salaried work for Indians. Particularly promising and important in this regard appear to be provincial government employment in areas of Indian population that are relatively far removed from major urban or industrial centres (e.g. construction work on roads, highways and other public works; resource development and conservation projects; educational, health and welfare services; and various types of clerical and office work).

(f) In general, then, provincial governments within their own respective boundaries have, under their direct jurisdiction and control, the main factors that are crucial for the economic development of Indians, as discussed elsewhere in this Report: i.e. natural resources and industrial development; employment and labour-employer relations; regional and community planning and development; education, health and social welfare. And, to an increasing extent, they have the financial resources or revenues to support expanding facilities and services in these various fields. Hypothetically, then, if a provincial government were fully committed to a program of economic development for Indians within its territory, and this were made the responsibility of a senior minister or committee of the cabinet, it could conceivably achieve far more effective authority, coordination and drive than any program of the Indian Affairs Branch, which has to depend essentially on the voluntary cooperation of various provincial governments and agencies on a rather piece-meal basis.

The considerations outlined above indicate that, to an increasing degree, provincial governments have been, and will continue to be, assuming functions and responsibilities on behalf of Indians, which previously had been assigned almost exclusively to the Indian Affairs Branch.

It should not be concluded from this, however, that the role of the Federal government, or of the Indian Affairs Branch specifically, will or should decrease in importance, in absolute or relative terms, and much less that its functions and responsibilities should be transferred entirely to the provinces – for the vastly enlarged and comprehensive program of economic development recommended for the Indian population across Canada seems likely to require greater efforts and expenditures at both levels of government. What should be anticipated is, rather, that there will be greater and, it is to be hoped, more efficient specialization, division of labour and coordination of functions between the Indian Affairs Branch and provincial governments in the enlarged program recommended. While the Indian Affairs Branch's role in some aspects of economic development may reasonably be expected to decline, relative to the provinces, in other aspects it should expand to far greater proportions than has been attempted hitherto – for there are crucial issues concerning the economic development of Indians across Canada which individual provincial governments, in the nature of the case, are not equipped to handle.

(a) Where, as outlined in (f) above, a provincial government is willing and able to commit sufficient money, personnel and resources to a comprehensive developmental program for Indians within its boundaries, and to use its full legal powers to protect their needs and interests, there may be good grounds for the Indian Affairs Branch handing over responsibility to that province, and limiting itself to a purely advisory role in that province's area of jurisdiction. This seems unlikely to develop in any but one or two provinces in the foreseeable future, however. For Indians across Canada as a whole, the role of the Indian Affairs Branch seems likely to remain of crucial importance.

(b) As innumerable reports and surveys have stressed, there are wide inequalities in average per capita income and in government resources and revenues – and, therefore, in the expenditures that can be afforded for economic development – among the provinces. By and large, the provinces most in need of the facilities, personnel and services needed for adequate economic growth are least able to afford them. Achievement of a more balanced and equitable growth and division of economic opportunities across the nation as a whole, therefore, must depend upon programs initiated and carried out by the federal government (and for Indians, by the Indian Affairs Branch) in cooperation with other federal agencies).

(c) Among the high-income provinces with relatively ample government revenues, there are wide discrepancies or inequalities in the priorities given to the development of human as against material resources respectively, and in expenditures per capita for such services as job placement of the unemployed, education, health and social welfare, as compared to those devoted to roads and highways and natural resources exploitation. British Columbia, for example, enjoys the highest average earnings per person employed of any province in the country. It likewise experienced the highest rate of growth in total income during 1951-61, and came second only to Alberta in expansion of employment and in investment per capita during this period. Yet, over the past two decades it has suffered the unusually high average annual unemployment rate of 5.1 per cent (as compared to 3.2 per cent for Ontario, 2.7 per cent for the Prairies, and 4.4 per cent over Canada as a whole). And, during 1961-63, it ranked fourth and fifth among the ten provinces in per capita government expenditures for health (including mental health) and education, respectively.[1] Such facts suggest that there would be unequal willingness among provincial governments to take over from the Indian Affairs Branch and effectively carry out responsibility for the education, health, employment and economic development of disadvantaged minority groups such as Indians.

---

[1] Figures quoted are from Economic Council of Canada, Second Annual Review, "Towards Sustained and Balanced Economic Growth", (Ottawa, December 1965), Chap. 5.

Such being the case, it seems only reasonable to assume that, to assure adequate protection and furtherance of the needs and interests of Indians, a federal government agency such as the Indian Affairs Branch will continue to be needed, and to have the financial resources necessary to provide adequate facilities and services to Indians, wherever and whenever provincial governments are unable or unwilling to do so.

(d) Again, for many Indians, the most effective program of economic development will lie beyond the capabilities of provincial governments regardless of such considerations as their individual willingness or financial resources. For Indians in a number of the more depressed bands in the Maritimes and in Southern Saskatchewan or Manitoba, for instance, the most feasible means of economic advancement would appear to be that of movement to urban or industrial centres in other provinces.

Or again, for the large number of Indian bands across the whole vast northern wooded belt of the country from Quebec to British Columbia inclusive, a viable economic development program, as described earlier in this Report, would require a variety of special personnel, facilities and services which provincial governments could not provide, individually, without a great deal of wasteful duplication and unnecessarily high costs.

(e) All this leads up to the central point stressed repeatedly in earlier sections of this Report; namely, that to achieve substantial economic development for the Indian population of this country, top priority must be given to measures that will enhance potential mobility, support those who wish to move away from their reserves, and train and otherwise prepare them for wage and salaried employment in available centres of job opportunities.

Provincial governments simply are not equipped to provide a comprehensive training and relocation program of this kind, and on the scale that will be required. Only the federal government has any sort of framework of trained and experienced personnel, research facilities and financial provisions, on the basis of which an adequate program can be developed. To date its activities along these lines have been inadequate, and carried out in uncoordinated bits and pieces.

A really effective program on behalf of Indians could best be carried out as one part of a new, larger, more comprehensive and better coordinated manpower program by the federal government for the labour force as a whole. The Indian Affairs Branch could and should have an important role in any such program, to provide experienced personnel and special facilities to meet the special needs of the Indian minority in the labour force.

(f) This conclusion seems to fit in well with the recommendations of the Economic Council of Canada in its recently issued second report entitled, Towards Sustained and Balanced Economic Growth. The Council gives top priority to educational and manpower planning as the two most vital requirements for Canada's continued economic growth. In a general context of overall demand sufficient to achieve full employment, and vulnerable therefore to labour shortages and inflationary "bottlenecks", the report states that:

> The area of greatest need for urgent and effective action is that of manpower and labour market policies. (p. 179)

Its specific recommendations in this area include the following:

(i) Establishment of an effective administration, specifically, "the establishment of a new ministry of manpower services. Such a ministry could be the sole coordinator of all manpower policies and programs, including not only those now in the Department of Labour but also those in the Department of Citizenship and Immigration" (p. 181).

(ii) Expansion of programs for training and retraining – "An urgent need, as we stated in our First Annual Review, is to develop facilities to improve occupational mobility, i.e. the basic education, training and retraining of both new entrants to, and existing members of, the labour force" (pp.181-2).

(iii) More adequate labour market information – "Nothing is more crucial to the development of an effective employment service and to the improvement of the functioning of the labour market than job vacancy data.... What is needed is specific and up-to-date information on job opportunities by occupation, industry, area, wage rates, skill and educational requirements" (p.183).

(iv) Effective programs to assist mobility – "We urged a year ago that a program of adequate financial allowances be made to facilitate geographic mobility where this was desirable. This has become an increasingly urgent matter in view of the bottlenecks which have developed in the labour market" (p. 184).

(g) The Economic Council of Canada was established by the dominion government two years ago as an advisory body of experts which could provide guidelines for and establish priorities in government economic policy. The Federal government now appears to be taking steps to implement some, at least, of the Council's recommendations. A new Department of Manpower is already being established to include the National Employment Service, the Immigration Branch, the Technical and Vocational Training Branch, the Civilian Rehabilitation Branch and the Manpower Consultative Service, as well as a large part of the Economics and Research Branch of the Department of Labour.

From this point of view the new department would seem to be the most appropriate place for the Indian Affairs Branch. For one thing, it should help establish retraining and placement in paid employment as the main priority for economic development, in place of farming and local resource development projects, which have tended to have top priority hitherto. However, this study has not paid adequate attention to all the possible implications of such a move and we cannot confidently make a recommendation. Even were a move made, it would not appear that the new Department of Manpower, with Indian Affairs as one of its branches, should assume responsibility for all the economic and other needs of Indians. A comprehensive economic development program on their behalf cannot consist exclusively of measures to encourage greater mobility, training and retraining, resettlement and job placement. Local resource and community development projects will continue to play an important role in many Indian communities. And, as stressed earlier, economic development will require various supporting programs in such fields as education, health, housing and social welfare. All these, in turn, will continue to require close liaison with and cooperation from other government departments and agencies at both the federal and provincial levels.

(h) To return briefly to the original point at issue, i.e. federal vs. provincial responsibility for Indians in Canada: The fact that the individual provinces constitutionally have prior legislative and administrative jurisdiction over labour, industry and resources, as well as education, health and welfare, undoubtedly imposes serious limits on the effectiveness of any developmental program undertaken by the Indian Affairs Branch on behalf of Indians, just as it does for any larger program of economic or manpower planning undertaken by the federal government. But that is not to say that the federal government, or the Indian Affairs Branch specifically, should abandon such programs, or that the provinces could carry them out more effectively.

Canada's economic growth undoubtedly could be achieved on a more stable, and balanced and equitable basis if the federal government had more power to control the use of resources and the allocation of capital investment on a centrally planned basis (as the French government has, for instance). And the manpower program recommended by the Economic Council could be made to function much more effectively if the federal government had more direct control over employers, and could require them to give prior notice of all dismissals and layoffs, and publicize all job vacancies (as is the case in Sweden, for instance). The same would be true, on a smaller scale, for any economic development program undertaken by the Indian Affairs Branch. The fact that it lacks the powers of provincial governments to directly allocate or control industry and resources, or to compel employers to follow certain policies, does not, however, mean that the provinces would be capable of assuming the main, or entire, responsibility for the economic development of Indians, any more than they are capable of carrying out an adequate manpower policy for the nation. For in both cases, to repeat, only the federal government has the financial capacity, personnel, research facilities and administrative structure for carrying out adequate economic programs, on a national scale, on behalf of the populations residing within the individual provinces. Given adequate financing, staffing, planning and coordination at the federal level, a great deal can be done to supplement provincial programs and influence provincial policy, despite the lack of direct federal legislative control or jurisdiction. How effective such programs will be in each province will depend largely, of course, on the degree to which provincial governments are willing to use their legislative and administrative powers to fully utilize and implement the funds, facilities and services made available by the federal government for economic development programs.

In any case, as part of a new department that is in the process of formulating an ambitious and coordinated manpower program, the Indian Affairs Branch should have opportunities for acquiring more prestige and status, and exerting greater leverage or bargaining power than it has had hitherto, to obtain adequate funds and personnel, and to elicit cooperation from other government agencies as well as from private interests.

CHAPTER XI

THE CANADIAN FEDERAL SYSTEM

Historically the Canadian Indian has had an especially strong link with the federal government and a weak and tenuous relationship with provincial governments. The initial basis for this circumstance was the assigning of "Indians and Lands Reserved for the Indians", 91-24, to the federal government under the British North America Act. In response to this assignment of legislative authority, an Indian Act was passed, an administrative structure was created, and special policies were developed for a particular ethnic group, the indigenous inhabitants of Canada. The result of the preceding was that the federal government involved itself in the provision of a complex series of services for Indians which other Canadians received from provincial and local governments.

This unique situation was justified and sanctioned by assumptions and attitudes which reflected the fact that while non-Indians lived in a federal system, the Indians virtually lived in a unitary state. Up until 1945 the federal government uncritically accepted its special responsibilities for Indians on the grounds that they were wards of the Crown. Provincial governments, with no pressure to do otherwise, assumed that Indians were beyond the ambit of their responsibility. The Indians, for their part, developed a special emotional bond with the federal government, and suspicious and hostile attitudes to the provincial governments.

For reasons to be discussed later, this situation has increasingly come under attack. New policies have emerged designed to render more normal the relationships of Indians and governments in the federal system. The attainment of this objective is fraught with exceptional complexity, and cannot be understood without a preliminary evaluation of Canadian federalism and the legal status of Indians.

This chapter analyses in some detail the basic aspects of Canadian federalism relevant to the present policy of moving the Indian more fully into the provincial framework of law and services. The following chapter analyses the legal status of Indians and the flexibility available for the development of a new pattern of federal-provincial responsibilities for Indians.

Federal systems are typically selected by constitution builders as a response to necessity. The factors of territorially grouped ethnic diversities, vast land masses, or distinct regional identities founded on separate historical experiences are capable, singly or jointly, of eliciting federal structures to create policy-making responsiveness to divergent needs. The basic characteristic of federal systems, the division of law-making authority between a central and several regional governments, is almost invariably accompanied by a written constitution which details the division of legislative authority, a final court of appeal to adjudicate inter-governmental legal disputes, and a complex amending procedure. A certain rigidity in the formal structure of federal systems is a corollary of the desire of the constituent governments for security in the exercise of the powers they have been granted. Since the formal structure is relatively inflexible, and since the underlying society experiences massive changes over time, federal systems are prone to respond to new circumstances by the elaboration of informal mechanisms of flexibility which significantly alter the working of the system while leaving its formal structure relatively untouched.

The kind of relationships by which the various governments are bound to each other, and the relative importance of each level of government vary from a loose relationship for minimal objectives and with a weak central authority, to a highly centralized version with predominant powers granted to the central authority and only a restricted stage for the exercise of autonomy granted to the regional governments.

The formal structure of Canadian federalism in 1867 was highly centralist. The provinces were given the least burdensome functions, access to the least productive tax fields, and a restricted law-making authority which was subject to federal veto. In the Confederation debates they were frequently referred to, in a derogatory sense, as little more than municipalities.

In the period between 1867 and the present, there have been important cyclical shifts in the relationships between governments in the federal system, and in the relative importance of the functions performed by each level. One of the most important long-run changes has been the movement from a situation in which Ottawa was clearly the dominant government in the federal system to one in which the autonomy of the provinces has been given increasing recognition. The coercive instruments of federal control contained in the British North America Act – disallowance of provincial legislation, reservation of provincial legislation by the Lieutenant Governor, and the general supervisory functions initially allotted to the latter federally appointed official – have fallen into disuse. These formal mechanisms of federal control are virtually obsolete. Intergovernmental relationships are now bargaining relationships which take place within a context of interdependence which recognizes the growing role of provincial governments.

Coincident with the erosion of the dominant position of Ottawa which was clearly visualized in 1867, there have been important changes in the role of government at both levels, The concept of the positive state intervening in society on utilitarian grounds has become widely accepted, although disputes and friction still remain at the margin when changes in the role of government are under discussion. In Canadian federalism there has been a long-run tendency to magnify the significance of the functions entrusted to the provinces. Important burgeoning areas of government activity in health, welfare, education, highways, and the development of natural resources are provincial concerns. In retrospect it is evident that periods in which the central government played a predominant role have been products of crises in which the very existence of the federation seemed to be in doubt – in general, the years of birth, war, and depression.

One of the most fundamental long-run changes in intergovernmental relations has been from a situation in which provincial and federal governments carried out their activities in reasonable isolation from each other to one in which there has been a proliferation of intergovernmental relationships. While the Confederation agreement presupposed a reasonable amount of intergovernmental collaboration, its extent was minimal compared to the present day. The basic reasons for the paucity of intergovernmental collaboration at Confederation, and indeed up until World War I, were twofold, the limited functions then performed by governments, and the related absence of sufficient administrative competence for the performance of more extensive and sophisticated tasks. in essence the lack of federal-provincial cooperation reflected the fact that the necessity for harmonizing policies is primarily a product of attempts to control the economy and to achieve basic social objectives by government actions. As these were lacking, the impetus to cooperative federalism was also absent.

It was not, in fact, until the post World War II period that the actual interdependence of the two levels of government was sufficiently recognized for habitual and effective methods of intergovernmental collaboration to emerge. A brief discussion of the post war variant of Canadian federalism will serve to illustrate the nature of the change.

From the beginning of World War II to the present there have been more important changes in Canadian federalism than in the preceding seventy years. There was a marked assertion of central government powers. In the immediate post war period the federal government was unwilling to relinquish the powers it had originally acquired due to wartime exigencies. The combination of electorates seeking more extensive government services, federal politicians seeking votes, the growth of egalitarian sentiments, and little public concern for the constitutional structure of federalism dovetailed perfectly with the fiscal dominance of Ottawa to orient the federal system in a centralist direction. The record of provincial incapacity in the depression and effective federal government performance in World War II tended to justify an enhanced post war role for the federal government. The regional political revolts in Quebec and on the Prairies had moderated in intensity as prosperity returned and the attainment of office institutionalized protest movements. These factors combined to reduce concern for provincial autonomy. A further impetus for these changes was the contribution made by the war effort to a growing nationalization of outlook, especially among returning veterans and their relatives. The war also had an important effect in creating an electorate responsive to welfare ideas, and in conjunction with the depression revelations of the inadequacies of an unregulated economic system, facilitated an enhanced post war role for the state. The war and post war period also witnessed a dramatic speedup in the tempo of industrialization and urbanization in Canadian society and, although the process is not completely clear, this has been correlated in western democracies with an increase in government economic control and provision of welfare services.

Post war federalism developed new techniques of intergovernmental collaboration designed to minimize the barriers which a divided power structure imposed in the way of solving problems beyond the capacity of any one level of government. Less attention than hitherto was paid to the role of the courts in policing the boundaries of the federal system or to the possible usefulness of the amending process as a device to allocate functions to the government most suited to handle them. These traditional instruments of constitutional adaptation were replaced by a new emphasis on flexibility arrived at by political agreement which left unchanged the formal provisions of the British North America Act. The constitutional divisions of legislative power declined in significance as exclusive determinants of the actual conduct of governments in the system. Jurisdictional lines are increasingly blurred as governments pool their fiscal resources and legislative capacities to tackle problems which could be handled by a single government only with difficulty. A dramatic increase in the scope and intensity of intergovernmental collaboration has been brought about by a striking improvement in the sophistication of technique and understanding which civil servants and politicians bring to bear in making the new federalism workable. Flexibility is now primarily located in new sets of attitudes and assumptions of politicians, civil servants, and the general public which are manifest in a complex pattern of agreements negotiated by the executives of both levels of the federal system. Thus post war Canadian federalism differed greatly from its predecessor with respect to the significance to be attached to the divisions of power found in Sections 91 to 5 of the British North America Act, the mechanisms for accommodating the federal system to the changed demands which were made upon it, and the amount of intergovernmental cooperation that occurred.

There has been a growing realization that federal-provincial relationships must be flexible and capable of frequent revision as circumstances require. There is less inclination than formerly to look for final solutions, for they imply rigidity. Cooperative federalism is an attempt to overcome constitutional and legal relationships with the much greater flexibility of the political approach. Underlying and contributing to the blurring of jurisdictional lines there has been the growing interdependence of the activities of both levels of government which clearly requires intergovernmental cooperation for maximum effectiveness. Federal and provincial politicians and civil servants increasingly realize the necessity of living in the short-run because of the unpredictability of the circumstances they will encounter in the future. In consequence there has been the growth of a pragmatic approach to problem-solving in Canadian federalism. Cooperative federalism is basically less a theory than a pragmatic response to demands which could not be effectively met within the framework of strict respect for divided jurisdictional authority. An ad hoc piecemeal approach has dominated the techniques of problem-solving in Canadian federalism since the failure of the Rowell-Sirois proposals and the federal proposals at the post war reconstruction conference to gain provincial acceptance.

The federal government saw its post war role not only as one of economic stabilization in accordance with Keynesian principles, or as one of providing the provinces with adequate unconditional revenues to undertake their functions, but to a significant extent as determining the standards by which specific provincial services were to be provided. The post war federal government was diligent in finding a national or public interest in a wide range of provincial services to justify federal financial inducements to alter the priorities and standards by which particular provincial public services were to be performed. The Rowell-Sirois commission had proclaimed that the "mere importance of a service does not justify its assumption by the dominion", but this opinion in no way inhibited the federal government's diligence in discerning some kind of national interest in a great many provincial services in order to justify its intervention. The intervention was primarily accomplished by the mechanism of conditional grants. This was a device whereby Ottawa, using financial inducements, persuaded provincial governments to alter their performance in aided areas of activity in the direction desired by the donor government. The conditional grant, a device which evaded constitutional restrictions by by-passing them, allowed a changing mix of federal and provincial financial support for functions assigned by the British North America Act to the provinces. Essentially it is a device which induces the provinces to do something they would not do, or would not do in the same manner, without federal financial assistance.

These grants underwent a dramatic increase in the post war period, growing from $50,000,000 in 1945-46 to $860,000,000 in 1963-64. The paradoxical feature of this striking growth is that for most of the post war period, overt provincial criticism was almost non-existent. Quebec excepted, provincial governments were prepared to tolerate federal involvement in provincial jurisdiction which markedly affected their capacity to establish their own policy priorities. The levelling of jurisdictional barriers by the conditional grant resulted in a "fused federalism" characterized by involvement of the federal administration in virtually all of the provincial areas of "exclusive" jurisdiction: natural resources, social welfare, highway building, higher education, local government, and so on. Provincial acquiescence was the more surprising in view of the serious criticism conditional grants had received at the hands of the Rowell-Sirois report in its comprehensive survey of Canadian federalism published in 1940.

The widespread use of the conditional grant mechanism was the most striking indication of the breakdown of classical federalism and the recognition of the emerging interdependence of government activity at all levels of the federal system.

Explanations for the successful conduct of a growing area of federal-provincial interaction are not easy. The relations between federal and provincial governments defy simple analysis. Relationships vary from those of an ad hoc informal nature at the "grass roots" level of administration to formal continuing collaboration under the aegis of legal agreements. It should also be noted that although, in some cases such as federal-provincial conferences at the highest level, it may be argued that confrontation and collaboration take place between governments as such, this is not always so. In fact, in most cases contacts occur between small official groups drawn from each jurisdiction. The clashes or compromises which take place at this level of contact differ little from those which occur between officials of different departments of the same government.

Post war Canadian federalism has been characterized by a proliferating committee and conference structure which brings together federal and provincial politicians and civil servants to develop and administer intergovernmental agreements and to discuss extension of joint endeavours to solve problems out-. side any single jurisdiction. The most obvious device here has been the top level political conference at the level of premiers and cabinet ministers. While this category of interaction attracts the most attention and provides important possibilities for the exchange of views and the resolution of tensions, it is likely that a host of federal-provincial committees at the civil service level play a more important role in harmonizing the workings of the federal system. This fused federalism is to a large extent an administrative federalism.

system. This fused federalism is to a large extent an administrative federalism.

It is, therefore, of great importance to understand the factors that facilitate or inhibit administrative collaboration across the jurisdictional dividing lines of the Canadian federal system. By common consent the most important factor here has been the emerging professionalism of both jurisdictions. This has had the effect of creating horizontal groupings of professionals who were typically less concerned with hierarchy and departmental loyalty than with the accomplishment of tasks by the application of professional standards. These officials were able to make common cause for, their objectives and to make common professional standards basic criteria for decision-making.

The capacity of professionals to collaborate with each other was related to their occupational culture. Professionalization triggers off a number of developments which strengthen the bonds between individuals with similar expertise. The growth of national associations, publication of journals, and in-group meetings at conferences, tend to support identification with fellow professionals at the expense of ties of loyalty and obedience to hierarchical superiors devoid of expertise. Such individuals belong to subcultures based on particular skill endowments which frequently constitute the primary focus of their concern. As Smiley says:

> It may also well be true . . . that officials in these specialized intergovernmental groupings do not look single-mindedly to their hierarchical superiors for rewards. Once such a community of interest and purpose is established officials may come to that community for influence and status. If and when this is so, the conduct that will result in the desired rewards being conferred will be based on the ability to establish and sustain cooperative relations with officials of other jurisdictions. [1]

Not only do these individuals share a common identity but they have the natural desire of specialists to solve problems themselves without the intervention of superiors less cognizant of the values of the specialist group. Such officials know that failure to solve intergovernmental tensions in their own field by their own actions could lead to the intervention of outsiders possessed of different values. Also, once a federal-provincial program becomes a going concern, officials in both governments have strong motives of self-interest in its continuation. They recognize that their program has greater financial support under a conditional grant arrangement than would be the case if federal funds were not forthcoming. A department which receives a conditional grant obviously is placed in a favourable bargaining position vis a vis its own treasury officials.

The service is provided on the cheap as far as the administering government is concerned. Presumably the difficulty of treasury control is enhanced by the fact that the program officials involved can always plead the cause of not jeopardizing federal-provincial relations by refusing to accept federal financial support, and on the grounds of the alleged national interest involved in a program of concern to Ottawa. One result, therefore, of a conditional grant is an increase in the autonomy of the aided department from external supervision. This interpretation is supported by the fact that analysis of conditional grants in Canada generally finds program officials to be warm supporters, while treasury officials tend to be hostile or lukewarm.

The federalism of the conditional grant era, therefore, was characterized by a relaxed political control of the civil service untypical of the theory of parliamentary government with its assumptions of ministerial responsibility and tight political control. This development was facilitated by the growth of a much more extensive set of collaborative arrangements between federal and provincial officials jointly concerned with particular functions than prevailed between political ministers and the personnel of control agencies such as the Treasury Board. There was, therefore, a greater degree of contact between professionals with narrow, but similar, interests than between officials and politicians of the two governments more concerned with coordination and with the assessment of priorities. This situation facilitated the isolation of one program from another and gave program officials in conditional grant areas a degree of autonomy not enjoyed by officials in non-aided areas.

---

[1] D.V. Smiley, "Public Administration and Canadian Federalism", Canadian Public Administration, Vol. vii (September 1964), p. 379.

Up until the mid-fifties, post war federalism was basically centralist. Although no comprehensive reallocations of federal-provincial functions were undertaken, the cumulative effect of ad hoc changes was consistently in the direction of centralization, it is now, however, evident that this trend has been reversed, and that Canadian federalism has entered a decentralizing period. Since a main aspect of Branch policy is to increase the provincial role pertaining to Indians, this growth of provincial self-assertion and power merits examination.

The most obvious statistical indication of the changing nature of Canadian federalism is the shifting proportion of total government expenditures accounted for by the different levels of government in the system. Provincial and municipal government expenditures are growing rapidly relative to central government expenditures. In 1939 federal, provincial, and municipal governments shared almost equally in total government expenditures in Canada. Under wartime pressure the federal share rose to 87% in 1944. By 1963 the federal share had dropped to 46%, the provincial share had risen to 26%. and the municipal to 28%. A projection of government expenditures indicates that if there are no major changes in defence spending and no major reallocations of functions between governments, each level of government will be spending about one-third of the total by 1980 – a return to the pre-war division. Given provincial responsibility for municipalities, such a trend would put two-thirds of total government expenditures under provincial jurisdiction. The factors behind existing and anticipated changes basically reflect the fact that the functions of government undergoing the greatest expansion are primarily municipal and provincial. The provinces, in asserting their needs and rights to more tax money, have the obvious justification that they and not Ottawa are constitutionally entrusted with authority over most of the developing areas of government activity.

It is not necessary for our purposes to comment in detail on all the factors which help explain the shifting balance of power in the federal system. The following points are relevant:

(1) The period of centralization which is presently receding was in large part an aftermath of war and depression. As the influence of these events has waned, the justification for federal dominance in the political system has correspondingly declined.

(2) The perceived importance of fiscal policy to counter economic fluctuations appears to have diminished in recent years. As a result, the rationale for federal fiscal dominance has weakened.

(3) The federal government's ability to offer uncompromising resistance to provincial pressures for decentralization has been reduced by the minority government situation which has prevailed in four of the last five federal elections. In contrast to the weak appearance of the federal authority most provincial ministries are faced with ineffectual oppositions, are led by strong-willed and aggressive premiers, and in a number of cases have enjoyed exceptionally long tenure of office.

(4) These changes have been accompanied by and reflect fundamental improvements in the competence of provincial administrations. The marked improvement in the competence and confidence of the public service in almost every province has been a factor of peculiar influence in federal-provincial relations during the past ten years. Civil service reforms, the elimination of patronage, entrance by competition, and security of tenure were introduced first at the federal level and then spread slowly to the provincial governments. Today the process is almost complete and it is no longer safe to assume that administrative competence resides only in federal hands. In area after area the

provinces possess a predominance of administrative competence and expertise. This emergence of expertise, especially in the large and wealthy provinces, has removed much of the paternalism from federal-provincial relations in specific areas, and we can expect provincial administrators and their political superiors to become even less likely to accept federal leadership as they grow more aware of their own capacities.

(5) There has been a gradual shift in the social and economic thinking about the role of government in the economy and with respect to welfare. In the post war period economic policies were essentially generalized measures to ensure full employment and economic growth. In the field of welfare, the basic improvements, commencing with family allowances, were located in the various categorical programs of income maintenance. As it became clear that these system-wide approaches did little to improve the position of disadvantaged groups such as Indians, or to alleviate the economic problems of particular areas, emphasis shifted to more discrete approaches which singled out particular communities and groups whose needs required special attention. This emphasis is manifest in various community development programs, in ARDA, and in the economic activities of provincial governments which are frequently oriented to the particular economic needs of depressed localities. The significance for the federal system of these developments is simply that while system-wide approaches naturally emanate from the federal government, the more specialized approaches required for the attack on the problems of particular groups or localities are more appropriately handled by provincial governments in many cases.

(6) The emergence of a new administrative and political elite to power in Quebec has led to a vigorous assertion of provincial power with accompanying demands for more "tax room" and for federal government withdrawal from its involvement in provincial matters. The changes in Quebec include a significant increase in the tempo of economic interventionism by the provincial government, one effect of which is to further reduce the relative importance of the federal role in economic matters.

(7) The growing power and influence of the provincial governments in Canadian federalism is intimately related to the importance of the economic levers they control. The growing expenditures of provincial governments exert a weighty influence on the country's economy. All but three of the provinces cover vast land areas whose lavish natural resources are exploited at the discretion of provincial cabinets. The boom in most of the northern hinterlands is subject to their exclusive jurisdiction.

(8) New political orientations within provincial cabinets are combining with growing administrative competence to impart a planning emphasis into provincial economic policy. Unlike the decade of the fifties when provincial cabinets formulated their budgets with inadequate views of the future, all provincial governments now recognize that the expansion of their role in the provincial economy necessitates sophisticated understanding of, and reaction to, economic events within and without their borders. The result has been the formation of consultative bodies on economic policy – the Manitoba Development Authority, the Nova Scotia Voluntary Planning Board, the New Brunswick Research and Productivity Council, the Quebec Economic Advisory Council, the Ontario Economic Council, the Saskatchewan Economic Advisory Council, and the Alberta Economic and Productivity Council.

The nature of the general development of a planning orientation in the provinces is helpfully described by Smiley:

> The provinces have been increasingly successful in attracting able and aggressive officials in both their treasury and program departments and have increasingly guided their conduct in terms of long-term projections of the needs for roads, schools, hospitals and other public amenities. Provincial commitment to budgetary and program planning gave rise to dissatisfaction with the inherent paternalism of the grant-in-aid

> device, particularly when Ottawa took action to sponsor new shared-cost programs or change the terms of existing ones without adequate prior consultation with the provinces. The complex of highly specific shared-cost arrangements was compatible with harmonious relations between the two levels only so long as provincial administration was somewhat haphazard and the 'fifty-cent dollars' available from Ottawa looked attractive because the provinces were not committed to rational procedures of priority-allocation).[1]

(9) The cumulative effect of the preceding has been to stiffen provincial resistance to ad hoc federal initiatives which disrupt provincial priorities and plans. One result has been a growing criticism of conditional grants, a criticism shared by the present federal Prime Minister. In his opening remarks to the 1963 Federal-Provincial Conference he stated:

> We have now reached a stage at which it is wise, in the interests of effective cooperative federalism, to take stock and consider whether some of these programs should be changed in favour of a full assumption of provincial responsibility, if that is the wish of the provinces.
>
> Often in the past these shared-cost programs have been the only way forward over the obstacles created by the uneven fiscal capacity of the provinces and the competing demands on provincial treasuries. In recent years, however, we have developed – in our system of equalization grants – an alternative way of meeting these obstacles and enabling all provinces to afford new programs. These unconditional, general purpose grants take into account fiscal needs .
>
> One can readily conceive of a new arrangement involving transfer to the provincial governments of full responsibility for some of the present shared-cost programs; such a transfer could be carried out on a scale that would involve hundreds of millions of dollars. Naturally the provinces could not be expected to assume full responsibility on such a scale unless they were to be compensated. One way to do this would be in the field of equalization payments and by increases in the abatements which the federal government makes in its tax laws to take account of provincial taxes.[2]

Prediction of future developments in Canadian federalism is especially hazardous because for the first time since the depression Canadians are discussing the basic features of their federal system with passion and vigour. It gradually became clear that the cumulative effect of post war ad hoc changes with a short range emphasis was capable of introducing significant qualitative changes in the federal system. In reaction to this there has been a renewed concern for fundamentals. The attempt being made to find guiding principles in French-English and federal-provincial relations is one of the most important manifestations of the changing climate. The Laurendeau-Dunton Commission, the proposals for amending and delegation procedures, the swelling critique of conditional grants and the resultant opting out provisions, the ending of tax rentals, and the frequent demands for a new constitution are all indicative of a revived concern for the establishment of basic ground rules in Canadian federalism. In general, it seems evident that the federalism of the immediate future will reflect simultaneously the growing importance of the provinces and the necessity for an even greater degree of federal provincial collaboration to harmonize the inescapable impact of the activities of each level of government on the other in a time of increasingly positive government at both levels.

---

[1] Ibid., pp. 380-81.

[2] Federal-Provincial Conference 1963, Ottawa, 1964, p.14.

In retrospect it is clear that the cooperative federalism which prevailed from 1945 to the late fifties was, as its critics suggested, largely a one-way street. While consultations did take place in some areas, the federal government launched conditional grant sorties into provincial fields quite often without even informing those provincial jurisdictions which were supposed to help finance the federal initiatives. The selective nature of federal financial inducements often distorted priorities which the provinces had set up for their own fields of constitutional authority, but there was no quid pro quo; the provinces whose policy-making autonomy was effectively diminished by Ottawa's manoeuvres were not compensated with any influence over the exclusive federal areas of policy-making.

While cooperative federalism, in the sense of both levels of government trying to concert their policies wherever possible, will certainly continue, it will be a much different species than cooperative federalism mediated largely by the conditional grant technique which prevailed up until recently. As indicated above the conditional grant itself is now under serious criticism and it will doubtless play a less important role in the future of Canadian federalism than it has in the recent past. It is probable that federal involvement in specific provincial programs will become less important than the much more difficult task of attempting to find and use cooperative mechanisms with respect to policies of economic growth and stabilization.

This change in the subject matter of cooperative federalism will be accompanied by an important change in the key participants in cooperative federalism. The predominance of program specialists which prevailed in the conditional grant era when federal-provincial relations concerned discrete areas of activity will be replaced by a greater degree of collaboration at more general levels in which the key personnel will include prime ministers and premiers, ministers and officials of finance and Treasury Departments and leading personnel from planning and development agencies whose activities pertain to fundamental economic questions. Superficially it would seem that these developments will lead to a reduction in the autonomy of program officials and they may make agreement in specific areas more difficult to obtain or make such agreement dependent on agreement in other areas to an extent that has not prevailed in the past. The gap between the existing apparatus for cooperation on the one hand and the demands which future developments will place on Canadian federalism make prediction hazardous. It is clear that at the moment cooperative federalism represents a goal still to be achieved rather than a habitual pattern of institutionalized cooperation that can be taken for granted.

In the midst of this century-long context of change in Canadian federalism, one factor has remained constant – the almost total exclusion of Indian communities from the services provided by provincial governments. Partly by default and partly by choice, the Indian Affairs Branch became responsible for administering almost the entire life of a small minority. A clientele department with an especially broad area of concern, it has been forced to deal with education, welfare, local government, economic development, community change and a series of specific responsibilities pertaining to the special status of Canadian Indians. The Branch, in short, has been a miniature government rather than an ordinary functional department. The Indians for whom it provided services numbered approximately 100,000 at the turn of the century and have recently grown to 217,864 in 1965. As of March 31, 1965 there were 551 bands and 2,267 reserves (including 72 Indian settlements not classified as reserves) administered by 87 agencies.

In response to post-war pressures the Indian Affairs Branch underwent important organizational and policy changes and involved itself in a number of new areas of activity. Clerical influence in education was reduced; qualifications of school teachers were improved; a small group of welfare specialists was hired; a large-scale housing program was developed; a revolving loan fund was created; an economic development division was established, and a new Indian Act was passed. In general, the Branch enlarged its budget and its personnel, brought in professionals, attempted to improve its standards of service, and began to stimulate research into the problems it was encountering.

In spite of these efforts, it has become increasingly evident that the Branch cannot develop the same degree of internal specialization of function and personnel as have the other governments in the federal system which constitute the model on which it is increasingly judged. The population served by the Branch is smaller than that of every province but one, smaller than several Canadian cities, and so geographically dispersed that the efficient use of specialist personnel was, and is, seriously hampered.

While these problems have always existed, their importance has grown due to two new post-war factors. Fifty or seventy-five years ago when governments played a comparatively restricted role, the special status of Indians, and in particular their exclusion from provincial services, was not overly disadvantageous. The restricted level of services provided Indians by the Branch probably did not materially differ from those received by their non-Indian neighbours from provincial and municipal governments. Now, however, with the development of positive government at the provincial level in such key areas as education, welfare, and economic development, the disadvantages of Indian exclusion are marked.

In a very general way it would seem that the seriousness of Indian exclusion from provincial government services can be measured by the relative significance of those services to all government services. Statistics cited earlier make it clear that the magnitude of provincial (and municipal) expenditures is rapidly increasing relative to federal expenditures. It is generally evident that the positive impact of provincial governments on the standards and styles of living of their citizens has markedly increased in recent years. While these are blunt standards of assessment, they are sufficient to reveal that an absence of provincial involvement with Indians constitutes a graver disservice to the Indian people than hitherto was the case.

The increasing importance of the services constitutionally assigned to the provinces has been accompanied by overall improvements in the competence of provincial administrative personnel. While this is not a sufficient condition for extending provincial services, it is a supplementary condition of considerable importance. In a number of areas the balance of civil service understanding and skill rests with the provinces and it is a disservice not to bring Indians into contact with the expertise at the disposal of provincial governments.

The disadvantages in service provision which now attend Indian status occur at a time when no successful defence can be offered for an inferior second-class status for a non-White ethnic minority. One of the factors which has been of great importance in fostering the policy of extending provincial services is the principled opposition to differential treatment along ethnic lines. While liberal democracies not only tolerate the special claims of certain groups –the aged, the unemployed, the sick, the young, etc. – but provide special facilities or benefits for individuals in these categories, they have been increasingly unwilling to tolerate different treatment based on grounds of "race" alone. The ending of imperialism in Africa, the struggles of the American Negro for equality of treatment, and the propaganda necessities of the Cold War have all contributed to this new climate of opinion to which governments are responding. Differentiation on ethnic grounds has become synonymous with discrimination, apartheid, second-class citizenship, and generally a host of emotive catch-words.

General egalitarian values and specific hostility to ethnic discrimination render politically difficult the continuation of serious differences in the levels and quality of services provided to Indians and non-Indians. The growing sophistication of the services of provincial governments confronts the Branch with an impossible task should it attempt to provide on its own similar services for Indians. The impossibility, in the absence of unlimited funds, of the Branch providing comparable services constitutes an important structural reason for increasing the tempo of provincial involvement. The desirability of generally procuring the extension of provincial services to Indians is an inevitable consequence of the growing importance and sophistication of those services.

In the fields of roads, welfare, education, and resource management primary responsibility and expertise resides in the provinces. Policies designed to further local economic growth also require provincial cooperation because of provincial control of natural resources and a growing concern for planned resource management. The preceding all constitute functional areas of marked importance for any policies designed to alleviate the backward conditions which prevail in many Indian communities.

It is evident, therefore, that existing trends strongly support the policy of extending provincial services to Indians providing suitable arrangements can be made with the provinces and Indians are in favour of such changes. Public and parliamentary support for this policy is found in the 1946-48 Special Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons appointed to examine and consider the Indian Act and in the representations made to the Committee. Strong advocacy of this policy can also be found in the representations before the 1959-61 Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons on Indians Affairs and in the Committee's recommendations.[1]

In response to these pressures and in the light of its own analysis of the situation, the Indian Affairs Branch has accepted the necessity and desirability of increasing the involvement of the provinces in Indian affairs. For reasons to be described below, provincial governments have become much more receptive to these Branch initiatives than they would have been a decade earlier. The concept of the Indian as a "ward" of the Crown, and a special and exclusive responsibility of the federal government is weakening.

As a consequence of these new responsibilities, there has been an important shift in the style and orientation of the Indian Affairs Branch. The Branch which had been one of the most parochial of government departments has become increasingly outward looking. The policy of extending provincial services necessarily means that one of the most important contemporary Branch activities is the development of the kind of positive relationship with provincial governments which will induce the latter to employ their resources and abilities on behalf of the Indians who live within their boundaries.

Pursuit of the objective of extending provincial services to Indians has placed the Branch in a new role which is essentially diplomatic. The Branch has become deeply involved in the intricacies of Canadian federalism. It is helpful to see this Branch role in the light of international relations. If the Branch is viewed as an independent state and the provinces as other independent members of the international community, then much of Branch activity is clarified. Formerly in this international system the Branch had an isolationist foreign policy. The development of formal relations with the provinces has been very recent. As a result, the Branch has very little experience in this area. Formerly there were a number of local arrangements between administrators, but, aside from fur and game, almost nothing of a continuing nature. The Branch was an inward looking body which avoided foreign entanglements. As this role became obsolete, the Branch became more outward looking. It found that it required the services of other governments to fulfill its responsibilities, This required the development of new techniques for negotiation and follow-up with the provinces. As a result, a new Federal-Provincial Relations Division was formed to provide staff advice and to keep track of proliferating agreements with provinces, school boards, and private agencies. The preparation of formulae which combine appropriate legal terminology with precise definitions of financial responsibilities and control mechanisms has become a key sector of activity.

Conversations with Branch officials reveal the apposite nature of the analogy. They are "pleased with the developments in province X", "worried about the breakdown of an agreement with province Y", "disturbed by a recent speech by a provincial cabinet minister from province Z", and so on.

From this perspective certain basic points, which will be further developed in a later chapter, can be made.

Perhaps more than any other federal branch or department, the special nature of its task requires the Branch to be exceptionally well informed of the intricacies of the federal system in which it must work. The successful implementation of a federal role for the Branch will require changes and improvements in the realm of attitudes, knowledge and machinery. In spite of official changes in policy, the Branch is still hampered by traditional attitudes derived from its isolationist background. In a number of cases, it was observed that the "federal" role of the Branch did not have the high priority which its importance justified. It is all too easy to assume that the time-consuming task of maintaining and developing good relations with the provinces is of lesser importance than working with "the files". The knowledge available in the Branch for the successful performance of a diplomatic role is inadequate. Factual knowledge of provincial legislation is often either unavailable, or, if available, is so diffuse and scattered as to be unusable. It is an admittedly difficult task for the Branch to be fully aware of legislative and policy changes in each province, the import of such changes for Indians, and the making of whatever representations are required to see that such changes do not discriminate against Indians either deliberately or through inadvertence. While perfection is not to be expected in matters of such complexity, significant improvements in Branch performance can, and should, be made.

---

[1] These two important Committees will be cited hereafter as Joint Committee followed by the appropriate year.

A consequence of a federal system is that the actions of each government in the system constitute variables for the other governments. Eleven major governments exist in the same political system. If they are to make the association fruitful, they will not deliberately or unconsciously pursue policies or initiate changes which frustrate the legitimate objectives of other governments in the system. Thus an elementary goal of general policy in the field of federal-provincial relations is to reduce the uncertainty which the diffusion of power in a federal system involves. This, however, is only a beginning. It is necessary to go further and where appropriate to pool federal and provincial legislative authority and fiscal capacities to provide solutions to problems which could not be as efficiently solved by either level of government acting alone.

As applied to the needs of Canadian Indians, an ideal policy would be one in which both levels of government applied their respective legislative and fiscal resources in a cooperative fashion to overcome the general isolation, poverty, and backwardness which prevail in most Canadian Indian communities. The barriers to the attainment of this desirable result, and suggestions for overcoming some of the barriers are examined in the following chapters.

PART

PARTIE

2

micromedia
a division of IHS Canada

20 Victoria Street
Toronto, Ontario M5C 2N8
Tel.: (416) 362-5211
Toll Free: 1-800-387-2689
Fax: (416) 362-6161
Email: info@micromedia.on.ca

A SURVEY

OF

THE CONTEMPORARY INDIANS

OF CANADA

Economic, Political, Educational Needs and Policies

PART 2

A SURVEY OF THE CONTEMPORARY
INDIANS OF CANADA

Economic, Political, Educational Needs and Policies

Editor, H. B. Hawthorn

Principal Authors
of Volume I:
H.A.C. Cairns
S.M. Jamieson
K. Lysyk

Principal Authors
of Volume II:
M.-A. Tremblay
F.G. Vallee
J. Ryan

Indian Affairs Branch, Ottawa

Volume II

October, 1967

® Crown Copyrights reserved

Available by mail from the Queen's Printer, Ottawa,
and at the following Canadian Government bookshops:

HALIFAX

1735 Barrington Street

MONTREAL

Æterna-Vie Building, 1182 St. Catherine St. West

OTTAWA
Daly Building, Corner Mackenzie and Rideau

TORONTO

221 Yonge Street

WINNIPEG

Mall Center Bldg., 499 Portage Avenue

VANCOUVER

657 Granville Street

or through your bookseller

Price $3.00 Catalogue No. R32-1267/2

Price subject to change without notice

ROGER DUHAMEL, F.R.S.C.

Queen's Printer and Controller of Stationery
Ottawa, Canada
1968

ADMINISTRATIVE AND RESEARCH STAFF

H.B. Hawthorn,	Director
M.-A. Tremblay,	Associate Director
A.M. Bownick,	Secretary and Administrative Assistant

M.J Audain

B. Bernier

M. Burbidge

P. Charest

S.W. Corrigan

D.M. Coutts

G.B. Inglis

R.H. Jackson

J.E.M. Kew

L. Laforest

D. Luth

M.J. Lythgoe

R.F. McDonnell

J.E. Nicholls

G. Parsons

E. Schwimmer

To The Honourable Arthur Laing, P.C., M.P.

Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development

400 Laurier Avenue West

Ottawa 4, Ontario

In 1964 the Minister of Citizenship and Immigration asked The University of British Columbia to undertake, in conjunction with scholars in other universities, a study of the social, educational and economic situation of the Indians of Canada and to offer recommendations where it appeared that benefits could be gained.

We have the honour to submit Part II of the findings, concerned primarily with education and the internal organization of the reserves.

M.A. Tremblay
Associate Director

H.B. Hawthorn
Director

VI

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I

INTRODUCTION AND RECOMMENDATIONS 5

II

AN ANALYSIS OF COMPETITIVE IDEOLOGIES 19

III

THE ADMINISTRATIVE AND EDUCATIONAL STRUCTURES OF INDIAN SCHOOLS 63

IV

EDUCATION OF THE INDIAN CHILD 105

V

A PHILOSOPHY OF INDIAN EDUCATION GENERAL GUIDELINES 161

VI

THE BACKGROUND OF FORMAL ORGANIZATION AND DECISION-MAKING IN INDIAN COMMUNITIES 175

VII

GENERAL ASPECTS OF BAND COUNCILS 191

VIII

PATTERNS AND TRENDS IN BAND COUNCIL ELECTIONS 203

IX

THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS 231

LOCATION OF FIELD AND OTHER RESEARCH BY STAFF – INDIAN RESEARCH PROJECT

Name	Main Topic and Region		Period
Dr. M.-A. Tremblay	Education	Data collection and interviews in Ottawa and in various centres. Reserves: Maria, Restigouche, La Romaine, Mingan, Natashquan, Seven Is. (old reserve), Maliotenam, Bersimis, Pointe Bleue, Mistassini, Weytonmachie, (Sanmaur), Rupert House, Six Nations, Fort Alexander, Beardy's. Agencies: Quebec, Ottawa, Toronto, Winnipeg, Saskatoon, Edmonton	1-3 days at each
Assistants:			
Mr. B. Bernier	Statistics		
Mr. L. Laforest	Statistics		
Mr. F. Charest	Ideology		
Miss J. Ryan	Education	Reserves: Cowichan #1 and #2, Comox, Inkameep, West Saanich, Sooke, Six Nations, Caradoc (Oneida, Muncey, Chipeweyan), Oak River, The Pas, Roseau River, Duck Lake, James Smith, Sweetgrass, Red Pheasant, Mosquito Stoney, Poundmaker, Little Pine. Agencies: Ottawa, Toronto, London, Winnipeg, Portage La Prairie, The Pas, Saskatoon, Duck Lake, N. Battleford, Edmonton, Vancouver, Nanaimo, Duncan, Vernon	1 day - 6 weeks at each.
Mrs. M.J. Lythgoe Mr. M. Burbidge	Education	Reserves: Musqueam, Squamish, Dollarton. Interviews at Vancouver Vocational Institute, Burnaby Technical, U.B.C. and various high schools in Vancouver and North Vancouver.	3 months
Dr. H.A.C. Cairns	Political & Administrative Issues	Data collection and interviews in Ottawa and in various centres.	
Assistants:			
Mr. M.J. Audain	Welfare		4 months
Mr. R.H. Jackson	Administration		8-1/2 months
Mr. J.E. Nicholls	Administration		4 months
Professor K. Lysyk	Constitutional & Legal Issues	Data collection and interviews in Ottawa and in various centres.	

Name	Main Topic and Region		Period
Dr. S.M. Jamiescn	Economic Survey	Data collection and Interviews in Ottawa and provincial capitals.	
Assistant: Miss D.M. Coutts	Social disorganization	Reserves: Squamish, Musqueam, Sarcee	3 months
Dr. F.G. Valée	Band organization		
Mr. G.B. Inglis	Social Organization	Reserves: Chilliwack, Port Simpson, Saddle Lake, Nipissing	2-10 weeks in each
Mr. D. Luth	Social Organization	Reserve: Walpole Is.	9 weeks
Mr. R.F. McDonnell	Social Organization	Reserves: Kamloops, Masset, Goodfish Lake, Dokis	2-3 weeks
Mr. G. Parsons	Social Organization	Reserves: Manitoulin, Fort Alexander	12 weeks
Mr. E. Schwimmer	Social Organization	Reserves: Mount Currie, Blood, The Pas	2-3 weeks at each
Dr. T.F.S. McFeat	Band Organization	Reserves: Christian Is., Parry Is. Work mainly with Tobique Malecites in New Brunswick	2 summers
Mr. J.E.M. Kew	Social Organization	Reserves: Christian Is., Walpole Is., Georgia Is., Scugog, Rama, Curve Lake, Hiawatha (Rice Lake), Alderville, Saugeen	1 day to 1 week in each
Mr. B. Bernier	Social Organization	Reserves: Comox, Cowichan	2 months each
Mr. S.W. Corrigan	Social Organization	Reserve: Oak River	5 months

INDEPENDENT RESEARCH SUPPORTED IN FULL OR IN PART BY THE PROJECT

Name	Main Topic and Region		Period
Mrs. P. Koezur	Education	Bands: Mattagami, Michipicoten, Amalgamated Rainy River, Couchiching, Lac La Croix, Seine River, Stangecoming, Golden Lake, Albany, Attawapiskat, Moose Factory, Moosonee, Winisk. Rat Portage, Shoal Lake #93 and #40, Wabigoon, Whitefish Bay, Manitoulin Is., Sheguiandah, Sucker Creek, West Bay, Whitefish River. Fort Hope, Long Lac #58 and #77, Nipigon, Dokis, Matachewan, Nipissing, Temagami, Whitefish Lake, Parry Sound. Fort William, Gull Bay, Red Rock, Mississauguas of Curve Lake, Batchewana (Rankin), Garden River, Serpent River, Spanish River #1 and #2. Caribou Lake (Round Lake), Lac Seul, Osnaburg (New Osnaburg, Cat Lake), Trout Lake, Six Nations, St. Regis, Mohawks of the Bay of Quinte, Walpole Is. Amalgamated.	1-28 days in each
Dr. B.S. Lane	Education	Saanich	45 days
Mr. S.W. Munroe	Social Organization	Stoney Band at Morley	continuing
Drs. E.W. & M. McL. Ames	Socialization	Iroquois school children	
Miss P. Atwell	Off-reserve Migration	Indians residing in Calgary	continuing
Miss N. Bossen	Economic Development	Ontario	3 months
Dr. H. Dimock	Economic Development	Chibougamau-Mistassini	
Prof. K. Duncan with D. Korn and P. McIntyre	Vocational Training	Oneida, Chippewa, Delaware	
Mr. L.R. Gue	Education	Northern Alberta	continuing

Name	Main Topic and Region		Period
Mr. and Mrs. W.R. Ridington	Social Organization	Prophet River	1 year
Mrs. R.L.B. Robinson	Socialization & Child Care	The Pas	2 months
Miss J. Smith with Mr. R. Malpass	Socio-economic Factors	Micmac	continuing
Dr. T.F. Storm and assistants	Motivation Research	British Columbia	continuing

Consultants

Mr. A. McCallum
Dr. C.S. Belshaw
Dr. R.M. Will
Dr. D.V. Smiley
Dr. E.R. Black
Dr. E.S. Rogers
Dr. P. Carstens
Dr. R.W. Dunning
Dr. EW. Ames
Dr. M. McL. Ames
Dr. P. Termansen
Dr. T.F. Storm
Mr. W. Duff
Dr. T.F.S. McFeat

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Schooling and Betterment

Chapter I of the first volume of the Report introduces the research undertaking, states what brought it about and what it attempts to do, and is therefore also Introductory to the present volume. Much that is set out in the first volume concerning matters like employment, income, resources, economic outlook and opportunities, the administration of reserves and the political conditions and prospects of Indian life is basic to a full understanding of the chapters that follow although as far as possible they have been written to stand on their own.

This second section of the survey addresses itself to two sets of issues, related to the provision and the adequacy of schooling for the Indian child and adult, and to leadership, organization and the direction of reserves.

The two issues are linked in a number of ways. The prime assumption of the Report has been that it is imperative that Indians be enabled to make meaningful choices between desirable alternatives; that this should not happen at some time in the future as wisdom grows or the situation improves, but operate now and continue with increasing range. But many of the desirable alternatives potentially open to Indians, and even more that will be open in the future, are open only to those educated for them. Consequently Indian children, and those adults who have the drive to attend classes, must find schools and proper programs ready to receive them.

An alternative chosen by some people, who are now a large majority and will certainly be in large number for at least the near future, is to live on the reserve even if they work elsewhere. The reserve is the place of birth, of family, of friendship, of one's language and of most of the values one shares with others. To the extent that is allowed by its setting within a modern nation, those who own the reserve wish to direct its affairs. Some of this direction now operates through their band council; more use could be made of other administrative devices, some of their features already spelled out in Part I of the Report, others mentioned in the later chapters of this volume.

The background of the stress on schooling and its results is interwoven with needs for better employment, better health and livelihood, more capital for enterprise and a greater share in the governmental and political life of Canada. The fuller achievement of goals in many of these areas is ordinarily and obviously dependent on a certain level of schooling. But schooling that is not accompanied or even preceded by some improvement in adult achievement is likely to be ineffective, as we demonstrate in Chapters IV and V. This is to say that the injunction implied above and so often given to the child as the foundation of schooling: learn now in order to become worthy and receive benefits later, is partly self-defeating, in this instance at least. Indians must receive some wider responsibilities and a fuller place in Canadian life now in order that learning can have enough meaning for their children. The child at school needs to see while he learns that an Indian can do other things besides logging, trapping, fishing or small faming. It is irrelevant that the horse comes before the cart; the cart and the horse must start in motion together.

Part I of the Report offered our analysis of a number of economic, legal, administrative and political issues. In this volume the issues under discussion are schooling and its adequacy, along with the direction and organization of life on reserves. And while we are mindful of the wider setting of culture and community in which these issues find their definition, we shall abstract them from that setting for discussion in the following chapters.

There has been an enlarged effort to supply employment for Indians and opportunity and support for Indian initiative in the economic sphere, particularly over the past decade. At the same time the revisions of the Indian Act and developments in Indian Affairs Branch policy have opened the way for the Indians to play a bigger part in the direction of their own affairs. And the efforts made to get all children in school, keep them there for a longer time and have them share all the educational benefits received by other Canadian children have been vastly increased from the time of the first moves towards school integration some twenty years ago. The advances in professionalization of educational services, in numbers of children in school and in the duration of their stay have indeed brought results. A growing number now stay to complete high school and a significant though still very small increase shows in the numbers of those continuing further. However, the numbers in high school and in post-secondary institutions are not yet near the size that will be needed to reach educational equality with the rest of the nation, and perhaps it could be said that most of the Indian's problems have even moved ahead of their educational solutions in the past few decades. The recipe almost certainly calls for more education, with a question as to whether it should have more of the some ingredients or different ones.

The schooling of Indian children today raises many questions. School for some of them is unpleasant, frightening and painful. For these and for some others it is not so much adaptive as maladaptive. They have little reason to like or to be interested in the school in any way, in or out of the classroom, and it does not provide a path to the jobs some expect from it. Preliminary studies indicate that their motivation to do well in school drops during their stay there. They fail to reach their potential as scholars. They fall behind from the beginning and come to see themselves as failures. Their schooling is not justified by results and moreover they are unhappy in it. A pattern that is followed by a few White children is followed by many, perhaps most, Indian children.

We began our survey of the situation by trying to assess in some detail the place of school in the life of the Indian child, and the provision of the different sorts of schooling under federal, provincial and other auspices.

To recount the experience as the child meets it, entry into school is a drastic break with past experience. Life has not been empty or meaningless for him and he has already learned a great deal before he arrives at the schoolroom door. His character has a certain orientation. It is not the same for all Indian children in all tribal groups and communities but for very many Indian children there are similarities of orientation and knowledge, ones which are different from what the school expects and requires. What the school wants the child to be like above all is the ideal middle- class Canadian child. At this point and in this study we do not propose to weigh the values of Indian childhood and the values of middle-class Canadian childhood and attempt to say which is better.

Each is undoubtedly fitting in different ways and for different situations. But since the Indian child often lacks a spokesman, and since later in the Report we comment unfavourably on aspects of his life which we think are harmful to him, we will note here that the qualities of independence, self-reliance and non-competitiveness which he commonly brings to school are not negligible ones, and in some of the major countries of the world would fit him well for life. But these qualities do not fit as well in a contemporary Canadian school, and the child's lack of many items of knowledge possessed by the ordinary White child is very unfitting in that context.

The integration of Indian children into provincial schools, once so hopefully regarded, has not settled the issue. While it offers an identical education to the Indian child, some of his needs are different from those of most non-Indian children and are not met by the existing programs. The case set out in the first volume of the Report that the Indians be treated as citizens plus because they needed and were entitled to that status becomes stronger for the child. He needs more than equality or similarity of education at this point. We shall set out that in some ways he needs more and in some ways different schooling. Yet this need not mean schooling apart. It appears possible for his special needs to be supplied within provincial school systems and most desirable that the benefits of attending school with other Canadian children be retained. The goal of making school better for the failing and unhappy Indian child appears to be approachable in a number of ways in which parents, home, teachers, classroom procedures, other pupils and parents, curriculum and administrative arrangements might all figure.

2. Schooling as a New Need

One simple and partial definition of schooling is a community vehicle for socialization. Through it the child is provided with controlled opportunities for learning elements of the roles, including occupational ones, he will fill later on. The definition is too simple to be fruitful for all purposes, because the child in school is also living in his present world, not merely preparing for his future, and he is entitled to a schooling that he likes and finds interesting, but it entails the statement that schooling should be integrated with the values and the totality of a culture. Obviously neither the contemporary provincial school nor the schools that operate specially for Indians are at all closely integrated with the values and the other aspects of the Indian child's culture. The child on entry and the teacher do not implicitly share as many values and expectations as do the teacher and the typical middle-class White child. The Indian child does not know what the teacher expects of him and perhaps the teacher does not discern his ignorance or under-stand the background of it. With the many barriers, of language, age, preoccupation and timidity along with others, the entering child and the busy teacher can embark on no dialogue to explore their differences in outlook. Undoubtedly both suffer, and for the child the outcome is a challenge to his identity. He finds he is not what others expect him to be. What he is never becomes clear but is plainly not what is wanted.

Perhaps the issue would not be so grave were not the reserve and the home undergoing a parallel crisis of identity. Developments have dragged the home and the reserve in their wake. Commerce, government, industry and settlement have affected every reserve without the Indian being able to feel that he has had much part in what was happening. He may have gained in many ways by the changes but that is not the immediate point. People and institutions with roots in a different past have called the tune. Being an Indian has become an uncertain thing. The child entering school finds this out for the first time, and is offered no way to resolve the uncertainty.

In some ways his situation is like that of children from many other minority families except that the other parents are likely to have insisted that their home values have an esteemed historical past, written down and accepted, and their children may soon grow to know that they can cite authority for speaking, acting and looking as their families do. Nevertheless, if home and school speak different languages the barriers to communication are still high. All provincial school systems are aware of such barriers for children from families with different language backgrounds and most of them have special or remedial language programs to meet the need. It would appear possible that an extension or alteration of some of these existing programs could be a first step in easing the difficulties faced by the teacher and the Indian child in communicating with each other.

The barriers to communication have an even wider effect, and they separate the parents from the school, Indian from White parents, and other students from the Indian child. We have paid some attention to the alienation of parents from the school, which renders the institution still more alien to the child, and to the likelihood that this alienation might be partially overcome by more extensive consultation of parents particularly when agreements to have the children attend provincial schools are being considered.

The attitudes of White parents and children affect profoundly, perhaps to an equal degree with those of the teacher, the capacity of the Indian child to learn in school. Where the attitudes of all are all negative, the child is overwhelmed. Such extreme cases appear to be rare but it is common to find that some other children and their parents still reject or dislike an Indian child regardless of his nature and qualities, merely because he is Indian. If total rejection is totally destructive, partial rejection is partially so. Where can a change begin? Some of our observations indicate that school administrators and teachers can play a significant role, and it is obvious that they have a responsibility to try to do so. The thinking of the times is on their side now, and even a solidly hostile White community would have the changed values of contemporary civilization brought before it through radio, television and the printed word.

3. Responsibility for Indian Education

There is general agreement on the problems faced by some Indian children in school. They come to value themselves less and to strive less as they get no benefit; they are confused as to what they should be and do; they do not live in a setting where schools prove themselves either happy or useful; they withdraw when they can, psychologically or bodily.

Various administrations and many teachers have tried to find solutions to these problems, and their efforts are continuing, either as part of deliberate experiments or else arising in response to the special circumstances in a particular school or community. These efforts include attempts to change the attitudes and outlook of Communities and teachers; altering the curriculum; adding to the program of teacher training; altering some aspects of classroom operation; instituting special kindergartens, nursery schools and remedial classes. In following chapters we offer comments on some of these programs.

The thoroughly successful operation of any of the programs designed to increase the benefit to the child requires that the responsible educational authority control suitable staff and adequate finances, and possess a belief that the program is the best one that can be tried. In subsequent chapters we mention briefly the different authorities that have been concerned with the Indian child. Various Christian churches first assumed the responsibility for inaugurating and operating Indian schools, and their concern is recognized in current governmental support for their work. The federal government through the predecessors of the Indian Affairs Branch instituted other schools and operated them directly, and over the past two decades the provinces have made various moves to assume responsibility under certain conditions. The result has been a number of forms of segregated day and boarding schools on and away from reserves, and of arrangements for the integration of Indian pupils into provincial schools.

Each of the authorities has held to its own and distinct philosophy of education, and distinctions in their views as to what is best for the child and how to attain it show also within their ranks, between the provinces, and between the churches that operate Indian schools, Some of the differences are more than mere slight variations; they show major oppositions between the viewpoints. In Chapters II and V we consider some of these and set out a case for some integrating principles to guide the schooling of the Indian child. Some of the principles which were used in fashioning our recommendations are similar to those recently expressed in the Report of the Royal Commission on Education in the Province of Quebec (Le Rapport de la Commission Royale d'Enquête sur l'Enseignement de la Province de Quebec, 1964), and others are given here and there through Chapters III and IV.

4. Leadership, Organization and Decision-Making on Reserves

To what extent can Indian communities stand on their own feet? From the viewpoint of income and employment, and in relation to the sorts of powers and status enjoyed by municipalities, the question was examined in Part I of the Report. The remainder of the question concerns the ways in which the communities organize those activities which transcend the boundaries of simple households and which involve people in their roles as band members and community residents.

Band councils and a number of voluntary associations with defined purposes arrange and direct effort within the reserve, face issues and arrive at decisions, and carry out what action flows from them. These councils and associations, their operations, their recruitment and their formation, were the focus of the research on which Chapters VI to IX are based. There is evidence that voluntary associations are growing in number and significance among Indians and our purpose included examining this trend in community organization and dynamics.

We took into account other groups such as families, lineages and networks of cliques whose activities are not so publicly visible and whose purposes are not so explicit and obvious, only where they appear to relate to the more formally organized structures. There are several reasons for not concentrating on these groups. This is a practical study, one aim of which is to suggest ways of working with Indian groups in order to help Indians improve their conditions of life. To make such cooperation possible it is necessary to be able to forecast how groups will operate. But general rules for families, networks of cliques and the like are almost impossible to formulate, let alone apply, and cooperation with them in the directing of community affairs will need to remain part of the art of government; it cannot yet be brought within its science.

Another reason for paying special attention to formal organization is that social power depends on its presence or absence. Following Robert Bierstedt we say that a group has social power, the ability and opportunity to exercise its voice and get what it wants, if it possesses a certain optimum combination of organization, access to valued resources and numbers. What resources are significant depends on the situation in a particular society. Among them may be money, skill, information, knowledge and property. In no society are all such resources distributed at random; in no society does every person have equal access to all resources. In Canadian society money is the chief resource, because access to so many different and desired things can be bought with it. Except at the local level, Indians are comparatively unorganized and by and large have access to little more than subsistence resources. There is not much they can withhold which would cause the non-Indian group acute discomfort, except their services and cooperation in helping the non-Indians achieve their goals, and those most easily blocked by the Indians are the ones planned to benefit the Indians themselves.

We do not maintain that organization has as its chief or sole aim the channeling or ordering of effort to achieve social power, for much cooperative effort goes into such important human pursuits as recreation and ceremonial. For some Indian groups the last-named would rank first among the goals of cooperative effort. But we emphasize the goal of power because nearly all Indians are concerned about their dependency and powerlessness, and demand an increase in their autonomy and self-reliance.

5. Contributors, Sources and Methods

The writing of Part II of the Report was carried out primarily by Dr. M.-A. Tremblay, Dr. F.G. Vallee and Miss Joan Ryan. Dr. Tremblay is primarily responsible for Chapters II, III and V, Dr. Vallee for Chapters VI, VII, VIII and IX, and Miss Ryan for Chapter IV. All contributed at various times, singly and in joint session, to the recommendations. Chapters II, III and V were originally written in French and the other chapters in English. In translation it is likely that some precision of meaning has been lost and because of the pressure of time, style has become a secondary consideration.

The extensive field reports that were written by Gordon Inglis, Michael Kew, Dietrich Luth, Roger McDonnell, George Parsons and Erik Schwimmer, which provided the contexts for the study of formal organization and decision-making, have been citied frequently in the relevant chapters. Mrs. Sheila Rorke assisted Dr. Vallee in the analysis of statistical materials for the study of trends in band council elections and operations. Dr. T.F.S. McFeat gave supervision for one set of field studies in the summer of 1964, besides providing material from his own studies in the Maritimes.

The study of education began with the advantage of the knowledge possessed by some members of the research team, in particular that of Miss Ryan. It continued with two summers of consultation of Indian Affairs Branch data in Ottawa and in regional offices. Dr. Tremblay and Miss Ryan visited schools and regional offices in all provinces where there was any considerable number of Indian children, while Miss Ryan carried out intensive studies of schooling on three reserves, and was aided by Mrs. June Lythgoe and Mr. M. Burbidge in collecting other data. Bernard Bernier, Lucien Laforest and Paul Charest assisted Dr. Tremblay in the preparation of statistics against which some of the conclusions were examined and in the reading of documents pertinent to educational philosophies and administration.

The selection of communities for the study of formal organizations and decision-making on the basis of questionnaire data was described in some detail in Chapter III of Part I and receives some further comment in Chapter IX of this volume. The locations of the first community studies carried out by Mr In glis, Mr. Kew and others were chosen by them and by the senior staff on the basis of our preliminary knowledge of places which appeared to be worth looking at, where things were either going on or for some reasons which we wanted to know, were not happening. Later locations were selected with the fuller knowledge possessed by the team as information built up.

Use has also been made of the finds of a number of recent anthropological studies which were not connected with the Project, ones mostly of bands in the Northern Woodlands and the Sub-Arctic, types of bands which are under-represented in our fieldwork and questionnaire samples. Our reasons for neglecting this type of band were not simply our desire to avoid duplication of work others had done or the need to make the most use of the time and funds at our disposal by concentrating on the most accessible places. We deliberately sought out a majority of places where we had reason to believe that things were happening as far as formal organization and decision-making were concerned. Thus our samples are biassed in the direction of larger bands located in regions where there is a considerable exposure to non-Indian stimuli and an above-average measure of contact with other Indian Bands. We believe that the direction of our sampling bias is congruent with the direction of trends in Indian bands everywhere and in particular the trends towards increasing contact with non-Indian people and institutions, towards larger and more complex communities that require more coordination than was the case in the past, and towards association with other Indian communities in regional groupings.

RECOMMENDATIONS ON EDUCATION

General

(1) The principle of integrated education for all Canadian children is recommended without basic question. The integration of Indian children into the public school system should proceed with due concern for all involved and after the full cooperation of local Indians and non-Indians has been secured.

(2) The Indian Affairs Branch should recognize a responsibility to see that integrated schooling, once embarked upon, is as successful as possible. This is an elaboration of the recommendation stressed throughout Volume 1 of the Report that the Branch should develop the function of representing the Indian's case in the many new situations of his life.

(3) All school authorities should recognize that special and remedial programs are required for the education of Indian children, whether under integrated or other auspices.

(4) The expectations of teachers and school authorities should be based on the practical rule that the range of potential intellectual capacity of Indian children is the same as that of White children.

(5) Educational programs should take into account the obvious differences in background of the Indian student and also the often less obvious differences in values and motivations.

(6) Teachers should be encouraged to learn as much as possible about the background and culture of their Indian students and should take the initiative in getting to know individuals.

Special Educational Services

(7) On entering school many Indian children, like many other children in Canada, speak English or French only as a second language if they speak it at all. To aid these children, the remedial courses in language which are a regular part of Provincial curricula should be offered in a form adapted to their special needs.

(8) Because children from many other backgrounds have parallel difficulties in learning and using English or French in the school, Provincial Departments of Education in conjunction with the Education Division of the Indian Affairs Branch should encourage university Faculties of Education to offer linguistic studies, including contrastive grammar, as a part of teacher training.

(9) It is recommended that the Indian Affairs Branch in conjunction with Extension Departments and Provincial Departments of Education sponsor special courses and institutes in the teaching of English as a second language. These courses would allow established teachers and the staff of faculties of education to become proficient in the newer techniques and familiar with the newer findings.

(10) The Indian Affairs Branch, through its curriculum division and by arrangements with outside specialists, should develop materials on Indian languages which could be used as guides for classroom teachers.

(11) Existing reserve kindergartens should be kept in operation except where children can be admitted into public school kindergartens. Where none of the latter is available, kindergartens should be introduced by the Indian Affairs Branch. A similar recommendation is offered for nursery school programs. Where possible, such programs should be cooperative so that Indian parents may share the responsibility for helping educate their young children. The program should emphasize the language arts and provide exposure to books, stories, records and similar experiences which are unavailable on the reserves.

(12) Few reserves have adequate home facilities for study. Several reserves have turned the Indian Day School or community hall into a study hail in the evenings. It is recommended that the Indian Affairs Branch encourage the establishment of Indian education committees which would arrange for supervised study periods for students. Tutoring should also be provided during study periods. Where they are available, high school volunteers could help younger children and university volunteers could help high school students. Teachers interested in Indian work might also assist, while Indian parents might help, as some now do, with transportation and general supervision.

Health

(13) The standard of health of many Indian children is marginal at best. All these children should receive mandatory medical examinations prior to school entry. These should be provided by Indian Health Services or by contract with whatever source is available. Dental and eye examinations should be required annually. In order to ensure that no child continues to suffer from malnutrition, from marginal sight or hearing or other disorders that would affect school work, the school nurse should check that prescribed treatment and medication are completed following examinations. In brief, a more act i ye public health service should be extended to Indian children and their parents.

(14) School complaints about the standard of personal hygiene of Indian children are numerous. Many Indian homes lack adequate bathroom and laundry facilities. In most schools there are other children whose homes also lack facilities and it is recommended that schools make arrangements so that students may use gymnasium showers and Home Economics laundry equipment. The practice of sending children home because they are dirty cannot remedy their situation and negates their education.

Although the full scope of this recommendation is beyond the responsibility of the Indian Affairs Branch, the Branch should initiate arrangements with schools that receive Indian students under joint agreement. Furthermore, in keeping with a recommendation of Volume 1 of the Report, it is urged that laundromats be considered as an enterprise to be encouraged on reserves.

Curriculum

(15) Some texts continue to include material about Indians which is inaccurate, overgeneralized and even insulting. Such texts should be eliminated from the curriculum. Where elimination must proceed gradually, it is recommended that teachers immediately correct the Indian content by reference to books and other sources which should be available in school libraries. To facilitate elimination, the Indian Affairs Branch should compile a list of texts whose references to Indians are incorrect and supply it to the Canadian Book Publishers Council as well as to Provincial Departments of Education.

The diversity of Indian cultures does not make it easy to present a detailed and accurate unit on Indians, although some Provincial and city museums have assumed the responsibility of supplying materials for this. Where the materials are not already available, schools with substantial Indian enrolments might be able to arrange with adult Indians to provide local Indian material for the social studies, art, drama and literature sections of the curriculum. Non-Indian children would benefit by having their horizons extended; Indian children could acquire a sense of worth and status.

Communication and Public Relations

(16) Almost all contacts between teachers and Indian parents are made in the school, are demanded by the teacher, and have the purpose of informing the parent about faults in the child. Teachers should visit the reserve to see parents whenever possible and it is strongly recommended that other occasions be created for contacts between parent and teacher. To facilitate return visits by parents, contracts for school bus services might be extended to include them.

(17) Both teachers and students report a lack of communication between them. Such a lack is not unique to schools with Indian students but the difficulty is compounded by differences in expectations and understanding when Indian students are involved. We have already recommended that teachers endeavour to increase their understanding of the background of the child. Putting this into practice, teachers should cease punishing Indian children for the results of situations they cannot control, such as tardiness, absenteeism and lack of cleanliness.

(18) Communication and relations between children of different backgrounds are sometimes good and sometimes poor. Except in isolated instances, the determining factor seems to be the general atmosphere in the school itself and in particular the limits to acceptable behaviour set by staff. Where verbal or physical attacks on Indian children occur, it is recommended that school personnel should assume full responsibility for stopping them. On the positive side, school administrators and teachers should create an atmosphere which will foster respect and friendship between White and Indian children.

Joint Agreements

It is recommended that:

(19) Public school facilities be used for the education of Indian children wherever the arrangements appear reasonable and beneficial.

(20) Agreements should not be made where Provincial schools are inferior or where community attitudes are unfavourable for Indian students.

(21) Agreements should not be signed prior to full and, if necessary, lengthy consultation of parents of Indian students and prior to ensuring their full cooperation as well as that of non-Indian parents. Some contact between parents of all school children should occur before final negotiations are undertaken.

(22) Agreements should include formal Indian representation on a Board where Provincial law allows. In other cases a Board should agree to accept informal representation.

(23) In order to ensure that Indian children are not handicapped by their status, provision should be made for group payments by the Indian Affairs Branch to the Board for required fees and expenditures for such items as textbooks, lunches, lockers and sports.

(24) Provincial Departments of Education should recognize that special facilities and personnel will be required for remedial programs; these should be provided under joint auspices and financing.

(25) The continuation of any joint agreement should be conditional on the school's continuing to provide the Indian child with an improved education

(26) Indian day schools should be considered for use as adult and remedial education centres when integration into the public schools is completed. Except in isolated areas there should be no further construction of these schools.

(27) Integration should occur only after the criteria outlined earlier are met.

(28) The conversion of present facilities into auxiliary resources should begin at the bottom and not the top. Thus ordinarily admission should be refused to Grade 8 of a residential school; Grade 11 students should not be compelled to integrate in their final year; children who will terminate school early should be permitted to stay on the reserve but Grade 1 students should be admitted directly into the public system.

Denominational and independent Schools

(29) Capital grants to reserve schools operated under religious auspices should be discontinued.

(30) Where reserve schools staffed by Indians are in existence and continuing to operate successfully (at par with public schools) they should be allowed to proceed as they are until parents propose that they integrate.

(31) Denominational boarding schools should be converted into full-time hostels and cease to operate as schools.

Vocational Training and Placement

(32) It is recommended that the Federal Government (Indian Affairs Branch and the Department of Manpower) continue to pay for upgrading courses for Indians aspiring to return to school, enter vocational training or gain employment.

(33) Information on upgrading and vocational training is not being adequately disseminated among Indians. A wider and more active system of providing information on courses, financing and application procedures should be instituted.

(34) The allocation of funds to this portion of the education program should be such that:

- (a) a continually increasing number of students can avail themselves of the opportunities for training;
- (b) students may live adequately so that they may pursue their work with the greatest effectiveness;
- (c) spouses and families can accompany the trainee to the training centre.

(35) A continually wider range of training programs should be suggested to applicants. Many students have abilities and desires to enter pursuits which they consider not available to them. Personnel should not reinforce the choice of "Indian occupations" and should systematically provide information on alternatives.

(36) We wish to repeat here our recommendation made in Volume 1 that the Indian Affairs Branch widen its assumption of responsibility for job placement of young Indians who have come to the city.

Additional

(37) It is recommended that the Indian Affairs Branch provide programs offering extra training through summer school, evening and inservice courses which would enable teachers and other personnel to gain some systematic knowledge about the people with whom they work, and that Boards, Provincial Federations and Departments of Education provide opportunity and incentives for teachers to take such courses.

(38) It is recommended that the Indian Affairs Branch explore such devices as programmed learning for possible use in upgrading children quickly and effectively; also, that a program of research be instituted in which problems related to the teaching of Indian students in public schools are investigated and experimental programs inaugurated for their solution.

(39) It is recommended that the Indian Affairs Branch remove all group psychological tests such as IQ and aptitude tests from its schools and that public schools be urged to do likewise. The Indian Affairs Branch is in the best position to alert all school authorities to the finding that such tests are neither valid nor reliable for Indian students.

(40) A liaison officer be appointed by Provincial Departments of Education with the function of coordinating the activities of various agencies and individuals concerned with Indian educational problems at the local level.

(41) That the role of school committees be enlarged in the interest of enlisting the special knowledge possessed by the adults of the reserve.

RECOMMENDATIONS ON BAND COUNCILS AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

(42) In elaboration of recommendations 85 and 86 of Part I, concerning the role of leadership and other adult education programs, research findings concerning their own lives should be presented in digest form to Indian people.

(43) One object in such leadership courses should be to get across the notion of cultural variability and plasticity, to widen the view of alternatives.

(44) In such courses, Indians should be encouraged to explain to non- Indians the underlying principles of achieving unanimity, saving face, avoiding discussion of the obvious, and other human relations matters at which they are said to excel, revealing that 'leadership' is much more than a matter of style, of acting 'with authority' by giving orders, of being skilled in parliamentary procedure, and so on.

(45) As a way of disseminating by radio information and ideas to Indian people in at least some of their own languages, projects such as that of the Indian Eskimo Association in the Arctic, modelled on the Farm Forum, should be extended into the northern regions of the provinces.

(46) Band councils and other bodies should be encouraged to seek professional advice of a legal, economic, and social character not only from official sources but from other sources as well.

(47) In elaboration of recommendation 50 of Part I, concerning the support of voluntary organizations, existing organizations, such as trappers' councils, conservation clubs, recreational clubs, cooperatives, should be encouraged to develop on a district or. regional basis. Support could be provided for travel and maintenance expenses incurred in the holding of meetings amongst those people living in regions where travel is difficult and expensive.

(48) Where no such structures exist locally, provision should be made in the community development budget and program for the establishing and maintaining of such cross-community ties.

(49) In elaboration of recommendation 89 of Part I, concerning the British Columbia experiment of forming district councils, we make a special point of stressing cross community ties in the more remote regions. In places where population is small, scattered, and where the present band councils are not isomorphic with any meaningful community structure, agency, district, or regional structures should be engendered.

(50) Such structures should have more than an advisory role, which requires that they be endowed with some powers. These units may be called by some such term as Local Improvement District or Resource Development District. The setting up of such districts should receive high priority in the community and economic development programs, and a special point should be made of intensive consultation with the Indians in the setting up of these district or regional units.

(51) It is desirable that people who are not registered Indian but who share the same regional living space and type of socioeconomic problem as registered Indians be included in such district or regional units. In order to achieve this, special arrangements will have to be concluded with provincial and

territorial governments. At present there are statutory barriers to such interaction in reserve areas and it is these statutory barriers which have to be dissolved through official action. However, there are other, non-statutory barriers, such as those of social distance, which can only be broken down in programs like those of community development, Friendship Centres and in the cooperative movement.

(52) To facilitate communication among representatives from different language backgrounds in councils that embrace districts and regions and to make it possible for people with little facility in one of the official languages to take part in such councils, the Indian Affairs Branch should provide training and material for simultaneous translation.

(53) In elaboration of recommendation 82 of Part I, concerning the fostering of a band civil service, such civil service employees should be responsible to the band council (or district council) and not to the Indian Affairs Branch. Salaries should be paid out of band funds where these are adequate and where councils control their own revenues, or out of grants to bands. Such band employees should not be eligible for council office in the larger bands.

(54) People for such positions should be recruited by open competition and these positions should not be tied specifically to membership in a given band or even to official Indian status.

(55) In places which are too small to warrant a full-time employee, the administration of local affairs could be performed – as indeed they are now in many cases – by a chief councillor or some other councillor who should be paid according to some formula based, say, on the estimated number of hours required to administer the affairs of the band or district. Alternatively, as proposed in recommendation 82 of Part I, one or more civil servants could be shared by small contiguous bands.

(56) The provision of such services should be undertaken by contract. That is, the incumbent should not be regarded as an employee of the Indian Affairs Branch, although that aspect of their work which has to do with the administration of welfare should be supervised and guided by federal or, where appropriate, provincial welfare officials (see recommendations 60, 61 of Part I).

(57) Where elected persons perform such administrative services under contract, some special machinery should be devised to provide recourse for people who feel that they are receiving unjust treatment.

(58) Even where they do not perform administrative tasks, chiefs and councillors should be granted more than the token remuneration they receive now. Councillors should receive at least $500.00 per year and chief councillors at least $750.00.

(59) Councils should be required to hold a specified number of meetings a year. Council meetings should be public and should be held as closely as possible to centres where the electors live so that maximum participation be ensured. Only people invited by Council should express themselves at Council meetings.

(60) Minutes of council meetings should be kept and should be made available to anyone requesting to see them. That is, they should be regarded as public documents. Resumes of council meetings should be posted.

CHAPTER II

AN ANALYSIS OF COMPETITIVE IDEOLOGIES

INTRODUCTION

The French concept of "éducation" and the English concept of "education" are not equivalent. Properly speaking, the English term "education" should be translated by the French term "instruction."

But, In order to avoid ambiguity, the English term "education" will be translated by the French term "éducation" in the following text. In addition, the expression "éducation scolaire" (academic training) will be used in a more restrictive sense.

1. Necessity for the Examination of Competitive Ideologies in the Field of Indian Education

It is felt that such an examination of ideologies on Indian education is necessary in order to understand the concepts of the various organizations involved concerning Indian education, and the resulting administrative policies, and also to gain an idea of the development of these concepts and policies through the years. Any action, any position taken to solve a problem is determined by the attitudes adopted in the face of the problem. Attitudes are the basis of action. By going back to attitudes we can retrace the concepts behind an action in a given situation. But again these attitudes, these concepts must be relatively uniform and recognizable. This analysis will proceed on three levels: the ideology of the federal and provincial governments, the ideology of intermediary groups, including Indian associations, and, finally, the ideology of denominational groups.

There are numerous administrators and other federal and provincial employees involved in Indian education. But as they belong to the same branch in their respective departments, they share to a certain extent the same attitudes – at least officially – or follow the same policy set forth by lawmakers or administrators in higher positions. There is therefore uniformity and continuity in the attitudes and concepts of these officials as regards Indian education. But there is also room for change. These changes may be due to several causes: changes in senior administration; changes due to the overwhelming influence of one or a few senior officials; transformations undergone by society. There is therefore a definite evolution in the attitudes and policies of administrations and, as a result, in ideologies.

As to an analysis of the ideologies of intermediary groups, Indian associations and religious denominations, these we regard as parallel ideologies. They tend to modify the official viewpoints of federal and provincial administrations. They are, moreover, competitive ideologies.

2. The Concept of "Ideology": Theoretic Outlook

Any ideology normally involves the following three elements:

(a) A definition of the overall social situation or of the particular social position of a given group.

(b) A line of action in accordance with objectives.

(c) An explanation or justification of the existence of the group and of its activity.

We wish to emphasize the fact that an ideology is not necessarily an evil thing, in the sense that it does not always constitute an erroneous concept of the social reality nor an unfounded justification of the influence of a group on society or a part of society. Hence it is not our purpose at the outset to pass judgment on the truth or error of various ideologies on Indian education. We wish essentially to analyze the contents of each in order to verify whether it corresponds to the social reality. An ideology may not correspond to reality and may lack cohesion either because the proposed action does not correspond to an analysis of the situation or because the action taken does not correspond to the planned action. On the latter point, we may wonder whether the ideology defined by senior officials is applied as such by subordinates. We shall discuss these questions after our analysis of ideologies.

3. Documentary Sources

Our analysis of ideologies on Indian education has been based on three types of written documents: A. legislative documents; B. administrative documents; and C. conference reports.

The majority of the documents consulted are of recent date, having been published between 1960 and 1965. The major portion of what follows will therefore deal with the most recent expression of various ideologies. At the same time, we shall briefly describe the development of these ideologies where our documentation permits.

The most important documents on which our various reports are based are the following:

A. Legislative Documents

(a) Indian Act, R.S., 1952, c. 149 as amended 1952-53, c. 41; 1956, c. 40.

(b) Minutes of Proceedings and Evidence, The Joint Committee of the Senate and House of Commons on Indian Affairs, No. 16, 1961.

B. Administrative Documents

(a) Administration of Indian Affairs, prepared for the 1964 Federal-Provincial Conference on Indian Affairs.

(b) Indian Education, in the series Indian in Transition, published by the Indian Affairs Branch, 1962.

C. Conference Reports

Minutes of the second and third meetings of the Schools in the Forest Conferences, 1964, 1965.

The majority of the administrative documents consulted were prepared by the Indian Affairs Branch. Of 24 documents consulted for the purpose of defining federal government ideology on Indian education, 18 came from the Indian Affairs Branch. Documents used to define the ideologies of the provinces are less numerous and less substantial but at least adequate to give us a brief picture. A few interviews with members of school boards make it possible for us to rapidly outline the attitudes of school boards in respect to Indian education.

4. Chapter Outline

The order and importance of the reports will correspond to the importance of the documentation gathered and to the degree of responsibility of the various organizations in Indian education. We shall analyze successively the ideology of federal government administrators, the ideologies of provincial government administrators, that of members of school boards, of private bodies and of denominational groups.

I. FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IDEOLOGY

1. Legal Foundation

Section 91 of the British North America Act gave the Government of Canada legal authority over Indians and matters which concern them. As a result, Indian affairs have always been considered the responsibility of the federal government. However, provincial laws also apply to Indians in areas not affected by a particular federal legislation. This exclusive right of the federal government to legislate in Indian matters creates difficulties when it comes to drawing up joint federal-provincial agreements on education or the economic and social welfare of Indians.

In fact, up till very recently, the federal government had always considered itself as bearing the sole responsibility for Indian affairs. But since the Government of Canada has wished to share this responsibility with the provinces, by virtue of the principle that Indians are also citizens of the provinces, it has been experiencing difficulty in having this change in policy accepted by the provinces. Because, although prepared to share responsibilities, the federal government continues to claim exclusive legal jurisdiction over Indian affairs.

This constitutional position determined that federal authorities have long been the only ones to deal with Indian affairs from both the legislative and executive points of view. It is not surprising, therefore, that the majority of the documents analyzed stem from federal authorities. However, in this Report we did not feel it wise to retain this distinction between lawmakers and administrators, realizing that the second has influenced the first as we noted in the analysis of the three documents of the last Joint Committee of the Senate and House of Commons on Indian Affairs. Administrators, in turn, must be directed by the Indian Act and organize their activities in conformity with it.

2. Development of the Ideology of Federal Administrators

The ideology of federal officials in charge of Indian affairs has evolved so much over the years that it is more correct to speak of several ideologies than one and the same ideology. The ideology of present administrators is considerably different from that of early administrators.

A. Paternalistic Ideology (1867 - 1945)

When Confederation was achieved in 1867, the federal government was entrusted with the administration of treaties concluded formerly between the Imperial Government and the Indians and decided to continue the policy of making treaties. By such treaties, the majority of Indians surrendered their exclusive interest in the land to the Crown and, in return, the latter set aside a part of this territory for their use and provided them with "additional benefits such as cash payments, annuities, educational facilities and other considerations."[1] The government also agreed to protect the territorial reserves and interests of the Indians.

These treaties are the source of the protectionist and paternalistic attitudes which for a long time influenced federal administrators in their dealings with the Indians. A former minister of Citizenship and Immigration described this attitude in the following terms:

> The attitudes of many years ago were paternalistic and even restrictive in nature, providing, it is true, for the minimum care and protection of Indians, but encouraging little initiative on their part to improve their own lot.[2]

Another quotation from a senior official supports this statement:

> In their eagerness to protect Indians from becoming victims of modern society, early governments in Canada set up protective legislation and administration which has been partly responsible for the fact that Indian communities generally still remain outside of the mainstream of Canadian economic, social and cultural events.[3]

This policy of confining bands to their reserves and as much as possible preventing contact with the outside world largely contributed to the Indians' continued isolation from the Canadian community at large. Hence the ideology at that time was definitely conservative. It was hoped that the Indians would preserve their traditional ways of life. However, officials overlooked the fact that the Indians' hunting grounds were considerably reduced. Once resources became insufficient, the Indians in increasingly greater numbers were forced to abandon their traditional economic activities to become dependents of the State. In addition, no thought was given to the fact that sooner or later contact with the outside Industrial society would be inevitable and the Indian would be totally unprepared.

With the earlier policy, the Indian was expected to be born, live and die on his reserve. There was no question of his leaving. The reserve was his refuge and salvation. Under these circumstances, the little education extended to the Indians was felt to be adequate to assure their economic and social welfare within the limits of the reserve. To be able to read, write and count, to know how to utilize and preserve the environment, to possess some notion of hygiene, this was felt sufficient for life on the reserve. Academic knowledge as such was not considered important.

---

[1] Indian Affairs Branch, Administration of Indian Affairs, prepared for the Federal-Provincial Conference on Indian Affairs, 1964, Department of Citizenship and Immigration, Ottawa, p. 4.

[2] René Tremblay, New Directions in Indians'Affairs, Notes for an Address by the Hon. René Tremblay, Minister of Citizenship and Immigration, to the Indian-Eskimo Association of Canada, at London, Ontario, on Saturday, November 21, 1964, p. 1.

[3] R.F. Battle, Address to the Fifth Inter-American Indian Conference, Ecuador, October 19-25, 1964, p. 8.

This isolationist, protectionist and paternalistic ideology was largely nurtured by administrators of Indians Affairs up to the end of the Second World War. The Indian Act, although since amended, still testifies in several of its sections to this same paternalistic spirit through the frequently discretionary powers it granted to the responsible Minister and the Governor-in-Council.

B. Democratic Ideology: The Indian, a Full-Fledged Citizen, 1945-1965

The post-war period witnessed a new trend in federal government policy in Indian Affairs. Initiative on the part of the Indian and the opening of reserves to the outside world were fostered. Indian children began to attend the same schools as Whites. As these first experiments proved successful, efforts were continued in this direction with the particular objective of integrating the Indian into Canadian society. The old paternalistic attitudes slowly faded and finally disappeared, at least officially, on the part of senior officials of the Indian Affairs Branch. There was now a desire to see the Indians integrate completely in the economic and social life of Canada and to live on an equal footing with other citizens of the country.

Attitudes changed so much that the period 1960-1965 witnessed a new ideology in administration of Indians' affairs, particularly in the field of education. This is the ideology we wish to describe in detail in the following pages. The ideology is both a definition of the social position of the Indians and a plan of action based chiefly on education.

A Definition of the Socio-Cultural Context of the Indians

Like any ideology, the ideology of federal officials in Indian affairs in general and on Indian education in particular involves a definition of the soda-cultural world of the Indian. It is important, therefore, to define the social position of the Indians as viewed by administrators, since it directly influences the line of action proposed for education. This definition concerns the Indians, their past and their history, their development, their demography, their economic and social welfare, their future and their relations with the rest of Canadian society.

1°/ Origin, History and Demography

What is known of the origin and history of the principal Indian groups in Canada as outlined in the document entitled Administration of Indian Affairs (pp. 1-3) corresponds to the latest anthropological and sociological information on the subject. Emphasis is placed on the probable Asiatic origin of the Indians and the subdivision of Indians in Canada into numerous linguistic groups. There are five different ecological areas which determine cultural traditions which are extremely different from one area to the next. This heterogeneity and the dispersion of the various groups are two main characteristics of Indian society.

In addition to the initial differences on the ecological level, there are various differences on the sociological level. The many groups show various degrees of development. The same is true of Indians taken individually, "from the hunter to the highly skilled labourer or professional." It will be noted also that the Indian population is increasing more rapidly than any other group in Canada. Today, Indians are as numerous as upon the arrival of the first explorers, 200,000 individuals approximately. This population is divided into more than 500 different bands having access to 2,241 reserves. The concepts of "bands" and "reserves" are the key concepts in the federal ideology. According to the Indian Act, a "band" is a body of Indians who possess lands, for whose use moneys are held by the federal government or who have received their legal status from the Governor-in-Council.[1] On the other hand, the term "reserve" designates:

> a tract of land, the legal title to which is vested in Her Majesty, that has been set apart by Her Majesty for the use and benefit of a band.[2]

These two definitions explain a great deal about the dependent status of the Indians.

The annual rate of increase of the Indian population of Canada is estimated at 4 per cent despite a high infant mortality rate. Following this pattern, the Indian population should double in less than 25 years.

2°/ Economic and Social Position

It is more or less plainly recognized that the Indians have long been neglected and that their economic and social position is well below that of other Canadian citizens. A Northern Affairs official has summed up the situation in these few words:

> During the first 90 years of our existence the Indian people of Canada have not shared in our growth in the way those of us whose parents and grandparents have come to this country have done.[3]

The enormous economic gap between the Indian and non-Indian communities is due to the fact that for a very long time, the Indians were excluded from the economic life of the rest of Canada. Confined to their reserves, the Indians were unable to take positions in industries and receive wages in return for their services. Later, when they began to leave the reserves, their lack of academic preparation prevented them from being able to compete with a more highly skilled, non-Indian labour force. Moreover, jobs within the reserves were always limited and generally unprofitable. Income from fishing, hunting and the trapping of fur-bearing animals does not compare with the wages paid in industry. The paternalistic attitude of government authorities perpetuated their economic inferiority by preferring to hand out subsidies and direct aid to needy Indians rather than reorganizing their economy and preparing them for salaried jobs.

The Indians' economic inferiority is directly reflected in the higher costs of social allowances paid out to Indians in need. Each year approximately 36 per cent of the Indian population must be supported in this way as compared to only 3 ½ per cent of the non-Indian population. On certain reserves, more than half the Indians receive direct aid at one time or another during the year. The per capita cost of social assistance paid to Indians is 22 times greater than the per capita cost for non-Indians. In 1963, the federal treasury spent 72 million dollars for Indians and the budget is increasing each year.

Government efforts to raise the standard of living of the Indians are concerned primarily with social welfare and economic development, in addition to very important efforts in the field of education, of which we shall speak further on.

---

[1] Canada, Indian Act, R.S., 1952, c. 149 as amended 1952-1953, c. 41; 1956, c. 40. Department of Citizenship and Immigration, p. 1.

[2] Ibid p. 2.

[3] Schools in the Forest, Report of the Third Conference, Yellowknife, North West Territories, May 4-7, 1965, p. 11.

The purpose of the social welfare program is to "assist Indians and Indian communities to achieve and maintain a standard of living comparable to that of non-Indians in similar socio-economic conditions."[1] To this end, agreements are negotiated with various provincial welfare agencies who extend their services to the Indians through added financial assistance. The federal welfare program covers public assistance (food, clothing, fuel and household equipment for indigents); protection and maintenance services for children; care of the aged; rehabilitation programs for physically and socially handicapped persons and a variety of programs designed to develop Indian leadership and promote the improvement of Indian communities.[2] In addition, Indians are entitled to family allowances, old-age assistance and disabled persons' allowances like any other Canadian citizen.

The government operates health services for the Indian although it is recognized that the Indian has no statutory entitlement to such services. In this way, an attempt is made to assure Indians of health and hygiene services comparable to those enjoyed by other Canadians. The activities of these health services are directed principally to the following areas: diffusion of information on hygiene and child care; assistance to women during pregnancy and birth; diagnosis and treatment of endemic diseases such as tuberculosis and pneumonia. Despite such efforts, the infant mortality rate is much higher for the Indian population than for the rest of the Canadian population. Infant mortality is three times greater, infant mortality rate in the pre-school age group Is four times higher.[3]

Aware that welfare measures are only palliative measures to assist needy Indians and that they cannot provide the standard of living to which the Indians are entitled as Canadian citizens, government authorities decided to concentrate their efforts on the economic development of the reserves. Their purposes are twofold. The first objective is to "encourage individual Indians and communities to provide for their basic economic needs at a level comparable to that of other Canadians in similar locations and circumstances. The second, and most important since it is directed toward human development, is to encourage individual and group participation in the Canadian social and economic environment by providing assistance in securing employment off reserves and guidance in making the transition to urban living. The basic objective is to help Indians develop and put to the best possible use the resources both on and off reserves which are, or can be, made available to them. Programs are essentially of a self-help nature, with financial assistance on a repayable basis in so far as is possible."[4] This text tells a lot about the new ideology of federal administrators on Indian affairs and introduces two new ideas which must be explained further: integration of the Indian in Canadian life, and the opening up of the reserves to the outside world.

3°/ The Future of the Indians

aa) The reserve System Versus Administrative Autonomy[5]

It is the present policy of the federal government to favour an increasingly wider share of responsibility on the part of the Indians, Indian bands and band councils in the administration of their own affairs. It is considered that "band councils may exercise most of the authority of local municipal councils."[6] The Indian Act confers upon the council of a band the authority to make "by-laws for a number of different purposes": for health, regulation of traffic on the reserves, public works, maintenance of law and order, protection of game and other matters concerning the welfare of the bands.[1] A still wider autonomy is extended, by virtue of Section 82, to bands which are felt to have reached a sufficiently advanced stage of development. The councils of these bands are authorized to raise money in the interests of the band. They may also administer all band funds kept on deposit by the Indian Affairs Branch and deal with "the surrender or lease of reserve lands, land allotment and band membership." "Management of welfare assistance, community planning, economic development and school administration may also be placed in varying degrees within their administrative orbit, depending on their willingness to accept the responsibility."[2] Up to 1964, 118 bands had passed a total of 338 by-laws since 1951.

---

[1] Administration of Indian Affairs, p. 65.

[2] Loc. cit.

[3] Ibid., p. 106.

[4] Ibid., p. 76.

[5] Here we present federal ideology and do not discuss our analysis and recommendations given in the first volume of the Report.

[6] Administration of Indian Affairs. p. 21.

Various obstacles of a geographic or sociological nature prevent a greater number of bands from participating in self-government. Distance and isolation, dispersion or a limited number of members, the absence of band funds are serious impediments to achievement by the bands of a degree of autonomy. However, there are over 300 bands "for whom advanced administrative development is clearly practical and an increasing number of these are showing a willingness to assume greater responsibility in the conduct of their affairs."[3] With this in mind, every possible encouragement is given to the emergence of capable and competent Indian leaders who will assume administration of their communities. Accordingly, leadership courses are given to Indian chiefs in a few universities in the country. There is a desire also to recognize and encourage such leadership:

> . . . we must at all times give due and proper recognition to Indian leaders, particularly those who have been elected by their people. . . . No opportunity must be lost to publicly give recognition to Indian leadership.[4]

Consultation with the Indians on matters of deep concern to them is also regarded as a method of increasing their participation in the management of their affairs. The following passage from a speech by a senior official clearly points to this:

> I stress and underline the need for full consultation with the Indians. . . . They, through their own leaders, must be partners with us in charting a new approach and new programs.[5]

However, it is noted that there is not yet an adequate organization for quick consultation with all the Indian communities of Canada. The reasons for this lack are the following:

(a) the large number and dispersion of bands over a vast territory;

(b) linguistic differences;

---

[1] Indian Act, Section 80.

[2] Administration of Indian Affairs, p. 27.

[3] Ibid., p.22.

[4] National Superintendents' Conference, The Years Ahead, Address of Lt. Col. H.M. Jones, Director of Indian Affairs, Harrison Hot Springs, September 18, 1961, p.4.

[5] Senior Field Officers' Conference, January 1964, Ottawa, p.20.

(c) the fact that the various Indian associations are not fully representative;

(d) various levels of advancement among bands;

(e) the reticence of Indians to give a clear expression of opinion;

(f) tribal jealousies.

To overcome these difficulties, the Indian Affairs Branch considered the setting up of Indian Regional Advisory Committees which would be invited to give their opinion and make recommendations on general policies regarding Indian affairs, such as new legislation, federal-provincial agreements, improvement of already existing programs, and the drawing up of new programs.

These measures designed to promote greater participation of Indians in the administration of their affairs correspond to the recommendations of the last Joint Committee of the Senate and House of Commons on Indian Affairs, which submitted its final report in 1962. The Committee recommended that the government grant "greater authority and responsibility to band councils and to individual Indians and, as a result, limiting departmental authority and control" and encourage "Indians to accept and exercise such authority and responsibility."[1] In order to promote such initiative on the part of the Indians, the Committee proposed several amendments to the Indian Act which, in the judgment of the Report, is of an extremely limiting nature and confers many discretionary powers on the minister and his representatives.[2] The principal changes proposed by the Committee were to increase Indian participation in the utilization and administration of the resources on the reserves, the election and authority of band councils, the use and handling of band funds. A recommendation was made that land within the reserves be administered by the bands or by capable individuals of the band, that the band council be given more responsibility and authority, that it control band funds and that it be given more scope in matters of credit.

The new ideology is therefore quite different from the former paternalistic ideology which prevented the Indians from doing anything to improve their condition. This new ideology may be summed up in the following terms: "the essential ingredient for the full success of all our operations -- full participation by the Indian people under their own leaders."[3] This formula pertains more to a line of action than to reality because, as we have seen, many bands have not yet been affected by this new policy and contribute very little, if anything at all, to the administration of their own affairs. Moreover, as long as the Indian Act remains unamended, it will constitute an impediment to full autonomy on the part of Indian bands.

The relative autonomy presently enjoyed by certain more advanced bands is far from being complete. The Indian Affairs Branch still possesses final authority over the administration of Indian lands and moneys. True, individuals or bands may request their complete emancipation and obtain it, but in the process they lose their status as Indians and Indian bands and all the privileges implied.

It is the ultimate objective of the federal government to grant complete autonomy to Indian bands and to release them from government patronage. The following quotation supports this:

---

[1] Joint Committee of the Senate and House of Commons on Indian Affairs, Minutes of Proceedings and Evidence, No. 16, Queen's Printer, Ottawa, 1961, p.5.

[2] Ibid., p.9.

[3] H.M. Jones, National Superintendents' Conference, p.17.

> . . . until Indians no longer require our services, we cannot claim that we have reached our final objective.
> . . . Any assistance we give to Indians must in some means contribute to their preparation for the day of our eventual demise.[1]

However, it is hoped that even after achieving independence, bands will retain the cultural and economic advantages they have inherited. The proposed system is the following: that "bands will become self-governing in the sense that they will operate as municipalities within the framework of the provincial-municipal structure."[2]

What then will become of the reserve system? According to one official, a large number of Indians will not want to abandon their reserve or see the government abandon the reserve system.[3] These Indians are still fully dependent on the federal government and are not ready to assume their own responsibilities. Moreover, it is not the intention of the government to force Indians off their reserves, but rather to replace the status of the reserve by that of an autonomous community or municipality. In this way, Indians will be able to retain a sense of belonging to a social and cultural community.

Thus although the ideology of the federal government is not very clear as regards the reserve system, It seems apparent that the system is not to be abandoned for the moment.

bb) Integration Versus Assimilation of the Indians

By integration of the Indians, we mean their full participation in the economic and social life of Canada, together with the retention of some of their cultural characteristics such as pride of origin, knowledge of their history, passing on of their traditions and preservation of their language.

In several documents, integration of the Indians in the social and economic life of Canada is defined as one of the long-term objectives of federal government policy in Indian affairs:

> the basic objective of the federal government in Indian administration is to assist the Indians to participate fully in the social and economic life of Canada

as stated on page 6 of the document on Administration of Indian Affairs.

> Related to this basic objective are the alms of the government's specific programmes in the field of education, economic development, social welfare and community development. All of these programmes foresee the Indian people sharing the rights and responsibilities of citizenship and participating on the basis of equality and opportunity through the full spectrum of Canadian life.[5]

---

[1] H.M. Jones, National Superintendents' Conference, p. 5.

[2] Administratiori of Indian Affairs, p. 28.

[3] R.F. Battle, Senior Field Officers' Conference, p. 6.

[4] Joint Committee.. p. 5; Administration of Indian Affairs, p. 8 and 76; R.F. Battle, Fifth Inter-American Indian Conference, p. 20; Senior Field Officers' Conference, p. 19; National Superintendents' Conference, p. 10.

[5] Administration of Indian Affairs, p. 6.

The idea that Indians should become equal with other Canadian citizens occupies an important place in the new ideology. Indians should enjoy the same standard of living and have the same opportunities as non-Indians. We quote the following two passages:

> Present policy in which Indians are encouraged to engage fully in economic competition as social equals of other Canadians has been encouraged by public opinion[1]

and

> We must look forward to the day when Indians have as equal a chance as any other group to the very best that the country has to offer . . .[2]

It was with this in view that the right to vote in federal and provincial elections was extended without restriction to Indians of voting age. Likewise, restrictions regarding consumption of alcoholic beverages by Indians are tending to disappear. Federal authorities are also of the opinion that more federal-provincial agreements in the field of education, welfare and economic development will help place Indians on an equal footing with other citizens of the same provinces.[3]

In the minds of the federal administrators there are numerous obstacles to the programs of cultural change which lead to integration of the Indian. Geographic isolation of a large number of bands and lack of schooling are seen as two major obstacles. Other equally important obstacles are of a psychological and cultural nature: distrust of change from outside, and the reluctance of Indians to take the initiative in such programs. Racial discrimination is not considered an important obstacle. This cultural transition from a state of segregation to a state of complete integration is viewed as a long and difficult process.

In certain texts, the integration process is clearly defined as being different from the assimilation process:

> Progress will be in direct ratio to the degree in which the public and governments realize that the participation of Indians in the social and economic life of Canada on a basis of equality of opportunity need not, in fact must not, be contingent on the Indians surrendering their heritage, their culture, their reserves and the special rights that have been conferred upon them as the first citizens of Canada, unless the Indians so desire.[4]

Other texts are more ambiguous. Certain texts emphasize that the Indians must retain their particular cultural values in this transition from a traditional to a modern society, but it is not made clear what these values are. There is no reference to preservation of language which is a primary factor in the preservation of the cultural identity of a community. It is stated, however, that cultural change is inevitable[5] and that various bands are more or less advanced in the cultural process.[6] However, there is no complete and detailed conception of the various stages in the process of cultural change which Indian communities must undergo. Federal government ideology, therefore, must be more precise on the subject of integration.

---

[1] R.F. Battle, Fifth Inter-American Indian Conference, p. 15.

[2] H.M. Jones, National Superintendents' Conference, p. 10.

[3] Administration of Indian Affairs, p. 16; R.F. Battle, Fifth Inter-American Indian Conference, p. 16.

[4] Ibid., p. 20. The underlining is ours.

[5] H.M. Jones, National Superintendents' Conference, p. 9.

[6] R.F. Battle, Fifth Inter-American Indian Conference, p. 3.

3. Indian Education: Instrument of Integration

Among the various means envisaged by the federal authorities as promoting the integration of Indians into Canadian society, education is given a position of primary importance. The Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons on Indian Affairs states this clearly in the following words:

> Your Committee is of the opinion that the key to the full realization of self-determination and self-government and mutual self-respect for the heritage and culture of Indian and non-Indian, will be found in the field of education.... Education is necessary if Indian people are to be able to fit properly and competently into our economic and social structure and effectively fill the role, which will be demanded of them in years to come, as spokesmen and leaders of their own people.

The Committee's opinion is shared by the Indian Affairs Branch and reflected in concrete measures. For several years, the efforts of the Branch have been concentrated on the extension and improvement of the educational services offered to Indians. A large proportion of the Branch's staff and a considerable portion of its budget are devoted to this educational activity.

Of course, the field of education is normally a provincial responsibility, under the terms of the British North America Act. However, since the legal authority for Indian affairs has been delegated to the federal government under the same Act, Indian education has been considered a federal field.[2] According to sections 4(13) and 113 to 122 of the Indian Act, all "Indians ordinarily resident on reserves or on Crown Lands" may take advantage of the government's educational services.[3] These services are free of charge, except for Indians having special revenues. Such Indians are "invited" to bear a share of the costs.

The policy of the federal government with regard to Indian education has evolved considerably since the Second World War. Before this time, education was not considered necessary for Indians in general. Only those living near cities or towns were able to profit from it. It was felt that those living in isolated areas had no need of education to continue their traditional way of life within the reserve system. Reserves, according to the theory of the time, were to be kept free from the influence of the modern industrial world. As a result, the system of education made available to the Indians left a great deal to be desired. Few schools existed and the level of education which they offered was low. Only a few hundred Indians, a number later increased to several thousand, attended school with any degree of regularity.

The first schools, moreover, were founded by religious groups before the federal government took over responsibility for all educational activity. Schools were normally segregated and there was no question of allowing Indian students to attend the same schools as Whites. This old system of education has been judged to be completely inadequate:

---

[1] Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons on Indian Affairs, Final Report: V: Education and Development of Human Resources, 1961, pp. 610-611.

[2] Cf.: Volume 1, Ch, XII.

[3] Administration of Indian Affairs, p.44.

> Conditions with regard to education were extremely unsatisfactory at the end of the Second World War, with general apathy, absenteeism and inadequate teachers and facilities among the disadvantages to be overcome.[1]

Since 1945, the position of the Indian schools has changed considerably as a result of the new orientation of government thinking. Because the influence of the outside world on the Indians' way of life was judged to be Inevitable, it was considered necessary to extend educational services to the greatest possible number of Indians. The educational system improved progressively. New schools were built in many areas, and competent teachers were hired. The school population expanded and educational levels Improved rapidly. The figures are eloquent testimony to the phenomenal expansion. Between 1948 and 1964, the number of Indians attending school rose from 23,285 to 55,475. During this same period, the number of students at the secondary level increased from 700 to approximately 5,000. The budget for education, which was approximately $5,000,000 In 1948, sextupled to $31,500,000 in 1963. This sum represented slightly more than half the total budget of the Indian Affairs Branch.[2]

The new philosophy must also be credited with the implementation of a vast program of school integration of Indian children. increasing numbers of these children are attending the same schools as non-Indian children. Although fewer than 100 Indian children attended Integrated schools In 19145, the number was 22,764 In 19614. This figure represented over 40% of the entire Indian school population. (In 1967, more than 50% of the Indian school population attended integrated schools.) School Integration Is thus the distinctive feature of the new philosophy and is the result of an attitude radically different from the old paternalism of government officials. It is a logical part of the new policy of integrating Indians with Canadian life.

Following this brief description of the evolution of federal policy on Indian education, we must now turn to a more detailed study of the new educational Ideology and its implementation. For the purposes of this study, we shall deal successively with the following points:

A. legislation regarding Indian schools;

B. aims of Indian education;

C. types of schools attended by Indians;

D. courses and teaching staff;

E. adult education;

F. Indian participation in education.

A. Legislation regarding Indian Schools

A brief analysis of sections 113 to 122 of the Indian Act will reveal the legal framework within which federal officials must work in the field of Indian education.

Section 113 states that the government may enter into agreements with provincial governments, school boards and religious organizations, for the education of Indian children. Under the terms of section 115, Indians between the ages of 7 and 17 are required to attend school and the Minister may oblige any Indian to attend school until the age of 18. Moreover, the Minister is also authorized to designate the school which an Indian child will attend, on the condition that he respect the child's religious beliefs and assign him to a school of the proper denomination. For instance, no Protestant child shall be required to attend a Catholic school and vice versa.[1] The Minister may also appoint truant officers to enforce the attendance at school of school-age Indian children.[2] Section 120 provides that "where the majority of the members of a band belong to one religious denomination, the school established on the reserve that has been set apart for the use and benefit of that band shall be taught by a teacher of that denomination." However, a religious minority may, with the approval of the Minister, have separate education for its children, on condition that their numbers warrant separate facilities.[3]

---

[1] R.F. Battle, Fifth Inter-American Indian Conference, p.10.

[2] Loc. cit.

The three basic principles of the law as regards Indian schools then are the following:

(a) the federal government's right to delegate to non-federal bodies the responsibility of educating Indian children or of administering the schools attended by such children;

(b) the parents' right to have their children educated in the religion of their choice; and

(c) the requirement that children attend school between the ages of 7 and 16, and the provision of coercive measures to ensure this.

These are broad principles and the law is vague as to its implementation. Officials thus have a substantial degree of latitude in determining the aims to be achieved and the means or methods to be used in achieving them.

B. Aims of Indian Education

As we have emphasized, the general aim of the federal government's present policy is based on the necessity of integrating Indians into Canadian society. Education is considered the principal means for achieving this aim. The secondary aims are to provide Indians with a degree of economic and social welfare equivalent to that of non-Indians and to provide them with the knowledge which they will need to live adequately within their own environment. These objectives are defined as follows in the document entitled The Administration of Indian Affairs:

> The educational system administered by the Indian Affairs Branch attempts to provide a complete educational program for every Indian child according to individual needs, local circumstances and the wishes of the parents. Its objective is to assist the Indian people in bridging the socio-economic gap between the Indian and non-Indian in Canada, and to provide each child with the education and training necessary for economic competence.[4]

Hence, the aim is to raise the educational standards of Indians to a level equivalent to that of the province in which they live and to prepare them for remunerative employment and, eventually, urban life. "To enable Indian school children to attain the grade achievement standards of the Province school population."[1]

---

[1] Section 117.

[2] Section 118.

[3] Section 121.

[4] The Administration of Indian Affairs, p. 41 .

School integration of Indians with non-Indians is seen as the primary means of attaining this long-term objective. Several texts are explicit on this point. The following three excerpts are typical.

> It is the policy of the Department to educate Indian children wherever possible in association with other children, particularly where accommodation is available and practical in a provincial school system and provided the Indians approve.[2]
>
> Overall planning . . . is based on the assumption that all Indian children should receive their education in association with other Canadian children.[3]
>
> We believe that by having Indian children and other Canadian children grow up and play together in the same school yard, they will work together better in later life.[4]

The program of Indian school integration constitutes the central point of the federal government's policy in the field of Indian education. We shall deal in greater detail with integrated schools in the following section, which discusses the types of schools attended by Indians.

C. Types of Schools attended by Indians

Education for Indians is offered in three major groups of schools, depending on the conditions of the moment and the environment: (a) denominational schools; (b) federal schools; and (c) integrated schools. Through the evolution of the types of schools attended by Indians, we can readily detect the changes in federal policy on Indian education.

(a) Denominational Schools

The term "denominational schools" is not intended to indicate a distinction from "federal schools", since religious education is offered in federal schools as well, but rather to mean schools founded and operated by religious denominations.

Historically, denominational schools were the first to be made available to the Indians, since the education of children has always been one of the major fields of missionary work by the various churches. After the federal government assumed the responsibility for Indian education, these churches continued to take an interest in Indian education and were offered the responsibility for Indian residential schools. The following four religious denominations continue to exercise this historic right: The Roman Catholic Church, the Anglican

---

[1] Schools in the Forest, Report of the Second Interprovincial Conference, Prince Albert, Saskatchewan, May 4-7, 1964, p.56.

[2] The Administration of Indian Affairs, p.41.

[3] Indian Affairs Branch, Observations on the Integration Program, The Education Division, Ottawa, February 1963, p.8.

[4] René Tremblay, New Directions in Indian Affairs, Notes for an Address to the Indian-Eskimo Association of Canada, at London, Ontario, 1964, p.4.

Church, the United Church and the Presbyterian Church. This traditional association between the religious denominations and the education of Indian children has resulted in a situation where education is still denominational through the free choice of the parents, in schools operated by the federal government as well as in residential schools.

Today, only very few residential schools still belong to the Roman Catholic clergy. They are operated by the clergy "on a per capita grant paid to the church authorities on behalf of each Indian child whose enrollment in these schools has been authorized by the Branch." Many other residential schools belonging to the federal government are "operated by religious denominations under basic financing agreements with the Branch," We shall discuss the residential schools further in the following group of schools.

The historical interest of the religious denominations is thus still recognized by the federal government, although the work of these denominations is now limited mainly to the administration of residential schools provided for Indians by the federal government.

(b) Federal Schools

The federal schools attended by Indians fall into three categories: day schools, residential or boarding schools, and hospital schools.

1°/ Day Schools

The day schools are located on the reserves and provide education for Indian children living on these reserves. Thus, only Indian children attend these schools. This type of school is a product of the ideology of the past, according to which Indians were to remain on the reserves and be trained solely for the life of the reserves. There are, however, still many isolated reserves where the establishment of integrated schools remains impossible and where the day school system is the only practical means of providing a basic education to Indians.

Today, the number of day schools and the number of students attending them is generally stationary. This fact is attributable to the new philosophy of education which encourages the attendance of Indian children at the same schools as non-Indian children wherever possible.

2°/ Residential or Boarding Schools

> Residential or boarding schools are operated for orphan children, children from broken homes and those who because of isolation or the migratory way of life of their families, are unable to attend day schools.[3]

As we have seen, all these schools are operated by religious authorities, and financed by the federal government.

Over the past few years, there has been an evolution in the concept of residential schools parallel to the evolution in federal thinking on Indian education. Formerly, the residential schools were segregated, providing education for Indians only. Today, most residential schools are developing into school residences where Indian children attending integrated schools away from home may board.

---

[1] The Administration of Indian Affairs, p.44.

[2] Loc. cit.

[3] Loc. cit.

Six such schools are now used exclusively as hostels for students attending non-Indian schools, while twenty have varying numbers of hostel students.[1]

3°/ Hospital Schools

The many Indian children who are in government hospitals and sanatoria for long periods of time can still receive an education, thanks to these hospital schools.

> Instruction is not restricted to Indians of school age, and training is given both to pre-school children and to adults.[2]

In 1960-61, 293 Indian students attended schools of this type.

(c) Integrated Joint Schools

The program of Indian school integration pursued by the Indian Affairs Branch is implemented through what are generally known as "joint schools" where Indians and non-Indians receive their education together. In most cases, these schools are part of a provincial school system. Besides encouraging the integration of Indian children in Canadian society, it is felt that school integration has permitted considerable improvement in the level of teaching offered. Secondary and higher education for Indians is generally included in the provincial systems of education. This practice relieves Indian Affairs of a considerable administrative burden. The federal government, however, continues to pay the operating expenses.

Attendance of Indian children at integrated schools is ensured by joint agreements between the Indian Affairs Branch and the school boards concerned. The basic principles governing these agreements are as follows:

aa) The federal government agrees to pay a portion of the school's administrative expenses for each Indian admitted and a portion of the capital invested in each new construction intended for Indian students.

bb) The school board agrees to admit Indian students to its schools and to see that they are treated on an equal basis with the other students.

cc) No joint agreement may be signed without the prior consent of the Indian parents. In 1964, there were more than 200 joint agreements in existence.

Because of the scope of the administrative work involved in all these individual agreements, the federal authorities hope to establish comprehensive agreements with the various provincial governments, under which a per capita grant would be made to the provinces for admission of Indian children to their schools. Such comprehensive agreements already exist between the governments of British Columbia and Manitoba and the federal government.

The Indian Affairs Branch feels that, as a general rule, Indian parents favour the idea of sending their children to integrated schools. Indian children do not appear to have any great difficulties in making friends among their non-Indian school-mates. Moreover, the parents are happy to see their children treated on an equal basis with the other children and to see them attaining the same degree of success. The feelings of inferiority created by school segregation and the reserve system also tend to disappear gradually.[1]

---

[1] The Administration of Indian Affairs, p.45.

[2] Loc cit.

The Branch has also received from Indians some protests against its school integration program. Some oppose integration for religious reasons, others through fear of losing their ethnic identity. One Indian group claimed that the school integration program was completely unsatisfactory and was simply broadening the gap between Indians and non-Indians. Another Indian group advised the government to move more slowly with its integration policy. Still others see this policy as a manoeuvre on the part of the federal government to abandon its responsibilities to the provinces or to the Indian communities.[2]

Despite these few protests, the Branch considers its program of school integration a success and plans to continue with it as the majority of Indians come to support it. Therefore, it is hoped that the provinces will assume greater responsibilities in the field of Indian education by accepting complete school integration and the conclusion of comprehensive agreements. The ultimate objective then is complete integration in the schools attended by Indians within the provincial school systems.

D. Courses and Teaching Staff

In this section dealing with courses and teaching staff, we shall analyze the policy of the federal government in the following areas:

(a) language of instruction;

(b) academic and practical courses;

(c) trades courses and apprenticeship;

(d) teaching staff.

(a) Language of Instruction

Language is an integral part of any culture, in the anthropological sense of the word. Moreover, according to linguists, the structure of a language determines the mental categories and thought processes of those who have inherited this language from their parents. No one will dispute the fact that the spoken and written word is an essential instrument in the process of transmitting and absorbing knowledge. In the field of education, there is a direct relationship between mastery of the language and success in learning. For all these reasons, the question of language of instruction in schools attended by Indians is thus of capital importance.

Indian children who are forced to take courses in a language which is not their mother tongue find school more difficult than other children, particularly during the first few years. This problem of the language of instruction has been recognized by a federal official, the Director of Indian Education.

> . . . the Indian children in the schools show a disability, a language disability. They may be able to speak English, but their vocabulary is limited as compared to white children.

---

[1] Integration Program, p.9.

[2] Loc.cit.

[3] R.F. Davey, Director, Education Division, Indian Affairs Branch, to the Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons on Indian Affairs, Ottawa, 1961, p. 496.

> . . . Some particular problems of Indian children in non-Indian schools arise from language and cultural differences. Indian children are not less capable to learn. but have to learn more.[1]

The principle solution to this problem was suggested by this same official:

> ......the best solution for this problem is the admission at the earliest possible age of Indian children in non-Indian schools.[2]

Two other complementary solutions are the establishment of kindergartens where the Indian child can learn the rudiments of the language of instruction, before embarking upon his formal academic education in English or in French, and the intensification and improvement of the language courses given during the first years of primary school.

We have found no proposal that education or any part of it be given in an Indian language or that courses in Indian languages be offered, It is true that this would be more difficult to accomplish in the joint schools than in reserve schools, but it is conceivable that, even in the joint schools, Indian children could be given the opportunity to improve their written and spoken knowledge of their own language, even if this required that special courses be offered. The lack of qualified teaching staff for the Indian languages is the principal reason for this serious weakness.

The government's policy on the preservation of the Indian languages is ambiguous. It would appear that there is a general unwillingness to make open statements on this subject. However, the lack of attention shown towards the teaching of the Indian languages in the courses of study would seem to indicate rather clearly that the Indian languages might be allowed to disappear and be replaced by either English or French (In Quebec). The great number of Indian languages and dialects and the need to integrate Indians with Canadian society might justify this measure.

The question then arises as to whether integration does not thus become actual assimilation. The loss of a people's language leads almost inevitably to the loss of their own ethnic identity and cultural traditions.

(b) Academic and Practical Courses

In the past, the system of reserve schools and residential schools offered dual-purpose courses, intended to provide both basic education and some training in the techniques of the traditional occupations -hunting, fishing and trapping. However, this often meant that Indian children who had attended school for several years without completing their studies were ill-prepared either for life off the reserve or for one of the traditional occupations. They were condemned to remain on the reserves, unemployed and dependent on the government.

Today, the new school policy promotes the academic courses in particular.[3] At the secondary, vocational and university levels, the curricula are exactly the same as those of the provinces, since most of the Indian children who continue their education beyond the primary level attend provincial Institutions. At the primary level, the joint schools use the provincial curriculum. The reserve schools also use this curriculum, but offer supplementary language courses. For example, in

---

[1] R.F. Davey, Senior Field Officers Conference, p. II.

[2] R.F. Davey, Joint Committee. p. 494.

[3] Ibid., ..."we are placing emphasis upon academic instruction." p. 497.

English-speaking schools, the teachers are required to give one half hour of oral English instruction daily to students in grades one to six. Courses in home economics for girls and industrial arts for boys are also included in the curriculum wherever possible.

Thus we see that the course of study in schools attended by Indians corresponds with the objective chosen by the federal government.

(c) Trades Courses, Apprenticeship and Employment Programs

> The importance of vocational and technical training cannot be too strongly emphasised. It was brought to our attention that the Indians have a great deal of native ability and more advantage should be taken of facilities available for such training.

This is the opinion of the Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons on Indian Affairs, which also recommends greater participation by the Indian Affairs Branch in technical education.[1] it is felt that Indians have a high degree of aptitude for trades and that training in trades will allow them to draw more advantage from their basic education, which otherwise would not be put to its fullest use. Moreover, Indians are more likely to continue with these courses than with strictly academic courses.

Knowledge of a trade will also allow young Indians to find jobs more readily either on or off the reserves. In the opinion of the federal officials, the present system of education should give the Indians access to remunerative employment. "Preparation for employment is considered a necessary part of education."[2] In order to assist the Indians in achieving this aim, the Indian Affairs Branch has set up programs offering vocational guidance and placement.

The vocational guidance program is meant to assist young Indians in choosing a career in keeping with their aspirations, abilities and the demands of the labour market. Guidance counsellors and advisors assist the teachers in directing the students' choice.[3] The employment program introduced in 1957 is intended primarily to find jobs for Indians who have completed their schooling and, in the long run, to integrate Indian workers with the labour force of the entire country.[4] Special attention is given to young people between the ages of 16 and 25, who adapt more readily to urban life.

These two programs are still in the initial stages and should be expanded in the years to come. Like the other measures, their ultimate aim is the integration of the Indian within Canadian society.

(d) Teaching Staff

In the past or, more precisely, before 1945, the shortage of qualified teaching staff affected considerably the development of an adequate system of Indian education. Today, although the recruiting of staff for Indian schools is still difficult, approximately 90% of the teachers hold a teaching certificate. The policy of the government is to hire only qualified personnel to teach in Indian schools. Approximately two-thirds of this staff are women. As well, in 1960-61, there were 121 Indian teachers employed in Indian schools, or slightly less than 10% of the entire teaching staff.[5]

---

[1] Joint Committee, p. 611.

[2] Hon. Rend Tremblay, New Directions in Indian Affairs, p.5.

[3] Jampolsky, Third Schools in the Forest Conference, p. 48.

[4] Information on Integration, p. 10.

[5] Indian Education, Indian in Transition series, Department of Citizenship and Immigration, Queen's Printer, Ottawa, 1962, p.15.

It has also been recognized that there is a need for special training for teachers working in Indian schools so that they will be better prepared to understand the Indians' cultural background and to meet the problems created by inter-ethnic relations. ("There is a growing need for teachers with special training to staff schools whose children are predominately Indian or Indian and Metis ... Language and other cultural differences between these groups and the dominant elements of the Canadian population require a specially prepared teaching staff."[1]) Summer courses in sociology, anthropology, psychology and Indian history have been organized for this reason in various Canadian universities and members of the teaching staff of Indian schools are encouraged by the federal government to take these courses.

Moreover, the Branch encourages the training of competent Indian teachers by offering financial assistance to those wishing to become teachers and thus help their people.[2] However, teachers trained In this way are not required by the federal government to teach in Indian schools.

The policy of the federal government as regards the teaching staff in Indian schools is thus to encourage the hiring of qualified teachers and the training of teachers of Indian origin.

E. Adult Education

In order to complement the system of education and to regain lost ground, the Indian Affairs Branch has organized an adult education program and an upgrading program.

The adult education program is aimed primarily at ill iterate Indians living in remote areas and at those who have very little schooling. The purpose is to give these adults a basic education by teaching them to read, write and do simple arithmetic, in 1960-61, there were 1,590 adults enrolled in these courses.

The upgrading courses are offered to Indian young people and adults who have left school before completing their studies but who do have several years of schooling. These courses have three objectives:

(a) to improve the students' academic background so that they may choose careers;

(b) to train them in trades in keeping with their preferences and aptitudes; and

(c) to provide them with information on employment opportunities and the advantages and disadvantages of the various types of employment available.[3]

As well, Indian leaders with sufficient academic background may further their education by taking courses in leadership organized by the Indian Affairs Branch and offered in various universities across the country.[4]

These various complementary programs of education are intended to improve the educational standards of Indians who have not been able to attend school or whose training is inadequate, and to facilitate more frequent relations between them and Canadian society.

---

[1] Working paper, Federal-Provincial Conference, 1964.

[2] Indian Affairs Branch, Your Opportunity to Serve Your People, a Message to Indian Students in High School, The Indian in Transition, 1962.

[3] National Superintendents' Conference, p. 2.

[4] The Administration of Indian Affairs, p. 71.

F. Indian Participation in Education

While, in the past, Indians took no part in the processes of education, today, the federal government's new policy allows them a greater degree of participation. This increased participation is apparent in three fields: the training of a growing number of Indian teachers, the existence of Indian Home and School Associations and that of Indian School Committees.

We have already discussed Indian teachers. Despite their relatively small numbers, they reflect the government's desire to entrust the teaching in Indian schools to Indians wherever possible. As we have seen, the government also finances the training of Indian teachers through the granting of scholarships and bursaries. The opportunities do exist in this field. It is up to the Indians to take advantage of them.

Various groups of Indian parents across Canada are members of Home and School Associations or similar bodies. They have the opportunity to express their opinions and to make suggestions to the school administration on the education which their children is receiving. These associations are not overly plentiful as yet, and it is apparently the parents with the most education who display the greatest interest in their children's education. Thus, "the growth of literacy amongst the Indian people is the most important contributing factor to this budding interest in education", states the document on The Administration of Indian Affairs.[1]

The Indian Affairs Branch also hopes to implement one of its basic principles in school administration, that of encouraging the participation of Indians in the administration of local affairs. For this reason, "matters pertaining to the general administration of education on reserves are frequently referred to band councils", and "in turn, councils may petition the Branch on educational matters which, in their view, demand attention".[2]

Moreover, the band councils may set up School Committees and nominate the three members composing them. These Committees are authorized to act on behalf of the Indian communities "under regulations drawn up by the Branch." They administer budgets previously established by the Department with respect to "janitor service, sports equipment and extra-curricular programs". The School Committees are also responsible for the school attendance of Indian children.

> School Committees may be regarded as embryonic school boards which will eventually assume the powers of a provincial school board with certain modifications with respect to school finance.[3]

The new federal policy aims then at promoting the participation of Indian parents in the administration of school affairs and in the process of education of their children in general.

4. Outline of the Federal Ideology

The policy of federal officials in the administration of Indian affairs has evolved to a point where it is more accurate to speak of several ideologies than of a single one. The old line of thought, which remained strong until 1945, encouraged paternalism on the part of government officials and developed a feeling of dependence on the part of the Indians, in an attempt to protect them. However, this philosophy did not favour the social and economic development of most Indian groups and hence, no great importance was attached to Indian education. The reserve schools and residential schools, where they existed, perpetuated racial segregation and aimed primarily at preparing Indian children for reservation life. Students were given a basic academic education and practical courses on the techniques associated with traditional occupations. Indians were not prepared for contact with the outside world.

---

[1] The Administration of Indian Affairs, p.49.

[2] Ibid., p. 48.

[3] Ibid., p. 49,.

However, such contact became more and more frequent. When it became obvious that the Indians' acculturation by the dominant Canadian society was inevitable, the philosophy of the government changed. After 1945, a new philosophy began to take shape and to develop slowly; it is only recently (1960-1965) that attempts have been made to define it more clearly.

The new ideology favours progressive integration of the Indians within the entire Canadian family from sea to sea. Since the various Indian groups across Canada occupy widely differing economic and social positions, the time required for the process of acculturation and integration will vary considerably from one group to the next. The ultimate aim is as follows: that the Indians be considered on the same footing as the other citizens of the country and that they enjoy the same services and the same standard of living. With this aim in view, the governments will encourage greater participation by the Indians in the management of their own affairs until they are able to assume full responsibility for them. School integration, which allows Indian children to attend the same schools as non-Indians is being encouraged as the principal means of achieving complete social integration. The new policy tends then to encourage as much as possible the attendance at joint schools by Indian children. Curricula are also being planned on an integrationist basis. Finally, there is the attempt to increase the participation of Indian adults in the process of education through the Indian School Committees, which are actually the embryos of future school boards. In the opinion of the federal government, the success of social integration depends to a large extent on the success of the education and school integration programs.

In general, then, the new philosophy favours the improvement of the economic and social status of the Indians and the transfer to Indian communities of the responsibilities for their own affairs.

This philosophy, however, displays several flaws or omissions and ambiguities. The government's policy on the preservation of the Indian languages and cultural traditions, for example, is not clear. As a general rule, they are not assigned much importance. This makes it difficult to distinguish between a policy of integration and a policy of assimilation, which allows the loss of the basic cultural values of the integrated ethnic group.

Moreover, the question arises as to whether this new philosophy is being applied in practice. On this point, we must ask ourselves two questions. Is this philosophy, as defined by senior officials, being implemented in its entirety by their subordinates? In many cases, there is some doubt, Is this philosophy in part an official philosophy meant to impress public opinion and is it therefore being implemented only in part?

Only an analysis of the actual social situation in a later chapter will allow us to find the answers to these questions. First, however, we should point out, in all fairness, that the new ideology is still quite recent and that it has not been possible as yet to implement all its long-term aims. Moreover, the present social condition of the Indians is so complex that it is impossible to hope for perfect implementation of the ideology.

II. PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT IDEOLOGIES

1. Growing Provincial Interest in Indian Education

The interest of the provincial governments in Indian education is only recent. Following the last war, when the Canadian government launched its program of school integration, the provinces were extremely sceptical about the results and maintained the status quo.[1] When the experiment proved a success, interest of various provinces was aroused and as a result it became possible to admit increasingly larger numbers of Indian students to the provincial schools. The Province of British Columbia has signed a general agreement with the central government for the admission of Indian children to its schools. As well, the Province of Alberta has established a school district almost entirely for the purpose of improving Indian educational conditions: the Northland School Division.

In the attempt to take advantage of this growing interest in Indian education on the part of the provinces and to improve the level of schooling, the federal government has proposed to the provinces a closer degree of collaboration and a sharing of responsibilities.

This proposal did not receive the same welcome in all the provinces. The provinces do not all have the same attitude towards, or the same interest in, the education of the Indians. Some are prepared to assume more responsibilities, whereas others display reticence or indifference. The financial arrangements are the main source of disagreement.

2. British Columbia

In British Columbia, the Royal Commission on Education noted that the school integration program pursued by the Indian Affairs Branch in co-operation with the Provincial Department of Education and various school boards, was on the whole a success and should be pushed ahead. "The Commissioners conclude that the present trend toward integration is desirable and should be encouraged. The Commissioners gained the impression that, on the whole, the program of integration was progressing in an encouraging manner."[2] British Columbia has declared itself in favour of the integration of the Indians into Canadian society and of the continuation of the school integration program. The authorities in this Province also recognize that the Indians are entitled to the same privileges and the same services as the other citizens of the country. "British Columbia fully agrees in principle that Native Indians be integrated with the general population and receive like services."[3] The Province is prepared to extend its services to the Indians in the field of education on condition that the federal government pay part of the costs by virtue of the responsibilities conferred on it by the British North America Act.

3. Saskatchewan

The Province of Saskatchewan also favours the integration of the Indians into Canadian society so that they can enjoy the same living standard as other Canadians. in this perspective, the extension of provincial services to the benefit of the Indians is considered

---

[1] Second Schools in the Forest Conference, p. 104.

[2] British Columbia Royal Commission on Education, Educational Facilities for Indian Pupils, p. 139.

[3] Second Schools in the Forest Conference, p. 84.

"desirable". It is also thought that this operation can be carried out without altering the traditional rights and legal status of the Indians, but the consent and co-operation of the Indians are essential conditions for the success of the undertakings

This Province is in favour of the integration of the reserve schools into the provincial school districts. It is also hoped that, in the near future, the Indian parents can administer the schools attended by their children.

In a report submitted to the Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons on Indian Affairs, it is stated by the Saskatchewan representatives that education is considered the most important service dispensed to the Indians by the Indian Affairs Branch and, consequently, it should be given greater attention, in the same document, the Province shows itself favourable to school integration for the Indians and opposed to the residential school system because it encourages segregation.

As far as the program and teaching staff are concerned, the following measures are proposed:

(a) the establishment of nursery schools;

(b) the development of a program of special skills and trade apprenticeship;

(c) a vocational guidance program;

(d) an adult education program;

(e) special courses on the Indian cultures for the teaching staff.

The Province of Saskatchewan is showing great interest in Indian education and on very many points its attitude agrees with that of the federal government.

4. Alberta

The representatives of the Province of Alberta are also of the opinion that the long-range policy must be one of integration of the Indians into Canadian society, on condition that they be allowed to maintain their ethnic identity. We shall be able to accomplish this objective only to the extent that the Indians are willing to acquire this social and economic equality. At the present time they enjoy a special legal status which is different from that of other citizens and they are kept segregated by the reserve system. As long as the Indian Act is not changed, the Indians will not be able to live on an equal footing with the other citizens of the Province. Moreover, the Indians must be encouraged to assume the rights and privileges of other Canadian citizens and receive the same Services. Along the same lines, there is a desire to encourage the Indians to participate in the making of decisions on matters which concern them, and in the administration of their affairs. Indians who assume responsibilities fulfil their tasks quite adequately. "Indians of my acquaintance who are given responsibilities without the paternalistic attitudes seem to respond very well." The speed and degree of acculturation of the Indians must be determined not by authorities on the outside but by the Indians themselves.

As regards education, it is the opinion of the responsible authorities in the Alberta government that the Indians must have the same opportunities as the other citizens of the Province. For this reason, the Department of Education has set up the Northland School Division. There is no racial discrimination in this school district and school integration is a fact.[1] Encouragement is also being given to greater participation by the Indians in educational matters, and it has become possible for Indians to be elected school trustees, even if they do not pay any real estate taxes.

---

[1] R. Davey, Third Schools in the Forest, p. 57.

The school program which the Indians follow is that of the Province, except for some recent adjustments permitting the study of the Indian languages and of local history by young Indians. The purpose of these courses is to broaden the knowledge of Indian students of their own cultural traditions and to increase their pride in their origins, as well as their knowledge of their environment.

It is held that young Indians who take specialized courses must receive their training in urban centres so that they may be accustomed to city life and be able to more readily meet competition from non-Indians when they enter the labour market.

In the attitude of the Province of Alberta, the concept of integration is clearly defined: the Indians must themselves determine the degree of their integration, while maintaining a significant part of their cultural traditions and pride in their ethnic identity.

5. Manitoba

Responsible authorities in Manitoba consider the Indians to be a source of problems for that Province because of their relatively high number (about 5% of the population) and their considerably lower social status compared to that of other citizens. Moreover, it is noted that the educational level of the Indians is much lower than that of the rest of the Province. In order to remedy this situation, the Department of Education of the Province has just worked out a new policy. The most important point in this policy is a Family Development plan under which parents and their children can take the same school programs: fathers and sons study industrial trades, mothers and daughters, household science. The training of competent teachers is also considered very important.

The opinion is also held that young Indians need to have basic academic training before being apprenticed to trades. In the area of specialized courses, there must be close co-operation between industry and the educational authorities so that Indians can learn a trade that is in demand and so obtain gainful employment when they leave school.

The government of Manitoba also favours the integration of the Indians into the social and economic life of the provinces. It sees in the abandonment of the reserves and the re-location of the Indians in more favourable spots as well as in vocational training and the practising of trades by the Indians, so many measures favouring integration.

6. Ontario

The government of Ontario deplores the fact that the Indians are considered as persons apart and are not treated on the same footing as the rest of the citizens.

The different Indian bands in Ontario are at different stages of development. The bands in the South enjoy nearly the same privileges as the other citizens of the Province, whereas the bands in the North have changed their way of life very little.

The establishment of a special program of formal education is considered to be the most needed measure for improving the condition of the northern bands. It is hoped that the Indians will take more part in managing their own affairs and reap the same benefits as does the population of Canada as a whole.

7. Quebec

The representatives of the Province of Quebec are of the opinion that the Indians must be given the same consideration as the other citizens of the Province and have the benefit of the same standards of services. The question of finances is not held to be an obstacle to the integration of the Indians and the Province says it is prepared to take charge of the extension of all provincial services to the Indians.

Quebec is in favour of the complete integration into the provincial system of the schools attended by the Indians, including school administration and the ownership of buildings and equipment. The incorporation of the reserves into the provincial school districts is also favoured, on condition that the Indians contribute in one way or another to the costs entailed by it. The integration of the Indian schools into the provincial school system would, according to the representatives of Quebec, encourage a rise in the level of schooling of the Indians.

Quebec also believes that the Indians should be consulted on all matters which concern them. It is considered essential that the Indians be able to vote at the election of school trustees for their district and that it even be possible for them to be elected school trustees.

Finally, Quebec is of the opinion that in the introduction of a long-range plan for the improvement of services to the Indians, formal education and community development which encourage initiative on the part of the Indians must have priority over welfare aid which keeps them feeling dependent.

8. The Atlantic Provinces

The Atlantic Provinces show less interest in Indian affairs than the other more heavily populated provinces, mainly because they have a much smaller Indian population. The Maritime Provinces are agreed that the initiative in this matter should be left to the federal government. The Newfoundland government, for its part, itself looks after the Indians within its territory, but would gladly accept financial help from the central government.

The four provinces are in agreement with the principle of integrating the Indians into the life of the provinces.

Prince Edward Island, which has only one Indian reserve, seems to favour moving the community, now on an island, to the mainland, so that the Indian children can receive a better formal education in an integrated school.

9. The Provincial Attitudes

The provinces are in agreement with the federal government's policy of integrating the Indians into Canadian society over a long period. They also see in school integration the principal means of reaching this goal. in addition, they favour much greater participation by the Indians in the management of their affairs, especially in the areas of education and municipal government.

On the whole, the provinces are prepared to assume more responsibilities in matters that concern the education and the social and economic welfare of the Indians, but on condition that the Indian Act is amended and the federal government gives the provinces financial compensation. The provinces are generally agreed that transferring from the federal to the provincial authorities the services already being provided for the Indians would improve the quality of these services and reduce operating costs.

The provinces also favour the conclusion of comprehensive agreements between the provincial governments and the federal government on the formal education of the Indians in provincial schools, paid for with moneys granted on a per capita basis by the federal treasury.

Education is an area in which it is relatively easy for the provinces and the federal government to reach agreement. It is a bridgehead which has led to an important reconciliation and gives indications of an undertaking of greater responsibilities by the provinces.

III. IDEOLOGIES OF THE SCHOOL BOARDS

We wish merely to draw attention to some features which seem most obvious:

(a) Generally, it is the Indian Affairs Branch which approaches the school boards in order to negotiate joint agreements under which the boards accept Indian children into the schools under their jurisdiction, receiving financial compensation.

(b) The school boards, for their part, seem mostly interested in the financial terms of such joint agreements.

(c) According to certain school boards, there is no segregation in the integrated schools and the young Indians mix well with the other children and make friends among their non-Indian schoolmates.

(d) Certain other school boards will not allow Indian children into their schools, claiming that they are dirty and disruptive, and pose problems for the teachers, in the opinion of these boards, the Indians should be confined to their reserves.

1. Basic attitudes of the Indian associations and the reserve Indians

We wonder to what extent the Indian associations express the views of the individuals on the reserves.

Our experiences when we visited the reserves in Quebec and in the Prairie Provinces hardly leave us with the impression that the Indians can be lined up behind an individual identified as the chief of a reserve. We do have the impression that on most of the reserves rivalries more often than not prevail over collective interests and that, under these circumstances, the effective social organization of the Indians is practically impossible.

However, the claims of the associations sometimes do correspond to the aspirations of the individual Indians they are supposed to represent in dealings with the Indian Affairs Branch. This is less likely to be expressed than to be tacit.

Thus we have the feeling that when an Indian association states:

> We do not want education that will turn us into second class white people; rather we want to become first class Indians,

it certainly represents the unanimous point of view of the Indians although the choice between being second class White men and being first class Indians is not the true one. The association is equally representative when it defends the right of Indian parents to live together with their children.

We feel that, because of the distrust felt by the Indians towards the White man, Indian associations have to show a certain aggressiveness, a certain intransigence no matter if they have to partially backtrack a little later on and agree to certain compromises.

There is no doubt that the Indian associations start with some vague and sometimes utopian claims presented to them by the chiefs of the reserves, and then have to thoroughly digest and rework them before transmitting some requests to the Indian Affairs Branch.

Moreover, the fact that several hundreds of the Indian children are not attending the schools available to them cannot be explained simply by over-crowding of the Indian schools. It is more likely that in many cases the Indian parents prefer to lavish on their children an "Indian style" education, out of contempt for the White man's education.

Finally, in the general interest of the Indians, the Indian associations find it advantageous to rationalize certain facts which would otherwise be embarrassing to the defence of the general interests of the Indians.

The Indian's attitude towards education reveals his ambiguous feelings from having the choice of two extremes represented by the Indian style of life as lived on the reserves and life in the "white man's world", which seems to entail a more or less deep alienation from his people. The latter is being accepted more and more frequently as it seems to be the inevitable result of schooling and progress.

2. Attitudes of the parent-teacher associations (as shown in the attitude of the Home and School and Parent-Teacher Federation)

A. What the Federation is and what it does

So that we can better understand the attitude of the Federation towards Indian education, we will do well to first consider the Federation's definition.

> The welfare of children is the raison d'être of our organization, not only the welfare of the children of our members, but the welfare of all children.[1]
>
> . . . a big democratic group which has been fighting for better education for the Indian children. . . [2]

The members of the Home and School and Parent-Teacher Federation limit their action especially to making annual submissions to government authorities:

> . . . and (they) have presented resolutions and briefs on this subject annually to the Federal Department of Indian Affairs since 1945.[3]

As the Federation itself explains, it was difficult for its members to do more for the Indian children. In order for the Federation to be able to do something, it had to mobilize the Indians themselves and do it legally.

> The Federation cannot effectively concern itself with Indian children unless the members of the Federation

---

[1] Submission by the Canadian Home and School and Parent-Teacher Federation to the Honourable René Tremblay, March 17, 1964, Appendix A.

[2] Letter from Mrs. Mary Kelly to the Battleford Indian and Metis Friendship Council, October 27, 1964.

[3] Loc. cit.

> are clear in their minds and in their hearts as to the rights of the Indian people.
>
> Right along from the beginning, under the Indian Act, there is no provision for the Indian to have a say in his own affairs. The Act may stipulate in some clauses that an Indian Council may make laws and regulations, but when all is said and done, it is the Governor-in-Council who has the final say.[2]

According to the Federation, the Indians are not in a position to decide their own destiny and therefore cannot play an effective role in their own welfare,

> We think the Declaration of Indian Human Rights is the very thing that is needed and should be used as a base for all studies into the problems. . The Indian Act is a direct contradiction. It should be scrapped.

This declaration of the civil rights of the Indians was presented to the Honourable J.R. Nicholson on April 28, 1965.

The declaration, based on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights of the United Nations, proclaims the essential rights of the Indians to self-determination.

In short, the Canadian Home and School and Parent-Teacher Federation does not hesitate to declare that the Indians must have the same rights as the White people so as to be able to contribute to the welfare of their own children by taking part in the Federation's activities.

B. Understanding the Condition of the Indians

The C.H.S.P.T.F. makes a quick analysis of the condition of the Indians to prove the need for defining the rights of the Indians as a people.

> People think that the Indian has or can develop no way of his own, better suited to his spirit and his traditions.
>
> Consequently, consciously or unconsciously almost all proposals in the past have been aimed at the absorption of the Indian into the white community, with the resultant destruction of the Indian people.
>
> The Indian has lost his lands, he has been deprived of his traditional means of livelihood; his spirit

---

[1] Proposed Declaration of the Human Rights of the Indian of Canada: Preamble, July 13, 1964.

[2] Eleanor Brass, "New Declaration of Rights": Regina Leader Post, January 11, 1965, paragraphs 3 and 4.

[3] Working Papers re: Declaration of Human Rights of the Indian. Letter from Mrs. A.H. Brass to Mrs. Van Sickles, February 23, 1965.

> is on the wane; his family is being broken down; he is losing his language and his culture; he is being wiped out by his assimilation.[1]

The foregoing indicates sufficiently to the C.H.S.P.T.F. that no fruitful action can be taken without prior recognition of the rights of the Indians.

C. Democratization of Indian Education

The Federation proposes certain steps that must come before it can even start contributing actively to the democratization of teaching among the Indians.

> The Indian Reserve . . . must be made economically independent with adequate land and capital for the development of an Indian way of life.
>
> The Indian Reserve shall develop a school board system comparable in purpose to non-Indian school boards.
>
> The Indian Education School Boards shall play much the same role as the school boards in the non-Indian community; . . . for example, the Indian community through its school boards shall select the teachers for its children.[2]

However, the Federation is aware that it takes time to implement these measures. Hence it proposes a temporary solution:

> Where Indian children are attending schools under the jurisdiction of a Board of School Trustees, we urge that there should be appropriate Indian parent representation on these boards, and, if necessary, that the Indian Act and Regulations be amended as required to make this not only possible, but mandatory.[3]

The Federation insists that the economic and social structure of the reserves be democratized and autonomous before the Indians are invited to work in a democratic way for the education of their children. For the Federation is of the opinion that democratic participation is a hollow phrase if the social structure does not permit of it.

> No one on the outside can do the job for them, but understanding and support from the non-Indian world will make possible the self-fulfilment of the Indian people.[4]

The Federation recognizes however that the Indian reserves are not all the same to start with.

> Each reservation or system of reservations is unique and requires its own solutions to its problems. Some reservations are engulfed, surrounded, inundated and absorbed by the non-Indian society to a point of no return.[5]

---

[1] Brief presented to the Honourable J.R. Nicholson -- Appendix A; Introduction. Statement which accompanied the proposed declaration, July 13, 1964.

[2] Ibid., some implications; par. 7.

[3] Ibid., points arising from the brief of 1964, par. 5.

[4] Ibid., some implications: par. 3.

[5] Ibid., some implications: par. 1 and 2.

D. The Federation's General Views on the System of Indian Education

They here examine Indian education from the points of view of educational content, teachers, and types of schools.

The Federation says this about educational content:

> Indian parents along with the Indian blood teachers, utilizing such other professional aid as they may require, shall develop a curriculum suitable for the Indian way of life, keeping in mind that some of the young people will elect to leave the reserve for the non-Indian community,[1]

In addition to requesting a curriculum suitable for the Indian way of life, the Federation is disturbed by the gap between the aspirations which education inculcates in the Indian children and the actual lack of opportunities in the reserves.

> We are particularly concerned about the disparity between levels of aspiration inculcated to Indian children relative to the opportunities provided to these children later in life to live up to these aspirations.[2]

As far as the teachers are concerned, the Federation obviously favours recourse to Indian teachers.

> Our working hypothesis is that the teachers of Indian blood are more likely than the non-Indians to be effective in the education of Indian children.
>
> This relative lack of Indian teachers has been persistent through the years, and has shown little sign of improvement. tie recommend a much more active policy of collaboration. to the end that a much greater number of suitable young Indians would embark upon a career in teaching.[3]

The Federation's recommendations are based on an overall approach to Indian education.

> What is taught, the language used and the teachers themselves are foreign both to the Indian children and to their parents: the educational system is out of step with the Indian people.[4]

As for the matter of schools, the Federation takes a rather hard line on integrated schools.

---

[1] Statement which accompanied the proposed declaration, Appendix A: Brief presented to the Honourable J.R. Nicholson - April 28, 1965, some implications: par. 9.

[2] Ibid., points arising from the brief of 1964, par. 4

[3] Ibid., points arising from the brief of 1964, par. 2

[4] Statement which accompanied the proposed declaration, more specifically.

> Integrated schools might better be termed 'absorption' or 'assimilation' schools. They are of the white, by the white and for the white, with the Indian boy or girl invited to join the non-Indian life.[1]

However, the Federation tempers its views on integrated schools, taking into account the gradual acculturation of the Indians. And even if school integration is inevitable, the Federation recognizes that it is possible to partly reduce what is considers a danger.

> Need for a better understanding of the Indian people and their children by non-Indian blood teachers who are teaching in 'integrated' classrooms.[2]

Residential schools are looked on by the Federation as assimilation centres, since they take the children far away from their parents.

> In the 1961-62 school year, 21% of all Indian school children were in residential schools far removed from the bosom of their families. How better to destroy the families as the natural and fundamental unit of a people?[3]

And the Federation is critical of residential schools to the extent that the rights of the parents are trampled on.

> The Indian family is the natural and fundamental group unit of his society and is entitled to protection by Canadian society in general and by the State.[4]

E. Conclusion

The attitude of the Home and School and Parent-Teacher Federation towards Indian education is fairly close to that of the Indians. But the reasons underlying the same demands differ to a certain extent.

Since the Federation is democratic in its aims as well as in its definition and ways of doing things, it naturally shares the same desire as the Indians, hoping to see them take their own economic and cultural life in hand. But if, for the Indians, this desire is based on the collective will to just be what they are, for the C.H.S.P.T.F., the realization of this ideal is the condition for Indian participation in the Federation's activities.

The attitude displayed by the Federation on the subject of Indian education is basically the one it takes when presenting its demands to any higher authority.

As we have said before, in the case of the Indians, the Federation holds that the democratization of the social structure is fundamental to the democratization of education. And the task of democratizing education is the fundamental reason for its existence. To best achieve this goal, it has recruited its members from among the parents and teachers.

---

[1] Statement which accompanied the proposed declaration - July 13, 1964, more specifically (4).

[2] Brief presented to the Honourable J.R. Nicholson. April 28, 1965, point arising from the brief of 1964, par. 3.

[3] Statement which accompanied the proposed declaration - July 13, 1964, more specifically (2).

[4] Declaration of the Human Rights of the Indian of Canada, Article V.

The Federation's criticism directed at various aspects of Indian education are explained by the fact that the educational means used for educating Indians are sometimes opposed to the process of democratizing education and therefore make it hard for those involved to control the child's development.

The Federation's attitude, without being very explicit on all points concerning Indian education, still represents a coherent explanation of its role and general position.

3. Ideologies of the denominational Groups

The various Churches whose attitudes on Indian education we shall analyze have traditionally been associated with Indian residential schools. Consequently, it is natural that a definition of their attitudes will, to start with, turn on the question of residential schools.

The documents we have drawn on to carry out this analysis tell us that there are four Churches operating residential schools for Indian children with financial support from Indian Affairs. They are the Anglican Church of Canada, the Roman Catholic Church represented by the Oblate Order, the United Church of Canada and the Presbyterian Church. A fifth church, the National Spiritual Assembly of the Baha'is of Canada, also makes known its point of view in the matter, but does not operate any schools.

We have established that two of the religious groups, that is, the representatives of the Anglican Church and the Oblate Order, are putting up some opposition to the promotion of school integration for the Indians. They are in fact the two most important groups operating residential schools: over two thirds of the 65 Indian residential schools are run by these two groups.

A. Attitude of the Anglican Church of Canada

The Anglican Church first justifies its role in Indian education.

> The interest of the Church in the education of the Indian people began with the Church's first contact with her Indian people. She provided the means of education because no other organized means was available.
>
> . . . there are still many areas where there is little or no developed community consciousness or sense of responsibility with respect to educational needs. There are hopeful signs, but during the interim period between complete lack of interest and some measure of local responsibility for education, it is our strong belief that the Church has a vital part to play in the educational life and needs of the Indian people. The Church represents in many of these developing areas the appropriate voice of peoples slowly emerging into community consciousness.[1]

This conception of its role at once raises a problem relative to the role of the federal government in defining an educational philosophy for the Indians.

> We strongly affirm that any tendency on the part of the Federal Government to be the sole arbiter of the educational policy for the Indian people is regrettable.[2]

---

[1] Anglican Church of Canada, Joint Committee, 1960, p. 796

[2] Loc. cit.

And to bolster its position, the Anglican Church postulates that:

> There can be no adequate educational program in a country unless such an education has a strong religious basis. We accept the principle therefore that one of the effective roles of the Church, in sharing with Government some measure of responsibility for Indian education, is to carry through some of the practical applications of this belief.[1]

In support of this argument, the Anglican Church lays stress on its resources in teaching staff:

> We are aware that the most important element in an educational program is the teacher and his work. Here, we see another supporting role of the Church, in this partnership with Government, to be an agency through which Canadian young people, Indian and non-Indian, are called upon to give themselves in ever increasing numbers in dedicated service to this distinctive sphere of teaching in all types of schools. . . . [2]

Another contribution which the Anglican Church tends to emphasize takes the form of residential schools which it maintains for Indian children.

> Another supporting role of the Church in this partnership with Government is to be the agency whereby the best possible substitute for the child's home can be found when through circumstances beyond the child's control he is forced to leave home for educational purposes .3

The points of view so far presented aim at consolidating the prerogatives of the Anglican Church which have prevailed till now.

In addition, the Anglican Church of Canada supports every effort to increase the number of Indian day schools.

> We earnestly urge a continuing expansion in these services, believing as we do, that any means which can be provided to keep children within the family unit is essential and desirable. Day schools conserve the values of home life and parental influence but keep education in the normal environment of the child. Educational advances to be permanent depend upon active home and community co-operation.[4]

The Anglican Church is thus in favour of Indian day schools. Their attitude is based on the fact that attendance at these schools strengthens religious unity at the family level.

---

[1] Anglican Church of Canada, Joint Committee, 1960, p. 796.

[2] Loc. cit.

[3] Ibid., p. 797.

[4] Loc. cit.

The Anglican Church of Canada agrees to a change in the functions of the residential schools.

> We endorse the policy of Government by which the emphasis in some of our residential institutions is being changed so that they are now becoming places where children live rather than where they both live and receive classroom instructions. However, we can readily see an increase in the use of these institutions for:
> 1) children from normal homes unable to secure education because of isolation; and
> 2) children from broken homes, ill-adjusted children or orphan children.

But the Anglican Church remains concerned about the present trend.

> The flexibility of action of the Church agencies is hampered by the imposition of government-made rules and regulations made to apply to all the institutions generally and overlooking entirely local and individual circumstances.[2]

The Anglican Church is also disturbed by the stipulation in the Indian Act that:

> Every child who is required to attend school shall attend such school as the Minister may designate, but no child whose parent is a Protestant shall be assigned to a school conducted under Roman Catholic auspices and no child whose parent is a Roman Catholic shall be assigned to a school conducted under Protestant auspices, except by written directive of the parent.[3]

The fact that Anglican parents can send their children to a residential school operated by the Oblates seems to have caused the ministers of the creed some worry. it would seem wiser to them to strike out the clause ". . . except by written directive of the parent."

But further on the Anglican Church suggests that Indian parents assume greater responsibility in the education of their children.

To all appearances, the fact of sending an Indian child to a residential school goes hand in hand with a lack of interest on the part of the parents in the education of their child. The Anglican Church seems to hope that the parents will feel more responsible if they have to pay part of the cost of maintenance.

> The question may be raised whether Government or Church is doing a just service in removing from the parents all such responsibility for their child or children.
>
> Should there not be an opportunity for the Indian parent to pay towards the cost of maintaining the pupil in a residence?

---

[1] Anglican Church of Canada, Joint Committee, 1960, p. 797.

[2] Ibid., p. 798.

[3] Ibid., p. 800.

> We feel . . . that by paying even a token amount towards the maintenance of his child the parent will feel more responsible for his family, and the child a closer tie with the parent.[1]

In dealing with integrated schools, the Anglican Church shows a certain open-mindedness.

> We heartily endorse the movement towards integrating Indian pupils into non-Indian classrooms in all communities. There are great benefits accruing not only to the Indian but to the non-Indian child, not least in the field of scholastic competition and achievements.[2]

However, there is a qualification.

> If the desired results of an integrated program of classroom instruction are to be achieved, it is important that the fundamental premises of the program be first explained to the parents and children of both the Indian and non-Indian constituency, and more essentially, to the teaching profession in whose hands success or failure of the program depends .[3]

As for the teachers, the Anglican Church has this to say:

> Academic qualification ought not to be the only prerequisite of a teacher in Indian classrooms. Because great responsibility for moulding the character of the pupil rests upon the teacher. . . Without an elementary understanding, at least, of the background, traditions, hopes and aspirations of the Indian people among whom the teacher is being placed rapport cannot exist between the teacher and pupil.[4]

We find this point of view shared by both the Canadian Home and School and Parent-Teacher Federation and the Indian associations themselves.

The Anglican Church also expresses an ambiguous attitude regarding provincial jurisdiction over Indian education.

> Has not the time come, in certain areas, where the details and mechanics of Indian education could be better served if the Provincial Departments of Education had such jurisdiction? The federal government would maintain its obligation to provide Indian education by expenditure of the necessary funds for such a program.
>
> We suggest that the possibility of the Indian Affairs Branch delegating its educational responsibility to the provinces be studied, and

---

[1] Anglican Church of Canada, Joint Committee, 1960, p. 798.

[2] Ibid., p. 799.

[3] Loc. cit.

[4] Loc. cit.

> that wherever practicable, Indian education, as far as policy and practice are concerned, be a Provincial responsibility with the Federal Government meeting the cost.[1]

This excerpt does not mention an actual transfer of jurisdiction from the federal to the provincial authority. The federal authority would still necessarily retain its jurisdiction through continuing to finance Indian education.

Moreover, the Anglican Church would wish that decisions be made as much as possible at the local level.

> Too frequently decisions are made governing the life of Indian peoples by officials without consultation taking place with the Indians concerned. In matters of education, this also applies. It is recommended that where circumstances are favourable, Indian trustees be appointed to assist local Indian Affairs Branch officials in establishing school policy and local school practice.[2]

In short, the Anglican Church has a quite open mind towards structural changes in the Indian school system, to the extent that its apostolic activity is not adversely affected, However, we do not note many definite references to school program content or the eventual orientation of Indian cultures.

B. Ideology of the Oblate Fathers

The Oblate fathers define education in the following terms;

> In Canada, education is an integrated process with each institution or factor co-operating harmoniously until the objective is reached and the process starts again with the next generation. The home prepares the child for the elementary school which prepares him for the high school, which prepares him for the university or for technical or vocational school, which prepares him to start a home of his own. Each step is interlocked with the next and when one breaks down, remedial measures have to be taken . . .
>
> When the situation of present day Indian adults under fifty is analysed, it is realized that too many of them are without regular income and unable to raise families the way other Canadians do, precisely because in their formative years, they were not trained to transfer from the economic activities of their forefathers to occupations that would have integrated them securely to the national economy. This is why extensive re-training is essential . . . . With few exceptions, the Indian home does not prepare the child adequately for the schooling processes designed to meet the needs of non-Indian Canadians. As a result, most Indian boys and girls cannot and do not profit from the preparation for life pattern offered to them. Most of them leave school before they reach even a Grade 8 level.[3]

---

[1] Anglican Church of Canada, Joint Committee, 1960, p. 600.

[2] Loc. cit.

[3] Oblate Fathers Indian-Eskimo Welfare Commission, Joint Committee, 1960, pp. 727-28.

The other two documents that we are able to make use of in order to examine the position of the Oblate Fathers on the educational system are the message of an Oblate Father to his parishioners and the report of a conference held together with the officials of the Indian Affairs Branch, on January 26 and 27, 1960.

These two documents indicate the opposition of the Oblate Fathers to the movement for the integration of Indian children into provincial schools.

In June, 1965, an Oblate Father said this to his parishioners:

> Some 60 years later, Satan and his legion, making a review of their positions came to the conclusion that they were losing ground the world over and the Indian population was not exempt; therefore, they changed their strategy, adopted modern tools and went to the attack seven times stronger. What is this strategy? Or, to put in modern words, what is this policy? To them religion must be done away with in all schools. A formula must be found to lure away the Indians from denominational schools. . . He hides himself behind the faces and hypocritical views of some white men with influential positions within the educational channels of our society.

This kind of tirade expresses the savage opposition of an Oblate Father to school integration of Indian children, We are forced to conclude that in his opinion the denominational school system is the only acceptable one,

This one document is extremely virulent but although we do not meet the same zeal in all of the testimony of the Oblate Fathers, we can detect the signs of real opposition to the school integration movement. Certain passages of the report mentioned earlier bear eloquent witness to this.

> Bishop Routhier stated that at recent meetings held in the West a number of Indians had expressed strong objections to sending their children to non-Indian schools because the children did not feel at ease among non-Indians. The Director remarked that he knew of many Indians who had benefited from non-Indian education and felt that wherever non-Indian high school education can be obtained with the consent of the parents, advantage should be taken of it. Bishop Routhier said that if it were the wish of the Indians he would have no objection to the director's statement.
>
> ....
>
> Bishop Routhier stated that he understands that the Department does not take the stand that all Indians must attend non-Indian schools, nor does the Church take the attitude that they should all attend Indian schools, Col, Jones felt that if there were no religious problems and if there is a local non-Indian high school nearby, the Department should attempt to have the children admitted to that school.[1]

---

[1] Minutes of Conference (on) Indian High School Education in the prairie Provinces, 26-27 January, 1960, p.2.

And the confrontation between the representatives of the Branch and the Oblate Fathers continues:

> Bishop Routhier felt the Indian children should be told something of their history and stated that there were very few teachers in non-Indian schools who were qualified to instill a feeling of pride in the Indian. Father Forget felt that possibly a teacher in a non-Indian school could be well qualified to teach history, but the weakness lay in the material that was at his disposal. Col. Fortier felt that perhaps the history books were not well prepared in so far as the treatment of the Indian is concerned. He also felt that it could be dangerous for Indians to be kept in an Indian high school where his own history was emphasized, without adequate treatment of other phases of history.[1]

It is obvious that during this meeting the Oblate Fathers brought up a number of arguments designed to question again the principle of school integration of Indian children.

But in view of the practical nature of the conference, we were unable to learn the position of the Oblates on the other aspects of the Indian educational system as developed by the Branch.

All the same we can understand the policy of compromise that the Oblate Fathers are trying to follow in their work of educating the Indian children. Moral and religious education are also plainly conspicuous in the residential schools, perhaps to the detriment of a more technical and, in short, more realistic training. Therefore, it is understandable that school integration should be looked upon as a stop-gap solution which, "morally and spiritually', would hardly be appealing in the eyes of these missionaries.

C. Attitude of the United Church of Canada

In a letter addressed to an official of the Branch, the United Church of Canada makes known its views on its residential and other schools.

> The proposal to negotiate with your Branch with a view to turning over the management of our schools and residences to you, is of course somewhat drastic at first glance. it is implied, of course, that we do not contemplate simply moving out of the business, in which case your Branch might conceivably ask another Church to take it on. It is our thought that if and when you were prepared to operate such schools as non-denominational institutions, we are now prepared to consider seriously relinquishing our management of them. Our Church has been saying since 1946 that we believed we should move toward non-sectarian education for Indians. It was the conviction of the Committee, supported by our Board, that it is time we demonstrated that we really mean it.[2]

---

[1] Minutes of Conference (on) Indian High School Education in the prairie Provinces, 26-27 January, 1960.

[2] Letter from Board of Home Missions, The United Church of Canada, April 24, 1965.

This excerpt from the letter summarizes clearly the position of the United Church of Canada relative to its role in Indian education, It intends quite simply to withdraw from this field of activity in the name of individual freedom. However, it makes no pretence for all that of ceasing to look after the religious observance of its members.

> If such a change were made, we would anticipate close co-operation with other denominations having pupils in the residence (Edmonton), in the provision of Christian Education and workshop experiences, either in the residence or in nearby churches. We feel that this kind of co-operation is long overdue and we have good reason to believe that it could be worked out.[1]

D. The Ideology of the Presbyterian Church of Canada

In the case of the Presbyterian Church of Canada, we have a document from which we can obtain a better idea of its point of view on Indian education.

> Our Church is strongly in favor of having Indian pupils attend the ordinary public or community schools of the district. We believe that the experience of growing up in the ordinary day school is an all-important one for all Canadian children, regardless of race or creed.
>
> We know that special schools are needed for special cases . . . in some places there can be no substitute for the residential school . . . . it is necessary to have a well-run hostel for Indian pupils of all ages (orphans, illegitimates, abandoned and neglected children). We think it is good, whenever possible, to transform residential schools into hostels from which pupils will attend the local community school.[2]

We observe that the Presbyterian Church of Canada has a very flexible attitude towards innovations in the system of Indian education. However, the Presbyterian Church is opposed to any measure tending to speed up school integration of the Indian children.

> We disapprove of the practice of taking young children, and even some inexperienced older children, far away from their home reserve to a central school, even though it be a very fine school. There must be a transition period so that the shock of a complete change and the shock of an overwhelming 'homesickness' will not accrue either to the pupil or to his parents and family. Incompatibility and loneliness . . . are major problems, often leading to withdrawal from schools.
>
> For those agencies, and particularly for the Church, the removal and transplantation of pupils frequently breaks a continuity of training and guidance.
>
> . . . Our plea is not to prevent the pupil from experiencing the impact of other faiths, but rather to continue the familiar 'home base' to which the pupil may turn

---

[1] Letter from Board of Home Missions, The United Church of Canada, April 24, 1965.

[2] The Presbyterian Church of Canada, Joint Committee, 1960, p. 186.

> to make balanced judgments and decisions.
>
> As a norm, we think the day school near enough to the reserve of the pupils, which is shared alike by Indian and non-Indian, is the most acceptable.[1]

The attitude of the Presbyterian Church towards the system of Indian education is conditioned by certain religious considerations. The day schools which are close to home are seen as the institutions which best favour the development of a human, moral and spiritual life. The Church opposes any haste in transferring Indian children to provincial public schools, especially if the schools are far from the family home, because of the disastrously upsetting effect such a change would have on the life and beliefs of the Indian children.

As for teaching content, the Presbyterian Church lays stress on measures which will inspire the Indians to develop their patrimony, to carry out research to enrich it, and to acquire pride in the group just as well as individual pride:

> as part of the curriculum of all schools should be included courses of factual history, Indian Treaties, the Indian Act or whatever legislation may from time to time be enacted, Indian lore and Indian culture . . . With scholarship (. . .) selected Indians should be encouraged to gather and put into forms which can be preserved, histories of tribes, their customs, their lore, their artistry, their language, and other marks of their culture, all of which would return to the Indian some of the dignity of which he was shorn by these processes of government and relationships with non-Indians . . . . This would not only be a matter of pride with the Indian, but would enrich the general culture of Canada and would be the means of correcting histories written for non-Indian consumption with a very severe bias against the Indian.[2]

As with several other groups whose attitudes we have analyzed, there is a concern for the future of the Indian and for the enrichment of his culture. However, it must be added that the Churches have everything to gain by the emancipation of the Indians and the improvement of their living conditions.

E. Ideology of the National Assembly of Baha'is

This religious sect is apparently very different from the preceding ones and does not operate any schools. The sect takes the following position on the system of Indian education:

> In our contacts with Indians in various parts of the country we have heard a number of specific complaints expressed concerning the present educational system. Many of these centre about the denominational schools. Where there is more than one mission on a reserve, the Indians from childhood become divided on religious lines, creating antagonisms and disunity. Some also draw attention to the fact that the Indian Act makes no provision for the religious rights of the parents who are non-Christian, such as those following the

---

[1] The Presbyterian Church of Canada, Joint Committee, 1960, pp.786-87.

[2] Ibid., p. 787.

> so-called 'Longhouse' religion. In denominational schools and particularly in residential schools, we are told, so much time is spent on religious instruction that the children do not receive an adequate secular education.
>
> . . . Most Indians appear to favour secular or public schools or preferably provision for attendance at non-reservation schools. [1]

It is precisely the religious aspect of certain Indian schools that the Baha'is, in contrast to the other faiths, seem to find fault with. They hold other faiths responsible for the poor education of certain groups of Indian children taught by teachers of one or the other of the Christian faiths.

As opposed to other faiths, this sect is against denominational schools.

> Wherever possible, Indian children should attend the same schools as other Canadians. If this is not feasible, non-denominational schools should be provided on the reserves with curricula and teachers' qualifications not less than provincial standards. The religious affiliation of the teachers should not be a primary qualification and the teachers should not be required to give religious instruction in any particular denomination. The history of religion and basic spiritual concepts or ethics common to all faiths should be taught. Provision for denominational religious instruction, when requested by the parents, should be made outside of normal teaching hours or without sacrifice of the public school curriculum.
>
> Children who cannot live at home while attending school should be placed, so far as possible, in foster homes rather than in hostels or other institutions.[2]

The sect is also against the use of residential schools as a stop-gap solution to the problem of the children not being able to live with their families. It recommends the use of foster homes, Until now the Baha'is are the only ones who have demanded complete freedom of religious belief for the Indians. That is why they are of the opinion that the faiths which are putting up a defence of their prerogatives with the government authorities are vainly raising obstacles which can only harm the true interests of the Indians.

F. Conclusion

A chaotic situation is revealed by this evaluation of the different positions taken by the various Churches who do or do not have certain residential or other Indian schools.

We note that the greater the educational resources possessed by a Church or the greater its investment in Indian education, the greater its anxiety to maintain the status quo. On the contrary, the faiths having the least material interest in Indian education are much more open to innovations.

However, almost all the faiths lay down conditions for their endorsement of the idea of school integration of the Indian children.

The United Church of Canada, and the Presbyterian Church, supported by the Assembly of Baha'is, differ from the Anglican Church and the Oblate Fathers in that they could not wish more than to be rid of their denominational schools as being harmful to the pursuit of the general interest of the Indians.

---

[1] National Spiritual Assembly of the Baha'is of Canada, Joint Committee, 1960, p. 350.

[2] Ibid., p. 357.

The implication Is that this multiplicity of denominational schools is a factor in the disastrous division within the reserves and is finally proving to do more harm than good.

Lastly, it is only the Assembly of Baha'is that criticizes the denominational school system for the overzealousness of the agents of the churches in carrying out their roles as teachers or principals.

However, we note that certain faiths like the United Church and the Presbyterian Church realize the disadvantages of denominational schools and aim to discard this system.

An examination of the attitudes of the denominational groups throws a light on the opposition experienced by the Indian Affairs Branch in its search for viable solutions. These attitudes act as a brake on the development of Indian education through the stress they place on their own privileges and on the dangers which school integration presents to faith and morals.

CHAPTER III

THE ADMINISTRATIVE AND EDUCATIONAL STRUCTURES OF INDIAN SCHOOLS

I. ADMINISTRATIVE AND EDUCATIONAL STRUCTURES

Having examined the objectives of those involved in Indian education, we must now evaluate the structures established to achieve these objectives. An analysis of official ideology on the education of Indians has brought out the main principles underlying the federal government's major educational policies. We must now see how these guiding principles are put into practice by analysing the structures established and the functioning of these structures. Ideology is in the realm of intentions; the structures and their functioning are in the realm of execution.

From this perspective we examine five complementary aspects of the school system planned for the education of young Canadian Indians:

1. educational jurisdictions of the federal government, the provinces, and the municipalities;

2. educational organization: hierarchy and functioning;

3. the network of schools serving the Indian population;

4. school committees on reserves;

5. special problems: see Part I of this Report, Chapters IV and V.

1. Educational Jurisdictions

A. The provisions of the Indian Act

The Indian Act is the basic legal document determining the respective jurisdictions of federal, provincial and municipal governments in the field of Indian education. This is a very important document, since it enables the federal government to define government responsibilities towards the education of young Indians, on the one hand, and eligibility to benefit from these services, on the other. Considering the federal government's very strong legal position and its custom of interpreting each case which arises in the light of this Act, we feel it is necessary to summarize its essential points.

In 1960, a commentary on the Indian Act was prepared for the use of a Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons. The meaning of sections 113-122 concerning schools, school attendance and religion in schools was interpreted as follows.

a. The federal government may establish, operate, and maintain schools for Indian children, or enter into agreements for the education of Indian children with provincial governments, local school boards and various churches (Section 113).

b. The federal government may take the initiative in establishing regulations concerning all stages of the educational program; provide for the transportation of children to and from school; enter into agreements with religious institutions for the support and maintenance of children attending these institutions (Section 114).

c. Except in cases where school attendance is specifically not required (Section 116), all children between the ages of 7 and 16 are obliged to attend school. The Minister can even lengthen this period of school attendance from 6 to 18 years of age (Section 115).

d. Without parental permission, children belonging to a Protestant church cannot attend a school directed by Roman Catholics, and the reverse holds true: Roman Catholic children cannot attend a school which is under the auspices of a Protestant church (Section 117).

e. The government may appoint truant officers whose main duty is to compel young Indian children to attend school (Section 118).

f. When the majority of the members of a band belong to one religious denomination, teaching in the day school must be carried on by a teacher of the same denomination. When the members belong to several churches, they may decide to hire a teacher belonging to a particular church by a majority vote at a special meeting. Finally, a Protestant or Roman Catholic Indian minority may, with the approval of the Minister, have a separate school or special separate class (Sections 120 and 121).

The Indian Act has defined the essential field of the federal government's responsibilities. We have also noted, in the first volume of the Report, chapters XII, XVII, and XVIII, that the government has taken on more responsibilities in education, for example, by authority of the Appropriations Act. Nursery schools and permanent education have been maintained under the authority conferred by this Act.

The Indian Act also confers authority to encourage provincial governments to take on more educational responsibilities. Today, there is a decided tendency toward a progressive transfer of jurisdiction in Indian education from the federal to the provincial governments.

We are presently at the stage of joint agreements which require the federal government to pay directly to the local school boards or provincial governments the costs of education incurred by the participation of Indian children in the public school system already established for White children. Such a move is facilitated by the fact that a complete network of modern schools is in place. It is thus worthwhile to study these joint agreements to see if they would make possible a better distribution of federal and provincial responsibilities; and if, eventually, they would raise the level of Indian education and make way for a better integration into Canadian life.

B. Joint Agreements: Instrument of Educational Planning

The most recent document at our disposal on school integration across Canada[1] clearly indicates that the number of joint agreements is increasing rapidly from year to year. These new agreements result in a parallel increase in the Indian student population educated in provincial schools. There are two basic characteristics of these agreements: they serve as an instrument of educational planning on the national level, and also as an incentive for greater participation by the provinces in the education of Indian populations living on their territory.

These efforts at planning can be examined as regards their administrative success or the effects they may have on the Indians that they are designed to help. From the administrative point of view, one must examine the use of existing institutional resources, the financial cost of agreements, the number of joint agreements, and so on. As far as individuals benefitting from these policies are concerned, can a higher academic level, a more adequate and varied technical training, a more systematic preparation for the life of the White man be observed? The two perspectives are essential to a better understanding of the efficacy of educational planning and the results it yields.

In addition, the provinces have a new awareness of the responsibility they must assume in Indian education. More and more the provinces tend to consider their native population on the same footing as their other populations. They are willing to offer them the same services and advantages available to other groups, or even to offer them additional programs designed for their particular needs.

The main educational objectives of the federal government and the provinces are clear: Indians should benefit from the same educational services as other citizens. As far as the subjective definition of these objectives is concerned, however, some Indians are very doubtful about the government's ambitions. They see them as both beneficial and dangerous: though better education would certainly result, so might conflicts in identification. The danger of a marginal culture and even of assimilation exists.

In this section, our chief concern is to measure the administrative efficacy of joint agreements and to examine the problems which result. We will carry out our analysis in two stages. In the first stage we will analyse the actual terms of the joint agreement in order to determine the concept and the final aim. In the second stage, we will examine the application of agreements in actual school settings to explain some of the problems that arise.

a. The Concept of Joint Agreements

1. The Two Guiding Principles

Until now, at least, the federal government has striven to respect two basic principles in drawing up its program of joint agreements: 1. the local school resources (of the province) must be of a quality as good as or better than the Indian schools, and they must be available; 2. the majority of parents must consent to their children's attending a non-Indian school. These two basic principles have always been considered by the educational administrators of the federal government as essential and as a prerequisite before negotiating with the municipal educational authorities in an endeavour to reach an agreement fully satisfactory to the two parties concerned.

It may be asked to what extent these two principles have delayed the expansion of the various educational integration projects of the federal government. The first principle refers to a policy of social justice: there is no question of retarding or compromising the education of young Indians by compelling them to attend provincial institutions whose academic level is lower than that of federal schools in the area. The value of the integrated schools program is its attempt to raise the level of education and to offer to young Indians the same academic advantages enjoyed by Canadian students. On this basis, but on this basis only, the program of integrated schools aims at giving full justice to the Indians by making it easier for them to attend better equipped schools which offer educational programs of a better quality. In this way, the young Indian can continue his studies to the level he desires, if he has the aptitude. His local school will not then check his scholastic progress and practically eliminate his chance of going on to higher education.

---

[1] Observations on the Integration Program of the Education Division, Indian Affairs Branch, Ottawa, February, 1963.

In theory, these equal opportunities are a positive factor only if the way is open for Indians to proceed further with their education. if the government's only aim were to provide the Indians with more opportunities to enter into direct and continuous contact with the White population, this limiting condition would not hold. In actual fact, school integration has practically reached saturation point in the provinces of Manitoba and Saskatchewan (and even in Alberta to a certain degree) because the federal government considers that its own schools are of better quality than the provincial schools in the northern parts of these provinces. It is difficult for us to state categorically that these conclusions are entirely justified, since we have not made a systematic examination of each situation. In some cases, the provincial school authorities contest the validity of these conclusions. In other cases, these same authorities are more than willing to have their students transferred to federal schools and are prepared to pay the expenses.

The current availability of provincial school services is not a principle of absolute necessity. In a good many cases, the federal government has approached a local school board even though it did then not have available the required space or personnel to sign a joint agreement. In these cases the discussions necessarily dealt with the steps to be taken to make services available, by putting up new buildings, creating new programs or hiring adequate staff. The final steps were completed only when these demands had been met to the satisfaction of the federal officials. This is the case for the financial participation of the federal government in the construction of provincial schools. Federal participation in construction costs is a powerful bargaining point in the preliminary discussion with municipal educational administrators. Such administrators use this aspect of the agreement to convince the members of their school boards to accept the federal offers. Indeed, many of the problems involved in joint agreements are a result of the provincial authorities' ignorance of the obligations undertaken when the agreement is signed. Such agreements are usually drawn up for an Indefinite period and are continually brought up to date in the light of new school or demographic statistics. For example, when the number of Indian school children exceeds the number set by the original agreement, an amendment or a new agreement is effected to take account of this change.

The second basic principle of these joint agreements is the consent of the majority of the parents. In this way, the federal government wishes to assure its integration program the full support of the Indian parents.

This policy has been the cause of disputes, some on the actual methods used to consult parents and obtain signatures, others on the very principle of an integrated school and its method of operation. As a starting point, we may point out that the Indians have never questioned the principle that the native population must be consulted. On the contrary, it is considered a necessary part of the democratic participation of the parents concerned. Indian criticism is directed rather towards the circumstances and techniques of the consultation. Under certain circumstances, federal directors accelerate their integration

---

[1] The fact that those who give their approval are more or less informed on the governments' intentions and that their approval can be given several different interpretations forms one of the fundamental weaknesses of a method of operation that proceeds from popular consent instead of a formally expressed request.

projects and request of insufficiently prepared people choices whose implications they do not fully understand. The consensus is seldom unanimous. In addition, the people who see their point of view rejected (those who continually oppose immediate school integration for any reason) object to the methods used to obtain signatures which are interpreted as consent. Indians have claimed that certain Indian families have signed or placed their cross on official documents when they understood little or none of the content. It has even been asserted that in certain cases the federal officials responsible for the popular consensus used discreditable means (intimidation, undue pressure, biased explanations, etc...) to obtain the necessary number of signatures for an agreement. Dissatisfied Indian leaders take advantage of these instances of division to spread doubt of the validity of the government's methods in conducting popular votes.

To conclude, the purity of the government's intentions regarding joint agreements can be praised. However, it is in interpreting actual situations or in using certain techniques and carrying out decisions that imperfections creep in, and these imperfections open the White man to criticism which is more or less well founded.

We have just set out the guiding principles of the government's policies concerning joint agreements. We must now define the various elements of the agreement in order to have a clearer understanding of the distribution of responsibilities.

2. The Main Elements of the Agreement

The first joint agreement was signed in 1950 (South Indian Lake, Le Pas) in Manitoba. On March 31, 1965, 25,207 Indians attended provincial schools. Up till now, the federal-provincial agreements controlling the organization and operating methods of these joint programs have been signed between the federal government and the local school board where the Indian students will be enrolled (an individual agreement). More recently, agreements have been signed between the federal government and some provinces (provincial agreement or Master Plan). In these cases, the federal government signs only a general agreement with the provincial government, which is responsible for its application by the local or regional school boards where young Indians are admitted to provincial schools.

aa. Individual Agreements

It is obvious that joint agreements between the federal government and the various Canadian school boards will not be identical in every way. Each one takes local circumstances into account. However, the following points are included in each agreement.

The school commissions agree to:

(1) to accept up to a specified number the young Indians who apply;

(2) to ensure that there is no racial segregation.

The school boards must bind themselves to three kinds of obligations involving the educational rights of Indians, administrative obligations and academic obligations.

(1) The obligations involving the educational rights of Indians include accessibility of schools (the school boards are required to accept the enrollment of all children of school age); compulsory education (school boards are obliged to offer courses to all children of school age who are duly enrolled); equal eligibility to enjoy all school services available (school boards must consider all Indians on an equal footing and must offer them all the educational services available to other students).

(2) Administrative obligations. The school boards agree to respect a certain number of administrative and financial obligations. In the first place, they must submit budgetary estimates before December of each year to be ratified by the Minister. They must then administer the annual budgets while respecting the limits established by the accepted estimates. They must pay all the operating expenses of such an undertaking, including the costs of teaching, school administration and the expenses incurred for the maintenance and repair of buildings. Unless they receive express authorization from the Minister, they can in no way levy school taxes on property assessments. In this way, the federal government assures itself that the integration of Indians into provincial schools will not put any financial obligations on the parents. Finally, the school board may rent additional school services if a request is made.

(3) Academic obligations are completely non-existent in the sense that no standard determines the curriculum, the professional qualifications of teachers or the variety and quality of programs. The agreement merely mentioned the theoretical possibility of optional consultation with the regional superintendent of Indian schools on the problems arising in the education of young Indians.

The federal government agrees to meet the costs of educating Indian children in provincial schools by paying a per capita amount based on the general operating costs when education services already exist. Where new buildings have to be built, the sharing of expenses is based on the relative size of the Indian student population compared with the total student population.[1] If the proportion is a quarter or a third or a half, the federal government will pay the same proportion of the total construction costs.

We have already seen that no academic standard is specified in the agreement. We are aware of the practical difficulties that too many academic provisions might raise, In addition, we know from experience and from our contacts with the majority of regional superintendents, that the academic side of the question is examined separately in great detail. No formal step is taken unless a favourable judgement on the quality of school and education services has been received. Finally, the directors of studies in the various regions and school districts are responsible for supervising the academic and social careers of Indians in integrated public schools. In spite of these judicious assessments and indirect controls on the academic aspect of the agreement, we feel it is necessary to include some academic provisions in the individual agreements with school boards. The objection may be made that the federal government has no jurisdiction in educational matters, since they are a provincial responsibility. in our opinion, the educational rights of Indians go beyond the strict limits of accessibility to schools and school services available. They also include the right to quality and diversity of essential school services in the educational centres of each province.

The absence of academic standards causes little difficulty when the school boards involved in the joint agreements are aware of the special needs of Indians, while at the same time avoiding all forms of unofficial segregation. For example, in the public schools at Maria and Restigouche, the local school boards have organized nursery schools for Indian children in order to make it easier for them to learn French. Since the language spoken at home is still Micmac, Indians of school age cannot go straight into first grade without risking failure or extremely poor results. Thus, the nursery school will make them better prepared to grasp the program of the first grade when they enter school. However, this understanding of the problem does not exist everywhere.

The joint agreements are equally silent about Indian representation on the school board. The federal authorities are fully aware of this fundamental gap in the program of integrating Indians into the provincial schools. Since they are not represented, the Indians have no say in any concern, and the board's decisions are made unilaterally. The Indians do not have the right to be elected on the school boards because they do not pay school taxes. This arrangement greatly limits the interest and participation of Indian communities in programs of school integration. The Indians feel completely dissociated from decisions taken, and too often consider them harmful to the welfare of their children. The regional superintendent and the district inspectors are of course present to protect the interests of the Indians, but they cannot do it in the same way as the Indians themselves would. Some avant-garde school boards get around this legal difficulty by inviting an Indian delegate to attend the school board's meetings as a consultant. However, these delegates do not have the right to vote. Sometimes, the Indian school committees are consulted on certain matters. But these consultations are too sporadic and ill-defined to constitute a positive element of native participation in the program of school integration. Indians rarely have an opportunity to influence directly the decisions concerning themselves and their children.

---

[1] The average contribution is $1,000.00 per student.

Although the joint agreement which we have analysed makes no specific statement on the subject, we may in conclusion sum up one of the principal characteristics of these agreements as follows: the federal government buys a service which is already in existence, and in no way tries to exercise control over the current methods of operation in a given school district. A typical clause explaining the government's position appears in the Deschambault joint agreement. We quote: "Nothing in this agreement shall confer on the Minister any right of supervision over the curriculum, the administration and teaching personnel, the methods or materials of instruction or management generally of the school, provided the Minister or any person authorized by the Minister shall have the right to visit the school from time to time."[1]

bb. Provincial Agreements

The greatest progress in the field of joint agreements is found in the agreements between the government and a province. In such cases, the terms of the agreement are automatically generalized to include all eligible provincial school boards that agree to educate Indian children. These agreements are progressive inasmuch as they offer the Indian population better guarantees of their educational rights. Finally, these agreements establish provincial participation in the education of native populations who are accorded the same rights as those enjoyed by the White population. The responsibilities of educating Indians are shared. The specific obligations of each party concerned are defined and codified in advance. We shall examine the three provincial joint agreements chronologically in order to see how they differ from the individual joint agreements, and in what way each one shows improvements over the previous agreements. These are, in order of appearance, the agreement with the Northland School Division; the agreement with British Columbia; and the agreement with Manitoba.

(1) The agreement with the Northland School Division. The first joint agreement which we will study is not properly speaking a provincial joint agreement. It is an agreement between the Northland school district of the Province of Alberta and the federal government. However, this school division[2] covers an area as large as the rest of the province and takes in a very large number of scattered schools offering a minimum of education services.[3] Finally, the innovating character of this agreement

---

[1] Agreement between the Department of Citizenship and Immigration and the Department of Education of the province of Saskatchewan with respect to the Deschambault school, Joint Agreement No. 164, signed May 22, 1963.

[2] Northern regional school board No. 61, established December 31, 1960, by order of the Minister of Education of the Province of Alberta, Dr. John West Chalmers was the first trustee.

[3] In this region, there were four kinds of schools offering minimal education services of poor quality: (a) schools run by the federal government; (b) mission schools; (c) Metis schools financed by the

holds great symbolic and strategic value for the future, it is unnecessary to go into the history of the establishment of this new regional school board in Alberta. For the purpose of our analysis, it is important to pick out the reasons which make this agreement particularly interesting in the light of the new division of responsibilities presently being established to direct federal-provincial relations in Indian education. We will set down the aspects which seem the most significant.

1. The agreement concerns the northern regions of the Province of Alberta where school integration would usually be hard to achieve.

2. The provincial policy of school "equalization grants" and also the vigorous leadership of the Department of Education have helped to raise the standard of northern schools.

3. The clauses in Alberta's School Act concerning religion in public schools have made it easier to transfer responsibilities from the federal government to the Province of Alberta.

4. The excellent personal relationship existing between the officials of the Department of Education and of Indian Affairs were a great help in drawing up the first agreement of this kind.

5. While bringing about this agreement, the federal government respected the prerogatives of the province and of this regional school board regarding educational autonomy (clause 6 of the agreement).

Having summarized the innovating aspects, we will now present an outline of the elements of the joint agreement. As in the individual agreements, some clauses define the responsibilities of the Minister of the Department of Citizenship and Immigration, while others set out the obligations of the Northland School Division. The responsibilities of the Department are more numerous; they attempt to reduce the number of problems presented by Indian education. The administrative obligations of the regional school board are more detailed. In the hope of reducing the difficulties involved in calculating operating costs, the officially accepted method of determining Indian enrollment for a year Is specified. On the academic level, the federal government recognizes the school board's autonomy in the same clause cited above.

The responsibilities of the Minister are as follows:

–to ensure that Indians attend school;

–to make Indians comply with standards of health, cleanliness, and dress comparable to those followed by white students;

–to share in operating costs on a pro rata basis according to the Indian population, and to make payments every three months;

–to notify the school board's trustee on June 1st of the Indian enrollment predicted for the following school year;

–to pay for the Indians all special charges which may be levied on non-Indian parents;

–to surrender all supervision of administrative and academic aspects of Indian education to the school board, though retaining the right to visit the school from time to time.

The responsibilities of the Northland School Board are also specified in the agreement:

Department of Education but operated by the Department of Social Welfare; (d) public or private schools run by independent school districts; these offer minimal education services.

--to accept the enrollment of Indians at the beginning of each school year and to supply Indians with the same education services as those available to White students;

--to avoid all forms of segregation in schools;

--to send a statement of account at the end of each year covering the operational costs payable to the school board for the fiscal year ended;

--to calculate Indian enrollment according to a pre-determined formula;[1]

--to assure Indian representation on school boards while taking into consideration the educational laws of the province.

Lastly, certain clauses make provisions for the termination of the agreement or for new agreements:

--when the regional school board operates and supports a federal school, each case will be subject to a separate agreement between the parties concerned;

--any project involving construction of a new school where Indians will be enrolled, will be subject to a special agreement;

--either of the two contracting parties can terminate this agreement provided that they notify the other party in writing. In this case, the agreement will be terminated at the end of the second school year completed after notice is given.

The most spectacular aspect of the agreement concerns the participation of Indians on the school boards when provincial education laws allow it. It seems appropriate to underline the comment of a federal official. He is not afraid to state that the provincial proposal:

> indicates a constructive step toward having the province accept increased responsibility for Indian education and could offer us an opportunity to observe the operation of a limited provincial-federal program functioning on an experimental basis.
>
> Secondly, if this school division is found to operate successfully with no unsurmountable difficulties, then this division would serve as a model for the implementation of similar joint responsibility programmes in other agencies.
>
> Thirdly, the teachers of both Indian and non-Indian children in the schools contained within this division would come under the jurisdiction of the province. This means that they will belong to the Alberta Teachers' Association and would accordingly be expected to obtain provincial certification.
>
> Finally, ... the status of denominational schools would in no way be endangered since provision for denominational schools is contained within the Alberta School Act.

He defined this agreement as:

---

[1] In order to determine the operating costs to be reimbursed by the federal government, the number of Indians enrolled on October 1st of each academic year will be taken as the number for the year. Alternately, the two parties concerned may arrive at a number after a preliminary agreement at the beginning of each year; this number cannot be less than 75.

> a starting point towards our ultimate objective; namely, provincial recognition of the Indian as a citizen with privileges and opportunities equal to those enjoyed by non-Indian members of the community.

On the academic level, this joint agreement made possible a large number of important duties, At least, that is the appraisal in the same memorandum when it defines the duties of the Northland School Division in relation to Indian children:

--management and administration of federal schools within the boundaries of the school board, boarding schools excepted;

--hiring and transferring teaching staff;

--financing the administration of schools. This includes teachers' salaries, materials, text books, supplies and maintenance;

--availability of classes and board for teachers on a basis of shared costs;

--school supervision, curriculum planning and program co-ordination;

--establishment of special services when necessary.

In short, the federal government's agreement with the Province of Alberta makes innovations on more than one point.

(2) The agreement with British Columbia. The agreement between the federal government and British Columbia was signed on November 12, 1963, but was made retroactive to January 1, 1963. It created a precedent in that it was the first joint agreement signed by the federal government and a Canadian province. An official of Indian Affairs expressed his views on this subject very clearly when he wrote:

> This agreement is a most significant document in that it establishes a precedent which we hope will be followed by other provinces.

The new aspect of this joint agreement is that it sets a monthly per capita operating cost of $25.00 for each Indian attending a provincial school. According to the terms of the agreement, this per capita rate will be valid for three years. In its request to the Treasury Board dated February 8, 1963, the Indian Affairs Branch pointed out the reasonable level of these educational charges:

> The proposed tuition fee is most reasonable as this Department could not provide the same facilities to the Indian pupils at comparable cost . . . It is our opinion that failure to meet the request of the provincial government would seriously damage the excellent relationship which has existed in connection with the integrated education of pupils inthis province which we have held out as a model of a province assuming its proper role with respect to the education of Indian children.

The progressive aspect of provincial participation in Indian education in British Columbia is also apparent in the wording of the clauses signed by the two parties. The clauses concerning the monthly school attendance of Indians are detailed because they form the legal basis for the total monthly grants the province can claim.

(3) The agreement with Manitoba. The agreement signed between the federal government and the Province of Manitoba closely resembles that of British Columbia, which, in fact, served as the basis on which discussions on this subsequent agreement were started. It establishes the educational rights of Indians in provincial schools (the right to education and all education services available to White students)

following an amendment to the Education Act of Manitoba. This amendment to the Education Act is the direct result of negotiations which led to the signing of this agreement by Manitoba. This is a substantial innovation. Whereas, In the cases of Alberta and British Columbia, the agreement was in no way contrary to their educational law and was in fact modelled on it, the agreement between the federal government and Manitoba brought about a reform in the Education Act. From now on, the officials of the provincial Department of Education will recognize even their moral obligations towards the Indian populations.

> In the discussion with a senior official of the Province, the principle of some coverage of responsibility by the Province for education of Indians as citizens of the Province was accepted - at least as a moral responsibility. The amount of financial responsibility was not ventured upon in the discussions, but the rates offered are coQsidered by the Province as fair and reasonable . . .

From moral responsibility to financial responsibility, there is only one stage left to cover, even if this stage represents a challenge of some magnitude. In other words, this new pilot agreement marks an improvement on earlier agreements and opens the way to a further increase in provincial participation. The agreement was signed July 21, 1965. Here are the principal points of the agreement:

> 1. That the Department of Education and the Indian Affairs Branch sign an agreement to provide for:
>
>   (a) the payment by Indian Affairs to the Province of Manitoba of an agreed per capita amount for the attendance of each Indian child at Manitoba public schools. This per capita amount would be exclusive of capital costs and transportation costs, and would be calculated separately for elementary and secondary pupils. Our calculations show that for 1965, the per capita cost for elementary pupils is approximately $275.00, and per capita costs for secondary students is approximately $400.00 per annum.
>
>   (b) payment by the Province of Manitoba to Indian Affairs for the attendance on the same basis of non-Treaty Indian pupils for whom the Province is responsible at Indian schools.
>
>   (c) if the foregoing arrangement can be made, the Province will pay to each school district and division where Indian pupils are attending, a monthly fee per pupil which would be calculated at the average net per capita cost to the local authorities.
>
> 2. It would be necessary to negotiate with the districts and divisions where agreements have already been made, to amend that part of the agreement having to do with payment by the Indian Affairs Branch of operating costs to the local authorities.

Concerning the agreement a federal official commented:

> We have agreed that the foregoing would constitute a fair and equitable arrangement for all parties concerned. Indian pupils would be guaranteed the right of attendance in our public schools; school districts and divisions would receive a fair return for services rendered; and the Province would be

---

[1] Memorandum, Indian Affairs Branch, 1965.

> recompensed for grants which it has paid to divisions and districts on behalf of Indian pupils in attendance at public schools.

Thus Manitoba continues to recognize its financial responsibilities towards the Indians who are not registered as such. The province agrees to reimburse the federal government for the education services which it provides them in its schools. The rates will be the same as those which the federal government pays for provincial services for the Indians.[1]

To conclude this sect ion on the concept of joint agreements, we can state that provincial agreements provide a better guarantee of educational and academic rights for Indians than individual joint agreements. They give uniform access to provincial schools and reduce arbitrary decisions as much as possible. They also enable the federal government to reduce the cost of Indian education (per capita cost) and noticeably improve the administrative and financial controls which the federal government must exercise over education operations in general. Finally, these agreements bring about provincial awareness of educational responsibilities toward Indians and make it possible for the provinces to acquire on a large scale actual experience in Indian education on both the academic and administrative levels. Theoretically, at any rate, the three parties concerned, Indians, provinces, and federal government, all benefit from the agreements.

As a general rule, joint agreements have favoured Indian emancipation in a positive manner. For example, they give Indians the same educational opportunities[2] as White students. In White surroundings, they are accorded the same rights that White people enjoy. Education services available to white children have become available to Indians as well. Unfortunately, due to a combination of socio-cultural conditions, Indians do not benefit nearly as much as White people from the services offered them, as is indicated by their greater retardation, higher rate of dropouts, lower level of education, etc . . . In spite of these handicaps, many particularly talented young Indians have cleared the formerly insurmountable barriers, and have shown beyond doubt the intellectual capacities of our native population. Until recently, it was mainly young Indians' talents in sports and art that were acclaimed. Now their intellectual aptitudes are recognized as comparable to those of the White man. Definite proof of these aptitudes are found in comparable school results when the living conditions (and chiefly the studying conditions) of young Indians are changed or improved. Teachers and educational administrators readily accept this fact.

Most of the joint agreements signed by the federal government and various Canadian school boards work well. By that we mean that the obligations taken on by the signers are respected to the letter, and that the education of Indian children in provincial schools does not raise any particular problem. This is obviously the result of favourable circumstances which vary from one place to another. To illustrate this point, we would like to mention the reasons which have made the joint agreement of Kinistino (James Smith Reserve) in Saskatchewan run so smoothly.[3]

---

[1] $13,75 per month for Kindergarten; $27.50 per month from 1st to 8th grade inclusively; and $40.00 per month from 9th grade to 12th grade inclusively.

[2] The inequalities appear mainly on the labour market. Even with equal education, Indians do not have the same opportunities as white people.

[3] Other examples can be chosen from other provinces such as Quebec, Ontario, Manitoba, Alberta and British Columbia. We are taking our example from comments noted at an interview at the Regional Office.

1. continued parental co-operation;
2. the enlightened and powerful leadership of the chairman of the local school committee;
3. joint meetings of parent-teacher associations (made up of Indians and white people);
4. close collaboration among the representatives of the federal government, the province and the school board;
5. regular meetings of the professional staff on the reserve and continual exchanges of information.

On the other hand, the joint agreements raise problems which are more or less numerous, and more or less serious in various regions of the country. These problems are not found concentrated in one spot. We shall examine these problems one by one, grouping them according to two separate categories:

1. legal problems;
2. administrative and financial problems.

Our purpose is not to challenge the value of joint agreements or that of integrated schools. On the contrary, the over-all judgement which we gave earlier was rather favourable. We merely wish to underline the weak points in school integration to bring about the necessary administrative or academic reforms. Moreover, we realize that we are not necessarily discussing all the problems, and that the ones we are referring to are not analysed in all their aspects. While taking into consideration these limitations, we will examine this series of problems in the order proposed above.

1. Legal Problems

The question of formal Indian representation (by election) was brought up at Restigouche, in Quebec. Up to now, Indians have been ineligible for membership on school boards because they do not pay school taxes. The regional superintendent has brought to the attention of the provincial Department of Education an argument which seems very strong to us. His reasoning is as follows: though the Indian does not pay school taxes directly, he does pay them indirectly through financial contributions made to the local school board by the federal government. In other words, the money which the federal government pays to the local school board for Indian education is the financial share which the Indians should pay for their education. The federal government pays their school tax ifl their name. The Department's legal advisor thinks that this legal interpretation of federal contributions is valid. We believe that these discussions will lead to the election of Indians to school boards. However, it may be several more years before this result is achieved. In the meantime, discussions will be continued on the legal aspects of this question which is of great importance for the future of the Indians.

In the Northland regional school board, this same question resulted in a review of educational legislation which would allow for Indian representation on the school board.

2. Administrative and Financial Problems

One of the most delicate financial problems in individual joint agreements is that of determining the financial costs (operating costs) of the agreement. A formula must be found to establish the exact number of Indians enrolled at a given moment and the number of items to be included in the operating costs.

aa. How should the total number of Indians enrolled be determined in order to calculate the total amount in subsidies to be received?

The number of Indians enrolled can be calculated in many ways:

(1) by calculating the number of Indians enrolled at a given moment - at the beginning of the school year, or on a specified date each month;

(2) by calculating the average school attendance; and

(3) by calculating total Indian enrollment for the year.

Thus there are several methods of calculation, and when these methods are not clearly specified in the agreement, divergent interpretations may become bones of contention. These problems seem clearly resolved in the provincial agreements where the methods of calculation are clearly indicated or in the case of certain provinces having methods which have already been tested.

> . . . Where the province has an established formula such as that in Ontario, which uses perfect aggregate attendance for secondary schools and actual attendance for elementary schools, this formula is accepted by the Indian Affairs Branch. Where no formula exists, the question is usually a matter for negotiation between the Department and the board. [1]

bb. What items should be included in the operating costs? In order to determine the per capita amount, it is necessary to establish the total operating costs. Once these expenses have been established, it is then easy to define the expenses attributable to the presence of Indian school children (proportional calculation of the expenses) inasmuch as total Indian enrollment can be determined to the satisfaction of the two parties. The central problem here is to fix the expenses which are to be reimbursed by the government. The transportation of Indian pupils is entirely assumed by the government. There is no question of a school board including its transportation costs for White students, and later charging part to the federal government. The latter already pays the transportation expenses of the Indian pupils. In the same way, when the federal government has already made financial contributions for the construction of a school, it will not afterwards agree to pay annually to local school boards the financial charges arising from the loans they made to finance their projects. The federal government has already paid its share and the interest is the responsibility of the school board. This opinion is clearly expressed in the document which we quoted above:

> Difficulties in the definition of costs arise because certain of these costs do not pertain to Indian pupils. For example, since the Department supplies all necessary transportation for its pupils, it should not be liable for a share of the board's transportation costs. However, the main item of concern is the inclusion of annual debenture payments. When a board is computing tuition fees for a pupil other than an Indian, it expects to recover part of these expenses through the tuition fees, but when the Department of Citizenship and Immigration has al ready made a contribution to the capital cost of the school, the inclusion of debenture payments in calculating the tuition fees due on behalf of Indian students is inappropriate. For this reason formal agreements are preferred when contributions to capital cost are made.[2]

---

[1] Report of Conference on the Financial Statistics of Education, Ottawa, Nov. 1961, D.B.S., Appendix F., p. 69.

[2] Ibid. pp. 69-70.

C. Evaluation of Joint Agreements

In spite of certain gaps which we have pointed out, the balance sheet for joint agreements and the gradual introduction of Indian pupils into provincial schools is distinctly profitable. These agreements grant Indian students an equal footing with White pupils where their educational rights are concerned and make accessible all programs of specialized and professional studies. This is a policy which the federal government should emphasize, while taking into consideration the preparation of the native population for the transition from reserve schools to public schools. The government must also encourage the provinces to take a greater interest in Indian education. From this point of view, new provincial joint agreements should be drawn up. Finally, a determined effort should be made to assure Indian parents of a greater participation in the education of their children. They would thus be better informed on the true nature of these programs and would have more adequate knowledge for judging them. As for the children, they are the first ones to benefit: the results can already be seen in the improvement in educational level and a more adequate technical preparation. It is still too soon to know whether they will become citizens who are better integrated into the Canadian way of life.

II. EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION: Hierarchy and Functioning

The Department of Education of the Indian Affairs Branch serves an area divided into seven school regions. These regions are:

1 - the Maritimes;
2 - Quebec;
3 - Ontario;
4 - Manitoba;
5 - Saskatchewan;
6 - Alberta;
7 - British Columbia.

In turn, these regions are subdivided into a certain number of agencies. When the number of agencies increases, new districts are created, each one comprising two, three or four agencies. British Columbia, because of its strong Indian contingent, is subdivided into five districts and ten agencies.

In order to exercise control over the education expenses of Indians and the quality of teaching offered them, the Indian Affairs Branch has created a complex bureaucratic structure with numerous officials to whom have been delegated powers of decision and execution in educational matters. We should note, however, that this bureaucratic structure of education officials is itself attached to the general bureaucratic structure established to assure the smooth running of Indian reserves in general.

To study the educational organization created for Indian education, we must examine this bureaucratic structure. In the first place, we will try to: 1) describe it in terms of delegating the power of decision and execution; 2) define the duties or tasks assigned to those holding positions at each level of authority; 3) describe the channels designed for communication and try to find out if they meet the needs of people at the foot of the ladder; and 4) mention briefly the type of educational institution the structure serves.

Secondly, we will state the objectives of the bureaucratic structure. In the third place, we will discuss some of the difficult problems raised by an overly ponderous bureaucratic machine:

A - conflicting loyalties;

B - bureaucracy versus the democratization of decisions;

C - low pay schedules as an obstacle to obtaining fully qualified staff;

D - the demographic growth of Indians and the increase in education costs;

E - resistance to school integration.

Finally, we will see how planning and integration constitute two instruments which can help to solve these problems.

1. Bureaucratic Structure at the Level of School Regions

A. Levels in the Hierarchy of School Structure

Although it would be more appropriate to speak of a regional structure rather than of a coherent national structure in Indian education, the overall picture presents some degree of uniformity. This permits us to discuss the various "positions" and "duties".

For example, each administrative region is headed by a regional director appointed by the Indian Affairs Branch, who exercises the authority of the Branch at the regional level and co-ordinates the work of subordinates who carry out particular duties in his name. Directly beneath him are the superintendents, including the regional school superintendent. According to the region, various positions follow that of regional school superintendent on the scale: a district school superintendent is found where there is a district office. Where such districts do not exist, the regional superintendent is followed by the agency school superintendent or supervising principal. His work is divided as follows: 40%, administration; 40%, class supervision; 20%, guidance of Indian students attending non-Indian schools. In any case, the district school superintendents always have school superintendents under them to take on some of their responsibilities at the agency level. In turn, the agency school superintendent is followed by the school principal, and the principal has of course jurisdiction over the teachers.

We have briefly run through the main positions found in the direct line of authority provided by the structure of educational organization. However, there are a number of positions kept for specialists in guidance, technical training, language, or other specializations. These positions were in the first place designed to improve the quality of teaching and the efficiency of the school system.

However, owing to the joint agreements, this description alone does not cover all aspects of the structure of the educational organization. In 1963, approximately 40% of the Indian school population was enrolled in provincial schools, and in 1965, approximately 50%. As a result, the various provincial education departments are necessarily taking on large responsibilities in Indian education, and the provincial officials take a close interest in the Indian population. Arrangements are made for provincial inspectors to visit Indian schools in order to compare them with provincial public schools.

To complete our picture of the educational organization for Indians, we must also include the positions of agency superintendent, local school boards, church representatives, as well as parent-teacher associations. The agency superintendent has only a limited responsibility toward Indian schools. In the various regions of the country, it is the regional school superintendent who determines the important educational policies of the region: these are afterwards approved by the regional superintendent and included in the budgetary estimates. Afterwards, the regional school superintendent sees to the implementation of these policies. Numerous administrative problems result from the duality in the lines of authority. It seems indicated that the regional school superintendent should take on more responsibility and should acquire greater freedom of action. An increased effort toward school Integration and a gradual transfer of federal responsibilities to the provinces favour these changes. The Indian school committees are not at all widespread, but they fill an important function which we will examine later. Church representatives have a role to play in education only in so far as they own schools or take on teaching duties. The parent-teacher associations are even fewer in number than the Indian school committees.

We will now look at the duties and responsibilities attached to this series of positions which form the structure of the school system established for Indian education.

B. Duties of Education Officials in the field

Although the regional supervisor of Indian agencies has a position in the chain of authority between the national director of education, stationed in Ottawa, and the regional school superintendent, it is difficult to attribute to this official a special competence in the field of education, A diagram[1] of the reorganized regional structure of services to Indians shows that the regional supervisor acts only as a link between Ottawa and the heads of services placed under his authority. As well, in chapter two (2) of the Field Manual concerning education, we find no special directive on the duties of the regional supervisor of Indian agencies.

As regards regional school superintendents or district superintendents, the guide for district superintendents makes the following stipulation in its introduction: "The Indian school administrator, whether at the regional or the district level, acts for the chief, Education Division, who, with his staff, coordinates the policy for the Department of Indian Education, Effective administration in the field demands adherence by field officials to that policy." What is this policy in regard to Indian education? It has essentially four points:

a. In principle, if the policies of the Indian Affairs Branch in education and procedures prove efficient, it is to be hoped that tangible progress will be made for the next generation thanks to the achievements of the Indians of this generation.

b. The Indian Affairs Branch intends to make the best educational services possible available to the Indians in order to fill their needs and meet the demands of their present situation.

c. The Indian Affairs Branch intends to educate the Indian child in the same class-room as the White child. To achieve this end, it will provide whatever is needed for Indian children to attend preferably public schools. However, it will retain different types of schools so that isolated Indian children will also receive an adequate education.

d. The regional school superintendent is the chief official in education working in the field. He is responsible to the regional supervisor for the smooth running of the Indian school system and for obtaining classes for the Indian children of the region. In addition, he is responsible for interpreting the policies of the Department of Education to the other education officials in the field. He may delegate part of his powers and responsibilities to the district school superintendent or to the agency supervising principal. Finally, these officials are asked to co-operate with the agency superintendent who takes on certain specific administrative responsibilities affecting schools.

While the regional school superintendent is responsible for interpreting the policies of the Indian Affairs Branch concerning Indian education and also for preparing forecasts on the expansion of services and the smooth running of the school system, the district school superintendent has three main duties:

(a) organizing classes;

(b) administering schools;

(c) supervising schools.

---

[1] Reorganization Plans - Saskatchewan Regional Office, Saskatoon, July 1965, Indian Affairs Branch.

Of the 16 duties listed in the guide prepared by the Indian Affairs Branch for district school superintendents in July, 1959, only 4 appear to have an educational character, properly speaking: this explains the predominantly administrative character of the district superintendent's duties.

We can summarize the role of the agency supervising principal by quoting from the guide prepared for his information in May, 1963:

> . . . he is expected to work co-operatively with the Agency Superintendent, assuming much of the administrative work connected with education which passes through Agency office and acting as consultant on all educational matters. Normally he will devote about 40 per cent of his time to administrative duties, 40 per cent to classroom supervision and related activities and 20 per cent to guidance and liaison work amongst pupils attending provincial schools. (p. 1)

We notice that the Indian Affairs Branch allots a considerable portion of professional time for school administration.

The Indian School Regulations describe the duties of the school principal in eleven points which we will list *in extenso*:

1. In compliance with the directives of his superiors, he must:
    (a) assign the responsibilities necessary for efficient operation of the school;
    (b) use his authority in all matters concerning the output of teachers and students;
2. Establish rules for the efficient operation of the school;
3. Supervise the performance of work by teaching staff or students; give advice when necessary;
4. Make certain that the attendance records and files are kept up to date;
5. Enroll children when the agency superintendent recommends their enrollment;
6. Expel those pupils indicated by the superintendent;
7. Suspend any student guilty of an offence damaging to the school's reputation; advise the superintendent of this action;
8. Make provisions for obtaining furniture, equipment, books or supplies;
9. Supervise the students and the school premises;
10. Inspect the school premises daily; report to the superintendent any condition requiring his attention; and
11. Report any absences or replacements of the teaching staff, and also the need for substitute teachers.

These regulations are based on the necessity of assuring that the subordinates themselves follow the required regulations.

Finally, in addition to teaching, teachers have the following responsibilities:

1. to establish a time-table showing the subjects for study, the order of the subjects, and the time allotted for each one;

2. to watch over the cleanliness, safety, welfare and comfort of students, and to report to the superintendent any sign of infectious disease;

3. to keep the school records up-to-date according to the set procedures, and to make them available to any authorized person;

4. to make arrangements to facilitate the verification of any duties assigned by the authorities;

5. to attend the teachers' meetings called by the principal or the teacher in charge of the school;

6. to arrive at work 15 minutes before classes start in the morning, and 5 minutes, in the afternoon;

7. to receive visitors with courtesy and to enter their names in the register; and

8. to report to the superintendent any absences among the teaching staff and the need for substitute teachers.

We see that, in addition to teaching, the teachers are subjected to detailed regulations. Their superiors are responsible for implementing the regulations, as can be seen from the regulations concerning the school principal.

C. Official Channels of Communication

In a bureaucratic structure, communications normally take place between superior and immediate subordinates all the way down the chain of authority. As far as the lines of communication for the district school superintendent are concerned, we cite the actual text of his guide:

> The district school superintendent may communicate directly on professional matters with the parents of children in the school within the district, the principals and teachers in these schools and the local school boards and church official, Routine matters on maintenance he may deal directly with the agency superintendent.[1]

As regards school supplies and questions concerning the living and working conditions of teachers. . .

> . . . the district school superintendents may communicate directly with Education Division.

Then again...

> All teachers will be governed by the 'Regulations' (Indian School Regulations) in the operation of their schools. The district school superintendent is not empowered to change or authorize any deviation from these regulations. He may submit to the regional school superintendent for a decision, requests from principals and teachers on matters pertaining to regulations...[2]

Concerning the agency supervising principal...

> The normal channel of communication for the supervising principal is through the office of the agency superintendent on matters pertaining to the administration of schools. However,

---

[1] Field Manual, 1962, Appendix DD.

[2] Field Manual, 1962, Appendix DD.

> he may seek the advice of the regional school superintendent on purely educational problems by direct communication.

Since his chief duty is to supervise the work of subordinates, he must accumulate a considerable number of reports:

(1) the school principal's monthly report;

(2) the annual report of each school;

(3) requests for school supplies;

(4) requests for leave;

(5) requests for bursaries;

(6) applications for employment;

(7) his own monthly report...

. . .etc.

Like the district school superintendent, although not through him, he must take his orders from the regional school superintendent in matters concerning the regulations for Indian schools.

The examination of these two positions in relation with the other positions in the structure shows us that the poles of communication are determined by the various responsibilities assumed by different people. However, since the responsibilities are distributed according to a complex pattern and sometimes are duplicated, communications are also carried out according to a complex pattern and may be duplicated.

Thus the district school superintendent may enter into direct contact with Ottawa and thus by-pass the regional school superintendent and the agency regional supervisor. On the other hand, the district school superintendent and the agency supervising principal are both liable to consult the agency superintendent on a similar problem or at least problems of the same nature. The same holds true for their relations with the regional school superintendent. We conclude that there is a duplication of duties and a duplication of communications. Add the possibility of conflict to this ambiguity and little more is needed to upset the official channels of communications. However, too faithful an adherence to procedures governing the communications between the different levels in the structure could result in the blocking of official channels.

The following statement was made by a liaison officer who was attempting to explain at the second conference of school committees held at Prince Albert in March, 1965, why Indian school committees had not succeeded in functioning smoothly.

> . . . When you have a large number of people who work together . . . you need administration, You have to have channels of procedure and this sort of thing and this is the best and only way that a large number of people can get together to achieve some common purpose . . . But there is another side to it. Administrative machinery is also the best way that has ever been invented to keep from doing things or do nothing. It is the kind of machinery that works both ways.
>
> . . . In terms of a couple of comments I heard with reference to the administrative machinery, one in connection with the short circuit, somebody said that they were on a school committee

---

[1] Ibid., Appendix CC.

> and they asked the superintendent what they should do and the superintendent did not know what they should do, so he said check with Regional Office and the Regional Office said it is a local matter and there you have a short circuit with nobody knowing what should be going on.
>
> Then another thing which can happen in machinery is the problem of overload, and perhaps this explains why sometimes communications slow down if you send in a request or letter for a suggestion and if you do not get a reply back as soon as you might want . . .
>
> One of the members of our Committee this morning mentioned that he would like to give more attention to some things but they have mountains of paper work back in his office and this is what is known as overload. . . . (p. 24)

This statement was an attempt to explain the isolation in which school committees found themselves. However, it is necessarily based on well known facts which feed to a great extent the criticism of the communications network within a complex administrative structure. There is no doubt, therefore, that communications between the levels of the structure set certain problems.

2. Objectives of the School Structure

It is obvious that any structure is designed to carry out certain proposed objectives, but it would be useful here to distinguish between planned objectives and those which have actually been achieved. To reach the ultimate objective of its Education Department, that is, the development of the Indians' potentials through education, the Indian Affairs Branch sees the school structure as a means . . . "for the efficient and successful organisation, administration and supervision of the schools. . ." However, when such an instrument begins to require so much attention from the officials working within the structure that they have little time or energy to wonder whether the system makes it possible to progress toward the ultimate objective, it is to be feared that in time officials will be more concerned with keeping the system going than with progress.

In fact, it is the idea of measuring progress that is made toward the major objective of the Education Department that has produced such a highly developed control involving the preparation of numerous and detailed regulations. However, as we have pointed out before, a worthy principle may lead to unimpressive results.

As the list of duties in the guides shows, administration monopolizes a considerable portion of time in the schedule of various officials and teachers. At every level, administration is extensive. Certain positions, for example, that of agency supervising principal, are defined almost entirely in administrative terms:

> The prompt submission to the agency office of all forms accurately and fully completed is one of the primary responsibilities of the supervising principal.

Even teachers, whose principal duty is above all else education, are subjected to regulated duties, and their superiors are required to see that these duties are carried out. We feel that the educational

---

[1] Field Manual, 1962, Appendix CC.

aspects are of the greatest importance in the schooling of Indian children, certainly more important than the non-academic aspects of teaching.

3. Some Problems Involved in the School Structure

In addition to the problems raised by the definition of the educational duties of the various officers, the complexity of communication channels and the very great variety in administrative procedures, we must mention five other types of problems which, to our way of thinking, reduce the efficiency of school organization and delay the improvement in the level of Indian education to a certain extent. These problems are as follows:

A. Conflicting loyalties in the middle and lower levels of the structure;

B. Latent and open conflicts between preserving the formal bureaucratic structure and the attempts to democratize the traditional structures;

C. The professional qualifications of those holding important offices in the system and the problems of low pay schedules;

D. The rapid increase in Indian population and in the cost of Indian education; and

E. Resistance to school integration on the part of officials already in position and teachers who fear that integration will result in their progressive elimination.

We will examine each of these problems according to this order.

A. Conflicting Loyalties

Through strict observance of the regulations drawn up for each public servant, the Indian Affairs Branch requires that the officials and teachers paid by the federal government be loyal to the official policies on Indian education, in other words, that they be loyal to their employers. We have listed the elements of this policy in the section where we defined the duties. The fact remains that the Indian school organization is formed of at least four types of schools. Some schools belong to the Indian Affairs Branch, and in those cases there are hardly any open conflicts in loyalties. However, in the case of residential schools founded and administered by religious orders, loyalty can easily swing in favour of the church, which does not necessarily share the views of the Indian Affairs Branch on Indian education. In a meeting which we had with Dr. Chalmers, Assistant Regional School Superintendent for Alberta, Dr. Chalmers underlined the conflict in loyalties in the following terms:

> There are two kinds of objectives: the church and the state objectives. The church objective is to make good people.
>
> The state objective is to give the Indians knowledge, skills and attitudes so that they can function effectively in a western middle-class North American civilization. The other choice is no longer a functional one since reserves are not viable.[1]

We can also add that it is the religious groups which are the most firmly opposed to the school integration of Indians... A regional superintendent made this statement to us about his relations with the Oblate fathers concerning school integration:

---

[1] M.-Adélard Tremblay, Notes d'entrevues, (interview notes), July 1965.

> It is regrettable but true: the Oblates in certain places are opposed to progress. They are trying to control the Indians. . . .[1]

During a visit to Lake Saint John in the summer of 1965, we also noted that certain teachers, under the leadership of nuns, were even trying to convince the Indians that integration was harmful.

In the field of teacher participation in provincial teachers' associations, Mr. Art McBetts, Assistant Director of the Saskatchewan Teachers' Federation, expressed his ideas as follows:

> One of the factors which limit the educational value of federal teachers is that they are not members of the Provincial Teachers' Association of Saskatchewan. They are federal employees, their loyalty is rather to the association of federal civil servants, which is of no use to them in their advancement as teachers. [2]

The loyalty of the teacher on certain questions concerning Indian children with whom he is in constant contact may incline towards educational principles overlooked in the regulations which are imposed on him from above. This phenomenon is even more liable to occur if the teacher himself is Indian, and as a result considers himself involved in everything which is in the interest of Indians or Indian children. On this point, a religious teacher would tend to raise a barricade between the Indian child and the demands of the Indian Affairs Branch which seemed contrary to his interests, i.e., a refusal to grant a bursary on the pretext that only a limited number of Indian children could benefit from it.

In short, the conflicts in loyalty of the staff within the structure vary according to the duties and the social or religious groups to which the officials belong.

B. Bureaucratization versus Democratization of Structures

The following statement is taken from chapter II, section 11.02 of the Field Manual, 1962:

> Leadership in school affairs must eventually come from the community with the advance of education on the Indian reserve. The formation of school committees which enable community leaders to part id-pate in the conduct of school affairs is one of the most productive methods of creating an active and intelligent interest on the part of Indian parents in the education of their children. .
>
> . . . Training the Indian adult to assume a measure of responsibility in running the affairs of his community is today one of the most important duties of the field staff.

Already by 1962 the Indian Affairs Branch hoped - and quite definitely - for a certain democratization in school organization through the establishment of structures and mechanisms which would make possible greater Indian participation. As a result, the Indians themselves would eventually take over the responsibility of educating their children. As they are today, they constantly follow in the wake of administrative officers whose intentions they barely understand and over whom they have practically no control. For example, when Indians wish to make a complaint, they do not know to whom they should go, how to state their grievances, or when to expect an answer. Moreover, the local and regional officials are themselves incapable of solving most of the problems immediately. They are constantly obliged to refer to their superiors and wait for an answer to come from above. Very often this answer comes too late or is not the most appropriate solution. How often have officials in the field spoken to us about the pyramidal structure of school organization and have complained that decisions are taken by their superiors without prior consultation or without sufficient consultation with everyone involved. One could wish that decisions came from below and were afterwards ratified by the top officials of the organization. Since they are closer to the situations and the problems, the field officers think that they would be able to provide better solutions for the problems which continually arise.[1]

---

[1] Ibid.

[2] Ibid.

Considering the difficulties which we have underlined, it would seem hazardous to organize school committees within the existing structures. We must not forget that these committees are expected to become actual school boards which will eventually take over many of the responsibilities at present devolved upon the officials of the Indian Affairs Branch,

The regulations for school committees contained in Appendix A of the Field Manual, 1962, are themselves open to criticism, since they give little consideration to the wishes of the population concerned. As well, we should not be surprised by the words of one of the participants at the Second School Committee Conference, held in Prince Albert, March, 1965:

> The policy of the Indian Affairs Branch is to develop a sense of responsibility among Indians so that they may eventually manage their own affairs. Let us then give Indians the opportunities to develop this responsibility.
>
> ……
>
> Are we really promoting our policy or merely paying it lip service? Regulations and restrictions safeguards, often choke our and the Indian's genuine desire to make policy a reality. Are we really consulting Indians, their Band Councils, and involving them in programming or are we merely asking them to 'rubber stamp' our own decisions, sometimes hastily made and impractical? Are we in tune with reserve thinking, have we got our finger on its pulse? Do we know the power structure, the contending factions, who the influential people are, what makes the reserve what it is, etc.? Has the Indian Affairs Branch got the Indians with it or have the Indians lost interest and dropped off or even taken up an opposition role on the reserve? . . . I would like to propose four bases for action, four principles that must govern our approach to working with Indian people:
>
> 1. we have a duty of helping people make choices between what is false and harmful in their situation and what is true and good,

---

[1] With the recent administrative decentralization and the increased powers of regional offices, a noticeable improvement in administrative procedures will soon be apparent. In addition, the regional offices themselves intend to give their field staff greater autonomy of action and better-defined responsibilities.

2. we must accept the fact that individuals are entitled to freedom of choice as to the group in which they wish to live, and the group is entitled to freedom in its way of life,

3. questions of choice, of action, of ultimate objective, must be answered by the people involved

4. and most important of all perhaps, if we are going to continue to talk about acceptance of the Indian people, we must be obedient to its demands. If we are not willing to obey its demands, then in all honesty, we must stop talking about it.

It seems fairly clear that an authoritarian attitude towards the Indians is at variance with the stated objective of democratization.

C. Low Pay Schedule versus Professional Qualifications

During the past years, various Indian associations and even those in charge of Indian education have often complained about the poor quality of teaching and the teachers' lack of qualifications. For several years, the Indian Affairs Branch has made an effort to overcome this great weakness in the Indian school organization, However, in spite of everything, it is difficult for the Indian Affairs Branch to find the teachers it needs.

> The reasons why it is hard to staff Indian schools in Alberta are the following:
>
> (a) The Indian Affairs salary schedule is not too attractive by Alberta standards, but it is in comparison with Atlantic provinces. A teacher from Nova Scotia can make $1,000.00 more a year in an Indian Alberta school than in his own province.
>
> (b) We do not yet have reciprocal pension arrangements. A teacher in the Alberta public school system would have to give up his pension plan in order to teach in an Indian school,
>
> (c) The poor reputation of Indian education. Five years ago, anyone could teach in an Indian school. No one with training and professional reputation wanted to lose his reputation, It is very hard to change that public image even though there are many improvements.
>
> (d) Professional isolation of the teachers in the Indian schools. Not so much true now. But it was for quite a while.[1]

The reasons brought out by Dr. Chalmers to explain the difficulty of recruiting teachers for Indian schools are true for other provinces, as many of the Indian Affairs Branch's documents show. And let us remember the statement of the Assistant Director of the Saskatchewan Teachers' Federation, that the loyalty of federal teachers:

> . . . is rather to the association of federal civil servants which is of no use to them in their advancement as teachers. . . . For teaching to make progress, there must be renewal both

---

[1] Meeting between M.-Adélard Tremblay and Dr. M. Chalmers, Assistant Regional Superintendent of Alberta, July 19 and 20, 1965.

> in curriculum and in teaching techniques.[1]

Dr. Chalmers also said:

> About 80% hold teaching certificates from other provinces or the U.S. or Great Britain. . .

This phenomenon does not help to create closer ties between provincial teachers and those employed by the Indian Affairs Branch.

D. Increase in Indian Population, Increase in Education Expenses

According to the calculations of the Federal Bureau of Statistics, the Indian population in Canada is increasing at the rate of 4% per year, which is about 1% higher than that of the Canadian population in general. Thus the Indian Affairs Branch must necessarily foresee a growing increase in the general expenses of administering reserves and automatically an increase in the cost of educating Indian children.

It is because of the financial spectre represented by the administration of reserves that the Indian Affairs Branch is putting all its hope into the integration of Indians with the provincial populations. Many official reports mention this fact, and indeed, school integration has become an imperative issue of the first importance inspiring the work of federal officers of the Indian Affairs Branch.

E. Resistance to School Integration

As many officers of the Indian Affairs Branch have pointed out to us in their conversations, it is religious groups which offer the most resistance to school integration. Their arguments are based on humanitarian motives:

> The disappearance of Indian schools from reserves is a policy which lacks vision, since the community is separated from the process of education. The communities no longer have a place to meet. Nothing can be organized anymore. Desolation reigns.[2]

However, one fact is already proved: school integration has been found to benefit the Indian children who have attended provincial schools. Thus the religious orders see their supremacy being challenged. Some reaction and opposition is understandable, since integration means that sooner or later the institutions which they established will be closed. These institutions, financed by the federal government, enabled them to serve the reserves' Indian population on a religious basis. Should they lose their residential schools, the churches would be hard put economically to bear the expenses incurred by the permanent residence of a missionary on the reserve. On the other hand, school integration represents the first step toward the dissolution of most reserves, because education makes it possible for the Indians to adapt themselves to the White Canadian's way of life. Abandoning the reserves would mean the scattering of the members of the religious orders. This perspective makes understandable the resistance of all religious groups whose interests are associated with the continuing existence of the reserves.

4. School Planning: Instrument for Integration

Up till now we have been severe in our analysis of the structure established to administer and control school institutions for the Indians. We have no desire to gild what seems to be a rather negative record.

---

[1] Interview notes of M.-Adélard Tremblay, July, 1965.

[2] Statement recorded by M.-Adélard Tremblay in an interview with Father Renaud during a visit to Duck Lake and Prince Albert - July 17, 1965.

However, in the perspective of school integration, this structure, which was designed as a system of control, takes a definite direction and is able to play a very useful role if it is used as an instrument of planning and as a machine to accelerate school integration. In spite of its weaknesses, this bureaucratic machine can be used to gather all the information necessary for the future orientation of Indian children toward schools of high academic standards.

It is in fact easy to predict the gradual displacement not only of Indian children, but also of their parents towards centres where the children can have a future and the parents can find suitable work and lodging. In this respect, the Indian school organization can be defined as a transition organization. This organization will make possible a better education for Indians and will eventually help in freeing them from federal guardianship.

III. THE NETWORK OF INDIAN SCHOOLS

Because of the very diverse sociological conditions of the various Indian groups established in the provinces or in other Canadian territories, the Indian Affairs Branch has had to organize a complex network of schools in order to reach the greatest possible number of Indian children.

A. The Types of Schools

In a pamphlet published in 1962 by the Indian Affairs Branch and entitled: The Indian in Transition - The Indian Today, Indian schools are divided into two main categories: schools which we would call permanent and schools which we would call temporary.[1] Indian day schools and Indian residential schools are permanent schools, while hospital schools are temporary schools. We call the latter temporary because they are not an ideal type of school. They are designed to provide a certain amount of teaching for Indian children hospitalized in sanatoriums. However, it is obvious that this is only a palliative form of teaching, designed to assure some continuity in teaching in spite of sickness. There would be no point in evaluating the role of the hospital school in the school organization established to serve the Indian population in Canada. Their role is marginal and palliative.

For this reason, we will limit our analysis to day schools and residential schools. With a few exceptions, the integrated schools are in no way subject to the school system under discussion, since they are usually provincial schools subject to the provincial systems.

B. Proportion of Indian Students in Each Type of School

Of all types of Indian schools, the day schools (377 in number) received the greatest number of Indian children - 20,572 - in 1962. This figure represents almost half the total number of Indian pupils.

The situation in reference to residential schools is complex, since changing conditions are altering the status of this type of school. Of the 66 boarding schools in existence in 1962, 57 belonged to the Indian Affairs Branch; all were administered by one religious group or another; and three from then on were used only as residences for Indian students attending provincial schools. In all, 8,391 Indian students boarded in these schools, 1,490 of whom received their education in neighbouring provincial schools.

In 1962, a total of 146,596[3] Indian students attended the various types of schools mentioned. According to a first calculation made in 1962, 44% of the total attended Indian day schools; 25% residential schools; 40% integrated schools; and 1% other types of schools.

---

[1] The Indian in Transition - The Indian Today, p. 8

[2] The Indian in Transition -The Indian Today, p. 8

[3] Ibid., p, 7

The total number of Indians attending school can be roughly divided between the Indian day schools and the integrated schools. Now the Indian day schools are primarily concerned with elementary education and the integrated schools assume the responsibility for secondary and higher education, However, it is obvious that the latter will assume a growing responsibility even in elementary education, according to the wishes of the Indian Affairs Branch:

> The past ten years have seen a spectacular growth in the integration of Indian students into non-Indian schools.[1]
>
> The policy of the Indian Affairs Branch is not to operate secondary schools, although some schools offer courses at the high school level. Most Indian students therefore attend provincial high schools and, if necessary, the government pays board and lodging for those who live away from home.[2]

As a result, the residential schools will be taking on certain specific functions which will eliminate them from the normal procedures in educating young Indians.

C. The Indian Affairs Branch's Policy toward Integration

In the 1962 version of the Indian Affairs Branch's Field Manual[3] the authorities of the Indian Affairs Branch state their policy toward school integration in clear terms:

> The Indian Affairs Branch is convinced that, where possible, Indian children should be educated in association with children of other racial groups. Where non-Indian day schools are conveniently located, the I.A.B. is prepared to enter into agreements with the authorities operating these schools to make possible the admission of Indian children.

It is thus apparent that the Indian Affairs Branch stresses school integration to bring to an end what is, with just cause, referred to as a condition of segregation with respect to Indians. At the moment, Indian schools certainly make it possible to provide an education for Indian children whose parents are cut off from the stream of Canadian life, nevertheless they isolate Indian children from the other groups who form the Canadian nation and represent modern life in Canada. For this reason, the Indian Affairs Branch is not interested in continuing a school system which up to now, we must admit, has contributed to the cultural if not the economic evolution of Canadian Indians, but does not have the mechanisms for a gradual adaptation of Indians to modern industrial life in Canada.

The fact remains that the Indian Affairs Branch must still keep up an autonomous school system to meet the demanding and precarious conditions in which the majority of Indian families find themselves. We must point out, however, that the continued existence of various Indian schools is conditional, as the Indian Affairs Branch states in its policy:

---

[1] Ibid., p. 7

[2] Loc. cit.

[3] Field Manual - Indian Affairs Branch, January, 1962, chap. II, sect. 11.00, par. C,

> The Indian Day School is for the children of Indian parents living a more or less settled existence within a reasonable distance of a central location. The Indian residential school is maintained to provide for children from broken homes or whose parents are unable to provide the proper care and direction, for the children of migrant hunters and trappers whose way of life makes day school arrangements impracticable and for high school students unable to attend school as day pupils.
>
> Schools and rehabilitation centres for both children and adults are operated by the Branch at hospitals operated under the Indian and Northern Health Services.
>
> For the children of migrant parents who return to a summer settlement each year, seasonal schools provide an abbreviated school program.[1]

We can state, therefore, that, according to the official policy of the Indian Affairs Branch, the existence of each type of Indian school is connected with particular sociological conditions which will be changing due to the initiatives of the Indian Affairs Branch and call for a review of the raison d'être of these institutions. Moreover, the annual reports of the Indian Affairs Branch indicate a rapid change toward school integration and a relative decrease in the number of Indian schools.

D. Duties assigned to the various schools

> Until roughly the end of the Second World War, the Indian Residential School was the mainstay of education for Indian children. There is, therefore, a background of at least fifty years of hard work and dedication which religious groups devoted to this area during which the Indian population was largely ignored by the country as a whole. Following the war and until the late fifties, the concentration was upon the building of Indian Day School facilities on reserves, From the late 1950's until the present all the emphasis has been on Joint Schools. Our present policy is therefore based on a firm belief that as representatives of the Government we have a solemn responsibility to do all we can to make it possible for the Indian people to participate in all the benefits of what is commonly referred to as our 'Affluent Society'[2]

If Indian day schools have enabled a greater number of Indian children to attend primary school, the joint schools, on the other hand, have enabled a greater number to attend secondary school. The residential schools were designed for children from Indian families considered "socio-pathological cases" or for children for whom there was no opening in any other type of educational institution.

As a result, the day schools continue to provide education at the primary level in conjunction with the residential schools and the joint schools. The Indian Affairs Branch intends to use the residential school as an educational institution only as a final resort, and does not consider it an institution to be perpetuated. For this reason, it is assigned welfare functions as well as educational ones:

---

[1] Loc. cit.

[2] Indian Residential School Principals' Conference, Saskatchewan, June 15-16, 1965, Minutes of Proceedings: Indian Affairs Branch, p. 1.,

> We believe that the normal and most desirable situation is for children to be able to attend school while living at home with their family. In the case of Indian children, we feel the ideal situation is for the child to live at home and attend a Joint School, together with non-Indian children... the next best alternative for the child is to live at home and attend an Indian Day School. Where, for any reason or reasons the first two alternatives are not possible, we feel he should live in a private Indian or non-Indian home and attend a Joint School. Failing this, we favour a hostel-type of setting for accommodation and enrolment in a Joint School for the academic training. We feel that ideally, Residential Schools should only be provided for students for whom any of the other alternatives are not possible.[1]

This attempt to define the respective and priority functions of each type of school is evidence of the good intentions of the Indian Affairs Branch, However, since the Indian Affairs Branch has called a conference in order to make certain points clear to the principals of the residential schools, we should see this as an indication of the Indian Affairs Branch's desire to remove any confusion over the actual role of residential schools in education. The situation is even more confused for the definition of functions in the case of residential schools, since there is a certain number of private residential schools directed by various religious groups which also run residential schools belonging to the Indian Affairs Branch. There is no problem about the duties assigned to day schools. However, taking into consideration the financial principles according to which the residential schools operate, on the one hand, and the administrative responsibilities of the group in charge, on the other, the material aspect of life in the residential school is of necessity emphasized to the detriment of academic formation, properly speaking.

The Indian day schools are under the immediate authority of the Indian Affairs Branch and their financial and academic administration is carried out by the staff of the Indian Affairs Branch who owe loyalty only to the federal government, in the case of residential schools, as we pointed out in a report on our visit to various reserves on Quebec's North Shore, "the government pays a grant to cover the cost of food and clothing for each student, and in addition a special grant for special activities. In other words, the institution receives a fixed amount proportional to the number of pupils for the administration, maintenance and repair of the building. The principal receives a fixed salary and is the administrator. He accepts the young Indians whom the superintendent assigns to the residential school. The principal is responsible for the physical and psychological welfare of the children. . . and for discipline." Farther on, we noted:

> The school principal gave the impression of concerning himself exclusively with the physical and material aspects of the school; all his remarks were on material improvements, such as buying tiles for dormitory floors, paint for the walls, the purchase of new tables and benches for the dining hell and so on. He talked a great deal about his pupils' success in sports. Among other things, he showed us all the cups which the school's teams had won during the last ten years.

This statement underlines the housing and recreational side of a residential school. On the other hand, the academic side proper offers a less dazzling picture:

> In spite of all this material comfort, the students present discipline and motivation

---

[1] Ibid., p. 2.

> problems. These problems are apparently attributable to the people responsible for the academic side of the institution and who are not appreciated by the students.

As a result, at the academic level, the residential school does not fulfil its main function adequately. This corresponds to a second problem which is related to the age of the students and the residential school system. "The residential school is the ideal system for all youngsters. . . . But as they grow older, they feel less at ease there. They would like more freedom and autonomy."

Thus the residential school does not seem a system which suits the natural aspirations of adolescents and as a result cannot adequately fulfil its educational functions toward a group of students who aspire to a climate of freedom. These weaknesses of the residential school are not found in day schools since the students are only confined there for a few hours each day and for a purely academic purpose.

Taking a particular case as an example, we have seen that the residential school has to assume the role of a home environment since it replaces the family home and at the same time that of a school whose principal concern is the intellectual training of young students. Since the residential school must perform this double function within the same framework, a certain ambiguity exists even in the minds of its pupils over the principal function of the school. They have been sent to the residential school: perhaps they were not given much choice and they are eager to leave in order to regain part of the freedom which they lost when they left their real home. According to our hypothesis, because of the administrative responsibilities which are incumbent upon the principal of the residential school, it seems difficult for the school to be a centre of teaching and at the same time provide a proper emotional climate, since the main preoccupation of the administration is to organize life in the school so that equipment, first and foremost, be protected. Hence the importance placed on discipline and the cleanliness of the grounds.

What effect does this have on young Indians regarding their preparation to live with the White man?

One indication offers an answer: it appears that where a joint school competes with an Indian residential school, those running the residential school define it in opposition to the White schools. "On this point, he (the principal) assured us that the Indian teams had carried off the cups in each of the four leagues organized in 1964, to the great despair of the White students of . . ." In this context, there seems to be fairly deep rivalry between the White students and the Indians.

As a result, far from encouraging adaptation to the world of the White man, the residential school in fact perpetuates the Indians' idea that they are different from White people by leaguing them together against the Whites, so that the gulf between the two groups remains deep. As a result, so far as acculturation is concerned, the residential school does not seem to help the process, or at least offers a path which appears easy but is in fact dangerous. In a report[1] well documented by anthropological studies, it appears that the Oblates are anxious to make use of anthropological data to justify the residential school system, or at least to refute the objections of the Indian Affairs Branch concerning these schools.

> Acculturation proceeds from exterior ways of behaving in economic pursuits (food producing, clothing, etc.) through social organization (forms of local government, recreation) to patterns of thinking (values, attitudes, sense of belonging). The first cycle is relatively

---

[1] Residential Education for Indian Acculturation - Workshop 1: General Principles - Indian and Eskimo Welfare Commission, Oblate Fathers in Canada, Ottawa, 1958.

> rapid as imposed by circumstances and easier to reconcile with the old ways of thinking. The second may take more time since harder to learn and to reinterpret, The third stage may never set in as a cultural unit. Unsuspected resistance under the form of nativistic or nationalistic movements appear after decades of apathy and acquiescence to changes in the other two areas (e.g., the present Six Nations' attitude toward Canadian citizenship). Acculturation cannot be accelerated unless all the above facts are taken into constant consideration.[1]

The above passage attempts to prove that the deeper acculturation goes, the more difficult it becomes to accomplish. However, the fact is overlooked that acculturation is a phenomenon which ordinarily stretches from one generation to another, and does not take place within the lifetime of one individual, unless he has been removed from his original cultural environment at a very early age.

When speaking of the conflicting loyalties of members of a religious group, we attempted to explain the resistance of certain Oblates to integration due to their disapproval at seeing a community which they had created according to their religious beliefs disintegrate. We will quote an extract from the same document which justifies such a resistance on their part:

> In an autonomous society. . . ., the community controls the school, one way or another, naturally, as one factor in the necessary transmission of its culture to the rising generation. All the activities of the school are based on or inspired by the cultural background of the community in which it operates, and aimed at preparing the pupils for life in this country. Any school which is divorced from the cultural stream of the community into which it operates, or which is not partly an activity controlled by this community, is artificial. . .[2]

Further on, the author takes a position which diverges radically from the integration policy of the Indian Affairs Branch.

> The Canadian problem in Indian education is not primarily one of schooling Indian children the same way other Canadian children are schooled, but of changing the persevering community into a Canadian community. When Indian children will not help but grow up to be culturally Canadian, then the average Canadian school will meet their education needs.[3]

The declaration of this principle presented as the conclusion of a report entitled Education for Acculturation shows that this religious order has no intention of accepting the principle of integration with the school as intermediary. In their opinion, the process of acculturation would be speeded up at the level of the reserve, rather than in the school. In this way, there would be no reason to empty Indian day schools and Indian residential schools to force school integration. As a result, it is normal that this principle should lead the Oblates to use the residential school as a last stand. On the other hand, the Indian Affairs Branch is trying to reduce its role to a minimum, again purely out of concern for economy; otherwise, better adapted and better located institutions would soon be established.

---

[1] Ibid., R.P. André Renaud, O.M.I., p. 29.

[2] Ibid., p. 31.

[3] Residential Education for Indian Acculturation - Workshop 1: General Principles, R.P, Andre Renaud, O.M.I., p. 36.

E. Criticism of Indian residential schools

In spite of the cultural advantages which the Oblates see in them, the residential schools have not always taken into consideration the problem of adjustment that graduates will have to face in the event that they decide to continue their studies in a provincial high school. Let us examine the statement of a journalist who made a study of Indian students graduating from residential schools.

She makes the following comment on the discipline of residential schools:

> With many, the sudden release from years of regimentation sparked an immediate spirit of rebellion against conformity and a sudden determination to break all the rules in the book. Dazzled by the bright city lights, dizzy with their first taste of freedom, they'd head for the nearest beer parlour and all its ensuing complications.[1]

As a result, the docility demanded from Indian students in residential schools prevented them from learning to make good use of their freedom later on. However, since this discipline was associated with compulsory religious observance at the residential school, it was to be expected that religious observance would suffer the reaction of a total let down:

> Very few continued to attend mass and receive the Sacraments though whether this trend was, and still is, part of their rebellion against regimentation, or their lack of personal conviction, or their inexperience in going to church with White people - or a combination of all three - it's hard to say. . .[2]

In spite of the fact that the principals of residential schools claim their institutions give adequate preparation for an integrated life, Miss Cronin shows the inadequate character of the training given in residential schools:

> In the economic sphere I found them equally ill-fitted to face the outside world. They simply had not a clue about how to apply for a job or what was expected of them in an interview. They had absolutely no sense of the value of money, spending it like water when it came to calling cabs, making phone calls, buying clothes, transistor radios or electric guitars. True they had very little money to start with, but inevitably any bus fares or pocket money allotted them each month was gone in the first few days.[3]

I feel that this statement is a sufficient demonstration of the distance between denominational residential schools and even the most elementary realities in the daily life of White people. It is not surprising that the Indian Affairs Branch disapproves of them and is trying to reduce their role in the education of young Indians to a minimum.

F. Conclusion

From our examination, we have discovered that of all types of Indian schools, the residential school was the most ambiguous form of school from the point of view of its concepts (academic, social and religious training) and the functions it assumed, I/e could find no comparison between the day school and the residential school from this point of view. The criticisms directed towards the residential school hold true in part for Indian day schools, in that young Indians cannot learn to live like the White man on reserves. Miss Cronin made the following statement on this point:

---

[1] Miss Kay Cronin, Address to Oblate Principals, p. 3, Workshop, Ottawa, August, 1964.

[2] Loc. cit.

[3] Miss Kay Cronin, loc. cit.

> . . . they knew next to nothing about White people, other than the Fathers and Sisters and lay staff at the school, or local ranchers or fishermen near their reserves, or Indian department officials - none of whom could really be called representative of the complex society in which they found themselves in Vancouver.[1]

IV. THE DEVELOPMENT OF INDIAN SCHOOL COMMITTEES

In our analysis of the regional bureaucratic structure of the Indian Affairs Branch's education department, we saw that the Indian school committees were situated at the very bottom of the ladder, and symbolized a first attempt at democratic administration in local school matters. Moreover, a certain ambiguity in administrative responsibilities necessarily resulted from the coexistence of bureaucratic administrative positions and Indian school committees. How did the Indian Affairs Branch envisage this coexistence? We will try to answer this question shortly. However, we must see to what extent the definition of the school committees' duties is in fact respected, and, on the other hand, how bureaucratic procedures restrict the responsibilities of the school committees' not only at the level of the implementation of decisions, but also in making these decisions. We must also see to what extent the Indian Affairs Branch makes use of the school committees in putting its educational policies into effect. In conclusion, we will discuss the limited risks attached to the formation of school committees, the restricted achievements which characterize their actions and the actual potential of such committees.

1. Objectives in creating Indian school committees

As the Indian Affairs Branch emphasizes in its Field Manual (1962~ the main objective of school committees is to prepare the Indians to take on their own responsibilities in education:

> The formation of school committees which enable community leaders to participate in the conduct of school affairs is one of the most productive methods of creating an active and intelligent interest on the part of Indian parents in the education of their children. (Chap. II, sect. 11.02)

In spite of this statement, the Indian Affairs Branch obviously intended at the beginning to limit the responsibilities of these committees and the budget they would use.

> The Committee will assume active responsibility in the following areas:
>
> 1. School attendance and truancy;
>
> 2. Care of school property and school grounds;
>
> 3. Attendance of Indian pupils at non-Indian school s;

---

[1] Ibid., p. 4

4. Use of school buildings for community activities (where applicable);
5. Special disciplinary problems;
6. Band fund appropriations for school activities;
7. Scholarships from band funds;
8. Acquisition of sports and playground equipment;
9. Extra-curricular activities such as field days, school fairs and festivals, educational expeditions, etc. . .[1]

These are the areas in which the committees can make decisions. However, the Indian Affairs Branch foresees that it may consult and authorize these committees to act in other areas:

1. School accommodation;
2. Annual school maintenance and repairs;
3. Day-to-day maintenance and care of school. The committee may nominate the janitor. (Not applicable when janitor is a Civil Service Establishment);
4. Recommendations regarding educational assistance to students of the reserve;
5. Joint agreements with non-Indian schools;
6. Lunch supplies for the winter months and supplementary school supplies provided by the band;
7. School bus routes;
8. Reserve roads in relation to school bus route.

The responsibilities defined above represent a field of action which could almost be classified as residuary. Of necessity, none of these responsibilities requires a large budget.

The budget is divided into two types of items: sports equipment and various expenses.

As a standard of reference, the criteria for establishing a budget on an annual basis are as follows: $50 for sports equipment per class-room and $50 per class-room for other expenses for a school of four class-rooms; $40 per class-room for a school of 8 class-rooms; $30 per class-room for a school of 12 class-rooms; $20 per class-room for a school of more than 12 class-rooms.

Supposing that the maximum number of class-rooms in Indian schools is 12, which would correspond to a reserve with a large population, the maximum budget would be $840, while the minimum would be $100. Even the larger budget certainly does not make it possible for the school committee to take on important responsibilities. Of course, the committee is free to raise within the reserve any additional sums needed. However, when the economic level of most reserves is considered, this method could scarcely make available a sum even as large as the revenue assigned by the Indian Affairs Branch.

---

[1] Field Manual (1962), chap. II, Appendix A.

2. Duties and responsibilities taken on by the school committees

We have examined the reports of the meetings of the Six Nations' school committee for a complete year (September 1, 1964 - September 1, 1965) in order to identify the nature of the responsibilities undertaken. This committee has an annual budget of $6,225.00 at its disposal; this is one of the highest budgets there is. We also examined some of the reports of meetings held by the committees of the Fort Alexander Reserve and the Berens River Reserve, both situated in northern Manitoba. It should be noted that the greatest number of Indian school committees in Canada is found in Manitoba, Since the two committees are under the same agency and undertake similar activities, we will limit our report to the school committee at Fort Alexander, which is the more important of the two. In the case of the Six Nations' school committee, we shall list each type of activity carried on, while in the case of the school committee at Fort Alexander, we shall give a brief account of each of the meetings held. Thus we will give an idea both of the extent of the responsibilities taken on and also of the particular importance of certain duties.

A. Summary of subjects to be discussed

a. The Six Nations' school committee

We have summarized 18 different decisions for the academic year 1964-1965. We will distinguish their characteristics once we have listed them.

1. Approval for expenses incurred, including salaries for the members of the committee depending on the number who attend. The main expenses are the salaries for school janitors, the cost of sports equipment and transportation of the pupils to attend school festivals;

2. A request made to the Band Council to name new members to the school committee when the term of office is up. Suggestion of candidates;

3. Permission granted to Indian pupils to attend School No. 5 until the Band Council accepts them on the reserve.

4. Pressure exerted on the roads committee for the repair and maintenance of roads (mainly in winter);

5. Request made to the manual training class to build the platform required by the Track and Field Club when sports competitions are held;

6. Recommendation that a school-girl receive a bursary for her education;

7. Dismissal of a janitor for incompetence and negligence in his duties. Hiring a replacement;

8. Request made for better maintenance and repair of the school;

9. Permission for school premises to be used out of school hours for gym courses and sports activities under the responsibility of a supervisor specially assigned for this purpose;

10. Permission refused for the Track and Field Club to hold a dance in the gym to raise funds for their activities. The reason given: "It is not an appropriate place for a dance."

11. Appointment of an executive for the school committee, including a treasurer. Authorization for the treasurer to sign cheques;

12. Pressure exerted for the upkeep of the school yard (spraying to control weeds);

13. Three members asked the Band Council to have them replaced. They wanted to give others a chance to gain experience on the school committee;

14. Drawing up rules and regulations for the use of school premises, including the gym. The Band Council refused to approve them;

15. Purchase of paper cups for the children;

16. Distribution of pamphlets on fire prevention to the schools;

17. Permission given to park cars in the three school yards during the exhibition. The profits will be used to buy shrubs for the school; and

18. Payment of the transportation expenses incurred for industrial, cultural and sports trips.

The activities of the school committee indicate a very great desire to participate in the task of educating the children, even if these activities are almost exclusively limited to their material welfare. From this point of view, the members of the school committee respect to the letter the duties which were assigned to them. In the pursuit of its objectives, the committee contends constantly with problems of a financial nature. Funds are constantly being sought to administer worthwhile projects. On certain occasions underlying conflicts can be noted between the Band Council and the school committee, even if its members are named by the Council. It would be preferable for the members of these committees to be elected, in order to give an even more accurate representation of the various tendencies on the reserve. It would also be desirable for these committees' mandates to be enlarged to include educational questions, so that the school committees, like independent school boards, could participate more directly in the education of Indians and could advise the Indian Affairs Branch on important education policies. On reading the minutes, one cannot help but realize that this school committee provides real training toward democratic procedures of decision-making. If the Indians are to assume increasing responsibility in the control of their own affairs, it is certain that this type of institution should play a fundamental role on the reserves.

b. The Fort Alexander School Committee

The report of the meeting on June 20, 1962, mentioned the necessity of having the bridge inspected which crosses the Saskatchewan River and joins the north and south sections of Fort Alexander. Other suggestions were the organization of a track and field day and the construction of a back-stop. The budget available was $86.99.

The report of September 11, 1962, had as topic the consolidation of certain classes and the setting up of a class in space available in one school. Officers were appointed to supervise the cleaning arrangements in the schools and the question of setting up a skating rink for the winter was discussed.

Another report (probably October, 1962) reported $11.76 in the bank.

At this time, an Oblate father on the reserve opposed the idea of consolidation, but his cause seemed to have hardly any supporters. On the contrary, consolidation was decided upon in the case of one school and it was proposed that the name of the school be replaced by an Indian name.

We do not have reports for 1963 and 1964.

On February 18, 1965, the school committee had $215.64 on hand.

The subject of the petition signed at Fort Alexander for the consolidation of certain schools was brought up. It was suggested that money be collected for sports equipment and for serving hot chocolate to the students.

On the following March 9, $32.80 only were reported on hand, and a discussion was held on methods for increasing the committee's funds. The organization of an educational trip for the children and the means of transport used were mentioned.

A request was made for a sign showing the way to schools built near the river. And finally, a bingo game was organized to send a delegate to Prince Albert. On April 13, 1965, following the annual subsidy from the Indian Affairs Branch, the committee's budget was $532.80.

A report of the convention held at Prince Albert was presented. The question of the sign to be put up on the north shore was brought up again. The organization of an annual track and field day was considered. A place was chosen and preparations were decided upon. The school principal of the agency took the floor to speak of the school committee's relations with the band chief and his council. He stated the situation of denominational schools and notified them of the impossibility of building a new school on the south shore before 1967. He informed the members of the committee that the Canadian Polish Athletic Association had donated uniforms for the base-ball team.

On April 14, 1965, the school committee had no funds left. It was suggested that the students from two schools join for an educational trip. The school principal of the agency suggested visiting Winnipeg rather than the place suggested earlier, The details of the trip were finalized.

The track and field day was brought up again; the chairman suggested the beginning of June. The principal acted as spokesman for the north shore concerning the choice of the south shore as the preferable site for this meet. On the suggestion of the principal, the participants were chosen. The principal suggested that the best athletes be sent to train at Peace Gardens, so that they could take care of the organization of games later on. It was then suggested that prizes be awarded to students with good academic records. Proposals were made.

The question of funds was discussed. The chief and his council decided to grant a subsidy of $500 to the committee, but the principal reminded them that they could not count on receiving funds from the Band Council all the time. It was the parents who should try to obtain the funds needed. At this point, the suggestion was made that a special day be organized for raising funds. The principal took the floor again to congratulate the delegates who had attended the Prince Albert conference. Reference was made to the male delegates' courtesy to a female delegate from a neighbouring reserve,

Next, the program of adult education was brought up; the advantages of taking a course at their expense was underlined. The question of consolidation was reopened. One woman called for consolidation of classes within a Catholic school on the south shore. Another asked that the status quo for denominational schools be maintained.

The principal recalled the policy of the Indian Affairs Branch on the matter of schools, but emphasized that if the citizens of the reserve wished consolidated schools, the Indian Affairs Branch was prepared to consider the question. At this point, an Oblate father again voiced his opposition to school consolidation in general, but if the families on the reserve so desired, the church could study the request. In any case, the church should be given time.

The principal reminded them that they would have to come to a decision on this question among themselves, On April 20, 1965, a special meeting was called on the question of denominational schools and family grievances. The meeting was apparently very lively. The principal requested the members to keep to the business on the agenda.

The conditions for consolidated teaching and the measures to be taken to respect the principle of denominational schools were drawn up. The school principal played an important part in the meeting. On May 18, 1965, the north shore committee acknowledged receipt of a budget of $497.30. It was suggested that $290 of this amount be used for the track and field day. Conditions were set for organization and the participation of students in the preparation of a CBC program on the occupations of Indian children during the summer holidays. The supervision of evening courses for students was discussed. The meeting ended with an exchange of mutual congratulations as the winners of the last drawing were announced.

The south shore committee held a meeting on June 14. Their funds amounted to $200.23. The principal discussed the criteria for selecting the site for the new school. He deplored the length of time the federal engineers were taking to come to make borings.

The senior teacher presented a report on the last sports day. The report was similar to those of preceding years. The plans were made for an educational trip to Winnipeg. It was noted the residential school's cafeteria staff was insufficient.

The principal took the floor to congratulate the students, the teachers, the members of the school committee and said that he was delighted to see teachers attending the committee's meetings. Finally, he announced changes in the teaching staff, which took up the rest of the meeting.

If it is permissible for us to make some remarks on these few reports which present jointly the activities of two interdependent school committees, we would say this:

We can find no attempt on the part of the members of these committees to exceed the field of responsibility granted them. However, the activities of these committees already show certain capacities to undertake larger responsibilities according to the wishes of the Indian Affairs Branch, These committees seem to have achieved some worthwhile projects in spite of a budget which is continually exhausted. Indeed, the obligation which these committees had to face to find funds so that they could continue their activities, seemed abnormal to us. We noted that at almost every meeting, the question of finding ways to raise money was brought up. Since the families on the reserve are generally far from being well off, the collections were very small. The organization of parties and bingo games used up a lot of energy and only contributed slightly to the progress of the students. In addition to this criticism, it seemed to us that the school principal of the agency controlled the proceedings of these meetings and monopolized a large part of the time for himself, which tends to destroy the democratic character of these committees. We have noted that these meetings tended to become an occasion for exchanging numerous congratulations, apparently to create the impression that the members were carrying out their responsibilities perfectly. We have noticed that an increasing number of Indian Affairs Branch officials are using these meetings to enter into communication with the Indians, thus incurring the risk of pushing aside the subjects which are supposed to be dealt with and the risk that the committees will increase their activities beyond the capacities of their budget and lean on the Band Councils.

It is evident that by keeping the committees on such a limited budget, the Indian Affairs Branch runs hardly any risk of seeing them take more initiative than at present.

B. Attendance at meetings

In order, Indian attendance varied in chronological order as follows: 17 (north) - 39 (north) - 46 (north) - 16 (south) - 11 (south) - 14 (north) - 19 (south) - 15 (south) - 9 (south). On the other hand, the attendance of Indian Affairs Branch officers varied in the following manner at the same meetings.

4 teachers (north)	- 3 officers - 14 teachers (north)
4 teachers 2 members of the clergy (north)	- 3 teachers (south)
1 teacher (south)	- 2 teachers (north) - 2 officers
5 teachers 1 officer (south)	- 2 members of the clergy (south) - 1 officer
5 teachers 1 officer (south)	- 1 member of the clergy - 1 teacher - 1 officer (south)

COMPARATIVE TABLE

Meeting	Indians	Indian Affairs Branch Employees	
1	17 (north) 1962	4	Teachers Clergy Officers
2	39 (north)1962	7	
3	46 (north) 1962	6	
4	16 (south) 1965	3	
5	11 (south) 1965	1	
6	14 (north) 1965	4	
7	19 (south) 1965	6	
8	15 (south) 1965	3	
9	9 (south) 1965	6	
10	9 (south) 1965	3	

According to the attendance figures of the school committees' meetings, the following phenomena appear to be taking place:

(a) the enthusiasm which seized the north shore committee in 1962 was followed by a period of stagnation in 1965;

(b) the same phenomenon can be observed in the case of the south shore committee;

(c) the varying times at which the different meetings take place explains the fluctuation in the attendance of teachers, clergy or officials;

(d) in general, White participation at the meetings tends to become too strong and to dissuade the Indians from participating. Without doubt the White officers of the Indian Affairs Branch should limit their intervention, otherwise exchanges in the committee run the risk of turning into monologues.

3. Indian Affairs Branch control over school committees

From correspondence exchanged between the officers of the Indian Affairs Branch about the Fort Alexander school committees, we see that the Indian Affairs Branch closely supervises the school committees and holds them to the definition of the responsibilities first assigned to them.

> I refer to the motion in the April 10 minutes of the above committee. . .
>
> The committee should be informed that they have no power to change school hours, but that they may make a recommendation to you for consideration . . . .[1]

---

[1] Correspondence exchanged in 1962.

If, instead of allowing the democratic process to follow its own course, the Indian Affairs Branch continues to subordinate the views of the school committees to the decisions of its officials, how can these school committees gain a thorough training in democracy? Might this not be one of the reasons which limit Indian interest in the school committees? We find in fact that the officials of the Indian Affairs Branch wish to avoid entrusting too much responsibility to the school committees.

> While the janitor positions for the schools are not covered by Civil Service appointments, and could come under the school committee, it is thought that these should be retained under Agency Office control until the committee has gained further experience in managing and budgeting their own affairs . .

Moreover, the school committees may occasionally anticipate the policy of the Indian Affairs Branch and on such occasions, the Indian Affairs Branch tries to protect itself against possible opposition to certain positions taken by the school committees. Here is an example:

> I read with interest your letter of September 13th in which you inform me that the school committee has initiated a proposal to effect grade consolidation across religious lines in the four schools along the north side road.
>
> Although I have no doubt this proposal has much to merit it, I wish to emphasize that Departmental officials should be extremely careful to avoid giving the impression that this move is sponsored in any way by the Department.
>
> The Department is, of course, anxious to meet the wishes of the people, but it has a responsibility to ensure that minority rights are protected.[2]

It must be recognized that the officers situated midways between the upper echelons of the Indian Affairs Branch and the school committees tend to find themselves in a dilemma on occasion. Here is a rather symptomatic answer in this connection:

> My education staff have made every effort to be tactful in this matter and I feel that if there is any difficulty with the church authorities, it will be a difference between the Indian people and their churches. In order to protect the Department from possible criticism, I now attach a petition for consolidation. This petition was initiated and completed by the school committee.[3]

4. Conclusion

In spite of the limited responsibilities granted to the school committees and budgets almost insignificant in respect to the needs that are felt, the record of the school committees in general seems definitely favourable. Besides the real encouragement which Indians receive to take over a sector of genuine responsibility involved in the education of their children, the most important gain is the training for life in a democratic society. We have seen that the Indians use a relatively large amount of energy to accomplish concrete tasks which, in spite of the motivation which justifies them, still require a considerable amount of devotion and altruism.

---

[1] Ibid.

[2] Ibid.

[3] Ibid.

This mobilization of energy on the reserve is a new phenomenon for the Indians and one which is a great benefit to them. It is to be hoped that the Indian Affairs Branch will relieve some of its officials of certain responsibilities which will, as a result, devolve upon these committees and contribute to their development. Perhaps the Indian Affairs Branch fears to lose control of the future orientation of the reserves by letting democratic procedures develop to the full. The national and regional directors of the Indian Affairs Branch should definitely forget, for a moment, the legal texts on which they base their incessant intervention and seriously ask themselves this question. Are they unconsciously afraid to break up even partially the bureaucratic structure which the Indian Affairs Branch has built for itself?

g

CHAPTER IV

EDUCATION OF THE INDIAN CHILD

INTRODUCTION

1. Preamble

In recent years, educational specialists have become increasingly aware of the problems inherent In educating children of minority groups in institutions designed to meet the needs and standards of the majority. The failure of the schools to meet the varying needs of children from different socio-economic and ethnic groups can be reckoned in terms of the large number of under-educated and unemployable individuals. The schools have been unable to resocialize such groups of children so that they become functioning adults in the social milieu of the majority.

Educators are seeking ways to meet some of the demands of all segments of society by attempting to eliminate early school leaving and lessen the resulting unemployment and rising social welfare costs. Some communities have instituted experimental programs which include schoolwork programs, pre-school education, remedial programs, increased guidance, smaller classes, community development and adult education. The long-run results of such programs are still unclear, but preliminary reports indicate that where such programs have been inaugurated, involvement and interest of participating individuals have increased and attitudes toward education have become more positive.

The Indian population of Canada is a minority group in the double sense that many Indians are culturally distinctive and often represent an economically deprived minority as well. Until recently, Indian students presented little problem to the public school system because they were educated on the reserve under the educational auspices of the federal government. In the past ten years, however, there has been a steadily increasing enrolment of Indian students in public schools and this enrolment can be expected to increase dramatically in the next ten years. In many areas, public schools have accommodated small numbers of Indian students without any problem. Where the number of students is substantial, however, both the schools and the Indians are becoming more aware of differences in educational achievement that are in part ascribable to differences in culture.

Under the terms of the Indian Act, the Indian Affairs Branch of the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development assumes responsibility for the education of Indian children. Through federal-provincial joint agreements, however, such services are increasingly being offered to Indians through the provincial facilities which accommodate the non-Indian population. The momentum for such joint agreements arises from the desire of Indian people for equal facilities as well as from the generally-accepted premise that segregated services diminish rather than enhance the opportunity for Indians to take part in national life. The one real basis for argument against integrating schools is in the case where provincial ones appear to be inferior to those of the federal government. There is also the question, in the case of integration of schools, of whether the experience the Indian child will have in a public school will be more detrimental to him than would be the effects of segregated education. In some cases it appears that joint agreements have been made without full examination of the type of experience and quality of schooling to which the child will be exposed. In other instances, if joint agreements had been approached with fuller consultation with the Indians concerned, better information might have been forthcoming and could have served as a guide for a decision that might have been different.

Since the Indian Affairs Branch plans to increase its joint agreements with local school boards, and since, in principle, integrated education appears the most feasible of educational alternatives for Indian students, this section of the survey looked at the type of experiences Indian students are having in public schools, how they perceive their situation, what success they meet with and what types of problems they are encountering in adjusting to public schooling.

The initial research on the issues considered in this section of the Project was carried out in the summer of 1964 in three Indian communities in British Columbia. These communities represented different socio-economic levels, had reached varying levels of acculturation, the children had been integrated in the public school system over a number of years ranging from four to fifty, and the communities represented diverse patterns of organization, factionalism, employment and geographic proximity to the non-Indian communities.

During the summer of 1965, the research continued with the addition of two staff members who interviewed Indian students from several British Columbia reserves who were in attendance at high schools and technical schools in Vancouver. Indian students attending the University of British Columbia were also interviewed. One of the investigators travelled west from Ottawa, stopping in each province to visit three or four reserves and interviewing those students and parents who were available.

In addition to students and parents, we interviewed teachers, administrators, service personnel and other Indians and non-Indians who could provide information about educational programs and the schooling of Indian students. Approximately 100 non-Indian adults were interviewed. Sixty-five adult Indians were interviewed and 125 Indian adolescents. Interview topics for each of the categories of the 300 people seen can be found in the Appendix. It should be noted that often there were two or more adults at an interview but in many instances it was impossible to record information for more than one informant at a time. As a result, the number of recorded interviews is lower than the actual number of people involved throughout the study. Some people were seen more than once but have been counted as a single informant. In some instances, the informant was the spokesman for a number of individuals.

Interviews were conducted as casually as possible and with full assurance of confidentiality. For the latter reason, the data are presented in general form and without identification. The investigators were general ly well received and informants were eager to express their opinions on the variety of topics under discussion. While some of the material presented in this Report is based on observation and interpretation of certain events, the major part of it is a generalized statement of the information gleaned from the people interviewed across the country. Many of the conclusions come from the suggestions of the Indian students and parents and the teaching and administrative staff. The investigators are grateful to the many people who gave them the information they sought. They hope that the data are as accurate a representation of what they said and felt as is possible and that this Report will serve them well.

Through the winters of 1965 and 1966, the data were analyzed, tabulated and collated with other information and research to give perspective and context. The findings are not startling but are much as were anticipated from the results of other research which has been carried out in other parts of Canada and the United States by independent investigators. The comparability of our findings to other studies lends authority to our endeavours and it seems worthwhile to emphasize that a variety of programs is underway in several countries which lend themselves equally well to the Canadian scene and which give us the benefit of evaluating their pitfalls and successes.

2. Definition of Key Terms

Some terms are used somewhat differently in this section of the Report so the following definitions are provided.

Indian: In this section we are departing from the legal definition and talking of any person of Indian ancestry who lives within the social, cultural and economic referents of a given Indian group. The rationale for this usage of the term is that a child who looks Indian, lives on or near a reserve, is considered to be an Indian by the non-Indians who have daily contact with him. He is treated like an Indian whether he is legally Indian, enfranchised or Metis. Where no differentiation Is made between these various groups of people, their school experiences have more in common than not.

Attitude: the evaluative and expressed opinion of individuals about specific topics or events. Attitudes of informants in this study were based on their perception and interpretation of given events and their generalizations from specific experiences. Attitudes determine motivation, affect the range of alternatives through elimination or extension, and colour the general perspectives of individuals. Attitudes are acquired by the child through day-to-day experiences, observations and contact with significant adults.

Culture: is the totality of behaviour, values, attitudes and other characteristics of a given group. A subculture is a distinguishable set within the larger one. Indian cultures can be regarded in two ways: (a) as cultural entities in themselves and (b) as a subculture of the larger Canadian complex.

Cultural Dissonance: Sometimes when there is change in parts of the system equilibrium cannot be restored through the available adjustive and innovative processes. Dysfunctional adjustments are then attempted and a state of social disorganization becomes dominant. The concept of cultural dissonance or disorganization is important to this Chapter. Dissonance is observable between Indian and non-Indian groups (or within the larger society) and within Indian groups as subcultures. It is sometimes possible for a subculture to restore and maintain its organization but often at the cost of a higher degree of dissonance with the larger cultural group. For example, mass alcoholism among some Indian groups is an adjustive mechanism within the social organization of the particular Indian group. However, such an adjustive process is dysfunctional and creates more dissonance between the subculture and the larger social group. In turn, this ultimately creates a greater degree of dissonance within the subculture.

3. Some Basic Assumptions

Certain initial assumptions were made which determined the focus of this section of the study. The following are the assumptions which proved relevant. It was assumed that:

1. Schooling of any type would represent a discontinuity of experience for the Indian child and the discontinuity would impede his early scholastic achievement.

2. The degree of discontinuity would be affected by such factors as the level of education of his parents, his economic background, the degree of acculturation of his community. Where such factors were low, cultural dissonance and personal anomie were expected to be high.

3. Where these factors were high and achievement was low, it was assumed that Indian patterns of life would be dominant and highly valued and that conversely, formal non-Indian education would be greatly devalued.

4. Where non-Indian attitudes towards Indians were negative and discriminatory, it was assumed that Indian levels of aspiration would be low and self-images would be primarily negative.

5. The higher the degree of disorganization in the Indian community, the greater would be the degree of ethnic ambivalence and lack of ethnic identity among Indian youth.

6. The lack of educated models in Indian communities would tend to hold down the level of aspiration of Indian youth toward occupations beyond the experience of members of the community.

Were the Assumptions Reasonable?

The data we have gathered indicate that all the above assumptions were useful in explaining the lack of achievement, the low levels of aspiration and the negative self-images of Indian youth.

1. There is no question that schooling presents a clear discontinuity of experience for the Indian child; such discontinuity contributes to the retardation of 80 per cent of the Indian children in first grade and to the average age-grade retardation of a minimum 2.5 years for all individuals.

2. Discontinuity of experience is directly attributable to the difference in educational backgrounds of Indian parents from non-Indian ones and in different expectations and socialization processes of the child. Low economic background usually revealed itself in lack of space in the home, poor health and nutrition and inadequate clothing and lunches. It also is reflected in the lack of experience with such things as books and records.

3. Where Indian cultures were relatively stable and Indian pursuits highly valued, schooling was devalued. Status and success are defined in Indian terms and an adequate economic level is achievable through occupations which Indians already pursue and which do not require a high level of formal education.

4. Levels of aspiration, achievement, self-images and personal identity varied directly with attitudes of non-Indians toward Indians in the same community.

5. Where social disorganization among the Indian group was high, Indian youth expressed a great deal of ambivalence about being Indian and a great deal of anxiety about the future. Personal anomie appeared to be high.

6. Unless Indian communities had semi-professional or professional models, Indian youth tended to aspire to vocations such as logging, fishing and unskilled occupations in which adults around them were employed.

4. Related Research

There has been much research done on Indian education and related areas such as the education of culturally deprived children. No attempt is made here to summarize the literature but a few salient points are worth noting.

The error of referring to the Indians as a homogeneous group throughout the nation is underlined by the diversity of material presented in the research literature. When the term "the Indian" is used, this is for convenience at the cost of some accuracy. All Athapaskans may share common characteristics but each small group of Athapaskans scattered throughout the country has features unique to itself. The situation is similar with each given group and locality. While data are generalized In this Report, there is no suggestion that the findings are applicable to all Indians across Canada nor that the recommendations will be useful in all cases. Clearly local differences are pertinent and problems and solutions must be re-defined locally.

It would be equally erroneous to equate Indian cultures with urban poverty cultures merely because members of the Indian groups exhibit similar characteristics to those of slum and marginal groups. The symptoms and syndromes appear to be identical but the routes to the given similarities vary significantly for Indians and non-Indians especially in the range of available alternatives and viable choices.

Indian children and non-Indian slum children exhibit similar behaviour in the classroom: both are unfamiliar with the school structure, with expectations held by teachers and with classroom procedures; both diverge from the normative group values attached to cleanliness, attendance and punctuality; both often have poor health, are listless and under-nourished; both show evidence of cognitive variance from their middle-class peers; both have difficulty verbalizing and tend to have depressed scores on I.Q. tests and low achievement levels. The similarities are striking but the causes differ significantly in many cases. For example, many Indian cultures are not deprived in the sense of the new urban slum. Children on reserves may have had rich experiences in the culture and language of their group. However, this early experience, rich as it may be, has not prepared the child for school routines and activities.

I. SOCIALIZATION: PROCESSES AND PROBLEMS

1. Early Socialization of the Indian Child

To understand how the Indian child enters the school system at a disadvantage, it is necessary to examine how the early socialization he has received differs from that of his non-Indian peers. In order to make the comparison as meaningful as possible, the Indian child presented here as the type is an English-speaking child from a reserve milieu with, say, water and electricity, low income, overcrowded homes, a large number of siblings in the family and some persisting Indian culture. It is likely that the men have seasonal employment of some sort and that occupations are unskilled. The level of education of adults is low, about fourth grade with a few exceptions. Life is contained within the reserve although shopping is done in the nearby non-Indian community and the children have made trips to town and other reserves.

The non-Indian child taken for comparison is from a middle-class home since the school is geared to his needs, values and development, and his early socialization is such that adaptation to school is relatively uneventful. Such a child comes from a home where overcrowding is not a problem, where there may be from two to four siblings, where father works regularly, and where parental education is high school or higher and where values are oriented to upward mobility through education and professional status.

Socialization takes place primarily in the family situation but it has broader societal referents. The values which parents pass on to their children reflect the values acceptable to the social group of which the family is one unit. The children learn to meet the expectations of the group and to act in terms of their shared values.

Each major social group has a set of basic and consistent patterns of life which are related to various cultural values. Differences in these patterns account for some of the conflicts which arise when members of different subcultures come into contact for the first time. The child who comes from a social milieu which does not value time or cleanliness encounters major difficulties upon coming into contact with people who value time and cleanliness highly. Unless the difficulties can be resolved, or one group substitutes the values of the other for his own, communication and understanding are low and conflict is created. Since basic values seldom alter simply through contact, and in some cases are clung to more rigidly because of threat, conflict remains persistently high.

Socialization is primarily the process of learning a role which will equip the individual to live comfortably in his own society and which will enable him to pass on the essentials of that society to others. In this way the social order is maintained. Of necessity, basic roles are ascribed by adults and acquired by children. In addition to basic roles, the individual may aspire to a variety of other roles and may also invent and elaborate additional ones for himself. For all children, the basic roles are acquired within the family group and then within the extended social group. As the child grows and develops he assumes additional roles as he encounters new situations. For most children, the new situations are not discontinuous with old ones and it is a process of role-extension rather than the acquisition of an entirely new role. For example, the child entering school has in a sense already been a student even though the formally-structured academic situation is new in many ways and requires adaptation of behaviour. It has continuity with old patterns. For the Indian child, the school is an entirely new phenomenon with new cultural items and some of his previous patterns of learning are not of value in the school situation. The Indian child is faced with the problems of overcoming disparate patterns of learning and of acquiring a new role in an unfamiliar setting.

2. Environmental Factors in Socialization

The interaction of social and developmental factors and their impact on intellectual performance and school achievement is complex. The high rates of failure, drop-out and unemployment, as well as obvious difficulties in personal adjustment attest to the low effectiveness of the school in preparing students for life in the larger society. There is ample evidence that children from the reserves and those from middle-class homes differ considerably in their patterns of language and thought. While the differences are not fully understood or accounted for, there is little doubt that the child from the reserve suffers as a result of being required to fit into the patterns of the majority and of being measured by its standards. It is worthwhile to attempt to delineate what factors contribute to such differences and how basic they are while recognizing that such understanding is of necessity speculative at the present state of our knowledge.

While the middle-class milieu does not consistently or completely furnish the conditions for maximum development, it seems to offer more generally nurturant conditions for growth and development than does the self-contained reserve milieu. The essential differences in available stimuli in the environment of the reserve and that of the middle-class child in conjunction with specific goals and means of socialization account for the differences in expectations, in set, in patterns of learning and in achievement in school. Some of the essential differences are:

Physical Environment	Indian	Non-Indian
Housing	Generally over-crowded; child sleeps with siblings in same bed; little or no privacy; scarcity of furniture; some-times dirty house; often unattractive, unpainted and uncared for.	Seldom crowded; child may share room but not bed; possibility for privacy; furniture adequate, usually clean; house usually painted and not unattractive.

Physical Environment	Indian	Non-Indian
Food	Generally inadequate for good nutrition and often inadequate in amount; lack of diversity and poorly prepared; meals when hungry rather than scheduled and communal; school lunches often lacking.	Sometimes inadequate for good nutrition but seldom is child hungry; usually diverse and adequately prepared by an adult; always scheduled and usually social; school lunches available and adequate.
Clothing	Generally insufficient and in poor condition; often unclean or unironed; often hand-me-downs and obtained from poor quality bargain sales,	Usually adequate and in good condition; always washed and ironed; some hand-me-downs but in good condition and usually of good quality.
Objects	Few toys; sometimes T.V.; seldom books or magazines available for child to read; sometimes records available; seldom any use of scissors, crayons and paste in making objects for play; meagre household furniture and objects useable for variety of experiences.	Often over-abundance of toys; usually child has own books, records and access to those of adults; considerable use of paste, scissors, crayons for constructing play objects; child uses own or house hold items such as egg beaters, etc.

Implications

Housing: It is difficult to assess how a minimum standard of housing affects growth and development. The lack of privacy, for example, no doubt has compensations in warmth and closeness to kin and in inhibiting feelings of isolation which often come when a child is retired to his own room and cut off from the warmth and interest of the adults who constitute his immediate world. Such lack of privacy also permits participation in all phases and nuances of human experience including involvements in drunken brawls and similar incidents, and also means the lack of a place to study, nowhere to keep personal effects such as books and clothes, and lack of sufficient sleep for school children.

Food: Lack of adequate nutrition for the child from any home implies potential lethargy and minimal operation of abilities which affect performance and achievement in school. Lack of scheduled meals in the Indian home often means that the child arrives at school not having eaten breakfast and for the few who lack school lunches in addition, the school day becomes intolerably long and tiring; learning capacity is greatly minimized.

Clothing: The matter of clothing is not directly relevant to achievement but does affect attendance, social status and psychological outlook to a considerable degree which then in turn can be related to achievement. Excuses for absence of Indian children are often based on the fact that there were not enough clothes to go around or that there were no clean clothes, or that no one was up to find clothes for the first grader. None of these factors applies to the non-Indian middle-class child who does not have to worry about the adequacy or condition of his clothes which are provided and cared for by his parents. Indian children are often laughed at because of their bizarre appearance in bargain and rummage goods. In the upper grades, the girls particularly find the comparison between their clothing and that of their non-Indian peers so extreme that their sense of embarrassment forces them into choosing to stay home rather than attend school. Such factors become even more vital in the upper-elementary and junior high school years when appearance is so important to social acceptance.

Objects: Development is stimulated by the availability of items and experiences in manipulation, exploration and creative play. Accuracy of conceptualization is refined by exposition to an array of objects and through experiences in which adults provide corrective feedback. The lack of objects in a child's world often means a paucity of stimulation and diminished opportunity for learning what things are, how they are used and how they are differentiated one from the other. The lack of experience with scissors and crayons, for example, means that the Indian child arriving at school has to learn what they are, the small muscle skills for using them, the various ways in which they are used, and the names for the colours. The non-Indian child who has developed these skills is ready to begin to learn to write and also to read. The Indian child has to "catch up.1' Individual potential is of little consequence if the child is not provided with the means for developing his skills and abilities.

Psychological Environment

Any child who is deprived of stimulation is likely to be deficient in development of various abilities. Indian children do receive stimulation but the variety is limited to a narrow spectrum in comparison with that available to most non-Indian children. Such deprivation has an effect on perception, attention span, patterns of learning and relationships with adults who normally provide corrective feedback, set up expectations for task completion, rewards and punishment and who provide reinforcement in a variety of ways. The language-symbolic system is also dependent on relationships with adults. Attitudes and set toward learning are established through interaction with adults from infancy on. Indian and non-Indian children have different psychological environments in the following ways:

Psychological Factors	Indian	Non-Indian
Attitudes toward Child	At age of mobility child is considered a person and left relatively free to create and explore his own environment. He develops a sense of independence and autonomy. He has limited stimulation and feedback from adults.	Child is watched and controlled by parents and remains dependent on them throughout childhood. He is not autonomous and has little opportunity to become independent. He has constant interaction and feedback from adults around him.
Parental Interest in Learning	Parents have little background in formal education and are not oriented, nor do they have time to teach their children specific skills. Little time is spent on teaching the child to walk and talk; some time may be spent in encouraging child to imitate father or mother in activities related to life on the reserve.	Parents have usually completed high school and are oriented toward preparing the child for school. Time is taken to teach children skills which will help them in school. Time is spent urging child to walk early and to talk early and correctly. Time is taken to expose child to a variety of stimuli through expeditions, shopping and visiting.
Verbal Practice and Development	Conversations between children and adults limited; questions often answered in monosyllables; custom sometimes demands silence from children in presence of adults;	Conversations often un limited; detailed answers given as often as mono-syllabic replies; child's speech and labelling may be corrected consistently. English spoken by parents

	Indian	Non-Indian
	English spoken by adults often inaccurate and limited in vocabulary. Some children have the opportunity to hear stories and folk tales which have colourful imagery and language. No one reads to the child.	usually correct and diverse; child is read to often and has books of his own.
Sanctions for Learning	Child is permitted to do things which interest him when he is ready. Seldom is he rewarded or punished for specific learning attempts although he receives approval when he does the task correctly after trial and error learning. Time is not a factor; he can take all morning to get dressed if he needs it. If child attempts a task and can't complete it, he is not urged to stay with it.	Child is urged to try things which are considered appropriate for him to know whether he has expressed interest, or not. He is rewarded for trying whether he learns task or not. Time is a factor: "see how fast you can dress yourself." Emphasis is placed on trying and on completing tasks undertaken.
Routines for Learning	Routines are flexible and often non-existent. Meals are served on demand; bed-times vary with sleepiness and family activity. Life is adult-centred and child is fitted in.	Routines are rigid. Meals served regularly and bed-times are stringently adhered to. Life is more child than adult-centred in sense that child's bed-time would not be disrupted for adult activities.
Discipline	Discipline is primarily protective and loose. Seldom is child punished. Age-graded behavioural expectations are minimal in early childhood; as child grows older, he is ridiculed if he fails to meet expectations but he has plenty of leeway. The concept of autonomy allows him his own decisions.	Discipline is relatively over-protective and rigid. Age-graded behaviour is demanded; few decisions are permitted, routines are controlled by adults; punishment is meted out for failure to comply with adult demands.
Miscellaneous Factors		
Economic Involvement of Children	Children often involved in economic routines and pursuits of parents which sometimes mean frequent mobility for seasonal labour, babysitting while mother works, helping on fishboats, and with fruit picking. Illness of mother often means older siblings care for whole family; economic level of reserve may involve children in wood and water-hauling and similar tasks.	Economic pursuits of parents seldom involve children; patterns tend to be stable and regular; mobility is low and participation of child in maintaining economic level is virtually nil; chores seldom disrupt routines of child; illness of mother and help with household chores usually handled by importing an adult.

	Indian	Non-Indian
General Family Patterns	Often unstable and father may be absent for long periods of time; in some cases, there is great deal of conflict and disruption within the home; drunken periods may mean children are left on their own for days at a time; care of children tends to diminish with periods of drinking.	Usually stable and father is usually at home more consistently than he is absent. Many homes have conflict but in most cases, there is an attempt to keep outbursts to a minimum and hidden from children. Children virtually never left on their own.

Implications

Environmental deprivation may have a levelling effect on the individual's achievement of certain skills and abilities. This is as applicable to the middle-class child who is restricted by routines and over-scheduling as it is to the Indian child whose experiential deprivation Is due to different causes. Such deprivation does not imply that children who are deficient will not be able to learn skills after bypassing them but it does mean if they have not learned them during the optimum period for development they will take longer to do so when given the opportunity.

Parental Interest in Learning: The orientation of non-Indian parents to learning processes and their familiarity with the requirements of the formal educational system augurs well for their children's establishment of patterns of learning which will be adaptable to the school situation. The lack of similar orientation among Indian parents and the lack of time for individual attention for each child lessens the possibility of establishing patterns of learning which will be consistent with those in school. The lack of corrective feedback and the paucity of objects provides the Indian child with few opportunities to discriminate perceptually and conceptually and limits his experience with items that are familiar to most children. For example, the non-Indian child who has blocks to play with learns to discriminate spatially, and to distinguish colours and sizes. He is helped in this by parents who correct him when he mistakes one colour for another and when he attempts to build a structure for which the blocks are not designed. Tactile sensory discrimination is also learned through familiarity with a number of toys and the direct teaching of the parents' "yes, that's rubber; no, that's wood." Such skills help immeasurably when the child learns to read and write. And such skills are assumed by the school as being possessed by all children on entry.

Verbal Practice and Development: Verbal skills are mandatory for learning in school. The child who has familiarity with books, who has been engaging in conversations with adults, who has an extensive vocabulary and who knows how to use words is at a distinct advantage when compared with the child who has had little verbal interaction, no exposure to books and who has learned English from adults who use it as a second language.

The child in the latter situation has not developed the auditory discrimination which is necessary for learning to read because he has not had the necessary corrective feedback. Because conversation has seldom been directed at him, his general level of responsiveness and attentiveness to incoming stimuli may be lower than that of the child described in the middle-class situation. This again lessens his facility in learning to read. Low responsiveness also has implications for reception of reinforcement, correction and attention span, the relationships of which to the formal educational process are obvious.

Sanctions for Learning are related to the development of a set toward learning including meeting the expectations of the teacher and being able to understand and decipher the cues given in the learning situation. The non-Indian pre-school child who is rewarded for "trying," who is encouraged to complete the task, who is given a time limit for performing the task has no difficulty assessing the expectations of the teacher and in meeting them in the majority of cases. The Indian child by contrast has had none of this pre-school conditioning and does not share the expectations of his peers with regard to the demands and behaviour of the teacher and his expectations. He therefore has to learn to do a task whether or not he is interested, to complete it, to do it within a given time limit and to accept punishment for not meeting these expectations. All of these factors interfere with the actual performance of the assigned task. They also reduce motivation. When the child has experienced negative sanctions for not meeting expectations and when his hope of achieving competence is constantly negated, he simply stops trying.

Discipline: The middle-class child is well prepared through the controls and routines Imposed on him at home for conformity to similar impositions at school. The Indian child is used to routines that are more free and to more independent behaviour. He encounters difficulty in school almost immediately and he must learn to conform to scheduled activity, to inactivity, to respond to the demands of the teacher and remain with a task until he completes it. He may also encounter punishment for the first time in his life and with little understanding of what he has done that is wrong. Again, he must learn the expectations for behaviour before he can learn anything else.

General Patterns and Routines: The middle-class child's routines are geared to his well-being and to ensuring that he gets enough food, sleep and activity in a regulated way. All of these arrangements contribute to his school achievement. The Indian child by comparison is often hungry and lacks sufficient sleep. His involvement in economic pursuits of the family may cause him to be frequently absent and tardy. In addition, the frequent absence of a father model who serves to reinforce an occupational image and the notion of success may also hamper the child's performance and motivation in school.

From the foregoing, it is obvious that the Indian child may have much difficulty in understanding and becoming re-oriented to the world of school as do the school personnel in understanding why this child is different and what his problems are. The Indian child from the first day of school experiences few successes and many frustrations and lacks the ability to articulate his confusion and misunderstandings and so reduces his opportunities for resolving them. Negative self-images begin to emerge, reinforced unwittingly by teachers and peers. The alienation process becomes firmly entrenched reaching its peak in negativism and despair about fifth or sixth grade. Parents may aspire for success for their children but they lack the knowledge of how to operationalize their aspirations. The cumulative educational deficit increases with age.

It is important to note that while the descriptive comparison between the Indian and middle-class situations appears to be invidious, that there are many and strong positives to be found in the Indian milieu. Unfortunately, these positives tend not to be congruent with the demands of the school and so count for little when considered in the light of preparation for formal education. For example, the strong sense of autonomy and independence and the considerable strengths developed by young Indian children in their own milieu appear not to provide them with any confidence in themselves when they are overwhelmed with the demands of the rigid school system. The little that transfers Is quickly eliminated in the demand for behavioural conformity. This is all the more unfortunate since the child enters school with essentially positive or at worst neutral attitudes toward school and soon learns negative ones. The school is the only agency which can alter the situation and that it has not done so is not entirely the responsibility of the school. The larger society makes it difficult for schools to experiment, offers little encouragement for special training of teachers and provides little research to pinpoint the specific types of problems presented by children of myriad backgrounds who arrive in good faith to become educated and who leave a few years later uneducated and without hope.

3. The Process of Alienation

One of the outstanding themes of Indian youth is the sense of alienation they feel with regard to their own culture and also to non-Indian culture. If one accepts many of their expressions at face value, one is forced to conclude that the majority of them live in a no-man's-land from which they have no escape.

Most adults and also many of the youth expressed a sense of powerlessness. Adults said, "we told those people what we wanted but it didn't make any difference," and, "government officials do what they want," and, "there is nothing we can do about it." Such expressions when heard in context indicated that the Indians in a variety of circumstances were quite clear in their own minds as to what they felt should be done about specific matters but they did not feel that any expression of opinion on their part would alter in any way what actually would be done. Youngsters in grade school expressed opinions that implied, "Indians never do well so what can I do?" and had long since stopped trying. The sense of powerlessness results in failure to achieve, lack of motivation, low levels of aspiration and inability to assess one's own potential. The lack of effort anticipates the lack of achievement and confirms the sense of powerlessness. The end result is stasis and a strong sense of alienation from people and events.

It is difficult to see how this vicious circle could be broken. The Indians have become accustomed to having decisions made for them and are loathe to reclaim their decision-making prerogatives. More commonly, parents silently accept a decision to integrate a school and then sabotage the decision by keeping the children home on a variety of excuses. In reality a basic explanation of non-attendance is the fact that they did not wish their children to integrate at that particular time, or in that way, or at that age.

An Indian's expectation that he can control the events of his life is low and based on persuasive experiences. If this is to change, then children must begin at an early age to accept responsibility for their own lives and affairs. A change in administrative controls--even those affecting children at the elementary school level--can help them accomplish this.

At the secondary level, the Indian student has little confidence in his own ability to make decisions affecting his future. He has had little experience in decision-making. He has little familiarity with the range of alternatives and tends to limit his decisions to acceptance or rejection of suggestions made by teachers or superintendents. Most of the interviewees in upgrading and vocational courses stated that they had come to Vancouver for the program because "the agent said I should" or "the agent suggested it would be a good idea." In most cases, the students had not thought about the prospects themselves, had no idea of what they would be doing and as a result many have failed or dropped out for lack of interest and commitment. Another person had made the decision and the student himself had invested little in it.

For those Indians whose own society is changing relatively rapidly and who perceive no substitute for old and valued ways, there is a strong sense of drifting and isolation. Youth internalize some of the goals of the non-Indian society while lacking the means of attaining them. High values are assigned to unattainable goals and low values are assigned to attainable goals within Indian culture. When young people become conscious of the discrepancy (often about fifth grade), motivation tends to drop off, ambivalence increases and the process of alienation from the non-Indian society begins in earnest. From this point on, achievement is lower, drop-out rates rise and personal anomie increases.

The process of self-estrangement seems to start early for the Indian child and culminates in the period around fifth grade under the circumstances described above. After a generally nurturant infancy and a relatively secure and emotionally warm early childhood, the Indian child starts school. Here he learns that he is "different" and that this difference accounts for the negative reactions of others toward him. His characteristic behaviour does not meet school expectations. He is punished or ridiculed for his failure to behave as others expect him to behave. Because he is dependent upon others for his rewards, he begins to build a concept of the ideal student which he cannot possibly meet but which he perceives other children meeting. He ultimately learns that he cannot attain the ideal status for reasons he does not comprehend. He begins to doubt the value of being an Indian and clings to the ideal image of the non-Indian student. The gap between the ideal self and the real self leaves the individual with a sense of self-alienation as well as a strong feeling of alienation from the larger society. There is little of himself or his culture that is valued within the classroom situation and the rewards he so earnestly seeks are seldom achieved. Failure follows upon failure until motivation, self-image, aspirations and achievement alter accordingly.

Aspirations and Alienation

The aspirations of young Indians were usually simply stated. They wished to become educated so they could obtain employment. Few knew what type of employment they sought and fewer knew what alternatives were available to them or what the educational requirements for specific occupations were. The dichotomy of ideal versus real appeared in response to questions such as "what would you like to do when or if you finish school?" Responses included such replies as "be a doctor, lawyer, or engineer" in contrast to replies to the question "what will you do when you complete school?'– which drew such answers as "fish, log, be a mechanic, hairdresser, nurse's-aide" and other occupations considered "typically Indian" or at least within their experiential frame of reference.

In almost every case, informants stated their aspirations by prefacing them with comments such as "if I could make it" or "if I finish school." While most youth indicated that they would like to complete high school, few planned to continue beyond grade ten. Very few informants mentioned university.

In general, informants knew no Indians who filled the ideal roles to which they aspired and in reality they expected to do what Indians did, that is, fish, go logging or do nothing. The expectation of actually obtaining employment in a non-Indian world was not high nor was it general. The lack of expectation made their educational goals hollow and deflected from the meaningfulness of life. Young Indians perceived the non-Indian world as unpredictable and their chances for employment low. Their aspirations tended to reflect the realities of their milieu in which virtually no one is employed at an ideal occupation or needs education to be employed in his particular occupation.

The sense of alienation among Indian youth seems to be traceable through the generations. The very elderly people have perceived the changes in reserve life but they are not personally involved in them. They eke out their days secure in their traditional status and untouched by the changes. The parental generation is not as secure. They have status neither in Indian society nor have they succeeded in non-Indian society. They express bitter feelings about the lack of educational opportunity and decry the lack of employment at the same time as they cling tenaciously to the belief that education will mean employment and a better way of life for their children. At the same time for some, a school generation has already gone and with it has come the realization that schooling did not guarantee employment and that life is not better. Today's youth are the product of both their parents' hopes and their own realizations. They grow up in a psychological environment which reflects a strong sense of defeat and hostility towards non-Indians. At the same time they hear the hopes that education will mean employment and a better life. These two points of view when combined with their own sense of alienation in school leave them little hope that they can achieve such goals. The combination of identification with parents, of alienation and normlessness, and of lack of belief in their ability to break through the barriers results in confirmation of expected failure. Ability and motivation may not be lacking at the start but they are soon stifled and defeat becomes inevitable. The syndrome is instituted early in life and comes into full operation in the first year of school and has run its course between fifth and eighth grade. The barriers to successful achievement of goals must be removed before the child becomes conscious of the gap between the goals and the means of attaining them. This means that the school experience for the Indian child must be different from the present one starting in the first grade if he is to have any hope of succeeding at all.

4. Values and Education: Functions of Ignorance

The system of values in some Indian communities tends to devalue formal education. It becomes important to understand the origins and development of such devaluation, and discover whether it implies a social function of ignorance or what substitutes the system offers in lieu of formal knowledge.

In the few remaining hunting and trapping societies, the time spent at school is a hindrance to becoming a good hunter and trapper. In communities where commercial fishing may provide a livelihood, the same concept of schooling is applicable. Time spent in school may be considered as time lost from important and vital life-processes and in such communities, adults were free in pointing out that the child in school was not learning anything of value to him. It was not surprising to find that children in such communities wished to leave school early. One variant was the community where the Indians are commercial fishermen with a high level of living, with good housing, new clothes, cars, refrigerators, deepfreezes and television sets. Here people indicated that the youth should finish at least high school but imposed no negative sanctions on drop-outs. Adolescents were frequently removed from school to help prepare for the fishing season. The alternate work available in this community was logging. The youth were all of the opinion that people should complete high school but each of them planned to drop out as soon as possible so he could get a job logging or fishing.

In the hunting and trapping economies, the adults expressed anxiety about the possibility that their children could maintain themselves through indigenous pursuits. However, they perceived little hope that the children could obtain employment in the Indian milieu since none of them knew anyone who had.

People readily assert that education is important and useful and that if one wants employment it is essential. In reality, behaviour and day-to-day conversations indicate clearly that education has little meaning to the Indians as a group. Few Indians know other Indians who are employed because they are educated. Few really hope to gain employment in a non-Indian milieu and youth from such communities share the same reflections as their parents. They aspire verbally to complete high school but they also quite openly admit that they will actually drop out of school at the first opportunity and at least by grade ten.

There is also a social function of ignorance. In some communities there is tremendous pressure on people to conform to norms and not to differentiate themselves. When individuals begin to pass the level deemed acceptable one of two things happens: the individual is persuaded to revert to the normative level or he leaves the group. This levelling influence affects education. In one instance, students stated that they would not want to go further than eighth grade; the only person who had progressed beyond that level in their area was beaten up regularly "because he thinks he's so smart and begins to act like he's White or something." In other instances, residential school informants indicated that they were sneered at by the "kids who don't go to school any more and it makes us feel awful." Other students who have moved away from the reserve said that they did not feel welcome at home now because their schooling had made them "different." These are high prices to pay for a year in school. When youngsters are faced with the problems of going on in school plus such pressures, it is understandable that they choose to drop out of school about the same time as their peers and others on the reserve.

The concept that youth will become educated is a difficult one for some elders to adjust to, also. Reserve leadership is tending to shift into the hands of the younger and partially educated men. Many councils have a secretary who has eighth grade and maybe some secretarial or commercial training. To the adult generation who are partially educated and whose only opportunity for status remains in their own community, better education of the young is a threat. There is some pressure exerted on adolescents to attend school for so many years but no more. The process reveals a social utility of ignorance whereby the current generation maintains its power by keeping the knowledge and educational levels of the youth at par with or not much beyond their own. This process does not work effectively in all areas and there are several reserves where social control is poor and where youth have little or no respect for Indian authorities and where chaos reigns. In such areas, adults tend to blame too much schooling for the lack of respect.

There is no doubt that the education of youth creates strains within the majority of Indian communities. The gap in understanding becomes wider between generations for each is moving at different paces and often in different directions. The demands of school children for better clothing, lunches, material items in the home increase with the child's exposure to different ways of life and his experiences in school. For example, residential school students complain that they dislike sharing beds and clothing and that they don't like the food when they return to the reserves for the summer. Parents are hurt and feel that their children neither love nor respect them any longer. Parents attribute the cause of this conflict to education. Education has evolved new needs which parents on the reserve cannot meet and has created conflict where earlier there was none. Where educational facilities are minimal and where educational attainment is low, such conflicts tend not to appear and the community is less disrupted. The social function of ignorance in such cases is a positive one from the point of view of the Indian in his community.

5. The Schools and the Minorities

Traditionally the public schools have tended to emphasize and propagate those cultural values which are primarily evolved by the middle class majority. The upper class has not been threatened by such emphases and in fact share most of the dominant values of the middle class. The lower classes and the non-Caucasian minorities have had a difficult time adjusting to and finding a place for themselves in the public schools. The degree of success of the children of minority groups in meshing into the cultural stream of the school has depended in part on the degree of deviance of their own culture from the majority culture. The process of acculturation has been singularly a one-way process with the accommodations being made by the students of the minority group and almost never by the schools or by the majority.

The school as a subculture in itself is rigid in its commitments to administrative procedures, schedules, curricula and methods of teaching. Personnel who might be flexible and knowledgeable enough to integrate material from the various cultures of the children into daily classwork seldom have the opportunity to do so when faced with the rigid requirements of completing the given curricula in the given way. Similarly, administrators who might be willing to overlook tardiness on the part of some minority children are unable to do so when forced to maintain a regulative system applicable to all. The contact of individuals from different backgrounds might be able to enrich and extend the perspectives of each. Such contacts can also lead to more differentiation and stronger conflicts which are intensified by obvious racial membership. The outcome depends in part on the school. The contact situation may produce a continuous frustrating experience generated by cultural marginality and in which there appears to be no resolution for the minority member.

The data from this study indicate that most of school life produces frustration and conflict for the Indian child rather than a situation in which ethnic differences are accepted and used for everyone's enrichment. The Indian child becomes aware of his ethnic difference for the first time. A great deal of anxiety is created by the fact that he is in a wholly unfamiliar environment; there is nothing in the school or in his classroom which is familiar to him nor is there any set of values or procedures which he can relate to his own world. In the unfamiliar environment the young child loses his identity not only because there is nothing familiar but because everything he is and does is wrong in the eyes of the teacher and his non-Indian peers. While he senses his failure to meet the expectations of significant individuals in the school setting, the Indian child cannot understand why he is told he is wrong and is unable to evaluate the situation for lack of experience and knowledge. The situation becomes an excruciating one for him as the years progress because he becomes more consciously aware of being undermined. Home and school underline world views different in detail and in orientation.

It is in the school situation that the failure of the Indian home to provide sufficient security within individuals to withstand attack and threat becomes obvious. Children are completely defeated by the time they reach the upper grades; their poor self-images and expressed lack of confidence and ability to succeed at nothing attest the fact. This would seem to indicate that while many Indians will state their sense of worth as Indians, they have passed the point of believing it and their children have sensed their doubts and reflect the same ambivalence. They are left with few resources to withstand the constant attack upon them as individuals with a distinct way of life.

Schools try to reach and alter parents through the children, thus often creating intolerable conflict. Such statements as "tell your mother not to send you to school unless she washes your clothes" have all sorts of ramifications and most often result not in cleanliness but in absenteeism.

Caught between the Indian and non-Indian worlds as well as between generations, the Indian child is faced with an overwhelming task: to assemble for himself an identity in situations of the utmost confusion. He must also develop a sufficient sense of self-worth to enable him to progress from childhood to adulthood with some conception of his role, his abilities, his limitations and some hope of success. The prerequisites for such a task include the development of skills to cope with his environment and the support of adults who will believe in him and guide him along his way. The child cannot resolve this dilemma while he is still dependent upon his family for primary needs and subject to the adult authority of the school which has found no meeting place with the home.

The Teacher's Dilemma

The dilemma of the teacher is no less than that of the Indian child, for the teacher must provide not only the material to be learned, but also the skills necessary for subsequent learning. In order to accomplish this, the teacher must make the material meaningful and find means of relating it to the things the child already knows and to his life in general.

In the average school, the majority of the students come from a background similar to that of the teacher. The teacher is thus in a position to relate, interpret and project ideas for the students. He is also able to interpret the behaviour of the children, both to himself and to other children, since they share a common social orientation. Problems arise when the teacher is faced with the necessity of helping a child who does not share this common orientation to become a productive and accepted member of the class.

Initially, teachers tend to evaluate children from minority groups ethnocentrically. This is usually not done in a deliberate attempt to castigate such children for their behaviour, but for lack of an alternative. That is, few teachers are sufficiently aware of the differing cultures from which their students come to be able to understand their behaviour. When faced with different norms, teachers fall back on their own patterns of thought and action and attempt to make the minority student fit those which are the most familiar and comfortable. This is doomed to failure: the teacher is faced with misunderstood and deviant behaviour on the part of minority students, and also with a growing sense within himself that he is not helping the child to learn.

The teacher is also placed in a difficult position by school procedures and regulations. Some teachers are quite knowledgeable about their minority students and the types of environment from which they come. They would be pleased to find a way to accommodate minority group Children, but they are prevented from experimentation by the pressure to maintain the regular operation of the school. Certain curricula must be covered in a set time and often in a given way. The teacher has little time to add material or to substitute material more relevant to the lives of students. Social studies provide a prime example of this kind of thing: Indian children with the illustrious background of the Six Nations sit through lessons In history in which the missionaries are martyred by the vicious Iroquois and in which the voyageurs obtain the credit for navigating the waterways. No text mentions the positive contributions of the Indians in the opening of the eastern provinces nor the help they provided to the initial explorers as guides along the many rivers and watersheds. For a teacher to overcome such misrepresentation would demand research on his part to accumulate factual material and the elimination of certain material from the accepted course of studies.

The day-to-day incidents in the classroom do not make the teacher's position enviable. The minority group child arrives for school late more often than on time. Even a teacher who understands the reason for tardiness has still to maintain a principle. The desirability of promptness must be reinforced for the class in general and the teacher is not in a position to overlook the tardiness of the child who arrives late every day. On the other hand, the hurt and withdrawal on the part of the late child is also understandable when one finds out that he missed the bus because no one woke him and that he walked the three miles to school without breakfast to be greeted with a rebuke.

Similar situations arise all throughout the day, taxing the ingenuity of the teacher and the sensitivity of the child. The teacher may become defeated and take recourse to ministering the needs of the majority and "doing what I can" for the minority. In this he is supported by the administrative organization of the school and by the mandate given all teachers to socialize children in a manner acceptable to the larger society and in a way which will enable the children to take their place in that society. Society and the school accept little responsibility for those who cannot conform and the teacher is not In the position to fight an educational system and a society on behalf of a few children out of the many.

While many teachers could do more in their own classrooms by being more understanding and in reinforcing the sense of worth of minority group children in many small ways, the mandate for change to accommodate them rests with the school administration. This can be done without disrupting the total process of education. That it must somehow be done is clear from the data which indicate that pressures on the Indian student to conform are useless and that Indian children are neither conforming nor becoming educated. Meanwhile, teachers continue to take refuge in the "rightness" of their ways and will struggle onward in the task of "helping the children overcome their Indianness."

Acculturation and the Problem of Identity

There can be no doubt that both teacher and Indian student are unwilling participants in a cultural conflict which is more than the summation of their individual encounters. A closer look at the process of acculturation as it proceeds in and through the school may provide insights into the dilemma.

By seeking to make the child less "Indian" and, by implication, more "middle-class White," the school is asking him to become a different person. Can this acculturation take place without changing the basic personality of the child – evolved through membership in his specific group through the early years of life? If the answer is no, to demand acculturation is to demand a great deal, in pain and effort, and raises the fundamental question of whether it is necessary.

Industrialization of all parts of Canada renders untenable a program of isolation for any small group. Indians are seeking to join the mainstream of national life and share in its benefits of employment, education, health and welfare and better standards of living. The process is not smooth, because it occurs on many levels of contact and often is neither planned nor sequential. Cores of resistance develop such as that in education. One of the major barriers to the adaptive process is the one of ethnic identity with all its implications for perception, behaviour and achievement in school and employment.

The Problem of Identity

The process of socialization bears down heavily and continuously upon the developing human being. In the early years learning is intensive and basic; for this reason early learning is considered most fundamental and affects the individual's adult patterns of thought and behaviour. Likewise, early learning is difficult to alter because of its intensity and its basic characteristics. In this lies the explanation of the difficulties encountered in attempting to change the patterns of thinking, acting and learning of the Indian child when he arrives at school. Only in those areas in which he does not have to unlearn things can one hope for ready success in teaching him new ways of thinking and doing.

The early learning hypothesis does not rest independent of other factors such as affect, types of pressure for change and the general circumstances in which the pressures are exerted, the availability of other alternatives and a multiplicity of related factors involved in the contact situation. It is generally accepted that core culture, values, basic cultural orientations and personality are most resistant to change. At the same time, change in any segment of the culture is not likely to occur unless there is a substantial reason for it.

Acquisition of new material or traits does not necessarily imply internal change. However, pressure to change patterns which are already learned requires internal change and meets with resistance depending on the factors cited above and the interdependency of the particular trait with others.

The young Indian child arrives at school with a cultural orientation, a set of values, and a structured personality. He has an identity as an individual and as a member of a specific cultural group. His cultural orientation and values will have prepared him to value certain things and not others, to perceive things in certain ways and to internalize goals for specific reasons shared with his community. To the extent that the school population holds different cultural orientations and values, his expectations and perceptions will differ from those of the others and a situation of conflict will be created. To the extent that the child learns that his way is not only different but is wrong, his identity and his security are attacked and he is confronted with a crucial problem.

Every child has a set of tasks in each developmental period which he must learn and complete in order to achieve maturity. For the child for whom the prevailing social trends are the normative orientation, the tasks remain substantial. For the child who must, in addition to resolving age-graded tasks, also evolve an identity in a society in conflict with his own, the task becomes overwhelming. For the non-Indian child, the school represents an on-going process of socialization within the school. For the Indian child, the process of socialization within the school represents a clear discontinuity. The most powerful reinforcements for learning are those of social and emotional reward. Such reinforcement is systematically denied the minority group child in school and negative sanctions are applied to him for possessing characteristics of which his parents approve. The only available source of reward for the minority child is found within his primary group which strengthens those very characteristics which the schools seek to alter. If viable alternatives were available to youth and if the schools rewarded for some of the behaviour of the culturally-different child, there would be a possibility of change. As long as all rewards must emanate from the primary group of the child, there is much less hope of the schools succeeding in re-socializing children from various minority groups.

In order to maintain a sense of personal worth and identity, the child must have some successful experiences in his attempts to learn and some hope of achieving success in future endeavours. Without some sense of worth and identity, the child cannot mature or become or remain a functioning human being.

Models and Identification

The availability of models with whom youth may identify in their discovery of themselves is an important factor in socialization. The Indian student has both Indian and non-Indian models to choose among. The process of identification can be a unitary one, that is, the individual can choose one model whom he seeks to emulate. Or the process can be extended to an array of models each of whom has certain characteristics which the individual seeks to develop in himself. Generally, individuals choose their model from among the group of adults close to them. Ultimately they branch out to identify with several models as the need for diversity in roles becomes stronger. Finally, the individual acquires his own identity, similar but separate from that of his models.

Indian children model themselves after other Indians in the initial phase of the process of identification. The characteristics which Indian models provide do not permit the acquisition of behaviour patterns which the child needs for fulfilling roles in school and in the larger society. Seldom do Indian communities have adult models who have achieved high status in that community through education. In school the Indian child has non-Indian models provided which he might use in his attempts to become like his non-Indian peers. However, if he chooses a non-Indian model, the child has no means of internalizing non-Indian characteristics; he does not have sufficient knowledge of them to be able to behave as a non-Indian in the absence of the model. The persistent conflict of cultures is highlighted again by the fact that when the goals which youth are internalizing derive from their own culture, the goals of education are extraneous; when the goals and behaviour are derived from the school, they find no reflection in the behaviour of adult models within the Indian community.

Identity and Aspirations

The process of identification and the choice of vocational aspirations are closely interwoven. It becomes necessary to distinguish clearly between ideal and real aspirations when discussing the matter with Indian students. Students often indicate that they aspire to be professional people, that is, doctors, lawyers, nurses and members of other related disciplines. Aspirations can only be considered real ones if the individual can project himself into the situation through the vicarious experiences of a model with whom he has identified, and if he is aware of the processes involved in attaining such a status.

Most Indian students who cited "doctor" as a vocational aspiration could name no doctor (Indian or non-Indian) that they knew personally and had little concept of what was involved in becoming a doctor. When the question was changed from, "What would you like to do?" to, "What will you do?" usually more realistic assertions were made which reflected the range of available vocations for which Indian youth had models within the community. When the gap in responses was brought to the attention of the respondent, the explanation was given that it was nice to think about various occupations but that it was unlikely they could achieve professional status because "Indians aren't doctors."

Discussion then led to, "What are Indians if they are not doctors or lawyers?" Seemingly, Indian models are primarily skilled and semi-skilled or unskilled labourers, fishermen, loggers, mechanics, truck drivers or "nothing" by occupation. For females, models are wives, mothers, practical nurses, cannery workers, cooks, charwomen, hairdressers and other similar occupations. Strongly prevalent is the concept that such occupations are Indian occupations because Indians have gained employment in these occupations and have succeeded in them.

In analyzing the choices that young Indians make there are several factors to be considered. First, they are Indians identifying with Indian models and by definition, Indian occupations. Second, students are aware that Indian occupations demand a lower level of education than would other choices. Third, since most Indians in school are on general or occupational programs and over-age as well, school and Indian Affairs Branch personnel tend to encourage these students to enter training programs leading to trade occupations, "because they are good ones for Indians." This further reinforces the idea that such occupations are for Indians and that others are not. Finally, school and Indian Affairs Branch personnel tend not to disseminate general vocational information and tend not to encourage Indian children to think about semi-professional and professional occupations because, "this is not realistic for Indians at this time." Little or no vocational information is given to Indian students so that many are unaware of the alternatives and are reduced to a choice within the narrow spectrum of their own community.

For the generation currently in school, the choices are now being slightly broadened. For males, there is support from school and home to pursue training courses leading to qualification as electrician, carpenter, and operator and mechanic for heavy duty equipment. For females, there is encouragement to think in terms of doing clerical work, or be receptionists in medical and dental offices and store clerks. Such alternatives remain close to the older definition of "Indian occupations" and require little further educational background than the ones already cited.

There remains the question as to why Indians do not identify with non-Indian models whom they meet daily in school and whose goals they have internalized at least partially. Some students did indicate that they might like to be teachers but hastened to add that they could never achieve such a goal because they would probably not complete high school and would never get to university. Some girls also aspired to be "real nurses" but were satisfied with contemplating practical nursing because they were not on the required academic program. When males were questioned about such occupations as police or game wardens, some categories of which do not require more education than the general high school program, youth responded that they would not be able to be law enforcement agents in their own communities nor would they "like to tell people what to do all the time." Similar statements were made by some respondents with reference to becoming teachers. Seemingly, youth tend to veer away from vocational pursuits which might place them in a position of authority in their own communities.

What factors might permit Indian youth to identify with models outside their own communities and to extend their horizons? One major factor is the degree of understanding and acceptance which exists between Indian and non-Indian groups. Where non-Indian attitudes are supportive, the chances for Indian youth identifying with non-Indians and their occupations are higher than in situations where there is little understanding and acceptance between the two groups. In communities where Indians are accepted for what they are and their Indianness is not decried, two main factors appear to be operative. The Indians have no ambivalent feelings about being Indian and have a relatively strong sense of worth. At the same time they perceive themselves as becoming more like the non-Indians in their desires for material goods and types of employment. Because they are accepted by the non-Indians, they perceive few barriers to their aspirations for jobs of status higher than the typical "Indian occupations." They also have more information about such occupations and aspire to higher levels of educational achievement. The Indians are encouraged by the non-Indians to think in terms of moving away from the reserve, living in an integrated community and supporting themselves through occupations available in the community. Offers of employment available after graduation serve as incentives to youth to complete school and as reassurance of acceptance within the non-Indian community. Where such incentives are also supported within the Indian community, the hope for achieving them becomes realistic. In concrete terms, Indians could identify with White models under the optimum conditions of (a) acceptance as an Indian by the non-Indians (b) encouragement of non-Indians through general support and job offers (c) reinforcement of such aspirations by the Indian community (d) educational success in an integrated school. If any of these factors is lacking, the possibility of Indians identifying with non-Indian models is diminished if not removed.

Other Types of Identification

Many youth identify quite successfully with models within their own community. This is particularly true of situations where the level of living of the community is adequate by Indian definition, that is, where people in the community have relatively good housing, appliances, cars, buy new clothes and have some cash for leisure. In general these were logging and fishing communities where income was derived from seasonal employment, unemployment insurance, social assistance and pensions. Status in such communities was derived from being a good fisherman with more money and more possessions. The better fishermen were more likely to hold positions on council and to consider themselves as hereditary leaders as well as elected ones. Youth in these communities were not as likely to look outside the reserve for the things they desired as were Indians from more depressed circumstances. They enjoyed the material levels they considered comfortable and they saw no need to venture into the non-Indian world in search of other things. They identified with the more successful members of the community, expressed little ambivalence about being Indian and had a disregard for formal education. They aspired to leave school as soon as they could in order to go on the boats or to the lumber camps. Youth indicated that "education is a waste of time" and while adults said "fishing is over; the kids should finish school and get jobs" they readily took the older children out of school early to help prepare for the fishing season. No one watching the total involvement and excitement of the community in getting the boats ready for another season, or listening to the stories of successes and speculations about the coming season could seriously believe the statement that "fishing is over; you should complete school and get another job."

Many situations were found where Indian youth observed and examined the process of identification realistically and pessimistically. This occurred where non-Indian attitudes were non-supportive (neutral or hostile) and where Indian models were either not available or weak. The social situation comprised disorganization, factional ism, alcohol ism and general mass unemployment. Youth from such reserves tended to be depressed, pessimistic about the future, have low levels of aspiration and poor self-images. They perceived the future holding not much more than the past. They were often surprised by the question of what they might do and be in the future since few of them visualized any possibilities of doing or being anything other than they were now. Indian youth in these communities aspired to be employed but were realistic in their appraisals that employment was unlikely because they were so far behind in school and also because employment was not generally available to other members of their community. Such communities were filled with people who had tried obtaining work to no avail or who had held jobs for short periods and then been fired or quit for a variety of reasons. Youth expressed fear about what happens to the Indian who leaves the reserve to obtain work and the difficulties he encounters in adjusting to the demands of city life and work. Recounting such stories, young people stated unequivocally that they were afraid to venture into similar experiences. At the same time they also expressed the strong desire to have more money and food and clothes and nicer houses which they perceived as being obtainable through employment. But they felt such employment was beyond the realm of the Indian.

The lack of successful Indian models on or off the reserve and the partial internalization of seemingly unachievable goals on the part of partially-educated Indian youth on such reserves result in an irresolvable conflict for individuals and groups of individuals. The lack of successful Indian models by any definition results in a lack of direction, diffusion of identity, ethnic ambivalence and a good deal of fear, all of which become self-perpetuating in inhibiting any move toward economic and social integration. At the same time, the internalization of at least the economic goals of the non-Indian society creates a feeling of frustration which makes life virtually intolerable on the reserve. Filled with the dissatisfaction of their present circumstances and convinced that there are no other alternatives open, Indian youth become greatly disenchanted and bitter about all aspects of life and seek to ease the constant dilemma by whatever means they can – legal or illegal.

In each of the situations cited above, the closed nature of the society adjacent to the reserve clearly prevents the movement of the Indian into and through the social system of the majority group. Where the non-Indian society is closed to the Indian, frustration and depression do not occur if the Indian society itself has the means of maintaining a satisfactory standard of living through indigenous activities. Indian models are available to youth and identity is achieved within the Indian group.

In cases where the non-Indian society is closed and the Indian society is disorganized and depressed, there are few ways of maintaining a sufficient and satisfying life. Youth in these communities exhibit identity diffusion and appear to be immobilized between conflicting goals of the Indian and non-Indian ways of life. They are permanently lost unless the closed non-Indian society can become more open through procedures which will enable youth who aspire to non-Indian goals to have the possibility of achieving them.

6. Summary

The young Indian child is subjected to an informal educational system within his own society which enables him to become an Indian; formal education in the public schools seldom overlaps the Indian educational process but it does make certain inroads. At adolescence, about fifth to eighth grade, the antithetical position of the two cultures becomes crucial because it faces the Indian youth with a dilemma he cannot resolve. In essence, it forces him to choose between being an Indian or an Indian "White." This is clearly a choice which he cannot make simply because whatever else he may be, he is an Indian and others regard him as such. Despite the fact that the Indian's early socialization had equipped him to be an Indian, his school experience has been at least partially successful in enabling him to internalize goals which he has no means of achieving within his own society. At the same time, the non-Indian society is usually more closed than open, thus further inhibiting him from achieving within it should he be capable of doing so. This produces an ambivalence within the majority of Indian youth which makes life miserable and which virtually negates all hope of achieving some degree of satisfaction and success.

Faced with continual criticism for being what he is, the Indian child struggles through a long series of failures still hopeful that he may succeed in time. By fifth grade, he begins to realize the chasm which separates him from others and to realize the futility of his efforts to achieve socially and academically. He then begins to withdraw from any participation in the learning process until he is legally of age when he is able to withdraw completely. Achievement, attendance, self-image and level of aspiration drop markedly.

II. THE INDIAN AND FORMAL EDUCATION

Fact and opinion were gathered from many people who were assured that they would not be identified and no specific references either to people or to communities will be made.

The sample is not a large one, but its consistency gives confidence that we can use it to come to conclusions about the larger population. Every effort has been made to provide corroboration from other sources--Indian Affairs Branch records and reports, school records and independent research projects. Nevertheless the data do not represent all reserves or schools and local variations make each situation unique in some respects at least.

1. Overview

It might be well to restate some of the principal findings. The early training of Indian children cannot be parallelled or equated with the process of training which non-Indian children are undergoing at the same time. General orientations, values, routines and relationships vary among social systems and the child from each develops a completely different world view. As a result, when Indian and non-Indian children appear at school initially their expectations are different, they perceive things differently, their familiarity with the material phenomena of the school is different and their behaviour is governed by differing sets of rules. There is no basis, theoretical or real, in these cultural differences on which to assume any lesser degree of potential ability or motivation on the part of either child.

The differences in general orientation ultimately prove to be crucial for the Indian child. School expectations, rewards and punishment, classroom procedures and related factors tend to enhance and complement the early learning of the non-Indian child. However, the school process interrupts or conflicts with the learning process of the Indian child forcing him to unlearn, relearn and acquire new learning in areas which he should have at his disposal at school entry if he is to progress at the same rate and in similar ways as his non- Indian classmates.

The Indian child falls behind immediately because he has to acquire many of the skills the non-Indian children already possess upon school entry. He also has to become reoriented so that he can communicate with the teacher and meet the expectations of the school. Some factors are beyond his control, such as punctuality, and so he fails to meet expectations. As negative sanctions are applied throughout the early school years for behaviour which he cannot control or adjust and as he trails along behind his non-Indian peers, the pursuit of success becomes obviously futile and motivation decreases. Failure increases. The image of the Indian student as a dull, retarded student without ambition becomes the school stereotype, and the child is constrained to fill the role.

Major areas of conflict experienced in the contact between Indian pupil and White teacher concern autonomy, discipline, competition, time and language. These are conflicts of their respective cultures. Many Indian groups consider the child autonomous between two and three years of age. From this time on he is not considered a child but a person. He is left free to create his own routines, make many decisions, play at and learn things which interest him and in general to develop independent of stringent parental guidance and control. The child becomes self-sufficient in many ways. His days and hours are relatively unstructured. Upon entering school, he has to learn to conform, to adapt to a schedule of activities, to learn to participate in things whether or not they interest him and to become subservient to the constant demands of another individual.

Closely connected with the concept of autonomy is the practice of discipline. Discipline in an Indian community is seldom harsh and rarely physical. (Discipline should be discriminated from the physical abuse of children by adults who are quarrelling and drinking.) Adults do not establish rigid sets of rules to control the child. Often he is not punished even when he commits an offence against a known rule; adults reason that he will learn that others will be ashamed of him, or will mock him or reject him if he persists in such behaviour. These are strong and compelling forces of social control but they do not constitute as narrow a disciplinary margin as do tight and rigid systems of rules with set punishments for infractions. There is much leeway on an age-graded basis in determining acceptable behaviour in an Indian community.

The child at home feels his way along the path to learning what constitutes acceptable behaviour. In school, no child is free to learn through trial and error; the rules are established and the punishments for infractions are defined. One difficulty the Indian child encounters is in learning what the rules are since many of them are implicitly shared and understood by members of the majority group and do not get discussion until after an infraction has occurred. The Indian child has little opportunity to learn the rules directly, since all are expected to know them. He begins to feel hurt and confused as well as unjustly treated when he realizes that he is being punished for things he does not know and understand and over which he often has no control.

Competition is a cultural phenomenon which may or may not be a part of the Indian child's background. In many Indian cultures, competition is a strong element and Indian students from such groups should have no major difficulties in engaging in competitive processes in the classroom provided they have the background of information necessary to compete. For other Indian groups, however, cooperation rather than competition is valued. Children from these groups are perplexed when scolded for providing the answer for another child or doing his work with him. Since many of the rewards of the school system are based on competitive methods of teaching ("see who can finish the problems on page ten first") the Indian child from a non-competitive orientation tends to gain much less recognition and reward than his more competitive peers. Given twelve problems and the motivation to "see who can finish first," the non-Indian child may race through and have five errors but complete the work; the Indian child may have completed seven sums correctly with the others untouched. The non-Indian child is commended for completing his work and told to correct his errors. The Indian child is reprimanded for being slow and not completing his paper. The psychological atmosphere for each is considerably different.

Time and schedules are major points of conflict between school and Indian students. The routines of an Indian home and the general orientation of the community to time and schedules are ones of general flexibility. The school does not run on flexible schedules nor could it; it expects the students to meet schedules with little allowance for deviance. The Indian student who walks to school is more often late than punctual; bus students are either punctual or absent. The Indian child also has to learn to conform to scheduled activities during the school day. Many non-Indian children also have to learn this but are helped by relatively consistent scheduling of meals and bedtimes and hours of awakening which not only routinize their lives but help them learn the concept of time. The Indian child often eats when hungry and sleeps when tired. In over-crowded houses, children follow adult schedules which means that they retire late and have insufficient sleep if they get up in the morning to get to school. They often are late in arising because adults are not up to awaken them.

Time subjects the Indian student to reprimands and to having to learn to value something which is contradictory to his past experience. The young child seldom manages to resolve this problem.

Language is a complex issue with many variants from locality to locality. For the child who comes from a non-English speaking home, as is the case in many northern areas, the problem is to learn a new language. This is perhaps the least complex of all the variables because in such instances the child can learn English from an English-speaking teacher and peers. Such a necessity retards the educational progress of the child initially but may give him good grounding for later years.

The child who comes from the home where English is spoken by parents as a second language probably speaks "Indian-English." This is a variant in which English structure and words are used but in which forms and meanings often vary from the standard ones of the school; and although the child who speaks Indian-English is viewed as an English speaker by the school, in most cases he is as much in need of instruction in language as the non-English speaking child.

Indian children also report they are confused by the constant stream of talk that goes on in the classroom. Some Indian children are used to relative quiet in the home with conversation limited in frequency and quantity. These children complain that the classroom is noisy and that they have difficulty keeping their attention focussed on the conversation of the teacher. This difficulty is compounded by the language difference cited above. The children tend to get discouraged at their failure to communicate with the teacher and vice-versa and withdraw into the silence by "tuning out." This is not unique to the Indian child, but the non-Indian child has the advantage of at least understanding what is being said when he tunes in again.

Indian children expressed hurt at being "yelled at" by the teacher. In our observation, in most instances teachers thought to be yelling were using normal teaching voices and were not angry or unpleasant. In many Indian homes a quiet tone of voice is usual, but raucous and strident tones are also common. The explanation may be that the Indian child is overwhelmed by the diversity of elements of language he has not mastered and that they produce a combination whose incomprehensibility he expresses in his complaint that teachers are offensively noisy.

The question of motivation of the Indian student is a complex one which is not easily unravelled. No studies have found that the Indian child is less motivated to succeed than the non-Indian. Pilot studies undertaken during the course of this project appear to indicate that the motivation of Indian students is as high as that of non-Indians and higher in some instances. Nevertheless, the study also indicates a sharp drop in motivation for achievement after a few years in school. Comparatively, White Canadian children tend to increase motivation for achievement in school with each year in school. The diversity can perhaps be explained by differences of experience in success and in support from significant adults.

The non-Indian child gains momentum for achievement both through success in school and through parental pressure and support to succeed. As the child grows older his success becomes more important and the pressure and support from home is increased on the premise that he must succeed in school if he is to succeed in life.

The Indian child's experience is considerably different. He loses momentum through the early school years because he experiences more failure than success. The goals toward which he is striving become less realistic as he matures. Economic and social mobility do not correlate as closely with educational progress for the Indian student as they do for the non-Indian child who knows people who work and who have certain jobs because they have specific training or education. The Indian community and the child's parents in particular often do not see school achievement as essential to future success.

Consequently, home rewards for good school achievement are virtually unknown and punishments for failure hardly exist. Indian pressures for achievement are directed toward things which are more significant to the community than achievement in school. Similarly, until the child's school experience alters and the system of rewards becomes germane to him and he has some opportunity to succeed it is likely that motivation will continue to decrease with each year in school.

In sum, the atmosphere of the school, the routines, the rewards, and the expectations provide a critically different experience for the Indian child than for the non-Indian. Discontinuity of socialization, repeated failure, discrimination and lack of significance of the educational process in the life of the Indian child result in diminishing motivation, increasing negativism, poor self-images and low levels of aspiration. Until some compromises can be made by the school and the Indian and non-Indian communities, the impasse will remain and the sense of worth of the Indian student will remain low, inhibiting adequate academic achievement. The schools serving the majority cannot readily accommodate the children of minority groups but some provisions can be made through special classes, skilled teaching, and sensitive teachers which should enable every child to experience some success and maintain his sense of worth.

2. Dropping Out and Staying In

Statistics for 1963-61 are used since when data were collected the 1964-65 figures were not complete, but a review of the 1964-65 figures indicates that the trends are similar. In 1963 there were 45,309 students attending day schools, boarding schools, provincial schools, vocational schools and special schools. Of this figure, 57 students were registered in universities and the remainder were predominantly in the elementary schools with a small proportion attending secondary schools and vocational institutes.

Analysis of Table I shows that the rates of repetition of grades and of drop-out are extremely high. Retention in grade one and the loss of students in any twelve-year period are alarming.

TABLE I

PROGRESS OF INDIAN STUDENTS THROUGH A TWELVE-YEAR SCHOOL CYCLE

Grade	Year	Enrolment	Loss (no.)	Loss (%)
1	1951	8782	-	-
2	1952	4544	4238	48.2
3	1953	3430	614	13.5
4	1954	3652	278	7.1
5	1955	3088	564	15.5
6	1956	2641	447	14.5
7	1957	2090	551	21.7
8	1958	1536	554	26.5
9	1959	1149	387	25.5
10	1960	730	419	36.5
11	1961	482	248	34
12	1962	341	141	29.3

In a period of twelve years, 8441 Indian students out of 8782 did not complete high school. Figures are not available which would specify the separate rates of retention and attrition. We are forced to use the gross figures which indicate there is a 94 per cent loss of school population between grades one and twelve. The national rate of drop-out for non-Indian students is approximately 12 per cent. The two figures of attrition are not fully comparable since late entry, language difficulty and the other factors already cited for Indian students make such a comparison unreasonable. Nevertheless, the difference is a rough measure of the position of Indian students in relation to non-Indians and a reminder that although more Indians are entering school each year and staying in school longer, doubly intensified efforts will have to be made to equalize educational opportunity for Indians. Non-Indian students are also staying in school longer and achieving higher educational levels. No measures are available which would enable us to compute the rate of increase for each group but it is certain that unless the Indian curve advances at a much faster rate than at present the gaps will remain significant.

Samples taken throughout the provinces show that approximately 80 per cent of Indian children repeat grade one. Many Indian children repeat grade one three times. Others are promoted after failing grade one; they usually manage to complete grades two and three but fail grade four. The failure pattern then remains consistent through to grade eight. In grade eight, a large number of Indian students leave school. The remainder continue through to grade ten, usually repeating the one or two years, at which point most leave school entirely and approximately 20 per cent go into vocational institutes. Those few students who continue through grade ten usually do adequately in grades eleven and twelve and complete high school.

The Indian Act states that a child may enter school at age six but must enter by age seven; he may leave school at age fifteen or at the completion of grade eight whichever comes first. Public School Acts require children to enter school at age six and permit them to terminate at age sixteen or grade eight. An Indian child who enters school at age seven, fails grade one and grade four is of legal age to leave school at grade six. Most continue on to grade eight but then do not want to continue because they are discouraged, feel "silly with all those younger kids" and don't anticipate that they will feel comfortable socially in the high school environment.

Administrative divisions of schools offer students a natural drop-out point when they are due to move to another school. Where schools include grades one through eight, students tend to leave at the end of grade eight. Where intermediate schools begin at grade six, those who are of age often decide to drop out of the elementary school rather than shift. A number of students leave the intermediate school at either grade nine or ten depending where the break occurs. This issue is further complicated where Indian students are integrated into public schools at grades six and eight.

Another factor abetting drop-out in some areas is integration into religious schools from the reserve system. One example will suffice: Children from reserve X attend an Indian Day (Roman Catholic) School on their reserve until grade six; they are then transported 20 miles past several public schools to attend a city academy for grade seven. Students are then admitted to other Roman Catholic schools spread out through the city for grade eight. They have to transfer again if they wish to attend high school. The transportation of students to this variety of schools is based on Indian Affairs Branch policy on religious education, on school administrative decisions that the Indians not exceed a certain quota of a school's enrolment and on the insistence of some parents and church officials that children attend Roman Catholic and not public schools.

It is not surprising to find that the students from this reserve drop out at grades six, seven and eight and that virtually none of them go into high school. Were the religious factor not present, the students could transfer from grade six to a local public intermediate school which would serve them through grade ten. This would eliminate the experience of trying to integrate into the terminal year of a school where the non-Indian students have been together for seven years. It would also eliminate the necessity of entering three schools in three years, a procedure which few non-Indian parents would tolerate and which can only be educationally adverse.

While the above instance underlines the complexities of providing educational services of the parental faith, the situation is not unique and also occurs in other areas where the issue is not religious. In several areas, children transfer from reserve day schools at grade four or grade six or grade eight. In almost all cases this creates difficulties of integrating over-age and educationally retarded children into a system which may not be prepared to offer them the special help they need in order to adjust both personally and academically. Numerous reports of students who have gone through such transitions reflect the difficulties of getting to know new people in an uncomfortable environment and define particular problems regarding lunches, clothes and marks. Lunches and type of clothing are not a problem in the reserve school because children wear similar types of clothes and go home for lunch. In the integrated situation, many Indian children are chagrined by the obvious differences in appearance between themselves and their peers.

Children who have been obtaining adequate marks on the reserve find themselves failing in the public schools. Discouragement and negativism are created and students who have integrated in upper elementary years have said they would prefer to stay in the reserve school. The other alternative is earlier integration.

Indian parents and some school officials assess the education of Indian children somewhat unrealistically. Parents feel that because their children have four to six more years of education than they themselves obtained that their children are "educated" and should be able to achieve more, obtain employment and have a better life than the parent generation. Similarly, school and government personnel point with gratification to the fact that more Indians are getting more education. Parents and personnel are justified in feeling that their efforts are due merit and recognition. However, the results of education are not in proportion to the increased enrolments and levels of achievement. Parents particularly have difficulty recognizing that the buying power of grade eight education is nil and that in most areas even high school is not sufficient education for employment even for skilled labouring jobs.

It is necessary to evaluate what is happening in the extended years of education. For the child who repeats a grade for the third time, nothing much is happening that is of positive or educative value. He is merely putting in time. Unless remedial measures are taken in such cases and unless the process of education is constantly evaluated, children can sit through ten years of school and gain the background of a grade four student. Personnel on vocational and upgrading programs voice the complaint that "They come in here with grade eight officially but most of them can't read or do math much beyond the grade four or five level." To these instructors falls the task of upgrading students to grade ten in a period of six months.

3. The Age-Grade Picture

Figures for any twelve-year cycle of schooling reflect the same trends. The majority of Indian students enter school late, that is, at seven rather than at six years of age. Approximately 80 per cent of the Indian students are retained in grade one; some are held there for three years. From grade six on, it is more common to find students who have repeated every grade than it is to find students who have been able to complete the work in one year. Only 12 per cent of the Indian students are in their proper age-grade. (Calculations are done on the base of age six-grade one; age seven-grade two and so on.) The average Indian student is 2.5 years behind the average non-Indian student by the end of eighth grade.

Only intensive research in specific areas would provide definitive explanations for the above patterns. The general survey and the results of independent studies yield some insights, however. The reasons for failure in grade one have already been commented on. The progress of the child through grades two and three without undue difficulty may be explained in two ways. Many schools have promotion policies which prohibit holding a child back for more than one year in three. The child who is failed in grade one must then be passed through grade two and three without retention. At the end of grade three he may be placed in a slow learners class until he is judged competent to continue the regular program or he enters grade four which he subsequently fails because he has been accumulating an educational deficit in the previous two years.

The second explanation of the failure in grade four may be that grade two and three work are greatly repetitive and the child has time to assimilate the material especially if he has spent two years in grade one and has completed the process of adjusting to routines. In grade four, many new concepts are introduced as are a few new subject areas. Reading and language become less of a subject and more of a skill. For the child who has not learned to read adequately, grade four work becomes extremely difficult because he needs reading skill in order to cope with all his other subjects. Again, grade five is not so different from grade four and is handled relatively comfortably by the grade four repeater. From grade six on, not only is the material complex but the social situation also becomes a pertinent factor. A change of school about this time may also evoke retarding factors.

If pre-school education were made available to Indian students and if ungraded primary classes were the rule rather than the exception, it is conceivable that the Indian child might be able to overcome his initial retardation on school entry and avoid accumulating a deficit. If schools could offer remedial training to all children from grade one on, it is also possible that Indian children would benefit greatly and that age-grade retardation could be much reduced.

One of the major problems Indian students encounter is the transfer from an all-Indian school to the public school. Students who attend residential school or reserve day schools report that the transition is a difficult one emotionally and academically. No general systematic study was undertaken but several informants indicated that they had been doing well at an all-Indian school and were shocked to find themselves failing in the public school upon transfer. Several who stated that they would have finished school satisfactorily in the Indian school dropped out of the public high school because, "I couldn't get anywhere; I was failing everything." There is no doubt that personal adjustments are harder to make at high school age than in grade one; the impact of a complete change of orientation and routine from the reserve or segregated system to the integrated one requires considerable personal flexibility and courage. According to the students who transfer and the school personnel who receive them, the academic background of students coming from segregated schools is not comparable to that of other children in the system including other Indian students. If the discrepancies were between a D standing in the Indian system and an F standing in the public system, the problem would be understandable. However, many informants reported discrepancies between A and B standing in the Indian system and complete failure upon transfer. Such experiences perplex and shock the students and raise many questions about the type of education the students are receiving in reserve schools. Where students transfer from small village areas to massive high schools, the problem is understandable. But where transfer occurs between relatively large reserve elementary schools and local public schools, the academic discrepancy should be virtually nil. If the student had the security of being able to compete academically, the adjustments required by the transfer would be less overwhelming. When the child cannot compete on any level, it is not surprising that he chooses to withdraw completely.

The importance of early integration and of ensuring adequate academic competence if integration must be delayed is underlined by parents and students and school personnel alike and by the negative results which follow the present circumstances.

4. Attendance

Attendance of Indian children in public schools is sporadic and low. The attendance problem was one defined by all adult informants.

Educators blamed the parents, the Indian Affairs Branch, and the RCMP for their laxness in enforcing compulsory attendance laws. Parents shifted the responsibility to the Indian Affairs Branch. Officials of the Indian Affairs Branch felt the parents had the ultimate responsibility. None of the official organizations (school, Indian Affairs Branch, RCMP, councils) wanted to claim responsibility for attendance or for evaluating a problem which they perceived to be so complex that it seemed impossible to solve.

Children are required to attend school between the ages of six to sixteen. Some systems have probation officers whose job it is to enforce the law. Principals have the right to advise the Family Allowance Branch to discontinue payments unless absent children return to school or attend more regularly. Parents may be prosecuted for not sending their children to school. Children could be placed in foster homes because of their non-attendance at school. Yet, none of these measures provides an effective solution for the large-scale absenteeism of Indian children although individual instances may have been solved by recourse to them.

The suspension of Family Allowances simply increases hardship for the family and may not significantly change attendance patterns. Where children lack sufficient clothes and food to attend school, the withdrawal of funds increases and compounds the problem. The prosecution of parents for failure to send their child to school requires that somebody lay a charge. School personnel are loathe to do so feeling it would alienate the parents even more and that it would add to rather than solve the problem. The RCMP will act only upon direct request of the school or the Indian Affairs Branch. The Indian Affairs Branch hesitates to invoke legal measures for a variety of reasons. The removal of any children from their parents is a drastic and final step. There is a dearth of social welfare workers to deal with individual cases and a lack of suitable foster homes for large numbers of children.

In a few instances, superintendents are attempting to get band councils to take legal action or remedial action of some other sort. The principle of involving the people most concerned is a valid one but this is a problem which experienced educators and administrators have not been able to solve. No band council could withstand the hostility and disruption which would arise if it took the drastic action that others cannot take.

However, reluctance to use the law is not entirely predicated upon an unwillingness to accept responsibility on the part of official agencies involved. There is a strong feeling that the answer is to be found in remedial measures rather than in punitive ones. The reasons for non-attendance vary but they almost always reflect both the student's growing disenchantment with school and the economic problems of the reserve. Significantly, absentee rates for Indians increase with each year in school. The range of absenteeism found is from 10 to 100 days of the 180 day school year. The average Indian child misses 40 days of school. The average white child misses 5-10 days of school. (Rates for all children are higher in primary grades due to infectious children's diseases which keep the average child out of school for 10 days; from third grade on absentee rates decrease steadily for the non-Indian child).

Reasons for Absenteeism

A differentiation must be made between absence for reasons beyond the control of the child and absence because of deliberate choice. The first type of absenteeism includes values held with reference to responsibility of kin. The second type stems from experience in school. In the first instance solutions must evolve from an understanding of the culture of the particular Indian community; in the second case, one must evaluate and perhaps alter school practices.

Many Indian groups have retained some system of kin obligation and reciprocity which affects the lives of all members of the group. If parents want to leave the house for the day or several days, they consider it reasonable to demand that one of the older children assume responsibility for the care of the younger ones. Priority is given to the needs of the parents and less consideration to the child's need to attend school. Most Indian parents agreed school attendance was essential but they also felt that older children had a primary responsibility to family. Values were expressed in statements of the following type: "It's too bad that X has to miss so much school because she gets behind but she has to babysit a lot."[1] No Indian parent questioned the primacy of demands placed upon the child. It was apparent that if the child was wanted at home then nothing else was as important.

Girls were most often kept home to help with younger children, to babysit when parents wanted to be absent, to help with laundry and to help in cases of illness. In several families the older girls rotated these responsibilities so that they all missed a certain number of days per month. In a few cases, older girls who did not like school released younger girls from rotation by volunteering to stay home thus virtually eliminating themselves from attending school.

Boys stayed home to help haul water for laundry, to cut wood and sometimes to care for younger siblings if there were no older girls. They also stayed home when boats or cars needed repairs, to help fish or hunt or trap.

Some of the above absences are precipitated by administrative procedures relating to welfare. For example, in one community Indians requesting supplementary assistance or additional clothing for children must travel to the agency office forty miles away to obtain funds. There they obtain a chit for purchases which is honoured by a store in their own community. Parents in this community often leave an older child in charge of the younger ones while they travel to the agency office. Some of the younger children may resist going to school and the older one may permit them to stay home, perhaps for company. Sometimes children are left without sufficient food and they want to stay close to home, hopeful that their parents will return with groceries as well as other things.

Other absences are also accounted for by the family's moves to seasonal employment. In areas where crop picking jobs are available, children are regularly taken out of school to help pick, since payment is usually made for bulk and even young children can help. Similarly, boys and girls are taken on fishboats early and kept out late in the season to help in various ways. In trapping areas, older children may also be involved in the collecting and preparing of skins.

Other family-related causes for absence have been mentioned earlier, patterns of living which entail late bedtimes and late hours of awakening. Many children do not get to school simply because no one in the house is awake to get them up and off to the bus.

It is difficult to imagine how school attendance can be immediately and greatly improved in the light of demands for children's services, unless these can be replaced where they are needed. Possibly, if the school experience were such that the child himself demanded the right to attend, absenteeism would be much diminished and that much more quickly. As education shows more positive results in the lives of Indians, then home demands for services of children will be lowered also. When education is followed by employment with money circulating back into the home and community pressures will be exerted on children to attend school. At the moment, many children do serve more useful purposes by staying home than by attending school.

Absenteeism due to lack of clothes and lack of food for school lunches could be readily eliminated under existing budgets and policies. The Indian Affairs Branch finances lunches for children attending schools where lunch is available. In schools where no such programs exist a lunch allowance might be given to the students involved. At the moment, the children are penalized in areas where lunch is not paid for. Similarly, it is policy that no child should miss school for lack of adequate clothing. Under local interpretations of the policy, the obtaining of sufficient clothes is dependent upon the attitude and interest of the local administrator and the machinery for processing requests. Barriers such as those cited in the case of the 80 mile trip for a chit for shoes influence attendance and morale in several ways.

Reasons for Absence: School-Related

Many children have personal reasons for not wishing to attend school regularly. Students stated that they stayed home from school because they were afraid of the teacher, they didn't want to be ridiculed, they failed all the time and they just didn't like school.

Young children expressed more fear of the teacher than did older ones. When asked to explain what they feared, students responded that they feared being punished or being brought to the attention of the class, or yelled at. Older children feared ridicule from the teacher and from peers and also feared academic failure. Parents tended to support children who chose to remain home, especially when the children suffered punishment or ridicule in school which was not understood by either parents or the child. Parents discussed the "hard time that kid has in school; other kids are always being mean to him." Sometimes the fear of school was general rather than specific. This seemed the case in areas where the Indian students were overtly discriminated against in the school and where fights and ridicule were not uncommon.

Concern about absenteeism is based on the belief that school is the place the child should be. The question of what is happening to the child at school. is relevant here. If the child is suffering in school, as some of these children are, school is not the place he should be. Children who are frightened or hungry or ridiculed are not free to learn. They are too busy attempting to defend themselves.

The school contributes, unintentionally but nonetheless certainly, to the fear and discomfort of Indian children. Reports from the children include few statements that teachers assist to integrate them into the classroom. When other children ridicule Indian classmates, few teachers use this opportunity to help students evaluate their attitudes. Non-Indian peers contribute to the unwillingness of Indian children to attend school by ridiculing them and by socially isolating them. The Indian child makes comparisons between his behaviour and dress and that of his classmates and feels awkward and uncomfortable. It is simpler and less disturbing to stay home than to attend school. The devaluation of the Indian child and his persistent failure does not help. Teachers who hold children responsible for situations they do not control ("don't come to school until your mother washes your clothes; this is the fifth time you've been late - why doesn't your mother get you up") add to, rather than diminish, absenteeism.

The school community makes many financial and social demands upon its members. Indian children tend not to join school organizations or to fraternize with non-Indian classmates because of the lack of appropriate clothing for given occasions and the funds involved to enjoy them. Seldom do Indian students have allowances or any spare money which might enable them to attend various school events or to socialize with non-Indian friends. Usually the Indian child is isolated further because he is academically retarded and his classmates are younger than himself.

The individual classroom could provide the opportunity for some success, for revision of the attitudes of white children, for elimination of much of the ridicule and for the minimization of many of the little things which contribute to the diminishing self-confidence of the Indian student. If school were a more comfortable place to be and if the Indian student could be a fuller member of the school community many of the fears which keep him away from school would become non-operative. If school buses were rescheduled so that participation in after-school activities were possible or some studying could be done at school before the bus left, the Indian student might find that he could succeed both socially and academically. Use of school showers might eliminate some complaints about personal hygiene; a home economics room might be used by those Indian (and other) students who wished to wash and iron clothes with less difficulty than at home. Teachers might visit reserves to see the conditions from which their students come and get to know parents. This might at least eliminate futile directives such as "don't come to school unless your mother washes your clothes."

5. Indian Attitudes Toward Education

In general Indian adults expressed the attitude "education is good." When reasons were asked for, the most commonly given were: "Education makes life easier;" "Education helps you get along with Whites better;" and "Education helps you get jobs." However, they could not give examples from their own experiences which supported the generalizations.

On the contrary, adult informants could give examples of how education had done none of these things and further how education had proven a humiliating and unsuccessful experience leading to neither better relations with Whites, nor to employment. The goals they first stated could be achieved through education were demonstrably not being achieved, and the reasons for the dropout and absenteeism of their children appeared reasonable in this light.

As a corollary to this, adults give little support to the child as a student. They all claimed that a child's services at home were more important than school. They emphasized their inability to adjust the living pattern of the family to accommodate his schoolwork and need for sleep. Indian adults also recognized that they could give no help to their children in their schoolwork or in their conflicts about school because they did not have the ability and knowledge to do so.

The systems of support for various types of behaviour are subtle ones requiring considerable interpolation by the Indian children. While verbal support for education is given by parents the child also hears many negative stories of his parents' school experiences. Furthermore, there is a gap between what is said and what is done. Indian parents say that their children should attend school but they permit them to stay home for spurious reasons and they also demand that they stay home when their services are needed. Such lack of real support when combined with the lack of educated models within the community and the persuasive quality of the child's own negative experiences in school undermine the positive attractions of becoming educated. The value of having an education has yet to be demonstrated in most Indian communities.

In analyzing the responses, three trends appeared. At best, education is considered in a neutral way. Informants felt that "education is okay" and were not bitter about the failure of education to meet their general expectations. Such parents tended to be helpful in getting the children off to school and in providing them with adequate clothing and lunches. However, If the children disliked school or wanted to drop out, they were neither upset nor opposed to it. The second trend which appeared was where parents openly opposed the education of their children in public schools and were vehement in their denunciation of the experiences which the children were having. These parents questioned the value of being educated at all. Such attitudes represent a very small minority of the sample but they did appear in every area. The third and major trend consisted of the conflicting verbal support of the need for education and behaviour that denied it.

Reasons for devaluation or neutrality are obvious. Few parents are involved in the current system of education. They have virtually no contact with the school. The majority of Indian parents have never been in the school nor had any personal contact with the school staff. They have only their own experiences to remember and the few reports they receive from their children upon which to base their concept of education. Education is the great unknown so Indian parents find themselves in an awkward position when asked what they think. They have no way of evaluating an unknown and no way of measuring the gap between their own experiences and current public education. They base their opposition on their feelings about their own education, the recognition that it did not make life easier or better for them, the perception of the discomfort of their children and the need to maintain a known quantity: their own way of life. Since the educative process impinges in such a minimal way in their daily lives, they tend to remain relatively neutral about it and to expend their energy and commitments on the things that are significant to them.

In general, parents felt that public schooling was preferable to segregated schooling. This conclusion was based on their negative feelings about their own residential schooling and reserve schooling. It was also based on the idea that segregated education had not helped them to achieve their goals of employment and "a better life" and that white people seemed to achieve such things. They felt the discrepancy might be eliminated by having their children obtain the same type of education as white children. The idea that public schooling helps Indian children "learn about Whites" was quite general. Parents feel such learning will help their children interact more than they can with non-Indians on an equal basis.

Some parents felt that segregated schools are preferable to public schools for their children. This opinion was expressed most frequently on reserves where social disorganization was high, where there was mass alcoholism and where income was severely restricted. Where such living conditions prevailed, parents felt that children would be safer and better off in residential schools. Parents also felt that children who attended residential schools seemed to complete more years of education than those who went to local schools. Other parents wanted reserve schools retained and re-opened where public schooling was proving difficult for children.

On the whole, Indian adults were more in favor of public education than of reserve education or residential schooling. However, the majority of parents were opposed to having the very young children off the reserve. They felt that an ideal schooling plan would include kindergarten and primary school on the reserve and all other education in public schools. At the same time, parents recognized that it is harder for the older children to transfer into the public schools than it is for the beginning students to start in the public system. Part of the concern about attendance of the primary children at public schools was that the distance from the reserve to town was often a long one and the children could not come home for lunch and parents could not check on their welfare. The anxiety of mothers about young children is understandable when one remembers that they do not know what the child is going into, how he will be treated and what will happen to him among non-Indians. Older children who have had negative experiences contribute to this anxiety.

In summary, a good many parents are neutral and would welcome encouragement and some proof of the value of education. The failure of educational systems to resocialize children so that they can function adequately outside the reserve system and its success in partially socializing children so they seek goals they cannot obtain leaves many parents in the difficult position of dealing with unhappy and restless youth. Until the schools resolve their own dilemmas in dealing with minority groups and until Indian parents can reformulate their ideas about education through more direct experience with current school systems, the attitudes and motivation for education are likely to remain primarily neutral ov negative.

6. Attitudes of Indian Students Toward Education

Indian students expressed no neutral attitudes toward education in general or toward specific types of education. Negative attitudes were prevalent among older children but many positive ones were found, also. Students, more than their parents, were able to evaluate their school experiences differentially and had definite ideas on various topics relating to education.

Students who had attended reserve or residential schools and then transferred to public school reported liking public schools better because of the diversity of experiences they offered. Most of the exceptions to this occurred in areas where reserve life was so unpleasant and difficult that children preferred to live in residential schools. The same preference was held in areas where discrimination in the public schools and in the White community was high. In general, Indian students claimed they disliked residential schools because of the restrictive regulations. Hostel students who attended local high schools were unanimous in their preference for such arrangements. Younger students who had only attended public school assumed that they would prefer it to reserve schooling were they given a choice. Older children who had integrated in upper elementary years reported too many difficulties in transferring and stated they would have preferred to continue in their reserve schools. Residential school transferees stated that they preferred being home and liked attending public school but also reported difficulty in the transfer. Many of this group dropped out in the year of transfer.

Students, like their parents, will state that education is the means to employment. In fact, however, they drop out before completion of high school and many after giving this first response were quite free in admitting that their expectations and plans were directed toward early school leaving rather than toward completion.

Judging from the consistent vagueness of their responses to queries on the value of education and the potential problems of early school leaving, it is reasonable to conclude that students are not strongly and personally involved in the educational process. The school and the Indian students seem to have no more significant communication than do the school and Indian parents. The student has little conception of what he is gaining by attending school; he recognizes that he is failing academically and that he is socially isolated. He cannot relate school activity with the future because of his lack of experience with the demands of life in an urban setting. His evaluations are made in the light of his immediate life to which education seemingly has little relevance. He cannot relate the education he is receiving to his life and the lives of his friends and relatives. He does not see models who would extend his horizons and make the concept of gains through education more real.

How do Indian youth view school? In general, Indian students see school as a place in which they spend a given number of hours each day during which they learn few things of relevance, and in which they are faced with academic and social difficulties. The degree of disenchantment varies from place to place and also varies directly with the degree of discrimination toward Indians. The prime compensation of school attendance mentioned by most students was that they had good friends or that they participated in some sport which they enjoyed. The school system is perceived as unchangeable and students conclude that if they cannot meet the requirements of the school, they are automatically unable to succeed at anything in the non-Indian world.

7. Problems of Indian Students Perceived by Parents and Students

Parents and youth perceive the problems of youth in school with considerable consistency. Both cited lack of adequate clothing and lunches as major problems. The problem of discrimination was raised in several instances and students mentioned "feeling stupid all the time" and "not belonging" as other major sources of discomfort. In addition, specific items of concern were mentioned such as unjust discipline, lack of achievement and problems related to absenteeism.

The problem of lunches and clothes need not be dealt with in any further detail. The matter of discrimination was defined in several ways. Some students and parents felt generally discriminated against "just because we're Indians". In most cases, the mention of discrimination was specific and was related to a particular school or teacher or administrator. In some instances discrimination was defined as "being picked on by the teacher" and when explored further turned out to be more a question of misunderstanding about expected behaviour than a matter of discriminatory practice. Parents complained, for example, that "those teachers are always picking on him because he's late". Parents failed to understand that the school demands certain behaviour from all children and that such demands are not necessarily discriminatory. Parents sometimes cited the fact that more Indian children failed certain grades than did non-Indians and they perceived this as discriminatory practice against Indians. In many of these cases, the students themselves were aware that they were not being discriminated against and most students felt that with the exception of a few specific teachers, they were only "picked on when they (other Indians) ask for it".

Such misunderstandings clearly evolve from different cultural orientations. Indian parents expect the schools to accept their children as they are and not to make demands of them that they themselves would not make. This particularly becomes an issue with reference to disciplinary matters. Parents fail to understand why their children "are always in trouble" at school. In actuality, Indian children seldom are considered disciplinary problems as defined by school authorities. However, they are reprimanded for tardiness, uncleanliness and a host of other things; these reprimands are interpreted by parents and some of the students as "always being in trouble" or "picked on."

The same kind of sensitive perception shows in the definition of failure which is seen as the result of the personal relationship between student and teacher, without any reference to the type of work done by the child and with no understanding of the academic requirements demanded of all students. In such cases, parents talked about their children "being hurt" by the teacher which when reinterpreted meant he had failed his year. Some students stated that they did not return to school "because I felt too hurt when I failed again last year". The high sensitivity with regard to these kinds of situations needs to be more clearly understood and defined before any solutions can be suggested.

Such misunderstandings would be reduced if parents and students gained a broader and more accurate idea of the demands the school must make on all children. Whether understanding would eliminate the feelings of personal hurt and affront and permit perceptions to be redefined cannot be assessed. The lack of significant communication between home and school certainly contributes to the misinterpretation of events and permits the building up of personally hurtful feelings that make the situation more complex than it need be. While it does not lessen the problematic nature of the situation, it was rewarding to discover that the incidence of actual discriminatory practice in the schools is low and that students themselves are aware of this.

8. Attitudes of Indian Students and Parents Toward Early School Leaving

All Indian parents indicated that they felt early school leaving was wrong, but no parents were prepared to take action to try to keep their children in school. The decision of the student was considered the final one and no parents had considered discussing the matter with school personnel or anyone else. In most instances, students and parents had not discussed the student's dropout and parents had simply accepted the decision of the student. Students indicated they had not discussed their decision to drop out of school with any adult at home or at school. Some dropouts had discussed their feelings with their friends. In some communities Indian adults expressed the view that students should not leave school but they also indicated that this was a decision only the student could make. In no Indian communities were there any negative sanctions applied to youth who had left school early. No informants expressed any sense of shame or guilt with reference to early school leaving.

The reasons given by youth for early school leaving were universal ones: boredom, lack of money, desire for a job, needed at home. Pregnancy was given as a reason in a few cases only. Some students had been in juvenile detention and had not returned to school after their release. Several students said they left school because they "felt stupid in classes with all those little kids".

Dropouts expressed a wish that they had completed school because they are not able to obtain work and because they are ineligible for vocational training courses. Others expressed no regret for their early school leaving and stated they would make the same decision again if faced with the same circumstances. Some dropouts said that they wished they could return to school now and felt that if they could they would ultimately be able to obtain employment. Many dropouts indicated that they did not feel that anything could be done to reverse the effects of their decision but that they were urging their younger siblings to complete high school "so things would be better for them."

Dropouts indicated that they might have stayed in school if someone had discussed their decision with them and encouraged them to keep trying. The importance of support was confirmed by students who are still in school despite the fact that they are over age and that their friends have dropped out. Such students said that their reasons for staying in school depended basically on the interest of an individual teacher or adult who was encouraging them to complete school.

In summary, the question of early school leaving is not a significant one to the Indians themselves because so few have completed school in various communities that they are the exceptions rather than the rule. No sanctions are applied within these communities against early school leavers because there are no strongly held convictions about the value of completing high school. Until some concrete results are seen by individuals and communities which stem directly from education, it is unlikely that any strong pressures will be exerted for youth to complete school.

9. Aspirations, Self-Image and Vocational Goals of Indian Youth

It is possible to separate the variables of self-image, aspirations and vocational choice for the purposes of discussion. In reality, they constitute an interdependent cluster which effectively determines the direction of an individual's life. When aspirations cannot be attained and no substitution of goals is made, the self-image is reduced. A low self-image can also lower an individual's level of aspiration and thus effectively reduce his range of vocational alternatives.

In general, aspirations of Indian youth lower significantly when they become consciously aware that the opportunities for attaining their aspirations are limited. Self-images of Indian youth become increasingly negative with age. Vocational goals are restricted to those occupations which Indian youth (and others) identify as being "typically Indian"...and by low confidence in their own ability.

It is difficult to imagine how an Indian child attending an ordinary public school could develop anything but a negative self- image. First, there is nothing from his culture represented in the school or valued by it. Second, the Indian child often gains the impression that nothing he or other Indians do is right when compared to what non-Indian children are doing. Third, in both segregated and integrated schools, one of the main aims of teachers expressed with reference to Indians is "to help them improve their standard of living, or their general lot, or themselves" which is another way of saying that what they are and have now is not good enough; they must do and be other things. In addition to these attitudes are the already cited problems of Indian children attending school.

One Indian informant, an attractive and charming 19 year old girl, had accurately assessed the atmosphere in her school and was determined to succeed in spite of it. She said, "I have to complete school because I am an Indian. Indians have to try harder to be better than everyone else because they are Indians. If more Indians could succeed then maybe the idea that Indians can never do anything would be done away with and we wouldn't have to prove ourselves all the time.'

Most human beings have a need to achieve. This is usually directed toward a defined goal. If the individual does not perceive that he has some possibility of achieving his goal, he substitutes a more accessible goal or he stops trying to reach the goal at all. Studies done in the course of the project indicated that there is little reliability to be placed in the common belief that Indians have less motivation than non-Indians. It is not true that Indian children, as a group, lack motivation in the elementary years to do well. However, it has already been established that young Indian children fail from the onset of their educational experiences. With each failure, motivation, self-image and level of aspiration drop.

It has already been stated that in general Indian people in reserves tend to have little faith in their own abilities to control their environment and lives. The Indian student comes to have these characteristics. He comes to accept his failures and to believe that there is nothing he can do to alter his status and proceeds to complete the self-fulfilling prophecy of the "inadequate and unmotivated Ind Ian."

If the Indian student is faced with the decision of trying to complete school in lieu of obtaining low-level employment immediately, he chooses the employment. Not only does it mean immediate income, it also fits his concept of "what Indians do" and is a more realistic choice when one considers his low expectations for academic success. The Indian's low level of aspiration agrees with his low self-image and his genuine belief that he cannot go beyond the limited range of goals established by the Indians he knows and by the additional restrictions imposed by non-Indians.

Apart from the beliefs of the Indian himself in relation to self-image, aspirations and vocational choices, the dearth of information available to him about alternatives seriously limits his choices. In only a few communities were Indians aware of the availability of funds and training programs through the Indian Affairs Branch and almost no Indians had any information about provincial facilities and opportunities. High school informants stated that the counsellor or principal had information available and gave it to those who asked. Most of them were too shy to go to the office of either principal or the counsellor. Upper-elementary students had access to no information through the schools.

When questioned, Indian Affairs Branch personnel indicated that they send information to all superintendents; superintendents stated that they passed it on to the Indian councils and that it was up to the councils to tell the students. Considering the little amount of time superintendents spend on each reserve owing to their heavy assignments, it seems unlikely that much discussion of vocational opportunities could take place. In addition, it would be unusual for members of councils to disseminate such information, even if they had it, to all adolescents on the reserve. The procedure is now highly ineffective. Students know nothing about various programs and available funds except in a few cases where some individuals have left the reserve for training under Indian Affairs Branch or provincial auspices. Some Indian Affairs Branch personnel indicated that they made no effort to disseminate information because in their opinion "the Indians aren't ready for it yet; there's no one in this agency who could make it through any of the courses." Such procedures do not provide opportunities for those who might be capable nor do they extend the very narrow horizons of many adolescents who might attempt some training if they knew about it.

Even were the information easily available, the negative self-images and low levels of aspiration of adolescents would tend to make them incapable of exploiting the various opportunities. The self-images of youth are pervasively negative and low. Their stated verbal aspirations reflect internalized middle-class goals but immediate and more realistic choices are made on the basis of personal experience and perceived opportunity. The array of occupational roles within the Indian community is limited and the perception of possibilities for success in the White community is low. Therefore, occupational choices remain restricted to non-skilled and semi-skilled categories of work. Where vocational guidance in the form of information or counselling is available it reinforces the tendency to choose those occupations which both Indians and non-Indians identify as ones "in which Indians can succeed."

10. Attitudes of Non-Indians Toward Indians

It has been posited several times that the attitudes of non-Indians toward Indians determines in a crucial way the attitudes of Indians toward themselves, their perception of possibilities for success off the reserve and their general status within the wider community. It seems appropriate to examine the data more closely to evaluate what types of attitudes the Indian encounters in daily interaction with Whites. The discussion will be limited to those encounters which Indians have with Whites who play a decisive role in the regulation of their lives. There was no way of obtaining data on Indian-White encounters which are purely casual.

Public school personnel encounter Indians primarily in the classroom. They have many ideas about what Indians are and should be, what some of the problems facing Indians are and what some of the solutions might be. Attitudes toward Indians were characterized by a genuine concern and a high level of inaccurate knowledge. Because most school officials have not been on reserves and have had virtually no contact with Indian parents, their beliefs about Indians and Indian life are predicated upon stereotyped information, misinterpretation of Indian behaviour in the classroom and a questionable use of standardized group intelligence tests.

In general, school authorities are convinced that Indian parents do not care about their children. This belief is based on the fact that Indian parents do not appear at the school when summoned for a conference, do not attend PTA, do not get their children to school clean and on time, send them without lunches, allow absenteeism and do not enforce study hours and regular bedtime hours. The above list is factual but it is being interpreted by members of one culture without reference to or understanding of the cultural context of Indian behaviour. Many teachers quite genuinely believe that Indians do not care for their children because they do not keep them clean and send them to school on time. Such teachers have not considered that Indian parents can exhibit their care in other ways than cleanliness and punctuality. Teachers also believe that adequate evidence of the retardation of Indian students is that they always scored low on intelligence tests and were at the bottom of the class. Some teachers recognized the lack of validity of the tests for Indian students and some understood that Indian students are not necessarily lacking in intelligence although their test and school performance indicated that they are. In general, teachers did not expect Indian students to perform well in school at any level.

Administrators stated that they did not believe in any innate differences in ability between Indian and White students but that Indian students were under-achievers because of the reserve milieu. Several administrators believed that "nothing can be done until reserves are abolished". They believed the reserve milieu reinforced negative attitudes toward school, work and the attainment of decent standards of living. The administrators perceived the problem of educating Indian children as a problem emanating from the reserve system and few felt that the school could or might provide opportunities for success for the Indian student because "we cannot fight the reserve system and all its implications."

The matter of intelligence tests is a serious one. The tests are known to be invalid for all populations except the one for which they were standardized, that is, English-speaking White middle-classes of an urban group. Non-Indian children from any other than the urban middle-class tend to score low on the tests; many minority group children are low-scorers when measured by such tests. Even children from the middle-class can score low on group tests on any given day for a variety of reasons. The Indian child has little likelihood of scoring adequately on the tests because of the time they are given, because they bear little relationship to the things he knows, and because he has low reading ability and perhaps also because his patterns of perception and abstraction may vary from those of his middle-class White peers.

The tests are given to all children at the beginning of grade one and at the end of grade one as well as in other grades throughout the school life of the child. Results are entered on the student's permanent Record Card and follow him from class to class and from school to school. Even if a teacher is aware that test results may not be accurate, it would be difficult for Whim to look at a series of below-normal scores on a child's PRC and not conclude that the child has low ability. If school systems had adequate facilities for slow learners, almost every Indian child in the country would be in one on the basis of his intelligence and achievement test results.

One example of the misuse of tests may suffice to make the point that the tests are not useful with minority group children and that a great deal of harm is done by using and recording them. In community X, 1400 students were given two tests: the Otis Quick Scoring and the California Test of Mental Maturity. Both are paper and pencil tests and both purport to measure achievement and intelligence. The tests were administered by the staff of a regional mental health clinic who had never been to community X before; their testing trip took three days which they spent in the school. Of the 1400 students, 189 were Indians from the local reserve. When the tests were completed, 200 children were classified as "ineducable" which means that they should have special education not normally provided in the average school. Of the 200 considered "ineducable", 164 were Indian. Of a total Indian student enrolment of 189, 164 were considered "ineducable."

The Indians came from a hunting-trapping reserve where there is also some seasonal employment on roadwork and the railways. Many of the people speak only Cree; most of the first grade children speak only Cree. With the exception of the superintendent for Indian schools for the area, no one questioned the test results. They were duly recorded on the children's PRC's and the discussion of what to do about this problem began. The action taken was to establish several remedial classes. But, like many remedial classes without specially-trained personnel and facilities, the program became not a dynamic and directed process but one of repetition of standard work at a slower and watered down pace. No course for teaching English as a second language was instituted; few new teaching techniques or materials were employed and little enthusiasm about educating these children was generated because they were accepted unquestionably as "ineducable".

While the situation described above has its own special features, it is not at all unique. Throughout the country, group IQ tests are being used as evidence of the unteachability of certain children and few questions are being asked by school personnel with reference to reliability and validity of the tests. School boards are expending considerable sums of money on the tests and results are being recorded. Children with a teacher who genuinely believes that they are "ineducable" or "slow learners" are more likely to perform at that level.

School personnel expressed a genuine concern about the types of home the Indian student came from, which they referred to in such terms as "poor homes" and "drunken homes". Few positives were perceived. Some school personnel stated that Indian children were "dirty, apathetic and like their parents". School personnel perceived their role with regard to Indians as being one of "helping the Indians make something of themselves." Such devaluation of all things Indian leaves little opportunity for the Indian student to flourish and grow with any self-confidence when he meets such attitudes daily, however sincere and kind the individual teacher may be in endeavouring to help the Indian. One teacher who had been teaching Indians for several years explained that "if you treat them like people, they ultimately begin to act like them.'

In general, superintendents felt that integrated education was a good practice. They found that public schooling for Indians created new problems of transportation, absenteeism, money, books and forms which they had not had to deal with when the reserve schools were in operation. The additional workload may have tended to make some individuals feel that integrated education had come too soon for many Indians and that it simply created more problems for administrators. Several superintendents questioned whether or not Indian students were capable of succeeding in integrated schools and cited the standards of living and attitudes of the Indian community as factors inhibiting possible success. Many felt that public schooling would not be effective until "something happens on the reserve" and were in favour of removing children from the influence of adult Indians through foster home and hostel programs so "that they will know what a decent life is."

Superintendents reflected some ambivalence about procedures which might help Indians achieve a different standard of living, a job and a higher level of education. They stated that the standard of reserve living must change before children will feel comfortable In school and before true socializing between Indians and non-Indians can take place. However, they are also aware that handing the key of a new house to an Indian does not raise his standard of living nor guarantee that things will be better.

The uncertainty of the superintendents toward integrated education is the counterpart of the Indian's uncertainty. The superintendents have been committed to programs which have brought partial results but which also are constantly changing and under criticism. The problems of reserve administration are so diffuse that solutions are difficult to perceive. Superintendents view public schooling as a step forward but they are cautious in inferring that it might be the means through which things could change. They have tried many things that might have brought change but did not.

Their ambivalence about the efficacy of public schooling for Indians hinders their ability to encourage parents to keep children in school or to discuss the issue when a joint agreement is proposed. Indian adults indicated that the superintendent did mention joint schooling to them but that there was little time spent on discussion. Such lack of time for discussion accounts for a good deal of the misunderstanding of parents. Parents complain that the superintendent did not tell them that the "kids would all have to go to the White school - even the little ones." Parents also state that they were not alerted that they could decide whether the children could stay on the reserve or attend the local public school. If integrated education is to succeed, the issue of joint schooling must be presented to Indian parents with all the pros and cons outlined fully and well in advance of the time at which a decision must be made.

Public Health personnel encounter Indians both on the reserve and in the public health clinics. School nurses also deal with Indian students. The attitude of public health personnel toward Indian people is primarily positive and they expend a great deal of time on educational health programs, childcare programs and general matters of health. Of all the officials they are the people who spend the most time in direct contact with Indian families, and Indian attitudes toward health personnel are primarily positive and cooperative.

Health personnel commented on the lack of adequate sleep and proper diet which affected the performance of school children. Cleanliness also was mentioned as a problem because nurses must deal with the students who have lice, scabies and who are just generally dirty. Such cases arise owing to the lack of sanitation facilities on the reserve and in some cases because of the lack of time, effort and understanding of parents whose children suffer from filth diseases, chronic infections and malnutrition. The control and treatment of chronic cases of this type require adequate sanitation facilities, time and effort. The incidence of malnutrition is not reported to be high. However, chronic low-grade infections due to inadequate diet and decaying teeth are reported to be high. Such low-grade infections reduce the physical vitality of the child, often leaving him tired and listless.

Indian children do not have regular medical care in most instances. Their parents take them to the clinic or doctor when there is an acute illness. Unfortunately, many Indian parents do not recognize certain illnesses at their inception and children are often not treated for illnesses which produce secondary infections and chronic conditions. As a result many Indian children have marginal sight and hearing as well as chronic upper-respiratory infections. Since Indian children tend to be quiet and their quietness is accepted by teachers as characteristic, it might prove valuable to initiate medical examinations for Indian children upon school entry. In this way, chronic infections and marginal problems could be diagnosed before the child is so behind in work that he cannot catch up. It is not uncommon for young children to compensate for marginal sight and hearing in the early grades through a variety of ways. The repetitive nature of the teaching material permits many children to fill in the words they have missed hearing by the third or fourth repetition. However, such conditions do not permit maximum learning and could easily be remedied in most instances.

Health personnel were more concerned about the mental health than the physical health of many Indian children who came from homes which were seriously deprived and disorganized. Several informants indicated that a group of disturbed individuals is being created on those reserves characterized by severe poverty, alcoholism and family disorganization. Cases were cited of homes where parents habitually abused the children, where parents were too depressed to maintain family stability and where parents abandoned their children for days at a time. Many examples of such conditions can be found. Non-Indian children coming from similar homes would predictably exhibit pathological symptoms which would be recognized by school officials. Paradoxically, it is difficult to find many Indian children whose behaviour indicates true pathological disturbance as classically defined. However, symptoms may be culturally masked. Children who appear quiet may in actuality be depressed or withdrawn and it is difficult to assess which child is disturbed and which is not. Children who appear retarded may be disturbed but diagnosis is seldom made since such children do not disrupt classroom order and since Indians are stereotyped as "quiet and passive".

The question which arises is whether the pathology of disturbance of Indian individuals is exhibited in ways which non-Indians have not yet learned to recognize. Alternately, there may be adequate compensations within the Indian milieu which override the anticipated pathology. Little research has been done on mental health of Indian populations. It is possible, for example, that the Indian child's perception of stress varies considerably from that of the non-Indian in such matters as abandonment. Indian children left alone for several days may not feel rejected or abandoned. They may feel this is a normal pattern of life and may also feel a sense of security from knowing that they may call on any band member for assistance if they require it. The sense of anxiety which non-Indian children would feel in this situation may be absent from the Indian child's purview. Some behaviour which is considered deviant in non-Indian culture is accommodated easily on the reserve. This provides many more outlets for stress and tension and also provides a generally less restrictive environment than does White middle-class society. Such provisions may account for the lack of overt acute disturbance evidenced by Indian populations in general.

While Indian society may be providing adequate security and outlets for individuals which offset the disruptive effects of severe deprivation, White society may be introducing new stresses which the Indian society may not be able to accommodate. The stresses of school attendance have been outlined already. The conflict which faces Indian youth with an impossible choice between drastically different ways of life may be contributing to the creation of a large group of individuals who have little adaptability to existing conditions, who withdraw daily from contacts with the larger society and whose resiliency may prove low if they are forced to leave the supportive milieu of the reserve.

To summarize: attitudes of non-Indian personnel working with Indians determine the attitudes of Indians toward themselves and toward non-Indians generally. The range of attitudes of superintendents, health personnel, school personnel and others varies from very negative to slightly positive. Many officials are genuinely interested in working with Indians but many have become discouraged by their lack of progress and by their perceptions of the immensity of the job they have to do. Indians are sensitive to the discouragement of officials and they tend to react by withdrawing and by exhibiting their desperation or hostility. Indians faced with the attitude of "what can be done about the Indians" feel that there is not much to be done.

Children exhibit the same one-to-one type of response to non-Indian attitudes. When teachers expect Indian children to work well and succeed, and give them some additional help in the classroom, Indian children tend to perform adequately. When teachers class Indians as slow learners and non-achievers, the children do not try to succeed because they are convinced that they cannot. The penchant of some Indian groups for accepting the attitude of officials with regard to their capabilities results in their showing these capabilities. As long as Indians accept the limitations imposed upon them by White attitudes and as long as teachers and officials feel equally overwhelmed by the low expectancy for success of their programs, there is not likely to be any break-through. If each group could evaluate their own limitations and assets more objectively and if programs could be run cooperatively between agencies then hopes for success would be higher and quite realistic. In the final analysis, however, the one-to-one relationship between an Indian and a White appears to be the major determinant in the establishment of an atmosphere which allows each individual to use his potentialities to the maximum degree in seeking a comfortable and successful route to achievement.

III. RESTATEMENT AND COMMENT

The following Section outlines major areas of concern about the present status of education of Indians in the public schools and attempts to provide some guidelines for change where it seems possible and vital. We are aware that our suggestions do not fit all situations nor reflect the needs of all Indian students. However, in the majority of instances where they are required changes can be made with comparative ease within the existing administrative structure.

1. Orientation and Success

The average Indian child enters the public school system with an orientation considerably different to that of the non-Indian child. The difference in orientation creates a discontinuity of experience which places him in a disadvantageous position relative to his classmates. Specific problems which confront the child at the beginning are his lack of familiarity with the books, scissors, crayons, routines, expectations and schedules of the school. The Indian child is not ready to use the tools of the school until he familiarizes himself with them, and while he is engaged in this task, his White peers are learning skills such as reading and writing. The Indian child begins to drop behind the pace of the majority of children in this class. Some children in some schools overcome this initial lag. The more common case is for the Indian child to build a cumulative deficit which hampers his ability to perform successfully in the upper grades. By the fifth grade the child has experienced so much failure and is so demoralized that he withdraws from the learning process as much as he can and aspires to leave school at the first opportunity.

It seems crucial that the Indian child should have some opportunity to succeed in his first year in school. If he could succeed initially the child might continue to strive to overcome some of his academic deficiencies in the subsequent years. Nursery schools and kindergartens could prepare the child to participate more fully in the first grade programs. Several public school systems have kindergarten programs and some Indian children are enrolled in them. First grade teachers report that Indian children coming into grade one from kindergartens are more advanced than Indian children who have not attended the classes. However, these children do not seem to become adequately prepared for grade one in one year of kindergarten and many of them still repeat grade one.

The type of program which would seem best suited to the needs of the Indian child would be a nursery school and kindergarten program on the reserve. A reserve nursery school and public school kindergarten might be equally effective. A reserve nursery school and kindergarten program would accomplish several things. It would allow a specially trained teacher to teach the children the things they need to know by school entry. It would expand the horizons of the child through direct experiences with a variety of play media, books, records, and short trips in the locality. If such nursery schools could be established on a cooperative basis, parents could be involved in programming and in the educational process. This involvement might lead to continued interest in the child's public school experience which would increase understanding and communication between the home and the school to everyone's benefit. Such programs might also stimulate adults to improve their own educational level both in order to be able to help their children and for their own general benefit.

The nursery and kindergarten teachers can use material and ideas from the background of the child with more freedom than the average public school teacher. This would enable the child to have an initial educational experience which does not circumscribe his sense of worth or completely devalue his world. At the same time, the child could become familiar with the demands of the larger world with regard to routines and procedures within a classroom in the minimal way that they are followed in such classes.

It has become Indian Affairs Branch policy to establish kindergartens in areas where public schools have no such programs.

We heartily endorse this policy. In addition, consideration should be given to the establishment of cooperative nursery schools on all reserves. The value of keeping existing kindergartens open even where public schools are instituting such programs should not be underestimated. On larger and more urban reserves, children may have sufficient experience to attend public school at age five but in the majority of cases it would appear beneficial to retain the child in a program specially designed to overcome the deficiencies which create problems for him on school entry. Given adequate preparation in such a program, there appears to be no reason why Indian children should not succeed in grade one.

2. Communication

The success and failure of any child in the school system is dependent upon his own ability, the teaching ability of the staff and the ability of each to communicate in a variety of ways. Most schools endorse a middle-class orientation and are structured to perpetuate it and most teachers are members of that class, as is the average school child. This ensures that the average child and the teacher have a number of shared values. Their expectations with regard to each other are understood and are supported by administrative edict and parental consent. The teacher and the child are in a position to interpret each other's behaviour, to seek similar goals and to communicate verbally and non-verbally.

Minority group children and majority group teachers have a reduced number of shared orientations and correspondingly communication is reduced. This creates difficulties in the learning situation which are often manifested through misinterpretation of behaviour or failure to meet expectations. This sometimes results in punishments meted out by the teacher and the consistent failure of the child to gain rewards for what he does. When the child comes from a different culture and a different language background, the problems of communication are compounded for both the teacher and the child.

Communication is a vital element in teaching as in all human relationships. The young child in the classroom is in no position to break down the barriers to easy communication. He completely lacks the knowledge and the skills to do so, particularly in the overwhelmingly alien environment in which he finds himself.

The teacher is in a significantly better position. He controls the situation; he has more knowledge and experience in human affairs and he can acquire the necessary specific knowledge and skills which would improve the situation. Some teachers already have some formal training in psychology, sociology and anthropology, which could give sufficient insight to make them aware that the behaviour of the child from a minority group is not necessarily deviant but is simply different. Such disciplines should also have prepared the teacher to help the child maintain his sense of worth while also learning behaviour appropriate to the circumstances and the social situation which surrounds him. The importance of formal background and training for people who will be teaching children from minority groups cannot be over-emphasized.

In-service training might also prove helpful in overcoming the lack of a teacher's understanding of such children. Some school boards have allowed early dismissal of classes to enable teachers to hold conferences on particular groups of children in their schools who present difficulties to personnel unfamiliar with their backgrounds. Such conferences call in a wide variety of people for consultation and have been enthusiastically received by teachers. In areas where joint agreements are being negotiated, it might prove worthwhile to have a cooperative in-service program arranged under the auspices of the Indian Affairs Branch and the local board so that the full resources of each could be utilized.

Teachers do not have an overabundance of time free from their many duties. This creates the need for parents to visit the school for conferences with the teacher. The Indian parent feels uncomfortable about going to the school. However, contact between the school and the parents must be established if understanding is to evolve and if the two are not to be kept at cross-purposes. The teacher receiving a dirty unkempt child into the classroom has a good basis for personal objection. However, if he were to see the circumstances from which the child came the teacher might instead feel amazement at the state of cleanliness of the child. Whatever he feels, seeing the situation first-hand might help the teacher understand that condemning the child solves no problems and creates several. Home and school must have contact for many reasons, not the least important of which is to save the child from being pushed into a role of middleman which is intolerable and confusing to him. Teachers and parents in direct communication with each other might come to a better understanding of the difficulties involved for each group in carrying out its responsibilities and might identify the areas of conflict between the goals each perceives for children in school. Such understanding could lead to an acceptance of the differences and limitations inherent in the viewpoints of teachers and parents. Acceptance would possibly pave the way for more direct involvement of parents in the educational process and the subsequent interest and support they would provide for their children.

Understanding the problems and differences in the background of the Indian child would also enable the teacher to help other children understand and accept behaviour and conditions which create tensions within the classroom. The less isolated the Indian child, the more hope for his success in school and his personal growth and development.

The child can also learn things about non-Indian society which will broaden his understanding and comprehension of the necessity for rules and regulations, for certain types of behaviour and for the expectations with which he is confronted. He can only learn these things if the teacher realizes he does not already know them (as do the other children) and will take the time to explain and teach as such things arise throughout the year.

3. Joint Agreements

The matter of joint agreements has been dealt with in other sections of this Report. It needs discussion here only in reference to the need for communication between parents and the Indian Affairs Branch prior to such negotiations and the subsequent ramifications for communication between the Indian parents and the schools. The policy of the Indian Affairs Branch has been to consult with parents prior to negotiating a joint agreement with various boards. The purpose of such consultations is to gain the consent and support of the Indians for public school education for their children. In general, such consent has not been difficult to obtain. However, parents are not in a position to evaluate their decision and to give or withhold consent in any meaningful way unless they have some concept of what the issue is. Most parents have never been inside a public school, do not know how they differ from reserve schools or what kind of experiences the child will have there. They assume that the experience for their children in the public schools will be essentially the same as it was in the reserve schools. When they discover that this is not the case and that most children experience both personal and academic difficulties, parents feel that they have been misled into consenting. Their feeling is understandable even though there has been no intent to mislead.

Part of the difficulty arises from the lack of time available to the administrator who must obtain the consent of the parents. Were he able to spend more time discussing the matter, and to arrange for parents and children to visit the local school and have an opportunity to discuss things with the staff, the problem might not arise. Such procedures would also give the local board time to consider their decision. Then if a joint agreement were decided upon, both parents and school personnel would have clearer concepts of the problems inherent in the move as well as its many advantages.

Officials involved in such procedures would have the opportunity for direct observation of attitudes of Indians and Whites toward each other and might be able to assess whether such an agreement would be to the personal advantage of the children concerned. In cases where the parties appear very dubious, it might be worthwhile not to pursue formal agreements until further groundwork can be done. Then the damaging effects of a broken agreement can be avoided.

4. Levels of Living

The low levels of living of the various Indian groups contribute to the physical and emotional undermining of the child and affect his school performance. The majority of Indian children do not receive regular medical attention. Few receive medical examination prior to school entry. Many children suffer from marginal eyesight and hearing defects and have chronic low-grade infections which contribute to their apathy. Some children do not receive sufficient food and sleep to support their activity through the school day.

Housing and sanitation conditions on many reserves contribute to illness, fatigue and marginal health of school children. The lack of privacy in overcrowded houses disrupts sleep and any attempts to study. The economic situation of various families often requires the services of children either as workers or as babysitters in order that parents may be released to work or travel. The economic status of the family also determines the quantity and type of food the child receives and whether there are sufficient clothes for the child to attend school in all types of weather. The availability of proper clothing also affects the attendance of older children in public schools who feel uncomfortable in the clothes they have obtained through bargain and rummage sales.

In general it would seem that the more economically depressed the reserve and the more depressed the people, the higher the rate of conflict and disruption and the more likely the existence of heavy and frequent drinking. Such factors affect the attitudes of children toward life in general, toward school and the future in particular. In general children from disorganized and alcoholic families miss school more often and suffer from a variety of negative factors. Their chances for completing school and succeeding appear to be much lower than those of Indian students from less depressed and disrupted areas.

Other recommendations set out earlier in the Report were that some arrangement be made so that Indian children can obtain lunches through the school; that Indian children entering first grade receive medical examination prior to admission; that schools could overcome some of the defects of housing and sanitation by allowing children to use the school showers and by providing time for study periods at school; that further attempts be made towards providing extra clothing for children who need it. Perhaps the best approach would be to include help to parents to budget their income, family allowance and welfare money so as to cover all expenses.

We recommend further that the Indian Affairs Branch, perhaps in cooperation with local boards, provide incentives to teachers to acquire extra training through summer school, evening and in-service courses which would enable them to gain some systematic knowledge about the people with whom they work.

The Indian Affairs Branch is to be commended for its efforts toward resolving the many reserve problems associated with non-viable economies and different values. It is hoped that these efforts will continue and will include the flexibility to take additional independent action and make cooperative arrangements with local boards to ameliorate the position of the Indian child in the public school.

5. School Problems

Many school personnel expressed the wish for the establishment of a position of liaison officer between the schools and the Indian Affairs Branch. The intent was that such a person could deal with problems arising from the dependency of Indians on the Indian Affairs Branch for such items as funds for school equipment, lunches, clothes and activities. It also arose with reference to absenteeism. Some problems tend to become more complicated when they are not dealt with directly, and absenteeism of children must be dealt with on the day they are absent, not at the time of the superintendent's next visit. Similarly, schools requiring information or action on a health or financial problem need it within a short period of time and cannot tolerate the long delay in correspondence which is sometimes involved.

The appointment of a liaison officer would serve several purposes. It would increase communication between the schools and government agencies. It would permit the utilization of all available resources in a given problem which the liaison officer could be expected to be familiar with but which school personnel often are not. It would assure the Indian parents and the school personnel that immediate action and consultation would be instigated to resolve a problem. It would decimate the absenteeism of students who now take advantage of the administrative delays and uncertainty. It would remove the necessity for the parents, the school and the Indian Affairs Branch to deal with a large number of individuals, perhaps the nurse, welfare officer, probation officer, and special counsellor, in the resolving of a single problem.

6. Retardation and Failure

It has been established that the rate of failure for Indians children far exceeds that of White Canadian children and that the primary reasons are cultural and social rather than intellectual. The many contributing factors have been outlined and their further repetition is not needed. Remedial measures must be taken to reduce the high failure rates.

It has already been suggested that lack of readiness for school with its inevitable result of failure in grade one be eliminated at least partially through the establishment of preparatory programs such as nursery schools and kindergartens. Additionally, it has been suggested that children be in good physical health and that remedial steps be taken to overcome any marginal defects and illnesses. Finally, it was suggested that teachers be professionally and adequately prepared to teach children of minority groups through a variety of methods, In addition, it might be wise for the Indian Affairs Branch to examine public school policies with regard to retention and promotion. It is conceivable that the Indian Affairs Branch could negotiate with the provinces or the school boards to institute cooperative programs for remedial and special classes with boards which do not have such facilities because of financial inability.

The policy which some schools have of not permitting a child to repeat more than one grade in every three seems reasonable. However, if the child repeats one grade and still is not competent in the academic material for his grade, then it serves little purpose to promote him without the skills and knowledge he requires for the next grade. Remedial teaching is indicated for such children and should be directed toward enabling him to overcome his deficiencies so that he can carry on at his proper age-grade level, without the need for him to lose a school year. Clearly, this is not possible for all children who need additional work but it might be possible for many.

The growing trend toward upgraded primary classes is heartily endorsed as one means of permitting children to learn at their own rate over a three year period. This enables many children who are not ready for school and who are immature to overcome their lack without the negative experience of being categorized as a failure in the initial year of school.

Persistent failure and increasing retardation discourage both teachers and students. They contribute to negative attitudes toward self and toward school and are crucial in deciding whether a child will stay in school or drop out. Failure also contributes to absenteeism. Remedial and special education might prevent some of the retardation and dropout. Special classes already exist in many systems but more are needed. Their absence is usually explained by lack of funds. If the Indian Affairs Branch or the provinces through agreement with the federal government were to provide an incentive for boards to establish such programs through a system of special grants, all children in that school district could benefit. Selection of schools to receive grants could be based on the proportion of Indian children in the school, the willingness of the board to hire specially- trained personnel and to institute special programs to accommodate the children concerned. Cooperation between governments and local boards could provide superior remedial services to all children in the form of special classes and such programs as half-work, half-school arrangements. Such contributions would be laudable and would certainly reduce the large number of failures and the high rate of dropout among other children as well as Indian students.

7. Integrated Education

There are many matters in connection with integrated education that could not be systematically evaluated for inclusion in this Report. However, in discussions with individuals many important items were mentioned and deserve mention here. The matter of procedure in the initial phases of establishing joint agreements has already been touched on. The decision to seek a joint agreement is undoubtedly based on a great deal of thought and an evaluation of the situation. We urge that the criteria for choosing areas of joint agreement and the consideration of the myriad factors continue to receive close perusal. The principle of integrated education is not questioned but the choice of school districts for integration and the system of procedure should be constantly under review.

There appear to be many concomitants of joint agreements which might be re-evaluated. The matter of quotas is one. In some areas, children are being transported to different schools because the most convenient school has established that only a certain percentage of the enrolment may be Indian children. When the quota is reached, other children from the same reserve must be transported to other schools. Apart from the additional time and cost involved, there is a more important issue. Indian parents who have to conform to such arrangements are not happy; they perceive it as an unwillingness on the part of Whites to accept the Indian child in the school and legitimately object to the personal inconvenience it causes them to have children of one family attending different schools. In some cases such quotas result in the exclusion of some children from a desired program, perhaps of kindergarten or high school. We recommend that joint agreements not be considered where they are conditioned by quotas which indicate an uneasy acceptance of Indian children in the school.

The aspects of the religious issue are germane here. In some areas, children are transported past public schools to attend private schools. In many cases, the parents would be content to have their children attend the local public school; in some cases, they would prefer it. The alternative of having children attend a local public school is seldom presented to parents of Roman Catholic children. They assume that such an arrangement is not a possibility. This matter should be clarified for them. Some of the duplication of facilities along religious grounds should be questioned. Two multi-grade one-room schools on one reserve both financed by federal funds provide poor educational experiences for children who need especially good teaching. A teacher who handles four grades cannot possibly be as adequate as a teacher who handles two. The logical division of such a school population if only two teachers are justified is in two classes of two grades each. We recognize that these situations are fewer in number than they were ten years ago but we can see insufficient justification for their existence at all.

Parents, students and school personnel all commented on the problems involved for upper elementary and high school students transferring from reserve and residential schools into public schools. The main criticism was that the transfer was complicated by the fact that the students were in a stated grade but did not have skills and information similar to those of their White peers in the same grade. It is not intended to imply that reserve or residential schools are inadequate. Many appear to be superior to local schools. However, It is recommended that Indian Affairs Branch officials constantly evaluate reserve and residential schools in order to ensure that Indian students transferring from them may take their place at par in the public school system.

The phasing out of Indian Affairs Branch schools and the locating of all Indian students in public schools is heartily endorsed. The actual process, however, should ensure that integration occurs at a time which is beneficial to the students involved and in a way which guarantees their excellence of education and personal growth and development. In areas where federal facilities and staff are clearly superior to rural local public systems, arrangements might be made to have the students move into the reserve school rather than transferring Indian students into inferior schools. This type of arrangement might be made under an agreement for a timetable setting a date on which the province and local board would take over the federal school and staff. The reserve status obviously inhibits such arrangements but where bands are making other links with provincial administration such an agreement would not be untenable.

We endorse the principle of integrating at school entry. The problems of transferring at upper levels are manifold and there seems to be greater educational gain in refusing admission in the lower grades than in closing down Indian Affairs Branch schools from the top. We recommend that students now in Indian Affairs Branch high schools be permitted to choose to continue their high school education in those schools but that no admissions be made from grade nine on. Similarly, high school students in hostels and residences should be permitted to complete their high school from the hostels and should not be forced out by the admission of larger numbers of upper-elementary students.

Reserves should not be split by an educational program. The experimental filtering of students into public schools is feasible for a short time. However, it has all possibilities of classifying children erroneously and being extremely harmful. Children being retained on the reserve because they are unlikely to succeed in the public system are receiving no remedial or special education. Should they later have to enter the public system they will be so far behind that the transfer will result in a series of problems and ultimate dropout.

8. Curricula

No systematic study was made of provincial curricula used in the public schools but several points warrant some consideration. In most systems there is no material related to Indian cultures. We strongly suggested that provincial curricula allow some flexibility in various subjects to permit inclusion of ethnic material from all groups in multi-racial schools. Social Studies, Art and Literature classes would lend themselves easily to such inclusions. The benefits of using local material would be sound paedagogically since it would focus interest and involve students from the various ethnic groups. It would also give them some sense of worth and of pride at being included.

Some attempts have been made to include references to Canadian Indians in Social Studies texts in a few provinces. Such material is usually poorly presented and highly stereotyped. The Indian is always portrayed as a Plains Indian with the ubiquitous feather band. Much of the material is as unrealistic to the Indian child in school as it s to the non-Indian. In one province, texts include biased and falsified accounts of encounters between Indians and Whites. Such texts should be removed from classrooms.

9. Experimental Research and Methodology

It would be worthwhile using programmed learning more fully in any school system. In schools where there are large Indian enrolments, such facilities might show some interesting results when used for remedial work or for language and arithmetic teaching. We recommend that specialists within the Indian Affairs Branch explore such devices for possible use in up-grading children quickly and effectively. We also recommend that a constant program of research exist in which problems related to the teaching of Indian students in public schools continue to be investigated and experimental programs inaugurated for their solution. Such programs as the English program developed in the Indian Affairs Branch by Rose Calliou are of great value and could well be used by the public school systems. The Indian Affairs Branch need not always assume the responsibility of the actual research or experimental teaching programs since several school systems have such programs underway. Nevertheless they usually suffer from lack of funds. Possibly, the Indian Affairs Branch could contribute to such programs or provide an incentive for their inception through special grants.

10. Testing Programs

The Branch and all public school systems have a testing program usually based on group pencil-and-paper tests. Some systems are beginning to dispense with such programs, It is common knowledge that such tests are not applicable to children from all backgrounds and it has been indicated that they cause a great deal of personal harm to the child and serve little positive purpose. We recommend that the Branch itself remove all tests from its schools and that public schools do likewise. The Indian Affairs Branch is in the best position to alert all school authorities to the finding that such tests are neither valid nor reliable for Indian students.

11. Additional Comment

We recognize that our findings will not provide information that some Indian Affairs Branch officials have not already noted themselves. However, in our analysis we have endeavoured to show the inter-relatedness of the many elements of the education of the Indian child and to bring into relief the more crucial factors. The artificial separation of educational problems from the general context of life must be constantly kept in mind since so many of the contextual factors determine what happens to the child in school. Most of the suggest ions presented here have been made by other people at other times. The majority will be accepted in principle now as they have been in the past. The challenge rests in changing "in principle acceptance" to action programs in the immediate future. For example, kindergartens have been accepted as necessary and several have been established on reserves. However, many more are urgently needed and they need special teachers and special programs. "In principle acceptance" will not help Indian children who enter first grade this year or next. Hopefully, their children will be in a better position when they enter school. For many, this ie only a short fifteen years in the future.

We are cognizant of the vast amount of time and effort and money which has been put into Indian Affairs Branch educational programs in past years. Recommendations contained here suggest new expenditures in some instances but in general call for the realignment of existing funds and programs to create more effective results. As Indian Affairs Branch schools close down and fewer teaching personnel are employed the freed moneys could be expended on some of these special educational facilities and research.

APPENDIX

The following checklist was used as a guide to interviews for Chapter IV:

1. Indian Adults:
   - feelings re attendance of children at public school; advantages and disadvantages
   - aspirations for children re level of education, employment, etc.
   - evaluation of what immediate future may hold for Indian youth
   - availability of local employment for Indians
   - feelings re discrimination in general; in school; in employment
   - concept of specific band problems; solutions
   - attitudes toward dropouts; desired level of education for children
   - ideas for improving school situation if needed
   - degree and type of contacts with school personnel; nature of contact
   - type and nature of contacts with Whites in general
   - attitudes toward alcohol problems, truancy and other problems cited and their solutions
   - types of programs visualized as of help in meeting variety of problems

2. Indian Students:
   - present grade and concept of academic standing
   - things liked and disliked about school
   - characteristics of teachers liked and disliked
   - plans re staying in school or dropping out
   - reasons for above plans
   - plans for future employment, if any
   - attitude toward students who did drop out
   - source of information upon which attitudes re leaving or staying in school are based
   - hopes and plans for the future
   - plans re staying on or moving off the reserve
   - degree of personal involvement in reserve affairs
   - identification of major problems of youth in area
   - suggested solutions to above
   - use of leisure time; participation in school activities
   - degree of social exchange with Whites in out-of-school hours
   - concept of attitudes toward Indians in public school
   - choice individual would make if he were free to attend any school (public, residential, Indian Day)
   - reasons for above choice
   - problems encountered in school because of being an Indian
   - concept of parents' attitudes re completing school; parents' aspirations for them
   - identification of types of jobs Indians have held in their area

3. School Personnel:
   - significant identifiable differences between Indian and non-Indian students
   - identification of major academic problems of students
   - any provisions the school makes specifically for Indians
   - attitudes toward Indians being in the school
   - opinion re public versus reserve schooling for Indians

- circumstances under which the school integrated; any special procedures; suggestions for administrators about to admit Indian students for the first time
- evaluation of relationship between school and the Indian Affairs Branch; between school and Indian parents
- degree of participation by Indian parents in school matters; reasons for non-participation
- degree of participation of Indian students in school activities
- identification of major school problems and whether applicable to Indians
- general policies re promotion, repeated failures, truancy
- availability of counselling services for all students; use made of services by Indians
- general level of education of parents in larger community
- general rate of dropout
- occupation of grads and dropouts in local community
- general community attitudes toward minority groups; degree of social exchange - discrimination
- suggested solutions to any problems identified above

4. Service Personnel:

a) Public Health

- estimation of general state of health of reserve people; health problems specific to the reserve
- general community health problems
- degree and type of health education program carried out; success or failure; why
- main Indian health problem
- suggestions for improving general and Indian public health problems

b) Probation Officer or RCMP

- general rate of delinquency for area
- types of youthful offences
- significant differences between rate and types of offences in which Indians and Whites are involved
- special difficulties encountered in dealing with Indian offenders
- differences in attitudes between Indians and Whites toward incarceration
- type and degree of preventive work possible, counselling and follow-up
- definition of major social problems in area; major Indian problems
- solutions proposed for above

c) Social Worker

- identification of major Indian and White social problems
- evaluation and description of Indian families on relief; contrasted to Whites
- variances in attitudes toward relief between Indians and Whites
- suggestions for solutions to cited problems

d) Indian Superintendent

- comparison of x band with others in agency; unique assets and liabilities of band x
- major problems in band x
- proposed programs and long term plans for development of band x

- attitude toward attendance of Indian students in public schools; evaluation of what would comprise the best type of education for Indians
- type of dissemination of information re funds available, employment opportunities, vocational training
- ideas and evaluation of current leadership and future leadership of band x
- attitudes toward identified problems of band x; suggestions for solution

CHAPTER V

A PHILOSOPHY FOR INDIAN EDUCATION

GENERAL GUIDELINES

Any academic policy must be directed towards certain objectives. In order to lay down general guidelines for the main government policies regarding schooling in Indian communities, three types of situations have to be examined:

1. The new self-awareness of Indian communities;
2. The low levels of education among people of Indian origin;
3. Modern educational knowledge and the new look in schooling.

An analysis of these three factors will allow us to set up a few general principles as a guide for educational strategy. The strategy must however take into account the actual experience of the federal government over the past quarter century. The results of these efforts have already been examined in a previous chapter and these, together with the present socio-cultural analysis, will enable us to set forth principles to be used as general standards for an overall educational policy that will remain valid for years to come.

1. The emergence of an ethnic self-awareness among Indians

It is unnecessary to visit more than one Indian reserve to be immediately struck by the new self-awareness prevalent in Indian communities. This new attitude, a turning point in Indian history, finds expression in an ambiguous ethnic identification and stems from inferior living conditions reflected in a host of factors such as employment, living standards, social organizations and intercultural relations with Whites.

We might emphasize at the outset that many native cultural traditions have undergone a more or less radical change on contact with civilization, technical progress and the mass media.

It is not proposed to assess in this Report the extent or intensity of cultural changes in Indian reserves or to classify native groups according to their degree of acculturation. Our purpose is to establish some general principles which will qualify our later statements in greater detail. On the one hand, there are marked differences between the various Canadian tribes in this matter of ethnic identification. Generally speaking, the tribes with the soundest economic resources and the greatest economic viability identify most strongly with their past and their traditions. Even within themselves the tribes are not homogeneous. Older Indians are generally more interested in the past than the young. Many of the young pay scant attention to what their elders tell them about the past. In some cases even, the young openly reject traditional customs and express admiration for everything that is not Indian.

Even so, it may be said that the desire to maintain an Indian ethnic identity persists both in communities relatively untouched by modern civilization and those where the technological age is gaining a foothold. Although the desire to identify with an aboriginal society and remain Indian is still strong, the elements of this identification are often vague and even contradictory. By this we mean that the proposed standards are ill-defined and include traditional elements side by side with foreign elements with which they are incompatible. The courage and moral strength of the ancestors are recalled; stories are told of their bravery, skill, ingenuity and intelligence, and of course customs and institutions are remembered. Apart from this evocation of the past reflecting a culture more or less distant past, the distinctive traits of this ethnic identity are limited in number. The distant past is regarded as a golden age and the present is looked upon as a period of crisis and decadence.

A second aspect of the Indians' self-image is a result of their position of inferiority and dependence in relation to the Whites, Although not a beaten or conquered people, they are in a state of legal and psychological dependence on the Whites, individually and collectively. They have long been regarded as inferior beings unable to decide what was good for them by some Whites who were responsible for their welfare. These misconceptions have been the basis of a paternalistic policy on the part of the central government, which gradually reduced the Indians' national pride, initiative and ability to plan beyond the immediate future. These are some of the repercussions of the policy of the central government, restricting the Indians to a limited cultural world, so limited in fact, that the Indian has come to despise himself and feel inferior not only in his prospects for earning a living (economically, legally and educationally), but even from the ethnic point of view.

The Indians blame their psychological and social failure on the Whites. As they see it, the Whites dispossessed and exploited them without ever giving them the full benefit of their wealth. They gave them money to satisfy their conscience and felt they had fulfilled their obligations. In point of fact, the Indians feel the Whites seized their riches and never paid any compensation for this calculated dispossession. Indians, they say, are incapable of living like their ancestors because the Whites have placed them in such conditions (on the reserves) that the continued practice of their ancestral customs has become exceedingly difficult. The Whites feel under a perpetual obligation to give the Indians money, but this is poor compensation indeed. The Indian finds it hard to understand why the White man will not give him more and refuses to make further services available to him out of his own resources. The Indian regards these payments and services as discriminatory prerogatives designed to maintain the superiority of the White race.

For all that, the Indian looks up to the Whites, The White man is well housed and has always enough to eat. He is properly dressed, can afford a car and travels, he has the means to acquire a number of material possessions which afford him ease and comfort and, above all else, he can better himself and plan for his children's future.

In short this is the source of the dual nature of the Indian's identity. In the formation of his own image, he combines indiscriminately elements taken from two widely different cultures. As a result of this conflicting situation, it is hardly surprising that his self-image is ambiguous. Ideally and ideologically, he would like to preserve a number of ancestral traditions which alone can be used as a mainstay and bring about a definite racial identity. On the other hand, several of these traditions are lost or radically transformed and the realities of everyday life confront him with the values and attitudes of a modern world which force him if not to reject the past, at least to question it as a source of inspiration. He is constantly being flung to one extreme or another according to whether he is dealing with members of his own race or with Whites,

This is the way we see it. The group's more or less mythical past is used both for supporting demands and as a means of identity. It serves to remind the Whites of their obligations to the Indians. The Indian admits he would find it hard to abandon his new way of life and return to the past; even in the most isolated localities, the traditional means of subsistence are being used less and less. There is besides an ideological plurality and a considerable difference of opinion when it comes to defining the objectives Indians hold for their communities. Several leaders and associations have national ambitions. Up till the present time, no chief or organization has been able to define the objectives in generally acceptable terms or bring about unanimity as to what they are. Even within a tribe or reserve, leadership is often assumed by rival factions which have different notions regarding the issues with which the community is concerned.

It is clear from these observations that the strength of the ethnic identity (expressed in the feeling of belonging to an original group) or even the attitudes towards the dominant culture (which attracts for reasons of prestige) will vary from one individual to another in terms of a vast number of factors, both institutional and personal. This self-examination is of the deepest significance for the cultural orientation of individuals and the groups to which they belong. The Indians will either identify themselves in terms of divided nationalistic aspirations or they will allow their internal divisions to add to the existing ambivalence resulting from their cultural contacts with the Whites, The first alternative would mean an Indian revival and the second would result in a breakdown of traditional patterns and the more or less speedy assimilation of individuals. We should note, however, that survival of the various native traditions depends on the integration of individuals pursuing the same objectives, although fulfilment of this condition would not necessarily guarantee their survival. Various other conditions are necessary in addition to these basic factors, namely: an improvement in living conditions, health and welfare; more advanced education and better technical training; more up-to-date social organization and the emergence of vigorous and enlightened elite groups. In short, it is necessary to restore an entire socio-cultural climate and eliminate a mass of economic and social inequalities.

These last considerations lead us to deal very briefly with living conditions on reservations as well as the educational levels of the population.

2. Economic and social inequalities on the reserves in relation to the rest of the country

A. The reserve culture

The first part of our Report points out clearly the substantial difference between living conditions on the reserve and those prevalent in the outside world. By living conditions on the reserves we mean factors such as the geographical situation, size of families and financial situation, satisfaction of the traditional and new needs of the members as a whole, the work of the chief, education of the children, levels of individual satisfaction, welfare and health.

It is a basic principle that the majority of Indian reserves as constituted at present do not give the individuals who live there the material, cultural and psychological resources necessary to the survival of the group as such. In other words, many reserves do not offer their residents the basic requirements of self-sufficiency, and consequently are not viable as socio-cultural units. They need constant stimulants from outside in order to survive and this is, needless to say, an artificial situation. In well-constituted reserves this outside help is almost negligible, but in the majority of cases outside help is such a common and important factor that it seriously threatens the internal adjustment dynamisms and their chances of restoring independence. If it suddenly became necessary to stop or reduce this outside aid to an appreciable extent, several of these socio-cultural units would inevitably disappear. We know that a development of this nature is unthinkable at this juncture. Indeed, it is generally realized that, for several years at least, this external financial aid and these professional services and consumer goods are going to increase in volume. The increase in external services (including the direction and control of activities on the reserve) will be necessary for two reasons: (a) increasing dependence on the outside world for economic survival; (b) constant increase in the needs of Indians under the pressure of intercultural contacts and the mass media.

(a) Ever-increasing dependence on the outside world for economic survival

Fifty years ago, the majority of reserves were able to meet their own economic needs and those of their members, by means of traditional techniques, To-day, the hunting grounds are more limited and the number of hunters is constantly diminishing. Hunting is tending to take on a symbolic rather than a practical meaning and has even become a sport, much as the city dweller returns to the country for purposes of self-restoration through communication with an idealized rural past. There is, here, we are convinced, a profound ritual relationship. These needs are all the stronger in the Indian when he is as yet unintegrated into the technological society while feeling its effects.

The great majority of reserves absorb relatively little of their own available manpower, because of their under-developed economy and their pitifully inadequate adjustment to an economy of supply and demand. This means that the vast majority of the workers have to seek employment off the reserve or be unemployed most of the year. As very few have the qualifications to get them a stable or remunerative employment, they are almost all condemned to chronic unemployment and the irregular manual labour available on the reserve or in the neighbourhood. General underemployment and a rather low standard of living place Indians living on the reserves in a permanent state of poverty and indigence. The social security measures and the many compensation schemes from federal government sources and from the various provincial governments (in some provinces Indian welfare is a provincial responsibility) only serve to palliate the financial privations facing an Indian family. Even more substantial financial aid is required to meet the mass of Indian needs.

Social disintegration characteristic of poverty-stricken communities (poverty is considered a dominant factor in the disintegration of a community) is too familiar in the literature of sociology for us to consider it here. Suffice it to mention that not only do reserves show this tendency but do so to an even greater extent than most economically backward communities. The undesirable effects of poverty appear all the more marked because most Indian communities are artificially constituted and do not possess the structural restraints found in natural communities. Economic poverty not only gives rise to material privations in the families and leads to social disintegration, but also increases the dependence of the Indian on the Whites, i.e., the government, and aggravates his feelings of inferiority. He feels more and more of a second class citizen. For ethnic reasons, he is condemned almost automatically to an inferior economic status. The greater his desire to share the White's privileges, worldly wealth and facilities, the worse this injustice seems to him.

(b) Constant rise in the levels of the reserves' needs

As the Indians come to know more about the White way of life as a result of travel and contact with Whites on the reserve and through the various information media, they aspire to a better standard of housing, nutrition and, above all, of clothing, for themselves, a standard more in keeping with that of the whites. But they also want some of the new symbols of prestige such as modern furniture and a car. This rise in the level of needs, as a result of the desire to enjoy the same material possessions as the Whites and even the same wealth symbols, only serves to emphasize the poverty of the Indians. Indeed the greater the gap between the aspirations of the Indian and the practical means of bridging it, the more frustrated and deprived does the Indian feel.

If the economic situation of the reserves remains stationary (and if it deteriorates the consequences will be even more serious) it must be expected that Indian demands for a rise in their standard of living will be more insistent. These feelings will be expressed with great assurance because, in the Indian's view, these improvements would merely be redress of an injustice which is going from bad to worse. For all practical purposes, the government would be spending increasing sums to reduce the gap between the needs felt and their satisfaction (standards of living).

If the assumption that the integration of the Indians into the world outside the reserve will continue to increase is correct, it is reasonable to assume also that there is going to be a corresponding increase in needs and the amount of money necessary to meet them will increase in proportion. This assumption takes it for granted that the economic situation will remain basically the same. It is a well-known fact that the central government and several provincial governments are carrying out experiments in economic recovery and planning. The results of these will be known within a few years, but even according to the most optimistic expectations, these improvements will reach only some of the reserves. The results obtained will be on a reduced scale and will relieve only a fraction of the mass of the new economic pressures referred to above.

There are two additional considerations which lead us to expect a necessity for increased expenditure by the government. The first is the population explosion on the reserves. At the present rate of growth, the population on Indian reserves in Canada is expected to double within the next twenty years if legal and administrative policies remain unchanged. The population growth alone will call for additional expenditure each year.

The other factor is less obvious. The results of poverty and indigence will be reflected at all levels of the social structure and involve hidden costs. These expenses will also increase unless communities can regain a certain economic self-sufficiency.

The various comments all point in the one direction; they highlight certain aspects of the crisis of Indian civilization. This crisis takes more than one form. Certain reserves which are almost self-sufficient, also are aware of White pressure, but can relieve it by relying on the positive elements of the community. Other reserves have become almost entirely dependent on the State and have lost almost all initiative. The generation gap between parents and children arises out of a difference of attitudes towards life and fundamental values; between traditional élites and the young acculturated élites; between older and younger married couples; between the illiterate and those who have received some education; between those who cling desperately to old traditions and those who wish to play the changing world by ear; this is the result of opposing and competing ideologies. They reflect the state of crisis through which the Canadian reserve Indians are passing.

We do not feel that this is a passing crisis. The basic question in connection with the Indian communities is the following: How do we make the Indian a full citizen of Canada, in the light of his deep loyalties, his ethnic affinities and his most basic aspirations? At present he is in conflict. He cannot, by himself, solve it and make final choices. *tie* must prepare him to make his choice by informing him of the content and significance of the processes going on in the world. Will he be less Indian when this has been accomplished? We do not think he will. On the contrary, by freeing himself from the shackles of poverty and cultural exclusion, the Indian will retrieve his pride and dignity which are qualities essential to his development and progress.

B. The low level of education in Indian populations

Before dealing with educational objectives as such, we wish:
(a) to lay down some general postulates concerning the right of the Indian to an education; (b) to define the underprivileged position of the Indian with regard to formal education which has existed up to the present time; (c) to attempt to resolve the apparent contradiction between a high level of formal education and the gradual loss of national awareness and ethnic identity.

(a) Education is a new need

When one examines the development of technological societies, it becomes apparent that their members attach greater importance to new than to traditional needs. The new needs are for cars, modern furniture, and household appliances, synthetic entertainment, security against risk and, finally, education. Each of these new needs is seen not merely as a necessity (which the Indian must enjoy without delay in order to be happy and accepted as a full member of one's group) but as a right. The attitude of Indians with regard to education is no different from that of other Canadians. They do feel that education is a necessity in order to succeed in life (the confusion surrounding this word success will be dealt with at length at a later stage). They also feel it is a right. This means that Indians must be treated on an equal basis with Whites and must be given the most advanced education and the most appropriately specialized which is possible, in terms of their tastes and skills. This is a principle which appears difficult to apply in view of the environmental conditions of their habitat (geographical isolation, transportation difficulties, sparse population, annual nomadic movement of the population, harsh climate or even special administrative difficulties inherent in operating an educational program in such communities). These aspects were studied as part of the analysis of the administrative and pedagogical structures of the Indian schools. But this right of the Indians to education also implies an increasingly greater part in the organization (membership of curriculum committees or school boards) in their administration (as teachers or school administrators) and in the planning of school programs. Finally, this right of the Indians to an education implies that school programs for them must enable them to progress and develop while maintaining their own identity.

The Indians' opinion with regard to the right to instruction is unanimous. Besides, the great majority regard education as a necessity if they are to adapt to the requirements of modern living. Education is such a keenly felt need that the Indians feel that the federal and provincial governments have considerable obligations towards them in this regard. These are of course the attitudes generally expressed by the Indians when they are questioned on the matter of education. But there is also a certain ambiguity, even a certain veiled hostility, indicative of inner attitudes of discontent and uneasiness. The older ones, the chiefs and parents, realize that their children will not be able to live as they did, that they need a certain training to adapt to the technological society and become useful members of it. They feel too that to withdraw their children from the present educational programs would be to condemn them to a state of perpetual inferiority and dependence. But the education of their children is an undertaking being conducted by outsiders and directed in terms of the life and society of the White man. These are the elements which make up the attitudes of the Indians towards the education of their children.

Indian objection to schooling is then at the general planning level and at the practical level. In other words, the Indian notion of education is not in keeping with the government ideology and avant-garde ideas. As a result, the services provided do not always meet the needs felt and often are not in keeping with needs expressed.~ The Indians feel that schools do not offer the various elements, structural and in the content of programs, which would allow them to develop according to their own ideas. This discrepancy between the Indians' concept of education and that of the government enables us to understand some of the fears and resistance of Indian communities.

The gap between the needs felt by the Indian population and the intentions of the government is not the only factor which explains the limited nature of achievements in education over the past quarter century. It must also be said that the indians themselves have had very little opportunity to express their views on this subject which has made government action very difficult indeed. Besides, present structures of the school system have made it hard for Indians to participate in their organization and planning.

(b) Indian education: the inequality of opportunity

Even if the principle of equality of opportunity for all Canadians, regardless of ethnic origin and creed, is a well accepted fact, certain groups have been at a disadvantage, as compared with others, in terms of educational opportunity. It is a known fact that city school systems were, for many years, better than those available in smaller towns, small centres and especially in rural areas. Besides, certain rural areas were quite unable to offer their residents an adequate educational service. In under-privileged school areas, one finds a high incidence of illiteracy and of people whose schooling stopped below the level of grade seven. Residents of these areas do not even use existing facilities as they should. Children have been withdrawn from school because they were needed on the farm or as breadwinners.

Like rural communities geographically distant from the centres, Indian communities have been generally at a disadvantage in this respect. The two factors which interfered with rural schooling have also been in evidence in the case of Indians. It has been difficult to organize schools and recruit adequate staff to run them. But the most important reason has been that the native populations did not understand the need for instruction and, which is even more important, could only send their children to school at irregular intervals.

Now that traditional patterns of survival on the reserves are being replaced by patterns associated with the laws of supply and demand, the Indians, like all Canadians, find themselves subject to the requirements of the labour market. Like any under-educated Canadian, the Indians find it hard to get steady work which pays enough to provide for their families' needs. They also come up against certain prejudices among White employers. Their residential environment, the reserve and its neighbourhood, affords little steady employment, and this lack of steady employment has helped confirm the proletarian status of the Indian. tie shall now see how this proletarian status came about.

Educational surveys in industrial societies have established that the level of education is associated with a host of highly diverse factors. For example, we have already seen how origin and environment affect education. It has also been established that the level of education is intimately linked with professional status. The higher this level of education the better the chances that an individual will reach a higher professional level. It is also known that promotion and advancement in later years will also be more likely in the case of the individual whose education is above average. The reverse is also true, the vulnerability of less educated workers (the likelihood of their being laid off or demoted) increases as they grow older. It has also been demonstrated that standards of living are closely associated with education, the best educated workers earning the highest wages on a regular basis.

By losing their traditional structure, the reserves have become increasingly dependent on the outside for their economic survival (government subsidies and seasonal employment), but at the same time the Indians are competing with workers who reach standards of living made possible by their superior education. There is on the reserves a large supply of unskilled manpower, but the jobs available for workers of this type are as a rule neither steady nor well paid. This amounts to saying that their low level of education does not enable Indians to earn a proper living.

This applies also to all under-educated Canadians. The Indians count increasingly on the government for their survival, while, in many areas bordering on the reserves, mining and manufacturing industries could hire Indian workers if only they possessed the necessary qualifications.

Our previous remarks were designed to point out that a given level of education entails many special consequences. The less well-educated are practically condemned to a more or less permanent state of economic dependence, but we refrained, and deliberately so, from mentioning the additional handicaps which are associated with the Indians' inferior status as a cultural minority. This status affects both school achievement and the chances of employment once a certain level of formal education has been attained. It may be stated, without danger of error, that Indians have been adversely affected by both these factors. They have always been at a disadvantage with respect to formal education and the difficulty of obtaining a permanent job after graduating from school. Any program of government action designed to give Indians some economic independence through education and appropriate technical training must also provide the mechanisms to permit the Indian to find jobs once he is qualified. The principle was amply documented in Volume I of this Report.

We might emphasize, in passing, that the teaching in the Indian and integrated schools should be designed to prepare students for the exercise of a trade or profession and to adapt them to the White society. An Indian's ability to find a job is a result not only of his education but also of his level of acculturation. If he is well acquainted with the values of the Whites and has good linguistic ability, if he is keenly aware of the working standards of the Whites, then he will have a better chance of finding a job and keeping it.

3. The functions of education among Indians

One may define the education of Indian youth as one of the general aspects of the process of socialization and as one of the aspects of the special process of his integration into the broader Canadian society.

Schooling is one socializing factor which is in competition with other socializing systems, such as the family, age and neighbourhood groups, church organizations and the mass media. The values and attitudes acquired by the young Indian come from these diverse institutions through their agents or officials who represent them more or less effectively.

Taking into account the competing pressures of one or the other of such agents on the children, it is possible to state the following as a premise: the home and school are two parallel and opposing worlds and impinge on each other very little. This premise is more or less valid according to the degree of progress the band has made and the location of the reserve. The two social worlds tend to come closer in metropolitan areas or near towns, and to move farther apart in reserves situated far from towns or which are still close to the traditional patterns of life. In reserves relatively unaffected by urban living, there is a rather marked opposition between the experiences of home and those of the school. Home and school are two different cultural entities and require from the child two distinct modes of adjustment. By distinct patterns of adjustment we mean that the demands of the two worlds are so different that the child has to make a new adjustment each time he moves from one to the other. This dual pattern of adaptation creates conflicts within the child which are reflected in his scholastic achievement, Even unconsciously the child feels preference for one system or the other. In the isolated reserves the child almost invariably opts for the socializing system of the family. Once he has expressed this preference, the child then attempts systematically to behave at school as though he were at home. He applies to the school situation the cultural criteria of home, which usually do not meet with the approval of the school teacher. On the other hand, in reserves near towns, the choice of the child tends to be reversed and he will tend to act more in accordance with the standards of the school and to think little of the home values. As a result he attempts to apply school standards at home and behave like a White. This conduct is usually rejected by his parents.

This polarized version of the situation tends to emphasize extremes. We are aware that there are many intermediate cases which would not fit in either of these extreme categories. Besides, the degree of closeness between a White centre and an Indian community is of little importance as neither is entirely homogeneous. Within them can be found various types of family, various types of student.

But school performance, as we saw before, is not merely a result of primary orientation of the student, either his own or that of the Whites, but it is also a result of aptitude, motivation, type of school, extra-curricular life; in the case of boarding schools, discipline and other forms of control, the training of the teachers, attitude of the student towards his teachers and towards school work itself (attention in class, home-work, etc.). The effectiveness of the various school situations with regard to scholastic achievement can only be assessed if the other factors mentioned above are more or less constant. Performance in school is probably an inadequate criterion for comparing reserve and integrated schools and boarding schools. Account must also be taken of the proposed goals, the services offered, the costs of operation and the influence exerted on the community in the case of each school.

This brings us back to our original question: does education encourage a serious conflict of loyalties in the long run? If these conflicts exist, do they seriously interfere with the development of a national identity and the bands' spirit of independence? Comparisons are always imperfect. In the case of French Canadians, it is apparent that higher levels of formal education and the increased urbanization of Quebec have not weakened the sense of belonging nor the strength of the ethnic identity. A certain number of French Canadians have, for practical purposes, lost interest in their origins, but the majority have remained faithful to the group to which they belong. They are very different from the French Canadians of two generations ago but continue to identify with their ethnic group. If this is anything to go by, the Indians can improve their level of education and prepare themselves better for the labour market without giving up their sense of identity or jettisoning all their communal customs, The contradiction we mentioned at the outset is only apparent. That is to say, the young Indian can acquire various of the Whites' values and modes of behaviour with no weakening of his ethnic identity.

We shall set out here the government's idea of education and its three major goals: (a) improvement of the Indians' living conditions on the reserves; (b) training in the practice of a trade; (c) gradual attainment of independence.

A. Improvement of conditions on the reserves

This is a general objective which, if it is correctly understood, takes in all the others. The improvement of conditions on the reserve means automatically making the reserves into viable socio-cultural units (functional social units) and making it possible for Indians who live on them to find adequate satisfaction of their needs. We have here two concepts each of which alone could be dealt with at great length, i.e., "viable socio-cultural unit" and "adequate satisfaction of their needs". The two are very closely linked as it is usually in the socially soundest communities that individuals have the best chance of developing this state of balance which is the feeling of well-being resulting from satisfaction of their needs. We can only deal here with the most important aspects. A viable socio-cultural unit is one which meets the functional requirements of society, which provides its members with the elements and the structures necessary for survival. They are, so to speak, the minimal cultural conditions which make group living possible, both in the first and the later years of life. This means natural resources, structures which make possible the satisfaction of the individual's physiological needs, assignment of roles and responsibilities according to individual aptitudes, adequate channels of communication, communal goals which are adequately defined and controlled, training of the young, enlightened leadership, in a word, all elements essential to the efficient working of social relationships.

Satisfaction of his needs means that the individual can find in his environment elements which he regards as necessary to the well-being of himself and his family. Improving conditions on the reserve means both establishing economic structures which eventually allow full employment of residents; improvement in housing, nutrition and hygiene; improvement in the standards of living; the prevention of the worst examples of social disintegration; it means new blood among the leaders so that the new elite groups will work towards complete independence and a new definition of the cultural ideal; it means favouring creative and reconstructive leisure and it means the re-establishing of an intellectual and artistic tradition. It means, in a word, the full development of each individual and each of the cultural traditions. The Indian must be brought to greater awareness of what he once was, of what he is and, above all, what he can become if he is given the necessary means to develop.

We are aware that this optimistic view of education, indispensable if the Indians are to adapt to the requirements of the contemporary society, is open to serious criticism. Our point is that education is an essential condition but not that it alone can bring about progress. It is true that education enables an individual to know more and gives him a greater awareness of what he is and what he is doing, a better understanding of what his neighbours are and are doing (this is the humanistic aspect of education) and also enables him to practice a trade or hold a job (the utilitarian aspect of education) necessary to the normal working of society. But it is also necessary that the individual find In his environment the opportunity to use his skills permanently and that his occupational activities bring him an income sufficient to provide him and his dependents with adequate living.

B. Job-training

We shall not deal here with the best methods of intellectual and occupational training of students. We shall simply lay down some general principles to be observed in Indian schooling. It must be borne in mind that Indians will judge education according to what educated Indians do with their education. Education is therefore pragmatic to this extent:

it must prepare the worker for competition on the labour market. The reserves are an environment which usually offer only the most limited employment opportunity. Sometimes mining or smelting industries set up operations in the vicinity of the reserve, but it would be dangerous to equip Indians to occupy only those jobs. Some trades have also tended to attract Indians. These patterns of employment should never obscure the fact that Indians are entitled to the highest educational opportunity, and to a chance to enter any occupation. Taste and personal choice should be the only factors allowed to limit the level of education and the type of specialization.

Since school and the bulk of school programs are designed to lead to a job or profession, provided the young Indians are successful in their studies and are guided towards the appropriate educational institution, compulsory education up to the age of eighteen must be introduced as soon as possible. This would enable those with the necessary aptitude to go at least as far as grade 9 before branching off into technical education, and to proceed to university and secondary school when they are ready for it. This would mean that primary school would no longer be terminal for anybody. In cases where the student lacked the intellectual capacity to go to grade 9, specialized job training could begin earlier. This implies a greater availability of guidance counselling to young Indians in order to determine the fields of specialization best suited to their ability.

The principles we have just set out are closely related to the strictly utilitarian functions of the school and the school environment in which the students find themselves. The school has also a social and community function. Although school is a preparation for specialized training (the type of training which enables an individual to find employment), it also has the task of shaping the intelligence, equipping the memory, developing judgement, creative imagination and awareness of social responsibilities. This is the humanistic aspect of education (its general purpose). The child, especially if he lives in a closed community, must be made aware of the links that bind him to those who live with him and those who live outside the reserve. He must understand the responsibilities which are his as a citizen of a reserve and, indeed, as a citizen.

As a community institution, the school must be an integral part of the community. It may be the centre of social, recreative and cultural activities and attempts should be made to set up teacher-parent associations in order to associate the parents with the work of the teachers. The school can also help adults who are at an educational disadvantage, by setting up adult education and educational upgrading programs to enable them to meet formal education requirements.

C. Attainment of independence

To what extent more advanced education for Indians will make possible their attainment of independence is a question we must attempt to answer.

Up to the present, the various positions of influence on the reserve have not necessarily gone to the more educated. But as the reserves' relations with the outside world have become more extensive, the Indians themselves have seen that their representatives would have to be capable of using the language of the Whites and know enough about their way of life to explain their own claims effectively. Educational attainments and experience in off-reserve living became factors highly appreciated by the Indians when it came to electing representatives and band leaders. Educational achievement is therefore an increasingly prized accomplishment in the eyes of Indians when it comes to negotiating or bargaining.

4. Modern pedagogical data

In this section we shall summarize the main facts of modern education in order to understand properly the requirements to be met by the student, the teacher and the courses of study. These data are based on the Report of the Royal Commission on Teaching in the Province of Quebec.[1] As a general rule, these data are of universal application and, everything else being equal, are valid for the education of Indians also. We shall raise some problems which are specific to the education of Indians. The following aspects will receive comment: (a) Progress in teaching; (b) Child-centred teaching and the requirements of active teaching; (c) General and specialized education; (d) Outlook on the world and social awareness; (e) Mental and physical balance; (f) Teacher training.

A. Progress in teaching

Progress in teaching appears in two ways: in a more democratic approach to teaching at all population levels and in the richness of options and courses.

Almost every Indian child, wherever his reserve, is almost assured to-day that he will be able to attend school as long as he wishes and can have the intellectual, technical and professional training open to Whites. Theoretically, educational opportunity for an Indian depends on talent and perseverence but in practice is dependent largely on the financial means of the parents.

The Indian child can choose professional or vocational training entirely in keeping with his aptitudes and preferences. Any educational or professional aspirations of the child (in as far as they are realistic) may theoretically be attained through the existing school programs, through the efforts of school guidance counsellors who direct the child towards the appropriate specialized institution, and through the increasing facility with which the Indian can be admitted to White educational institutions, through joint agreements. The school system, as a whole, offers courses which respect the diversity of aptitudes and the variety of personal interests. The central government, in collaboration with the provincial governments, has committed itself to provide for everyone the most extensive and appropriate education. These programs, as we pointed out, are already available to Indians even in the most economically backward and isolated areas.

---

[1] Parent Report, vol. II, p. 113-17 and vol. III.

In spite of this increased availability of educational opportunity, it cannot be said that there has been a corresponding advance in educational achievement or perseverance among Indians, and this lag between institutional and individual progress is something we must strive to understand. The partial failure of the central governments' efforts is to be found in the Indian's failure to understand what schooling is about, his lack of motivation and the failure of the individual Indian to adapt to school environment..

B. Child-centred schooling

A child-centred schooling attempts to put into practice our knowledge of psychology and what we know about the development of intelligence and feeling in the child and the maturation process in general. This knowledge enables us to increase motivation, improve techniques of mental training, avoid repetition of grades and in general raise levels of instruction. A child-centred school (something like a kindergarten and a nursery school) is dynamic in the sense that the child is participating actively in what is going on there. As the Parent Report says, "activist" pedagogy "always tries to begin with the child, with his interests, with his play, with his imagination, in order to develop in him curiosity and personal initiative. The object is to eliminate the formalism of the teacher, the restraint of fixed programs, the passivity of the child. This way of thinking finds its inspiration in those values which we ourselves want to see honoured in the school: respect for intelligence, for creative talent and for the spirit of inquiry."[1]

These are all highly valid objectives whose application raises many problems. We might mention, among others, the language-learning problem experienced by Indian children as well as the need to fill roles they are not called upon to play in their daily life at home. We shall not go into the matter of teaching in the native language and the problems this raises, but shall take as our starting point the general situation in which Indian students find themselves. As a result of their inadequate knowledge of the language used in the school (English or French as the case may be) because of their shyness and also because of their ignorance of certain roles familiar to Whites, the principle of the new, active teaching, subjects the Indian child to certain psychological and cultural handicaps. In short, the most basic question to be answered is that of deciding when integrated culture should start. Should it be at the begin-fling of the child's schooling or should it come at a later stage?

C. General education and specialization

Recent educational research shows that a general basic education for all is necessary and that it should be as extensive as possible without preventing the free movement of students from one level to another (i.e., from primary to secondary and to the occupational and university levels) and their orientation towards one of the various occupational options. We stated earlier that the Indians must not be forced into particular occupations. As a group, they have all the talents to cover the entire range of occupational options, and this principle is as valid for them as for the young White student.

---

[1] Parent Report, p. 15.

We know that this has not been true until now, due to a number of combined circumstances such as the level of schooling of the Indians and educational backwardness of all kinds. Because of their relative lack of education, the Indians have been limited to the lower-paid occupations, but as they reap the advantages of the more extensive instruction of the integrated regional comprehensive high schools, they will be increasingly exposed to varied curricula which will include a common basic program taken by all as well as options to meet the tastes and preferences of the individual student. Through increasingly specialized options, the student will be enabled, from the age of sixteen onwards, to make more or less definitive preparation for his career. Students with difficulties in adapting to school will receive special attention and will be able to enter the labour market through the establishment of appropriate terminal courses. It will be necessary to pay close attention to the school progress of Indian students to avoid unnecessary delay in their progress from one grade to the next.

D. Outlook on the world and social awareness

This is basically a matter of preparing the Indians for life in the very broadest sense of the word. We are aware that an individual's occupational activity is only one of his many activities, For this reason the school must not only prepare him to hold a job but also to live fully and make a valuable contribution to the society of which he is a member. The occupational functions of an education cannot be dissociated from its social functions. Besides, an individual who practices an occupation will derive more satisfaction from it if he sees its importance in relation to the activities of society as a whole. For these reasons, and many others which cannot be examined here, the educational process should help develop in the child a better knowledge of the outside world and a better awareness of his responsibilities as a citizen. This view of the world and social awareness are all the more important to the young Indian student in that he has to adapt to the way of life of the wider world and become independent of the reserves. It is really the rising generation which will either take or shun the steps necessary for the emancipation of the Indian. They will make this decision to the extent that we have prepared them to do so, that is to say, to the extent we have taught them to understand the nature and operation of the broader society and handed them the tools for their emancipation. This philosophy must be the basis of any new Indian school policy. This function of education is all the more important to the Indians in that it prepares them for and directs them towards autonomy.

> Modern pedagogy seeks both to assure them (the books) their true place in a well-rounded education and to avoid their tyranny. The book must not act as a screen between the student and the world; it must prepare and prolong his contact with reality. To give students a taste for reading and for understanding what they read is of prime importance, yet a dynamic and progressive education also lifts the student out of his books and his classroom, leads him to nature, makes him aware of his social and human environment, offers him a laboratory suited to his nature and his level of achievement.[1]

E. Mental and physical balance

It is not today necessary to fight for recognition of the fact that an educational program is concerned with the human being as a whole, and that for this reason we must take into consideration modern medical and psychiatric knowledge in the education of youth. Education will be all the more successful if it takes into account the inter-relationship of the physical and psychological and the influence of both on the intellectual development of the child. Differences in motivation and intellect among the students must be borne in mind and this makes it possible to understand how each particular student reacts to anxiety, ambition, competition and all sorts of classroom situations.

---

[1] Parent Report, vol. II, p. 16.

If up to now little attention has been paid to the physical health of the Indian child, his emotional reactions to the school context have been far too long neglected. There has been too little interest in the possible psychological consequences to the child of punishment, compulsion and threats, in short to the atmosphere created by the teacher's personality, his method of control and instruction and the end results. These psychological factors are all the more important to an Indian child whose training is taking place in an alien cultural environment (we are referring to schools on the reserve and integrated schools) and whose behaviour and reactions may be misinterpreted by the teacher through an ethnocentric interpretation. These are all reasons which justify not only special physical care at school, but also psychiatric care, in order to provide exceptional and handicapped children with the services necessary to ensure their adequate education and development.

F. Teacher training

The Parent Report is explicit on this point and we shall quote from it without comment.

> In every country it is thoroughly understood that to embark upon such new courses and to perform these new functions, the educational system needs a highly competent personnel. Teachers are the keystone of any system and the only hope for the accomplishment of educational reforms. Whatever the programmes of studies may be, whatever standards are established, whatever experiments are tried, the solution depends ultimately on the teaching staff. . . . To make them into true educators, it is desired to give all future teachers true pedagogical training, based on adequately advanced studies in psychology and the social sciences. It is desired that all instructors have a better grounding in general education and that those concerned with secondary education be specialists in a specific field of knowledge)

A further requirement in the professional training of teachers is that educators who instruct Indians should have a knowledge of Indian psychology, of native cultures and of the work situation faced by those who live on the reserve. This special understanding which the teacher must have of his Indian students is an essential factor in the motivation of the student to learn and in his attitudes as a whole within the school situation.

---

[1] Ibid., p. 17-18.

CHAPTER VI

THE BACKGROUND OF FORMAL ORGANIZATION AND DECISION-MAKING IN INDIAN COMMUNITIES

To place the subsequent discussion in perspective we offer this brief sketch of the situation which existed at the time of European-Indian contact and thereafter with reference to leadership and decision-making in matters whose significance transcended the simple household and extended family, matters which we refer to loosely as political. A thorough treatment of some of these aspects has been presented in Part I of this Report, but it is desirable to touch again on certain highlights in order to provide historical context for the following chapters.

Man has invented many kinds of political institution, but one set of political functions is recognized by many social scientists as practically universal, although the functions may be performed by many different kinds of institution. These functions may be described briefly as follows: to maintain peace and order within the group by the settling of disputes, the enforcement of rules; to coordinate activities whose significance is community-wide rather than confined to individuals or families; to provide representation for the group vis-a-vis other groups; to direct activities such as warfare against other groups.

In some societies specialized institutions, such as legislatures, judiciaries, police forces and diplomatic corps fulfill those functions. This is the case in large-scale societies, with clusters of population of high density, where proportionately less energy is devoted to subsistence. However, in small-scale societies absorbed in problems of subsistence these functions are usually fulfilled by non-specialized institutions such as the kinship grouping. In a sense we can say that such small societies do not need specialized institutions.

Such institutions were to be found among the Indian societies of Canada. ~#mong the Iroquois, the group that practised agriculture more intensively than any other in Canada, there was a heavier density of population, larger permanent villages, more true warfare - as distinct from skirmishes, raids and sorties - than in the rest of the country. As is well known, the Iroquois developed a comparatively elaborate set of institutions to handle the problems associated with the conditions under which they lived. On the Plains, where hunting was a large group enterprise, there emerged a set of institutions, usually called military societies, to coordinate the hunting enterprise and enforce the rules. The Ojibwa, with an above average density of population for Canadian Indians, and frequent surpluses of food, had an association, the Grand Medicine Lodge which, among other things, exercised social control and other political functions.

People in these societies identified with comparatively large groupings, like tribes and large clans within the tribes. The clans were dispersed over several localities, so that the identification of the person was not exclusively bounded by a specific locality. However, in most Canadian Indian societies it was the group that resided together and moved together which was the focus of identification and the locus for the exercise of political rights and obligations. The typical band of people who resided and moved together among the nomadic hunters seldom numbered more than a few hundred people. In some seasons of the year a co-residential group might number fewer than twenty. Villages which were occupied for more than a few years were rare. The concept of fixed geographical boundaries, clearly delineated for the purpose of defining rights and obligations was not strongly developed. Most Indian residential locations were really camp sites, the placing of which depended on the season of the year and the kind of economic activity being pursued. These bands had headmen who spoke and acted only on behalf of their own band, groups of narrow compass. They did not speak and act for larger groupings of people, such as tribes.

The social operations which are today wholly or partly the responsibility of government bodies were handled within the context of the family, band, military or ceremonial society. The grooming of youngsters to take over adult roles and skills, the provision for the ill and needy and so on, were activities undertaken within an unspecialized context. The process of solving problems which affected the band or tribe was formalized among the Iroquois, and in some of the Ojibwa and Plains tribes in the form of council meetings, involving headmen from different Sections and levels of the system. However, in the great majority of Indian bands, this process was largely an informal one involving persons of influence in the band who did not necessarily occupy special and named positions.

The method of election of chief and councillor by the band public at large was unknown. Elections did occur within some councils in order to decide which person was to be senior, but these were not public elections as we know them. More typically, a headman would step into his status either because he was the most eligible person in a line of descent which provided leadership or because band public opinion would indicate, without public pronouncement, that he was the man people wanted as headman. The hereditary principle was strongest among the Iroquois and on the Northwest Coast, but the principle was implicitly recognized elsewhere. Perhaps the best way to state the case would be to say that, whereas in some tribes the hereditary principle was explicitly stated as the foremost criterion of selection for office, it was not the foremost criterion among most Canadian Indian groups. However, even in these groups if a person's father or uncle had been headman, he would have a very good chance to become one himself, provided he was competent in the relevant spheres of life.

Some differentiation, or specialization, was found in leadership roles, not only in the more complex systems, such as the Iroquois and Plains, but in many other groups as well. For instance, a person who was headman or chief for purposes of maintaining internal order and solidarity was only infrequently the leader in war. Some anthropologists compare what they call the war chief with what they call the civil or peace chief, noting the different qualities required for each office. From their evidence, it is safe to say that the office of civil or peace chief was the most stable and enduring one. The familiar model that seems applicable to this office is that of the wise and amiable priest, seeking to patch rifts, giving generously to the needy, a quiet but dramatic orator. It would appear that the most pressing and recurrent problem which Indian groups faced, apart from getting a living, was to maintain harmony within the group. This was one of the special tasks of the headman, and he did it by striving for consensus and unanimity among band members.

With the advent of the fur trade there emerged another kind of chief, to which anthropologists usually prefix the label 'trading'. The trading chief acted as an intermediary between the traders and his own people, organized hunting and trapping activities. He was selected for his knowledge of the country, his competence in hunting and trapping, and his ability to command the respect of his fellowmen. As Indian dependence on the fur trade increased, the trader's power increased with it, as did the power of the trading chief. For some groups it was only during the peak of the fur trading period that they had ever known strong internal leadership, although this was in turn dependent on an outside source of economic power. Of course, the role of trading chief was of sustained importance only in the northern parts of the country, for during the second half of the nineteenth century the agricultural settlement of the country and the building of the railroads virtually wiped out that trade elsewhere.

As non-Indian settlement spread, new kinds of Indian residential groupings were established on what were formerly the frontiers. Over most of the country, the trading settlements - often called forts - and the small agricultural settlements were dots in the wilderness, surrounded by shifting groups of Indians, but with the growth of non-Indian population and the channeling of Indians into reserve communities, over much of the country it was the Indian element which came to be surrounded by the non-Indian. For the first time, thousands of Indians found themselves living in permanent, sedentary communities with clearly defined spatial and social bound-aries. A growing body of formal rules governing corporate land usage, residential rights, band membership rights, and so on, gave these mostly quite small communities a legal character and an exclusiveness which stood in marked contrast to the traditional residential groupings.

If we say that the traders invented a new kind of Indian intermediary, the trading chief - we can also say that the government invented still another - the government chief - as well as an institution called the band council through which its affairs with the Indians were handled. It will be recalled that for the greatest majority of Canadian Indian groups there was no precedent for offices and structures such as these. What Hawthorn and his colleagues had to say about British Columbia Indians applies to those in many other parts of the country:

> Thus the chief and the council of a band are administrative devices, without forerunners in the pre-White cultures, and the 'life chief' in the wording of the old Indian Act, refers in this region to a new office which in recent years has sometimes become hereditary within the most socially prominent lineage.[1]

Apparently it was assumed that the model of the European or Canadian village with its elected local government, majority rule, a body of citizens identifying strongly with the community, and so on, would be adopted by the Indians and that the creation of band councils would pave the way to this adoption.

Now with the wisdom of hindsight, we can see that this assumption was somewhat unrealistic, that this development did not materialize to the extent hoped for. Many Indians did not perceive their communities as viable bodies with lives of their own, as it were, and continued to orient themselves primarily to family, extended kinship or other groupings that either cut across the residential community or were but one of several separate segments within it. There was for many no coincidence between the village or other co-residential unit they lived in and the units which they felt were most meaningful. Where interest was shown in local government it was frequently dissipated by the lack of real power to make meaningful decisions at the local level. With the elaboration of rules and regulations designed to protect Indian interests, as then defined, very many matters had to be sanctioned by the Indian Affairs Branch. There was a paucity of important matters about which decisions could be made by Indians in their communities. Furthermore, there was generally a lack of means through which significant changes could be made in situations causing concern.

---

[1] H. Hawthorn, C. Belshaw and S. Jamieson, The Indians of British Columbia, 1958, p. 35.

Band councils persisted in Indian communities, not because they were perceived as responding to important local government needs, but because the government insisted on dealing through them - indeed it had to deal through some formally constituted body, representing the band - and because councils were not only local government bodies, but also ones which acted on behalf of members in fund management and other matters, even when these members were not resident on band land.[1] Several sections of this report are devoted to trends in band council operations, so no more of an evaluative nature need be said in this chapter in which we want only to establish historical perspective. The chief points here are that the band council device was not a spontaneous creation of the Indians, but one which was introduced from the outside; that the system was not congruent with Indian precedent or social organization in most cases; that the development of self-government at the local level did not occur to the extent anticipated. These conclusions were reached by Indian Affairs officials in recent decades, and in particular since the end of World War II. Official optimism with respect to the potential of band councils as viable units of local government is evidenced in the changes to the Indian Act introduced in 1951. Among the changes discussed in Chapter XIV of Part I and worth noting here, one was contained in sect ion 60, through which Indian bands may be granted the right to exercise control and management of its reserve land. Another is contained in section 68, through which Indian bands may be permitted to manage their revenue monies. Still another is contained in section 82 which enables councils to pass money by-laws.

Other attempts to develop self-government among Indians and responsibility for their own affairs include the proliferation of leadership courses, community development projects, the setting up of regional advisory councils which transcend local communities but which are in touch with these local communities, and the decentralization of Indian Affairs Branch administrative structure. These are recent developments designed to inject some corporate life into the veins of Indian communities. Our task is to assess the likelihood of achievement of this aim in different community settings, by looking at community organization trends across the country.

I. COMMUNITY SETTINGS

It is recognized that there are several acceptable definitions of the term community, definitions which differ from one another in important respects. The geographical definition has as its key the notion of co-residence, the sharing of living space among a group of people who inhabit a named locale with boundaries marking it off from other locales. In this usage, community does not imply anything more than the sharing of space and the interactions concomitant with that sharing. A social-psychological definition has as its key the notion of emotional identification, the extent to which people share feelings of solidarity with others who do not necessarily reside in the same locale. A social anthropological definition has as its key the notion of a relatively self-contained structure of relationships that link people together, the people concerned acting as a corporate group for certain purposes.

In this Report our concern is with aspects of social organization in specific locales and so we take as our point of departure for this brief discussion of community settings the geographical definition which features the idea of co-residence, bringing in where appropriate questions about solidarity and social ties that are not completely defined in terms of co-residence.

---

[1] For an extensive discussion of the different functions of band councils, see Part I of this Report, Chapter XIV.

[2] See Part I of this Report, p. 382 forward, for a description of these councils.

The Indians of Canada are unique with respect to residence. There is no other ethnic group in Canada, or, for that matter, in the world which is so much scattered over a vast land in tiny groupings of the hamlet or village category. These small communities are joined together in variously-sized groupings, like agencies and regions, for administrative purposes, but these are external-bureaucratic links rather than communal ones. Few Indian communities are tied together in systems of interdependence for political and economic purposes. People in different Indian communities are joined in networks of kinship, ceremonial and sociability, as we shall see later, but links which have significant power implications cutting across community boundaries are still quite rare.

One can devise many different typologies of Indian communities, using combinations of ecological, demographic, sociological, acculturative and other criteria.[1] However, it is sufficient here to offer a simple classification based on location with reference to environing physical and social objects, and on selected features of social organization.

In terms of sheer frequency, the most common type of Indian community is the small, isolated reserve, frequently referred to in the vernacular as 'bush', in rural non-farm surroundings or on the edge of farming areas. About fifty percent of Canada's Indians reside in such woodland regions. About 300 bands inhabit the woodlands of the Northeast, the northern parts of the western provinces, and the Territories. Not all of these bands are on remote reserves. In the Territories there are no reserves and the Indian populations there inhabit what are officially called Indian Settlements, lands which are not restricted to a particular band. Many of these settlements are former trading posts or fort towns which have since become service and administrative centres for health, welfare, education, and the Indians in these places share community space with non-Indian and Metis. But the more common pattern in the northern regions is that of the relatively isolated reserve with a small population and little contact with non-Indians, that contact being channeled through governmental, religious, and commercial intermediaries. The resource base in these communities is to a declining extent that of trapping and fishing, with only a tiny tapping into the economic juices from employment in mining and lumbering.

Next in frequency are reserve communities in farming regions dotted with non-Indian villages and towns. Reserve communities in farming regions are most of them larger than in the woodland regions and their people are more exposed to the stimuli of everyday non-Indian life. Just over one hundred Indian bands comprising about thirty-five percent of Canada's Indians, live in these predominantly agricultural regions. These Indian reserves are distinguished from the surrounding milieu either by their lack of farming, by the farming of their lands by outsiders who hold leases, or by the lower standards of farming where it is practiced by the Indians. There are exceptions to this general rule: in every province except Newfoundland there are some Indian farmers whose operations equal the standards of non-Indian ones.

Several cities and towns have Indian reserves on their borders or in their midst, as when reserves have become surrounded by municipal lands. Some of these Indian communities are like ethnic neighbourhoods, the boundaries of which are not too clearly defined. Others are like exclusive suburbs, in the sense that very few non-Indians penetrate the district. Such places are like urban villages.

It should be made clear that we are not referring here to those Indian people who have migrated to cities and towns to work and live.

---

[1] For discussion of regional variations in terms of economic position of Indian Communities, see Part I of this Report, Chapter IX.

This migrant element was not included in our study and we mention it here only to differentiate it from the urban reserve communities. We estimate that about fifteen percent of the Indian population lives in urban surroundings. This is the lowest urbanization rate for any substantial ethnic group in Canada, another index of how much the Indians are out of phase with development in the country as a whole.

It is safe to predict that the isolated small band will become increasingly rare. What were formerly rural communities, isolated from urban influences, are coming under the environing society's influence with the spread of mass media. Social and economic services like schools, nursing stations and shops extend into frontier locales to satisfy the swelling demand. Airlines, railways and roads open up far reaches. The tremendous expansion of the tourist industry should introduce an economic base into many corners of what has become an economic wasteland. Industries based on oil, metal, and lumber push back the frontiers. Indians demand urban facilities, like electric power, running water, sewage disposal and arenas even in the most remote places. The point to note with reference to local government, is that this development increases the pressure on communities to order and coordinate operations beyond the individual household. Of course, scores of small co-residential groups will be excluded from such developments, but scores of others are being drawn into it at this time.

Our survey indicates that the type of community least likely to develop a strong local government structure is that which has been recently or is still based on a family-holding trap line economy with winters in the bush and summers at a lake or coastal trading post. The information from the Northeast locations, such as Mistassini in Quebec, lends support to this conclusion. These are reserves which to outside observers appear unorganized, but which still maintain some sort of uncentralized existence. Dr. Tom McFeat, in private communication, evokes a picture of people on such a reserve:

> . . . they are not politically organizational. Nonetheless they are on the reserve, and they keep the home fires burning. They. . .keep the language alive and are, contrary to expectations because of their lack of other incentives, quite groupy. They are groupy with regard to kinship, not only on the reserve, but well across the boundaries of reserves. They love going to Ste. Anne de Beaupre on Ste. Anne's Day. . .and they are given to picking potatoes now and then, or raking blueberries, and occasionally looking for a job, usually looking along with one or two others. . .

These are people who presumably do not have a strong identification with a very specific locality, whose meaningful ties cut across what to them appear as artificial boundaries. It could well be that the most meaningful definition of community for them, as far as decision-making about Indian matters is concerned, is wider than the co-residential community and that they would participate more readily in these wider configurations. In our discussion of voluntary organization later we look at these inter-village ties as potential carriers of community sentiment and decision-making.

The type of community where strong local decision-making units develop is that which maintains a kind of deliberate distinction from its environs, while at the same time interacting with it in a selective fashion. In our field reports we see that such groups as the Squamish of North Vancouver, the Blood of Alberta, the Dokis of Ontario, maintain social boundaries around themselves while at the same time linking up selectively with outside agencies in the surrounding society. Indian communities like these are well-off, when compared with the average, in band-owned resources which they can and do convert into wealth, making them relatively independent.

The variable of economic independence is not easy to analyse. For one thing, economic independence can be a resultant of organized action on behalf of the band. Take, for example, two reserves which are roughly equal with respect to forest or tourist resource potential. whether or not this potential is realized, that is, whether or not these resources are converted into actual wealth, depends not only on such matters as market conditions, transportation facilities, Indian Affairs Branch policies, and the like, but also on how the band as a collectivity responds to opportunities. In one case, certain attitudes of band members and certain organizational impediments, such as excessive factioning, to collective action result in a dormant resource potential; in the other, different kinds of attitudes and a coordinative or integrative organization results in resource exploitation on a systematic basis. Dokis in our field work sample is a case in point.

Another thing to keep in mind when considering economic independence as a determinant of community organization is that an appearance of independence can be achieved through large subsidy and technical aid in communities which are centrally organized through the efforts of government. The appearance can be deceptive and such model communities might be more accurately described, in the words of one of our research team, as crown corporations or establishments. Commenting on this type of situation in the field notes describing one such community, the writer notes the relatively large Indian Affairs Branch subsidy for revenue-producing projects...

> . . .which work through chief and council and thus for the benefit of the reserve more or less as a whole. . .a situation we label the Crown Corporation or Establishment. tie can think of the Establishment as an extension of the bureaucracy itself. For instance, the new band manager and band clerk positions are an explicit extension of the bureaucracy, and are referred to by Branch personnel as 'their own civil servants '.

He goes on to point out that the band council and band public have little genuine voice in decision-making, merely giving assent to what are bureaucratic decisions.

Finally, we mention a type of Indian community close to built-up areas which does not show much in the way of corporate action for local community purposes. This is the type of community in which individual wealth, derived from wages, is far more significant than band wealth, derived from valued holdings of lands, resources, and so on. In such cases, economic independence refers to individuals and families as such and not as members of a band. Lorette, near Quebec City and Rice Lake, near Peterborough, are examples of this type, in which individual Indians are so much oriented to the environing society for purposes of work, sociability, and services that the Indian reserve itself can be regarded as a community in only the geographical sense. [1]

Later in this Report, during the discussion of band council operations, we have occasion to point out some of the effects of factions in conflict within reserve communities. At this point we deal only briefly with the obvious point that communities which are internally divided into groups with conflicting interests are not likely to act in concert on many issues, although this does not mean that such a community will lack a centrally organized group which purports to speak for the community as a whole. For instance, in two of our sample communities, both in agricultural regions, there is a clear-cut social class division, with a few relatively wealthy farming families at the top and many casual labour families at the bottom. The poor class is politically unorganized, indeed suspicious of organization. The wealthy class dominates the few community organizations and the band council and presents to the non-Indian world a front of efficient local government. The lower class is alienated from positions of influence and power, except that a few are usually recruited as minor councillors. Our field workers' discussions with the lower class people in these communities reveals that they view the wealthy ones as "not really Indians", in a sense denying the wealthy ones legitimacy as full community members. Implied in their argument is the notion, frequently noted by observers in Indian communities, of an egalitarian ethic, according to which people with the means to do so should provide the less fortunate with the means to live the same kind of life.

---

[1] For mention of this kind of situation in the context of economic and community organization, see Part I, p. 125 f.

Where differences from the larger Canadian scene are most notable is in those cases where there is considerable variation in wealth within the community, but where the people are tied together in bonds of solidarity which are based on identification with a highly valued tribal tradition (for example, Haida, Blood, Iroquois). In such communities the poorer elements also tend to be traditionalist in their orientation, but are brought into the networks of influence and power. This element tends to be more hostile to the White world than the wealthy one and to combat the intrusion of such non-Indian ideas as majority rule and elected councils. However, they also tend to link up with others in concerted action - that is, to take part in formal organization - and exert influence in that way and make their voices heard.

A particularly awkward situation exists, in terms of different interest groups within the community, where members of more than one band occupy the same geographical space or where registered Indians share this space with those people of Indian ancestry who are not registered. Many communities have in their midst (for example, in the Northwest Territories) or on their fringes (for example, In the Prairie Provinces), people who live an Indian style of life but are not legally Indian. The mechanisms of exclusion were originally solely legal but have since become social also. The basic point is that the people concerned face the same kinds of problem, in meeting the demands of a changing world, but are locked into different bureaucratic systems, impeding concerted action designed to solve the problems. In such cases we can speak of more than one sociological community embraced within one geographical community. The legally Indian community has a basis for concerted action that the other communities do not. An exception in our field work reports is that of The Pas, Manitoba, where a program to duplicate the legally Indian pattern of organization of band council was adopted, but with little success. An attempt to get around the problem that groups which share the same space are linked to different bureaucratic organizations is reported from Fort Resolution in the Northwest Territories, where the Indian Affairs Branch pays so much per head of legally Indian population, while the Territorial government pays so much per head of others in the community towards the costs of setting up a cooperative to exploit local resources. The general impression from the literature is that a mountain of administrative effort is needed to bring forth a mouse of collective action in those geographical communities that include both legal Indians and other people who live like them and face the same kinds of problem.

Another pattern which emerges from our field reports has to do with the physical nucleation of the community. While this does not appear to be as important an issue as social solidarity among the different elements in the community, the evidence is that it must be taken into account in trying to explain why some communities reveal more explicit consensus and collective action than do others, It appears that in most Indian communities homes are scattered over a large area and that there are few publicly recognized gathering points which would give physical expression to the social integration within the community, if indeed that exists. The evidence on hand suggests that the more nucleated the community in physical terms the more likely it is to have a viable corporate life. This is particularly true of those communities where there is either a split along factional lines or an orientation to kinship groups and cliques rather than to the community as a whole.

In brief, the community settings most conducive to collective action are those in which there is homogeneity of membership in tribal groupings; a resource base which permits some degree of economic independence and which is defined as band-owned; and some degree of nucleation in residence.

Needless to say, other factors in the community setting are of importance in determining propensity to collective action. One is the relatively fortuitous happening in which strong outside pressure, perceived insult or injury impel people within the community to organize for a specific purpose. As we have only two reports on this type of social action and reaction we are not justified in doing more than simply mentioning it. Another factor is the presence in the community of some unofficial person or persons from whom radiate waves of organizational energy, messages of guidance, crucial information, pleas of exhortation, and the like. In nine of the communities studied the presence and activities of such persons received special attention. At the risk of premature generalizing on the basis of scanty data, we are prompted to distinguish two separate types of such unofficial persons of influence: the catalyst and the counsellor,

The catalyst is the dynamic person, most often non-Indian but with some legitimate reason for being in the community, who rouses people in different groupings to some kind of concerted action, even if that be only to meet for purposes of discussion or sociability. It appears to be a kind of general rule that energetic people like this do muster a positive response from substantial numbers in the community, but that the persistence of the groupings and activities they generate depends much on their continued presence and pressure.

The other type, the counsellor, is the less obtrusive eminence, a person of influence who holds no official position but whose advice is sought by people in official positions. Such persons of influence are usually Indians who have had considerable experience outside the community. indeed, in three communities in our sample the persons who perform this role were not born in the communities they most influence and are not regarded as one-hundred per cent members of the band. They are pot as much enmeshed in local kinship and factional webs as is the average Indian. We may view them as cosmopolitans. They are most likely to be found in better-off reserve communities in agricultural or mixed agricultural-woodland regions, living as entrepreneurs. One of their most important social functions is to act as nodal points around which public opinion on certain issues can take shape, those issues having to do particularly with local government problems rather than those of community development in the broad sense - the ultimate goal of the catalyst - those of maintaining internal harmony and solidarity, or those of social control.

There are, of course, other kinds of influential persons who are neither catalysts nor cosmopolitan counsellors, whose influence finds expression in efforts to maintain solidarity, settle disputes, protect and enhance group identity, and so on. tie pay special attention to the catalysts and cosmopolitan counsellors here because their roles have not been described with reference to Canadian Indian communities. The unobtrusive person of influence operates in the covert sphere of informal relations, backstage, as it were; the catalyst operates front-stage and tends to promote the development of organizations for the purpose of channelling communal energies, as we shall see later where we spell out in more concrete detail some of these general points.

II. VOLUNTARY ASSOCIATIONS

In Part I of the Report some attention is devoted to the topic of organizations among Indian people, specifically in relation to economic and political development. There the focus is on large-scale organizations and those which bring Indians and non-Indians together. In this chapter the focus is more on local organizations and specifically on the type we call voluntary associations.

We shall not quibble about a definition of voluntary association but simply adopt the popular usage: if an association of persons formed deliberately for any purpose is not defined as governmental, we call it voluntary. The assumption is that one is compelled to belong to governmental groupings, like municipalities, provinces, states, and that one is not compelled to belong to others, like Chambers of Commerce, unions, temperance leagues, and the like.

There is a belief in our society that it is desirable to promote the development of voluntary associations; this is seen as a worthwhile goal in itself. People who are valued as the backbone of society are often leading figures in voluntary associations, like service clubs, professional organizations, recreational clubs, religious sodalities, and the like.

In recent years, Indian spokesmen and interested non-Indian agencies and individuals have urged the formation and fostering of associations in reserve communities, in cities and towns, regionally and nationally. In the files of the Indian Affairs Branch are the titles of 35 regional and national associations, most of which have emerged during the past ten years. The majority of these are exclusively Indian in membership and leadership. There are also scores of local associations such as Friendship Centers which do not appear in the files.

In six of the communities described by the research team, special mention is made of efforts to develop associations at the local level by such varied sorts of people - some of them included under the category of catalyst in the previous chapter - as missionary, community development officer, union representative and local Indians who have attended Branch sponsored leadership courses. In most of the other field reports a picture is presented of viable community organizations but without specifying who initiated them.

The secondary literature on the more remote woodland and sub-Arctic bands contains few references to associations. Such bands are shown as groups which get along with hardly any formal organization. The social networks of kinship and friendship are apparently sufficiently strong to carry the social load in mutual aid, recreation, adaptation, and so on. This appears to be true for the smaller ones, in some of the larger far northern bands (Fort Franklin, Fort Resolution and Fort Rae, Aklavik) recent growth in organization is reported, especially those having to do with getting a livelihood, like trappers' councils and cooperatives. Two of the bands in our field work sample with the richest associational life are in northern British Columbia, Port Simpson and Masset, both with populations of over 600. Thus, the simple attribute of being in the northern woodland or some remote location is insufficient to account for associational life in itself.

From our field work sample we are encouraged to suggest that the chief variables enabling one to predict the numbers and viability of local associations are much the same as noted with reference to concerted action at the community level: size of community; permeability of the social boundaries enclosing the group; homogeneity of the reserve population with reference to language and tribal origin; cultural precedents and predispositions; power of non-Indian institutions in the community. Each of these variables will be discussed in turn. Here let us make the summary point that, apparently, the larger the community, the more social distance between it and the surrounding society the more homogeneous in language, and tribal origin, and the less the locally exercised power of government, church, trader, and so on, the more varied and viable will be the local associational life, especially if in traditional times the group was given to specialization in community functions.

There is probably an optimum community size below which one or more Voluntary associations are unlikely to thrive, where, in effect, they are not needed in the sociological sense. In several of the smaller bands in our sample, such as Cheam and Dokis, associational life sputters faintly, if at all. In two small places in our sample energetic attempts were made to develop associational life by indians who had been imbued with the idea at leadership courses. Observers report that, while their achievements look impressive on paper - several separate clubs and societies are listed for each - only few are truly active and the continued existence of all of them depends much on the continued efforts of the initiators. This does not imply that such communities are not integrated, that there are no bonds which link people in networks, but only that the community integration process is achieved without much formal ordering of relationships.

Having a population of more than 500 or so does not, of course, guarantee the existence of viable local associations. For one thing, the band could be so much integrated with a larger, surrounding community that much of its associational life gets linked with that community. Earlier we suggested that Lorette and Rice Lake could be used as examples of this type of suburban integration. Another way of making the point would be to say that the social boundaries between the Indian band and the surrounding community in such cases are permeable, that many links are with non-Indians. It should be remembered, however, that geographical proximity does not imply social proximity. Where people in the Indian group seek deliberately to maintain social distance, or where the environing groups reject them, the chances for the birth and survival of local organizations are propitious, given the population size and the perceived need for organization.

From our data, it appears that survival chances for associations are greatest where the group is homogeneous with reference to language, religion, and tribal origin. A large proportion which identifies with the one heritage, speaks the same language, or had ancestors who spoke the same language, has a traditional basis for its solidarity. Where such a group also had a set of associations in the pre-modern period, it is likely to spawn a number of associations in the contemporary one. The rich associational life of the Iroquois is well-known from the literature. In our field work sample the homogeneous Blood of Alberta exemplify a relatively large group (over 2000), deliberately maintaining social distance from non-Indian society, and with abundant precedent in the way of traditional associations. We hasten to add that the lack of precedent in formal organization in the past does not rule out the development of a thriving associational life. Indians of The Pas band, numbering over 700, have developed an extensive set of associations, even though their ancestors lived under a kind of informal, non-associational regime said to be typical of the northern woodlands.

It was suggested earlier that where one institution or, more specifically, its agents dominates a community, exercising pronounced power and influence, there will be a feeble development of local voluntary associations. This does not mean that associations will be absent or few in number, for the agents of the institution involved (for example, a church or government agency) might deliberately instigate the setting up of several associations, linked in common membership in the institution or in common sponsorship by the agency. What is suggested here is that the interest and participation of the local people in these associations will be minimal. We do not have much in the way of research support for this contention, for the reason that the great majority of communities in our sample are not dominated by a single institution present at the local level. However, information from two communities which reveal this pattern of centralized domination by a non-Indian institution leads one to believe that the agents of the institution are primarily interested in the institution itself and secondarily in the community, and view the associational structure as a means of satisfying the needs of the institution.

A survey of our sample reveals a multiplicity and variety of associations at the local level which belies the common stereotype of the Indian as a non-organization man. These associations can be described in terms of their purposes and functions, their sponsorship, their inclusiveness or exclusiveness in terms of larger structure, like regions, and whether or not they are exclusively registered Indian in composition.

The most frequent type is that which has to do with sociability, mutual aid, and the maintenance of cultural identity. Within this classification, the most frequent sub-type is the organized grouping for purposes specific to the community - entertainment and social service. To outsiders, the best-known of these associations are the Homemakers' Clubs, sponsored by Indian Affairs Branch in an attempt to muster the participation of Indian women. The presence of these clubs is noted for seven communities in our sample, in two of which they are said to be quite active. For two others, the observers report that only a few women take part in Homemaker activities. For the other three it is difficult to assess the significance of these clubs, because of the lack of opportunity to observe them in action. In many ways similar to the Homemakers' Clubs are the Women's Auxiliaries of church groups, except that the latter are typically dominated by non-Indian persons. An interesting development, a variation of the theme of the women's organization, is a group called the Willing Workers at The Pas reserve, which is a strictly local group, presided over by the wife of the band council chief. It is primarily a mutual aid organization, one of the functions of which is to lend money for weddings and funerals. Another group rather like this one is reported from Port Simpson. It is called the Happy Gang, and is composed of young women who contribute money for Christmas gifts, wreaths at funerals and the like, raising the money at dances. The picture that forms in reading of these various women's organizations is that of the typical rural hamlet or village, with its gatherings of adult women in sewing circles, baking sales, church decoration, and the like. As in non-Indian communities, these groupings tend to be dominated by the most prominent local women - the minister's wife, the teacher, nurse and the chief's wife. Where more than one women's group exist, the one set of women tends to dominate them all, except where there are two religious denominations in the community. Again, we suggest this as the pattern for equivalent non-Indian communities.

An interesting variant of the type of association concerned primarily with sociability is that which includes non-Indians in its membership and activities in a deliberate attempt to bring together people of different origins. The Friendship Centre at The Pas is a case in point, involving as it does Indians, Metis and Whites. The Mika Nika club in Kamloops is another. The Trail Rider's Club on the Blood reserve organizes a camp once yearly for a mixed Indian and White group. The United Church Men's Club in Goodfish (part of Saddle Lake band), was initiated by the minister there, his aim being

> . . .to broaden everyone's outlook by bringing in speakers, and to assist in integrating the Indian population of the area by alternating the meetings between the reserve community hall and the town hall in Ashmont.

Apart from the avowed aim of such organizations to improve relations between ethnic groups, observers note the underlying or latent function of exposing Indian people to the ways of the outsiders so that they learn how to operate in the larger society.

While on the subject of groupings with mixed memberships, we must note the increasing participation of Indians in Alcoholics Anonymous, mentioned in four of our community studies. A significant point is that the Indian participants are mostly from among the most influential elements in the community - chiefs, councillors, chairmen of organizations on the reserve, the very people who have adopted, at least superficially, the middle-class approach to life. Whatever the therapeutic consequences, it is in the setting of Alcoholics Anonymous that Indians have some of their most intimate contacts with non-Indians, interacting as equals, as people in the same boat.

---

[1] See page 126, Part I of this Report, where this and other mixed membership associations are mentioned.

We get the distinct impression from field work reports that the most vital voluntary associations in Indian communities are those which are defined as exclusively Indian and which have as their chief aims the coordination of activities in sociability, recreation, ceremonial, and the protection of Indian interests in the local setting. Some of these associations are strictly local; others are tribal and regional in scope. Some are patterned after models in the surrounding society; others look to tradition for their models.

To begin with those which are of strictly local span, we note that one cannot tell from the title or constitution of the association just what functions it will perform. Take, for instance, the Masset Athletic Club, comprising most of the male population between 16 and 45, As its title implies, this club organizes sports teams and events. However, it also acts as a pressure group in local politics, openly campaigning for certain nominees in band council elections, some of whom were former executive officers and senior members of the club. The club also holds dances, takes part in and contributes to funerals. In short, the title is misleading in terms of the actual functions and powers of this club. Similar associations are reported from other larger-than-average reserves. To mention one in particular, the Walpole Island Conservation Club is focussed, as is implied in its title, on a specific objective, control over the spread of pesticides. Yet this club performs many important local government functions, is a pressure group, and assumes the right to define what is desirable for the community as a whole and for Indians in the global sense. Like the Masset Athletic Club, its operations spill over into many domains of community life. Such clubs as these owe much of their success to the fact that they can claim legitimacy on the basis of their Indianness, even though their structures and procedures are based on non-Indian models.

Then there are numerous organizations and committees in Indian bands which coordinate recreational and ceremonial events in which Indians from different localities are brought together. To list a few described in our field work reports: the Indian Dancers of Mount Currie; the Blackfoot All Indian Rodeo Association, with representation among the Blood; the Cultus Lake Festival, among the small Chilliwack bands; the inter-community associations linking Iroquois groups, such as the Six Nations' Pageant. From accounts of these associations one gains the impression of widespread and enthusiastic participation in activities that bring Indians together in specific communities but on a regional or tribal level. Some of these activities are defined as sacred and solemn; others - such as sporting contests - as recreational and pleasurable. What they have in common is interaction of Indians across community lines and the expression of something wider than a local solidarity. In effect, they demonstrate to the world that they are still alive, not in the biological sense, but in the social sense, as distinct Indian groups. It would be interesting to study the development of inter-community ties in terms of the changing technology, with the spread of roads and methods of rapid transportation, especially automobiles, over the past few generations. Unfortunately, our data lacks sufficient historical depth to warrant our making definite statements on this score, but we venture to suggest that improvement in communication and transportation facilities has in recent years increased the interaction of Indians across local boundaries and that this trend will be stepped-up in the future.

Another type of association which operates on a regional or even national, basis and which we found represented locally in a few places is the protective and pressure group type, resembling the ethnic group associations so common in Canada. Some of these, like the Indian-Eskimo Association of Canada,[1] were originally sponsored by non-Indians, but most are Indian in sponsorship and membership. Regional associations are most numerous in British Columbia and the Prairie provinces. As our concern is primarily with the question of decision-making and organization at the local level, we do not attempt to assess the significance for Canada as a whole of this type of ethnic association. Where our observers found them represented at the local level, they report that interest in them was not widespread and was confined to only a few of the more prominent members of the community. Two reports mention that some suspicion of national and regional associations was manifested by informants who felt that many of the leaders of these associations were not genuine Indians.

---

[1] See Part I of this Report, p. 381 f.

We cannot say with the limited data on hand just how much channeling of local views, grievances, and desires is directed through these regional associations. There is an evident desire on the part of government to help construct some kind of channeling machinery, but their chief strategy in this regard appears to favour the setting up of quasi-governmental regional advisory councils. Perhaps the most valuable function to be performed by the kind of voluntary associations under review will be that of feeding into local communities messages from broader Indian fronts which will facilitate the formulation of goals at the local level and will contribute to the definition and re-definition of Indian identity. These associations should prove to be of long-term significance to Indians as an ethnic group and not as members of any given community.

Of more direct and obvious relevance to questions of adapting to political and economic conditions is the type of association, rare amongst Indians, which deals on their behalf with those who employ them. As an ethnic category, the Indians are the least organized and integrated into the union movement. Our sample includes only two communities in which chapters of unions exist, Port Simpson and Masset. It was in this region of northern British Columbia that the first Indian association dealing with economic problems confronting Indians in the fishing industry was founded and flourished, the Native Brotherhood of British Columbia. Eventually this association extended its scope to other spheres of concern, such as Indian land claims, citizenship rights, and so on, but its chief activities had to do with representation and negotiation on behalf of Indian workers. Our field work reports that this association has a strong competitor, at least in Massett, in the Shoreworkers' Local of the United Fishermen and Allied Workers, a non-Indian led union with headquarters in Vancouver, which our observer reports is gaining members from the Native Brotherhood (and especially the Native Sisterhood, its female counterpart) because of the latter's comparative lack of vigour and success in specific negotiations with employers.

Another type of association having to do with economic adaptation is the cooperative. In our field work sample, Fort Alexander in Manitoba shows the most vigorous development in this respect, with three cooperatives functioning in the community. As these were launched only a few years before our field worker visited the community, it is too early to assess the effectiveness of this movement. However even after a short time in operation it became manifest that the cooperatives were assuming a conspicuous role in community organization, not simply as economic associations, but also as coordinating and social control agencies for many purposes. As we point out later on this community has two factions, one of which is a numerical minority, and it is the most numerous faction which supports the cooperative movement most heartily. What the establishment of cooperatives has achieved, then, is a new focus of organization for one faction in the community, at the same time adding a new boundary marker between factions.

In looking over the total picture of associational life in our sample, certain patterns in recruitment, support, and modes of integration stand Out. In most places the associational work load is carried by only a few people, often of the one family - such as a group of adult siblings - or of the one set of prominent persons. Like the influential people discussed in the previous chapter, these persons are likely to have had experience outside the reserve community and to be familiar with models of non-Indian organization. An exception to this general rule applies to these associations based on traditional models, like the age grade and military society of the Blood and the religious societies among the Iroquois, whose leaders are usually deeply committed to the local group or tribe. The strongest and most widespread support from the public at large is extended to those associations which concentrate on sociability, sports, and entertainment, particularly where these activities involve groups from other communities.

Three modes of integration of groups within communities stand out. One is exemplified in the Blood reserve where the various associations are integrated in terms of an explicitly recognized division of functions without a strong central core. No association competes with another. There is a consensus in the tribe about which grouping is to do what and about the legitimacy of the associations. The strongest associations appear to be those based on traditional models. A rather similar pattern of integration occurs in Mount Currie, in the sense that there are several organizations with complementary functions, which do not compete with one another, but the great majority of these are patterned on non-Indian models. There is not much inter-locking membership, but some focal point to which all refer is present in the form of the Roman Catholic Church, which nevertheless does not dominate the associations. Like the Blood, then, the Mount Currie pattern is essentially an uncentralized one. One effect of this decentralization is to put the associational structure outside the control and concern of official authority or of any one set of persons or institution.

Another pattern is the one in which inter-locking memberships and executive positions provide a network binding associations together. This is the most usual pattern in the smaller reserves, although it occurs also in some larger ones, like The Pas, where most of the population is brought into one or another association, the associations being linked through inter-locking memberships. It is typical of this mode of integration that the associational structure is linked closely with the band council, which can be viewed as either serving the associations or dominating the whole network of organization. Centralization through interlocking membership and leadership and band council also occurs in Fort Alexander and Nipissing, but in both these places substantial components of the populations are more or less alienated from the associational structure. In situations like this organizations which compete or conflict are likely to be found.

Nowhere in our field work reports is there mention of any inherent inability on the part of Indians to engage in collective endeavours such as occur in many voluntary associations. On the contrary, where a need for collective action is felt, those Indians who feel it are willing to start or take part in local organizations. In this respect the Indians are probably not much different from others who live under similar circumstances, and any difficulty in stimulating collective action in such places is not an Indian difficulty, but a socio-economic one, as has been suggested in Part I of the Survey.

CHAPTER VII

GENERAL ASPECTS OF BAND COUNCILS

In the following chapter we focus on one kind of organization, the band council. The legal and political dimensions of band councils have received close attention in Part I of the Survey and a certain amount of repetition is unavoidable, but our chief concern here will not have to do with the formal characteristics of band councils. Our concern is to examine trends in the actual internal operation of these units and to draw attention to their varying significance in different communities.

We do not choose to devote so much space and attention to band councils because we think that they are most important units of community organization, for that would be prejudging their significance. Two reasons are advanced for magnifying band councils in this Report. First, because they are the only officially constituted units of local government in Indian communities which occur all over the country, development of them in the interest of planned change on a national level is easier to achieve than is development of other units of community organization. Second, because no systematic study of band councils has ever been offered on a national scale, it is opportune to present the rather extensive data we have on the subject.

In the ensuing discussion it is important to keep in mind that band councils are not simply units of local government in the usual sense of that term. As has been pointed out elsewhere in this Report, band councils are local government bodies involving residents on band-controlled land, where they have to do with such common-place local government matters as sewage, culverts, school buses, relief allocation, and the like. But they are also the legally constituted units vested with responsibility for treaty matters, trust funds, band capital and revenues. In this respect they are like financial companies whose scope extends beyond residents of band-controlled land to those who are members of the band but do not live on its land.

How important are band councils? How important are they as bodies representative of Indian views, aspirations, and needs; as coordinators of community activities that affect people in significant ways; as agencies of social control? Before plunging into the data gathered in this project in an effort to answer this question, let us look briefly at some general points made about band councils in recent studies. Going back almost ten years, to look at the exhaustive study of Indian life in British Columbia, we find the evaluation of the band council situation at that time to have been as follows: it is best to separate out the local government responsibilities of councils from their other corporate responsibilities, a recommendation that is repeated in Part I of the present Report; that because so many of the smaller band councils perform few significant functions, it is advisable to inject local government participation by creating larger, more inclusive structures, such as agency councils. This latter point will be taken up again later. The chief point made in the British Columbia study is that the band councils are potentially crucial vehicles in the process of social change.

This study, unlike others of older and recent vintage, reports on what band councils actually do in British Columbia. On the basis of observation of band council meetings between 1952 and 1954, the study lists the kinds of topics which get on the agendas of band councils in that province. From the great variety of topics covered, Hawthorn and his colleagues derive a few categories under which band council business can be subsumed:

> . . . a) the superintendent initiates a discussion to obtain a formal resolution which he requires to implement his policy
>
> . . . by far the greatest proportion of agenda items and time spent relates to matters which have this character...
>
> . . . b) the superintendent requires facts to enable him to arrive at an administrative decision... The information he needs may pertain to property owned by a deceased person... to the degree of indigence of some person who is applying to him for relief; to the intention of residence of some person whose status is in doubt... (In a few cases he accepts the recommendations of) the councillors... We believe the delegation of this function to councillors is an important step in creating a responsibility of administration in them...
>
> . . . c) the superintendent wishes to obtain the council's views on policy matters...
>
> . . . d) the band council initiates a discussion in order to obtain action or facilities from the superintendent. This group of agenda items might in a sense be regarded as an index of the successful progress of the council. If this be so, we must record that councils have far to go at present (1956)...
>
> . . . e) the passage of disciplinary by-laws... Councils do not seem to be aware of their potential powers to pass such by-laws...
>
> . . . f) exhortation on moral or welfare matters (by superintendents)...
>
> . . . g) to settle disputes...usually of a civil nature, involving say the inheritance of land...[1]

It will be seen from the categorization above that the sociological functions of band councils can be grouped under two main headings. One is the representative function, in which the council represents the government vis-a-vis the band and the band vis-a-vis the government. This could as well be called the intermediary function. One part of this function is to be the channel of communication for certain kinds of messages between the band and the outside world. In this representative function the band council gives formal sanction to measures and decisions originating in the band or outside the band. From the data presented in this British Columbia study, it would appear that the band councils there and at that time were primarily legitimators of measures and decisions from outside, channeled through the superintendent.

Two other functions which are not illustrated in the information from this British Columbia study, but which are theoretically the properties of governments are: the coordination of activities which are important for the group as a whole; and the formulation of long-term strategies and goals on behalf of the group governed. In our field work data we provide illustration of these functions, which do not seem to have been prominent on the British Columbia band council scene in the mid-fifties, which scene presents band councils with limited political and administrative significance.

---

[1] Hawthorn, *et al.*, 1958, p. 454 f.

Where a band council is preoccupied with policies and programs for the political and economic development of the band and where it takes a direct part in coordinating activities that have to do with this development, we say that the council has a directive or adaptive function. For instance where the council acts like a municipality, dealing with other non-Indian units of local government in mutual concerns; where it acts like a real estate agency, promoting deals with industrial and commercial interests; where it promotes the exploitation of its resources by linking its members with lumber companies, tourists, fishermen and hunters, and coordinates the efforts of its members in providing such goods and services; where any or all of these kinds of operation form a significant portion of council business, and especially where these matters are of considerable significance to the band as major sources of income, we can say that the band council has much influence in the overall direction of the community, that it has a directive function.

This kind of function may be compared with two other kinds: one, the routine administration of what could be called personal and physical plant - welfare allocation, school buses, band roads, and so on; and, second, what is sometimes referred to as the socio-emotional kind of function, concerning the settling of disputes, integration of the community, tribal or band identity, ceremonial activity, and so on. Such socio-emotional matters are rarely the concern of elective band councils according to the literature consulted, but the evidence we shall present later shows an increase in concentration on personal and physical plant maintenance and on adaptive measures. Let us say in a preliminary way here that the representative and intermediary functions stressed by the Hawthorn group for British Columbia in 1958 are the most important for the majority of band councils. As we saw, they took this to be some measure of the band council's limited significance, but promising potential.

This view of the limited significance of band councils, especially where populations are small and band resources are limited, is found in much of the recent literature on band council activities in what we have called the secondary sources for purposes of this study, which contain accounts of contemporary hinterland life in northern locations from Alert Bay near Vancouver Island to the Labrador in the East. Certain themes, which we summarise briefly here, run through these accounts.

One theme, which perhaps is the major one coursing through these reports, is the lack of fit between the elective band council and procedure and the traditional structures and procedure. Another is the evident desire for public consensus or unanimity and the perception of the elective system and majority rule as inimical to the achievement of this goal, because they bring Out into the open divisions between factions and individuals. Unfortunately in these studies the actual process of decision-making is seldom described, because the emphasis is on comparing the present day situation with aboriginal situations. One gathers from these accounts that whatever indigenous leadership there was has weakened. Again and again one is reminded of the insignificance of official band councils as decision-making bodies and the location of whatever Indian leadership there is in the covert power structure. One reads in these accounts of the difficult role of chief as an intermediary, or liaison official, between the Indians and the government.

In most of these studies the chief and councillors are portrayed as channels of communication for certain purposes between the band and the government, and as part of the administrative, as distinct from the political, structure. For many places it is reported that the only part of their role which is regarded as legitimate by band members is that which has to do with transmitting messages back and forward between band and government.

The strain in this role, as a result of the cross-pressures, receives some attention in these accounts. In a few of these studies it has been pointed out that the key quality sought in candidates for office is inoffensiveness; the kind of person desired is one who is unlikely to alienate the outsiders or people in his band. Apparently this quality is most admired where there is a strong interest in maintaining a public front of solidarity and harmony. This implies a concern that the consent of people of consequence in the community be assured before a decision is made. Unfortunately, in the accounts given in these secondary sources, there are hardly any examples to show how in concrete instances the chiefs and councillors contribute to the maintenance of this overt display of solidarity.

The typical picture from the studies reviewed is that of chiefs and councillors with little say in administering band revenues, because in most places there are hardly any revenues; in band economic development, because opportunities for this are so limited; in social control, because they are reluctant to wield whatever authority they have; in maintaining the solidarity and identities of their people, because other, more traditional and influential people perform that function; of wielding any significant power, because real power is in the hands of outsiders, such as traders, missionaries, government officials, and the Indian people have become dependent on such people.

Because it is the habit of anthropologists, upon whose observations the foregoing summaries are made, to prefer research among the most remote and untouched bands, we introduce perspective by pointing out that most Indians live in other than remote bands, and that it is the experiences of these Indians in closer touch with changes in society which are becoming increasingly typical. Perhaps the foregoing summary picture of band councils, in their relations with their own people and with the outside, is already out of date for scores of band councils in the country.

One way to regard band councils is in terms of the bureaucratic structure of the Indian Affairs Branch. When viewed in this way, many of them are really appendages, performing few functions beyond that of rubber-stamping or carrying our certain elementary functions like that of feeding information to the administrative system on such matters as who should have a new house, who is entitled to welfare assistance, and so on. This is particularly the case where the band has limited funds or where it has little control over funds, as well as where specific revenue-producing projects are subsidized by the Branch and where the expenditures have to be scrutinized at just about every step by the central government. In such cases, bands are limited by statutory impediments as far as autonomous decision-making is concerned on matters of significance.

Where statutory limitations are not so strict, for instance, where bands control their own revenue monies, and where there is a substantial band-owned resource to exploit - as was the case in several of the bands in our sample - the council assumes the look of a municipal government rather than that of a bureaucratic appendage. This does not mean that they are fully autonomous, any more than a non-Indian municipal government is fully autonomous. The latter are also subject to statutory limitations imposed by provincial and territorial governments and can have many of their decisions disallowed by the more inclusive level of government. In the same way, Indian band councils can have decisions disallowed by the Minister, which is to say the Indian Affairs Branch. For instance, a given band council might decide to develop tourism in an area where regional plans call for timber or some other resource development which is incompatible with tourism. The final sanction in such an issue comes from above. The implications of this point are spelled out in Part I of the Report. tie repeat the point here to put the question of autonomy in perspective. Autonomy is a matter of degree. Furthermore, as we have seen, many bands do not take advantage of the degree of autonomy that they already have, for instance, in passing by-laws which permit them to raise taxes for certain local purposes, creating zoning, curfew and other regulations. While there has been a general reluctance to legislate such by-laws, the evidence indicates that this reluctance is on the wane and that, where a band council breaks the ice by passing one, it is likely to pass other by-laws. However, despite the permissive features of the Indian Act and regulations concerning powers to make by-laws, the strength of the band council in the total Indian Affairs Branch superstructure is determined more than anything else by the band-owned wealth and the degree of control over that wealth enjoyed in the band. In recognition of this, the Indian Affairs Branch has recently instituted a grants-to-bands program through which councils in bands with scarce funds can make decisions which imply the spending of money without a day-to-day accounting to the Indian Affairs Branch. tie do not have sufficient data from our field work to permit an assessment of this recent program, but on tho basis of what we know, it would appear to be a good one if the grants are defined as something to which the Indian groups are entitled by right rather than as something which is presented as an enticing carrot in an experiment designed to see how they will respond.

The attitudes and conduct of Branch officials are key variables influencing the development of institutions of self-government. While a number of factors, such as the educational level of reserve residents, their degree of militancy in demanding more local autonomy, and the amount of corporate wealth they have at their disposal, will all affect the responsiveness of the Indian Affairs Branch to the play of local pressures, the fact remains that in general the balance of authority and power in the relationship between Indian bands and the administration is inevitably one-sided. In the last analysis any significant development of independence is permitted by the administration.

Verbal adherence to "working oneself out of a job", projections of the withering away of the Indian Affairs Branch, extreme sensitivity to charges of authoritarianism or paternalism, the launching of the community development program with its advocacy of democratic relationships between the C.D.O. and Indians, plus numerous public statements about the desirability of local self-government by and for the Indian people, all indicate that at the level of generalised policy the Branch now sees itself as a development agency working with Indians rather than as a caretaking agency protecting its wards. Ultimately, however, policy has to manifest itself in new patterns of relationships between Branch officials, especially at the Agency level, and Indians.

Beneath the verbal adherence to local autonomy there is a fear, both collective and individual, of taking calculated risks . The resultant cautious conservative attitudes to the introduction of change reflect the legacies of previous patterns of conduct and belief in the Branch. As one of our field workers pointed out:

> To date, it would be generally true to say that the Indians have not been taught to fully believe that Indian Affairs and the local governments on reserves ought to look after their interests, and consequently it is not of prime importance that they do not appear to do so.

There is widespread verbal adherence to the idea that Indians will learn from their mistakes, but this is countered by the perceptions of administrators that the criticism which such mistakes engender will be borne by officials and not by Indians. The following two extracts from a field worker's report summarizing his observations reveal the pressures which operate at the Agency level of administration:

> Insofar as the trend is towards smooth administration, Indian Affairs are interested In maintaining peace with the local governments on reserves. This has resulted in a certain 'type' of leadership being appreciated,

> and also in a limited understanding of the Indian by the administrators. This understanding is of a practical and superficial nature and is conditioned by the needs and purposes of the Superintendent qua bureaucrat, and in this remote capacity, he is concerned with external behavior and only a small part of it. Therefore, we find local governments being considered acceptable if they accommodate the administrative needs of the agency, and a general condemnation of those local governments which disrupt or thwart the administration. Although, it would seem, if they took their objectives seriously, that the administration ought to create opposition to itself in order that Indians could gain what experience they can of organized work for political purposes, such opposition is not appreciated. One hears Indians in such opposition activity being branded as 'trouble makers' rather than leaders.
>
> . . . .
>
> The emphasis of the procedures of officials at the lower levels of Indian Affairs remains largely in the direction of ensuring that the bureaucratic machine runs smoothly rather than in attempting to establish 'good' (i.e., responsible to the majority) government. In other words, there is a primary concern with making local government responsible to Indian Affairs rather than to the Indians... This bias is (partially) to be found in the heavy demands placed on those individuals at the agency level in Indian Affairs. These men cannot really afford to entertain anything but narrow views and shallow objectives, for it takes all their ability just to accommodate temporarily the many interests they cannot afford to neglect. The net result of this seems to be a sat is-fact ion of the demands of the bureaucracy and a neutralization, if anything, of the demands of the Indians. Although 'progressive' policies may be passed down from the senior levels of Indian Affairs, the higher 'time preference' of officials at the lower levels nullifies their effectiveness... The inclination to place the emphasis on paper work rather than people is especially true for 'career' men in Indian Affairs, who have no desire to try something new for fear that it will go wrong.

The ambiguities in Branch policy are also apparent in an ambivalence about self-government which was noted by another field worker with reference to a reserve in British Columbia:

> The methods of the agency are somewhat paradoxical with respect to the objectives in local government which they hope to obtain. On the one hand they desire the band council to be responsible for their decisions, 'without having to find out what the people think all the time'. However, at the same time exception is taken to those decisions by the council which are not in accord with Indian Affairs Branch desires.

In illustration of this point, another of our field workers reported that:

> It appears that local Indian Affairs Branch officials become willing to place some of the means of 'self-government' in the hands of band councils when those councils demonstrate 'progressive' leadership; that is, leadership based on goals that appear to be essentially in agreement with Indian Affairs Branch policies. It also appears that administrators are unwilling to recommend 'self-determination' moves for councils, however powerful or representative, who embody 'traditional' or 'conservative' leadership.

Branch procedures can themselves be so inhibiting that self-government may get lost in long procession of administrative requirements. For example, an outstanding feature of the operation of passing by-laws is the intricate network of checking and approving involved. In the initial stage a by-law will be formulated and discussed among band council members. If the by-law requires enforcement by the Royal Canadian Mounted Police or other police force, these officials will be approached for their views. The superintendent is also involved at this initial juncture. It is his function to report the proposed by-law to the regional office of the Indian Affairs Branch Regional officials and check the purpose and adequacy of the by-law before sending it to Indian Affairs Branch headquarters. Here financial and technical aspects are investigated prior to the signing of approval. At any stage the proposal may be referred back to a previous procedural stage for changes or for more information. This is not to say that by-laws always take a long time to be approved or that delay is necessarily a bad thing. However, if bands are to be given the formal powers to develop local self-determination, any practices which might stall such a policy should be given more examination.

The Indian Affairs Branch is a large and complex administrative organization. It administers the affairs of over 200,000 Indians scattered from the Atlantic to the Pacific. As a consequence the processing of information and the response to queries from the field is often slow. We. could provide many examples of delay in the processing of band business, delays occasioned by structural blockages outside the bands' control.

These comments on some of the attitudes and procedures of the Branch which may inhibit the development of self-government at the local level must be tempered with the recognition that the Branch, particularly at headquarters level, has been undergoing a profound transition characterized by policy and personnel changes, and that recognition of the problems is evident in Branch personnel and they are seeking ways to overcome them.

Our remarks so far have concerned points about the relations of band councils with the embracing administrative structure of the Indian Affairs Branch. Structurally, most band councils link up directly only with the Branch. Where they do have some kind of dealing with other agencies, for example, town councils, developers, provincial agencies, negotiations proceed indirectly with the Branch acting as intermediary. The Branch's mediating role is so much taken for granted that, according to our field work reports, even where interested parties do not need to go through this intermediate step, they do so rather than going at first directly to the band council with whom they will have to deal in the end. However, the trend which is noted later on is for those band councils which most resemble municipalities in their operations to deal directly with such outside agencies as city councils, school boards, sources of professional advice, developers, provincial government agencies, and so on. Where these direct negotiations occur the council and the band get defined by outsiders and members alike as autonomous units with real powers. It is a sociological truism that people tend to act in the way in which they are defined: if they are defined as autonomous, they act autonomously.

Given this trend among band councils with the resource and statutory muscle to deal directly with environing powers, we must remind ourselves that most band councils link with such powers through the Branch. As we saw in a previous chapter, considerable linking occurs across community boundaries in sociability and ceremonial, but little occurs in the power spheres of economics and politics. A few exceptions to this rule have been noted as far as the economic realm is concerned. Cooperatives link up across community lines in the one place in our field work sample where there is a strong cooperative development and we have reports of trapper's councils covering whole districts in the far north. Otherwise there is little interaction of an economic or governmental kind covering districts in which the inhabitants of different communities face what are basically the same kind of problem. tie did note earlier that the Indian Affairs Branch has a developing program of regional advisory councils, but these cover very broad regions, in some cases whole provinces, and are not inter-community or inter-band links in the sense used here.

As we have seen, in regions where band populations are small and there is considerable dispersal in several small localities, band councils have little significance, except for bureaucratic purposes, as an administrative finger of the Indian Affairs Branch. In such areas one might have expected the development of other, wider structures, embracing bands or interest groups across community boundaries. while this kind of development has not been impressive, it should be reported that it does occur. In our field work sample is a report on the grouping called the Ten-Band Advisory Council, made up of the small bands in the Chilliwack district of southern British Columbia. This development occurred in a district where communications are relatively easy to establish and maintain. With some difficulty, occasioned by geography and poverty, a group of bands in northern Ontario which come under the one treaty have created an inclusive organization. Provincial authorities have sponsored meetings of groups on a district level. These experiences have shown there are formidable difficulties in creating structures which include more than one band in the northern woodland and sub-Arctic regions. Travel costs and language differences have proven to be the chief problems. The language difficulty deserves special mention here because of the limitation it places on participation of people whose facility in one of the official languages is poor or non-existent and who are comfortable only in their mother tongue, thus restricting participation to those who speak one or the other official language. An attempt to circumvent this difficulty is reported from northern Saskatchewan where simultaneous translation facilities have been provided for meetings involving Indians from three different language backgrounds. It is interesting to note that at these meetings people other than registered Indians took part, people whose living conditions and socio-economic problems are similar to those of registered Indians.

The discussion has wandered from a consideration of band councils as such, which is inevitable considering the need for local government structures in areas where the band council is not isomorphic with any meaningful community structure for the solution of socio-economic problems, most of which are not peculiarly Indian and not particularly local.

Another aspect of the structural position of a band council to consider is the relations it has to other groupings and persons within the community. In a few groups in our sample, the band council is a powerful community force, with overlapping legislative, executive, and administrative functions. For instance, in one band the council makes rules concerning land usage, conditions under which relief is granted or withheld (they recently adopted a work for relief policy) and other local policy matters; administers winter work and other employment programs; has a hand in coordinating many kinds of activities. In this case the Superintendent concurs in the policies and methods employed by the council and seldom interferes with these, regarding this council as a model one. The field work report on this reserve states that many apparently genuine grievances of band members are discounted by the council which is dominated by one set, or clique, of persons who are difficult to unseat at election time because of a lack of unified opposition to them. A vignette of this council in action is given on page 5 of Chapter IX.

Bands, Civil Servants and Other Officials

A trend which is visible in several bands in our sample is towards the separation of the policy-making from executive and administrative functions, by employing people who are defined as servants of the band to carry out administrative tasks. tie do not refer here to administrative personnel like Superintendents or assistant Superintendents who report directly to their agency regional headquarters. Because of their orientation to the Branch, there is almost always a pigeon-holing of people in such posts as part of the out-group, even if they are of Indian descent and are personally liked. Such officials are viewed more as administrators of the Indian Act rather than as band civil servants. The latter term is often used to designate those persons, usually of Indian descent, who occupy positions as band managers, clerks, welfare administrators, work supervisors, constables, and the like, and who report directly to the band council.[1] Managers and clerks in some bands possess communicative and manipulative skills which are quite scarce in Indian groups and because the band public and council are dependent on persons with such skills, the servants occupy positions of considerable power and influence. However, at least in theory they can be removed by their employers, the council. We hasten to point out that the problem of usurpation of power by band civil servants does not appear to be a serious one. What is more of a problem is the lack of practically trained Indian persons to carry out administrative tasks which are currently handled by Branch personnel or by council members themselves.

It is very difficult to assess in general terms the effectiveness of currently employed band civil servants from the data at our disposal, so great and many are the variations in reported performance. At one extreme we have the following assessment of a field worker reporting on an Ontario reserve:

> . . . the band manager, who happens to be a brother-in-law of the chief, is hopelessly inefficient, even by his own admission. There had been no competition for the post, the man just happening to 'be in the right place at the right time'. People resented this and said it was simply a family affair.

At the other extreme, we have the assessment of a band manager on a reserve in an urban community who is a high school graduate and who

> . . . is a real estate dealer, accountant, and executive combined. I am sure that the city hall would pay high for a man of his calibre. Even though the family he comes from is not popular with the establishment which dominates the council, he is very much appreciated and people are proud of him.

In two bands in our sample local administrative functions are performed by Indians who do not belong to these bands but are immigrants from other bands in the same general region. Neither is involved In the kinship and clique networks of the communities in which they work, a factor which, according to our observers, works to their advantage as administrators and focusses attention on their performance rather than on their connections.

Our remarks to this point concerning administrative functions have been made with reference to bands of larger than average size. In most bands, the population size and the extent of administration do not warrant the employment of full-time band civil servants, although several small ones have part-time clerks and secretaries. The administrative load in the majority of small bands, where it is not carried by an agent or assistant agent, is carried by the chief or less frequently, one of the councillors. They are not paid for this work, tie have noted numerous complaints on this score from our field work reports and from secondary sources. One kind of complaint emanates from members of the band public who feel that they are unjustly treated as applicants for welfare, houses, land usage, and the like, charging that the chief or councillor discriminates against them in his executive and administrative capacities. It is almost impossible to evaluate the bulk of these charges. The other kind of complaint, which does seem to be realistically grounded, is that the amount of work involved in ordinary council business plus administrative tasks is rather onerous for chiefs or councillors who, like so many Indians, live just on or above the subsistence level and who have to sacrifice opportunities to leave the community on hunting, fishing, trapping, or seasonal labour journeys in order to carry out their community responsibilities.

---

[1] For discussion of the need for band civil servants, see Part I of the Report, pages 309-11.

This brings up the more general problem of rewards for filling the office of chief and councillor. There is considerable variation in how much is paid out of band funds to chiefs and councillors. In some bands with ample funds and where the council plays an important role in band affairs, councillors are paid on a per meeting basis; in others with ample funds, they are paid so much per annum, amounts that vary from $100 to $500. In about thirty-five percent of bands with funds, no payments to council members are made, although in bands which are under treaty the chiefs and councillors receive respectively $20 and $10 more than do other members of the band by way of annuity. Thus, for instance, where the annuity paid to members of a band is $5 per annum, the chief would receive $25 per year, the councillors $15. Although the payment in a few well-off bands is substantial, in the majority the amount to be earned as chief or councillor is almost negligible.

Insofar as monetary rewards symbolize significance of function and position, the message which accompanies the low level of payment is that elective posts are not really of much importance. It goes without saying that people compete for office for reasons other than monetary ones, but the evidence at hand shows clearly that, where people in elected posts are expected to carry out administrative duties, they feel that they should receive appropriate payment. Even where such duties are not carried out, the remuneration is felt by some to be hardly more than a token. One informant claimed that a key reason for the reluctance of the "best people" to offer themselves for office is that many cannot afford it or regard the other rewards -whatever these may be - as insufficient compensation to balance out the lack of remuneration. Three of the chiefs in our sample expressed a desire to become band managers, offering two main reasons: one, that they would be more adequately paid; and the other that they would be more effectively employed, could make more of a contribution.

We close this chapter by considering briefly the latter point, for it reveals something about the peculiarities of the conception of chiefship in many bands. We observed earlier that for many Indians the appropriate behaviour for a chief is featured by his efforts to maintain peace, harmony and unanimity, but that the trend appears to be towards expecting the chief to give some direction in the adaptive spheres of the local economy and government. Now in same bands, the traditional expectations are still strong enough to constrain chiefs who feel impelled to act in a directive manner. The chief of a northern Ontario band put it this way to one of our research team:

> I think that I will step down next time. I've been in for six years. What I want to be is a councillor. Then I can talk more and give my ideas (about establishing a tourist facility, and systematic exploitation of timber on the reserve). When you're a chief, you can't talk, you just listen. Sometimes I just about burst

> at meetings, but I hold it in and try to tell the councillors my ideas after the meeting. But they don't care much, even though they speak out a lot on this and that. If I'm a councillor I get up at a meeting and blow the roof, I tell them all my ideas. I was asked to be on (a regional advisory body) and I think I will do that, but be a councillor at the same time. Can I do that? (Here he asks the observer, assuming that the latter was knowledgeable on the rules concerning the holding down of positions on different councils at the same time).

It is tempting to generalize from our data and offer the opinion that where directive persons seek posts as councillors, they will support a weak chief; that where such directive persons seek the chiefship, they tend to override the rest of council. The reversible pattern: weak chief, strong councillor; strong chief, weak councillor, occurs again and again in our sample, particularly in bands with populations of less than 500 or so. In those larger bands with a chief who tends to offer direction and to have a clear platform, one or two councillors will be found who challenge the chief and who are likely to have chiefly aspirations. It is difficult to sort out what we call the role aspects of these positions from those aspects discussed in the next chapter having to do with council positions viewed as representative of particular groupings - families, denominations, factions, parties, and so on. The point is that band councils have structural features, are differentiated internally in systematic ways, and that these structural features are not just the result of happenstance or the interplay of personalities, but are related to band size, structure (e.g. whether divided along class, denominational, or other lines), resources and degree of control over them, traditional expectations concerning decision-making roles, and other factors. The interplay of some of these factors and resultant implications for decision-making as a process is the main topic of Chapter IX.

CHAPTER VIII

PATTERNS AND TRENDS IN BAND COUNCIL ELECTIONS

It was observed In earlier chapters that Indian Affairs Branch has for same time been optimistic about Indian support for and participation In band council affairs, anticipating that band councils will assume Increasing responsibility for local government and that they will be Increasingly concerned with "all matters affecting the well-being of their members".[1] The term well-being implies that the Branch wants the band councils to play a key role in the total development of their populations. Is their optimism justified? In trying to answer that question, we look at statistical patterns and trends, then attempt to clothe this statistical skeleton with the meat of observation from our field workers and from secondary sources.

The trend, especially since 1951, towards adoption of the elective system and the modification of the "tribal system" of recruiting band chiefs and councillors, has been noted. Another trend worth noting is that towards the administration by bands of their own revenue monies discussed in Part I of the Report. As of March 1966, of the 557 bands in existence, 115 had come under section 68 of the Indian Act, according to which the band council administers partially or totally its own revenue monies. It is safe to say, then, that on paper the band council has gained in significance in the overall administration of Indian Affairs. This does not mean necessarily that the band council system has gained wider local acceptance or that it has promoted a significantly higher degree of participation and interest on the part of band members within their Communities. To this question we now turn:

The Sample:

For the statistical analysis of such matters as voting participation, age of councillors, and so on, we used a sample of 34 bands, or roughly six per cent of all bands in the country. The provincial distribution is as follows:

Atlantic Provinces -	3 bands;
Ontario and Quebec -	10 bands;
Prairie Provinces -	10 bands;
British Columbia -	9 bands;
N.W.T. and Yukon -	2 bands.

The list of bands and their size appears in Table I.

The statistical data concerning council elections in these bands are derived from Indian Affairs branch files. The completeness and reliability of the information contained in these files varies from band to band. In same bands where the elective system has been practiced for many years and where Indian Affairs Branch agency

---

[1] The Administration of Indian Affairs, Indian Affairs Branch, 1964, p.26.

TABLE 1
STATISTICAL SAMPLE, 34 BANDS SOURCE: I.A.B FILES

BAND	POPULATION	RATIO OF POP. 20-49 TO 50+	% OF POP. OFF RESERVE	RELIGION	AVERAGE AGE OF CANDIDATES—ALL ELECTIONS	AVERAGE AGE OF CANDIDATES—LAST 5 ELECTIONS	AVERAGE AGE OF COUNCIL—ALL ELECTIONS	AVERAGE AGE OF COUNCIL LAST 5 ELECTIONS	CONTINUITY IN OFFICE FROM ELECTION TO ELECTION	NUMBER OF CANDIDATES PER POST	NUMBER OF DIFFERENT CANDIDATES PER POST	NUMBER OF DIFF. CANDIDATES PER COUNCIL POST	NUMBER OF DIFF. CANDIDATES FOR CHIEF PER POST	NUMBER OF DIFF. COUNCILLORS ELECTED PER POST	NUMBER OF DIFF. CHIEFS ELECTED PER POST	PROPORTION OF ELIGIBLE VOTERS VOTING LAST 5 ELECTIONS	PROPORTION OF CANDIDATES WHO ARE NEW - LAST 5 ELECTIONS	PROPORTION OF NEW WHO WERE ELECTED — LAST 5 ELECTIONS	PROPORTION OF COUNCIL WHICH IS NEW—LAST 5 ELECTIONS	UNDER SECTION 68	SIZE OF BAND FUNDS PER CAPITA
BIG COVE	872	3.09:1	1130	RC	38.0	38.5	38.9	41.5	50%	1.97	1.00	.97	1.20	.56	3	71%	34%	24%	16%	—	$ 189
BLOOD	2,116	3.98:1	1%	A 30% RC 66%	53.0	48.1	55.2	51.9	—	6.17	4.20	4.70	2.40	.58	3	29%	58%	10%	35%	partial	$ 368
CAUGHNAWAGA	3,807	3.05:1	24%	UC 10% RC 84%	50.7	48.3	50.3	50.3	54%	2.07	.96	.91	.80	.53	4	33%	36%	35%	25%	—	$ 578
CHEAM	125	5.20:1	5%	RC	38.7	37.2	38.3	38.9	73%	1.20	.53	.40	.80	.50	1	52%	28%	60%	20%	—	$ 273
CHRISTIAN IS.	493	3.28:1	17%	UC 65% RC 34%	43.1	42.0	45.2	45.5	32%	1.98	.92	.80	1.40	.80	3	71%	29%	29%	16%	—	$ 570
COTE	952	4.10:1	9%	UC 53% RC 42%	45.12	44.7	44.8	45.1	28%	2.16	1.10	.89	2.80	.82	2	44%	32%	31%	21%	partial	$ 804
CUMBERLAND H.	166	2.12:1	2%	OC 69%	51.5	51.5	51.5	51.5	—	.00	1.00	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	$ 146
DOG RIB RAE	1,006	2.00:1	3% off 97% c.l.	RC	59.1	58.9	59.1	58.9	69%	1.00	.82	.88	.20	.52	1	—	29%	100%	29%	—	—
DOKIS	190	3.50:1	44%	RC	39.5	38.3	40.6	38.6	53%	2.60	1.28	1.40	1.00	.50	2	71%	33%	23%	20%	partial	$1903
ESKASONI	1,155	3.80:1	4%	RC	30.2	37.6	38.2	30.2	35%	1.90	1.10	1.00	2.00	.72	4	63%	43%	37%	31%	—	$ 73
BANDS FORT ALEX.	1,093	3.40:1	7%	A 27% RC 73%	45.3	44.5	45.1	44.9	36%	1.74	1.10	.91	2.00	.73	5	42%	43%	45%	33%	—	$ 12
FT.SIMPSON	523	2.50:1	2% off 98%c.l.	A 22% RC51%	43.6	42.6	44.2	44.2	—	1.30	1.00	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	$ —
GOODFISH	450	2.94:1	11%	RC 50%	44.5	42.5	45.2	43.1	19%	1.70	1.10	1.10	—	.80	2	61%	53%	61%	56%	—	$ —
HAY LAKES	710	3.28:1	9%	BC	53.0	53.0	53.0	53.Q	—	1.00	.54	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	$1401
KAMLOOPS	321	2.60:1	6%	RC	40.6	41.7	40.8	41.5	47%	2.50	1.00	.72	1.80	.54	3	55%	13%	40%	13%	full	$1054
KEESEKOOSE	541	4.40:1	25%	RC	44.0	44.4	45.7	46.5	43%	1.92	.92	.85	1.20	.65	2	83%	20%	50%	58%	partial	$ 80
KEY	280	3.60:1	11%	A 73% RC 20%	42.4	43.9	39.8	44.4	46%	2.53	.10	1.10	1.20	.70	2	73%	19%	43%	20%	partial	$ 220
LORETTE	909	2.19:1	42%	RC	45.4	46.1	46.3	46.7	50%	1.03	.87	.84	.00	.68	2	77%	33%	56%	33%	—	$ 1
LYTTON	842	2.39:1	16%	A	45.4	45.2	45.2	45.5	36%	1.43	.79	.71	1.40	.68	3	24%	39%	64%	47%	—	$ 33
MANIWAKI	852	2.10:1	24%	RC	43.7	44.3	43.8	44.5	90%	1.05	.35	.34	.40	.40	1	—	10%	100%	10%	—	$ 104
MASSET	985	3.50:1	17%	A	46.6	48.2	46.5	46.6	24%	1.95	1.10	1.10	1.00	.72	2	46%	41%	361'	20%	full	$ 103
MISTASSINI	1,086	3.20:1	.4% off 99.6% c.l.	A	32.4	32.4	32.4	32.4	—	1.00	1.00	—	—	—	1	—	—	—		—	$ —
MOUNT CURRIE	794	3.00:1	8%	RU	47.4	48.5	48.5	49.5	46%	1.92	.97	.81	2.00	.65	3	72%	33%	39%	25%	full	$ 192
NIPISSING	470	2.35:1	25%	RC	48.5	48.5	48.5	46.5	60%	2.52	1.10	1.00	1.80	.90	3	62%	32%	30%	24%	full	$ 223
PIKANGIKUM	598	2.90:1	5% 22% c.l.	UC 75% RC 25%	43.3	38.8	43.3	38.8	26%	1.00	.71	.88	.80	.75	4	—	71%	100%	71%	—	$ 10
POINTE BLEUE	1,383	2.50:1	18%	RC	45.1	43.7	46.3	44.4	35%	1.92	1.20	1.10	1.40	.61	3	67%	35%	45%	32%	full	$ 7
FORT SIMPSON	1,072	2.87:1	22%	UC	53.3	52.0	52.6	49.1	62%	1.06	.89	.74	.80	.48	1	52%	27%	50%	22%	full	$ 145
SADDLE LAKE	1,580	2.94:1	11%	UC 25% RC 75%	45.5	46.4	47.9	49.7	40%	2.05	1.20	1.20	—	.67	4	53%	47%	34%	33%	—	$ 141
SEABIRD IS.	280	4.30:1	2%	RC	42.6	37.2	45.6	40.3	53%	2.20	.87	.80	1.40	.80	1	58%	36%	50%	40%	—	$ 47
SKWAH	170	4.00:1	4%	RC	40.2	37.2	42.7	40.5	34%	1.53	.87	.90	.80	.90	3	51%	39%	56%	33%	—	$ 67
SQUAMISH	988	3.30:1	9%	RC	45.1	50.0	47.4	46.9	—	2.90	2.20	2.20	—	—	—	46%	76%	32%	70%	partial	$ 251
THE PAS	843	2.38:1	2%	A	48.3	46.9	46.7	48.8	50%	2.13	1.10	.97	2.20	.54	2	43%	36%	35%	27%	—	$ 91
TOBIQUE	519	4.04:1	3%	RC	43.2	41.5	43.4	39.4	28%	2.21	1.10	1.20	.80	.57	3	65%	28%	33%	21%	—	$ 84
WALPOLE IS.	1,443	2.26,1	14%	UC 22% A 70%	43.8	41.9	45.6	43.5	53%	3.32	1.80	1.50	2.20	.53	2	63%'	33%	19%	21%	full	$ 261
AVERAGE	882	3.15:1	12.5%		45.6	44.6	47.0	45.9	46%	2.08	1.09	1.08	1.33	.62	2.4	57%	36%	46%	31%		$ 275

personnel have been keen reporters of events, we have abundant data on voting turnout, the ages of candidates, numbers of votes cast for each candidate, and so on, for as many as ten elections. For other bands such information is sparse, varying in detail from election to election. Moreover, some bands in the sample have been under the elective system for a relatively short time, their files providing information for only two or three elections. In a few cases it is not clear from the files just how elective is the recruitment of chiefs and councillors, particularly among bands which carry on a modified form of "tribal custom", as it is termed in reports. Despite these limitations we believe that the information contained in the files is sufficiently valid, reliable, and significant to qualify for use in statistical analysis.

The total population of bands in our sample is 33,700. In selecting the sample we deliberately introduced a bias in that we have only about six per cent of the bands represented but about sixteen per cent of the total registered Indian population represented, as we have explained in Part I of the Report. In other words the proportion of bands with larger than average population is higher in the sample than it is in the country as a whole. We did this deliberately for we had reason to believe that the larger the band, the more active and significant the band council, and this was our primary concern. If we had followed faithfully a sample design in which each type of band would be represented according to size and location, we should have had to include a large number of small bands, many of which are scattered about the remote regions of the North and about which scant material of a statistical nature is available. Furthermore, a higher proportion of bands in the sample than occurs in the total population Is within fairly easy reach of non-Indian towns and cities. This bias was also introduced deliberately in order to tap information about urbanization trends.

Twelve of the bands in our sample, or roughly thirty-five percent, had by January 1966 come under section 68 of the Indian Act, through which the bands are given control over revenue funds in whole or in part. As only about twenty-two per cent of all bands in Canada had come under sect ion 68 by January 1966, there is a bias in our sample in favour of those bands with more than average control over their revenue funds. Again, this bias was introduced deliberately in order to tap information on the trend towards increased control over band finances, a trend which is evident in many parts of the country.

To sum up, on a number of counts our sample is not completely representative and we must be cautious in making generalizations, especially of a statistical nature, for the total Indian population on the basis of data from our sample. Where we do attempt such generalizations we adopt a conservative weighting by reducing such indices of band council participation as voting turnout, number of candidates per post, and so on, by twenty per cent when applied from the sample to the total population. This is a very simple and somewhat arbitrary formula, but its use is justified in a report like this where overall trends are more important than precise and refined calculations.

For twenty of the thirty-four bands in this sample we have data derived from field work carried out since the summer of 1961, data which has some pertinence to the operation of band councils. People carrying out this field work were either directly involved in our project or had the project in mind when gathering material primarily for another purpose. In the text we refer to material from this source as "our field work date", "notes from our field work", and so on. For an additional five of the bands in our statistical sample we have pertinent data derived from secondary sources, that is, from studies in which the investigators were neither directly linked with our project nor aware that it was going on. Finally, we use other secondary sources on the more remote northern bands, sources which do not deal specifically with bands in our statistical sample but do contain material pertaining to regions in which our sample is under represented.

Voting Participation:

We were able to get data on voting rates in elections over a ten year period ending in 1965 for 27 band councils in our sample. The proportion of eligible band members who voted in these elections in 1955-56 was fifty per cent; in the elections of 1964-65, the proportion was 51.6 per cent indicating a rise in voter participation. In the ten-year period under review, a total of 20,015 votes were cast in band council elections in our sample. Generalizing from the sample to the total population, we estimate that in the ten-year period 1955-65, about 47,000 votes were cast by Indians in band council elections across the country. In reaching this estimate we take into account the bias in our sample towards those places with elective systems and large population, using the formula mentioned on page 3. Unfortunately, comparable figures for a sample of non-Indian voting participation in local government elections are not available. We suggest that such a sample, made up of equivalent portions of non-Indians who live in rural non-farm regions, as do the bulk of Indians in our sample, would show a lower rate of participation than does the Indian one. We make this point to put into perspective the widespread view of Indian apathy and non-participation in his own affairs. To the extent that the percentage of eligible members voting is an index of participation and interest in local government, it seems that Indian participation and interest is higher than that of non-Indians. Of course, these bare statistics tell us nothing of what it means for an Indian to vote in a band council election, a matter to be discussed later, but the statistics are worth reporting as indications of what Indians actually do, as a report on behaviour.

The matrix set out in Table II reveals that there was only one statistically significant correlation between Voting participation and other variables and this was an inverse correlation (R= -.480), between the proportion of candidates who are new, that is, who have not tried for office before, and the proportion of eligible members voting: the larger the proportion of candidates who are new, the lower the proportion of eligible members voting. Only one other correlation approached statistical significance, and that was between voting participation and proportion of band members living off the reserve: the higher the proportion of members living off the reserve, the higher the percentage of eligible members voting (R= .359). Although this correlation is almost statistically significant, too much should not be made of it. The practice of including or excluding members who live off the reserve in the eligible voting list is not uniform: in some bands off reserve members are rigidly excluded from voting, while in others they are not.

While an overall increase in voting participation is indicated, the increase cannot be attributed to such factors as increase in band funds or control over band funds. One of our hypotheses was that bands with large band funds and with control over them (i.e. bands under section 68) would reveal a relatively higher rate of voting than would other bands. As can be seen from the correlation matrix in Table II, the association among these factors did not even approach statistical significance.

Candidate Participation:

As more bands adopt the elective system, it might be expected that more people offer themselves as candidates for office. In the following analysis we distinguish between number of candidatures and number of different candidates per post. For instance, in a band with five council posts at stake, suppose seven people offer themselves as candidates for these posts in 1954, seven offer themselves as candidates in 1956, and seven offer themselves as candidates in 1958. This makes a total of twenty-one applications for candidature in the three elections. If in our example, the same seven people kept offering themselves as candidates, over the three elections we would have 21 candidatures but only seven individuals, or seven different candidates per post in that three-election period. At the other extreme, if no person who had offered himself as a candidate in

TABLE II

Size of Band Funds	Control of Band Funds	Number of Candidates per Post	Average Age of Candidates Council	% off the Reserve	Continuity	Voting Partici-pation	Homogeneity in Religion	Ratio of 20-49 to 50+	Proportion of council which is new	# of different councillors per Post	# of different candidates per Post	Proportion of new who get elected	Proportion of candidates who are new
Size of Band Funds	X^2= 6.730	X^2= 12.111	x^2= 2.064 Council X^2=2.668 Candidate	X^2= 6.330	X^2= 2.28	X^2= .692	X^2= 2.592	X^2= 2.395	x^2= 6.532	x^2= 3.583	x^2= .3	x^2= 3.332	x^2= very low
	Control Band Funds	x^2= 5.977	x^2= .512 Coun.	x^2= 2.977	x^2= very low	x^2= very low	x^2= 0.913	x^2= very low	x^2= 2.222	x^2= very low	x^2= very low	x^2= 1.427	x^2= 1.427
		# of Cand. per Post	R= .05 Cand.	R= .196	R= .139	R= .058	X^2= very low	R= .279	R= -.226	R= .106	R= .713	R= -.705	R= .106
			Aver. Age of Cand./ Council	R= -.134	R= .568	R= .291	X^2= very low	R = .417 Cand.-all R= .378 Last 5	R= .141	R= -.106	R = .033 Cand. Last 5	R = .041	R = -. 083 Cand.
				%off Reserve	R= .192	R= .359	X^2= very small	R= -.167	R= -.247	R= -.258	R= -.030	R= -.051	R= -.269
					Cont'y	R= .071	X^2= 2.183	R= -.212	R= -.207	R= -.502	R= -0.201	R= 0.016	R= -0.449
						Voting Part.	X^2= very low	R= .019	R= -.227	R= -.017	R= -.042	R= -.025	R= -.480

TABLE II (continued)

Size of Band Funds	Control of Band Funds	Number of Candidates per Post	Average Age of Candidates Council	% off the Reserve Continuity	Voting Partici-pation	Homogeneity in Religion	Ratio of 20-49 to 50+	Proportion of council which is new	# of different councillors per Post	# of different candidates per Post	Proportion of new who get elected	Proportion of candidates who are new
						Homogen. in Religion	X^2= 1.093	X^2= very low			X^2= .6	X^2= .6
							Ratio of 20-49 to 50+	R= .028	R= .727	R= .145	R= -.194	R= .097
								Prop. of Coun. which is new	R = .578	R = .039	R = .703	R = .687
									# of diff. councillors per Post	R = .045	R = .180	R = .604
										# of diff. cand. per Post	R = -.718	R = .415
											Prop.of new who get elected	R= -.079
												Prop. of cand. who are new

NOTES:
X^2 are chi-square correlations
R are rank order correlations
Underlined correlations are statistically significant
Minus sign denotes inverse correlation.

TABLE II: Correlation Matrix; Sample of 34 Indian Bands

one of these elections offered himself again in another, we would have twenty-one different individuals offering themselves as candidates in the three-election period.

Rates of candidature can be expressed in terms of a percentage of applications per council post. In a given band, if there are five posts available and 14 people offer themselves as candidates, the number of candidates per post in that election is 2.80, and if 25 people offer themselves, the number of candidates per post is 5.0. Of 30 band councils In our sample which have elected at least five councils, the number of candidates per post over the last five elections is 2.06. A comparison by year, presented in Table III, reveals slight fluctuations around 2.06 without any clear-cut trend over the five-election or roughly ten-year period.

TABLE III

NUMBER OF CANDIDATES PER POST, LAST
FIVE ELECTIONS, 30 BAND COUNCILS

Years of Ocurrence of Elections	Numbers of Candidates per Post
1955 - 57	1.91
1958 - 59	2.00
1960- 61	1.97
1962 - 63	2.24
1964- 65	1.87

What is suggested here is a relatively high degree of stability in the pattern of application for candidature over the whole sample, with roughly two candidatures per post. As far as questions about the broadening of participation in elections is concerned a better index is the number of different persons who offer themselves as candidates. In our sample, the number of different individuals who have been nominated and have run for council posts in the five-election period is 629. If we attempt to generalize from our sample and take into account its bias in favour of the more active band councils, we come up with an estimate of about 3,000 Indians who have in Canada offered themselves as candidates for band council election in the last five band elections, or roughly a ten-year period.

Again, we lack comparative information from an equivalent, largely rural and non-farm segment of the non-Indian population, but it would surprise the authors if that non-Indian segment had as high a proportion of its population running for office as does the Indian segment. The implication is that Indian participation and interest in band councils is quite high, considering the fact that so many of thom go to the trouble of running for office.

To what factors is rate of candidate participation related? Consulting the matrix in Table II, we see that there is a strong correlation between number of candidates per post and size of band funds. A weaker, but still significant correlation is found between control of band funds and number of candidates per post. In other words, in those places where band funds are high, the probability of contested elections per post is higher than where band funds arc meagre. Because size of band funds correlates with control over them, the same link between numbers of candidates per post and control over band funds is found, but It is a weaker link, presumably because some places which have control over their band funds have been granted that control, not because of the size of the funds, but because of special requirements for using provincial government services, a matter which is explained in Part I of the Report.

Participation of "New" People:

An indication of increased or decreased participation in band councils as the elective principle spreads is the tendency for people to offer themselves for office who had never done so before. In this Report we refer to these as candidates who arc new. By finding for a given election or series of elections the proportion of candidates who are offering themselves for the first time, we arrive at a proportion of candidates who are new. In the same way we find the proportion of council which is new, by calculating the percentage in a given council of members who have not before been councillors.

In our sample it was felt that the most reliable elections to survey in order to find proportion of new candidates and councillors would be recent ones. Because for many bands in our sample the information on candidates taking part in elections before 1952 is not abundant or reliable, we felt that deciding which candidates had run previously would be too risky for elections up to about 1960. From that point on, when we found the name of a candidate for whom there was no record of having previously competed in elections, we assumed that he was a new candidate. Using this procedure, we analyzed the data and found that there has been a steady increase over the last three elections in the proportion of candidates who are new to those who are not new. For the most recent elections (1964) the proportion of candidates who are new is 38 per cent; for the one before (1962) the proportion is 36.4 per cent; and for the one before that (1960), it is 31.7 per cent. Thus it seems safe to conclude that a broader range of people is being tapped by band councils in recent years. To some extent this trend is accounted for by the tendency for more women to enter band council elections, a tendency which is discussed in a later section.

Table II shows the correlations among the proportions of candidates and councillors who are new and other variables, such as proportion of new candidates who get elected, number of different councillors per post, and so on. Deserving special comment at this point is the correlation between size of band funds and the proportion of council (i.e. elected members) which is new ($X^2 = 6.532$). What this correlation indicates is that in those bands with large amounts of funds, those candidates who are new arc more likely to get elected than are new candidates in bands with smaller funds. It will be noticed that proportion of candidates who are new does not correlate significantly with size of band funds, but only the proportion of council which is new. Our field notes do not shed light on the reasons for this correlation.

It is reasonable to guess that a large part of the influx of new candidates into band council affairs would be made up of younger people who have been until recently discouraged from taking direct part in these affairs as councillors and chiefs. If this were the case we should expect a high correlation between proportion of new candidates for office and average age of candidates. Table II reveals that the expected correlation does not occur, which suggests that age is not a good predictor of which people are likely to offer themselves as new candidates or get elected as new councillors.

Age of People Running for Office:

It was hypothesized that, given the increase in participation in band council elections, and the growing adoption of the elective principle, there would be a marked lowering of the average age of candidates who present themselves, especially in those places where bands control their own revenue. Table IV shows that there has indeed been a lowering of average age of candidate.

TABLE IV

AVERAGE AGE OF CANDIDATE

Election (Years)	Avge. Age of all Candidates	Average Age of Unsuccessful Cand.	Average Age of Successful Cand.
All Elections in Sample	46	47	43.9
1958 - 59	45.6	46.6	44.3
1964 - 65	43.1	43.4	42.9

However, the expected correlations between average age of candidates and size and control of band funds, while in the predicted direction, were not statistically significant. As Table II shows, the only correlations of statistical significance involving average age of candidates were with demographic structure and continuity in office. The higher the proportion of people in the band who are over 50 years of age relative to those who are between 20 and 49, the higher the average age of candidate (R = .417 for all elections; R = .378 for last 5 elections). The higher the average age of candidates, the higher the degree of continuity in office R = .568). The matter of continuity in office is explained and discussed in the following section.

Does a candidate's age have a bearing on the probability of his being elected? in order to answer this we look separately at the age composition of successful and unsuccessful candidates. Table IV shows that the older the candidate the more likely it is that he will be elected. However, of even more significance is the declining gap between the average age of successful and unsuccessful candidates, a discrepancy of 2.3 years for the 1958-59 elections and of 0.5 years for the 1964-65 ones. Another way of stating this point is to say that age of candidate has become less of a reliable predictor of success in band elections during recent years.

However, it would be rash to speak of a revolutionary swing towards younger leadership on Indian band councils, and to imagine waves of younger persons challenging the positions of older ones. For one thing, the correlation between proportion of new people running for office and lower average age is not impressive, as we have already pointed out. For another, as we have already demonstrated, the demographic structure and trends in Indian communities are to some extent responsible for the lowering of average age of candidates. Nevertheless, there is evidence in our data that it Is becoming easier for younger people to got into band council office than it was in the past.

We should note here that there is considerable variation among bands in our sample as to average age of candidates. For instance, the average age of candidates in the past five elections in Dokis, Northern Ontario, is 36; in Port Simpson, B.C. it is 52. Among the Dog Rib Rae, N.W.T. where a modified tribal custom system prevails, it is 59. In some places, with the switch from the customary to the full elective system, the average age of people in council drops spectacularly. For instance among the Blood of Alberta, the average age of councillors dropped from 52 to 47 between 1963 - 64 when the elective system was introduced. It must be reported that in other places no noteworthy change in age composition of candidates and councillors occurred with the switch to the elective system.

Our field work notes contain several references to age of people in office which arc worth quoting. In reports on four bands there is special mention of how the people themselves are using the hypothesis of generational conflict and difference to explain what is happening. Statements like the following are common in these reports:

> "Those old guys should make way for younger guys who are in step with the world." "My generation is too old to change with the times. We should get out and let the younger ones come in. That's why I'm not running again." "What's happening here is that the younger men are taking over, and maybe that's the best thing."

It is significant that in two of these cases, where the researchers took pains to check out what was happening, they found that change in band council candidatures and membership was more convincingly explained by factors such as factionalism between parts of the reserve (Nipissing) and the continued operation of the hereditary principle, in this case favoring younger men in the correct line of descent (Cheam) than it was explained by the imputed drive to have younger people in office. The suggestion we make here is that Indians in some places have adopted the generational conflict theory common in the environing society, and use it to explain changes in leadership. Another reference in our field work data refers to the tendency of people who enter Indian communities determined to propel forward community development to ignore the older people and excite the younger, encouraging the latter to run for office and take over leadership roles. The assumption here appears to be that the younger people will be less conservative than the older ones. This assumption cannot be tested with the data on hand.

To summarize the discussion on age of candidates and office holders: the evidence shows a trend towards younger people getting into office, To get definite trends in age composition and its correlates we need a larger sample and a longer time series of elections. Within a few years, after the large number of bands which have recently adopted the full elective system have had another few elections, a study of Land council statistics such as this one should be repeated, using the considerable amount of information on file at the Indian Affairs Branch.

Participation of Women:

Another indication of change in community participation in band council affairs is the increasing part which women are assuming. Until 1951 women were not allowed to vote or run for office in band councils. Our statistical analysis does not permit us to separate male from female participation in voting, but we do have data on women running for office. According to an Indian Affairs Branch source in the whole of Canada in 1964 there were eight Indian women who were chiefs of bands and 107 who were councillors. In our sample there was no female chief in 1964, but there were 17 female councillors. Note that six per cent of the female councillors in the country as a whole in 1964 were in our sample, and that the sample represents about six per cent of all the bands in the country. This suggests that perhaps our sample is more representative than we reckoned it would be, considering our deliberate attempts to introduce bias, the reasons for which are discussed above.

To return to the discussion of female participation: there is clear evidence of growing participation as candidates in our sample. In the three-election period covering the years 1954 to 1959, about seven per cent of the candidates for office were female; in the more recent three-election period covering the years 1960 to 1965, about twelve per cent of the candidates were female. In that earlier period, 46 different women sought office; in the latter one, 71 different women sought office. Over the period of the last six elections, four different women were candidates for chief in bands in our sample. Three were unsuccessful; one was successful on two occasions (Skwah Band, 1960 and 1962). Our sample reveals that women candidates have a smaller chance of getting elected to council than have males, but that their chances are improving slightly during recent elections. The relevant figures appear in Table V.

TABLE V

PROBABILITY OF ELECTION BY SEX OF CANDIDATE

Candidates	Election Years	Percentage of Candidates Elected	Percentage of Candidates Not Elected
All Candidates	1954 - 64 (6 elecs)	47	53
Female "	" "	35	65
Female "	1954 - 59 (3 elecs)	34	66
Female "	1960 - 65 (3 elecs)	36	64

In most bands for which we have relevant data and which have had women participating in elections, the rate of recent success of female candidates is almost equal to that of males. But one band in the sample had a high number of women running in the elections of 1962 and 1964 and only one of these women was successful. We refer to Walpole Island, Ontario, where between 1960 and 1964 there were 19 female candidatures among 13 different women. Only one of these was elected. In order to show what effect the exclusion of Walpole island would have on rate of election in the other bands of women candidates for the last three elections, we present in Table VI a tabulation showing how female candidates in these other bands fared.

TABLE VI

PERCENTAGE FEMALE CANDIDATES ELECTED
WALPOLE ISLAND AND OTHER BANDS

Female Candidates	Percentage Election Years	Percentage Elected	Not Elected
Walpole Island (N= 19 Candidatures)	1960 - 65 (3 elecs)	5	95
Other Bands (N= 64 Candidatures)	1960 - 65 (3 elecs)	43	57

Unfortunately our field work on Walpole Island occurred at the beginning of our project and contains no reports on the band council election of 1964, in which many women took part as candidates, so that we cannot even offer hypotheses about what appears to be a rather unusual situation there with such a high rate of rejection of female candidates.

Looking at the sample as a whole, the number of women directly involved in band council affairs, increasing though it is, was still too small to permit statistical manipulation in order to discover what it is that correlates with female participation. Except to say that in the most remote bands still depending on trapping, hunting, and fishing, hardly any women come forward as candidates, there is not much we have to offer to account for differences in female candidacy and election. We checked out hypotheses with reference to traditional leanings towards matrilineal descent, urbanization, education. None of these hypotheses was confirmed by our data. As we pointed out with reference to the analysis of age trends, we need a longer time series and a larger sample in order to conclude confidently what supports female participation and election.

Nor can we make any statements about the participation of Indian women in local government compared to non-Indian women, *tie* have no data on the participation of non-Indian women in affairs of local government. Our own guess is that it would be lower than the direct and formal participation of Indian women as candidates for office. In any case, our uncertainty on this point can only be cleared up when a sample of non-Indian people, comparable to an Indian one, is studied with reference to its attitudes towards and participation in local politics.

Patterns of Continuity in Office:

In this context continuity in office means simply the extent to which people in office in one council are likely to be in office during a subsequent one. Perfect continuity in a council is expressed arithmetically as 1.00, signifying that all members of the previous council have been returned to office. Least continuity is expressed arithmetically as 0.00, signifying that no member of the previous council has been returned to office. If, say, three members of the previous council were returned in a council of five members just elected, this would be expressed arithmetically as a rate of 0.60 continuity, or simply three out of five continuing in office. Taking several elections for a given band over a given period, continuity in office can be expressed arithmetically for that band as the average rate of continuity over however many elections are in the sample. Table I shows that in our sample the average rate of continuity for all bands is about 0.46 for all bands in the sample. Translated into ordinary language, this means that any given council is likely to have almost half its members repeaters from the previous council.

As in most measures in this sample, the continuity one shows impressive variations among band councils. At one extreme there is Maniwaki, P.Q, with a high rate of 0.90 and at the other extreme Goodfish, Alberta (Saddle Lake Agency) with a low rate of 0.19. It will be seen in Table II that continuity in office correlates most strongly with average age of candidates and with the number of different councillors per post. The higher the average age of candidates, the higher the degree of continuity in office in the band. As would be expected, the higher the continuity the lower the number of different councillors per post. A slightly weaker but still statistically significant correlation is that between continuity and proportion of candidates who are new, the lower the latter proportion, the more continuity in band councils.

Patterns of continuity in office cannot be used as indices of greater or lesser interest in, and significance of, band councils without a good deal of analysis within the context of the communities in which the patterns of continuity occur. The statistical material under review does not provide that context. However, the field work material does provide that context for almost half of the thirty-four bands in our sample and permits us to make a few points about continuity and the politico-administrative process in Indian bands. A high degree of continuity combined with low voting and number of candidates per post could signify minimal interest in running for office and in elections. This would appear to be the case in Cheam and Maniwaki. However, the same pattern - high continuity combined with low voting and candidates per post - could signify the survival of an hereditary system behind the front of an elective one, with the band council still playing a significant role in the eyes of band members, despite the superficial indices of low voting and candidature. Dog Rib Rae in our sample could represent this type.

Where high continuity is combined with high voting and large number of candidates for office it is reasonable to suppose that the people who are returned again and again are performing well in terms of band criteria of performance. But this same pattern could represent a situation where there is something like a party system, in which certain cliques on the reserve try again and again to unseat a sitting clique, the unsuccessful factions presenting many new candidates in each election. Walpole Island in our sample seems to represent this type.

A high rate of discontinuity, where there is a large turnover of successful candidates from election to election could signify keen competition for office and relatively difficult standards of performance for those in office to sustain. This would imply a keen interest in band council affairs where combined with a high proportion voting and running for office. Tobique, N.B. shows this pattern in the statistical sample. But the field work data indicate that this pattern could signify, not so much the failure of candidates who get into office to live up to performance criteria, but rather a precarious balance between factions or parties on the reserve, a balance which shifts from election to election, resulting in a high rate of turnover or discontinuity in the statistics.

What could be called the "Joe job" pattern is where there is low continuity, little voting and few candidates per post, signifying a high rate of drop-out or resignation from office because of the perceived insignificance of the council role or an unwillingness to face the strains of office.

The various combinations of rates of continuity with other rates, such as Voting, candidate participation, and the like, could be studied on a larger sample with a longer time series in order to identify the various syndromes. In this way a typology of band council situations could be built up and form the basis for a sample to be studied using conventional field work procedures.

Other Variables Pertaining to Voting and Candidate Participation:

Observations from documents on Indian matters and from our field notes suggested that probability of voting turnout, or becoming a candidate and of getting elected would be related to a number of other variables, such as family membership, educational achievement, economic position, and religious affiliation. One problem encountered in checking out these variables in the available files is that the information on any given candidate is often quite limited. In many cases nothing was available on candidates except name and age. Hardly anything could be determined about the kinship affiliations of candidates from files. For more than fifty per cent of candidates there was some employment label and grade of school completed. However, in these latter items there is such an overwhelming uniformity in what is reported for candidates that statistical manipulation is out of the question. The vast majority of candidates are reported simply as labourers, farmers, or trappers, and to have had from five to seven years in school. Lacking the data which would permit one to compare for given communities the economic standing of the candidates with that of the rest of the band population, one cannot conclude from the statistical sample anything about the significance of the attributes of candidates, However, our field work notes do provide us with information about kinship, economic position, and education of candidates for several bands in the sample. We return to a discussion of these items after dealing briefly with religious affiliation and its correlates in our statistical sample.

First let us look at the correlates of the two major religious groupings, the Roman Catholics and the Protestants, for it is common in studies of social matters to attribute behavioural and other differences to affiliation with one or another of these groupings.[1]

---

[1] For discussion of the links between religious affiliation and economic attitudes, see Part I of the Report, p. 130 f.

Are Roman Catholics more or less likely to vote than are others? Our sample reveals no correlation between proportion of eligible members voting and religious affiliation. Are Roman Catholics more or less likely to become candidates or to get elected than other people? Again our sample shows no correlation between religious affiliation, candidature and election. In fact religious affiliation did not correlate with any of the variables tested in this band council study.

Because the information on religious affiliation for bands is valid and reliable, we felt that we could utilize it in another way: as an index of community homogeneity and heterogeneity. It was felt that patterns of band voting and other election patterns would vary along the dimension of homogeneity and heterogeneity in the band. Of course religious homogeneity is only one kind among many - linguistic, social class, kinship, and so on - but it was one which was easiest to get from the files consulted. The procedure was to regard bands with more than seventy per cent in one religious denomination as homogeneous, the others as mixed. The correlation matrix in Table II shows that this variable also did not correlate with any of the others.

Kinship Affiliation:

In our field work notes and in secondary sources there is frequent mention of kinship affiliation as an important element in band council composition and support. Some references mention kinship directly, others by implication, as when they talk of groupings in the community such as cliques, factions and denominations, identification with which is to some extent determined by descent and affiliation, It must be remembered that band membership itself is determined by descent in the male line with few exceptions, such as when new members are adopted into the band. Because band membership is determined by kinship and because band members are generally reluctant to admit new members, the rate of movement of residents and households into and away from Indian communities is probably much lower than such movement into and out of most non-Indian towns, villages, and hamlets, and the rate of marriage within the Indian communities is probably much higher than in equivalent non-Indian places, resulting in a multiplicity of kinship ties within the community for the average Indian person.

In the small bands in our sample and in the secondary sources observers are hard put to isolate kinship as an independent variable in candidacy, probability of being elected, the giving of voting support, and the like. People in these small bands rarely formulate election patterns in kinship terms. Because descent and marriage links are so much intertwined, even a random process of selection for office would probably turn up a slate in which several lineal and affinal kin would share office on council.

Where the hereditary principle is still overtly recognized as the appropriate way of recruiting chiefs, descent plays an obvious role in candidacy. But where this principle is not overtly recognized, it is with great difficulty that the observer gets enough information to permit him to specify with confidence the precise significance of descent, at least as far as candidacy and support are concerned in smaller bands.

It is common in many of these bands for one sibling group to have a higher proportion of its members than its sheer numerical strength would warrant in prominent positions, including council. This point was made above during the discussion of community organization. But even in these places it is rare for the people themselves~ to stress kinship in the ordering of community life. A typical passage from the field notes, this one from Christian Island, illustrates the strong position of a local sibling group in terms of memberships in community organizations, of which the band council is one.

> The councillors were not obviously elected under the influence of any kinship ties, i.e, there are

> no significant clusters of near kin in the council... There was, however, an obviously important sibling group composed of a core of leaders, or at least a core of persons active in filling formal offices. Of this group, consisting of four sisters and two brothers, three of the sisters held official positions in the ladies organizations...; one of the brothers was the Band Manager and Indian Constable, and the husband of one of the sisters was a council member... in addition the new chief was their cousin.

Typical of such small bands, then, is linkage by kinship of people in official positions, but without kinship itself serving as a deliberate and openly recognized principle of recruitment and support.

The number of complaints reported from smaller bands by Indians who charge chiefs and councillors with favouritism towards their relatives indicate that the demands of kinship are not discounted by many people in office. However, the fact that so many complaints are made can be taken as evidence of a widespread rejection of the particularistic norms of putting first the interests of one's relatives and letting the rules of kinship prevail in office, and the support of the universalistic norms of putting first the interests of the band and letting the rules of office prevail over those of kinship for appropriate purposes. Of course, this is an academic question for people in many small bands Where the chief and council have hardly any power to help anybody, lacking the funds, resources and direct control over significant objects which are valued. To sum up this section, in most bands in our sample and in the secondary sources, and particularly in the smaller bands, the people who run for council are not perceived as "representatives" of kinship groups, such as extended families and lineages, even though they might occasionally favour their kinsfolk.

However, in some larger bands, while the chiefly office is viewed as representative of the band as a whole, councillors are viewed as representatives of sectional interests which usually have a kinship referrent. For instance, the Cote Band with about one thousand members is reported by Shimpo and Williamson to be made up of surname groups or clusters, which the authors sometimes call cliques.[1] Except for the chief, whose office is hereditary, although his appointment must meet with the approval of the band, the councillors are not regarded as representatives of the whole band, but rather as representatives of surname groups and cliques. They also report that those people are most likely to get elected who have large numbers of kinsfolk to support them.

The tendency to regard councillors as representatives of "sectional interests" rather than as representatives of the entire band population is particularly strong among those bands which are still on the customary system or which have only recently switched from it to the fully elective one. As Hawthorn and colleagues pointed out in 1958, with reference to British Columbia,

> In some bands the sections are the descendants of earlier communities which at one time or another have amalgamated into one band. Where these communities still maintain a separate residential identity, the difficulty of representation could be overcome by the establishment, under the Act, of not more than six electoral sections... Quite often, however, the sections are mixed up residentially so that a ward system would not work; and more often still the sections which

---

[1] M. Shimpo and R. Williamson, Socio-Cultural Disintegration among the Fringe Saulteaux, Saskatoon, 1965, p. 249f.

> tradition desires should be represented are lineage groups, not residential groups. In considering this problem, we should bear in mind that a traditional chief was often little more than primus inter pares, a representative or head of a superior lineage; and that his equals, with almost similar prestige, would be the heads of other lineages in his community)

In our sample there are several larger bands (Blood, Caughnawaga, Squamish, Walpole Island) in which the principle of sectional representation is openly recognized. For such larger groups the term band is actually misleading, for the tendency is for the people to regard themselves as "tribes", "nations" or "peoples", made up of bands. Our field report from Blood is most explicit on this point:

> (An informant) like all the other councillors I interviewed belongs to a chiefly family, his father having been chief before him. He suggested (like others interviewed) that the word 'band' was not an appropriate one for the total population of the Blood Reserve (about 3000). He would speak of the Blood tribe and he would distinguish a number of 'bands' (8-12) as smaller kinship groups making up the total population. His father was chief of such a band and this band chose him as successor, in preference to other candidates. If there were 74 candidates for the council as a whole, each 'band' would put up an average of about six candidates, It was in effect between these six that the 'band' members made their choice of chief. It is usual to cast one's vote for a relative, for a 'band' member rather than an outsider. It was only for the Head Chief that votes were cast on other than a kinship basis.

This kinship element in recruitment, support, and representation on band councils implies a strong emphasis on particularism, which social scientists usually associate with a traditionalistic, conservative ethic, ill-suited to meeting the adaptive problems of a changing society. But the rule that wherever particularism prevails in selection to legislative and executive office one finds also a reluctance to put much energy into adaptation to change is far from being an "iron law". The Blood is one of the most adaptive and "change-oriented" groups in our sample, as we point out in the next chapter. So is the Squamish, which is actually a tribal council made up of bands which formerly had their own individual councils. Our field work notes for this group contain quotes from a member of the band, who also happens to be a student of anthropology, on the role of kinship groups which get linked in a network of "friendship alliances", as he calls them. This excerpt is worth quoting at considerable length, for it provides an insider's view of backstage election behaviour denied to most outsiders.

> . . . it is the kinship group that lies at the base of the political structure of the Squamish Tribe. When the band system was dropped by the Council, the big question concerned who were going to be elected councillors. In the old system, the sub- chief represented his band. Now, a councillor had to be elected by the whole Tribe; thus, the band as a unit had little chance in electing a representative. It soon became apparent that the solution could be found in the kinship network. A large kinship group would enter a candidate and request support from friendly kinship groups. These groups would in turn request help from

---

[1] Hawthorn, et. al., 1958, p. 447.

> other groups. In a similar way, an opposition candidate would call up his forces, and the battle would be on.
>
> The candidates act as people in the public eye should act (among the Squamish). They dare not open their mouths lest they should offend some of their supporters. The would-be councillor is not expected to make speeches, telling how wonderful a representative he would be, but rather, he is expected to carry un as if he were unaware of an election taking place. His supporters fight 'tooth and nail' to get the support of the neutral groups. They dig up as much dirt as they can to smear the character of the opposition candidate (this includes what his kinsmen have also done, as I have mentioned earlier). There are no bands, flag wavers, political platforms, speeches, and the like. All politicking is done over the back-fence, over the telephone, at the local pub, or any place where small-talk can be exchanged freely.
>
> Then comes election day. All adult members of the Tribe take positions in the meeting hall and act as if they were about to receive some distribution money. it is here that one used to find out who his friends or enemies were. It is considered a moral obligation for everyone to get out and vote for his kinsmen. The heads of the families make a special note of those kinsmen or friends who are not present for the voting. Just a few years ago, voting was done by raising one's hand. Imagine the chaos such a method caused~ Everyone knew who the 'traitors were.
>
> It became apparent that the Voting method had to be changed, so the secret ballot was adopted. if an alliance is successful in getting a candidate elected, it is also able to get other candidates elected and, thus, control the Council. A large kinship group such as the Smiths may be able to get two of its kinsmen elected (Joe and Tom Smith), but it will lose support from its friendship alliance if it tries to get another member elected. Thus, it will support the election of a member of a friendly kinship group, in this case, the Blanks, who are also allies of the Joneses, as the Joneses are also allies of the Smiths, Thus in the election this alliance will probably emerge with four councillors (two Smiths, a Blank, and a Jones). In another case, the Browns are allies of the Blanks, but not of the Smiths and Jones, and a different alliance will come into force. Therefore, the alliance that a kinship group is in depends on what the situation is.
>
> . . .the Council is composed of Tribe members who were mainly elected through the efforts of their kinship groups. In the old system, ii a band wanted action concerning a certain matter, it would request the sub-chief to present its views to the Council. Today, the councillor represents his kinship group. If the kinship group or a friendly kinship group wants something done, the councillor introduces the motion to council. Thus the Tribal Council is a representative body ... the only way that the people can effect the Council's decision is through the indirect use of 'kinship pressure groups'.

The Squamish Council performs an integrative function, ensuring some representation from each of its major kinship groupings, and preventing the overwhelming takeover of control by any one of them, but the operation of the Council is rather bureaucratised, in that there is a clear division of labour, several committees, a band manager and other employees, and the approach to its tasks is as universalistic as that of any small municipality, we believe.

The pattern in such tribes as Blood and Squamish is to have represented on council kinship groups which are more or less equivalent to one another, although particular families and alliances might have more influence than others and have proportionately larger numbers of councillors than these at any given time. Alliances among families are not fixed rigidly, and kinship groups are not to be regarded as being in power or in opposition, as though they were parties.

A different situation is found in those bands where the kinship- based sections of the community are divided into disputing factions. In such places the band council can be viewed as a stage upon which is acted out the underlying social conflict. The term faction is used here in the same way Ricciardelli used it in his study of the Oneida Band in Ontario:

> . . . (Factions are) groups in conflict, struggling to permanently overcome the opposition through some conclusive social victory. The factions are not regarded as part of the established order of things; the people feel they are disruptive of the unity and integrity of the community. At the extreme limit, factional disputing may result in the fission of the community, with the complete severance of social relationships.[1]

What distinguishes a faction from a party in this usage is that, whereas the party recognizes the legitimacy of other parties and competes with them, the faction denies the legitimacy of the opposing faction or factions, or the basic governmental structure. An example of the latter was the abortive revolt of certain factions within the Six Nations group in 1959. There a separatist group which denied the legitimacy of the elective system refused to vote or take part in elections and strove to revive the hereditary system. As Ricciardelli observes, the tendency is for such factions to be incipient parties, for the conservative element to give up its strategy of complete alienation of the elective body and take part in elections, thereby implicitly endowing the body with legitimacy.

In our field work sample there are a few situations which are at least superficially more faction-like than party-like. One is at Fort Alexander where a minority of people who regard themselves as "true" Indians, deny the legitimacy of the majority group which they claim are not "true" Indians, being the descendants of Metis who happen to have been brought into treaty and defined legally as of Indian status. This division is accentuated and reinforced by the fact that the numerical minority of "true" Indians have English names and are predominantly Anglican, while the numerical majority have French names and are predominantly Roman Catholic. The latter control the council and the various co-operative committees which have been established in an economic development program, the minority being relatively isolated, suspicious of innovations and of the increasing activities among Indians on the part of the provincial government. On a miniature scale this is something like an ethnic-group split and, as ethnicity is determined by descent, it turns out to be split along lines of kinship groupings. Many informants in the minority view the band council as an instrument used for the benefit of the Metis-descended majority.

Another situation in which the band appears to be divided into factions rather than parties, is at Nipissing. This reserve is a long (about 20 miles), narrow one, with the majority of the population living in two villages at the western end, the rest in three villages in the eastern part. All of the current councillors are from the two villages at the western end. They are pursuing economic policies of leasing and selling land and resource rights of which many in the eastern end disapprove. According to the field notes,

---

[1] Alex Frank Ricciardelli, Factionalism at Oneida, an Iroquois Indian Community, Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, University of Pennsylvania, 1961, p. 73.

> . . . men from the East End who were once leaders are now discouraged, and express little hope of reversing the trend of policy. Although council meetings are open to the public, few from the East End bother to attend... Some have formally challenged council elections; some appear to believe that decisions made without a band vote (as distinct from a council vote) are not legally valid and have attempted to stop council decisions from being put into practice... The division is so pronounced that the people at the East End talk of splitting the reserve in two... The split between the East and West of the reserve is accentuated by the fact that each cluster of households tends to be a kin-linked grouping; the newer and more modern villages at the West End are less kin-linked than the others.

Information from the Indian Affairs Branch files on Pointe Bleue Band suggests something like a kinship-based factional situation there which could be an incipient party pattern. In the files, reference is made to elections at Pointe Bleue as contests that symbolize,

> . . .which clan is to rule over the other... suitability of candidates is of almost no importance. The minority from one clan is termed the opposition.

Descriptions of elections there evoke a picture of bitter conflict, with reports of violence, threats, appeals for annulment by losers, and so on. An unsuccessful candidate for chief in the most recent election refers to himself as Chief of the Opposition. One reason that so many candidates run for office at Pointe Bleue, is that each candidate for chief has a slate of from four to seven people who run as councillors. We do not have enough information on this band to determine precisely the kinship composition of these slates or to discover the nature of the groupings referred to in the files as "clans". They could be factions, but they could also be incipient parties, polarizing divergent outlooks as to what goals should be given priority in the band. These factions or parties would have kinship correlates, but it would be misleading to view the disputes as primarily caused by kinship differentiation as such.

We have been led in the present discussion from a focus on kinship as an isolable element or factor to a focus on opposition between rival components in the community which have divergent views about policies and goals. Here we offer a few generalizations based on our field work.

What appears to be happening in those bands which have relatively substantial resources to exploit, either directly by band members or indirectly through leasing and sale, is for the people who emphasize resource exploitation and the raising of the standard of living to either take over the council entirely or form the dominant element in it. It is people like this who are likely to support Indian Affairs Branch or provincial programs once they are in office, although they might have been critical of such programs before getting in. Their opponents complain that they are simply front men for the administration and that they are selling their Indian birthright by this co-operation with government, by their treating of lands and resources in a purely materialistic and economic light rather than in the light of the need to maintain Indian status and distinctiveness. In a number of our reports, these opponents are described as "conservative" and "traditionalistic" by council members and by non-Indians, and are reported as rapidly losing favour with voters where they do run as candidates. At this point we want to put the polarization of views into perspective by introducing an oversimplification, foreshadowed in an earlier chapter, by labelling opposing elements in band council elections and operations as Friendlies and Hostiles, in terms of their orientation to the Indian Affairs Branch in particular, and the non-Indian world in general.

Friendlies and Hostiles:

These are the actual terms used in field reports of three bands in our sample to describe the salient characteristics of groupings with divergent views towards those band affairs which have relevance to councils. Some were tempted to use the terms "progressive" and "conservative" but felt that this over-simplified distinction was more misleading than the friendly-hostile one, because some people are conservative with reference to certain matters having to do with administrative and legal changes while being progressive with reference to accepting technological and economic changes. A good summary of the characteristics of friendlies and hostiles is excerpted from the field work notes on a northern coastal band in British Columbia. The observer cautions the reader against regarding the attitudes and behaviour he describes under the friendly label as being fixed properties of clearly defined groups and asks that they be regarded as constellations of attitudes and behaviour which like-minded individuals who are in the majority in council have in common, in contrast to the hostiles who are in the minority.

> The Friendlies - 1) Little emphasis is placed on the traditional kin ties in such large groupings as the clans and moieties of old... 2) No strong feeling for or against the whiteman as whiteman is expressed...likely to interact with whitemen (more than do the hostiles)... 3) The men (who are friendlies) get employment whenever they can... several are entrepreneurs, part-time or full-time (individualistic and mobile)... 4) The approach that the new Superintendent has adopted... is appreciated and supported... The individuals on council who are so identified by us as friendlies are not a distinct social group...
>
> As for the Hostiles, the individuals in this category, apart from sharing certain attitudes, also constitute a social grouping in the band... They are descendants (of three men) who were formerly very prominent in local administration and who were involved... in the formation of the Native Brotherhood... (But) it is not a descent group... One of the most significant factors which contributes to the existence of the hostiles as a group is the strong feeling they have of being persecuted by the whites... (Another factor) which differentiates the hostiles from thetg friendlies is that they are less individualistic, more likely to work together, to participate in ceremonial and sociable events involving large numbers of people who are like them and related to them... They continue to observe certain traditional patterns and relationships (such as in marriage preferences and proscriptions)... The final factor is the attitude to various aspects of the current administration (e.g. they condemn the council's going along with the Indian Affairs Branch policy of having fewer full band meetings and more council meetings, with the Superintendent present at meetings.)

Data from other bands provide us with more components of friendly and hostile positions than the ones given in the excerpts above, but the key ones which seem to pervade bands where this divergence is noted have to do with strength of identification with the Indian group and its traditional culture and of differentiation from non-Indians; degree of interest in maintaining the social boundaries around the group; the extent to which a purely "rational-economic" approach is taken towards band lands and resources, including human ones. In these respects the friendlies appear to be more acculturated that do the hostiles, although this does not mean that their ultimate goal is assimilation into the surrounding society. On the contrary, very little evidence of a desire for enfranchisement or other indices of assimilation can be found in our field work reports.

We repeat that our distinction between friendlies and hostiles is a deliberate oversimplification, used here to arrange some of the rich and complicated variety of information we have on differences in attitudes, styles, approach, and so on. The larger the band, the more varied and numerous the different orientations. In a large band, these different orientations can be accommodated without the risk of serious disruption, but in the smaller ones, continued divergence, especially in ideas about basic goals, between fixed groups is likely to be more disruptive than in larger bands.

Perhaps it is partly for this reason that in smaller groups the closest to the friendly-hostile division one finds is in the rather temporary stands taken by people seeking office. We should note that it is common in all bands for people, whether friendly or hostile, to express certain anti-Indian Affairs Branch sentiments. Quite apart from the validity of the specific objections to the Indian Affairs Branch or its representatives, it is clear from our field work data that the Branch is a general target for hostile expression among the Indians seeking office. At times the criticism of the Branch is directed at the local or regional levels; at other times - and more commonly - to the headquarters level in Ottawa. Two cases are reported in the field notes where aspirants for office have praised local representatives of the Indian Affairs Branch and at the same time have expressed hostility against Ottawa, in these cases possibly echoing the sentiments of the local officials themselves! Given the general expectation that some hostility will be expressed against the Indian Affairs Branch, it is still apparent that those who are very strident and extreme in their expressions of hostility are not as likely to win elections as those who are only mildly critical. It is worth suggesting that in most Indian groups the person who is very strident and extreme in anything is more likely to be rejected.

To return to our sample, the tendency has been noted for several bands to be hostile while out of office and friendly while in office. In other words - and to return to a remark made earlier concerning the smaller bands - the hostile stance is frequently only a temporary one, to be abandoned once in office. We are not suggesting that this is either a conscious pose or particularly Indian; we suggest that it is a pattern which is characteristic of all individuals and groups who are out of power and who later get into power, with the exception of revolutionary groups. In the case of the Indians, the flow of hostile-friendly sentiment is directed mostly towards the Indian Affairs Branch because it is the agency that symbolizes the surrounding society and because it is the agency through which is channeled so very much of the business which affects Indian lives. To maintain a high level of hostility towards it while in office would mean that hardly any business would get carried on.

To summarize briefly, the hostile-friendly division can be relatively permanent attributes of different segments in the community, in which case the hostile element is likely to have a bounded-group character. This is most likely to occur in larger bands. In recent elections, this element has been losing ground. On the other hand, the hostile-friendly division can represent shifting stances which individuals assume, depending on whether or not they are in office, for the evidence indicates that all who aspire to represent Indians are expected to show some suspicion of the Indian Affairs Branch and to criticise it.

Economic and Educational Standing:

As we pointed out earlier, the statistical sample did not provide us with enough reliable and valid data upon which to generalize concerning the economic and educational attributes of successful and unsuccessful candidates. The field work material, on the other hand, does contain some suggestive points, particularly on the economic aspect.

Unfortunately we do not have detailed information on relative occupational and income standing with reference to all bands in the field work sample, but we do have enough to confirm what one would expect: that the better off a person is compared with others in his band, the more likely it is that he will be nominated, that he will agree to stand, and that he will be elected to band council; and that those who are regularly employed for wages or are entrepreneurs are more likely than others to be councillors - although not necessarily chief councillor. This ties in with the remarks made earlier concerning the hostiles and friendlies: that the friendlies (who could be mildly critical of the Indian Affairs Branch) were more likely than the extreme hostiles to run for office and to get elected if they did run; and that the friendlies were more likely than the hostiles to have steady employment or be entrepreneurs. While there are several notable exceptions in our sample, it is still evident from it that most of the extreme hostiles are not regularly employed for wages and have low incomes, although they usually have some influence on public opinion in the band, appealing to traditional sentiments of solidarity and Indian identity.

Given this association between economic standing and likelihood of running successfully for office it is in only two bands of our sample that one can talk assuredly of an established socio-economic class system. As we pointed out above, reports mention the strong egalitarian ethic among Indians and how those who amass noticeably more wealth than others are defined as "not really Indians". It is only where a group of such economically successful people have had a chance to consolidate their advantages over a generation or so and to build up networks of inter-marriage and interaction with one another that something like socio-economic stratification occurs. In the two bands in our field work sample where this situation exists, the wealthier element dominates the council - but as councillors rather than as chiefs.

The main point here is that those people who are regularly employed for wages or who are entrepreneurs are more likely than are others to have the motivation and the skills which appear to be appropriate to band council office in those places where the band council is viewed as playing a directive or adaptive part in the band. Such people will almost certainly be English or French speakers and have had considerable experience outside the reserve community.

Substantial economic differentials do not occur among the more remote bands unless these have access to regular and well-paid employment - a rare phenomenon - or rights over the lease and sale of valued property and objects. In most of these bands, as has been observed, the band council does not have much of a directive and adaptive role. Qualifications for office are less likely to pertain to economic and occupational achievement, but rather are likely to pertain more to familial connections and personality attributes, a matter to be dealt with in the following section.

A similar distinction between bands which expect their councils to play a directive and adaptive part on the one hand, and those which do not, on the other, is to be found in the educational differential between successful councillors and others. In the former kind of band people with no schooling whatsoever, or with only two or three years of it, are not likely to come forward as candidates, nor are they likely to be elected if they do. For those bands on which we have the data, it is quite common for councillors to have had five to eight years of schooling. Perhaps there is a minimum number of years of schooling which the average Indian must have accumulated before he is comfortable in English or French and acquires an adequate facility in reading and writing. In the remote bands whose band councils perform simply as intermediaries and legitimators, quite a few chiefs and councillors with no education at all or with only a few years of it are to be found. In most of these places, the intermediary function is filtered through interpreters, with, the clerical function being performed by clerks.

We suggest, on the basis of the field work, that those groups in which council has a significant adaptive or directive part in affairs have relatively clear-cut policies and goals - although these could be contested within the band - and that because of this, they have relatively clear-cut criteria according to which people are selected for council. Stating it in this way gives the impression of deliberate and conscious and rational choice, but we use selection here in a sociological sense, in which a combination of the needs of the group, the motivations of individuals, the hindrances and helps in the environment, result in differential probability of success and failure for certain kinds of people, some of whose attributes have been discussed above.

Where no clear-cut band policies and goals exist, it can hardly be expected that people would have formulated explicit criteria as to what kinds of chiefs and councillors they are likely to support, beyond the criteria of kinship mentioned earlier and certain personality criteria to be discussed in the following section.

Personality Attributes:

We have little data bearing directly on the personality attributes of people who get on councils, but we have some material to offer which refers rather obliquely to personality. Indirectly from our field notes, we gather that the prevalent "style" of chiefs, which can be taken as at least a superficial manifestation of personality, is a low-key, unhurried approach to band business, a reluctance to encourage or engage in impassioned debate, a tendency to listen to and find a balance among different views. This may really be a definition of the role or office of chief in many bands and persons with certain personality attributes are more likely than are others to be attracted to this role or office.

Here and there we read of an aggressive and outspoken chief, but this is usually in contexts in which the chief confronts the outside world and views it as an audience rather than those in which he confronts his fellow band members, In those few bands in our sample which have been in a state of ferment, candidates for chief appear to be more brash and directive than the typical chief in our sample or in the literature. The behaviour and stances of councillors, as distinct from chiefs, are rarely described in the sources at our disposal, but a general impression is that the chief or councillor should not act as though he sought power and authority as a goal, as though he wanted to direct the band in the way, for instance, a candidate for mayor is expected to act in a municipal election. There are exceptions, but it appears to be a general rule that the chief, at least, act as integrator rather than as director.

An extreme example of this general rule that Indians should not manifestly seek local power and authority as a goal comes from some northern bands. In connection with his study of leadership among Indians of the Northeast (Ontario and Quebec), Rogers observes that there is a general reluctance to get into official posts because, if one did and actively sought to get things done, one would be

---

[1] Rogers, E.S., "Leadership among the Indians of Eastern Subarctic Canada", Anthropologica, VII, 2, 1965, p. 278 f.

perceived as a seeker after power and would become the target of critical gossip and witchcraft. In such bands the least offensive persons tend to be recruited to elective councils. This could be called the "weak chief" pattern, described by Balikci for the Vunta Kuchin.[1] It should not be confused with the "integrative chief" pattern, an instance of which is found in the Dog Rib Rae, to be discussed in the following chapter. But, in common with it, the prevalent notion is that the ideal person should not deliberately seek power, but should have it thrust upon him, either because he is the Joe for the Joe job or because he is the person who happens to be in the right line of descent or who happens to have the knack of acting as an integrative figure-head and is waiting in the wings to be drafted.

To sum up, the Winston Churchill model of the directive leader, with out-thrust jaw and bellicose expression, is not one which is likely to win support in local band council elections among Indians. Perhaps persons with this kind of personality or style would attract followings on a larger stage of political action, such as in regional or national councils, rather than on the smaller stage of local band councils.

Summary:

In this chapter we have assessed certain overall trends in band council significance in terms of Indian participation as voters and candidates and have tried to assess the attributes which appear to enhance a person's chances for election to councils and the different situations in which this or that combination of attributes seem most auspicious. Specific recommendations offered on the basis of our findings appeared earlier. Here we summarize the findings in very general terms.

Over the past ten years or so there has been a gradual increase in voter and candidate participation in band council affairs. A wider range of people is being tapped for council activities, belying the common view of apathy and non-participation of Indians in their own affairs. This is true particularly for those groups with sizeable band funds and with some control over them. Chances of taking direct part in council affairs are becoming better for younger adults and for women. Where council is regarded as a body with significant power and not simply a "rubber stamp" legitimator of policies and programs originating outside the band, or not simply as an intermediary between band members and the administration, the following attributes appear to be most auspicious for those seeking office:

(1) being in a proper line of descent or having approved kinship connections;

(2) being assured of support of kinsfolk and their allies;

(3) being between 36 and 45 years of age;

(4) having gone to school beyond grade 6;

(5) being fluent in either English or French;

(6) having had military, work, or educational experience outside the reserve

(7) having above average (for one's band) occupational and income standing;

(8) expressing middle-of-the-road views, rather than overt identification with views of either extremes of the factions or parties (hostile-friendly, conservative-progressive, traditionalist-modernist, and so on).

---

[1] Balikci, Asen, Vunta Kuchin Social Change, p. 146.

(9) being able to give the impression that office has been thrust upon one rather than being deliberately sought.

CHAPTER IX

THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS

There is no need to document the frequently stated desire that Indian people make decisions for themselves. Newspaper editorials, policy statements by the Indian Affairs Branch, statements by spokesmen for Indian groups, and by members of governmental Committees on Indian Affairs, are replete with references to this need and with condemnation of paternalistic treatment by non-Indians, Vet in such documents it is hard to find statements about just what it is that the Indians should be making decisions on or precisely how this decision-making process should proceed.

Decision-making is going on all the time. Choices are made by each individual hourly, daily, from among alternatives. Sometimes the range of alternatives is wide, sometimes it is narrow. But there is always at least one alternative - to postpone a decision. Decisions which pertain to groups, that is, decisions which are binding on more than the individual making them and which commit others than the decision-makers, are less frequent in occurrence than purely individual decisions. It is clearly this kind of group decision-making which is in the minds of people who deplore its alleged lack of occurrence among the Indians.

Frequently this lack is attributed to something in the Indian personality or to some group characteristic which inhibits decision-making. Discussion of decision-making usually focusses on persons, such as chiefs, as leaders with certain qualities. The actual process of making decisions is rarely spelled out in the literature. We are told, for instance, about certain northern bands and about Eskimos, that there is a primus inter pares arrangement in which the person who is the best hunter and has access to the supernatural is likely to be the traditional leader, chief or whatever.

Implicit in many of these accounts, although rarely made explicit, is the idea that the person most listened to is the person who has the crucial information, about the nature of the country, the habits of the animals, the state of the weather. These are of course the key qualifications for a good hunter and trapper, the qualifications of one who can read the environment and see what it spells in terms of dangers and opportunities. These attributes of knowledge and skill are reinforced and indeed at times explained by the possession of what we would call supernatural attributes. But even these can be described in terms of privileged communication with the supernatural world. Thus we find that in most accounts of traditional leadership and power, the emphasis is put upon knowledge of matters which are crucial to the group. This knowledge can be categorised by outside observers as natural, in the sense that it can be tested empirically, or supernatural, in the sense that the individual having it claims to be linked with the spirits, and enjoys more or less exclusive communication with them. It seems to us that most accounts in the literature of traditional power figures can be viewed in the perspective of superior knowledge about what ought to be done, whether or not this knowledge is perceived by outside observers as empirically testable or untestable - e.g., supernatural or magical knowledge. tie put the stress here on the knowledge which the decision-maker for the group possesses about the most serious problems afflicting it and about the solutions which are likeliest to be effective. Whether the knowledge pertains to war, hunting, sickness, or whatever, the principle remains the same: the person with the most direct links with the sources of information about how to solve problems s the person most likely to command an audience. But we invite the reader to focus attention on the information rather than on the one who is in a privileged position to receive it.

It is in the light of this perspective that we present the ensuing remarks concerning decision-making. For the purposes of the present analysis we cannot be satisfied with existing accounts in the literature about decision-making bodies and individuals among the Indians, concentrating as they do upon the historical stratigraphy of different kinds of leaders at different periods. These are very useful accounts for purposes of establishing historical perspective, but we feel that this kind of formulation does not give rise to fruitful hypotheses about the present day situation with respect to decision-making in Indian groups.

We have little to add here to what we have already said about leadership qualities and styles. For some purposes, a focus on leadership qualities and styles is important, but for our purposes we decided it was best to bring into sharp focus the process of decision-making rather than the qualities of leaders end what it is that makes Indian decision-making different from other kinds. In doing this we are forced to oversimplify in the direction of synthesis and pay scant attention to those cultural factors which make Indians different from others. This is a deliberate bias, introduced to highlight how Indians are similar to others with respect to the process of decision- making and, hopefully, to encourage people to generate hypotheses for testing, hypotheses which have to do with Indian as compared with non-Indian groups.

In this chapter we shall be concerned primarily with the decision-making process in band councils, lacking the data for this process in other groupings outside the household, such as voluntary organizations, advisory councils, vestries of local churches, and so on.

Band Councils as Decision-Making Bodies:

In this section we examine the management functions of band councils. It is customary to study decision-making groups in political administration in terms of such analytically distinct types of responsibility as legislative, executive, administrative, and the like. In another part of this Report band councils are discussed in terms of this conventional paradigm. A simpler distinction to keep in mind when considering the management functions of band councils is that between programmed and non-programmed decisions. Following the definition of Simon,[1] we consider that decisions are programmed.

> . . . to the extent that they are repetitive and routine, to the extent that a definite procedure has been worked out for handling them so that they don't have to be treated de nova each time they occur... Decisions are nonprogrammed to the extent that they are novel, unstructured, and consequential. There is no cut-and-dried method, for handling the problem because it hasn't arisen before, or because its precise nature and structure are elusive or complex, or because it is so important that it deserves custom-tailored treatment.

---

[1] Herbert A. Simon, The Shape of Automation, New York, 1965, p. 58, 59.

The secondary sources referred to earlier in this Report lead one to believe that the typical band council operates in a highly programmed manner. This is what is implied in the many references using terms like "rubber-stamp" or ritual approval. However, our own field notes reveal that several councils cannot be so described, particularly those which have assumed directive and coordinative functions in band economic development, and have gotten themselves into relatively non-programmed areas of decision-making.

Before discussing these and other bands in the sample, we make a few points about decision-making. We treat it here as a process and not simply a product. Studies of leadership tend to concentrate on the final phase of this process: the giving of an order; the taking of a vote; the signing of a pact, paying little attention to the other phases of the process. Simon distinguishes three phases in decision-making.[1] The first phase entails the scanning of the environment by the individual or group in order to identify conditions which can be defined as problems requiring a solution. The second phase entails the search for possible courses of action, for alternative solutions. The final phase is the one which as we have mentioned, receives most attention in studies of the decision-making process: the making of the choice from among the alternatives. We now look at our field studies of band councils in terms of this three-phase paradigm.

The first two phases, which command by far most of the time and energy in decision-making bodies, are very much ones of information gathering and exchange, as well as one of interpretation of information. What is gathered, exchanged and interpreted is not a self-evident matter, for in this process selectivity plays an important part. First of all, and obviously, the terms of reference of the band councils limit the range of matters which are relevant in the technical, formal sense. Some band councils, for instance those under section 68 of the Indian Act, have a wider range of powers than others. However, apart from this matter of legal competence and formal limitation over what band councils can make decisions about, selectivity of what questions will be grist for council mill is governed by the band's own perception of the council role, that is, how the council is defined by the band members; by the council's control over and access to channels of communication and sources of information; by what can be done realistically by council to solve certain problems; and so on.

Several bands in our sample consider that a very wide range of matters are within the scope of the band council and these, working most commonly through a multiple committee system, receive information on matters many of which are considered worthy of council action. For instance, a typical meeting of the band council of The Pas Band received reports and took action on the following matters, as listed in the report of one of our field workers:

> a shed was leased to a white farmer for the storage of potatoes; here the farmer's offer, evidently made through the agency, was accepted... A letter was tabled from the Fisheries Department offering the band a licence to catch 5,000-10,000 pounds of fish at Clearwater or Rocky Lake this autumn, but not for purpose of sale. Council decided to pay the expenses of catching the fish and to distribute it free among the people... A letter was tabled from the Health Department answering a complaint about wells: 'This is the last time the wells will be prepared at government expense'. During the discussion it appeared that though there had been carelessness, people really did not feel that the wells were good enough. They wanted water reticulation. They were hoping for a deal

---

[1] Ibid., p.

> with the Town Council (The Pas), but evidently this had been hard to arrange. From the question of water reticulation, the discussion passed over to sewage systems, on which a technical report was already to hand... (Among the other matters raised) was the Friendship Centre's underpayment of the sports director, which led to a proposal that the band council should in future employ this person, seeing that they were paying a subsidy anyway; and a proposal made by the local Anglican minister, who was present at the meeting. He wanted Jehovah's Witnesses banned from the reserve, and spent a long time defending this suggestion, but council, though belonging to the Anglican faith, would not have it. 'Some members enjoyed Awake', they said, 'but still remained loyal to their church. Freedom in Canada implies that the Witnesses have a right to come.'
> . . . The Assistant Superintendent made a proposal concerning personal loans for such occasions as weddings and furniture in new homes... Though Council granted this, it showed itself unfavourable to the setting up of a loan fund to help out band members in the future; members did not like the idea of having to refuse loan applications to persons not regarded as creditworthy...

This field work account indicates a band council which is open to messages from many quarters and one in which the flow of messages is not highly programmed. Some band councils in the sample were much more restricted in the range of matters within their competence or in the range of matters which they were willing to entertain on the agenda. Those bands with meagre funds and facilities or with no direct control over the resources they have are naturally more restricted in the variety of matters which they adopt for consideration. In such places, the flow of information into the council tends to be highly programmed and predictable, some of it being channeled from the floor at meetings, this consisting mostly of individual complaints about hardship or injustice, much of it being channeled by an agent of the Indian Affairs Branch or some other person of power in the community, such as a chief or a strong missionary.

A further screening from among the many messages which can be directed to council occurs through a discounting process in relation to certain sources and kinds of information. In two bands in our sample, a deaf ear is turned to many messages emanating from the Indian Affairs Branch. In four others, the deaf ear is turned systematically to certain classes or categories of persons in the band and attempts are made to protect council against the importuning of these persons. This is done in the name of improved efficiency.

A good illustration of this kind of screening was noted by a member of our research team. He describes the operation of a band council on one of the few reserves in our sample which is clearly stratified internally according to social class, with a relatively wealthy elite of Indian farmers who enjoy certain privileges of usufruct in band land at one end of the power scale and a poor, under-employed rural proletariat at the other. In such a situation one finds lack of agreement as to what are the fundamental problems of the community.

> . . . When I posed the question, 'what would you say is the most important problem on the reserve?' what I call the power group, councillors and representatives of the marginally successful portion of the population answered, almost to a man, 'Relief. People are not willing to work anymore. They all want handouts.' On the other hand, the same question elicited from representatives of the poor majority statements about the lack of remunerative employment or

> about the controls of the power group on agricultural enterprise, or both.

This council holds its meetings at some distance from the reserve, in a non-Indian town where the Indian Affairs Branch agency is located. This is a deliberate policy, aimed at protecting the council against everyday distractions produced by its constituents. To continue from the background field notes:

> . . . in 1958 a Regional Supervisor questioned the wisdom of holding the meetings so far from the population, but the council defended the practice by saying that discussion of personal affairs of individuals applying for assistance was better if not done in public, and that the constant interruption of meetings by persons bringing small personal problems before the council 'impedes and delays the passing of more urgent business'... The Agency Superintendent supported this statement with a plea of his own...to the effect that the council could 'stand up to pressure groups' if it did not have to 'face them on the floor'.

This particular council has adopted a rather extreme selective device in its programming of the flow of information from within the band membership and has developed efficient mechanisms of an informal kind to discount the messages that do leak through. An illustration of how these mechanisms operate can be seen in an excerpt from the account of one of the meetings of this council:

> . . .in most cases, a potential spokesman for the opposition can be quickly confused and rendered ineffective. While watching an elderly illiterate making an appeal, hat in hand, to the council, I was reminded of the way in which experienced workmen often treat a novice, using their knowledge and trade jargon to cut him off from participation while shaking their heads over his ignorance. The old man stood directly behind the Assistant Superintendent's chair. The Assistant did not turn around, but in a weary voice explained in jargon to the council that there was really no reason for the old fellow to be there. Nobody undertook to explain the situation to the man, although it was obvious that he did not understand. The Councillors listened with eyes rolled heavenward when be spoke and from time to time 'explained' to each other where his representations were in error. The incident ended with the Assistant agreeing to the council that he would look into the matter, and immediately raised another piece of business. The old man was not even aware that his case had been dealt with, but stood around until it became clear to him that something quite different was being discussed, and finally wandered vaguely out.

The processing in this example worked in such a way that the message given by the old man was received and acknowledged in a special way, a way which hardly encouraged the transmission of similar messages in the future.

Numerous band councils in our sample were said to be concerned about their exposure to pleas, complaints, suggestions, and so on, from the general population and to desire some protection from these stimuli. The British Columbia study noted on earlier occasions in this Report also records such a concern and made specific recommendations with regard to that concern. We have paid some attention to these recommendations in our analysis. For the moment, let us take note of a trend which is visible in our field reports, a trend in the larger bands towards increasing the separation of council from the band as a whole and the channeling of information into council through the more formal machinery of representations from committees and other associations, with much of the day to day management of relief, job placement, and so on being carried out by paid employees who report to the band council, either directly or through the appropriate committee.

This does not necessarily reduce the flow of information from the band public into the council nor reduce overall participation in council affairs, except where there is much overlap on the committees. Where the population is stratified into something like social classes, there is a considerable amount of such overlap in committee memberships, with the same few persons appearing on several committees. However, in our field work sample we also find networks with little overlap. In Kamloops, for instance, where there has been an upsurge in council significance and activity in recent years,

> . . . the Indian Affairs Branch urged that the positions on the numerous committees in the band, which are affiliated with the council, be occupied by as many different individuals as possible for the reason that 'we want to ensure there is widespread participation in band affairs'. Precisely this has occurred and there is nobody who holds a position in more than one of the five committees; as a consequence, the band council now has established contacts with many diverse opinions in the band, most of which, for various reasons, take exception to the Indian Affairs Branch.

In such places there is an increasingly high ratio of council meetings to full band meetings. It should be remembered that in many, perhaps most, smaller bands the council meetings tend to be virtual band meetings, with attendance and participation thrown open to members who are not on the council. It should be remembered, also, that even in larger bands, full band meetings must be called when there are items on the agenda which can only be dealt with by getting majority consent as, for instance, items concerning the surrender of land or the admission of new members into the band.

Our data indicate that, the larger the band and the more varied the fields of action in which the band council has a role, the greater the separation between the ordinary member of the band public and the members of the council and the fewer the full band meetings. Of course, in some communities many band affairs which were formerly non-programmed and which were aired in full band meetings have since become routinized and programmed and are administered by specialists who are either paid civil servants of the band or who are on special committees responsible for handling the particular kind of problem.

Thus, for instance, the Squamish of North Vancouver have a council which at least one of their members views as a cabinet, with ministers of health, welfare, works, and so on. Beside this they employ a band manager with a salary of about $8000 per year paid out of council funds. Many of the band grievances, problems, and needs are handled in a more or less routine fashion by such people acting in office. In bands without this division of labour and authority, such grievances, problems and needs are likely to absorb much of the attention of chief and councillors in session, or be taken directly to Indian Affairs Branch personnel, by-passing the council.

The trend noted earlier towards a decrease in full band meetings coupled with an increase in private council meetings, is a source of band public complaint in three bands of our sample. Typical is this excerpt from the field worker's notes on Masset:

> . . . the criticism, which many from this opposing group were heard to make, was that the present council does not hold enough band meetings. There was also the complaint that the few meetings held were always attended by the superintendent. Apparently considerable significance has been

> placed on these meetings as a mechanism of social control. It is said that individuals who had grievances in the past would make it a matter of public discussion in the band meetings and the general consensus reached in such discussion would settle whatever dispute existed.

It would appear that in those communities in which the band council was formerly an important integrative force concerned chiefly with social control and the maintenance of band solidarity, the shift to a strong concern with such matters as economic adaptation calls for a relatively impersonal approach on the part of officials, in which they tune out or discount the socio-emotional, or "human relations" messages. One is reminded of the distinction between an emphasis on task problems (getting a living and improving efficiency) and an emphasis on social-emotional problems (keeping peace in the group and maintaining motivational levels) and of how groups which place heavy stress on one set of problems invite difficulties in the other set.[1]

In several bands in our sample, the band council has indeed taken a leading role in such task or economically adaptive endeavors as property dealing, creating employment for band members and arranging for the production and sale of products and services. Prominent among these bands are the Blood, Dokis, Kamloops, The Pas, Nipissing, Port Simpson. At Kamloops, Nipissing, The Pas and Port Simpson, our field workers report increasing effectiveness of band councils in economic adaptation, accompanied by difficulties in the human relations sphere. bong the Blood, the band council was not the central integrative agency, this function having been performed by various organizations, like the age sets, Women's Society, and so on. There the modern band council is not vested with direct responsibility for the socio-emotional concerns of the group, the kinds of expressive and identity-maintaining concerns handled to a large extent within the ceremonial cycle, nor is the council subject to much pressure from the band public in these respects. In carrying out the responsibilities they do have, they can be rather impersonal, act in a manner which is supposed to be characteristic of executive bodies in business and government, and justify this stance in terms of the band's own definition of their role. As our field notes have it,

> In its relationship to the band, the council is perceived by the Blood as the carrier of modern ideas. They stand, above all, for the expansion of economic activities, and they are beginning to apply universalistic criteria.

In the case of the Dokis, the band council, led by a chief who has run for office successfully in elections since 1953, has been acting like the board of directors of a corporation, organizing such economic enterprises as the cutting and sale of timber, the provision of guides for hunting and fishing, the building of power lines into the reserve, and so on. In short, they have been most keenly concerned with what we are calling adaptive problems. However, little in the way of human relations or socio-emotional difficulties is reported from there, perhaps because the community numbers not much more than one hundred, is homogeneous and nucleated. Nipissing, on the other hand, while only about 30 miles from Dokis, has a larger population, dispersed over several small communities and lacks the cohesion of Dokis. While some people in those Nipissing factions or segments which are not in power admit that the band council deserves credit for their efforts in the sphere of economic development, many complain that the band council will not listen to their points of view and attend to their problems. In terms of our paradigm of decision-making, the latter are not treated as items for the agenda.

---

[1] Cf. for example, Robert F. Bales, "The Equilibrium Process in Small Groups", in Talcott Parsons, et. al., Working Papers in the Theory of Action, 1953, pp. 111-61.

Some bands in our sample have councils which show an interest in such matters as economic adaptation and development, but which do not perform as the chief band agency in this sphere. For instance, at Fort Alexander, where there has been a fairly strong cooperative development, the band council has given its approval to this development - in fact, the chief and three councillors are on the executive committees of the three cooperatives - but responsibility for the coordination of band economic activities is vested in the cooperatives rather than in the council. Without significant band resources to manipulate, the council is limited in this adaptive function. In the social-emotional realm, the council has apparently never been viewed as having special competence or responsibility and has not been expected to act as the integrative body linking together the different religious and tribal factions on this extensive and un-nucleated reserve. Our field worker notes that, although there has been some increase in interest in band council activities in recent years, apathy and disinterest are still characteristic. He notes that,

> . . . apathy and disinterest may facilitate decision-making by the present leadership group. It is generally considered that major issues or proposals should be taken to the band membership for decision according to democratic processes, and band meetings are called in such circumstances. Few people attend, and if these few endorse council proposals, council is then free to proceed with its plans as if the entire band membership supported them. As one councillor explained following a meeting called to endorse a proposal to establish a sewing factory, and attended by about 35 people: 'It's only a small meeting, but it is a band meeting, and the people were notified of it. So as far as we're concerned we've got the band's approval to go ahead'.

In this band the flow of information from individual members of the public to the band council is not directed along clear and specified channels and, although it is true that much information is transmitted informally, during the course of everyday life, it need not be treated as a legitimate item for the agenda. Our field work notes on this and other bands show that, as expected, the messages fed to council informally by some people in the community are more likely to enter as data into the decision-making process. As we observed earlier, in just about every group studied in our sample, there are influential people who are not councillors or chiefs but whose advice and guidance are sought by councillors and chiefs. These influential people have as the source of their influence command over valued skills and facilities or the capability of delivering the consent of sections of the community to policies and programs.

So far in our study of the flow into councils of information which is screened for its admissibility or exclusion as proper band business, we have paid most attention to information which comes from within the band membership, with only occasional reference to information coming from other sources. It is evident in our field work reports that information from outside the band membership is becoming of increasing importance, particularly in those bands which have taken more responsibility for economic development and local government. How this information is treated and fed into the decision-making process depends on a number of factors, one of which we single out for special attention: the nature of the immediate link between the Indian Affairs Branch and the local community.

Where the Indian Affairs Branch officials take a direct and obtrusive part in band affairs, much information from outside is channeled through them and they, in turn, diffuse it narrowly or widely, with or without their glosses and interpretations attached. An illustration of narrow diffusion from the superintendent of information which goes into the council mill and the interpretation by the superintendent of what the information was about and how to deal with it is provided from our field notes:

> . . . the superintendent has found it necessary to narrow increasingly the point of contact with the band in order to avoid the diverse and heavy criticism which obstructs his ministrations. This narrowing of communication channels between the band and the Indian Affairs Branch has practically eliminated even the councillors and has placed a heavy burden on the Chief, who visits the superintendent nearly every day and is becoming increasingly involved with confusing and stultifying...red tape. Examples of the effects of this situation were observed during council meetings. In these meetings the superintendent would present an issue with what he considered to be its resolution, which he claimed he and the Chief had worked out. In nearly every instance observed the 'issue' was something entirely new to the other councillors, and although immediate agreement was reached occasionally, usually one and often two councillors would take exception to the resolution and ask to examine the various relevant documents, and for a precise explanation of the wording of the resolution...

This narrow channeling of information and the direction of how it is to be treated occur most frequently where the superintendent lives in the Indian community, attends all or most meetings and, while assuming the role of resource person and secretary, becomes a human switch-board in the communication system. This role he justifies in terms of the lack of skill in bureaucratic and parliamentary procedures among the Indians; their lack of knowledge and understanding of the content of directives, reports, contracts, and so on which flow into the community from outside; and the need to be expeditious in carrying on the business of the band. A brief excerpt from our field notes describing a band council meeting evokes in concrete terms a picture of communication management by an agent:

> . . . There were two seats behind the small chairman's desk, at one of which the superintendent sat down. The chief came along later and sat down. Councillors were seated in a circle around this table, but the circle was a fairly wide one so that the centre of it was empty. The secretary of the council (an Indian) had a lectern to write on, the others nothing... The superintendent spread his papers all over the desk. There were a great many of these. The chief had brought two small exercise books, but there was no room for these at the small table, except in a little corner, so the chief held his papers in his hand throughout the meeting. The superintendent then started peering through his papers, reshuffling them and making noises signifying control. Meanwhile the group retaliated by having a discussion in Cree,,. When the meeting finally started going, it was the superintendent who introduced every subject to be discussed. No agenda was circulated, and the secretary did not hold the correspondence that was being discussed...

A quite different pattern occurs where the agent is seldom present in a location or at the meetings and where most communications from outside the band are sent directly to the council, from Indian Affairs Branch and other federal government agencies, other units of local government, like municipalities, cooperative associations, entertainment groups, potential tourists, business interests, voluntary associations, and so on. It is where this pattern occurs that the band council most resembles a viable municipal government. In our sample the bands which most closely approximate this pattern are Blood, Dokis, and Squamish. In those places the selection from external messages of those which will be defined as problems to be solved is left largely to the council, who may or may not seek guidance in interpretation of the messages.

Another matter to consider is the flow of information from council to its public. Few councils in our sample which hold a high ratio of private council meetings to full band meetings keep and publish exhaustive minutes. Complaints on this score have been reported by our field workers from five places. A typical one is cited here:

> Sketchy minutes of council meetings are kept by the assistant superintendent and typed copies are posted on the reserve. One man summed up his view of the situation in this way: 'Those council, they have meeting. ..we don't know what they say there. (The assistant superintendent) he put up a paper, but we can't read that. Sometimes my daughter read it to me, but I don't know what it says. All those big words. They never tell us nothing - just say we do this and we do that'... I have many examples of lack of communication (between council and public) and the ignorance of the majority of their own affairs.

The problem of communication between the council and the public in the community is of course most acute where the rate of illiteracy is high and where there are few full band meetings. In such places issues which have a pronounced technical and legal component, for instance, issues having to do with treaties or changes in the Act, tend to get defined by council as problems for the future or, if they do get defined by council as problems for the current agenda, the results of their deliberations are not likely to be presented to the band public in a way which makes much sense to them. Field notes from the Northwest Territories bands illustrate this point clearly with reference to discussions about the unfulfilled provisions of Treaties 8 and 1); it is clear from these accounts that the Indian public and, indeed, many chiefs and councillors have very slight knowledge of these treaties and their implications.

Before focussing on the second phase in the paradigm of decision-making, the phase that has to do with the search for alternative solutions, this is an appropriate point to insert some general remarks about communications which transcend the discussion of band councils specifically. In that part of the Report dealing with education and in our field work reports the point is made again and again that the content of documents, circular letters, directives, reports, and so on, emanating from the Indian Affairs Branch and other bodies, documents which have a bearing on Indian lives, are unintelligible to a large number of Indians because of their low educational level and difficulty in English or French, and because of the style and complexity of the materials in these documents. Where these are combined with a lack of knowledge of the complex external bureaucracy and structure of communication channels, it is a small wonder that, as one of our field workers put it,

> . . . they have only a vague and often inaccurate idea of the laws and regulations under which they live. In Indian Affairs Branch files and in Indian homes I encountered many examples of cases in which attempts by Indians to spur official action or simply to seek information had petered out in a maze of jargon and red tape.

This lack of knowledge of the system is due partly to the medium and offices through which relevant information is passed. Information of the specifically Indian band forms of government and their position in relation to others in the system is carried in official documents and handbooks and is seldom presented systematically to the Indian public in forms other than official ones. In the Northwest Territories our field work reports note that an attempt will be made to use radio as a medium to impart information and opinion on such matters, but for no other part of the country is such a project contemplated, as far as we know. Such information is also transmitted orally, of course, by Indian Affairs Branch personnel during the course of their duties and by others at leadership conferences, but the communication link here is quite selective, occurring between representatives of the external society and councillors, influentials, people selected for leadership courses, and the like. There is no diffuse channeling of information in readily intelligible forms, such as might occur in community adult education programs, except in those few places where community development programs and workshops have been instituted. It is the opinion of one of our field workers that,

> . . . even the growing number of leadership conferences and workshops seem to concentrate upon drawing out from the people both statements of problems and suggested solutions - a nearly hopeless task when the people lack the information by which they could define problem situations and propose alternative solutions.

Requests by ordinary individuals for information are usually sent directly to the Indian Affairs Branch, to members of the cabinet, and even to the Prime Minister. Members of parliament are being utilized for this purpose to an increasing extent. However, such requests are usually fed into the Indian Affairs Branch channels along which flow the replies. An example of this closed-circuit pattern is provided from our field notes:

> In one case, an illiterate, middle-aged man had his twelve-year-old daughter write for him a letter to the Prime Minister complaining about conditions on his reserve, and asking for a 'book that will explain what is in the Indian Act, so we can know what is right' (This is not verbatim). He received a letter from the Prime Minister's office couched in highly technical language, referring him to his local agency office, and his book - a standard copy of the Indian Act. He told me of his letter, and showed me the reply, but was unable to express what was wrong with it. Partly, I think, he felt that it was his own or his daughter's fault that they could not understand it... Later, at a meeting of his band's council (at which he was not present, of course) the assistant superintendent told the councillors, 'I'm going to read you something amusing',... He then went on to read the original letter.., and the reply.

The belief seems to be quite common among Indians that the possession and understanding of documents is a source of power in dealing with external bodies. This applies not only to treaties and books of rules, but also to documents containing information on a variety of topics emanating from government headquarters. A field worker notes that at one reserve studied,

> . . . an intelligent, alert man is attempting to organize an inter-band organization. He believes that its prime function will be to collect and interpret the 'circular letter' or administrative bulletins sent out by the Indian Affairs Branch for he feels that lack of success in dealing with the Indian Affairs Branch is often due to inadequate knowledge of prescribed procedure. He hopes to have some of the young people now in high school study these letters and keep them on file.

More evidence from the reports of our researchers could be provided to demonstrate the central importance of communication in studying local government and decision-making in Indian bands but we feel that enough has been presented to convince the reader that the question of local decision-making among Indians is not simply one of finding and training certain kinds of persons to play leadership roles or to muster support for those that already play these roles. To this point we return during the summary of this chapter.

Many of the points we made in connection with the getting and processing of information with a view to its eligibility as data for band councils are equally applicable to the second phase of the decision-making process, the search for alternative solutions. In our field work sample there are certain themes and patterns which appear in almost all bands, with a few notable exceptions. Two which are worthy of special mention here are the following: the tendency to depend on persons of local influence for advice about alternative courses of action; and the limited number of sources of external advice utilized by councils in dealing with those matters which they view as problematic. After dealing briefly with these two patterns we examine a growing trend in certain bands to deliberately seek guidance from sources outside the conventional Indian Affairs Branch- band council network.

It goes without saying that the source of guidance and advice explored depends on what kinds of problem are important. For instance, in those cases where the band council is expected to find solutions in the social-emotional realm, such matters as disputes between individuals and factions, deviant behaviour, sociability and the like will probably be referred to the local experts in this kind of problem solving. These could be people of influence in the covert system of relations, people whose esteem is high (even though their prestige might be low) and who fully belong in the band, for instance, hereditary chiefs. A missionary or some other non-Indian person who knows the community well might also be approached informally, and in their unofficial capacities, in seeking guidance on such issues. Occasionally band councils do appeal to the Indian Affairs Branch through the formal channels in attempts to solve human relations problems. In our field work sample, three different band councils have sought official help in curtailing deviance by asking for improved policing. However, many bands regard these problems as internal ones to be handled through the informal and unofficial community organization in which persons of influence carry most weight.

Where the problems are of a less personal and a more technical order, adaptive problems which outsiders would label economic and political, the local influential whose advice is sought is likely to be a person who has had appropriate experiences outside the community. In several bands our field workers note that Indian band members who are not on council and are not recognized as experts in socio-emotional matters, such as those mentioned above, nevertheless wield considerable influence as behind-the-scenes advisors on questions having to do with leasing of land or resource rights, the feasibility of alternative business ideas, method of getting action - that is, of manipulating the system. As we pointed out in an earlier chapter, these persons of influence are likely to be cosmopolitans who are often immigrants or the descendants of immigrants, and in a sense not eligible to pronounce upon internal social-emotional matters, but valued as helpful in enabling the band to meet the changing times in specific ways.

Apart from these local influentials, the chief source of advice for individual band councils in handling adaptive problems is, as we would expect, the Indian Affairs Branch. The flow of suggestions about solutions to problems tends to be channeled narrowly from the Indian Affairs Branch official in the agency to the individual band. In some cases it is the official himself who creates the suggested solutions, but more typically, his solutions are programmed in the sense that he is fed with suggestions from his own superiors and he passes these on. The Branch employs experts who originate suggestions. They are themselves in touch with other experts in different branches of government, business, universities, and so on. However, it is unusual for the band council itself to be in direct contact with these sources of ideas about solutions. By the time the ideas have been processed in the system, they reach the agent in a fixed or distilled form. A further distillation takes place at his level and he passes them on to the council, typically in a one-alternative form: you should adopt the elective system; you should not lease your timber rights; you should not adopt a work-for-relief policy; you should agree to move your community thirty miles away where the soil is better; and so on. The point here is that the Indian Affairs Branch itself has a stake in which alternative is chosen and is understandably prone to push strongly for one alternative over the other.

Our field work data reveal a trend in some places to discount the advice of the Indian Affairs Branch and seek elsewhere for ideas about solutions to problems. This trend began with the use of independent lawyers to advise bands on matters which have a strong legal implication. In recent years some bands have linked up with unions and cooperative federations and are tapping these sources of expertise; have hired their own economic consultants in order to carry Out feasibility studies on their reserves; have accepted the help of organizations such as the Indian Eskimo Association in advisory capacities with reference to economic development. With provincial and territorial governments sharing an increasing amount of responsibility with the federal government in Indian affairs, we foresee an expansion of the range of sources from which ideas about alternative solutions will be drawn, particularly in those places where community development schemes prosper.

This does not mean that better or more expert solutions than those currently suggested by the Indian Affairs Branch will be offered. In two of our sample bands, independent advice from non-Indian Affairs Branch experts in economic matters has been adopted and has turned out to be wrong advice in terms of the economic goals which the Indians themselves had formulated. In both cases the discounted government advice would have been more suitable in terms of these goals. What we draw attention to here is not the goodness or badness of the solutions offered, but rather the involvement of the band councils in the advice-getting process. The evidence is that those bands with resource potential are breaking out of the single circuit system of information flow between themselves and the Indian Affairs Branch and linking up with other problem-solving agencies. The bands that explore this way are establishing links with parts of the institutional apparatus of Canadian society from which they have been excluded, except indirectly through the mediating channel of the Indian Affairs Branch or through their unwitting participation as objects of research.

To put this latter point in perspective, let us consider the Indians as objects and consumers of research which is explicitly launched in order to better their lot. Sometimes the objects of research, who are also the beneficiaries of it, happen to be direct consumers of the findings. Take, for instance, medical research. A person who is an object of such research as a patient will presumably be a beneficiary, or can look forward to his fellow-men being beneficiaries, while at the same time getting information about the findings through digested articles in newspapers and magazines or from the researchers working on him. In the same way, managers read of management studies; academics read of studies about their own patterns of recruitment, market value, trends in research, and so on. They are at once the objects, consumers, and, perhaps, the beneficiaries of the research. Indians, on the other hand, are the objects of research and, hopefully, the beneficiaries of it, but there is hardly any feedback of research information in digested or any other form to these people, so that they cannot be considered as consumers of it. A sign that the social structure is changing in some bands is the tendency noted earlier for band councils to commission their own inquiries in the search for solutions to problems.

One final note is offered on the range of services available to Indian bands. Many agencies of government have devised research, guidance and other services to assist people in difficult circumstances solve their local or regional problems, agencies like area development boards, ARDA, Central Mortgage and Housing, and so on. In Part I of the Report the overall issue of Indian access to these services is considered in depth, so that we need not at this point go into matters of exclusion, coordination, and duplication. In the present context, we want only to indicate the general lack of communication between band councils and such agencies, even though the programs operated by the agencies are often the very kind which Indian bands need most. According to our field reports, it is rare for people on band councils to even know that such services exist.

A further source of information about alternative solutions to problems which is apparently used only minimally by any given band, is information about how other bands in the country deal with similar problems. One of the unintended consequences of establishing and nurturing local band councils was to turn these mostly small units in upon themselves. The establishment of regional advisory councils discussed elsewhere in the Report is a measure which should help rectify this narcissistic situation and make available for individual bands information on how other ones are doing, putting into perspective the local problems and adding to the fund of ideas available for any given band. National, regional and area voluntary organizations, and in particular those which are mostly or entirely Indian in membership could perform the same disseminating function. We have discussed earlier how such associations can perform significant functions in the socio-emotional sphere of identity, sociability, and solidarity that transcends the community and as pressure groups in the political sphere. However, our data suggest that their role in the sphere of economic adaptation is negligible.

In brief summary, for many of the problems faced by band councils there is available to them a very limited and highly channeled amount of information, although information is a primary requirement for any decision-making body.

In our highly oversimplified paradigm, the final phase of decision-making is that in which the actual choice from among alternatives is made. Given the definition of problems and the assessment of alternatives, how are choices made by band councils? It is beyond the scope of our competence and data to answer questions about the personality determinants of individual choice patterns or about backstage choices which get transformed through a vote or through some other formal operation into an official choice.

There is evidence from our field work that many councillors go along with particular decisions without investing much concern in the process, either because they are indifferent to the issues, or because they lack the information which would permit measured judgment. Where all or most of a council decide in this way, we have the rubber-stamp style of council decision-making discussed earlier in this chapter. In this case their role in choice is simply that of legitimator, of giving the needed official sanction to the choices made by others. Of course the giving or withholding of that sanction is also a matter of choice and in order to make statements about what determines choice at that level we need much more information than is available to us.

As far as the first two phases of the decision-making process are concerned, the investigator can at least determine with a fair degree of accuracy who gets what information, the distribution of knowledge about problems and solutions, and the like, and analyse these phases on the basis of what he has learned, it is much more difficult to analyse the final phase, for the data concerning this phase are more open to variable interpretations than are the data for the first two. Much of the data about actual choice consists of statements about imputed motives which are difficult to validate and of statements about who actually makes the choice which are often ambiguous and contradictory.

To illustrate the difficulty, let us look at a few cases confronting the investigator, in several places he is told by informants that the council or particular councillors always decide in terms of their own personal interest or the interest of their kinship group, section, or clique. In one or two cases it has been possible to conclude that this is a fair charge, because evidence of choices actually made clearly reveals the bias or the councillor in question admits to the bias. However, in the great majority of cases, the councillors admit to no such bias and the evidence in their record of choices is not sufficient to permit confident conclusions to be drawn.

In the present state of our knowledge about many bands, we cannot say much more than that the choice of alternative will follow precedent where adequate information upon which to base a judgment is lacking and that choice will make sense to the outside observer only if he views the choice as resulting from a balance of interests and pressures. For instance, where band solidarity is a prime concern, the alternative which least harms band solidarity will be chosen. Where economic advantage is the uppermost concern, the alternative which is perceived as most likely to ensure it for the band will be chosen. Where those required to make formal decisions are subjected to cross-pressures, they are likely to abstain or to choose whatever alternative will keep them in the good graces of that segment of the band public with which they are identified and from which they derive their support. Another way of stating simply what appear to be general rules pertaining to the final phase of the decision-making process in many of our bands, is that band public-opinion and the interests of his particular subgroups, as these are perceived by decision-makers, determine their choices from among alternatives.

We know that each band has its own style of processing alternatives and of formalizing a decision, that is, making it public and official. Where the process is highly programmed, little discussion is needed, for sufficient people know what the decision will be. Where it is not highly programmed, in some bands where overt consensus and unanimity are strongly desired, the Indians are highly skilled in carrying out the backstage work to ensure unanimity before the onstage decision is formally made by the council. One could enumerate from the field work a list of styles of public and official decision-making, but our data are not sufficiently profound on this score to warrant generalizing or spelling out the correlates of these different styles.

Excerpts from our field notes concerning the Dokis Band illustrate the observer's problem in discovering exactly who makes the final choice on a given issue and in deciding what weight to give public opinion. After describing the patterns of information flow from the chief to the band, the field worker goes on to say,

> The filtering (by reinterpretation) of such information has its consequences with respect to who actually feel they have made a decision on a certain issue. On the one hand, the chief feels that he in fact makes all the decisions on the reserve. Indeed he feels that 'the problem' is that no one criticised his ideas or had opinions of their own. On the other hand, the band members feel that they themselves make the decisions (in that they) as a body have the power to veto any idea by vote. One individual summed up the feeling of many of the band members when he said, 'it doesn't really matter who is in as chief and councillor, because all they do is run the meetings and we're the ones who say what goes around here'. It seems that both these contentions are in part true, but to understand this it is first necessary to have a more precise idea of what constitutes band policy,..because, rudimentary as it may be, band policy conditions all these decisions which are made in band meetings.

He then outlines that basic policy, formulated and put into practice about ten years ago, which can be summarised as one of controlled exploitation of timber, pulp, fishing and guiding, in order to provide enough work throughout the year for members. Originally there were critics of that policy, but they have been virtually silenced by the success of it, and arguments currently focus on differences of opinion about means. Thus we have a situation where decision-making is highly programmed in its three phases. According to the field notes,

> . . . at Dokis the band as a whole have little need to pass a vote on most issues which arise. This is a consequence of the fact that the majority of the issues have already been dealt with successfully in the past...there is a precedent.

The small size, homogeneity, nucleation, and favourable resource position of this band imply that consensus is more feasible than in most bands in our sample where such clear-cut policy is lacking. But even here it is difficult to make conclusive statements about the final decision phase as it applied to the chief and band council.

It is well to keep this in mind when evaluating leadership programs for people at the local level. Two types of leader appear to serve as models in these courses. One is the catalyst-integrator who organizes broad participation in activities and in discussions, getting people accustomed to formal organization and to speaking freely about their views of what the problems are and how to solve them, at the same time attending to socio-emotional and solidarity needs within his group. Indians in many places are skilled in the handling of socio-emotional problems and, as we saw above, are quite capable of organizing at the local level where there is a felt need for organization. A minimum of formal training is needed insofar as this type of leader is concerned.

The other type of leader resembles the popular model of the executive in corporation or government, who knows exactly what he wants, can manipulate meetings and rules of procedure, and is willing to risk his standing or job in support of a policy. This is a cultural model from the environing society which finds few replicas in Indian communities or indeed in any small communities.

At the local level we have tried to show that what is most needed in the way of improving the decision-making process is not the development of Indian corporation executives, or even of catalysts and integrators although at more inclusive levels of organization, national and regional, such Indian persons are sorely needed. But we have argued that at the local level the most pressing need is for the broadening of perspectives of the band public by being exposed to experiences that transcend the strictly local scene and by ensuring that there is available the information, convertible into knowledge, which can be fed into the decision-making process. Where this is available and where the band council has real, rather than fictional, control over substantial expenditures, our evidence shows that viable band councils have little difficulty in recruiting capable "leaders".

INDEX

A. Acculturation, 29-31, 161-164.
    Education, 42-53, 94-97, 119, 121-127, 173-174.
    Language, 36-37.
    Reserves, 21-23, 169-171.
Alberta,
    Education, 43, 77, 87-88.
    Northland School Division, 42-44, 69-73.
Appropriations Act, 64.
Assimilation, 49.
    Versus Integration, 25-28.

B. Band Councils, 7-8, 86, 191-201.
    Chiefship, 199-201.
    Civil Servants, 199-201.
    Decision-making, 232-246.
    Election trends, 203-229.
    Historical Perspective, 177-178.
    Indian Affairs Branch, 194-199, 203, 232-246.
    Kinship, 218-224.
    Recommendations re., 17-18.
    Sociological Role, 192-193.
British Columbia,
    Band Councils, 191-193.
    Education, 42, 77.
    Federal-B.C. Agreement, 36, 72.
British North America Act,
    Education, 21.
    Indian Affairs, 21-22.

C. Churches,
    Education, 8, 33-34, 5 2-62, 84-85, 88-89, 94-95.
Citizenship and Immigration,
    Department of, 22f, 69f, 70-72, 76.
Community Organization, 9-10, 175-189.
    Decision-making, 175-189, 231-246.
    Kinship, 218-224.
    Leadership, 5,25-28, 39f, 176-177, 246.
    Schools, 85-87, 94, 96-104.
    Recommendations re., 17-18.
    Residence Patterns, 179-183.
    Voluntary Associations, 183-189.
    (See also Band Councils)
Confederation
    Indian Administration, 21-22.
Culture
    Definition of, 109.
    (See also Acculturation, Integration)

D. Decision-making, (See Community Organization)
Definitions of terms used, 109.
Discrimination,
    Education, 140.

E. Economic Development, 6, 23-26.
    Level of, 24, 164-166.
    Reserves, 23, 168.
    Residence Patterns, 179-183.
    Social Welfare, 25-26.
    Voluntary Associations, 188.
Education, 5-9, 19-62, 105-159.
    Acculturation, 42-53, 94-96, 119, 121-127, 173-174.
    Adult, 5, 39.
    British North America Act, 21.
    Budget, 31.
    Churches, 8, 33-34, 36-62, 84-85, 88-89, 94-95.
    Definitions, 19.
    Employment, 5, 38-39, 167-169, 173.
    Enrolment Trends, 31, 32, 75-76, 78, 88-89, 127-137.
    Federal Attitude, 19, 21-29, 40-41, 169-171.
    Future Directions, 161-174.
    Health Education, 25.
    Indian Act, 30-32, 63-64, 105.
    Indian Attitudes, 40-41, 46-47, 107-108, 117-119, 137-143, 166-167.
    Integration, 7-8, 30-41, 88-96, 105-106, 132-133, 153-154.
    Language, 36-37, 172.
    Legislation, 20.
    Living Standards, 151-1 52.
    Objectives of, 32-33, 168-169, 171-174.
    Parent Teacher Federation (Home and School), 47-52.
    Philosophies of, 19-62, 161-174.
    Post-1945, 23, 30, 40-41.
    Pre-1945, 22-23, 40.
    Provincial Attitudes, 19, 41-46.
    Recommendations re, 8-16, 148-156.
    Responsibility for, 8-9.
    Right to, 166.
    School Boards' Attitudes, 46-52.
    Socialization, 7-8, 109-127.
    Vocational, 38-39, 123-125, 141-143, 167-171, 173.
    Weaknesses, 166-169.
    (See also Schools)
Employment
    Education, 38-39.

F. Federal Bureau of Statistics, 43.
Federal Government,
    Education, 21-30, 63-64.
    Integration, 28-29.
    Joint Agreements, 64-77.
    Language, 37.
    Legal jurisdiction, 21.
    Reserves, 25-28.
    Schools, 34-39.
    Social Welfare, 25-26.
    (See also Indian Affairs Branch)
Fort Alexander, 222, 238.
    Schools, 55-59.

H. Health,
    Education, 24-25.
    Recommendations re., 13.
    Standards, 24-25, 146-147.
Home and school (See Parent Teacher Federation)
Hospital,
    Schools, 34-35, 89.

I. Indian,
    Definition of, 107.
    White attitude forwards, 143-147.
  Indian Act, 6, 20, 23, 48, 233.
    Autonomy of bands, 25-28.
    Changes in, 178.
    Definition of Band, 24.
    Education, 30-32, 63-64, 105.
    Revenue of bands, 203.
  Indian Affairs Branch, 6, 7-8, 40-41, 65f, 84, 86-87, 178.
    Administrative regions, 78.
    Band Councils, 194-199, 203, 23 1-246.
    Community Leadership, 26-27.
    Education, 20, 30, 32-36.
    Integration, 7-8, 90-96.
    Recommendations re., 12-18.
    Vocational Training, 38-39.
  Integration,
    Definition of, 28.
    Education, 7-8, 12, 30-41, 88-96, 105-106, 132-133, 153-154.
    Indian Affairs Branch, 7-8, 90-96.
    Joint Agreements, 65-77.
    Recommendations re., 14-15.
    Social and economic, 23, 164-165.
    Versus Assimilation, 28-30.
    Voluntary Association, 186.

J. Joint Agreements, 21-47, 64-77, 105-106.
    Recommendations re., 14-15. 150-151.

L. Language,
    Integration, 29.
    Recommendations re., 12.
    Schools, 7-8, 36-37, 68-69, 172.
  Leadership (See Community Organization)
  Legal jurisdiction,
    Federal-Provincial, 21.

M. Manitoba,
    Education, 44, 72, 77, 98.
    Federal Government, 35, 72.
    Joint Agreement, 67.
  Maritimes,
    Education, 45, 77.

O. Occupations,
    Education, 38-39, 91-96, 123-125, 141-143, 167-171, 173. Recommendations re training, 15.
  Ontario,
    Education, 44, 77.

P. Parent Teacher Federation,
    Attitudes to Education, 47-52.
  Paternalism, 22-23, 40-41.
  Population,
    Increase, 23, 88, 166.
    School, 31.
  Provincial Governments,
    Education-views of, 42-46.
    Joint agreements, 64-77.
    Legal jurisdiction, 21.
    Schools, 35, 77-89 (See also Integrated Schools)
    (See also Separate Provinces)

Q. Quebec
    Education, 44, 77.

R. Recommendation re.,
    Band Councils, 17-18.
    Communications and Public Relations, 14.
    Education, 12-16, 148-156.
    Health, 13.
    Joint Agreements, 14-15, 150-151.
    Language, 12.
    Limitations of, 108-109.
    Vocational Training, 15.
Research,
    Assumptions, 107-108.
    Contributors, 10.
    Methods, 10-11.
Reserves,
    Autonomy, 6, 25-28.
    Band Councils, 9.
    British North America Act, 22.
    Conditions, 169-170.
    Culture, 5, 163.
    Decision-making, 9-10.
    Economic Development, 23-25, 163-165, 169-170.
    Education, 166-169.
    Federal Government, 27-28.
    Leadership, 9-10.
    Organization, 9-10.
Restrictions,
    Alcohol, 28-29.
    Voting, 28-29.

S. Saskatchewan, 85.
    Education, 42, 77.
School Boards, Local,
    Federal Government, 66-68.
    Indian Education, 46-52, 66-69.
    Joint Agreements, 65-77.
    School Structure, 79-87.
    School District of the North, 75.
Schools,
    Absenteeism, 134-137.
    Administrative Structures, 63- 104.
    Churches, 30, 33-34, 52-62, 84-85, 88-89, 94-95.
    Classification by Type, 33-36, 54, 89-91.
    Communication channels, 81-83.
    Course of study, 37-38.
    Enrolment, 31, 39, 75-76, 78, 88-89, 127-137.
    Federal-Provincial Agreements, 69.
    Finances, 35,45,65-67, 71f, 76, 88.
    Indian Act, 30-32, 63-64.
    Indian Participation, 40-41, 49, 68-69, 71, 75, 96-103.
    Integration, 23, 30-33, 35, 40-41, 50-51, 55, 64-65, 78, 88-96, 132-133.
    Joint Agreements, 64-77.
    Language, 36-37, 68.
    Provinces, 7-8 (See also Integration and Separate Provinces)
    School Boards, 35, 46-52, 67, 68, 74.
    Special Programs, 77.
    Teachers' Qualifications, 38-39, 55, 87-88.
    Tuition Fees, 72,
    (See also education)

S. (Continued)
- Self-Government,
  - Band Councils, 191-201.
  - Reserves, 25-29.
- Senate and House of Commons Joint Committee on Indian Affairs,
  - Education, 20, 21, 27-28, 30, 37-38, 43, 63-64.
- Social Welfare, 24-25.
- Socialization, 109-127.
  - Education, 7-9.
- Socio-Economic Development (See Reserves, Economic Development)

T. Tests,
  - Aptitude, 16.
  - I.Q.,16, 144-145.

V. Vocational Training, 38-39.
  - Recommendations, 15.